

**Date:** 2018/01/04 10:34:20  
**From:** Katty Law [REDACTED]  
**To :** cwdcadm <cwdcadm@cwdc.had.gov.hk>  
**Subject:** Bishop's Hill development  
**Attachment:**

---

Dear District Council Secretariat,

Below please find a complaint letter by Central & Western Concern Group to Legco Public Complaints Office on 20 November 2017 regarding the Bishop's Hill development. Please circulate to all district councillors for today's meeting.

Thank you for your kind attention.

Best regards,  
Katty Law  
Central & Western Concern Group

To: Legislative Council Public Complaints Office  
From: Central & Western Concern Group

Dear Sir/Madam,

The Central & Western Concern Group would like to lodge a formal complaint with the Legislative Council regarding a huge private hospital development proposed by Sheng Kung Hui (SKH) on historic Bishop's Hill in Central District. The Development Bureau is trying to push forward this project with SKH which would be detrimental to the important heritage sites, environment and traffic in the area.

In January 2017, representatives of SKH made a presentation to the Central & Western District Council regarding its plan to build a 25-storey private hospital on Lower Albert Road. According to the paper submitted to the Council, the new hospital will have 293 beds, 12 operating rooms and 90 car-parking spaces. The details and design of the scheme can be found in the link below:

[http://www.districtcouncils.gov.hk/central/doc/2016\\_2019/en/dc\\_meetings\\_doc/11737/20170119\\_DC\\_Paper\\_3\\_2017\\_R1.pdf](http://www.districtcouncils.gov.hk/central/doc/2016_2019/en/dc_meetings_doc/11737/20170119_DC_Paper_3_2017_R1.pdf)

Bishop's Hill is situated right next to Government Hill and the area is one of the most important heritage areas in Hong Kong. The Bishop's Hill site, dating back to 1848 as the residence and office of the Bishop of Victoria (Anglican Church), is surrounded by the Government House (Declared Monument), the Old Dairy Farm Depot which houses the Fringe Club and the Foreign Correspondent's Club (Grade 1), the Former Central Government Offices (Grade 1), St John's Cathedral (Declared Monument) and the French Mission Building (Declared Monument), which are all sites of great historical significance. Within Bishop Hill there are four graded historic buildings, namely, the Bishop's House (Grade 1, one of the oldest western buildings in Hong Kong), St. Paul's Church (Grade 1), the Church Guest House (also known as Martin House; Grade 1) and the Old SKH Kei Yan Primary School (originally the south wing of St. Paul's College; Grade 2). In short, the whole area is a precious cluster of historic buildings which lies at the heart of Old Town Central - the historic core of Hong Kong. To erect a 25-storey hospital building in the middle of Bishop's Hill will irreversibly damage this cultural landscape.

The proposed hospital development will be disastrous to the already overloaded traffic condition in the area. Serious traffic congestion is a daily occurrence on Hollywood Road, Wyndham Street, Glenealy, Ice House Street and beyond. It is unthinkable how such a huge hospital development can be allowed, given that the narrow streets cannot sustain the additional traffic created by a big hospital which accommodates a large number of patients, visitors, doctors and staff, bringing in more taxis, private cars, ambulances, supply trucks and so on.

Bishop's Hill is a GIC (Government, Institute and Community) site which unfortunately has no height restriction or development control. This is a loophole which can be exploited by the lease-holder asking for unreasonable/excessive development. In the case of Bishop's Hill, SKH's proposal is an excessive development that has no regard for the locality's environment and historic landscape. However, we see that the Development Bureau is working closely with SKH to push forward this project. The discussion has been held behind closed doors without any public consultation. Given the inherent problems of these GIC sites, where the Government may fail to control the development, we call on the Legislative Council to look into this matter and to take necessary steps to prevent any irreversible decision.

Your assistance in arranging a meeting would be greatly appreciated.

Thank you for your kind attention.

Best regards,  
Katty Law

Convener  
Central & Western Concern Group

**Date:** 2018/01/04 11:18:39  
**From:** Katty Law [REDACTED]  
**To :** cwdcadm <cwdcadm@cwdc.had.gov.hk>  
**Subject:** Fwd: West Wing facade  
**Attachment:**  [IMG\\_7400.JPG](#);  [IMG\\_7403.JPG](#);  [IMG\\_7404.JPG](#);  [Docomomo International Request of Preservation.pdf](#);

---

Dear DC Secretariat,

Below pls find a submission by Central & Western Concern Group to the Department of Justice on 13 December 2017 regarding the preservation of the original mosaic facade of the West Wing of the Former Central Government Offices. Please circulate to all district councillors for today's meeting.

A related Ming Pao report on this topic for councillors' information, pls circulate:  
[https://news.mingpao.com/pns/dailynews/web\\_tc/article/20171217/s00005/1513446630437](https://news.mingpao.com/pns/dailynews/web_tc/article/20171217/s00005/1513446630437)

Attached also find a letter by Docomomo International to the Chief Executive (on 2 Jan 2018) in support of preserving the original mosaic facade of the West Wing. Pls circulate.

Thank you for your kind attention.

Best regards,  
Katty Law  
Central & Western Concern Group

----- Forwarded message -----

**From:** Katty Law [REDACTED]  
**Date:** Wed, Dec 13, 2017 at 12:57 PM  
**Subject:** West Wing facade  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** John Batten [REDACTED], Paul Zimmerman [REDACTED], Albert Lai [REDACTED]

Dear Mr Siu and Ms Lee,

The Central & Western Concern Group has been paying great attention to the restoration of the West Wing on Government Hill since the government announced its retention in 2012. We have expressed the importance of conserving the building to a high standard so as to retain its architectural and cultural significance.

It has been brought to our attention that the **original mosaic facade** of the West Wing has been preserved in a good condition underneath a layer of stucco/paint. As you can see in the attached photos, the West Wing has an original facade in yellow and blue mosaics (along Queen's Road Central and Ice House Street front) when it was built in 1959. These mosaics have been preserved in good condition showing good colour contrast. Being the original wall decoration, we advise that the facade of mosaics should be revealed so as to reflect the architectural style of the building.

As this is an important issue related to the conservation of West Wing, we hope you can give us a prompt reply at your earliest convenience.

Thank you.

Best regards,  
Katty Law  
Central & Western Concern Group

## 同場加映：政府山西座原來的馬賽克還在



【明報專訊】在國際現代運動建築遺址協會（Docomomo）發出「文物警示」、政府擱置重建計劃後，五年以來，政府山西座在公眾焦點移至郵政總局和中環街市之下，平靜地展開了復修工程。月前，一個秋冬之交的下午，一個研究舊建築物料的德國女孩在場採集樣本，想知道外牆的油漆原本的顏色，卻發現油漆底下，有一層紙皮石。廣告inRead invented by Teads

女孩驚奇，像發現了秘密，揭開更多油漆塗層——西座的外牆，原本並不是我們印象中的灰白，而是一整幅的馬賽克牆！



1 黃色馬賽克磚  
2 灰/藍色馬賽克磚，配有黃色點狀圖案  
3 花崗石牆  
4、5 深色上海批盪  
6 花崗石牆混以上海批盪



### 翻新外牆 白漆直接覆蓋馬賽克

剛好是六年前，十二月的一個周末，當時的特首候選人唐英年在一個城市規劃論壇上，被問及政府山西座的保育爭議，他說，這個曾經是他工作九年的地方是一座「ugly building」，長方形的建築物恰似一個煙盒。唐英年或許算是年輕，棄商從政做局長是千禧年後的事，那時候，西座已翻新，外牆髹上白灰色油漆，看上去是一座經典不過的現代主義建築，設計強調功能、物料強調實用。如果，樸實無華的美學沒太多人懂得，認為簡約即是單調，那麼，突然重見天日的馬賽克外牆，會否為政府山西座爭取更多人的認同和愛護？

「在所謂現代主義建築之中，馬賽克其實是常見的物料。現代主義常說建築物應要表現時代進步，物料上講求能做到衛生，相比起往時用木或石，以大片馬賽克覆蓋建築物表面是其中一種做法。外觀上，最好能表現建築結構的簡潔美學，於是很多時用上黑白灰色。」研究東亞現代建築歷史、曾任教於理大設計系和SPACE建築系的黎雋維說，從相片中看到，這些剛「出土」的馬賽克保存很好，顏色鮮明，應該是多得被塗上了白漆。他說，當年西座外牆翻新，直接用油漆蓋住馬賽克，顯然是貪快貪便宜的方法，但這竟然意外地保護了馬賽克，「如果日曬雨淋，馬賽克一定不是現在的模樣了」。

這次發現了馬賽克外牆的德國女生格桑是個建築學博士，她解釋政府山是一個L形建築物，主要有六面外牆，但只有面向平民多用的雪廠街和皇后大道中的兩面牆才找到馬賽克，其餘面向山的四面牆有用花崗石、上海批盪等，六面牆的設計都不同。可以推測，當年的建築師有它的想法，是一種刻意的設計。「面向皇后大道中的一面，窗下的外牆主要是黃色馬賽克，至於雪廠街那面，以灰藍色的馬賽克為主的外牆，有黃色馬賽克圖案作為點綴。」

## 政府擬改建商廈惹眾怒

政府山西座建成於1959年，此前，殖民地政府從1840年代起就已在這一帶建總督府、政府辦公室等，作為早期殖民地權力核心之地。1952年，政府山上重建「中區政府合署」，由東座、中座、西座三幢辦公樓組成——東座是高級官員辦公室，中座由核心官員使用，曾有立法局和行政局會議廳，至於西座，則最為「平民」，內有各部門的辦事處，公眾也能用的職員食堂是不少人的共同回憶。2006年，政府公布發展添馬艦，計劃把政府總部辦公大樓遷進新址；三年後，時任特首曾蔭權在《施政報告》提出「保育中環」，建議綠化及發展政府山，拆卸西座改建為甲級商廈，引起爭議。

抗爭三年，在國際保育機構向香港政府發出「文物警示」後不久，政府宣布保留西座，用途改作律政司辦公室。自此之後，政府着手復修工程，西座預計於明年年底完成。

翻看當年政府計劃重建時委託顧問做的研究報告，其實早有提及西座原本的外牆是馬賽克，換句話說，這個設計，其實並非沒有人知道；只不過，一般人都以為已翻新的西座，髹上白漆時馬賽克該被拆下了。

作為舊中區政府合署最親民的一座，政府山關注組羅雅寧說，對於最後決定的復修方法，公眾其實所知不多。當年擱置重建後，關注組與政府一直集中就開放更多公眾地方討論。「將來重新開放之後，公眾可從皇后大道中入口乘升降機到七樓平台，平台外的花園是公共空間，這些與往時無異，不過七樓的食堂就沒有了。而由升降機到花園的有蓋通道，則同時用來做文物展示，那通道很窄，西座是否可以有其他地方闢作展示區呢？政府山的歷史，值得更仔細與香港人分享。」

### 關注組：承辦商對馬賽克沒反應

羅雅寧得知西座原本的馬賽克還在，「非常驚喜，看到舊照時，很難想像最初的西座原來咁靚，但再仔細打探下，聽說雖然負責相關工程的人都知悉馬賽克仍在，但看來他們不會讓它重見天日，照原定計劃重新髹上白油。他們沒說原因，不過對於馬賽克的發現沒反應，大概是避免節外生枝，用最快速最便宜的方法解決便當是完事了」。

### 重用的掙扎：成本風險與歷史價值

黎雋維說，他想像得到，負責相關工程的人的想法其實在行內很普遍，「現在揭開一小部分，看上去保存的質素不錯，但如果揭開整幅牆、然後發現爛了八成的話，怎辦？每開一部分，就多一點風險，不如不要繼續揭下去了。不過，這在外國其實很普遍，只不過是香港人不習慣。每幢建築做復修的時候，邊做邊會有新發現，然後再逐一想對策，這過程很像在做考古，你可以想像，有歷史的住宅建築，每個業主搬進去時都重新整裝，到現在你只不過把客廳的牆身一層一層清理，可能會發現在油漆下有五十年前的報紙被黏上牆了」。

根據格桑對物料的認識，認為這外牆要回復原貌，技術上並不困難，事關紙皮石算是現代的物料，即使有部分破損了，要復修、甚至要找類似的材料填補，相信很多香港師傅也會懂。政府山西座的馬賽克外牆，「老實說，它在那個年代很普遍，倫敦如是，香港也如是，只不過也許大多顏色單一，看上去好像沒什麼特別」，但黎雋維說，這種普遍性才更反映西座與世界上其他現代主義建築有關聯。「這不止是香港建築歷史一部分。現代主義建築流傳開去，如何在外地實踐、本地化，國際上其實有很多人想知道、研究，這甚至在學術界慢慢開始自立門戶，研究殖民地摩登建築是什麼回事，換句話說，也就是香港建築在世界建築歷史裏有它扮演的角色。」

文//陳嘉文

圖//資料圖片、受訪者提供

編輯// 何敏慧

fb: <http://www.facebook.com/SundayMingpao>

Lisbon, 2<sup>nd</sup> January 2017

**Subject: Request of preservation the original materials of the West Wing of the Former Government Offices (by Michael Wright, John Aitkin and John Charter, Hong Kong, 1960s-1970s)**

Dear Ms. Carrie Lam  
The Chief Executive of the Hong Kong SAR Government,

Docomomo International – the International Committee for Documentation and Conservation of Buildings, Sites and Neighborhoods of the Modern Movement – wishes to support the preservation of the original materials of the West Wing of the Former Government Offices (by Michael Wright, John Aitkin and John Charter, Hong Kong, 1960s-1970s).

Docomomo International is very pleased by the result of the Heritage Alert request developed in collaboration with the International Scientific Committee on Twentieth Century Heritage (ISC20C) of the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS) and the International Union of Architects (UIA), back in 2012, that resulted in retaining the building for government use (now as the house of Justice offices) instead of being sold for a commerce development.

According to recent correspondence with Gesa Schwantes (PhD Architectural Conservation; MSc Conservation; Conservator/Restorer BUAS (Diplom Univ.) and Director of Architectural Conservation Laboratory (ACLab)), Docomomo International painfully realizes that no specific measures are being undertaken to respect and retain the authenticity and integrity of the West Wing of the Former Government Offices.

Following the graduation of the whole, by Antiques and Monuments Office, as level 1, the highest grade under the Hong Kong legislation, Docomomo International wishes to call for your attention to the possibility of preserving the original materials of the West Wing of the Former Government Offices.

It is evident the existence of the original design façade (photograph 1) underneath the current synthetic textured finish: bright yellow mosaic tiles on the wall sections under the windows at the North East elevation as well the grey/yellow pattern mosaic tiles at the east side of the North-West (photograph 2 and 3). Consequently, and agreeing with the specialist, the restoration to the original finishes (tiles) would be smooth: the tiles are quite robust and can be easily exposed; any loose tiles can be re-attached and replacement of missing tiles appears to be simple (similar tiles are still produced).

Docomomo International asks you to consider the possible preservation of the original materials instead of painting the façades, in order to don't lose the original materiality character of the building, from which we can still learn today.

Docomomo International wishes to express its full support for all the efforts that may be carried out in order to respect the integrity of the original building, taking into consideration the history of the West Wing of the Former Government Offices and the will to maintain its authenticity for future generations.



Ana Tostões  
Chair of Docomomo International

Cc: Michael Wong Wai-lun (Secretary of the Development Bureau and Commissioner for Heritage's Office);  
Ms. Susanna Siu (Executive Secretary of the Antiques Monuments Office) and Department of Justice



1. Photograph of the original building, 1964



2. Photograph of the exposed original tiles, 2017



3. Photograph of the exposed original tiles, 2017

# 五十年代的實而不華

位於政府山上的建築物，除了政府總部包含的中座、東座及現在備受爭議的西座外，還有聖約翰座堂、終審法院及禮賓府等，每一幢都帶有不同的建築美學特色，從百年前的殖民風格到濃厚的宗教味道，現代化的功能性建築，乃至炮台里的古風走道、多樣化的大樹和植物等都足以令人駐足細看，更凝聚了香港百多年的發展及人文回憶。特區政府要將之改容易貌，如從前要洗擦皇后碼頭一樣，觸動起不少人的回憶。

西座畢打街出口於六十年代的原貌，當時外牆還有優雅的花紋圖案。





