

(Translation)

Islands District Council
Minutes of Meeting of Traffic and Transport Committee

Date : 18 July 2022 (Monday)
Time : 2:00 p.m.
Venue : Islands District Council Conference Room,
14/F, Harbour Building, 38 Pier Road, Central, Hong Kong

Present

Vice-Chairman

Mr HO Siu-kei

Members

Mr YU Hon-kwan, Randy, MH, JP	(Left at around 3:15 p.m.)
Mr CHOW Yuk-tong, SBS, MH	
Mr CHAN Lin-wai, MH	
Mr HO Chun-fai	
Mr KWOK Ping, Eric	(Arrived at around 2:20 p.m.)
Mr FONG Lung-fei	
Ms LAU Shun-ting	

Attendance by Invitation

Mr KO Chi-keung	Senior Property Services Manager/Eastern, Architectural Services Department
Ms YEUNG Ka-man, Carmen	Property Services Manager/Shau Kei Wan & Islands South, Architectural Services Department
Ms CHOI Siu-man, Sherman	Senior Transport Officer/Planning/Ferry 2, Transport Department
Ms WONG Ka-hei, Nicole	Transport Officer/Planning/Ferry 4, Transport Department
Mr HO Kwok-fai, Godfrey	Chief Engineer/Lantau 3, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr NGAI Chi-wah, Tony	Senior Engineer/10 (Lantau), Civil Engineering and Development Department

In Attendance

Mr LI Ho, Thomas	Assistant District Officer (Islands)1, Islands District Office
Ms HO Chung-yin	Engineer/Islands(3), Highways Department
Mr WONG Yui-him, Tim	Engineer/Islands 1, Transport Department
Ms HUI Shuk-yee	Engineer/Islands 2, Transport Department
Ms FUNG Sin-yee, Mini	Senior Transport Officer/Islands 2, Transport Department
Ms WONG Wing-ying, Chloe	Engineer/22 (Lantau), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr HO Ngai-king	District Operations Officer (Lantau District), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr IP Ngai-chung	Assistant District Operations Officer (Lantau District), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr HO Lee-yip	Manager, District Relations, New Lantao Bus Company (1973) Limited
Ms Anthea CHAU	Senior Corporate Communications Manager, Sun Ferry Services Company Limited
Ms LAM Wai-ling	General Manager, Hong Kong and Kowloon Ferry Limited

Secretary

Ms CHAN Hoi-ching, Mandy	Executive Officer (District Council)3, Islands District Office
--------------------------	---

Absent with Apology

Ms WONG Chau-ping
Mr WONG Man-hon, MH
Mr WONG Hon-kuen, Ken

Welcoming remarks

The Vice-chairman said that the Chairman was unable to attend the meeting due to other commitments and he would chair the meeting on her behalf. He welcomed Members, representatives of the government departments and organisations to the meeting.

2. Members noted that the Chairman, Mr WONG Man-hon and Mr Ken WONG were unable to attend the meeting due to other commitments.

I. Confirmation of the Minutes of Meeting held on 23 May 2022

3. The Vice-chairman said that the captioned draft minutes had incorporated the amendments proposed by the government departments, guests and Members, and had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

4. Members voted by a show of hands. The minutes were endorsed unanimously.

(Members voted in favour included: the Vice-chairman Mr HO Siu-kei, Mr Randy YU, Mr CHOW Yuk-tong, Mr CHAN Lin-wai, Mr HO Chun-fai, Mr FONG Lung-fei and Ms LAU Shun-ting.)

II. Upgrading of Ferry Piers – Peng Chau Ferry Pier (Paper T&TC 13/2022)

5. The Vice-chairman welcomed Mr KO Chi-keung, Senior Property Services Manager/Eastern and Ms YEUNG Ka-man, Carmen, Property Services Manager/Shau Kei Wan & Islands South of the Architectural Services Department, and Ms CHOI Siu-man, Sherman, Senior Transport Officer/Planning/Ferry 2 and Ms WONG Ka-hei, Nicole, Transport Officer/Planning/Ferry 4 of the Transport Department (TD) to the meeting to present the paper.

6. Ms Sherman CHOI and Ms Carmen YEUNG briefly presented the paper with the aid of PowerPoint presentation.

7. Mr Randy YU expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Members were looking forward to the improvement works for the Peng Chau Ferry Pier. After the completion of the porch of the Cheung Chau Ferry Pier, residents of Peng Chau had expectations for the design of the porch and the canopy at the entrance of the Peng Chau Ferry Pier. The department had pointed out that unlike the porch of the Cheung Chau Ferry Pier that was built on solid ground, the canopy of the Peng Chau Ferry Pier was based on the pier, therefore the

bearing capacity was weak and it might not be feasible to fully imitate the design of the porch of the Cheung Chau Ferry Pier. He reiterated that residents had expectations and often compared the designs of the Peng Chau Ferry Pier and the Cheung Chau Ferry Pier, therefore he hoped the department would make every effort to enhance the design of the porch and canopy of the Peng Chau Ferry Pier.

- (b) Based on the layout plan of the upgraded ferry pier in Annex 2, the department designed a screen-like gate to fence off the rear entrances of the two restaurants, but the protruding gate would narrow the entrance. He suggested that the gate should be pushed back to align with the wall of the entrance to avoid the L-shaped area, so that the wall at the entrance could extend all the way to the ticket gate, allowing more space for the entrance area. Although the number of tourists to Peng Chau was not comparable to that to Cheung Chau, the pier entrance should be designed to be as spacious as possible to facilitate the flow of passengers. If the department wanted to fence off the rear entrances, a stairwell design should be adopted for the area and the L-shaped area should be pushed back instead of taking up space at the entrance.

8. Ms Carmen YEUNG said that the current design for the beautification of the canopy was still at a preliminary stage. When selecting the materials for the canopy, the department would take into account the texture and durability of the materials, the structure of the canopy and the bearing capacity of the existing pier structure. After the improvement works for the ferry pier were endorsed by Members and the funding was approved, the department would work with the consultant to study the materials that could be used for the canopy and how to strike a balance between aesthetics, structural safety and future maintenance. Regarding the screen-like gate to fence off the rear entrances, the department would consider to allow wider space for the pier entrance later in the detailed design stage.

9. The Vice-chairman asked the department whether berths would still be provided on only one side of the pier after the completion of the improvement works.

10. Ms Sherman CHOI said that the purpose of the proposed improvement works was to enhance the design and facilities of the pier, so as to provide a better environment for passengers waiting for the ferry service. Therefore, the improvement project mainly focused on renovating the internal design of the pier. Regarding the berths at the pier, the department had been closely monitoring the operation of the Peng Chau Ferry Pier. It was observed that the operation of the two ferry routes currently using the pier remained normal in general. The department would monitor closely and follow up with relevant departments when necessary to improve the ferry berths.

(Mr Eric KWOK arrived at around 2:20 p.m.)

III. Study on Traffic, Transport and Capacity to Receive Visitors for Lantau
(Paper T&TC 14/2022)

11. The Vice-chairman welcomed Mr HO Kwok-fai, Godfrey, Chief Engineer/Lantau 3, Mr NGAI Chi-wah, Tony, Senior Engineer/10 (Lantau) and Ms WONG Wing-ying, Chloe, Engineer/22 (Lantau) of the Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) to the meeting to present the paper.

12. Mr Godfrey HO and Mr Tony NGAI briefly presented the paper with the aid of PowerPoint presentation.

13. Mr Randy YU expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Although the Study on Traffic, Transport and Capacity to Receive Visitors for Lantau (the Study) was completed after a delay of more than a year due to various factors, he thanked the CEDD and the consultant for accepting different views and appreciated the mitigation measures proposed by the department. He hoped the works would commence as soon as possible. He believed that with diverting measures and the dissemination of more information, tourists would choose different destinations and the overcrowding problem in individual tourist locations would be alleviated.
- (b) In addition to the improvements to the walking trail that connected the Tung Chung Town Centre with the Tung Chung Development Pier for enhancing visitors' walking experience, the department might also consider improving the public transport services connecting the two locations to save visitors' time and efforts on walking, so as to attract more tourists to travel between Tung Chung and Tuen Mun or Tai O by water transport.
- (c) The roads on Lantau Island, such as South Lantau Road, still had considerable spare capacity because they were closed roads where the traffic volumes were limited. In addition, as the department planned to enhance the resilience of relevant road network under emergency situations, various improvement works had to be carried out. He hoped that the department would clearly explain the above reasons when conducting public consultations in the future, so as to ease public concerns over the waste of public funds in large-scale construction projects.
- (d) He reiterated that South Lantau Road was built for the construction of the Shek Pik Reservoir, and some sections of the road might no longer meet the current standards for road design. The department should take the opportunity to upgrade the entire South Lantau Road by, for example, rebuilding the sub-base and resurfacing with asphalt etc., so

that road excavations or maintenance could be carried out quickly through cold milling and resurfacing in the future. Currently, South Lantau Road had to be resurfaced in sections, and the works for a road section of only 200 to 300 metres long could take three months, during which the relevant road section would be closed intermittently. Cold milling and resurfacing were preferable in terms of long-term efficiency and maintenance.

- (e) He opined that it was more straightforward and desirable to build a new road tunnel to connect Mui Wo with North Lantau. A tunnel connecting Mui Wo with Discovery Bay would be shorter and the project cost would be lower as well. However, as the tunnel would connect with the existing roads and tunnels in Discovery Bay, the Government might need to spend money to resume the franchises of some private roads or tunnels. In addition, residents of Discovery Bay loved the quiet and low-traffic local environment, but the new tunnel would inevitably increase the traffic flow in Discovery Bay. Therefore, he opined that the proposal was less desirable. He understood that the new road tunnel was intended to connect Mui Wo with Siu Ho Wan because Siu Ho Wan would have a large population. However, he had doubts about the number of residents who needed to commute to and from South Lantau every day for work or school. As a result, he suggested that the new road tunnel should connect Mui Wo with Tai Ho, so that the road network between northern and southern Lantau Island would be improved and drivers could also make their way to destinations on eastern or western Lantau Island via the future Tai Ho Interchange.
- (f) Regarding the improvements to the road connection between Keung Shan Road/Tung Chung and Tai O, he understood that the construction of an elevated vehicular bridge could solve the current problems brought about by the steep and winding Keung Shan Road, and the cost of the works would be slightly lower than that for the construction of a road tunnel. However, as the site was located in the country park, the construction of an elevated vehicular bridge would have an impact on the ecology, and the local residents and green groups might not agree to the proposal. Therefore, he suggested that the department should alternatively build a new road tunnel to connect Shek Pik with Tai O Road.
- (g) He welcomed the department's study on the improvements to the Pak Kung Au to Cheung Sha section of Old Tung Chung Road for the purpose of diverting the traffic in both directions and providing cycle tracks for visitors. However, he hoped that the department would also conduct a study on improving the Pak Kung Au to Tung Chung section of Old Tung Chung Road to ease the traffic on the road section, and even study how to allow buses to make a U-turn at Pak Kung Au

to provide more convenient bus service for the public going to the Sunset Peak.

- (h) He opined that some of the proposals raised in the Study and the approach to allow only public transport to access the road section were not justified and would result in wastage of resources. At present, the residents had to pay an annual fee of \$900 for a Lantau Closed Road Permit (LCRP). He did not understand why the department would still restrict the public's right to use the roads when there was not much traffic. It would be better not to issue the LCRPs at all. It was a different issue from the bus-only lanes on Tuen Mun Road during peak hours.
- (i) He agreed to the proposal to improve public water transport services. In addition to the improvements to the piers at Man Kok Tsui and Yi O, the department also planned to build new pier facilities along the South Lantau Coast (such as Tong Fuk, Cheung Sha and Pui O). This initiative would not only complement the land-based transport of Lantau Island and increase its capacity to receive visitors, but also make a response to Members' request for years that the Government should, while building the incinerator at Shek Kwu Chau, upgrade the pier facilities in South Lantau, so that the local economy could be boosted when the public and tourists visited the "waste-to-energy" infrastructure in Shek Kwu Chau in the future.

14. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) With regard to the Tung Chung New Town Extension (TCNTE) project, Members had proposed for many times to open Chui Kwan Drive of the North Lantau Hospital to alleviate the traffic from Yu Tung Road and Shun Tung Road to the urban area in the past discussions over the development of Tung Chung West and Tung Chung East. Members had also indicated to the department that as different works were in progress in Tung Chung West, the various road sections nearby were becoming increasingly busy and traffic in the vicinity could be alleviated with the opening of Chui Kwan Drive. In addition, Members had proposed to improve Tat Tung Road since the previous term of the District Council. He hoped the department would, based on this study, alleviate the problem of buses accessing the terminus and the longstanding congestion problem on relevant road sections.
- (b) Regarding the construction of cycle tracks, it had been stated both by the Sustainable Lantau Office (SLO) and in the Policy Address that Tung Chung would be developed into a low-carbon smart community, and he had also mentioned several times that the department's intention of building cycle tracks was to promote environmental

friendly by encouraging members of the public to use bicycles to go to various public transport stations. Therefore, he suggested that the cycle track network should be extended to all private housings, community centres, schools and public housing estates in the district, so that members of the public could go to the bus termini and all the upcoming MTR stations in Tung Chung by cycling. To this end, the department was suggested to study the arrangement of bicycle parking spaces, for example, by making reference to the practices of other countries. The former Commissioner for Transport had also introduced the smart bicycle parking system to Members. He hoped that the department could conduct a study on the construction of relevant ancillary facilities for the cycle tracks.

- (c) The District Council had discussed the Lantau North-South Road Link to connect Mui Wo and Tai Ho Wan as early as year 2000. However, the elevated vehicular bridge proposal would cause pollution to the Tai Ho Stream and failed to pass the environmental impact assessment. As a result, there came the discussions on the construction of a tunnel to connect Mui Wo and Siu Ho Wan. It had been 22 years since the proposal was approved by the Legislative Council. He strongly supported the recommendations of the study. However, he hoped a dual-tube design would be adopted for the tunnel in order to cope with various major developments in the future.
- (d) As for the improvements to the Old Tung Chung Road, he enquired of the department whether it was feasible to rebuild the relevant road section into a cycle track that was up to standard. In addition, the number of hikers visiting Pak Kung Au and the Sunset Peak had been increasing in recent years. As buses needed to stop at the bus stop at Pak Kung Au, the traffic at the concerned location was very congested. He had learned from the bus company that in response to passenger demand, additional special departure services for Pak Kung Au were provided. Although Pak Kung Au was within the country park area, the department still needed to study the feasibility of building a roundabout and providing parking spaces there, so that the traffic problem at Pak Kung Au could be alleviated and buses could make a U-turn at the location without needing to proceed to Cheung Sha.
- (e) Regarding the road improvement works in South Lantau, he was in favour of the department's proposal to provide charging facilities for electric vehicles. In addition, there was currently a shortage of parking spaces across the various districts of South Lantau, but the department did not highlight the issue in the paper.
- (f) With regard to Lantau Island's capacity to receive visitors, he asked whether the department had studied how to disseminate information in a timely manner when the capacity was saturated, so as to suggest

other people consider not to go to such areas. In addition, he was in favour of the department's proposal to improve the accommodation arrangement, and opined that this would not only help promote the economy of Lantau, but also reduce the traffic load brought by visitors making a same day return trip.

- (g) He was in favour of the proposal to improve the pier facilities in South Lantau.

15. Mr HO Chun-fai expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Discussions on the improvements to the roads in South Lantau had been going on for many years, but the department often emphasised the principle of "Conservation for the South", promoting a belief among members of the public that infrastructure construction was not suitable for South Lantau, otherwise the environment would be damaged. He opined that the principle of "Conservation for the South" hindered the development of the traffic and transport infrastructure in South Lantau. Places such as Mui Wo and Cheung Sha would be developed into popular tourist destinations, but no significant improvement had been made to the roads in South Lantau since the 1950s. He said that the improvement works did not require a huge capital input, nor did it involve any complicated process. As long as some bends were straightened and widened by about one metre, the problem that vehicles could only pass the road section when those in the opposite lane stopped to give way would be alleviated. However, since there were not many improvements on the traffic and transport infrastructure in the area under the principle of "Conservation for the South", coupled with the TD's recent decision to increase the quota under the "Driving on Lantau Island" Scheme, there was discontent among the residents.
- (b) He had mentioned in the past that there was no passing bay on the uphill road section from Pui O to Mui Wo. He questioned why the department did not conduct any relevant studies. In addition, the bus bay on the lane in the opposite direction was actually designed for smaller buses in the past, therefore it could not fully accommodate the current buses. Moreover, the number of tourists had increased significantly in recent years, and passengers who crossed the road after getting off the bus would be obscured by the buses, thus posing dangers to them. The Planning Department (PlanD) had carried out planning for the lands in Pui O in recent years. He had mentioned many times that a road should be at least 30 metres away from the country park area, so as to avoid time-consuming consultations with the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department and other relevant departments when road widening was required in the future. He hoped the departments could strengthen communications, and

conduct a review of the roads in South Lantau through the study to understand the problems.

- (c) He understood that the proposal of allowing only public transport on certain road sections was based on the planning principle of “Conservation for the South”. However, it was pointless to restrict vehicle access to the closed roads and continue the study on the traffic and transport of Lantau Island while there remained spare road capacity.
- (d) As early as 20 years ago, the District Council had indicated that the construction of a tunnel connecting Tai Ho could not only prevent serious accidents on Tung Chung Road from affecting the external land transport of South Lantau, but also greatly shorten the journeys to Tuen Mun, Chek Lap Kok, Tsing Yi, Tsuen Wan and Tsim Sha Tsui. It was the most ideal plan. He asked the department to consider the proposal carefully.
- (e) Regarding the improvements to the public water transport, when the Government was planning to build an incinerator at Shek Kwu Chau, Members had asked the department to provide relevant supporting facilities and build pier facilities in the area, but the proposal had not been implemented. He supported the department’s plan to improve public water transport, so that residents of Pui O, Cheung Chau and Lamma Island could travel by water transport in general and tourism in the district would be boosted.
- (f) The improvement works for Tung Chung Road had been discussed for many years, but no enhancement works had been carried out at Pak Kung Au, causing a loss of tourism in the district. The department should build a roundabout and provide more parking spaces at Pak Kung Au. Tourists visiting the Sunset Peak often expressed their wish for a viewing platform to be set up there to enjoy the fascinating landscape of the airport and South Lantau. He suggested that the department consider the proposal.

16. Mr FONG Lung-fei expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He expressed concern about the study on the artificial islands in the Central Waters and believed that the department had drawn on Dubai’s experience on artificial islands. During the construction of the artificial islands, since sand and stones would be washed away due to the changes in the water current, some beaches on nearby islands would become deep water areas while some deep water areas would turn into shoals. Since Kau Yi Chau was close to the artificial islands, he was worried that the construction would cause changes in the water current, and sand and stones would be washed to Sai Wan

and Victoria Harbour, affecting the water depth of Victoria Harbour and even the safety of the three road tunnels across Victoria Harbour. In addition, the department also needed to study whether the sand, stones and water current would cause more serious wave problems in the coastal area of Sai Wan during extreme weather and affect the third runway under construction at the Hong Kong International Airport.

- (b) The department also needed to consider whether the changes in the water current caused by the works would have any impact on Macau and Zhuhai. Macau had suffered from the salt tide problem more than ten years ago. During flood tides in November and December, sea water would flood into reservoirs, affecting the supply of fresh water. In addition, he said Dubai still needed to spend huge amounts of money on the repairs and maintenance of the artificial islands, therefore, the problems that might arise after the completion of the artificial islands could not be ignored.
- (c) With regard to the winding and narrow roads in South Lantau, as the pointed bays in Sha Lo Wan, Sham Wat and Tai O were actually on a straight line, and most tourists would visit Tai O during holidays, the department might consider building a bridge to connect the three places, so as to alleviate the traffic problem between Tung Chung and Tai O and ease the traffic load on the roads in South Lantau, which was in line with the planning principle of “Conservation for the South”. Since the current new reclamation method did not require dredging of sediment, marine pollution could be reduced. He suggested that the department should conduct an assessment to see whether the impact on marine ecology and natural environment could be minimised if a bridge was to be built to connect the three places on the shore.

17. The Vice-chairman opined that except for the proposal to construct a new road tunnel to connect Mui Wo and Siu Ho Wan, most of the proposals put forward in the Study could not alleviate the traffic problems of Lantau Island. He also said improvement works for the Old Tung Chung Road was a waste of resources, and it was preferable to use the road as a cycle track. He criticised that the department had no knowledge of the geographical environment of Lantau Island. He supported the department’s proposal to improve public water transport and enhance tourist accommodation facilities to alleviate the crowdedness on public transport. The majority of tourists would travel back to the urban area by buses at dusk and the long queues of waiting passengers seriously affected the Lantau residents returning home from work. However, if the department only referred to the number of tourists in recent years under the epidemic as a criterion for the visitor receiving capacity, it might not be able to cope with the vigorous development of the Guangdong-Hong Kong-Macao Greater Bay Area in the future. In addition, due to the high operating cost of ferries, apart from studying the construction of new pier facilities, the department should also understand that it was not easy to find a suitable ferry operator

by tendering, and detailed studies should be carried out. He hoped the department would implement mitigation measures and learn about the local conditions before implementing the plans, and not to work behind closed doors.

18. Mr Randy YU expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He added although he had mentioned just now that it was better to build a road tunnel to connect Shek Pik with Tai O than an elevated vehicular bridge, as he read the paper carefully, he found the department used “and/or” between the two proposals, so he reiterated that Members would welcome it if both of the proposals were to be adopted, but the tunnel proposal was more suitable if only one proposal could be opted for.
- (b) When the Chek Lap Kok Airport was constructed in the 1990s, the Government had promised to build a north-south road link connecting Mui Wo and Tung Chung and a coastal road connecting Tung Chung and Tai O. Residents had been looking forward to the projects for more than 30 years and had always hoped the promise would be fulfilled. As mentioned by Mr FONG Lung-fei, if the department hoped to achieve “Development in the North; Conservation for the South”, it might consider the coastal road proposal. Since the works would have less impact on the environment, and an environmental impact assessment and other procedures would be carried out by the department, he believed there would be no problem. Compared with the immense scale of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge, if a parallel coastal road of a smaller scale was to be built, the cost issue might be a bigger concern. In addition, the coastal road connecting Tung Chung and Tai O and the north-south road link connecting Mui Wo and Tai Ho would form a circular road network on Lantau Island, with which the land traffic would not be paralysed by landslips or serious traffic accidents in any part of Lantau Island. Therefore, he hoped that the above proposals could be included in the study.

19. Mr Godfrey HO made consolidated responses as follows:

- (a) Regarding the proposed tunnel to connect Mui Wo and Discovery Bay, as the Study considered that the existing Discovery Bay Tunnel still had spare capacity, the department planned to investigate in the next stage that whether it was feasible to make use of the Discovery Bay Tunnel to improve the resilience of the North-South Lantau’s road network under emergency situations. In addition, the department would also review the proposals to connect Mui Wo with Siu Ho Wan and Tai Ho respectively. When the preliminary results were available, the department would consult local residents before proceeding to the subsequent stage of study. The department noted Members’ views, and would review the proposals for the construction

of some new bridges or a new road tunnel on Keung Shan Road.

- (b) Regarding the proposals to provide cycle tracks from Pak Kung Au to Shek Mun Kap on the Old Tung Chung Road, and a new roundabout at Pak Kung Au as a bus terminus to facilitate the visitors and the U-turns of buses for avoiding congestion, since part of the concerned road sections were within the country park areas, the department would conduct a review in the next stage of study to examine the impact of the proposed works on the environment and ecology.
- (c) The department noted Members' views on the improvement of the pier facilities in South Lantau, and anticipated that the improvement of the public water transport would facilitate tourists' visits to different tourism attractions in South Lantau.
- (d) Since the study in the next stage would mainly focus on improving the road connection within Lantau, the department would, under the existing mechanism, forward Members' proposals on the road improvement and traffic and transport issues in Tung Chung to the relevant departments for follow-up actions. In addition, the proposal of the construction of cycle tracks connecting the three MTR stations in Tung Chung, as the traffic and transport improvement measures in the district, was also noted by the department.
- (e) With regard to electric vehicle (EV) charging facilities, the department had set up an EV charging station in Mui Wo in 2021, and the EV charging facilities at the public car parks in Tai O would be available for public use in the third quarter of this year. The charging stations were currently managed by the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) and provided free charging services. Fee charging software had been installed in the charging facilities to support the Government's measures to levy EV charging fees in the future.
- (f) The department planned to conduct a study to explore the provision of crowdedness information at tourist hotspots. The SLO had been discussing with start-ups in the Hong Kong Science Park with a view to providing tourists with real-time information on the crowdedness in Tai O through a platform, for example using different colours to indicate the crowdedness in Tai O, so that tourists could decide whether to continue their trips. In addition, a number of improvement works would be carried out in Tai O, such as the proposed Po Chue Tam Footbridge. It was anticipated that such improvement works could improve the pedestrian connection in the area and facilitate the uses of tourists and local residents.
- (g) The department would review in the next stage of study the feasibility of constructing new pier facilities in the coast of South Lantau, such as

Tong Fuk and Cheung Sha, to improve the public water transport.

- (h) The department was aware that various departments had carried out different local road improvement works in South Lantau, including road widening and bend improvement. Therefore, the department would discuss with the relevant departments in the next stage to further explore improving some road sections in South Lantau. The department welcomed the views from Members on the priority of road sections which needed to be improved, to enhance the road safety of South Lantau.
- (i) The department noted that Members had expressed a strong request for constructing an elevated vehicular bridge to connect Tung Chung and Tai O over the past years. However, the study showed that the proposal would cause serious environmental impacts on the conservation areas of Tai O. The elevated bridge would also damage the unique fishing village landscape of Tai O and might affect a lot of private lands. In addition, the proposal also involved high costs. Given that the main roads in South Lantau still had considerable spare capacity, the study considered that there were no sufficient justifications in terms of traffic flow to support the construction of large-scale traffic and transport infrastructure for connecting the North and South Lantau.
- (j) With regard to the improvement of Tung Chung Road, the department would extend the study area from the road section between South Lantau and Pak Kung Au to the road section between South Lantau and Shek Mun Kap.
- (k) The SLO would convey the Members' views on the impacts of the artificial islands in the Central Waters on the surrounding environment to the relevant teams of the department.
- (l) With regard to the suggestion of converting the Old Tung Chung Road into a cycle track to avoid conflicts between cyclists and other road users on the new Tung Chung Road, the department would include the proposal into the study in the next stage.
- (m) The department had commenced "Initiatives for South Lantau Eco-recreation Corridor – Investigation Study" in the end of 2021 to explore the provision of diversified and sustainable leisure and recreational facilities at different locations in South Lantau so as to provide visitors with different experiences and help divert the visitors to different locations, and reduce the impacts on Tai O residents.

20. Mr HO Chun-fai said that the mountain bike trails and practice ground in Mui Wo had been put into use. Currently, many people would depart from Mui Wo,

ride a mountain bike to the Chi Ma Wan Mountain Bike Trail, and exit near the Swire properties on the middle section of the South Lantau Road. The cyclists were in groups. Sometimes a group could have nearly 100 participants. If they suddenly appeared on South Lantau Road, it could easily cause traffic accidents. Therefore, he suggested that in addition to the studies on the widening of the relevant road sections, the department should also consider providing cycle tracks to avoid the situation where cyclists competed with other vehicles for the road space.

21. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He supported the planning principle of “Development in the North; Conservation for the South”. Although some Members were worried that conservation would hinder development, as stated in a paper dated November 2000 of the Panel on Transport of the Legislative Council on the Lantau North-South Road Link, the Government had given sufficient considerations to the need to balance conservation and development. The paper concluded “We remain of the view that a safe road connection between northern and southern Lantau Island is needed. The Administration is committed to building an environmentally acceptable road that can both meet the needs of Lantau residents and support the conservation of the island’s ecologically important areas. Our study on the Mui Wo-Tai Ho Road is a clear indication of our wish to find a solution. As we cannot identify an acceptable simple solution, we will have to look for a solution involving long tunnels. The safety requirements for a long tunnel require a twin tube tunnel which will provide capacity much higher than the demand arising from the rural countryside development in South Lantau. We are proceeding urgently to examine the best alignment for the alternative option, together with EPD and PlanD, with a view to identifying an environmentally acceptable and safe solution to address the transportation needs of Lantau residents.” In accordance with the 2004 Policy Address, the Government also established the Lantau Development Task Force in the same year. After an extensive consultation, an overall planning framework for the development of Lantau was formulated, which clearly stated the need to strike a balance between development and conservation. The Government had kept its promise, so he was in favour of the proposal.
- (b) The department indicated that as the construction of a coastal road from Tung Chung to Tai O would damage the coastal ecology, it would be difficult for the project to pass the environmental impact assessment and objections would be received from green groups. He had written to the then Chief Executive and expressed his views in the District Council on the Policy Address of previous term of the Government, proposing to the Government the construction of an elevated light rail transit system to connect Tung Chung and Tai O. The proposed solution could minimise the impacts to the coastal

ecology and air pollution. In addition, he had also proposed to the Airport Authority Hong Kong that it should consider building an elevated light rail transit system linking Tung Chung and the town centre, or working with the Government to build an elevated light rail transit system to connect Tung Chung and Tai O. The Airport Authority Hong Kong was planning to build an autonomous transportation system, which might extend to the Tung Chung Town Centre in the future. The system would help alleviate the pressure on road traffic, promote environmental friendly and reduce air pollution.

22. Mr FONG Lung-fei supported the department's study on the improvements to the public water transport. He said it only took 25 minutes to travel from Tai O to the Tung Chung Development Pier by ferry, which was much faster than taking buses. Since there were always long queues of passengers in Tai O waiting for the buses commuting to the urban areas on weekends and holidays, and the opening of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge had brought challenges to the companies providing ferry services between Hong Kong and Macau, he suggested that the department should liaise with the ferry company to see whether they could provide additional vessels and departure services on holidays, so as to enhance the capacity of water transport and reduce the pressure on bus services.

23. Mr Godfrey HO made consolidated responses as follows:

- (a) The department was planning to implement expansion or associated works for some mountain bike trails, including exploring the construction of a new mountain bike trail on the road section from Pui O to Mui Wo, so as to reduce the chances of mountain bike cyclists using the South Lantau Road. A mountain bike practice ground had been opened for public use in Mui Wo, with various trail sections connecting to other parts of South Lantau. The mountain bike trails were expected to open for public use by the end of this year.
- (b) With regard to "Development in the North; Conservation for the South", the SLO had been, since its establishment, carrying out ecological studies in different areas of South Lantau in phases to identify and conserve ecologically important sites and to explore suitable conservation measures with a view to promoting the conservation work of South Lantau. In addition, the department also encouraged non-profit making organisations to carry out conservation-related projects via the Lantau Conservation Fund (LCF). So far, 18 conservation-related projects had been approved in the first round of the LCF and were launched successively. The LCF was currently open for the second round of applications and the results were expected to be announced in the third quarter of this year.

24. Mr Tony NGAI said that in response to the demand for transport services from Tung Chung to Tai O, the Fortune Ferry Company Limited started providing

additional short-haul route “Tung Chung - Sha Lo Wan - Tai O” on Saturdays, Sundays and public holidays from August 2018 on a trial basis. This service became regular service now, i.e. three additional round-trip ferry services (six trips in total) were provided on Saturdays, Sundays and public holidays. In addition, in the 2019 Policy Address, the Government suggested providing Special Helping Measures to six outlying island ferry routes and the measures would be extended to eight other outlying island ferry routes, including “Tuen Mun - Tung Chung - Sha Lo Wan - Tai O” route. The Government would also launch a new Vessel Subsidy Scheme to replace the fleets of 11 ferry routes and introduce greener vessels, including “Tuen Mun - Tung Chung - Sha Lo Wan - Tai O” route, within a decade from 2021 in two phases, so as to enhance the service quality and promote a greener city. The Government also planned to subsidise the Fortune Ferry Company Limited for the replacement of all the five existing vessels with 250-seater hybrid fast vessels for “Tuen Mun - Tung Chung - Sha Lo Wan - Tai O” route during the licence period from 2026 to 2031.

(Mr Randy YU left the meeting at around 3:15 p.m.)

IV. Question on Lantau Closed Road Permit Fees
(Paper T&TC 16/2022)

25. The Vice-chairman welcomed Ms FUNG Sin-yee, Mini, Senior Transport Officer/Islands 2 of the TD to the meeting to respond to the question, and said Mr WONG Man-hon had asked him to present the question.

26. The Vice-chairman briefly presented the question.

27. Ms Mini FUNG responded as follows:

- (a) At present, Tung Chung Road, especially the road section to the south of the junction with the Shek Mun Kap Road, and all the roads in South Lantau were closed roads. According to the Road Traffic (Registration and Licensing of Vehicles) Regulations (Cap. 374E), any person who wished to drive a motor vehicle on a closed road had to apply for a closed road permit with the payment of the permit fee. Currently, residents and business operators on South Lantau could apply to the TD for a LCRP to enter Tung Chung Road. The department would also issue LCRPs to those who had genuine needs to enter South Lantau for reasons such as implementation of construction works, performance of official duties, weddings, funerals, tomb sweeping and so on. The LCRP fees were \$900 per annum or \$75 per month for first issue, and \$660 per annum or \$55 per month for renewal.
- (b) In recent year, the department had from time to time received complaints about abuses of application eligibility, such as abuses of

authorisation letters or the use of abandoned land lots in applications, etc. As a result, the department had conducted a review of the arrangement for LCRP application. After consultations with the Traffic and Transport Committee of the Islands District Council and the stakeholders in the second half of 2022, a revised LCRP application mechanism was implemented from January 1 this year, in order to maintain and adhere to the principle of issuing LCRPs to those who had genuine needs.

- (c) Under the revised mechanism, application for renewal was only applicable to non-temporary LCRPs. As temporary LCRPs were issued on a short-term basis to those who had genuine needs to access the closed roads on South Lantau, the department had cancelled the renewal arrangement for temporary LCRPs. If necessary, holders of temporary LCRPs could apply for a new LCRP prior to the expiry dates of their current LCRPs, and the department would process the applications in accordance with the established approval procedures for the issue of new LCRPs.
- (d) Since Pak Mong Village, Ngau Kwu Long and Tai Ho in Mui Wo were all located outside the closed road area, residents could drive a private car to and from the urban area using the existing open roads, and permits for driving a private car to access South Lantau were not necessary in daily life. If residents of the relevant areas needed to drive a private car to access South Lantau, they could apply to the department for a permit with the provision of sufficient justifications. The department would consider and deal with the applications on a case-by-case basis.

28. Mr HO Chun-fai said that residents of the three villages used to be eligible for application for LCRPs prior to the completion of the Tsing Ma Bridge. Due to the close relation among the villages on Lantau Island, residents would go to other villages via Mui Wo when visiting their relatives. He opined that it was unreasonable for the department to exclude Pak Mong Village, Ngau Kwu Long and Tai Ho from the application for LCRPs after the opening of the Tsing Ma Bridge on grounds that the three villages were not located within the closed road area. He reiterated that residents had lived and worked in Mui Wo, Cheung Sha, Pui O and Tai O for a long time, and seldom visited the urban area. The department's exclusion of the three villages from the application for LCRPs made it inconvenient for residents who needed to go to Mui Wo for business or the spring and autumn ancestral worship. He pointed out that Sheung Shui residents who had needs could apply for a Closed Area Permit for entering Sha Tau Kok, but while the three villages were under the management of the Mui Wo Rural Committee, their residents were ineligible for application for a LCRP.

29. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) The department used the existence of counterfeit permits as an explanation for the increase in the LCRP renewal fee. He opined that the problem of counterfeit permits should be dealt with by the Police, while the TD should be responsible for the administrative work. Therefore, he suggested writing to the TD to ask how the 36% increase in the renewal fee was calculated. He said that in the early years, application for LCRPs was free of charge. Subsequently, an administrative fee of \$60 was charged and was then raised to \$120. The then Members of the District Council had expressed their dissatisfaction with the arrangement. However, the department subsequently further increased the application fee for a LCRP to over \$400 and said that there would be no further substantial increase in the fee. Nowadays, the application fee for a LCRP had been increased to \$900. The department had to explain to residents of South Lantau how to calculate the increase.
- (b) He had proposed repeatedly in the District Council the installation of an electronic identification system at Shek Mun Kap for detecting vehicles without a valid permit. After the last meeting of the Traffic and Transport Committee, the department said that in order to strengthen the traffic control over the closed roads on Lantau Island, the CEDD, after discussions with the TD and the Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF), had commissioned the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department to conduct a proof-of-concept to study the feasibility of using technology and instrument to identify vehicles accessing the closed roads on Lantau Island without a valid LCRP. The system installation works had commenced in May this year. It was expected that the instrument setup at site would be completed in 2023, followed by an on-site commissioning for one year. When the system was put into use, the process of vehicle identification would be as simple as a vehicle passing through an automatic toll booth in a tunnel, and the administrative workload and the relevant cost would be greatly reduced. Meanwhile, there would be much less justification for the increase of the LCRP fees.

30. Mr FONG Lung-fei said that the indigenous residents of Lantau Island had lived in the area for a long time, the department should not require them to pay a fee for going home because of the changes of the policy. Also, the fees had increased significantly. A rural committee member who needed to go to Tai O for a meeting could only take public transport if without a LCRP. He did not understand why it was so difficult for the indigenous residents to apply for a LCRP. He said that the Government had increased the quotas under the “Driving on Lantau Island” Scheme without raising the permit fees in order to promote tourism. He opined that the Government’s policy should target tourists instead of shifting the cost to residents. The high oil price and the 36% increase in the LCRP fees had severely increased the burden on residents who drove. He understood that the Government wanted to encourage citizens to use public transport, but the transport services on South Lantau

was unsatisfactory, therefore the department should review the fee increase.

31. Mr HO Chun-fai said that in the early years, residents had chartered vessels for travelling to and from Yau Ma Tei at their own expense. Later, a fee was charged for LCRPs. Since the LCRPs could only be used within Lantau Island, the fee was \$250, which was a quarter of that of a vessel licence. He said that villagers now had to pay up to \$660 and \$900 for driving to the South Lantau area while the permit fee under the “Driving on Lantau Island” Scheme was relatively cheap, which was unfair.

32. Ms Mini FUNG made a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) The department understood Members’ concerns over the LCRP fees. The department had cancelled the renewal arrangement for temporary LCRPs since the beginning of this year. As a result, some persons who used to use a temporary LCRP had to pay \$900 to apply for a new permit from this year. She reiterated that residents of South Lantau were generally issued with a non-temporary LCRP if they made an application, and application for renewal was still applicable to non-temporary LCRPs, so residents could continue to renew their permits at a fee of \$660 per annum.
- (b) The department always adhered to the principle of “user pays”. The LCRP fees were determined based on the administrative cost incurred in the application processing procedures. The department understood that some residents had actual needs to visit South Lantau, for example, for business reasons. Therefore, applications would be dealt with on a case-by-case basis as always.
- (c) The department noted Members’ concerns and views, and would review the arrangement in a timely manner in the light of the development and road traffic of Lantau Island and other factors, so as to maintain and adhere to the principle of issuing LCRPs to those who had genuine needs.

33. Mr Eric KWOK said that residents of South Lantau had few responses to the fee increase because no consultation had been conducted by the department, hence residents were not aware of it. Otherwise, there would be strong responses among the villagers.

34. The Vice-chairman expressed his views as follows:

- (a) The department said that it had consulted the major stakeholders on the increase of the permit fees, but Members present and local residents knew nothing about it, he suspected that there was dereliction of duty or fraud on the part of the department. In addition, villagers did not foresee the needs to attend emergency meetings, weddings or funerals,

so it was impossible for them to apply for a LCRP in advance. He had no idea of the department's criteria for issuing LCRPs. He said that the department was at the end of its tether in dealing with illegal conducts such as permit trading or forging, but it was unfair if the department just arbitrarily passed the relevant cost to law-abiding citizens.

- (b) Pak Mong Village, Ngau Kwu Long and Tai Ho were all under the Mui Wo Rural Committee. However, residents of the nearby Sha Lo Wan were eligible for application for a LCRP, but villagers of the three villages were not. The villagers thought it was not fair.
- (c) Currently, there was not much reaction from the residents because most of their LCRPs had not yet expired. When they applied for a new permit later and found that the application fee had increased from \$660 to \$900, they would definitely express their dissatisfaction.

V. Question on the addition of a carpark at Shui Hau Village
(Paper T&TC 17/2022)

35. The Vice-chairman welcomed Mr WONG Yui-him, Tim, Engineer/Islands 1 of the TD to the meeting to respond to the question.

36. Mr HO Chun-fai briefly presented the question.

37. Mr Tim WONG responded as follows:

- (a) The department had conducted a feasibility study on the proposal to build a public carpark on a piece of land on South Lantau Road near the lamp posts numbered FA3506 to FA3507 at Shui Hau Village (i.e. the location mentioned in the question). The land concerned was designated as a marine reserve in the approved South Lantau Coast Outline Zoning Plan No. S/SLC/21. According to the notes of the outline zoning plan, "public carpark" use was not a permitted use within a marine reserve. The planning permission from the Town Planning Board was required for land filling or excavation works within a marine reserve.
- (b) Since the site was a tree-covered slope, the construction of a public carpark would require the removal or relocation of a large number of trees for site formation works, which might affect rare and protected woodland bird species and reptile and amphibian species of conservation significance. For the above reasons, the department had no plan to build a public carpark at the location in the current stage.
- (c) The department had provided the public with information on public

parking spaces on southern Lantau Island to facilitate drivers in need. The department also encouraged members of the public to use public transport as much as possible and reduce reliance on private cars, especially when going to Shui Hau Village or other locations without parking spaces. The TD would refer the problem of illegal parking in the vicinity of Shui Hau Village to the Police for follow-up. However, the department was also reviewing with relevant departments whether it was feasible to provide a certain number of on-street parking spaces for private cars in the bus bay on the westbound carriageway of South Lantau Road near east Shui Hau Village, and would carry out district consultations in due course. The department would continue to closely monitor the traffic condition of the relevant road section and would take appropriate measures to ensure road safety when necessary.

38. Mr HO Chun-fai believed that the TD's response would cause dissatisfaction among villagers. As many tourists would visit Shui Hau for windsurfing and bird watching activities, coupled with the indiscriminate parking of vehicles under the "Driving on Lantau Island" Scheme, residents were seriously affected and even U-turns by buses were obstructed. Residents had sought assistance from the Police many times. However, when he reported the problem to the TD, the department refused to respond on the grounds of conservation. Earlier, some bird watching societies and university groups wanted to hold cultural and conservation tours in Shui Hau and the Government even planned to build an exhibition hall there, he had raised the need to solve the problem of parking spaces for coaches and visitors. He reiterated that the residents were in favour of the conservation activities provided that the department had to resolve the problem of parking spaces first. He hoped that the department would take into account the practical needs of villagers and the public, rather than dismissing the proposal to build a carpark just on the grounds that the area was a marine reserve.

39. Mr Eric KWOK said that the department had to seriously consider the proposal to provide parking spaces at Shui Hau Village. Apart from Shui Hau Village, places such as Pui O and Mui Wo also faced the problem of parking space shortage, but the situation at Shui Hau Village was more urgent. He opined that the department was using the marine reserve and green belt as excuses to refuse to conduct any studies or improve the local transportation facilities. The department might now consider carrying out site formation works at the area behind the Shui Hau Public Toilet for designing and expanding the area to provide parking spaces, and should later discuss with the village representatives and villagers on the provision of additional parking spaces at other locations as far as possible without compromising the marine reserve, rather than shirking its responsibility.

40. Mr HO Chun-fai said that the department had conducted an on-site inspection for the construction of a carpark at Shui Hau Village in the early years. At that time, it was determined that the construction of the facility under the Lo Kei Wan Bridge (transliteration) would have the least impact on the marine reserve and

was still feasible. However, due to the delay in action by the department, the area was now overgrown with vegetation. He pointed out that the location of the proposed carpark was actually inconvenient for villagers, but due to the space problem, they had no choice but to accept the decision of setting up a carpark on the left-hand side underneath the Lo Kei Wan Bridge opposite the village office. He asked the department to deal with the parking space problem in Shui Hau squarely and communicate with the relevant departments on how to strike a balance in the marine reserve. Villagers were very supportive of the environmental protection projects in Shui Hau, such as the bird watching activities and the guided tours, but the department failed to help the villagers solve the parking space problem in Shui Hau.

41. The Vice-chairman said it was disappointing that the department failed to provide the relevant facilities for local residents and tourists to solve the livelihood problems.

42. Mr Tim WONG said the department would study the feasibility of providing on-street parking spaces in the bus bay near east Shui Hau Village. In addition, the department knew that other departments were conducting studies on the construction of a conservation centre and other facilities in the vicinity of Shui Hau Village. The department would review the relevant development plans and request the project proponents to provide additional transport facilities as needed, so as to support the development of the projects and avoid affecting the traffic in the vicinity.

VI. Question on the addition of traffic lights and electronic audible traffic signals at Tong Fuk pedestrian crossing
(Paper T&TC 21/2022)

43. The Vice-chairman welcomed Mr WONG Yui-him, Tim, Engineer/Islands 1 of the TD to the meeting to respond to the question.

44. Mr HO Chun-fai played the video clip and briefly presented the question.

45. Mr Tim WONG responded as follows:

- (a) The department had conducted a road safety investigation on the road section concerned. At present, the section of South Lantau Road in front of the public carpark in Tong Fuk provided a clear vision and the traffic there was smooth in general. As the zebra crossing was in normal operation, and the traffic and pedestrian flows were low, there was no conflict between pedestrians and vehicles. Appropriate traffic signs and road markings had also been provided near the crossing to alert drivers to drive slowly as there might be pedestrians crossing the road ahead. Since the addition of unnecessary traffic lights might hinder and delay the traffic and pedestrian flows, and the electronic audible traffic signals would also cause noise nuisance to the nearby residential buildings, the department opined that the existing traffic

facilities at the crossing were appropriate and there was no need to add traffic lights at this stage.

- (b) The situation mentioned by the Member might involve careless driving. The department had forwarded the relevant information to the Police for follow-up. In addition, the department noticed that recently there had been suspected driving in an opposite direction of the traffic at the pedestrian crossing concerned. In view of the situation, the department had reviewed the road markings on the road section and arranged the works department to change the road markings near the zebra crossing to double white lines to further enhance road safety. According to the Road Users' Code, when approaching a zebra crossing, a driver had to look out for pedestrians waiting to cross and be ready to slow down or stop behind the "Give way" line to let them cross. Drivers had to stop and give way to anyone who had stepped onto a zebra crossing. In addition, drivers should signal to other drivers if they intended to slow down or stop. The department would continue to closely monitor the traffic condition of the relevant road section, and would take proper measures to maintain road safety when necessary.

46. Mr HO Chun-fai expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He had repeatedly raised the issue about the safety at the Tong Fuk pedestrian crossing at Traffic and Transport Committee meetings, including the requests for the installation of speed enforcement cameras, the reduction of the speed limit at the location to 30km/h, the change of road markings to double white lines and the addition of traffic lights. However, except for the proposal of double white lines, none of them were accepted by the department.
- (b) The "Driving on Lantau Island" Scheme was like a time bomb. In the video clip, since the view of the driver was obstructed by the bus, he did not know that there was a zebra crossing ahead and ended up overtaking the bus in an opposite direction. He did not want that to happen again. If there were pedestrians crossing the road at that time, the consequence would be dreadful. The department should not face up to the problem only after they happened.
- (c) Residents had requested to reduce the speed limit of the road section to 30km/h, but the department replied that to lower the speed limit from 70 km/h to 30 km/h, there had to be a road section with a speed limit of 50 km/h in between to provide a buffer. Therefore, he proposed to reduce the speed limit at the road section from Tai Tan to Tong Fuk Beach to 50m/h for lowering that of the Tong Fuk Village road section to 30 km/h, and add double white lines at appropriate locations, so as to solve the problem.

47. Mr Eric KWOK said that the vehicle in the video clip moved in an opposite direction of the traffic, the situation was very dangerous. There had been an accident in Tong Fuk in which a pedestrian crossing a zebra crossing was hit by a vehicle traveling in an opposite direction of the traffic. The traffic signs set up by the department were only applicable to law-abiding citizens, and enforcement actions against drivers who did not abide by the law had to be stepped up. He said that installation of speed enforcement cameras was preferable. If the department had concerns over the funding, it could explore the installation of CCTVs on the nearby lamp posts and the posting of notices to achieve a deterrent effect. He hoped that the department would do its best to solve the livelihood problems. If the proposal was unfeasible, the department should explain to villagers and implement short-term relief measures.

48. Mr HO Chun-fai said that the video clip had been forwarded to the traffic formation of the Police, and the Police had promptly prosecuted the driver to alert other drivers to slow down when passing the location. He reiterated that villagers were in favour of lowering the speed limit of the road section to 30 km/h and changing the road markings in the vicinity of the zebra crossing to double white lines to ensure the safety of pedestrians, especially during the peak tourism season. He hoped the department would accept the proposal to ease villagers' worries.

49. The Vice-chairman said that drivers had an unshirkable responsibility, but the department should also take precautions and actively follow up on the problem.

50. Mr Tim WONG said that the department would first change the broken lines on both ends of the relevant road section to double white lines, and at the same time continue to closely monitor the relevant road section. It would consider whether further actions were necessary having regard to the actual circumstances, including the installation of speed enforcement cameras, the addition of traffic lights at the pedestrian crossing and the imposition of speed limit.

VII. Question on the laying of anti-skid dressing on the downward slope of the dual carriageway of Tung Chung Road
(Paper T&TC 20/2022)

51. The Vice-chairman welcomed Ms HO Chung-yin, Engineer/Islands(3) of the Highways Department (HyD) to the meeting to respond to the question.

52. Mr HO Chun-fai briefly presented the question.

53. Ms HO Chung-yin responded as follows:

- (a) The HyD had dispatched personnel to conduct a detailed survey of the condition of the pavement of Tung Chung Road. It was found that the surface of some road sections suffered wear and tear after a certain

period of use. Therefore, the department had continuously arranged resurfacing of pavement to improve the road condition and restore the surface texture, thereby increasing the friction of the road surface. Currently, anti-skid dressing had been laid on some sections of Tung Chung Road. The department had also completed the re-laying of anti-skid dressing for the section of Tung Chung Road near Pak Kung Au in June this year.

- (b) For the section of Tung Chung Road near Wong Ka Wai, the department had received a works request form from the TD, and would complete the re-laying of anti-skid dressing within this year. As to the question whether anti-skid dressing was necessary at other locations, the department would deploy resources to carry out improvement works having regard to the traffic accident statistics prepared by the TD, the road surface conditions and test results.

54. Mr HO Chun-fai expressed his views as follows:

- (a) The gradient of some sections of Tung Chung Road was as steep as 1:6. The road surface widening works were appropriate for South Lantau. At present, anti-skid dressing was only laid for the road section from Pak Kung Au to Tung Chung, which was the steepest but offered a wide field of view. Meanwhile, the road section from Pak Kung Au to Cheung Sha was winding and only offered a constrained field of view, but the department seldom carried out improvement works for this road section. He said that actually this road section had a high frequency of traffic accidents, but no casualties or vehicle collisions were involved. The drivers had not reported them and therefore the TD did not have the relevant records.
- (b) He had once driven along Tung Chung Road at a speed of about 40km/h. When he was about to go downhill and make a turn after reaching the highest point of Pak Kung Au, he suddenly found that there was a broken down vehicle in front. Although he braked immediately, his car still skidded for about ten metres. He said that on rainy days, as soil and dried leaves on hills would be washed to the road, coupled with the pollutants left by vehicles, the road surface was very wet and slippery, making it difficult for people to stand still and also difficult for vehicles to start due to skidding. During the rainy season in summer and the peak tourism season, there were often breakdowns of buses, for which assistance from the Police was required to divert the traffic. However, none of the above situations had been reported to the TD. He asked the department to take precautions and lay anti-skid dressing for the downhill and winding road sections.

55. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He suggested that the department should raise the problems of Tung Chung Road when discussing with the CEDD on the Study. The works of Tung Chung Road were of poor quality. Even if resurfacing of pavement or laying of anti-skid dressing was carried out, pot holes would appear on the pavement after continuous heavy rain, resulting in uneven surface which posed danger to drivers. Although the department would repair the road surface regularly, the problem was endless. He said the main reason was that Tung Chung Road was not suitable for heavy vehicles. The department should conduct a study on restricting the access to Tung Chung Road by heavy vehicles. He had once witnessed a truck carrying heavy machinery travelling on the winding and sloping Tung Chung Road. He had also seen the metal I-beam on a truck that were casually tied with wires, which was very dangerous. In addition, he said it had been proposed in the District Council that access to Tung Chung Road by petrol tankers should be prohibited, but the proposal was not accepted by the department. Should there happen an accident involving a petrol tanker, the water sources in the catchwater and the Shek Pik Reservoir were likely to be polluted. He asked the department to seize the opportunity of the Study to review the existing problems of Tung Chung Road with the CEDD, so as to improve road safety and dovetail the policy on the opening up of South Lantau.
- (b) A proposal to connect Cheung Sha and Tung Chung with a tunnel in substitute for Tung Chung Road had been put forward in the District Council in the past, but it was not adopted in the end. As there existed many problems on Tung Chung Road, the department had to listen to the views of Members and review the problems with the CEDD and other departments concerned.

56. The Vice-chairman said that the department spent a lot of resources on the Study, but did not take the views of the then Members. If the tunnel proposal was adopted, Tung Chung Road could be opened for public use as a cycle track, and the road safety would be enhanced as well.

VIII. Question on the addition of motorcycle parking spaces in Tung Chung Central
(Paper T&TC 19/2022)

57. The Vice-chairman welcomed Ms HUI Shuk-yee, Engineer/Islands 2 of the TD to the meeting to respond to the question.

58. Mr FONG Lung-fei briefly presented the question.

59. Ms HUI Shuk-yee responded as follows:

- (a) Generally speaking, references had been made to the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) in the developments in the district for the provision of the required number of parking spaces. The TD would do its best to look for suitable sites to build temporary car parks when necessary, and would provide on-street parking spaces at locations where parking spaces were needed provided that the traffic, road safety and other road users would not be affected. In addition, the department would provide additional public parking spaces at suitable government organisations and community facilities or developments on public open spaces in accordance with the principle of “single site, multiple use”.
- (b) The department had earlier proposed to provide additional parking spaces at the existing motorcycle parking area on Man Tung Road near the Seaview Crescent to make better use of the road space. However, objections were received from the public during the public consultation, therefore the proposal was not implemented. The department had recently conducted an on-site inspection in the vicinity of Man Tung Road and noticed that there were sufficient parking spaces for motorcycles (including the motorcycle parking spaces in the nearby developments and the temporary carpark on Hei Tung Street). The department would continue to monitor the demand for motorcycle parking spaces in the area, and would look for suitable sites for the addition of on-street parking spaces for motorcycles where necessary and feasible.

60. Mr Eric KWOK said that the residents of Mun Tung Estate were very concerned about the possibility of adding on-street parking spaces for motorcycles in the Estate. He had conducted a site visit with the department half a year ago, during which the department said further studies would be carried out. He enquired about the progress.

61. Mr FONG Lung-fei was puzzled by the objections received by the department during the public consultation. He said that many people working in the Citygate Outlets would park their motorcycles at the motorcycle parking spaces beside Man Tung Road and they usually got off work late. When the residents returned to Tung Chung at dusk, the parking spaces were usually fully occupied. As a result, they had no choice but to illegally park their motorcycles beside the on-street parking spaces, and on the next morning there would be motorcycles illegally parked next to vacated parking spaces. In view of the situation, he asked the department to resolve the problem.

62. Ms HUI Shuk-yee said that after the on-site inspection, the department had sent staff to count the number of motorcycles at night. It was revealed that the demand for motorcycle parking spaces was low in the vicinity of Mun Tung Estate, but was high in the vicinity of Yat Tung Estate. Therefore, the department had decided to add a few dozens of parking spaces to the existing carpark in Yat Tung

Estate. The department noted the views of Members and would continue to monitor the demand for motorcycle parking spaces. If needed, the department would also look for suitable sites to provide more motorcycle parking spaces.

63. Mr FONG Lung-fei said the residents of Mun Tung Estate had reported that they had to park their motorcycles at the parking spaces outside Hong Yat House, and then go home on foot or by bicycle. That was why the demand for motorcycle parking spaces in the vicinity of Mun Tung Estate was low. He asked the department to take note of the situation.

64. Mr Eric KWOK said that according to the information he had obtained through surveys, the addition of motorcycle parking spaces was necessary for Mun Tung Estate. As there were not sufficient parking spaces in Mun Tung Estate, residents were often fined for illegal parking. Therefore, he advised residents to park their motorcycles behind Hong Yat House. The shortage of parking spaces gave rise to competition and conflicts among residents for parking spaces. The addition of on-street motorcycle parking spaces at Hong Yat House was the result of years of discussion, but the supply still fell short of the demand of Yat Tung Estate. As far as he knew, a small number of residents of Yu Tai Court would also park their motorcycles at Hong Yat House. Therefore, the department should provide more parking spaces in Mun Tung Estate. Even if only five or six parking spaces could be added, it was still worth considering.

65. Ms HUI Shuk-yee said the department noted the views of Members and would send staff for an inspection.

IX. Question on the development of Tung Chung West
(Paper T&TC 18/2022)

66. The Vice-chairman welcomed Ms HUI Shuk-yee, Engineer/Islands 2 of the TD, Ms HO Chung-yin, Engineer/Islands(3) of the HyD, Ms WONG Wing-ying, Chloe, Engineer/22 (Lantau) of the CEDD, and Mr HO Ngai-king, District Operations Officer (Lantau District) and Mr IP Ngai-chung, Assistant District Operations Officer (Lantau District) of the HKPF to the meeting to respond to the question. The written replies of the HyD, the CEDD, the HKPF, the EPD and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department had been distributed to Members for perusal prior to the meeting.

67. Mr FONG Lung-fei briefly presented the question.

68. Ms HUI Shuk-yee responded as follows:

- (a) As observed in the TD's on-site inspection during peak hours, the traffic of Yu Tung Road, Chung Yan Road and their junction was smooth and the traffic flows were within their designed capacities. Therefore, the department had no plan to provide additional traffic

lanes on Yu Tung Road and Chung Yan Road.

- (b) When dealing with development projects, the Government would generally require the project proponents to submit a traffic and transport impact assessment report and propose a mitigation plan for the traffic impact, so as to ensure that the infrastructure could accommodate the additional traffic flows brought by the development projects. The CEDD had conducted a traffic and transport impact assessment for the TCNTE project. According to the assessment report, the existing traffic lanes of Yu Tung Road and Chung Yan Road were sufficient to accommodate the traffic flow that would be brought by the development. The CEDD had also, according to the recommendations put forward in the assessment report, included the improvement works for the junction of Chung Yan Road and Yu Tung Road and the junction of Shun Tung Road and Yu Tung Road in the infrastructure contracts for the TCNTE project. It was expected that the works would commence this year and would be completed in phases.
- (c) In addition, in order to support the operation of buses, the TD planned to add a bus bay on the southbound lane of Chung Yan Road near Yu Tai Court. The department had completed the public consultation on the plan and issued a works request form to the relevant departments. After alighting at the new bus bay, passengers only needed to walk for about 100 metres to reach Yu Tai Court and the nearby villages.
- (d) The TD was responsible for the management of traffic on public roads. The question on the aggregates and sand on the road surface should be responded to by the responsible department(s).

69. Ms HO Chung-yin briefly presented the written reply of the HyD.

70. Ms Chloe WONG briefly presented the written reply of the CEDD.

71. Mr HO Ngai-king briefly presented the written reply of the HKPF.

72. Mr FONG Lung-fei expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Currently, the section of Yu Tung Road between Chung Mun Road and Chung Yan Road was parked with construction vehicles for the works in Tung Chung West, and only one traffic lane was available for the passage of vehicles. As residents gradually moved into the residential developments in Areas 42 and 46, the traffic flow would continue to grow. In addition, the parking spaces for coaches, trucks and construction vehicles in Tung Chung District had been persistently in short supply. Therefore, he suggested that an additional traffic lane should be provided at the road section, with part of the space to be

designated as parking spaces, so as to solve the problems of illegal parking and insufficient parking spaces for large vehicles.

- (b) There were two major traffic jams in Tung Chung in the past month, which were caused by a traffic accident and a traffic lights failure respectively. He had repeatedly proposed the opening of Chui Kwan Drive with a view to providing an alternative lane to divert the traffic and reducing the impact on residents of Tung Chung and even South Lantau when Yu Tung Road was congested.
- (c) Tung Chung West was developing gradually. The addition of a traffic lane for the section of Yu Tung Road between Chung Yan Road and Shun Tung Road could help ease the traffic and provide more flexible road alignment. Although there would be a new MTR station in the future, residents always needed to rely on road transport, such as private cars and buses. He had pointed out many times that there were large greening zones in the middle of many roads in Tung Chung, which were large enough to accommodate three or four traffic lanes, presumably reserved for future development. The department should plan ahead for future development.
- (d) The greening zone on Chung Yan Road near Yat Tung Estate used to be overgrown with *crinum asiaticum* var. *sinicum* and the plants even protruded into the road area, which could easily lead to traffic accidents. Therefore, he had suggested that the department use planter kerbs to enclose the plants near the crossing, so as not to obstruct the vision of drivers and pedestrians. After the addition of traffic lights at the location, the problem of traffic accidents had been improved. It could be seen in the photograph attached that a vehicle overturned after hitting the kerb, which showed that the central median greening zones posed potential hazard. Since the department was about to remove the plants there, he suggested that the department should at the same time re-designate the area as traffic lanes to make better use of the road space.
- (e) He understood that greening was very important. However, plants were already planted on both sides of Yat Tung Estate. Excessive greening zones would also bring about environmental hygiene and traffic safety problems. At present, the plants on the left-turning section of Chung Yan Road leading to Chui Kwan Drive obscured views of pedestrians. In addition, there had happened many traffic accidents at the intersection of Chung Yan Road and Yu Tung Road. Pedestrians often crossed the greening zones to cross the road for the sake of convenience. Since the vision of pedestrians and drivers was obstructed by plants and illegally parked vehicles, accidents happened easily. In view of the situation, he hoped the department would rezone the green belt site on Yu Tung Road for the provision of

additional traffic lanes and parking spaces.

73. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) The department should conduct a careful study on the conversion of the planter sites in the central median of the roads into traffic lanes or parking spaces. Many years ago, the District Council had adopted a proposal to re-designate a traffic lane on the section of Yu Tung Road from Mun Tung Estate to Yat Tung Estate to provide a lay-by for non-franchised buses. However, the road sections other than the lay-by were also packed with parked vehicles now. As a result, traffic enforcement by the Police was often needed and the stopping of buses behind Yung Yat House was also affected, passengers therefore had to get on and off the buses in the middle of the road, which was very dangerous.
- (b) The Member's proposal of converting the planters in the central median of Yu Tung Road into traffic lanes could help to solve the problem caused by the increase in population and traffic flow during the development of Areas 42 and 46 of Tung Chung West. Yu Tung Road was originally designed with two-lane carriageways to cope with the traffic flow in Tung Chung. However, since the site of the large open-air carpark in the district was used for the development of Mun Tung Estate, there was a shortage of parking spaces. Therefore, the department should consider converting one of the traffic lanes into parking spaces and converting the planter site in the central median of the road into traffic lanes.
- (c) Recently, the traffic lights at the intersection of Shun Tung Road and Yu Tung Road near the police station had once broken down at night, and assistance from the Police was required to direct the traffic at the scene. He pointed out that the traffic light set had broken down three times in the past three months and asked the department to take note of the issue.
- (d) Although the CEDD stated that the department had required the contractor to properly wash the wheels and bodies of the construction vehicles before the vehicles left the construction site in Area 42, he did not see any staff monitoring the entrance and exit of the construction site when he passed Mun Tung Estate every day. Also, the exit of the construction site near Tung Chung Road was covered with yellow mud and sand.

74. Ms HUI Shuk-yee gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) It was just a temporary traffic arrangement that only one traffic lane was available for the passage of vehicles on Yu Tung Road due to the

implementation of works. The TD would review the temporary traffic arrangements made by the contractor and ask the contractor to assess the impact of the arrangements on the traffic at the location. If the impact was significant, the department would require the contractor to take mitigation measures first.

- (b) If the TD found that there was obstruction to the vision of road users caused by trees, it would notify the responsible department(s) to carry out tree trimming.
- (c) Regarding the proposal to convert the planters for the provision of additional parking spaces, the TCNTE project would provide the number of parking spaces recommended in the HKPSG. On the other hand, following the principle of “one site, multiple use”, the department would provide additional parking spaces at government organisations and community facilities (including the future developments in Area 107) in response to the current demand for parking spaces, and parking spaces for large vehicles would also be provided in the developments in Area 107. In addition, the CEDD would provide parking spaces at the carpark to be developed soon in Ma Wan Chung Village. The TD hoped that motorists would make good use of the existing parking facilities, including the parking spaces in the Yat Tung Estate Shopping Centre, so as to free up road space for the passage of vehicles.
- (d) The traffic light failure mentioned by the Member should be the incident in the evening of June 17 this year. According to the department’s records, there was no traffic lights failure that night. The reason for the temporary switch-off of the traffic lights was the temporary traffic arrangement implemented by the CEDD for the traffic light alteration works required for the TCNTE project. The department knew that the CEDD had coordinated with the Police in advance.

75. Mr Eric KWOK said that the District Council had consistently reflected the serious problem of illegal parking in Tung Chung, which indicated that there was actually a shortage of parking spaces in the district. Although new parking spaces would be provided in Tung Chung North, they were still insufficient and the problem would remain unresolved. Therefore, the department should study the provision of parking spaces for non-franchised buses. In addition, with regard to the department’s appeal to the motorists for making good use of the parking spaces in the Yat Tung Estate Shopping Centre, he said that the carpark only provided parking spaces for private cars and light goods vehicles, and there were no large parking spaces for non-franchised buses.

76. Mr FONG Lung-fei added that the works on Chung Yan Road in Yat Tung Estate had not yet commenced. In addition, he said that only Yat Tung Estate

residents could apply for the coach parking spaces in the Yat Tung Estate Carpark, and there was no parking place for external coaches or large construction vehicles. In view of this, he suggested that the department should provide more parking spaces for large vehicles in the vicinity of the designated parking spaces on Chung Mun Road. On the other hand, he suggested that the department should simply add a traffic lane to Yu Tung Road for the parking of buses and large vehicles, so as to avoid the illegal parking of large vehicles on the nearby streets as they were not allowed to access the carpark of the Estate. He said that the department, while failing to provide sufficient parking spaces, used punitive measures to combat illegal parking, such as issuing fixed penalty tickets and ordering the vehicles to leave. It would do nothing to solve the problem. Citizens would only take the penalties unwillingly and continue to park their vehicles at other locations. He reiterated that the addition of a traffic lane could not only ease the traffic flow, but also alleviate the shortage of parking spaces. Therefore, the department should plan for it as early as possible.

77. Ms HUI Shuk-yee said that the TD noted the views of Members. Since requirements such as noise control had to be taken into account in the provision of parking spaces for heavy vehicles, the addition of parking spaces for coaches in the vicinity of residential buildings was challenging. The department would continue to provide in the district more parking spaces for coaches and trucks at suitable locations that were far away from residential buildings. In addition, the department had earlier proposed to add parking spaces for heavy vehicles in the Tung Chung Development Pier. The consultation on the proposal had been completed, and a works request form had been sent to the HyD by the department.

78. Ms Chloe WONG said that construction vehicles for the works in Area 42 of Tung Chung West would not use Tung Chung Road. Instead, they would go along Chung Mun Road, and then access the construction site in Area 42 via the village road on the west bank of Tung Chung Stream. The department would continue to closely monitor the situation, and would also require the contractor to properly wash the wheels and bodies of the dump trucks before leaving the construction site and ensure that the covers of dump beds loaded with inert construction material or other materials were closed.

X. Reports by Working Groups
T&TC Working Group

79. The Vice-chairman said that the report of the above working group was tabled at the meeting for Members' perusal.

80. Members noted and endorsed the above working group report.

XI. Any Other Business
Highways Department's Minor Traffic Improvement Projects and Works Schedules

81. The Vice-chairman welcomed Ms HO Chung-yin, Engineer/Islands(3) of the HyD to the meeting to respond to the question. The HyD had submitted the Minor Traffic Improvement Projects and Works Schedules of the Islands District as at early July this year prior to the meeting. Members were invited to raise enquiries and opinions.

82. Members noted the paper.

Follow-up on the improvement of Keung Shan Road, Tai O

83. The Vice-chairman said the Traffic and Transport Committee Working Group had followed up on the improvement of Keung Shan Road in Tai O at the meeting held on June 27 this year. Members of the working group hoped the relevant departments would report on the progress of the works on the section of Keung Shan Road near lamp post No. FA0461 at the meeting today. He welcomed Mr WONG Yui-him, Tim, Engineer/Islands 1 of the TD to the meeting to report the progress.

84. Mr Tim WONG said that the TD had earlier consulted the relevant departments on the preliminary plan to widen the section of Keung Shan Road near lamp post No. FA0461 on Lantau Island. The road section was situated within the Lantau South Country Park. According to the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (Cap. 499), unless exempted from the requirement, an environmental impact assessment had to be conducted for road works to be carried out in a country park. In this regard, the TD was working with the HyD to review the environmental impact of the plan, and would liaise with the relevant departments later to further explore the feasibility of the plan.

85. The Vice-chairman asked whether the TD was conducting the environmental impact assessment.

86. Mr Tim WONG said that the TD and the HyD were currently reviewing the environmental impact of the works and discussing whether an exemption from the environmental impact assessment requirement could be applied for. Discussions would be held with the relevant departments later.

XII. Date of next meeting

87. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:21 p.m. The next meeting would be held at 2:00 p.m. on 19 September 2022 (Monday).

-END-