

**Summary of Minutes of Meeting of Islands District Council**

Date : 15 December 2014 (Monday)  
Time : 2:00 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Islands District Council, 14/F., Harbour Building,  
38 Pier Road, Central, Hong Kong.

I. Visit of Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation to Islands District Council

The Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation said that the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) had a history more than one hundred years and he cited examples to illustrate its close relationship with Islands District.

Assistant Director (Inspection & Quarantine) of AFCD briefly introduced the work of the five branches of the Department, namely Agriculture Branch, Fisheries Branch, Inspection and Quarantine Branch, Country and Marine Parks Branch, as well as Conservation Branch.

A member said that Hong Kong should not rely only on the financial industry or tourism, instead other industries should also be developed. She enquired how the Department would encourage Hong Kong people to develop the agriculture and fisheries industries. She was also concerned of the safety of imported agricultural and fisheries food products. She thus proposed the focused-development of accredited farms, and enquired how AFCD would promote such plans and encourage Hong Kong people to take part.

A member noticed that there were often reports of illegal felling and thefts of incense trees in country parks and the countryside. He said that every time it was the Police who cracked the crime, and he was critical of the law enforcement of AFCD. He enquired how AFCD would deal with the above problem. He also said that issues concerning dogs were becoming more and more serious on Lamma Island. Every year there were more than a dozen cases of men bitten by dogs on the island. He urged the Department to step up measures to deal with the problem and review whether relevant legislations had become outdated and should be amended.

A member asked the Department to provide figures of reported cases of trawl fishing and their prosecution, as well as figures and results of judgments. He said that there were fishing boats conducting trawl fishing in the waters of Cheung Chau, Lantau South and Shek Kwu Chau these days. Fishermen said that these fishing boats would conduct trawl fishing only for 20 to 30 minutes with their license plates covered. It was suspected that they came from the Mainland, and even if these cases were reported to AFCD, law enforcement would be difficult. These activities made it hard for fishermen to carry out normal fishing practices. As far as he knew it, several fishing boats moored inside Cheung Chau Typhoon Shelter would also conduct trawl fishing time and again. He hoped that AFCD would step up law enforcement to protect interests of the fishermen.

A member was concerned of “urban-rural conflicts”, and he was pleased to learn that the communication between AFCD and Heung Yee Kuk had improved recently. He cited a government publication and a government paper issued in 1970s to illustrate that the Government then attached great importance to fisheries and agriculture. Over the decades, however, fisheries and agriculture had declined and villagers moved out of the countryside. These days, some villagers had returned. He enquired how AFCD would resolve “urban-rural conflicts”, so that villagers could enjoy the land rights they were entitled to. Finally, he hoped that the Department would, through publicity, make urban dwellers understand that apart from nature conservation, cultural heritage of villages should also be conserved, and that villagers had endured much hardship when they pioneered and developed the land for farming.

The Director of AFCD responded as follows:

- (a) The current-term Government had proposed at the beginning of the year that Hong Kong should conduct a review on its industrial structure and provide more choices for the young people. With the advance in technology, more young people had joined the farming industry. And with the development in leisure farming and conservation industries, retirees and schools were attracted to take part. The Food and Health Bureau would soon publicize a consultation paper on sustainable agricultural development and members of the public could then give their opinions. AFCD had all along encouraged farmers to participate in the Accredited Farm Scheme and had provided training and equipment for them. The number of farms joining the Scheme increased every year.

- (b) Country parks were extensive in area and incense trees usually grew in remote places and thus law enforcement was difficult. Staff of AFCD would conduct patrol regularly and information provided by members of the public was helpful. People who felled incense trees illegally were mostly armed with weapons, and therefore AFCD would need the co-operation of the Police. There were successful cases of prosecution and the Department would provide relevant information after the meeting.
- (c) With regard to trawl fishing, the coastline of Hong Kong was very close to that of the Mainland. Fishing boats could easily enter the Mainland waters if they veered slightly off-course, and that had rendered law enforcement quite difficult. AFCD would hire boats and more manpower, and co-operate with the Marine Police to step up law enforcement. In October, 2014, there were some successful prosecutions, and relevant information would be provided after the meeting. The Department would continue to tackle illegal trawl fishing, and its success depended on mutual co-operation of AFCD, the Marine Police and the department(s) responsible for fisheries administration in the Mainland.
- (d) “Urban-rural conflicts” were difficult to resolve as many issues were involved. The original intention of the two papers previously mentioned by a member was to include private lands and indigenous villages into enclaves. In regard of deserted villages, the Department would follow the established practice of posting notice first, and included them into country parks if there was no objection. Records showed that there had been no incident of forbidding the construction of village houses because private lands and indigenous villages were located within country park areas. The Tai Long Sai Wan case in 2010 had caused changes in policy. After reviewing 54 enclaves, the initial proposal was to include suitable lands into country park areas, and the remaining lands would be regulated by means of outline zoning plans (OZP). He stressed that the planning of enclaves had to go through legislative proceedings and local stakeholders would be consulted. Applications for major development projects in country park areas had to be submitted to Country and Marine Parks Board. If a consensus was reached by various sides that the project was not suitable for implementation in the country park, the owner(s) could make use of the mechanism as stipulated in the Country Parks Ordinance to demand

compensation from the Government. He hoped that such a pragmatic practice would alleviate “urban-rural conflicts”. He supplemented that Heung Yee Kuk would publish some materials on Country Parks Ordinance and history related, which might be helpful to resolve the problems of enclaves.

The Assistant Director (Inspection & Quarantine) responded on cases of men bitten by dogs as follows:

- (a) The Rabies Ordinance stipulated that dogs that had bitten men had to be quarantined for seven days at a quarantine centre. Dogs already vaccinated against rabies, issued valid licenses and implanted with microchips would be exempted, but they had to be segregated at home. Staff of AFCD would examine dogs that had bitten men after the incidents occurred, and another examination would be conducted seven days later to ensure that the dog was healthy and it had no symptoms of rabies.
- (b) AFCD had received complaints about stray dogs on Lamma Island, and that some dog owners did not properly controlled their dogs. The Department regularly deployed staff to catch stray dogs on the island but encountered much difficulty, such as tampering of cages and equipment placed to catch dogs. AFCD had reported the cases to the Police, and it hoped that dog lovers would not hinder the Department from catching stray dogs.
- (c) Every year, AFCD successfully launched around 100 prosecutions of cases of men bitten by dogs, and there were 800 to 900 other prosecutions such as not possessing licenses for dogs and not properly controlling dogs. Compared with around 3000 cases of prosecution twenty years before, the figures reflected that people were more aware of the need to control their dogs properly. Stray dogs caught had also decreased from around 14 000 each year to around 4 000 to 5 000, reflecting that the number of stray dogs was on the decrease.
- (d) Years before, Public Health (Animals and Birds) Ordinance was cited to govern matters related to dogs. Later, the Rabies Ordinance stipulated that dog owners had to possess license for dogs, that dogs had to be quarantined after they bit men, and that dogs had to be quarantined if they were imported from disease-affected areas. In 2000/2001, Dangerous Dogs Regulation prohibited import of some

dangerous dogs or required their sterilization before import. The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals in 2006 imposed heavier penalties on related crimes, and the Animal Traders Regulation would also be amended in the following year to regulate illegal breeding of animals.

A member said that with the implementation of infrastructure projects and establishment of marine parks, fishing areas and resources were both diminishing. She enquired how AFCD would tackle the above situation.

A member said that villagers gave up farming because of lack of water sources, and that there were not many applications for building village houses because of lack of roads. He stressed that villagers and people living in the countryside were very dissatisfied that there was no compensation after lands were subject to planning and development was restricted. He asked AFCD, the Planning Department and other relevant government departments to consider setting up a mechanism for provision of compensation to land owners, so as to resolve “urban-rural conflicts”.

The Director of AFCD responded as follows:

- (a) The area of Hong Kong waters had been decreasing in the past decades as a result of reclamation. AFCD had all along devoted efforts to maintain sustainable fisheries by providing technical supports and sustainable fish farming methods, and developing leisure fisheries. The establishment of marine parks had affected a total of 7000 to 8000 hectares of waters. After consulting the relevant District Councils and taking into account the actual situation, AFCD would issue fishing permits to allow fishing in certain designated areas. For fishermen affected by reclamation projects, relevant departments would act in accordance with mechanisms in place to make compensation.
- (b) Catchment areas were set up in relation to reservoirs, and were not related to country parks. In 1976, the Government included catchment areas into the country park areas for management and maintenance purposes.
- (c) The Department had taken note of members’ opinions and would follow up on them.

## II. Work Plan of Lantau Development

The representative of the Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) said that the purpose of the meeting was to introduce the most recent information of Lantau development and that of Lantau Development Advisory Committee (the Committee), and to listen to members' views on various issues. The representative of the Planning Department briefed the meeting of the potentials and concerns of development of Lantau Island, infrastructure and development projects being implemented on Lantau Island, the vision, strategic positioning of overall planning on Lantau and the planning themes. A representative of the Development Bureau briefed the meeting of the information of the Committee, its achievements so far and its plans. The Development Bureau expressed its appreciation to the Chairman, the Vice-chairlady and various members for their contribution to the Committee and its working groups.

With reference to the opinions given by members of the Committee, a member concurred that the narrow bend sections of Keung Shan Road and South Lantau Road should be improved. He said that the problem of illegal parking would deteriorate if more closed road permits were issued without increasing the parking facilities on Lantau.

A member enquired about the progress of funding application of the study on topside development at Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Facilities island submitted to the Legislative Council earlier. He said that after Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge was opened to traffic, it was anticipated that many travellers would need to buy daily necessities. Proposals had been raised to establish a retailing area at Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Facilities island, so that travellers would not have to commute to Tung Chung or Lantau Island to purchase the goods, and thus the congestion caused by travelers as experienced in Sheung Shui could be avoided.

A member said that a number of housing projects were being implemented in Tung Chung, and traffic to Tung Chung Old Town areas, South Lantau and Tai O was expected to increase. He enquired whether Tung Chung Road would have the capacity to cope with the increasing traffic load, and he urged the Government to enhance the road facilities and relax applications for closed road permits using Tung Chung Road.

A member gave his opinions as follows:

- (a) He supported the Government's plan to improve Keung Shan Road and South Lantau Road. He also proposed the construction of a coastal highway connecting Tung Chung and Tai O.
- (b) The number of vehicles and travellers visiting Tai O had increased every year since the implementation of the plan to revitalize Tai O.
- (c) He was not satisfied that the department responsible for transportation had turned down the proposal of constructing a new road on the excuses of insufficient population in Tai O and cost-effectiveness. In the past, residents moved out of Tai O because the Government did not improve its environment and transportation. If the roads on Lantau were improved, people would move into Tai O.
- (d) The initial estimation of Transport Department put the length of a Tung Chung to Tai O coastal highway at 9 kilometres and time for a car journey at 15 minutes. He hoped that the Government would pro-actively consider the proposal, which would improve the external traffic connection of Tai O and be helpful for conservation of land along South Lantau Road.

The Vice-chairlady gave her opinions as follows:

- (a) The development of Lantau was particularly important for enhancement of the competitiveness of Hong Kong. However, much of land was country park area and development of Lantau was thus restricted. She hoped that the Government would make good use of Lantau's tourism resources, so as to advance local economic development through planning.
- (b) Lantau Development Advisory Committee was an advisory body. She hoped that the proposals raised by the Committee would be submitted to the Government, and that the Legislative Council would provide funding for their early implementation.
- (c) In the future, many people from other districts would go to work at Tung Chung and the Airport. She enquired the Government about relevant roads and traffic arrangements.
- (d) The population structure of Tung Chung would be changed before 2023, the year as estimated by Tung Chung New Town Extension

Study for the first batch of residents to move in. She thus proposed that projects already matured and not involving reclamation could be implemented before 2023, such as improvement works of revitalizing Tai O, Mui Wo and Ma Wan Chung in Tung Chung, and the study to explore tourism resources in South Lantau.

Another member gave his opinions as follows:

- (a) With the opening of Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge, development of the Airport and the Tung Chung New Town Extension Study, visitors to Tung Chung and North Lantau were expected to increase. He hoped that markets, night markets and assembly markets would be set up for the formation of a “binary economy” in Tung Chung, which would provide space for daily life and opportunities to start up business for the grassroots. If businesses were to be dominated by tourism, commodity prices in Tung Chung would continue to rise.
- (b) There was no uniformity in toll fees of bridges and tunnels in Hong Kong. He was concerned that high toll charges for bridges and tunnels connecting Lantau Island might affect the development of small businesses on the island. He urged the Government to review relevant policies.
- (c) With reference to a powerpoint picture shown, he enquired whether there would be a road linking North Lantau Highway and Mui Wo. He also enquired how East Lantau Metropolis would be connected with adjacent development projects.

A member gave his views as follows:

- (a) The Association of School Heads of Islands District (the Association) queried the setting aside of many lands for the construction of ten schools and a few international schools in the OZP as proposed in Tung Chung New Town Extension Area. There were about 30 to 40% excess of school places in Tung Chung at present and the Association was doubtful whether the capacity of ten new schools could be accommodated. He hoped that the Development Bureau would first correctly calculate the need for school places in accordance with future population, and suitably relocate old schools instead of establishing new ones.



- (b) It was understood that the Education Bureau said that it had no comment on the proposed lands for schools, but did not propose the need for ten new schools. He asked whether the Planning Department had proposed the lands for schools according to Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines. The Association hoped that no problem would arise by improper planning and that development of schools would not be affected in the future.

Another member proposed the construction of a bridge connecting Cheung Chau and Lantau Island which would not only provide convenience of commuting, but also safeguard the safety of residents.

A member gave his opinions as follows:

- (a) The establishment of an inter-bureau/departmental advisory committee reflected the resolve of the Government in developing Lantau Island. However, some bureaux/departments failed to think outside the box. He hoped that representatives of these bureaux/departments would not be restricted by conventional thoughts and co-operate with the Development Bureau, CEDD and the Planning Department for the development of Lantau.
- (b) A member of the Committee estimated that there would be more than 200 000 job vacancies in Lantau area in 2023, but the population would be less than 200 000 people. Therefore more residences had to be built in Tung Chung and nearby areas. An initial estimation of the Transport Department put the construction cost of a coastal highway from Tung Chung to Tai O at around \$4.7 billion and time needed at around 8.5 years. There would be much government land along the route which would be suitable for low and medium density residential developments. The member roughly estimated that the sale of two pieces of land would bring in nearly \$10 billion which would be adequate for the construction of the highway.
- (c) With regard to the strategic studies on proposed artificial island(s) in the central waters, he proposed that CEDD and the consultants should conduct demand analysis, apart from conducting technical feasibility studies. He gave an example to illustrate that land demand analysis could be conducted in respect of commerce, residences and visitors in East Lantau Metropolis to calculate the area of land that would be needed, and conduct reclamation accordingly.

A representative of the Development Bureau responded as follows:

- (a) The Under Secretary for Development attended the Islands District Council meeting in June 2014 and had listened to views of members. The Work Plan of Lantau Development introduced previously had incorporated some of the proposals raised by members then.
- (b) Members' opinions and classification of proposals previously mentioned referred to members' comments collected up to October 2014 and other views from members of the public. However, it did not mean that other proposals not included would not be considered. The issue of inadequate parking facilities in the area had been raised by the Chairman and the Vice-chairlady in the Committee, which had agreed that it could be dealt with in accordance with existing mechanism. The representative of the Transport Department who was in attendance at the meeting was aware of members' opinions and would follow up through existing mechanism, and so would the issues of the capacity of Tung Chung Road and inadequate number of parking spaces for buses.
- (c) The most recent estimation of the Transport Department put the construction cost of a new road from Tung Chung to Tai O at \$6.3 billion roughly. She agreed with many members' opinion that the development of Lantau was closely related to that of Hong Kong as a whole. On whether new road network should be built or whether transport ancillary facilities should be improved, forward-looking planning would be required instead of simply considering existing traffic needs and flow. The Transport and Housing Bureau, which was represented on the Committee, would explore whether Tuen Mun-Chak Lap Kok Link Road should be toll-charged.
- (d) Funding application for study on topside development at HK Boundary Crossing Facilities island had been included in the meeting agenda of the Finance Committee of the Legislative Council to be held on 19 December 2014.
- (e) There would be two sections in Tuen Mun- Chak Lap Kok Link Road, namely one from North Lantau Expressway to the artificial island, and the other from the artificial island to Tuen Mun, each with its respective date of completion.

- (f) The Development Bureau noticed that the population structure of Lantau Island had changed. Apart from conducting long term planning study, the Committee had explored the implementation of short term projects so as to boost local economy. Relevant departments would implement improvement works of revitalizing Tai O, Mui Wo and Ma Wan Chung as early as possible if resources would become available.
- (g) Some members opined that new facilities could be introduced before 2023 when the whole project of Tung Chung New Town Extension would be completed. The Bureau concurred that planning for new community facilities should be timely reviewed in response to changes in local population and the time new residents moved in.
- (h) The Education Bureau should have already raised its disagreement about the planning of lands for school use in the course of consultation of Tung Chung New Town Extension Study if it had held different views. The Development Bureau would further discuss with the Education Bureau on opinions raised by members on lands for school use.
- (i) The Bureau would consider and set priority for the proposal of construction of Cheung Chau-Lantau Island Bridge in accordance with factors such as value for money and distribution of public resources.
- (j) Further studies would be needed for the transportation link between Lantau, Mui Wo and the future East Lantau Metropolis. The Development Bureau concurred with the view that with the change of population structure and further development of Lantau, enhancement of internal and external transportation of Lantau was necessary and should be carried out at the same time as far as possible, and that the improvement of roads should be prioritized if necessary. The external link of East Lantau Metropolis would be explored in the strategic studies on proposed artificial islands in the central waters.
- (k) The Development Bureau would conduct short-term studies to develop the strategy for overall commercial land use on Lantau and market positioning, strategy for recreational and tourism development, as well as proposal of individual recreational usage. The role of Lantau in streaming visitors to Hong Kong and the need for tourist facilities would also be taken into account. As land resources were very valuable in Hong Kong, Lantau Island was thus a treasure trove and

consideration should be made to allow more creativity and room so as to introduce new impetus for the economy of Hong Kong. Members were welcome to give their opinions in various consultation exercises.

- (1) The Development Bureau and various government departments would endeavour to advance the development of Lantau and active participation of members and co-opted members of the Committee was appreciated.

### III. Question on installation of automatic doors at Fu Tung Plaza

The member who raised the enquiry noted the reply given by the Link and did not raise other opinions.

### IV. Question on follow-up of “Revitalization of Tai O”

The representative of CEDD said that the Department was aware of the importance of two pedestrian bridges to Tai O residents, and thus the Department had been following up on the project all along with the consultant. However, environmental impact assessment (EIA) had to be conducted and the Department was carrying out preliminary works, such as preparation of project profile. The project profile would be submitted to the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) upon its completion. After the issuance of Environment Impact Assessment Study Brief, the consultant would be asked to conduct EIA in accordance with relevant ordinances, and formulate remedial measures.

A member enquired whether the design of the two bridges had been completed.

The representative of CEDD said a competition on the design of the bridges had been held earlier and concepts of entries received would be used as reference. He would follow up with the member on related matters.

### V. Question on requesting Bank of China to install cash deposit machines and passbook update machines in Tung Chung

The Chairman said that replies from Hong Kong Monetary Authority and Bank of China respectively had been related to members before the meeting.

A member gave his views on the reply from Bank of China. Despite being a note-issuing bank, Bank of China lacked commitment in Tung Chung and Lantau Island. As a result, residents often had to go to the Bank's branch offices in Tsuen Wan and the Airport for some basic bank services. He urged the Bank to install more automatic teller machines, cash deposit machines and passbook update machines in Tung Chung as early as possible.

VI. Question on the progress of construction of community and recreational facilities in Tung Chung Area 39

A representative of Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) said that in the planning of sports stadia, the Department had to make reference to the population requirements as stated in Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (the Guidelines) and based on the development of Islands District as a whole. The existing population of Islands District was about 140 000, and there were five sports stadia, which had already met the standard as laid down in the Guidelines. LCSD was aware of the concern of members in that regard, and it was also aware of the Tung Chung New Town Extension Study being implemented. The Department would closely monitor the future development of Tung Chung, and would timely provide sports stadium to fulfil planning pledges.

The Assistant District Officer said that the Islands District Office (ISDO) was aware of members' request of construction of a community hall in Tung Chung. The Government had to take into account various factors in the matter, such as population, local characteristics, similar facilities already existed nearby and their utilization rate etc. The utilization rate of Tung Chung Community Hall at Man Tung Road was around 70 to 75% currently. Its opening hours and opening days had also been extended recently. As there was already the provision of Tung Chung Community Hall and based on the existing population of Tung Chung West, the construction of another community hall was not that urgent. The Planning Department was conducting the Tung Chung New Town Extension Study, and review would also be conducted on the planning and development of the remaining parts of Tung Chung. ISDO would closely monitor the overall development of Tung Chung and its population growth, and would timely review the feasibility of constructing a new community hall in Tung Chung West.

A member said that in the planning of facilities for Tung Chung, the Government should take into account the needs of North Lantau as a whole, rather than simply basing on the average population of Islands District. He enquired whether LCSD had submitted application for funds to conduct preliminary studies and design,

and enquired about the progress and timetable of construction of Tung Chung West Sports Stadium. Furthermore, with reference to the completion of the public housing project in Tung Chung Area 39 in 2018, he enquired whether the Government would consider the construction of a sports stadium or community hall.

The representative of LCSD said that it was still the early stages of planning and many details and technicalities remained unresolved. The Department would seek to resolve the issues and implement relevant projects as early as possible. The public housing project in Tung Chung Area 39 was one of factors the Department was considering. Once there was progress, LCSD would report to Islands District Council (IDC).

The Vice-chairlady said that there was no community facilities in the South-west of Tung Chung, and the population would exceed 50 000 in 2018. She thus urged for early planning of community facilities. She also said that the high utilization rate of the existing Tung Chung Community Hall reflected the lack of facilities in the area.

The District Officer concurred that in considering the proposal of construction of a new community hall, the development of Tung Chung as a whole and its population distribution should also be taken into account. As such, the increase in population brought about by the housing development projects in Tung Chung Areas 39, 56 and 55 had to be factored in. There was a community hall at Man Tung Road currently. After reviewing situations in other areas of Hong Kong, ISDO opined that the priority of construction of a community hall in Tung Chung West was relatively not high. However, ISDO was aware that according to the Tung Chung New Town Extension Study, the future population of Tung Chung would grow substantially and thus departments concerned would strive to materialize the proposal of constructing a community hall in Tung Chung West as early as possible.

A member said that the public housing project in Tung Chung Area 39 would be implemented, and the increase in population had also been pre-determined. He hoped that the Government would make decision as early as possible, and not to wait till 2018 to implement the construction of facilities. He enquired whether the two facilities would be placed within one building complex, or that a sports stadium and a community hall would each be separately built.

A member understood that the Government had to follow the population requirement in its provision of community facilities. However, it had been pointed out in past District Council meetings that if facilities would only be built after adequate population was to be reached, inconvenience would have been caused and harmony

would be adversely affected. As the future population of Tung Chung would certainly be increased substantially according to planning, the Government should think out of the box and handle the matter differently, i.e., provision of facilities only after certain rigid criterion about population was reached.

The representative of LCSD said that with regard to the land reserved for sports stadium in Tung Chung Area 39, LCSD could act as the leading department, in response to the need of Home Affairs Department (HAD) and the District Council, to develop both a sports stadium and a community hall on the land. The Department would consult HAD and then the District Council. As far as the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines were concerned, there was no criterion in regard of community hall, but there were requirements concerning sports stadia. He stressed that there were already five sports stadia in Islands District, but the Department would closely monitor the development of Tung Chung. It would try to act flexibly without deviating from the Guidelines.

VII. Motion opposing the construction of large-scale private columbarium on Cheung Chau

A member said that in response to the proposed amendments to Town Planning Board (the Board) Application no.Y/I-CC/3, Cheung Chau Rural Committee had raised objections in seven written submissions to the Board. Its contents were mainly as follows:

- Cheung Chau residents strongly opposed to changing “green belts” on the island to “Other Specified Uses”, in particular to “columbarium” usage.
- Cheung Chau was small in area, but had a population of more than 40 000. There were not many “green belts” on the island, and thus residents opposed to the proposed amendment.
- Ferry was the only means of external transport for Cheung Chau and existing ferry service was already overloaded. The provision of columbarium would further strain the ferry service during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung Festivals. The facilities on the island would not be able to cope with the additional demand of crowds, and problems of environmental hygiene and traffic would be caused.
- As residents’ representatives, Cheung Chau Rural Committee therefore strongly opposed to the planning application.

A member said that the application had caused nuisance to residents and District Council members of the area. She queried the practice of Planning Department to allow the applicant(s) to submit amendments repeatedly. If approved, the application would have wide implications on the life of Cheung Chau residents. She thus supported the motion.

A member said that all four members of Cheung Chau opposed the planning application. He said that the green belts should not be changed to profit-making private “columbarium” usage.

As there was no amendment to the motion, the Chairman asked members to vote by show of hands. Nineteen members voted to support the motion, and there were none against and two abstentions. The motion was adopted by IDC.

#### VIII. Question on caravans

The representative of EPD responded to the enquiry as follows:

- (a) EPD was responsible for enforcing environmental protection ordinances and not responsible for issuing hotel licenses.
- (b) Locations where caravans were situated had to comply with relevant legislations’ requirements in air, noise and water pollution management, and applications had to be submitted to EPD for relevant licenses. In that regard, it was no different than ordinary commercial establishments or residences. For instance, if there was sewage discharge from the site, license for sewage discharge would be needed. If sewage was transported away by contractors, then no license for sewage discharge would be needed.
- (c) In normal circumstances, caravan sites only involved minor works and would not involve application for EIA permit.

A member said that according to the reply given by HAD, if caravans provided boarding services and if its operation fell within the definition of the Hotel and Guesthouse Accommodation Ordinance (the Ordinance), then a hotel license would be required. However, existing license issuing guidelines did not include caravans into its scope of control. The reply of the Buildings Department also said that caravans did not fall within the scope of Buildings Ordinance. He was perplexed by the two replies and wondered whether caravans were subject to control of the



Ordinance.

A member queried the reply given by HAD. He gave two scenarios to raise doubts on the scope of control of the Ordinance. He concurred with the opinion that caravans were not buildings, and that HAD lacked justifications in citing the Ordinance to regulate caravans.

A member enquired the exact location of the caravans and enquired whether it was private land.

The Vice-chairlady said that she had received a letter from an operator of caravans who said that he/she received a letter from the Government informing him/her that a license was required, but the person did not know through which channel to proceed. She had doubts whether caravans were subject to control of the Ordinance. She understood that the Government was concerned of the environmental hygiene and safety problems caravans might cause. However, she also hoped that the Government would formulate relevant policies or licensing systems, with consideration of advancing local economy and encouraging innovations in mind.

A member said that operators hoped to apply for licenses but government departments did not provide necessary assistance. He said that it was duty-bound for HAD to deal with the matter as it was the license-issuing department. HAD should provide channels for the lawful operation of caravans, if it was to regulate them with the Ordinance.

A member said that it was reasonable to require hotel licenses for operation of caravans, but there was no such precedent. He proposed that the experience of allowing New Territories village houses to operate guest houses be adopted, and conditions be formulated for application for caravan licenses. Flexibility should be allowed in handling these applications to boost the development of that novel industry.

The District Officer responded as follows:

- (a) According to the reply given by HAD, if any premises provided sleeping accommodation with fees charged and if its operation fell within the definition of “hotel” in the Ordinance, then hotel license would be required. The only exemption would be premises the letting period of which was consecutively 28 days or more. According to paragraph 5 of the reply, provision of sleeping accommodation by “fixed” caravans with fees charged, and if its operation fell within the

definition of “hotel” in the Ordinance, then hotel license would be required.

- (b) According to the reply given by the Buildings Department, caravans did not fall within the jurisdiction of Buildings Ordinance. Nonetheless, as pointed out in paragraph 5 of HAD’s reply, caravans to be used as hotels had to meet safety standards prescribed and the land where caravans were placed had to meet the requirements of its prescribed usage. And if the business or relevant activities were subject to control of other ordinances, application for other licenses or permits as required should also be submitted. The requirement mentioned by EPD previously was a case in point. To ensure that safety standards were met, and that residents and neighbourhoods nearby would not be adversely affected, control was necessary for any premises to be operated for a fee-charging accommodation service. To conclude, hotel license would be issued only if requirements in land usage, safety standards and those of relevant ordinances were fulfilled.
- (c) Members could provide information of individual cases mentioned previously after the meeting to be passed on to HAD. HAD would endeavor to provide for and support development in local areas.

The Vice-chairlady hoped that the District Office could provide assistance and relate the request of license application to HAD. She also urged HAD to study the details of issuing licenses.

The District Officer requested that concrete information be passed to the District Office for onward submission to HAD.

A member said that the operation of holiday houses in Islands District had encountered many problems in the past. Under the co-ordination of HAD, the problems were solved. She hoped that HAD would similarly act as a co-ordinator in the current situation and formulate licensing conditions to assist the new industry and the tourist industry.

The member who raised the enquiry clarified that his enquiry did not involve any case in particular. Rather, he raised the enquiry because he hoped that a regulatory system would be planned ahead for an industry that was newly developing. He said that HAD should consult other government departments in controlling caravans, and then proceed to solve the issues step by step.

A member said that the requirements and procedures for issuing licenses were not clear. He hoped that the Government would be flexible in handling the issue so that caravans as an industry could operate lawfully.

IX. Motion on Election of the Chief Executive by Universal Suffrage in 2017

On behalf of another member who was absent, a member read aloud the opinions of the absent member which opposed the motion being raised. The scale and the length of period of the “Umbrella Movement” were unprecedented in the history of Hong Kong, and most of its participants opposed any proposals containing a screening mechanism. He thus urged the Government to restart the “Five-step Process” to respond to the request of Hong Kong people.

A member said that the existing controversy was focused on whether the universal suffrage was a genuine one. She said that the introduction of the “Five-step Process” was a violation of the Basic Law, and the proposed screening mechanism would lead to a farcical universal suffrage. The two-month long occupation movement was a political issue and should be solved by political means. She therefore opposed the motion.

A member said that the ultimate goal of the motion was the realization of one-man-one-vote in the 2017 election for the Chief Executive (“CE”). The proposal was a step ahead towards the ultimate goal, no matter from the angle of realization of stipulations of the Basic Law, or from the angle of the general public or advancing the system one step forward. He therefore supported the motion. He said that the “Umbrella Movement” mentioned earlier should be called “unlawful occupation of the Central”, which had affected the economy and livelihood of the people adversely, torn apart families and the society, and shaken the rule of law.

A member agreed with the saying that political issues should be dealt with by political means. In such case, the issues should be handled at meetings of political councils. The incident therefore was a matter of rule of law.

The Vice-chairlady strongly supported the motion. She believed that the “Five-step Process” would lead to advancement of political development of Hong Kong. The recent controversy was caused by misunderstandings of the contents of the Basic Law. The nearly 80 days of occupation had caused great loss to Hong Kong and she urged the Government to initiate the second round consultation as early as possible.

A member disagreed with some members' opinions. She opined that a universal suffrage with a screening mechanism was in fact a step backward. She said that the CE was the person who had caused the tearing-apart of the society. Hong Kong's image had been damaged in the past two months and it was the responsibility of those who governed.

The Vice-chairlady said that it was stipulated in the Basic Law that nomination of candidates for office of CE had to be carried out by the Nominating Committee. The election of heads of state or chief executives of any place across the globe had to go through a screening process. As such, the constitutional development of Hong Kong had to be advanced in accordance with the provisions of the Basis Law.

A member said that the election of the CE had to go through two processes: nomination and voting. If thresholds for both processes were very high, then one might hold that it was a step backward. The voting process currently proposed was open and seen from that angle, it was a step forward. The demand put forward by people who took part in the unlawful occupation, politicians and some people who claimed themselves to be scholars had departed from the framework of Basic Law. He was disgusted with the actions of adults who started the movement and he would not blame the students. He was appreciative of the performance of the Police.

A member raised the point that Hong Kong people were not allowed to elect the Governor during the rule of the British. Some media had been partial in reporting the law enforcement actions of the Police.

A member said that the court was highly critical of the occupied movement in the judgment of injunctions. By turning themselves in, some people who took part in occupation held that they had not acted against the rule of law. He did not agree with that viewpoint. He said that the constitutional development of Hong Kong had to be advanced in accordance with the provisions of the Basic Law. He supported the motion.

As there was no amendment to the motion, the Chairman asked members to vote by show of hands. Nineteen members voted to support the motion, and there were none against and two abstentions. The motion was adopted by IDC.

#### X. Question on service and number of Lantau Taxi

The representative of the Transport Department said that the 4 000 urban taxis mentioned in the enquiry actually referred to the journeys made by urban taxis in

North Lantau daily. The Transport Department was aware that Lantau residents hoped that more Lantau taxi licenses would be issued. The Government's established policy was that in issuance of new taxi licenses, factors such as the demand for taxi service, the operation conditions of taxi industry and the impact on traffic caused by the number of taxis increased had to be taken into account. The Department was aware of the future developments of Lantau Island, and that with the projected increase of its population and tourists, the demand for traffic would also increase. The Department would closely monitor the situation and would timely review the overall service of public transport on Lantau and would strengthen service if and when necessary. The Department would continue to listen to views from various parties and consider whether to issue more taxi licenses in accordance with established policies.

A member queried that the Transport Department was aware of the shortage of Lantau taxis. She said that a member had raised the issue at a meeting of the previous term of IDC, and four years had passed and the Department was still studying the issue. Lantau was developing all the time and the current number of 50 taxis simply could not meet the demand. She urged the Department to conduct field visits, especially on holidays, and queried that it attached importance only to the opinions of the industry.

A member said that many members and he himself had raised the issue many times before. The Transport Department would respond every time that it was open to proposals and would consider the demand. Many years had passed and the response had remained the same and he was gravely unsatisfied. The population of Lantau had increased very much compared with that of 1997 and only ten more licenses had been issued. The tourist industry of Lantau was developing and the number of Lantau taxis was inadequate. He urged the Department to conduct field inspections.

A member also said that the issue had been discussed many times at IDC meetings and Traffic and Transport Committee meetings. The Transport Department would time and again respond that it would study the issue. He queried the method of collecting statistics conducted by the Department. The taxi association had proposed the issuance of twenty new licenses and the proposal had yet been materialized. He was critical of the Transport Department in its delay to make decisions.

A member said that the number of Lantau taxis was woefully inadequate, and the situation was much worse on holidays. He said that more licenses had to be issued.

A member asked the Transport Department to respond to the demand of members and increased the number of Lantau taxi licenses. She also proposed that urban taxis could be allowed, on a trial basis, to provide service in Lantau area on holidays. She urged the Department to squarely deal with the issue of strong demand for transportation service in Islands District on holidays, as there were many tourist attractions in the area.

The representative of the Transport Department responded as follows:

- (a) The Transport Department had conducted survey on Lantau taxi service every year. The demand for service was strong on holidays and thus the waiting time was longer. On weekdays, the waiting time might only be a few minutes. The Department would closely monitor the situation and collect statistics and would study the issue.
- (b) The Transport Department had to consider the issue from a holistic point of view, and the supply and demand of urban taxi services in Lantau had to be taken into account as well. It would request the Airport Authority to improve the difficulty of catching taxis to go to Tung Chung from the Airport.
- (c) As South Lantau was a conservation area, the proposal of allowing urban taxis to provide service in the region had to be considered carefully.

XI. Project No. 7417RO-1A Improvement Works at Tai O - Phase 2 Stage 1

Members supported the project proposal and hoped that works could begin as early as possible.

XII. Draft Po Toi Islands Outline Zoning Plan No. S/I-PTI/C

A member hoped that the authorities would achieve a balance between the opinions of the local people and those of the conservations, i.e., needs in development would be taken into account at the same time as conserving the natural environment. The areas planned as green belts, marine reserves, conservation areas were extensive. She urged the Government to provide suitable facilities for the islands, and not to include private lands into conservation areas.

A member welcomed the preparation of OZP for Po Toi Islands, which would control the usage of lands. In 2011/12, plants were felled in southwest of Po Toi Island and concrete planks were laid on the land. She enquired whether the land was government land and what law enforcement actions had been taken.

The Chairman said that as far as he understood it, the land was private land.

The representative of the Lands Department also replied that the land was private land, and he would provide after the meeting information of law enforcement and remedial actions taken.

The member was critical of the performance of the representatives of the Lands Department at the meeting.

A member said that many lands were planned as green belts and conservation areas and that would hinder development. He said that Po Toi Islands needed electricity and water supplies.

The Chairman supported the planning of land usage on Po Toi Islands, but said that there was over-emphasis on greening and conservation, and that needs of residents had not been taken into account. The inclusion of private lands into conservation area would affect development and livelihood of the people. He stressed that the Government should maintain a balance between conservation and development.

A member enquired whether objections had been received when the draft OZP was submitted to TPB.

The representative of the Planning Department responded as follows:

- (a) Several years before, the Planning Department separately received opinions supporting and opposing the draft plan. It also received opinions supporting and opposing the draft OZP for the current time. The conservations hoped that there would be more controls while the local people would hope to have more room for development. The Planning Department would continue to listen to various parties and endeavor to achieve a proper balance.
- (b) The Planning Department had all along discussed with relevant government departments about details of planning. The planning of green belts, marine reserves and conservation areas were arrived at

after considering professional advice received from relevant departments.

- (c) In respect of “village type development”, the Planning Department was aware of members’ concerns, and would take a “gradual increase” approach in handling development of villages. The need of small houses in the next ten years would be taken into account, as well as the local environment. Construction of houses would be planned mainly in areas where existing houses were congregated, and temporary structures in the vicinity of the pier would be rebuilt as permanent structures.
- (d) The Planning Department had all along maintained contact with relevant government departments on provision of electricity and water supplies to Po Toi Islands. But as far as it was understood, there was no plan currently for such provisions. The Government could go ahead with infrastructure projects on the islands if there were such needs.
- (e) In regard of opinions given by members, the Planning Department would carefully conduct assessment on the impact on the environment and discuss with government departments concerned and then report to TPB.

The Vice-chairlady said that the residents were not one-sidedly against the planning. Rather, they hoped that the Government would take into account their needs in housing and facilities. She proposed that existing planning be enhanced to provide for needs in development.

A member opined that the consultation conducted by the Planning Department was not adequate. She urged the Government to endeavor to eliminate the worries of residents and tourists, and advance the development of tourism on the islands.

Islands District Council Secretariat  
February 2015