

(Translation)

Minutes of Meeting of Islands District Council

Date : 23 October 2017 (Monday)
Time : 2:00 p.m.
Venue : Islands District Council Conference Room,
14/F, Harbour Building, 38 Pier Road, Central, Hong Kong.

Present

Chairman

Mr CHOW Yuk-tong, SBS

Vice-Chairman

Mr YU Hon-kwan, Randy, JP

Members

Mr YUNG Chi-ming, BBS
Mr CHAN Lin-wai
Mr CHEUNG Fu
Mr WONG Hon-kuen, Ken
Mr LOU Cheuk-wing
Mr WONG Man-hon
Ms YU Lai-fan
Ms LEE Kwai-chun
Ms YUNG Wing-sheung, Amy
Mr TANG Ka-piu, Bill, JP
Mr CHOW Ho-ding, Holden
Ms TSANG Sau-ho, Josephine
Mr KWOK Ping, Eric
Ms FU Hiu-lam, Sammi

Attendance by Invitation

Mr CHAN Chung-ching, Thomas , JP	Director of Lands, Lands Department
Mr TANG Lung-cheung	Chief Land Executive (District Lands Office/Islands), Lands Department
Ms LOU Yin-yee, Joanne	Senior Estate Surveyor, Lands Department
Mr TANG Wai-tung	Senior Health Inspector (Environmental Hygiene/Islands), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Dr LUK Wan	Consultant, Family Medicine & Public Health Care Services, Kowloon West Cluster, Hospital Authority
Dr LOH Lai-ting, Taron	Senior Medical & Health Officer (Community Liaison), Department of Health

Mr LEUNG Chiu-keung, Kenneth	Senior Engineer, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr LAM Hon-wa	Senior Engineer, Drainage Services Department
Ms TANG Ka-yuet, Annie	Engineer, Drainage Services Department
Mr CHAN Wai-ho	Divisional Commander (Marine and Off-shore Islands), Fire Services Department
Mr LI Kai-chung	Station Commander of Tai O Fire Station, Fire Services Department
Ms CHAU Shuk-man, Anthea	Corporate Communications Manager, New World First Ferry Service Limited
Mr CHAN Tin-lung, Benny	Deputy General Manager, New Lantau Bus Company Limited
Mr WONG Wah	Administrative Consultant, New Lantau Bus Company Limited
Mr LI Kin-lok, Kevin	Public Affairs Manager, Citybus Limited/ New World First Bus Services Limited

In Attendance

Mr LI Ping-wai, Anthony, JP	District Officer (Islands), Islands District Office
Mr AU Sheung-man, Benjamin	Assistant District Officer (Islands)1, Islands District Office
Ms CHONG Yan-yee, Belinda	Assistant District Officer (Islands)2, Islands District Office
Mr FONG Kai-kit, Frankie	Senior Liaison Officer (1), Islands District Office
Ms CHAN Hing-kwan, Patty	Senior Liaison Officer (2), Islands District Office
Mr WONG Kwok-fai, Alfred	Chief Engineer/Islands, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms TAM Yin-ping, Donna	District Planning Officer (Sai Kung and Islands), Planning Department
Mrs CHEUNG LO Pik-yuk, Helen	Chief Manager/Management (Hong Kong Island and Islands), Housing Department
Mr LI Kin-nga, Denis	District Lands Officer/Islands, Lands Department
Mr WONG Tat-ming	Administrative Assistant (Lands/Islands), Lands Department
Mr LAM Ding-fung	District Social Welfare Officer (Central Western, Southern and Islands), Social Welfare Department
Mr HO Ka-fei, Kelvin	Deputy District Commander (Lantau), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr SHERIDAN RICHARD, BRINSLEY	District Commander (Marine Port), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr CHAN Chun	Police Community Relations Officer (Lantau District), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr LAM Wai-kit	Acting Police Community Relations Officer (Marine Port District), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr MOK Ying-kit, Kenneth	Chief Transport Officer/NT South West, Transport Department
Mr KWAN Yau-kee	District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Islands), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Mr CHAU Chun-wing, Tomy	District Leisure Manager (Islands), Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Secretary

Ms Candy CHAN	Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Islands District Office
---------------	---

Absent with Apology

Mr FAN Chi-ping

Mr KWONG Koon-wan

~~~~~

**Welcoming remarks**

The Chairman welcomed Members and representatives of the government departments to the meeting and introduced the following representatives of the government departments who attended the meeting:

- (a) Mr HO Ka-fei, Kelvin, Deputy District Commander (Lantau) of Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF) who attended the meeting in place of Mrs MAK LAU Wai-mun, Josephine; and
- (b) Mr LAM Wai-kit, Acting Police Community Relations Officer (Marine Port District) of HKPF who attended the meeting in place of Mr YUEN King-ho.

2. Members noted that Mr FAN Chi-ping and Mr KWONG Koon-wan were unable to attend the meeting due to other commitments.

I. **Visit of the Director of Lands to Islands District Council**

3. The Chairman welcomed Mr CHAN Chung-ching, Thomas, JP, Director of Lands to the meeting for exchange with Members. He was also pleased to welcome Mr TANG Lung-cheung, Chief Land Executive (District Lands Office/Islands) and Ms LOU Yin-ye, Joanne, Senior Estate Surveyor of Lands Department (LandsD).

4. Mr Thomas CHAN outlined the work of LandsD including land grant (e.g. land disposal, land grant, lease modification, land exchange and approval of short term tenancy), land resumption and clearance, land administration (e.g. land control and lease enforcement) as well as land survey and mapping with the aid of PowerPoint Presentation.

5. Ms Amy YUNG expressed her views as follows:

- (a) Discovery Bay (DB) might be the only place in Hong Kong which developed by phases according to the Master Layout Plan (MLP). With phased development, the developer could change the land uses set out in MLP according to its development plan. The Director of Audit's Report No. 43 promulgated on 23 October 2004 stated that the developer was not charged with a premium for changes in land use. As a result, both the Government and individual land owners suffered

losses, and the revised development plan was completely different from the original development concept. After the severe reprimand by the Director of Audit, she thought that LandsD would carefully process the developer's applications in future. Regretfully, the department had failed to perform the duty of gate-keeper properly for the past ten years or so.

- (b) The Deed of Mutual Covenant (DMC) of DB stipulated that GBA should be used as the management unit which measured from the outside of the external walls. However, starting from 1999 and 2000, the developer used the gross floor area (GFA), instead of GBA, as the measurement when submitting DMC to the Legal Advisory and Conveyancing Office (LACO) of LandsD, with the exclusion clauses enclosed. As such, the management share of the developer in the new development (hotel in particular) was much reduced upon the apportionment of management fee, and individual landowners bore a substantial share of management fee since GBA was used as the measurement. She hoped the Director would instruct LACO to examine the land applications of the developer thoroughly. Authorised Persons appointed by the developer submitted applications with the statutory declarations of solicitors enclosed. LACO then approved the applications without further verification or consulting residents, thus aggravating the discrepancies for more than ten years.
- (c) LandsD said it would enforce lease conditions and rectify irregularities, if any. She asked how many cases were rectified by the department since 2004. While LACO said with the excuse that it trusted the Authorised Persons and solicitors of the developer, she asked whether legal actions would be taken against deliberate omissions or false representations. All developments, residential developments in particular, in DB were subject to the DMC. She requested LandsD to instruct LACO after the meeting to provide details of the management units of DB approved in tabulated form.
- (d) She opined that Director of Lands, being an official representative of the Town Planning Board (TPB), should perform the duty of gate-keeper when approving the development applications of developers to ascertain whether the areas concerned exceeded the management unit and the method used in calculation of management fees was fair and equitable and if other owners were affected. She hoped the Director would urge LACO to follow up on the matter seriously.

6. Mr Bill TANG expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He hoped LandsD would pay attention to and facilitate the future development of Islands District. On the small house policy, he enquired about the progress of processing small house applications and

the approval progress of Islands District in comparison with other parts of the New Territories. Of the 18 districts in Hong Kong, Islands District was the largest in terms of area but with a relatively small population. There were more than 70 villages within the district but only 69 small house applications were approved. He opined that the approval progress was not satisfactory. Small house was an issue of public concern, and the Government should not evade it. He enquired whether the Government would review the small house policy, e.g. implementing the proposal for building multi-storey small house developments to establish a centralised ownership and provide more storeys with a view to accelerating the approval progress and releasing more land.

- (b) The government departments indicated support for and would facilitate the organisation of bazaars, including permitting the holding of bazaars on private agricultural land. However, a stall owner had earlier tried to install electrical devices and fans, etc. on private agricultural land but the District Lands Office (Islands) (DLO/Islands) implemented enforcement actions immediately and demanded the clearance of structures. He enquired whether the definition of structures on agricultural land covered bazaar facilities. He hoped that clear guidelines would be issued for holding of bazaars on private agricultural land and the construction of structures thereon.

7. Mr Eric KWOK said that, on lease enforcement, the Sustainable Lantau Blueprint (Blueprint) identified Tai O, Shui Hau and Pui O with conservation values but most of the land was private agricultural land and might be developed by land owners by means of “destroy first and develop later” (e.g. landfilling) before incorporation in the conservation scheme. The Blueprint stated that the departments would step up enforcement against illegal dumping on private agricultural land. He cited Pui O Beach as an example where refuse dumping was found in the vicinity although part of Pui O was zoned “Coastal Protection Area” and “Green Belt” under the South Lantau Coast Outline Zoning Plan (OZP). Loopholes arose as no enforcement power was granted under the OZP. LandsD could only follow up and conduct investigation after a breach of lease conditions was found, hence worsening the situation. He proposed the setting up of a conservation fund for special purpose to acquire private land in South Lantau with conservation value (including the private agricultural land in Tai O, Pui O and Shui Hau) in line with the direction of conservation for the South as set out in the Blueprint.

8. Mr Holden CHOW expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He welcomed the recent debut of shared bicycles in Tung Chung, although he was concerned that the mode of operation might give rise to illegal parking problem, etc. He noticed that bicycles were parked randomly and hoped that the relevant departments would take enforcement actions to avoid adverse impacts on the surrounding environment and the public.

- (b) It was the responsibility of the bicycle-sharing operator to deal with the illegally-parked bicycles. Apart from enforcement actions, he asked whether the department would request the operator to conduct routine surveillance to ensure that the users would not park the bicycles randomly. If arrangements were made by the operator and the departments for proper monitoring and enforcement against illegal parking, he believed the public would welcome the new bicycle-sharing mode of operation.

9. Ms YU Lai-fan expressed her views as follows:

- (a) Islands District was large in area and the use of bicycles was common among residents. However, the relevant legislation was outdated, making it difficult for LandsD to carry out land administration. Illegal bicycle parking was now serious in Lamma, Mui Wo and Cheung Chau. Inter-departmental joint operations failed to achieve the desired result. Bicycles were causing obstruction on the pavement. On bicycle sharing, Islands District was already facing the problem of illegally-parked bicycles. She hoped LandsD would pay attention and review the situation.
- (b) There were many slopes in Islands District with trees growing abundantly. Residents in Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island reflected that if the trees were not trimmed frequently, loads of leaves would fall and accumulate as garbage beside the residential areas, attracting mosquitoes and insects. She hoped LandsD would pay attention to the matter.
- (c) The Vegetation Contract Management Teams under LandsD were set up in 2016. There were a total of three teams, one responsible for New Territories West (including Islands District). To ensure public safety, the management teams trimmed or removed trees which posed a danger, and she appreciated their work which achieved good result. In view of the large area covered by the New Territories West team, she hoped LandsD would conduct a review and allocate more manpower and resources for effective management of trees in Islands District.

10. Ms LEE Kwai-chun said it now took about two and a half months before dangerous or dead trees could be dealt with. If road obstruction was caused, the Fire Services Department (FSD) would remove the dangerous or dead trees. She hoped LandsD could expedite the process of tree management.

11. Mr LOU Cheuk-wing expressed his views as follows:

- (a) It now took around two years for processing applications for redevelopment of small houses on private land. In view of the length of time required, the money reserved earlier might not be enough to

cover the costs of the entire project. In addition, the compliance certificate was not issued long after the small house was completed, sometimes over two years.

- (b) Much of the government land was now managed by LandsD. A piece of land now used as the venue of Chinese opera could not drain freely, and stagnant water was accumulated on rainy days, attracting mosquito breeding, thus affecting public health. Residents hoped that the land would be levelled. He also hoped that LandsD would open the government land not yet allocated for public use temporarily.

(Post-meeting note: Regarding the accumulation of stagnant water, arrangement had been made by DLO/Islands for the contractor to carry out works to clear stagnant water from the government land near Lung Tin Estate, Tai O.)

12. Mr Thomas CHAN made a consolidated response as follows:

Development of Discovery Bay

- (a) The matters of DB involved many facets. First, its overall planning was subject to the Discovery Bay OZP. For the role of TPB, he, being a member on the board, was not in a position to comment on its operation. Second, the land lease of DB fell under the ambit of LandsD, which considered all development applications (including amendments to the original MLP) in accordance with the land leases using a set of uniform criteria and assessed and demanded any premium payable under established mechanism. Third, for undivided shares of a building under DMC, DMC was a contractual agreement among the owners of the building. According to the land lease, LandsD scrutinized the sub-DMC applications which was executed by the owners or appointed managers.
- (b) The department understood the concerns of the households of DB. For future new developments involving sub-DMC, apart from requiring to specify in the sub-DMC the apportionment of undivided shares of the development, it would consider requiring the developers to specify whether the undivided shares were allocated from the undivided shares in their names so that the individual owners would know more about the apportionment of undivided shares

Small house policy and applications

- (c) The number of small house applications approved and the approval progress in Islands District from 2015/16 to 2017/18 were similar as in the past years. Close liaison were maintained between LandsD and the Heung Yee Kuk for the approval progress of the applications. A monitoring mechanism was in place to monitor the number of small house applications as well as the area covered.

- (d) The review of small house policy was the ambit of the Development Bureau (DEVB). The role of LandsD was to approve applications according to the prevailing small house policy

#### Redevelopment Applications for New Territories Exempted House (NTEH)

- (e) Members were concerned about the relatively long time required for approving redevelopment applications. During 2015/16 and 2016/17, about 40 cases were approved. Subject to complexity of cases, 18 to 30 months or so would be required for processing. Redevelopment applications for NTEH were more complex. For cases involving old deeds, more handling procedures would be involved. LandsD would closely monitor the progress and allocate more manpower to speed up the process where necessary.

#### Organisation of bazaars on agricultural land

- (f) On the organisation of bazaars, it depended on the policy direction of the bureaux on bazaars, and LandsD would give full support for serving community purposes via land administration. For instance, it could consider granting government land through short-term tenancy or permit a change in land use via short-term waiver for holding bazaars on private agricultural land. Bazaar policy fell under the ambit of the Food and Health Bureau (FHB). FHB had earlier indicated that measures would be implemented to facilitate the holding of bazaars. Members could convey their views to FHB, and LandsD would give support via land administration as best as it could.

#### Conservation of private agricultural land

- (g) A main duty of LandsD was lease enforcement. According to a court decision in the 1980s, although agricultural land held under Block Government Lease was not subject to land use restrictions, it did not mean that all sorts of activities could be carried out thereon, including construction of structures without authorisation. The use of private agricultural land was also subject to the applicable provisions of the Town Planning Ordinance and statutory plans. It was understood that no enforcement power was vested under the South Lantau Coast OZP. DEVB, when compiling the Blueprint, received lots of feedback on the conservation initiatives on South Lantau. The relevant issues were under review and LandsD would co-operate when the need arose.
- (h) The setting up of conservation fund was within the policy areas of the Environment Bureau (ENB). The Policy Address of this year also mentioned that effort would be devoted to carry out countryside revitalisation and the setting up of a conservation fund.



#### Illegal parking of bicycles

- (i) Bicycle sharing was a new business model. If illegal parking was found, LandsD would take enforcement actions in collaboration with other departments, including the posting of notices and removal of bicycles upon expiry of the time specified in the notices. Regarding the suggestions on requiring the bicycle operator to step up the management of bicycles to prevent illegal parking, the matter was within the scope of bicycle management at the district level. It was being monitored by the Steering Committee on District Administration under the Home Affairs Bureau and LandsD would convey Members' views to the committee.

#### Vegetation management

- (j) Trees were grown abundantly in the countryside of Islands District. Slope or vegetation management was the responsibility of LandsD. Regarding the government land management (tree trimming and grass cutting and mosquito control in particular), LandsD had to make use of limited resources to handle the vast quantity of government land. As such, District Council members or members of the local community were welcome to provide input to help set priorities to allocate resources to areas that were more pressing and of public concern. It was hoped that more resources would be available to enhance the management of government land. On the division of work among government departments, the trimming of trees in parks as well as on roads and pavements was, in general, the responsibility of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) or the Highways Department (HyD), while the trees on unallocated government land were maintained by LandsD

(Mr Bill TANG left the meeting at about 2:45 p.m.)

## II. Confirmation of the Minutes of Meeting held on 4 September 2017

13. The Chairman said that the captioned minutes had incorporated the amendments proposed by the government departments and Members, and had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

14. The captioned minutes were confirmed unanimously without amendment.

## III. Question on problems facing the community with increasing population after intake of Mui Wo Home Ownership Scheme flats next year (Paper IDC 112/2017)

15. The Chairman welcomed Mr MOK Ying-kit, Kenneth, Chief Transport Officer/NT South West of Transport Department (TD), Mr Kelvin HO, Deputy

District Commander (Lantau) of HKPF, Dr LUK Wan, Consultant of Family Medicine & Public Health Care Services, Kowloon West Cluster, Hospital Authority (HA), Ms CHAU Shuk-man, Anthea, Corporate Communications Manager of New World First Ferry Service Limited (NWFF) as well as Mr CHAN Tin-lung, Benny, Deputy General Manager and Mr WONG Wah, Administrative Consultant of New Lantau Bus Company Limited (NLB) to the meeting to respond to the question. The written reply of TD had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

16. The Vice-Chairman Mr Randy YU presented the question.
17. Mr Kenneth MOK briefly introduced the written reply of TD.
18. Mr Kelvin HO responded as follows:
  - (a) Regarding the impacts on policing with the population growth after the intake of Mui Wo Home Ownership Scheme (HOS) flats and Ying Tung and Mun Tung Estates, the Police District had, before the intake, begun to examine the crime situation and conduct risk assessment in respect of the law and order, traffic and social problems, etc. after the intake. It would closely monitor the latest situation in order to make appropriate policing arrangements.
  - (b) The Police would deploy extra manpower in view of the population increase after the intake. Before the completion of Mui Wo public housing development, Lantau Police District would set up a task force comprising intelligence, anti-triad and police public relations personnel to maintain good communication and exchange views with various departments and stakeholders within the district on the possible social problems arising from the population increase upon the completion of public housing development to ensure that appropriate arrangements were made beforehand.
  - (c) During the intake of Mui Wo public housing development, the New Territories South Regional Headquarters and the Anti-triad Unit (Lantau) would take appropriate actions to prevent triad members or bad elements from monopolising flat decoration works through unlawful means or committing other illegal acts. The Police District would deploy sufficient manpower to implement the performance pledges, work with the Housing Department (HD) to conduct publicity campaigns, set up hotlines for residents to report crimes and step up patrols and set up neighbourhood police office during the intake to improve communication with the public.
  - (d) On traffic, the Police District would maintain close liaison with TD to take enforcement actions in line with the latter's future traffic arrangements so as to ensure smooth traffic flow and enhance pedestrian safety. In addition, the Police District would continue to take enforcement actions against vehicles travelling on closed roads

without a closed road permit. Road blocks would be set up on Tung Chung Road to intercept vehicles and summons would be issued to drivers for entering South Lantau without a permit.

19. Dr LUK Wan said that HA had put in place an established mechanism to monitor the usage of general out-patient clinic services regularly. The usage of Mui Wo Clinic would be kept in view after the intake of Mui Wo development next year. The cluster management would be mindful of the demand of Islands District, especially the increase in the number of consultations after the completion of Mui Wo development next year and would maintain close liaison with the head office with due consideration on human resource planning.

20. Ms Anthea CHAU responded as follows:

- (a) NWFF keeps monitoring its services, including the demand of passengers, ferry deployment and fares to ensure that appropriate arrangements were made according to the situation. Earlier this year, noting that the intake of Mui Wo HOS flats would begin in the third quarter of next year, NWFF had requested the assistance of TD several months beforehand to obtain from relevant government departments the population and working population projections of Mui Wo in the coming years so as to formulate the plan for the ferry services of Mui Wo comprehensively.
- (b) On ferry fares, monthly tickets are provided to residents commute between Mui Wo and the urban areas. Monthly ticket users of Mui Wo could normally get a discount ranging from 24-45 percent. Users could get a discount of up to 46 percent provided that they travelled in ordinary class for the whole month of, say, November and did not change to deluxe class or fast ferry by paying the fare difference. In addition, to enable residents to enjoy concessions during holidays, holiday round-trip tickets are available for trips between Mui Wo and the urban areas in the same fare as weekdays. Under the non-means tested Public Transport Fare Subsidy Scheme (the subsidy scheme) announced recently, monthly ticket users would be eligible for the subsidy, which might help further allay the concerns of people going to move to Mui Wo over the ferry fares.
- (c) On carrying capacity, the overall patronage of Mui Wo ferry route is closely monitored by NWFF. The average patronage of the Mui Wo ferry was only about 30-odd percent in recent years, with less than 40 percent on average during the morning and evening peak hours, i.e. 6 a.m. to 8.30 a.m. as well as 6 p.m. to 8 p.m. During holidays, using the last summer holiday and festive periods such as the Golden Week as reference, the overall patronage was similar at about 20-30 percent although a few fast ferries had a higher patronage of 80-90 percent. If a ferry was full, extra sailing would be deployed where circumstances permitted.

- (d) NWFF would upgrade its five 403-seater fast ferries progressively, with each offering 20 more seats. The upgrading work for two ferries had been completed and they were now in service. It was expected that all five fast ferries would each have a boost of 20 extra seats early next year and the carrying capacity of fast ferries would be further increased. According to the statistics mentioned just now, there was still abundant capacity on the ferries of Mui Wo route to meet the demand of the new residents of Mui Wo. Nevertheless, NWFF would monitor closely any changes in the carrying capacity. Members were also welcome to provide more information for it to formulate comprehensive planning.

21. Mr Benny CHAN said that NLB had proposed the use of double deckers for route 3M plying between Tung Chung and Mui Wo with an expected increase in carrying capacity of about 40-50 percent. The bus company would monitor closely the population increase and demand in the district and continue to keep under review route 3M with TD for adjustment where necessary.

22. The Vice-Chairman Mr Randy YU expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He asked whether the cost of ferry monthly tickets would be included as transport expenses under the subsidy scheme if they were bought with Octopus cards so that people with transport expenses exceeding the prescribed amount were eligible for the subsidy.
- (b) He appreciated that HA monitored the general out-patient clinic services continuously with adjustments made according to the changes in the number of consultations after population intake. He hoped HA would provide the monitoring schedule and monitor the usage of out-patient clinic services and the staffing arrangement in different periods, e.g. before population intake and three or six months after population intake to set people's mind at ease.
- (c) He understood that Mui Wo ferries, in general, still had spare capacity but some sailings were up to 80-90 percent full and residents, in some cases, could not get onboard as the ferries were full. Although the average loading of 7 a.m. to 9 a.m. sailings was acceptable, the one at 7 a.m. was always full. He believed the future residents would take the 6 a.m. and 7 a.m. ferries and hoped that NWFF would make special arrangements, e.g. deploy extra sailings, arrange ferries with larger capacity or permanently reserve a standby ferry for extra sailing as an interim measure during the first three months after population intake to allay residents' concerns.
- (d) According to the written reply of TD, HD had conducted traffic impact assessment for Mui Wo HOS development during the planning stage and considered the traffic impacts brought by the development "acceptable". If "acceptable", did it mean the residents found

acceptable or the department found acceptable? It was said that parking spaces for private cars and bicycles were provided according to the relevant planning standards. He did not agree that the new parking spaces provided for private cars were adequate. Although over 50 parking spaces were provided by HD and an additional 90 spaces would be provided near the former New Territories Heung Yee Kuk Southern District Secondary School (NTHYKSDSS), about 300 vehicles were parked illegally in Mui Wo every night. The new parking spaces were just like a drop in the ocean and could not meet the demand of the rising population. Although it was difficult to address the problem, he could not accept TD's reply and its claim that the traffic impacts were "acceptable". He was afraid that more serious community problems would be caused in a year. He hoped TD would follow up proactively and take actions accordingly.

23. Mr WONG Man-hon said since there were already 135 parking spaces for private cars in Mui Wo area, the plan to provide 188 parking spaces meant there would be an actual increase of just 33 rather than 90 parking spaces. He opined that the written reply of TD was misleading and questioned whether the said parking spaces could meet the demand of residents of the new HOS flats. TD stated in the written reply that there were 1 500 parking spaces for bicycles in Mui Wo and that according to observation, the bicycle parking spaces near Mui Wo Pier were not yet saturated. He opined the above claim was open to question. Bicycle clearance operations were conducted in Mui Wo regularly. He did not think it should wait till the commencement of improvements work at Mui Wo, Phase II to increase the parking spaces.

24. Mr Holden CHOW said that many districts were facing a shortage of parking spaces. The new building projects of the Government encroached upon the parking spaces but no new parking spaces were provided in compensation, and no adequate parking spaces were provided to meet the demand of rising population. He urged the Government to make comprehensive planning to respond to the demand of the local community. He emphasised that with the large number of residential flats provided, the Government should ensure that sufficient parking spaces were provided, otherwise the residents would encounter parking problem due to a shortage of parking spaces.

25. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Aspiring buyers of Mui Wo HOS flats reflected that there was a severe shortage of kindergarten and primary school in Mui Wo.
- (b) He asked whether HD considered encouraging social welfare organisations to provide services when launching HOS development in Mui Wo; and if not, how the family or youth problems that might occur would be dealt with.

- (c) Although NLB would be using double deckers to run route 3M, it should not just satisfy the demand of Mui Wo passengers. People waiting in the bus stops enroute (such as Pui O) should also be taken care of, otherwise structural problems would emerge if they could not get onboard because the buses were packed.
- (d) Illegal parking was serious in Mui Wo but TD and the Planning Department did not face up to the issue. The Policy Address mentioned the goal to develop Hong Kong into a smart city. One of the features of a smart city was construction of high-rise developments. Earlier, Members had suggested the construction of multi-storey car parks. He queried why the departments did not consider the proposal. He urged the departments to address the shortage of parking spaces in Mui Wo.

26. Mr Kenneth MOK made a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) The subsidy scheme was still being studied and it would need time to work out the detailed arrangements. To his knowledge, the scheme covered the payment of ferry fares (including single-trip ticket and monthly ticket) with Octopus cards. He would convey the concerns and views of Members to the colleagues of relevant sections for consideration during the formulation of the details of the scheme.
- (b) TD had been striving to increase the parking spaces for private cars in Mui Wo. In addition to the 50 parking spaces for private cars in the housing estates and 90 parking spaces near NTHYKSDSS, it had proposed to use the playground of NTHYKSDSS as a temporary car park under short-term tenancy and also provide 30-plus roadside parking spaces in Mui Wo Town Centre for private cars, but the proposal was met with opposition from the local community and could not be implemented. TD would look for sites proactively for additional parking spaces. It was now exploring the feasibility of allocating the Nam Pin Wai drainage reserve for temporary car park and associated infrastructure under short-term tenancy.
- (c) The problem of shortage of bicycle parking spaces would be conveyed to the colleagues of the relevant sections. When planning for new bicycle parking spaces, TD would request the relevant departments to adopt the new parking rack design, such as double-deck racks for bicycle parking to provide more parking spaces. It would continue to follow up on the issue proactively.

27. Dr LUK Wan appreciated the concerns of Members. Service capacity of Mui Wo General Outpatient Clinic had not reached saturation. HA would monitor closely to obtain information about population health after the intake, including the possibility of patients with chronic diseases referred to Mui Wo clinic for follow-up treatment. Members are rest assured that appropriate actions would be taken if the

usage of Mui Wo outpatient services rose sharply or reached saturation after the intake.

28. Ms Anthea CHAU responded as follows:

- (a) The sailings departed at 7 a.m. and 8:30 a.m. had the highest level of patronage. Fast ferries with the largest capacity (with 403 seats) were now deployed to run the 7 a.m. sailing, and the number of seats onboard would also be increased from 403 to 423 soon. It was expected that there would be vacant seats to cope with the passenger demand.
- (b) According to the statistics collected at the start of school year in September, there were still over 50 vacant seats on the 403-seater fast ferries in the 7 a.m. sailing. If passengers increased substantially in future, NWFF would review the situation.
- (c) 403- or 231-seater fast ferries were used to run the 8:30 a.m. sailing subject to the availability of ferries. As 231-seater fast ferries were used in September, a higher level of patronage at about 80 percent or above was recorded. If bigger fast ferries were used, the patronage would drop to about 40 percent. If passengers were expected to increase persistently in the coming year, NWFF would deploy larger fast ferries for the sailing where possible.
- (d) As the vessel resources were rather stretched during the morning peak hours, the provision of a permanent standby ferry might not be feasible. Nonetheless, if notification was received from schools or organisations that group tours would take the ferry at the busy time, NWFF would try to arrange a standby ferry where possible so as to reduce the impacts on people going to work or school. Arrangements would be made as far as possible if prior notification was received.

29. Mr Benny CHAN said the bus company now arranged 4 additional trips travelling from Pui O to Tung Chung from 6:50 a.m. to 8:20 a.m. with patronage of about 70-80 percent. The bus company would monitor the alighting and boarding of passengers at the stops enroute and make adjustments where necessary.

30. The Vice-Chairman Mr Randy YU expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He appreciated that NWFF deployed standby ferry where necessary. The intake of new HOS flats began in August next year but as residents would not move in simultaneously, there would be time for review of the situation and arrangement. Take the 7 a.m. sailing as an example. The population of Mui Wo would increase by 30-40 percent upon the completion of population intake. The spare capacity of 10 percent in the 7 a.m. sailing as a buffer would not be enough. He suggested NWFF deploy the standby ferry during the morning rush hours in

September 2018 for a month as an interim measure and then make adjustments according to the statistics.

- (b) As the majority of residents in Islands District used monthly tickets, he hoped the department would include the costs of monthly tickets as transport expenses under the subsidy scheme.
- (c) He hoped HA would closely monitor the usage of Mui Wo General Outpatient Clinic services starting from September next year. He would also follow up via the Hospital Governing Committee of North Lantau Hospital.
- (d) The proposal of providing temporary parking spaces at Nam Pin Wai had been under discussion for some time, but has yet to be implemented. The parking problem in Mui Wo was worrying with the commencement of population intake of new HOS flats next year. He hoped the representative of TD would conduct site visit of Nam Pin Wai with the member of the constituency and the staff of relevant departments and then formulate comprehensive planning. It was hoped that initial results could be reached in three months for early implementation of the proposal.

(Post-meeting note: TD had arranged a meeting with the member of the constituency and the staff of Islands District Office (IsDO) and relevant departments on 17 November 2017 to look into the parking problem in Mui Wo.)

31. The Chairman hoped that the relevant government departments and organisations would consider and follow up on the views of Members.

IV. Question on transport, hygiene and safety concerns relating to large events held at Tai Pak beach, Discovery Bay  
(Paper IDC 113/2017)

32. The Chairman welcomed Mr TANG Wai-tung, Senior Health Inspector (Environmental Hygiene/Islands) of Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) to the meeting. HKR International Ltd. and the Discovery Bay Services Management Ltd. (DBSML) were unable to arrange representatives to attend the meeting but had provided a written reply for Members' perusal. The written reply of FEHD had also been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

33. Ms Amy YUNG presented the paper.

34. Mr TANG Wai-tung briefly introduced the written reply of FEHD.



35. Ms Amy YUNG expressed deep regret that HKR International Ltd. and DBSML had, as usual, failed to arrange representatives to respond to the question, and she expressed her views as follows:

- (a) The holding of large events at Tai Pak beach had been causing problems for years and the situation had become worsened. She urged FEHD to step up monitoring (the traffic and transport in particular) upon the granting of licence. She cited an example that the shuttle buses primarily served the residents rather than visitors but large numbers of visitors used the shuttle buses while large-scale events were held, making it difficult for the residents to board the buses. Residents had to wait for over half an hour at the bus stops in Sunny Bay and Tung Chung under the scorching heat and complaints were made continually via the hotline 1823. She had also called the complaint hotline of DB many times but the line was always busy. On many occasions, she saw police vehicles entering the venue, which was worrying. A number of large engineering vehicles were also parked on the sloping emergency vehicular access, posing a safety risk.
- (b) On the day of event, she received many complaints from DB residents about noise nuisance caused by the event. Some residents even lodged a complaint to FEHD and the Environmental Protection Department (EPD). After the event, rubbish and food remnants were found at the bund and outside the litter bins, providing a breeding ground for insects and rodents. Rodents had been found in a number of housing courts of DB since this summer.
- (c) Although DB was a private development, Tai Pak beach was a public open space and it was incumbent upon LandsD to maintain it. She believed LandsD had developed a set of standard for maintenance of public open space in private developments. She opined that there was insufficient supervision of the holding of large-scale events in public open space, resulting in continuous complaints. She requested FEHD to consult LandsD on matters such as the arrangement and implementation of management measures for the activities to ascertain that they were up to standard and to exercise stringent control upon the granting of licence to minimise the impacts on the residents.

V. Question on oil leakage and sinking of stranded cargo vessel  
(Paper IDC 114/2017)

36. The Chairman said that the written replies of the Marine Department (MD) and the correspondents of the shipping insurance company in Hong Kong had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

37. Ms Amy YUNG presented the paper and expressed her views as follows:

- (a) She was dissatisfied that MD had not arranged representatives to attend the meeting and said that the aim for inviting government department representatives to the meeting to respond to questions was to provide an opportunity for interactive discussions. The departments should arrange representatives to attend the meeting to give an explanation, rather than providing a written reply. Otherwise, there would be no need for District Councils to hold meetings, and District Council members would just communicate with the departments through correspondence.
- (b) The cargo vessel ran aground on 23 August but the authorities only stabilised it on 9 October and then arranged for hauling it away from Hong Kong waters. That was a serious matter. It could be shown from its failure to explain the Lamma ferry disaster how MD was dealing with the public. She criticised the department as being irresponsible, and again accused it for failing to arrange representatives to explain the matter.
- (c) She emphasised that the sunken vessel with fuel onboard had remained near the yacht club, which was next to the residential areas and an oil depot nearby. If an explosion occurred, the consequence would be too ghastly to contemplate. She queried why MD waited until the insurance company put out a tender instead of taking immediate actions. She opined that the department should stabilise the vessel and pump the remaining fuel therefrom to prevent accidents, and then recover the costs from the insurance company.
- (d) MD failed to take immediate actions after the incident. It just deployed vessels to detect any oil leaks nearby. She found it unacceptable. She again deplored the way in which MD handled the matter (failure to take actions promptly and arrange representatives to attend the meeting to give an explanation).
- (e) She requested the Secretariat to urge HKR International Ltd., DBSML and MD to arrange representatives to attend the meeting in future.

VI. Question on safety of South Lantau buses and a serious traffic accident involving a bus of Citybus route E21A  
(Paper IDC 115/2017)

38. The Chairman welcomed Mr Kenneth MOK, Chief Transport Officer/NT South West of TD, Mr Benny CHAN, Deputy General Manager and Mr WONG Wah, Administrative Consultant of NLB and Mr LI Kin-lok, Kevin, Public Affairs Manager of Citybus Limited/New World First Bus Services Limited (NWFB) to the meeting to

respond to the question. The written reply of TD had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

39. Mr Eric KWOK presented the paper.

40. Mr Kenneth MOK explained the written reply of TD.

41. Mr Benny CHAN said that NLB required part-time drivers to provide details of their current work arrangement and understand clearly the content of the Guidelines on Bus Captain Working Hours, Rest Times and Meal Breaks issued by TD. Part-time bus drivers employed during holidays were also subject to the requirements under the Guidelines. The driving time included the time the bus leaving the depot up to the returning of bus after work as well as the time required for driving the bus to other bus terminus.

42. Mr Kevin LI responded as follows:

- (a) Citybus/NWFB felt grief for the traffic accident at Cheung Sha Wan Road near Yen Chow Street involving route E21A and would fully co-operate with police investigation into the cause of accident. Citybus/NWFB had been arranging the working hours and rest times of full time and part-time bus drivers in accordance with the Guidelines issued by TD for franchised bus companies, in which the driving duty covered the time with and without passengers onboard. If the bus drivers of Citybus/NWFB wanted to take up part-time jobs, approval had to be obtained from the company. Part-time bus drivers should also declare whether they were engaged in other employments.
- (b) On driving time, the bus company would work out the driving time taking into account the length of the route, road condition and business operation and conduct regular review and make adjustment where necessary. For example, if congestion occurred frequently in a certain route and the driving time increased, the bus company would make adjustment to ensure that the bus captain would have sufficient journey time. Bus drivers who failed to reach the bus terminus at the time scheduled would not be punished.
- (c) The bus company appreciated the public concerns over the working hours of bus drivers and recognised there was room for improvement on the Guidelines. However, apart from recruiting extra manpower, amendment to the Guidelines would involve considerations including rest patterns of the existing bus drivers, bus operation and service stability, etc. To allay public concerns, the bus company had met with the employees union and the Joint Consultative Committee a fortnight ago to discuss short-term improvement proposals, including reducing Citybus bus drivers' working duty to no more than 13 hours, and adopting an alternate shift pattern temporarily which comprised short and long shifts for NWFB bus drivers to avoid consecutive long shifts.

It had also discussed with TD and other franchised bus companies about amendments to the Guidelines in the hope that a consensus could be reached as early as possible.

43. Mr Eric KWOK said the EU rules limited the working hours of drivers to nine hours. Life was priceless, and one should not overlook the long driving hours of bus drivers due to financial and service-related reasons. The accident caused by the E21A bus led to devastation for a number of families. The present 14 hours of work was excessive and bus drivers would be tired and prone to accident. He was concerned about the safety of Lantau buses and opined that the Guidelines of TD were inadequate. If the bus crash occurred on Tung Chung Road or Keung Shan Road, Lantau Island, the consequence would be too ghastly to contemplate. It was hoped that TD and the bus company would address the long driving hours of bus drivers and the serviceability of buses thoroughly.

44. Ms Amy YUNG said that a shuttle bus rammed into a tree on Discovery Bay Road on 14 July this year and two shuttle buses collided last week. She was concerned about the working time arrangement for shuttle bus drivers and noticed that their attitude had been poor recently which might be due to fatigue from work. She asked whether TD monitored the operation of shuttle buses (including the working times and attitude of bus drivers).

45. Mr Kenneth MOK said that when formulating or amending the Guidelines, TD would consider the rest time for bus drivers, the operations of franchised bus services, the aspirations of bus drivers as well as the overseas standards and would consult the bus companies and bus driver unions. While the current guidelines were applicable to franchised bus services only. TD maintained communication with the non-franchised bus trade through regular meetings which could exchange views on the work arrangement for bus drivers. He would convey Ms YUNG's concerns to the relevant section.

46. Mr WONG Wah said that apart from revising the working hours, the integrity and work and rest schedule of bus drivers at their leisure time were very important.

47. Mr Holden CHOW said that society had a lot of discussions about the work and rest schedules of bus drivers. Traffic accidents involving buses occurred frequently. As the Guidelines on the working hours and driving time of bus drivers not exceeding 14 hours and 11 hours respectively had been adopted for years, timely review was required. He noticed that it was difficult to recruit drivers and hoped that the bus companies and TD would find ways to attract new blood (e.g. offering better pay and benefits to bus drivers) to increase manpower supply.

48. Mr Eric KWOK hoped that apart from consulting the industry and employees union, TD should collect public views when conducting a review of the Guidelines.

49. The Chairman requested TD to consider Members' views.

VII. Question on Elderly Health Care Vouchers  
(Paper IDC 116/2017)

50. The Chairman welcomed Dr LOH Lai-ting, Taron, Senior Medical & Health Officer (Community Liaison) of Department of Health (DH) to the meeting to respond to the question. The written replies of DH, the Medical Council of Hong Kong, the Chinese Medicine Council of Hong Kong, the Optometrists Board and HA had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

51. Mr Eric KWOK presented the question.

52. Dr Taron LOH briefly introduced the written reply of DH.

53. Mr Holden CHOW enquired whether a mechanism was in place to penalise the service providers participating in the Elderly Health Care Voucher (EHCV) Scheme and publicise the cases if complaints (e.g. overcharging) against the participating service providers were found substantiated after investigation by DH.

54. Mr Eric KWOK said that according to information, around 1.22 million Hong Kong elders were eligible to receive EHCV. As at end of July this year, 760 000 elders had used the vouchers and the annual voucher amount per eligible elder was \$2,000. Enormous resources were involved. If the service providers defrauded the elders by improper means, not only the subsidies of elders were gnawed but there would also be a waste of public resources. He hoped an avenue would be provided for the elderly people and their families to lodge a complaint and a 24-hour public enquiry hotline would be set up. He suggested some simple guidelines be provided for elders to alert them to matters that should be paid attention to when they used the vouchers. He said his office received complaints from locals that an optical shop in Tung Chung charged the elders up to over \$1,300 for long-sighted prescription glasses, and a general out-patient clinic in Tsuen Wan charged an elder using EHCVs a consultation fee of \$2,700. He urged DH to step up monitoring, e.g. conducting undercover operations or inspection on irregular basis to crack down on service providers overcharging clients.

55. Ms Amy YUNG suggested DH and the Consumer Council co-operate to publicise a list of unethical service providers or others overcharging clients to prevent elderly people from being cheated and a waste of public resources.

56. Dr Taron LOH made a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) If people had doubts or suspicion that the service providers had breached the terms and conditions of the agreement made under the Elderly Health Care Voucher (EHV) Scheme, they could contact the Health Care Voucher Unit of the DH by telephone, email, fax or post. The Health Care Voucher Unit would then follow up with the client or complainant of each case for further information and investigation as

appropriate. Generally, if any participating service provider is found to have failed to comply with the terms and conditions of the EHV Scheme Agreement, the voucher claims will not be reimbursed by the Government. In case the reimbursement has been made, the Government will recover the amounts from the service providers concerned.

- (b) For any service provider suspected of fraud or professional misconduct, he/she would be referred to the Police and/or relevant professional regulatory board or council for follow-up, and the service providers concerned might be disqualified from participating in the EHV Scheme. The Health Care Voucher website ([www.hcv.gov.hk](http://www.hcv.gov.hk)) provides the lists of enrolled service providers for public reference.
- (c) DH had issued letters to the participating service providers, reminding them that they could not impose different charges on voucher users and non-users. Details of charges should be explained to patients at their request before provision of services. The department also advises that elders enquire about the service charges before receiving the service and decide whether they consented to using the vouchers for the service.

57. Mr Eric KWOK considered that the guidelines of DH could not effectively protect people against unscrupulous practitioners. He suggested the department conduct undercover operations and inspection on irregular basis, etc. to deter malpractices. He opined that preventive measures should be taken instead of just relying on the elders to report malpractices, which would not be enough.

58. Ms Amy YUNG asked again whether DH would work with the Consumer Council to publicise the names of service providers engaging in malpractices.

59. Mr CHEUNG Fu considered that the relevant department could investigate whether service providers were overcharging customers according to the invoices issued by them.

60. Dr Taron LOH said she would convey to the relevant unit of DH the concerns and opinions of Members.

(Mr Ken WONG and Mr Holden CHOW left the meeting at 4:05 p.m. and 4:10 p.m. respectively.)

#### VIII. Question on request for setting up a post-disaster recovery mechanism (Paper IDC 117/2017)

61. The Chairman welcomed Mr KWAN Yau-kee, District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Islands) of FEHD; Mr LAM Hon-wa, Senior Engineer and Ms TANG Ka-yuet, Annie, Engineer of Drainage Services Department (DSD); Mr LEUNG Chiu-keung, Kenneth, Senior Engineer of Civil Engineering and

Development Department (CEDD); Mr Kelvin HO, Deputy District Commander (Lantau) of HKPF; Mr CHAN Wai-ho, Divisional Commander (Marine and Off-shore Islands) and Mr LI Kai-chung, Station Commander of Tai O Fire Station of FSD; as well as Mr LI Ping-wai, Anthony, District Officer (Islands) of IsDO to the meeting to respond to the question. The written reply of FEHD had been distributed to Members for perusal prior to the meeting.

62. The Vice-Chairman Mr Randy YU presented the question.

63. Mr KWAN Yau-kee briefly introduced the written reply of FEHD.

64. Mr LAM Hon-wa indicated that DSD had arranged the installation of stop-logs before the onslaught of Typhoon Hato on 22 August to strengthen protection against flooding. Typhoon signal no. 10 was hoisted for Hato, which edged close to Hong Kong. The astronomical high tide and storm surge caused a rise in water level reaching as high as 3.72 metres, which exceeded the 3.67 metres when Typhoon Hagupit hit Hong Kong in 2008. This yielded the first challenge after the completion of the riverwall project. In light of the situation observed in Tai O and the available data, the department was exploring feasible improvement measures including enhancement of the stop-log installation and arrangement at entrances etc.

65. Ms Annie TANG supplemented as follows:

- (a) On short-term measures, as stop-logs were installed manually under emergency situation and on the day when Hong Kong was hit by Typhoon Hato, minor water leakage occurred at a particular location which might caused by loosen installation of stop-logs. The department had requested the contractor to step up the inspection of installed stop-logs and to increase the inspection frequency. As for the stop-logs at the entrance points, discussion with FSD, the Police and the Civil Aid Service (CAS) on the enhancement was underway.
- (b) At the Lantau Area Committee meeting held earlier, Mr Randy YU and Mr LOU Cheuk-wing proposed providing facilities for the nullah behind Wing On Street and Tai Ping Street to trap the leaves and branches so to avoid accumulation of debris and vegetation at the drainage channel. The department preliminarily planned to install screens at the nullah to trap leaves, and to provide facilities at locations with overhanging trees to block the falling branches. More sandbags would also be made available for emergency use.
- (c) On long-term measures, the department was working with the relevant departments to study the feasibility to expand the existing flood protection area (to area such as north to Tai Ping Street), and continue to enhance the stop-log facilities to maximise flood prevention at Tai O.

66. Mr Kenneth LEUNG indicated that CEDD had been maintaining close liaison with DSD, IsDO and Members concerned. The preliminary view of the

department was to construct a rubble seawall in the vicinity of Shek Tsai Po Street, and a concrete wall along the coastal footpath near Nam Chung Tsuen to Fan Kwai Tong to defend against the stormy waves along the coast. CEDD was now examining the design and would further discuss with the relevant government departments, District Councillors and local communities in due course.

67. Mr Kelvin HO said that under emergency and necessary situations such as during typhoon or serious flooding, the Police would provide support and assistance to various government departments (such as IsDO, FSD, CAS and TD), in recovery work at affected areas to safeguard public safety. On transport, the Police would enhance co-ordination with the relevant departments and implement traffic control to clear obstacles on roads for Tai O and ensure smooth traffic thereon. On 29 August this year, staff of Police Community Relations Office of Lantau District, Junior Police Call volunteers and the FEHD staff visited Tai O to assist the residents in clearing mud and refuse from the streets in the aftermath of the typhoon.

68. Mr CHAN Wai-ho responded as follows:

- (a) FSD was very concerned about the flooding problem in Tai O and had formulated an internal flood response plan after Typhoon Hagupit struck Hong Kong in 2008. When a typhoon was approaching, the department would closely monitor its direction. It would monitor whether the typhoon would threaten Hong Kong, whether the Hong Kong Observatory (HKO) would issue a higher typhoon signal or whether high tide or astronomical high tide would happen and aggravate the impacts. If a typhoon signal was issued at night (or in the early morning), the department would activate the mechanism at an earlier time and appropriately deploy manpower for preparation. Station Commander of Tai O Fire Station would attend the station and standby at night.
- (b) During the hit of Typhoon Hato, Station Commander of Tai O Fire Station received notification from IsDO at around 5 p.m. to 6 p.m. on the day before, with HKO anticipating that the typhoon might cause the water level to rise above the normal level. The then Station Commander of Tai O Fire Station, Mr LAM Wing-tat, arrived at Tai O Fire Station at around 10:00 p.m. that night to standby.
- (c) Upon receipt of notification from IsDO, FSD immediately activated the mechanism and according to the information provided by the Social Welfare Department, deployed staff to inspect and visit singleton elderly in Tai O to check whether they were staying in stilt houses or flats, and advise them to seek shelter temporarily at the Tai O Rural Committee, Hong Kong Young Women's Christian Association or Lung Tin Estate. For elderly who insisted on staying at home, the department would make record and inform the Neighbourhood Advice-Action Council to arrange staff to advise them to take temporary refuge at a safe place. On the next morning, District Officer



(Islands) convened an urgent meeting at Tai O Rural Committee. FSD staff attended the meeting and made preparation for the implementation of the response plan to minimise casualties and property losses.

- (d) On recovery arrangement, FSD could deploy the FSD Volunteer Team to give support.

69. Mr Anthony LI responded as follows:

- (a) In light of the experience from Typhoon Hato, IsDO considered that arrangements in several aspects could be enhanced. On the clearance of massive domestic waste and refuse, the progress in the first few days was unsatisfactory due to a lack of large grab-mounted lorries, village vehicles and manpower. FEHD had just advised that new arrangements would be made. When the arrangements were finalised, IsDO would incorporate them into the response plan for follow-up by relevant staff in the future.
- (b) On transportation, since Keung Shan Road and South Lantau Road were the only external road connection for Tai O, it was crucial to maintain the smooth traffic flow thereon. In the aftermath of typhoon, the two roads were blocked by fallen trees, and IsDO had been following up with HyD and TD. The trees blocking the roads were removed near midnight for bus service to resume normal and for access of vehicles to clear the refuse and transport the waste. IsDO would explore with TD and HyD whether grab-mounted lorries could be arranged for standby near Keung Shan Road or South Lantau Road in advance when serious flood and possible generation of a large volume of waste were expected, so as to quickly remove any trees that blocked the roads.
- (c) On staffing arrangement, the recovery work in the aftermath of Typhoon Hato was carried out with the concerted efforts of the community and various government departments, including the FSD Volunteer Team and Junior Police Call Volunteer Team of the Police. In this regard, IsDO would also consider incorporating “liaising with relevant departments and volunteer teams of other organisations for assisting in the recovery work” into the response plan.
- (d) On flood prevention, as stated by the representatives of DSD and CEDD, the riverwall had played an important role in minimising the impact of this flooding incident. DSD was now following up on the water seepage at certain locations within the scheme. IsDO would follow up with CEDD and DSD on the medium- and short-term measures. Regarding areas not protected by riverwall (such as the vicinity of Shek Tsai Po and Nam Chung), IsDO would explore with CEDD on provision of concrete walls at appropriate positions and road sections to block water.

70. The Vice-Chairman Mr Randy YU raised opinions as follows:

- (a) He thanked the various government departments for giving responses and bringing the response mechanism into full play wherever practicable and with limited resources. Upon receipt of the typhoon notification, the Chairman Mr LOU Cheuk-wing and executive members of Tai O Rural Committee visited the elderly in person that night, reminding them to be careful and take temporary refuge at temporary shelters when necessary. He considered that satisfactory contingency measures had been taken in advance.
- (b) On recovery efforts, he thanked the District Officer (Islands) for co-ordinating the relevant departments and holding a number of meetings to review how the recovery arrangement could be enhanced. He also thanked FSD, HKPF and CAS for rendering assistance after the typhoon.
- (c) He was glad that DSD would follow up on the water seepage of flood prevention facilities at Tai Ping Street and Wing On Street. He enquired whether the department would implement improvement measures at other places such as Kat Hing Front Street and hoped it could provide a reply upon the completion of preliminary study.
- (d) He was glad that IsDO would contact the relevant departments and explore the implementation of improvement works at Shek Tsai Po and areas from Nam Chung to Fan Kwai Tong village, etc.
- (e) FEHD said that apart from large grab-mounted lorries, village vehicles would be used to replace manual labour to transport refuse as far as practicable. He hoped FEHD could implement the measure soonest so that IsDO could incorporate the arrangement into the recovery mechanism. He enquired whether the use of village vehicles would be regularised or only an arrangement for post-disaster recovery, and whether various contractors would be involved in the recovery work after the mechanism was activated.

(Post-meeting note of FEHD: Regularising the use of village vehicles to replace manual labour for waste collection services involves changes in government staff establishment, staff deployment, resource allocation, internal procedures of the government including procurement procedures and the constraints, etc. Moreover, the outsourcing of waste collection services by village vehicles is subject to the consent/approval of relevant government departments including TD, Home Affairs Department and LandsD, etc., and it takes time. The department is open-minded towards regularising the use of village

vehicles for waste collection services, including engaging different outsourced service contractors to provide services.

On the other hand, a procurement exercise had been conducted for waste collection services on Peng Chau by village vehicles and all relevant procedures were completed in mid-October. The department has liaised with the successful bidder to provide the services as soon as possible. However, the successful bidder was still waiting for TD's reply on its application for exemption from restrictions on operating village vehicles during specified periods including Saturday afternoons, Sundays and public holidays, as well as the proposed driving routes and time slots, etc.)

71. Mr CHEUNG Fu was concerned about the impact of typhoon. He was appreciative of the dedicated efforts of various departments in the recovery work, and commended the Police and FSD officers who handled the fallen trees without regard for their personal safety under typhoon signal no. 10.

72. Mr LOU Cheuk-wing expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Given that the flood this time was more serious than that in 2008, many problems might arise if there was no response mechanism. He commended that under the co-ordination of IsDO, the loss by members of the public was reduced. He was also thankful that senior officers of the Police and FSD attended the scene to supervise the work.
- (b) He opined that FEHD had underestimated the situation and had not made sufficient preparation, in particular on vehicle arrangement. There were as much as over 100 tonnes of refuse but the department only deployed existing staff for clearance. He hoped the department would learn from the experience and improve future arrangements. He also suggested the department use village vehicles to transport the refuse and deploy additional manpower to handle the recovery work, and incorporate the application of prohibited zone permit for work vehicles into the recovery mechanism.
- (c) Recently FEHD had not arranged staff to clear refuse at night, resulting in piles of refuse at rubbish bins in Tai O and dirty streets. In particular, rubbish was found everywhere at Tai O Rural Committee Square. He hoped the department would examine the management of refuse clearance and use village vehicles in Tai O as soon as possible.

(Post-meeting note of FEHD: Due to the need of staff redeployment in the district earlier, night-time cleaning worker had been temporarily deployed elsewhere for work. Reprovision of worker at night in Tai O has been made by FEHD.)

- (d) As flood prevention facilities at Wing On Street and Tai Ping Street were proved effective, the middle section of the streets was not affected while flooding occurred at the front and rear sections of the streets. He hoped the relevant departments would explore flood enhancement measures at unprotected areas in Tai O.

73. The Chairman understood that the strong typhoon had brought about many problems which the relevant departments might not be able to deal with immediately. He hoped various departments could learn from the experience and review the arrangements of recovery work, as well as consider and follow up on Members' views.

(Mr CHEUNG Fu left the meeting at around 4:50 p.m.)

IX. Question on bicycle-sharing  
(Paper IDC 118/2017)

74. The Chairman welcomed Mr Kenneth MOK Chief Transport Officer/NT South West of TD and Mr Kelvin HO, District Commander (Marine Port) of HKPF to the meeting to respond to the question. The written replies of the Transport and Housing Bureau (THB) and TD had been distributed to Members for perusal prior to the meeting.

75. The Vice-Chairman Mr Randy YU presented the paper.

76. Mr Kenneth MOK briefly introduced the written reply of TD.

77. Mr Kelvin HO responded as follows:

- (a) The main duty of the Police was to maintain law and order. The parking of bicycles was part of street management. Only when illegally-parked bicycles posed imminent danger to the public, affected law and order, caused serious traffic congestion or seriously obstructed other road users would the Police take immediate action.
- (b) The Police had been handling illegal parking of bicycles through an inter-departmental approach, and participated in joint enforcement operations co-ordinated by other government departments.
- (c) Lantau Police District would continue to support IsDO's District-led Actions Scheme and take joint operations with IsDO, FEHD and DLO/Islands to clear illegally-parked bicycles at illegal parking black spots including Tung Chung and Mui Wo, etc. In 2017, Lantau Police District participated in 5 joint operations and cleared a total of 360 bicycles.

78. The Vice-Chairman Mr Randy YU expressed his views as follows:

- (a) While the Government endeavoured to foster a “bicycle-friendly” environment and promote the “green commuting” policy, it had not made proper planning for Lantau Island or taken any practical action. As he had indicated in the discussion under the previous agenda item, THB set eyes only on public housing development but failed to provide sufficient traffic and transport ancillary facilities. Since the Government agreed that community bicycle rental service was conducive to promoting the policy objective of “green commuting”, and there were 3 to 4 operators at present, it should take corresponding actions in terms of policies, measures and facilities to resolve the problem. The relevant departments might draw reference from the experience of other cities such as London.
- (b) There was no evidence of the Government making proactive effort to promote a “bicycle-friendly” environment and the “green commuting” policy in THB’s reply. If the Government only adopted a piecemeal approach to tackle the problem, it would be difficult to deal with it when more green transport means came into existence in the future. As he had previously mentioned under the other agenda item, since no long-term transport strategy was formulated for Lantau Island, he could not see what strategy the Government could adopt when there was a natural disaster or an increase in the number of tourists. There was a mountain bike trail on Chi Ma Wan Peninsula but no island-wide cycling track on Lantau Island. Bicycles were forced to use the vehicular roads and were thus susceptible to accidents, particularly on South Lantau Road and Keung Shan Road which were narrow with many bends. He requested the Administration to formulate long-term traffic and transport strategies for Lantau Island pragmatically so as to address the issue of bicycle-sharing and other related problems in the district.

79. Mr LOU Cheuk-wing suggested TD draw reference from the experience of the Mainland in bicycle-sharing management and the relevant arrangement.

80. The Chairman asked TD to relay Members’ views to THB.

(Post-meeting note: TD had relayed to THB the views of Members set out in paragraph 78 of the minutes.)

X. Question on provision of large-scale event notification system  
(Paper IDC 119/2017)

81. The Chairman welcomed Mr CHAU Chun-wing, Tomy, District Leisure Manager (Islands) of LCSD to the meeting to respond to the question. The written reply of LCSD had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

82. Mr WONG Man-hon presented the question.

83. Mr Tomy CHAU briefed on the written reply of LCSD.

84. Mr WONG Man-hon supported in principle the holding of district activities, but residents obtained the details only on the day of event and could not make arrangement beforehand. The cross country competition was held at night and the residents were concerned about the traffic arrangement during evening rush hours. He gave support for launching such activities but hoped that the relevant departments would inform the residents as early as possible so that appropriate arrangements could be made.

85. Ms Amy YUNG said that LCSD stated in its reply that a monitoring mechanism was put in place to prevent non-compliance during the implementation of activities, and the local residents would also be informed to make arrangement. However, a three-week long event was launched in DB during the summer vacation this August but neither the community nor the member of the constituency was consulted at all. She was perplexed that FEHD rather than LCSD was the licensing authority for the activities held in DB. She asked whether large-scale activities held in open space on private land were subject to the regulation or control of LCSD including matters relating to safety, transport and environmental hygiene and what its role was. He also asked if FEHD could inform the member of the constituency as soon as possible upon receiving the applications for large-scale activities to allow residents to make arrangements.

86. Mr Tomy CHAU thanked Mr WONG Man-hon for his opinions and stressed that LCSD would continue to remind the applicants to approach the local organisations as early as possible for co-ordinations. On the other hand, if it was considered necessary, LCSD would contact the relevant rural committees or District Council Members separately to help disseminate information. Regarding Ms Amy YUNG's suggestion, he revealed LCSD was only authorized to manage gazetted public pleasure grounds, activities held on private land were outside their jurisdictions.

87. Ms Amy YUNG said that given that applications had to be made to FEHD for activities held in DB, the department should shoulder responsibility. She hoped it would follow LCSD's practice and consult the member of the constituency in advance so that residents could make arrangement to minimise the impacts of traffic congestion and noise, etc.

88. Mr KWAN Yau-kee supplemented that under the existing mechanism, FEHD would seek the advice of the relevant departments (including Buildings Department, FSD, EPD, HKPF, LandsD and Electrical and Mechanical Services Department) upon receiving applications for temporary places of public entertainment licences. The relevant member of the District Council would not be consulted.

89. Ms Amy YUNG said that the large-scale events held at Pak Sha beach had caused problems for years and the residents had always complained about nuisance. For instance, emergency vehicles were deployed by the Police and FSD during the events to provide rescue services. She hoped FEHD would review the existing mechanism to minimise disturbance to the public.

90. The Chairman requested the relevant departments to consider Members' views.

XI. Marine Port District Action Plan 2017 (Interim Report)  
(Paper IDC111/2017)

91. The Chairman welcomed Mr SHERIDAN RICHARD, BRINSLEY, District Commander (Marine Port) of Hong Kong Police Force to the meeting to present the paper.

92. Mr SHERIDAN RICHARD, BRINSLEY briefly presented the paper.

93. Ms LEE Kwai-chun appreciated the endeavours of Police in maintaining the low level of crime in Islands District. On combating "Quick Cash Crime", the paper stated that online shopping deception and property purchase fraud were reported in the first half of the current year in Cheung Chau Division. She asked for details of such cases (especially those relating to property purchase fraud). For crackdown on illegal immigrants, she enquired where the 16 illegal immigrants were arrested. For marine conservation, people used explosives and toxic substances, etc. illegally for fishing in the past and she hoped enforcement actions would be taken by the Police and the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) jointly.

94. Mr Eric KWOK appreciated the efforts of marine police in marine conservation. The paper stated that for the first half of the current year, the Police District had mounted 46 anti-illegal fishing operations. He enquired whether illegal fishing was found, e.g. the entry of Mainland fishing vessels into Hong Kong waters for fishing. He also hoped that the Police would step up patrol in the waters off South Lantau near Mong Tung Wan to Cheung Sha during and after the fishing moratorium (16 August to early September) at night as information revealed that lots of fishing vessels fished for cuttlefish off Cheung Sha. He was worried that the overfishing of cuttlefish by mainland fishing vessels would cause substantial damages to the ecosystem of Hong Kong and hoped the marine police would pay more attention to it.

95. Ms Josephine TSANG said that there were only four police officers on Peng Chau and two of whom were posted out recently. The incoming police officers were not too acquainted with the environment and community of Peng Chau and residents were afraid that if something happened, they might be unable to arrive at the scene immediately for assistance. She hoped that not more than one police officer was posted out at one time if there was any transfer of staff in future.

96. Mr SHERIDAN RICHARD, BRINSLEY made a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) Online fraud in Cheung Chau Division usually involved mooncake coupons, concert tickets and infant clothing, etc. and no substantial loss was incurred. Fraudsters preyed on people looking for petty advantages. For the case of property purchase deception, a couple fell victims when remortgaging their property with the fraudster alleging that advantageous terms and conditions would be offered for the loan.
- (b) On illegal entry, the 16 arrested illegal immigrants arrived at Hong Kong illegally by fishing vessels to buy diesel at low costs for smuggling to the Mainland.
- (c) Marine police and staff of AFCD had stepped up patrol during the fishing moratorium, especially in the waters south of Lantau. The vessels fished illegally near the Hong Kong water boundary and when the marine police launches gave chase, they returned to Mainland waters swiftly. There were difficulties in law enforcement.
- (d) Anti-illegal fishing operations were mounted by marine police at different time slots (including during the evening and at night) while the joint operations with AFCD were normally conducted from early morning to 6 a.m. (when most Mainland vessels entered Hong Kong waters). On cuttlefish fishing, the fishing ban during the fishing moratorium did not cover cuttlefish. It might not be unlawful to carry out such fishing activities. Marine police would conduct investigation with AFCD.
- (e) On staff transfer for Peng Chau, the Police District noted Members' opinions and would transfer one officer at one time as far as possible.

97. Mr Eric KWOK enquired if marine police held regular meetings with the Guangdong Provincial Fisheries Bureau and hoped it would reflect to the latter Members' concerns so that the Mainland counterparts could step up supervision and stop Mainland fishing vessels from entering Hong Kong waters for illegal fishing.

98. The Chairman considered that it would be more appropriate to raise the opinions to AFCD.

(Mr LOU Cheuk-wing left the meeting at about 5:25 p.m.)



XII. Lantau District Action Plan 2017 (Interim Report)  
(Paper IDC 110/2017)

99. The Chairman welcomed Mr Kelvin HO, Deputy District Commander (Lantau District) of Hong Kong Police Force to the meeting to present the paper.

100. Mr Kelvin HO presented the paper.

101. Ms Amy YUNG raised opinions as follows:

- (a) It was mentioned in the interim report that the overall detection rate of Lantau District in the first half of 2017 was 46.5%, a decrease of 9.9% from 56.4% in the same period last year. She enquired about the reason for the decrease in detection rate.
- (b) On combating burglary cases, it was mentioned in the report that in order to combat burglary cases more effectively, the Police District had from time to time provided education and publicity on home safety for members of the public with District Councillors and District Fight Crime Committee (DFCC) members. Since she ceased to be a DFCC member, she was no longer informed of the details of activities by the Police District and could only get the information upon enquiry with the police officers concerned. She hoped when the Police invited the staff of the Discovery Bay Security Management Company - to participate in the activities, the District Councillors would be informed as well.
- (c) She said that a person who often made reports to the Police once yelled at a meeting in 2015 and subsequently reported to the Police of having been assaulted. Two months after the incident, the Police arrested the defendant who had been framed. A total of 14 attendees at the said meeting including her were requested to make statement at Tung Chung or Discovery Bay Police Station which lasted for about 3 hours. She considered that police manpower and resources were wasted in the handling of the above incident. When a similar case happened again recently, the Police took over half a year for investigation and summoned relevant persons to attend the police station every two months. She hoped the Police could investigate and handle the case in a fair and equitable manner without wasting resources and showing favouritism to individuals. She had written to the Police in 2015 to provide the details of the incident which had been put on record. If the Police did not handle the case properly, she would lodge complaints to the Independent Police Complaints Council and the Hong Kong Independent Commission Against Corruption.

102. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He welcomed that the Police set up road blocks at Shek Mun Kap and San Shek Wan exits on Tung Chung Road and stepped up enforcement actions against drivers driving on closed roads on Lantau without a permit. To avoid a high level of manpower requirement, he suggested installing an electronic detection system at Shek Mun Kap for monitoring.
- (b) He supported the Police District in launching the “Project Lantau GuardWATCH”. The residents appreciated that officers of Police Tactical Unit (PTU) visited various villages to check whether the elderly needed assistance when Typhoon Hato hit Hong Kong on 26 August. He hoped the Police District would consider arranging post-typhoon visits to various villages in the future.

103. The Vice-Chairman Mr Randy YU expressed his views as follows:

- (a) According to the paper of the Central FCC, the detection rate of the two Police Districts of the Islands District ranked top of the 22 Police Districts in Hong Kong. He thanked the Police for achieving remarkable results despite limited resources. He enquired about the reason of the decrease in overall detection rate of the Lantau District in the first half of 2017.
- (b) He commended that the two Police Districts of the Islands District had been co-operating all along instead of working on their own, and assisted the residents in installing closed-circuit televisions (CCTVs) to prevent crime. While the Islands District was large in terms of area, there were not many policemen on Lantau Island, and the two Police Districts always made necessary deployment for better co-operation. Where the land-based policemen were unable to patrol the remote villages (such as Yi O and Fan Lau), the marine police would step up inshore patrol to meet shortfalls, which could help maintain law and order in the Islands District and allay the concerns of residents.

104. Mr Kelvin HO gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) Regarding the case mentioned by Ms Amy YUNG, the Police would not show favouritism to individuals and would ensure that police investigation was conducted in a fair, equitable and open manner. He thanked Ms YUNG for reminding and said that she would be invited when promotional activities were held in Discovery Bay in the future.
- (b) The overall detection rate of the Lantau District in the first half of 2017 was 46.5%, which was higher than other Police Districts. The detection rate depended on the types of cases recorded. For burglary

cases, the detection rate was generally low because CCTVs were not installed at most of the crime scenes, thus making gathering of evidence difficult. Besides, most of the suspects absconded to the Mainland, and the Police could only place them on the “wanted list” and arrest them when they were in transit. Moreover, the witnesses’ memory might be fading, making detection difficult. For shop thefts which were seasonal offences, the detection rate was close to 100%. Enhancement of shop security would be conducive to secure arrest, thereby increasing the overall detection rate.

- (c) As stated in the interim report, certain types of offences (such as shop theft) recorded a relatively large decrease, which led to a lower overall detection rate. He reiterated that the Police had been doing its utmost to investigate each and every case. Taking bicycle thefts and fighting cases in the district as examples, the Police would employ overt and covert techniques and view the CCTV recordings with a view to making successful detection.
- (d) Regarding Mr Eric KWOK’s proposal of installing an electronic detection system at Shek Mun Kap, the Police had conducted a study with TD years ago. Checkpoints had been set up at the road section concerned in the past, whereas at present, only enforcement actions were taken by the Police. Due to limited resources, the road blocks were set up during holidays and the Police would endeavour to perform gatekeeping properly.
- (e) He thanked Mr Eric KWOK for his support. Lantau District would continue to implement the “Lantau GuardWATCH Scheme”. The visit of PTU officers to the elderly in the district earlier was part of the special measures after a typhoon. If necessary, the Police might arrange senior volunteers of the Senior Police Call to pay a visit in the future so as to make better use of community resources.

105. Ms Amy YUNG hoped the Police District could provide the crime detection rate by type in the future so as to provide a much more accurate picture. Moreover, she had served as a witness in some cases and also accompanied residents to the police station for statement taking. She found that some policemen did not handle the cases seriously. Some got the names of members of the public wrong and was not efficient enough, and the statement taking sometimes lasted from 6 p.m. to 4 a.m. the next day. She hoped the Police District would provide proper instructions and training to the staff so as to make effective use of limited resources.

### XIII. Progress on District-led Actions Scheme (Paper IDC 120/2017)

106. The Chairman welcomed Mr AU Sheung-man, Benjamin, Assistant District Officer (Islands)<sup>1</sup> of IsDO to the meeting to present the paper.

107. Mr Benjamin AU presented the paper.

108. Mr Eric KWOK suggested rescheduling the anti-mosquito work if adverse weather condition occurred, otherwise the mosquito larvicidal oil sprayed would be washed away by rain and the efforts would be in vain. In addition, where resources permitted, he hoped the relevant departments would step up anti-rodent work in rural areas (such as Ma Wan Chung Village) besides Yat Tung Estate.

XIV. Composition of Islands DC Committees for 2018-2019  
(Paper IDC 121/2017)

109. The Islands District Council (IDC) endorsed the proposal set out in the paper for maintaining the current composition of the committees, and that the Chairmen and Vice-Chairmen of all committees would remain in office.

XV. Report on the Work of the Islands District Management Committee (September 2017)  
(Paper IDC 122/2017)

110. Members noted and endorsed the paper.

XVI. Reports on the Work of the IDC Committees and Working Group  
(Papers IDC 123-127/2017)

111. Members noted and endorsed the paper.

XVII. Allocation of DC funds

(i) Up-to-date Financial Position on the Use of DC Funds  
(Paper IDC 128/2017)

112. The Chairman said that funding had been earmarked for the printing of IDC's work report. He proposed that he and the Chairmen of the four committees (i.e. Ms LEE Kwai-chun, Ms YU Lai-fun, Mr Ken WONG and Mr WONG Man-hon) be responsible for compiling the current-term IDC work report. If his proposal was endorsed, the Secretariat would prepare the relevant information and arrange for the work meeting.

113. Members noted and endorsed the paper and proposal.

- (ii) Approval for Using DC Funds by circulation from 1 August to 30 September 2017  
(Paper IDC 129/2017)

114. Members noted and endorsed the paper.

XVIII. Date of Next Meeting

115. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:54 p.m.  
The next meeting would be held on 18 December 2017 (Monday) at 2:00 p.m.

-End-