

(Translation)

Minutes of Meeting of Islands District Council

Date : 20 February 2023 (Monday)
Time : 2:00 p.m.
Venue : Islands District Council Conference Room,
14/F, Harbour Building, 38 Pier Road, Central, Hong Kong

Present

Chairman

Mr YU Hon-kwan, Randy, MH, JP

Vice-Chairman

Mr WONG Man-hon, MH

Members

Mr CHOW Yuk-tong, SBS, MH
Mr YUNG Chi-ming, BBS, MH (Left at around 3:55 p.m.)
Mr CHAN Lin-wai, MH
Mr WONG Hon-kuen, Ken
Mr HO Chun-fai
Mr HO Siu-kei
Ms WONG Chau-ping
Mr KWOK Ping, Eric
Mr FONG Lung-fei
Ms LAU Shun-ting

Attendance by Invitation

| | |
|-------------------------------|---|
| Ms YOUNG Bick-kwan, Irene, JP | Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene, Food and Environmental Hygiene Department |
| Mr TSANG Wing-lok, Gabriel | Assistant Director (Operations)1, Food and Environmental Hygiene Department |
| Ms KUN Ka-yin, April | Assistant Director of Planning/Territorial, Planning Department |
| Mr NG Kim-wai | Chief Town Planner/ Studies and Research 2, Planning Department |
| Mr WU Kwok-yuen, Jacky, JP | Head of the Sustainable Lantau Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department |
| Mr IP Wai-man, Raymond | Deputy Head of the Sustainable Lantau Office (Works), Civil Engineering and Development Department |
| Ms CHENG Nga-see, Ellen | Chief Engineer/Lantau 4, Civil Engineering and Development Department |

| | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Mr TSANG Chi-yuen | Housing Manager/Hong Kong Island and Islands 8, Housing Department |
| Mr NG Chung-ho, Dicky | Property Service Manager/Service (Hong Kong Island and Islands)4, Housing Department |
| Ms PO Pui-man, Karen | Chief Transport Officer/Planning/Ferry Review, Transport Department |
| Ms CHOI Siu-man, Sherman | Senior Transport Officer/Planning/Ferry 2, Transport Department |
| Mr LO Tsz-him, Andrew | Principal Regulatory Affairs Manager (Market & Competition 12), Office of the Communications Authority |
| Ms WONG Nga-ting, Alice | Project Manager (Market & Competition 12), Office of the Communications Authority |
| Mr SZE Wang-cho, James | Project Manager (Planning and Engineering Study), Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited |
| Dr LEUNG Kam-shing | Team Leader (Town Planning), Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited |
| Mr Perry POON | Team Leader (Transport Modelling), Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited |
| Mr Leo LEE | Director, Commerce, Fortune Ferry Company Limited |
| Mr Yuson IP | Senior Operations Manager, Fortune Ferry Company Limited |
| Mr HU Xiaobo | Deputy Manager, Technical Department, Fortune Ferry Company Limited |
| Mr WONG Siu-fai | Representative, Hong Kong Telecommunications (HKT) Limited |
| Mr CHAN Tai-yuen, Thomas | Representative, Hong Kong Telecommunications (HKT) Limited |
| Mr Cliff KO | Representative, Hong Kong Telecommunications (HKT) Limited |
| Mr CHOY Chung-ching, Mike | Representative, Hong Kong Telecommunications (HKT) Limited |
| Mr TANG Chi-fung, Billy | Representative, Hong Kong Telecommunications (HKT) Limited |

In Attendance

| | |
|----------------------------|---|
| Ms YEUNG Wai-sum, Amy, JP | District Officer (Islands), Islands District Office |
| Mr LI Ho, Thomas | Assistant District Officer (Islands)1, Islands District Office |
| Ms TSE Yik-ting, Ellie | Assistant District Officer (Islands)2, Islands District Office |
| Mr MOK Sui-hung | Senior Liaison Officer (1), Islands District Office |
| Mr CHAN Yat-kin, Kaiser | Senior Liaison Officer (2), Islands District Office |
| Mr CHOW Siu-hong, Vincent | Senior Engineer/15 (Lantau), Civil Engineering and Development Department |
| Mr KWONG Wang-ngai, Walter | Senior Town Planner/Islands 2, Planning Department |
| Ms YAN Lai-ming, Jenny | District Social Welfare Officer (Central Western/Southern/ Islands), Social Welfare Department |

| | |
|----------------------------|---|
| Mr LING Ka-fai | District Lands Officer/Islands (District Lands Office, Islands), Lands Department |
| Mr TSANG Wai-man | Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Islands), Lands Department |
| Ms KWAN Ka-mun, Karen | Chief Transport Officer/Islands, Transport Department |
| Ms CHEUNG Hoi-yan | District Commander (Lantau), Hong Kong Police Force |
| Mr Clive WALTON | District Commander (Marine Port District), Hong Kong Police Force |
| Ms LI Ka-chai, Denise | Police Community Relations Officer (Lantau District), Hong Kong Police Force |
| Mr CHAN Sheung-yung, Cyrus | Police Community Relations Officer (Marine Port District), Hong Kong Police Force |
| Mr HUI Kar-nung | District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Islands), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department |
| Mr TO Chak-foo | Chief Manager/Management (Hong Kong Island and Islands), Housing Department |
| Ms LIM Ting-ting, Sylvia | Chief Leisure Manager (New Territories West), Leisure and Cultural Services Department |
| Ms HA Chung-wan, Joanne | District Leisure Manager (Islands), Leisure and Cultural Services Department |

Secretary

| | |
|----------------|---|
| Ms Kennis CHAN | Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Islands District Office |
|----------------|---|

~~~~~

#### **Welcoming Remarks**

The Chairman welcomed Members and representatives of the government departments to the Islands District Council (IDC) meeting and introduced the following representatives of departments:

- (a) Ms HA Chung-wan, Joanne, District Leisure Manager (Islands) of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD), who replaced Ms SIU Kit-ping, Currie;
- (b) Mr CHOW Siu-hong, Vincent, Senior Engineer/15 (Lantau) of the Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD), who stood in for Mr CHENG Yuk-lung, Stanley; and
- (c) Mr KWONG Wang-ngai, Walter, Senior Town Planner/Islands 2 of the Planning Department (PlanD), who stood in for Ms TANG Tsui-yee, Caroline.

I. Visit of Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene to Islands District Council

2. The Chairman welcomed Ms YOUNG Bick-kwan, Irene, JP, Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (FEHD) to the meeting to meet and exchange views with Members. He was also pleased to welcome to the meeting Mr TSANG Wing-lok, Gabriel, Assistant Director (Operations)<sup>1</sup> and Mr HUI Kar-nung, District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Islands).

3. Ms Irene YOUNG said that FEHD had a broad scope of work, mainly in the areas of environmental hygiene and food safety. She introduced the work of FEHD in the above two areas to Members and hoped to listen to their views:

- (a) In respect of environmental hygiene, the work of FEHD included street cleansing, waste collection, public toilet service, pest control, hawker and market management, licensing food business and making inspections by risk levels, managing hygiene conditions of buildings (including waste accumulation, building water seepage, dripping air-conditioners), and managing or regulating cemeteries, crematoria, columbaria and funeral services, etc.
- (b) In respect of food safety, the Centre for Food Safety under FEHD was committed to ensuring that food sold in Hong Kong was safe and fit for consumption, including carrying out regular food surveillance and sample check at import, wholesale and retail levels, enacting relevant legislation and launching public education initiatives for promoting food safety.

4. Ms Irene YOUNG further said she believed that the Members were more concerned about the work of FEHD on improving environmental hygiene and pest control in the district. Therefore, she would make the following highlights:

- (a) Improvement of Environmental Hygiene
  - (i) The District Matters Co-ordination Task Force (Task Force) launched the “Government Programme on Tackling Hygiene Black Spots” in mid-August last year. Various departments worked together to clean up more than 600 hygiene black spots in Hong Kong and stepped up the routine cleansing of about 4 000 locations.
  - (ii) The FEHD was mainly responsible for the environmental hygiene of public places. Under the “Government Programme on Tackling Hygiene Black Spots”, the department had stepped up the cleansing work of public places and refuse collection. Over ten thousand frontline workers of the department were responsible for sweeping all public streets in Hong Kong at least once a day, washing streets and public toilets, and clearing

disposed items on pavements and rear lanes. The department collected and treated over 6 000 tonnes of refuse every day.

- (iii) Despite FEHD's efforts in improving environmental hygiene, there were still formidable problems remained unsolved in the district. In this project, FEHD had identified multiple hygiene black spots located in public places in the Islands District based on the feedback provided by the public and the members of the local community, and the latest situations observed by colleagues during routine inspections.

(b) Pest Control

- (i) The Islands District covered an extensive area with a dense stretch of trees. Some of the area were rarely accessed and prone to stagnant water, resulting in the breeding of mosquitoes. The rainy season was relatively long last year, the monthly gravidtrap index (including the Islands District) in June once reached a high level of 20 per cent, indicating that the distribution of *Aedes albopictus* in the survey areas were extensive. Upon learning of the situation, FEHD immediately contacted relevant government departments, appealing to them to strengthen their mosquito control work. Under the concerted efforts of various government departments, most of the survey areas had recorded a significant decrease in the Area Gravidtrap Index in July. The department welcomed the Members to contact them regarding matters of mosquito infestation in the district. The department would follow up proactively.
- (ii) Rodent infestation was another environmental hygiene issue widely concerned by members of the public. The FEHD had adopted new strategies on rodent control in recent years. Since rodents were usually active at night, and setting rodent traps during daytime would affect public activities and the business of stalls, the department had set up overnight rodent control teams since July last year to set rodent traps at night and retrieve them in the morning. The effectiveness of this strategy was remarkable, and the number of live rodents caught had multiplied. New tools were also adopted by the department while carrying out anti-rodent operations to prevent accidental poisoning of non-target animals. In addition, new technologies such as thermal detection cameras were used by the department to track the movements of rodents to facilitate operational deployment.
- (iii) Since late 2021, the FEHD had launched an enhanced version of the anti-rodent operation for designated target areas in various districts. In late-October 2022, the "Strategic Anti-rodent

Operation” was fully implemented by the department. In December 2022, the Environment and Ecology Bureau (EEB), FEHD and other related government departments jointly launched the “Cross-sectoral Territory-wide Anti-rodent Action”. She hoped the aforesaid measures would be effective, and members of the local community would support them.

5. Ms LAU Shun-ting asked if FEHD had set up overnight rodent control teams in all districts in Hong Kong (including Lamma Island and Po Toi Island); if not, whether the FEHD would consider extending the service to the above districts. Moreover, she enquired about the distribution of the rodent control teams.

6. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He appreciated and thanked FEHD for its work in the Islands District. He witnessed FEHD’s efforts in improving the environmental hygiene of the district since he served as an IDC Member. He said that other Government departments should follow the example of FEHD.
- (b) The cleaning workers in rural areas were relatively mature in age. Given the increased amount of waste being disposed of during holidays, and some members of the public would dispose of oversized waste by the waste collection bins, the cleaning workers might find it difficult to clean up the waste. He had suggested that FEHD deploy electric waste collection vehicles (electric vehicles) to reduce the workload of cleaning workers and hoped that the Director of FEHD would consider the suggestion.
- (c) During the spring and autumn seasons every year, the FEHD would collaborate with DOs to conduct anti-mosquito operations. He noticed that FEHD had used new mosquito traps on a pilot basis two years ago, which reduced the number of mosquitoes through controlling the egg laying of female mosquitoes. The management office of Mun Tung Estate had also purchased at its own expense such new mosquito traps for trial use and found that the number of mosquitoes was significantly reduced. Moreover, given that insecticides would kill beneficial insects, he opined that the new mosquito traps were more environmental friendly. He hoped the FEHD would step up promotion of the use of the new mosquito traps where feasible.

7. Ms WONG Chau-ping appreciated the work of FEHD. Whenever Members raised problems about environmental hygiene, it would respond promptly. Also, since there were nullahs in many villages in rural areas, odour was easily given off in the hot summer weather. She hoped that FEHD would step up the relevant cleaning work to eliminate mosquito and rodent infestation.

8. Mr Ken WONG expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Given that water mains were not provided in many refuse collection points in the Island District at present, frontline cleaning workers had to wash their hands in parks under the purview of LCSD or other places, causing inconvenience. He noticed that water mains were provided in most refuse collection points in Cheung Chau and opined that FEHD should install water mains in refuse collection points in other districts.
- (b) Despite FEHD's dedicated efforts to improve environmental hygiene in the district, the FEHD could only take limited actions and could not solve the problem effectively. He cited an example in which a member of the public often took items home from refuse collection points, leading to rodent infestation and thus affecting environmental hygiene. Although FEHD and the Lands Department (LandsD) took immediate follow-up actions to ameliorate the problem, the member of the public concerned reverted to his old habit and the problem repeated. As such, he suggested that the FEHD should enact legislation to solve the problem in the long run.
- (c) Since the implementation of the Producer Responsibility Scheme on Waste Electrical and Electronic Equipment, many waste electrical appliances were left uncleared for many days in refuse collection points of FEHD and were only dealt with after being transferred to the collection points of the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) by members of the public. He believed that it was because the electrical appliances concerned were not disassembled, and it was difficult for FEHD staff to transfer them onto grab-mounted lorries for removal. He hoped that FEHD could pay attention to the problem.

9. Mr WONG Man-hon expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He appreciated the work of the FEHD, but said that certain work involving multiple departments were to be improved. He said that there were often refuse collection vehicles parked on the roadside of the refuse collection point near Sheung Ling Pei on Tung Chung Road to collect refuse, which not only affected traffic, but also posed a danger. In addition, there was a similar situation in the refuse collection point near Lo Wai Village on South Lantau Road. There would be dire consequences if traffic accidents occurred. The above problems had existed for more than ten years and the IDC had discussed them many times, but the situation had not improved. He opined that the FEHD, TD, HYD and LandsD, etc. should coordinate with each other to tackle the problem.
- (b) Members had visited the Sunlight Market earlier and found that the pick-up and set-down point for members of the public were also the main loading and unloading place for nearby shops. They were concerned that the traffic there would become chaotic and pose a danger after the opening of the market. The FEHD had stated earlier that it would make

appropriate arrangements to specify the time and location for unloading goods, but he opined that it was difficult to implement the arrangement.

- (c) The mosquito infestation in the rural areas of Lantau Island was serious, especially after dark. Although the FEHD had done a lot of work, the problem had not yet been solved. He was worried that there would be an outbreak of dengue fever similar to that in Cheung Chau.

10. Mr HO Siu-kei expressed his views as follows:

- (a) There were swathes of mangrove in Tai O, and tourists and residents were easily bitten by mosquitoes when passing by. The FEHD had adopted various anti-mosquito measures before, but the problem had not been completely solved. He hoped that the FEHD would work towards a solution with experts.
- (b) Unlike the urban area, refuse in Tai O was mainly delivered to the refuse collection point by hand. Due to the remote locations of the refuse collection points in Tai O, the distance between Shek Tsai Po Street and the Lung Tin Tsuen refuse collection point was about 800 to 1 000 metres. The street would be fouled if the rubbish bag broke on the way. He hoped that the FEHD would take note of the above situation and improve the refuse delivery.

11. Mr HO Chun-fai said that since there was no refuse collection point in Lantau South, improper disposal of large furniture items on the roadside was common and the environmental hygiene was affected. He had reported the issue to the FEHD earlier and the FEHD had immediately conducted on-site inspections and followed up on the issue, gaining appreciation from the residents. In addition, he hoped that the FEHD would study the feasibility of setting up a refuse collection point in Pui O.

12. Ms Irene YOUNG gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) She thanked Members for recognising the work of FEHD and supporting and complying with FEHD's environmental hygiene measures rolled out in districts. FEHD was willing to listen to Members' views and make improvement.
- (b) At present, FEHD had placed over 170 new mosquito traps in the Islands District. Apart from trapping mosquitoes, the new mosquito traps also hindered the growth of mosquito larvae and killed adult mosquitoes with Insect growth regulator (IGR) and fungi. As such, they were more effective than the old mosquito traps. The FEHD would widely promote and place the new mosquito traps throughout the territory. Since the mosquito infestation area of some places was relatively large or the intensity of mosquito infestation was relatively high, fogging was conducted to kill adult mosquitoes instantly and effectively. The



FEHD would handle mosquito infestation with a multi-pronged approach.

- (c) Prevention of mosquito infestation was equally important. The FEHD would pay more attention to areas where mosquitoes were prone to breed, such as construction sites. The FEHD conducted inspection in construction sites in the Island District in the second half of last year and took enforcement or prosecution actions. The annual anti-mosquito campaign was conducted by the FEHD in three phases with the first phase starting from 20 February. The FEHD appealed to Members for their support.
- (d) District Environmental Hygiene Offices held District Anti-Mosquito Task Force meetings with relevant departments (including LandsD) monthly to follow up on issues raised by Members and the mosquito infestation problem in districts.
- (e) According to the information, the mosquito infestation problem was serious last year with the gravidtrap index in June reaching Level 3, showing that *Aedes albopictus* infestation exceeded one-fifth of the district. After FEHD's follow-up action with various departments, the index dropped in July. As for the Islands District, the gravidtrap indexes in Cheung Chau South, Cheung Chau North and Tung Chung in December were all 0%, lower than the territory-wide index of 0.1%. The above mentioned places were the major monitoring areas of the FEHD, though other places were also worthy of concern. She believed that Mr HUI had already noted Members' views and the FEHD would take follow-up actions.
- (f) The FEHD was also concerned about the waste collection and delivery problem raised by Members. The leakage of wastewater during the waste collection process would affect street hygiene, which was not desirable to the FEHD. Moreover, the FEHD would pay attention to the occupational safety and health of cleaning workers and examine whether the cleaning workers had enough protection when handling heavy objects. Since FEHD had outsourced many cleaning services, it needed to work with the contractors to solve the problem.
- (g) With regard to the location of and demand for refuse collection points, she noted that the IDC would discuss the relevant issue. Also, she noted that the location of the refuse collection point at Tung Chung Road near Sheung Ling Pei posed a traffic hazard and the FEHD would provide Members with an account when FEHD had updated information.
- (h) With regard to the enquiry about the overnight rodent control teams, she said that due to the limited resources of the FEHD, the FEHD would conduct the relevant work progressively and in order of priority. She

noted that FEHD was arranging an overnight rodent control team to conduct rodent control work in Cheung Chau. She asked Mr HUI Kar-nung to provide supplementary information about the future work arrangement of the overnight rodent control team in due course.

- (i) She also noticed the problems about the ancillary transport facilities, transportation and management of Sunlight Market. The market was located nearby Fu Tung Estate and was also close to the MTR station and public transport interchange. Therefore, the area was busy with traffic. After listening to Members' views, the staff of FEHD Market Section had already contacted various departments to adopt improvement measures, such as installing traffic lights at the junction of Yat Tung Street and Fu Tung Street; expanding the pedestrian crossings and refuge islands; setting up traffic signs in Fu Tung Street to remind motorists to pay attention to pedestrian safety, etc. She would relay Members' views and concerns to relevant departments, including LandsD and the Transport Department (TD) in order to improve the ancillary transport facilities of the market as far as practicable. Given that Sunlight Market was opening soon, the FEHD would closely monitor the development, ancillary facilities and traffic condition of the market and improve the relevant facilities where feasible.

13. Mr HUI Kar-nung supplemented as follows:

- (a) The FEHD was aware of the situation mentioned by Mr HO Siu-kei and would examine the use of other tools to transport refuse to reduce the burden of cleaning staff. Apart from using plastic bags, the FEHD would require contractors to use plastic garbage bins to transport refuse to avoid fouling the streets with rubbish and sewage when the plastic rubbish bags were broken during transportation.
- (b) The FEHD would consider deploying an overnight rodent control team to Lamma Island. There was currently an overnight rodent control team providing services for Cheung Chau and the FEHD would review the effectiveness of its work. After the work in Cheung Chau was completed, the FEHD would consider deploying the team elsewhere and rolling out the services to different places in a sequential manner, such as Peng Chau and Lamma Island.
- (c) At present, many refuse collection points in the rural areas (including Peng Chau, Lamma Island, Cheng Chai and Tai O) did not have water and electricity supply, the FEHD considered the situation unsatisfactory. Water and electricity were basic utilities for refuse collection points. Therefore, the FEHD was gradually connecting water and electricity supply to the relevant refuse collection points. With the assistance of the Architectural Services Department (ArchSD), the FEHD had completed the installation of water and electricity facilities at the Yung Shue Long refuse collection point on Lamma Island. With the

assistance of CEDD, water and electricity facilities would also be installed at the Lung Tin Estate refuse collection point in Tai O during phase two of the Improvement Works at Tai O. The FEHD would also consider carrying out the above improvement works in Peng Chau.

14. The Chairman said that DC Members would conduct a site inspection on 22 February (Wednesday) on the addition of a refuse collection point in Pui O. He said that the refuse collection point near Sheung Ling Pei on Tung Chung Road had been a long-standing issue, and Members had repeatedly discussed it. As it was a dual carriageway, when a refuse collection vehicle was parked in one of the lanes, drivers had to cut the lane to overtake, which would obstruct the line of sight of oncoming drivers and pose a danger. He hoped that the FEHD would study how to improve the above situation after the meeting.

15. Mr FONG Lung-fei expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Mosquito and rodent infestations were found near Chung Yan Road earlier. There were a lot of shrubs in the green area of that location and rodents could easily hide in them, resulting in a large number of rat holes near Kui Yat House. The LCSD had subsequently removed all the shrubs to resolve the problem. In addition, residents of Tung Chung North had reported earlier that lush grass had been growing in the area, mosquito breeding and rodents had been spotted. The LCSD had taken follow-up actions after learning about the situation. He suggested that the FEHD and LCSD should work together to effectively address the above problems.
- (b) Some members of the public reported that the FEHD were spraying from 8:00 a.m. to 9:00 a.m., which was the playtime for children. They hoped that the FEHD could postpone the spraying time, and the FEHD had subsequently made adjustments.
- (c) Four stall-holders of the Sunlight Market expressed concern to him about the problem of cooling units for the water-cooling system. The FEHD required the installation of indoor cooling machines but stall-holders and even electricians were worried about potential dangers. He said that it had been a long-standing problem but the FEHD had not provided a solution. The above stall-holders were all fish traders who would not be able to open for business on 1 March if they failed to obtain the licences. He hoped that the FEHD would take follow-up actions and explore solutions, such as installing the cooling machines outdoors, so that stall-holders could open for business smoothly.

16. Mr Eric KWOK asked again whether the FEHD would consider allowing frontline cleaners to use electric vehicles to transport rubbish. He said that Pui O was a flat area and suggested that the FEHD include Pui O in the Electric Vehicles Trial Scheme. In addition, he suggested that the FEHD increase the number of new mosquito traps in the district to tackle the mosquito problem.

17. Ms WONG Chau-ping hoped that FEHD would respond to the proposal of conducting regular nullah inspection. She said that whenever villagers reported to DC Members that the nullahs were emitting odour, DC Members would relay their views to the departments concerned for follow-up. However, this was not the most effective solution. She considered that the breeding of mosquitoes and insects could be effectively prevented if the department would conduct regular inspection of the drains. In addition, she said that the refuse collection point near Sheung Ling Pei on Tung Chung Road was located on a major road of Lantau Island. Refuse collection vehicles parked on the roadside would easily lead to traffic accidents. She hoped the department would pay attention to the matter.

18. Mr Ken WONG noted that FEHD was carrying out improvement works to add solar power and lighting facilities to the refuse collection points in the district. He, however, opined that a lack of water source should be the matter of most concern. He said that once there was a water meter in a refuse collection point dripping water, and it took the ArchSD three years to complete the repair of it. He suggested that the senior officers of the department should discuss with the ArchSD the expedient installation of water pipes in refuse collection points. Moreover, despite FEHD provided street cleansing service, cleaning worker often did not know where to take water in areas without a standpipe. They might need to take water through water pipes inside municipal services buildings, which was very inconvenient. He said that the department could discuss with LCSD to consider the use of water mains of the roadside flower beds under the management of LCSD, or to provide a source of water by other means.

19. Mr FONG Lung-fei said that the use of electric vehicles for refuse transport might require the application for licences. Therefore, he suggested switching to electric pallet trucks, which was convenient and could be easily operated by both males and females. He hoped the department would consider the suggestion.

20. Ms Irene YOUNG gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) FEHD would work with other relevant departments, especially LCSD, to conduct mosquito control work.
- (b) FEHD would conduct mosquito control work at greened areas managed by LCSD on a regular basis. The department had noticed that some of the vacant government lands were covered with weeds, and were prone to the breeding of mosquitoes and insects. After seeking views from the EPD, the department would recommend relevant departments, for example the LandsD, to consider laying out wood chips on greened area to prevent the growth of weeds. Not only could it cut down the expenses on grass trimming, but also reduce the breeding of mosquitoes and insects. The department would continue following-up on Mr FONG Lung-fei's suggestion with other government departments.

- (c) FEHD had consulted the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (EMSD) and ArchSD on the issues of the water cooling units for the water cooling system in Sunlight Market. She invited Mr HUI Kar-nung to give an update on their follow-up actions.
- (d) FEHD understood the importance of regular clearance of nullahs. It could not only avoid environmental hygiene problems such as the generation of odour or breeding of mosquitoes and insects, but also prevent flooding caused by the silting of nullahs. If Members had any views on the department's work, they could reflect to the colleagues of the relevant districts, and the department would handle them as soon as possible.
- (e) FEHD would study the feasibility of using electric vehicles to transport refuse. Various factors such as condition of road surfaces had to be considered, therefore the use of electric vehicles might not be suitable for all places. She thanked Members for their suggestions and said that the department would explore the use of electric vehicles or other means to improve the flow of refuse transport.
- (f) FEHD would take note of the issue of water source in refuse collection points raised by Mr Ken WONG, and would seek advice from LCSD after the meeting on the possibility of using their water mains for cleaning.
- (g) The department would increase the number of mosquito traps subject to the availability of resources.

21. Mr HUI Kar-nung provided supplementary information as follows:

- (a) Fish traders must apply for relevant food business licences and submit layout plans to FEHD Licence Issuing Offices after successfully obtaining the tenancy of the stalls in Sunlight Market. As such, FEHD had already known that the fish traders had to install water-cooled units outside the fish stalls. However, given that the tops of the wet market stalls could not support the weight of the units, FEHD was now examining with the ArchSD the feasibility of hanging the units behind the stalls, so as to facilitate the operation of the stall owners without causing inconvenience to the public visiting the wet market. FEHD and ArchSD would also examine whether there were other feasible solutions. FEHD would further discuss with the stall owners and report to Members the progress in due course.
- (b) The cleaning of nullah is a regular task of FEHD's street cleaning workers. FEHD would remind workers to increase the frequency of cleaning if it noticed that odour was generated from nullahs. Odour would be generated from nullahs if users connected their drains to nullahs illegally or incorrectly. The staff of FEHD Environmental

Hygiene Section would investigate whether the odour was caused by the above situation and refer the case to other relevant departments for joint follow-up actions where necessary.

22. The Chairman thanked the Director of FEHD for attending the IDC meeting and having discussion with Members. He said that most Members recognised the work of FEHD. He concluded two priority issues that required FEHD's key follow-up actions: (I) Review the problem of manual transport of refuse by cleaning workers. He understood that electric vehicles were deployed for the transportation of waste in Peng Chau. He opined that FEHD might be occupied by heavy workload that it was unable to study the deployment of electric vehicles in different districts at the same time. He requested the FEHD to follow up. (II) He hoped that the Director of FEHD or relevant colleagues would assist in liaising with the TD and LandsD for a joint on-site inspection with Members at the refuse collection point at Tung Chung Road near Sheung Ling Pei to solve the problem in the long run.

23. Ms Irene YOUNG said that FEHD staff would continue to serve the Islands District with dedication. FEHD would tackle various problems proactively and she hoped that the public would feel the efforts FEHD put on the improvement of environmental hygiene and the determination the Government had on combating the long-standing and thorny problems. She said that Members were the main channels for collection and expression of public opinion at the district level and were important partners to FEHD. She hoped that through attending this meeting, and the close liaison between Members and FEHD staff in the district, they would work together to serve the district.

## II. Confirmation of the Minutes of Meeting held on 19 December 2022

24. The Chairman said that the captioned minutes had incorporated the amendments proposed by the government departments and Members and had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

25. Members had no other amendment proposals. The minutes were confirmed unanimously.

(Members who voted in favour included: the Chairman Mr Randy YU, the Vice-chairman Mr WONG Man-hon, Mr CHOW Yuk-tong, Mr YUNG Chi-ming, Mr CHAN Lin-wai, Mr Ken WONG, Mr HO Siu-kei, Mr FONG Lung-fei and Ms LAU Shun-ting.)

## III. Kau Yi Chau Artificial Islands (Paper IDC 2/2023)

26. The Chairman welcomed Ms KUN Ka-yin, April, Assistant Director of Planning/Territorial and Mr NG Kim-wai, Chief Town Planner/ Studies and Research 2 of the Planning Department, Mr WU Kwok-yuen, Jacky, JP, Head of the Sustainable

Lantau Office (SLO), Mr IP Wai-man, Raymond, Deputy Head of the SLO (Works) and Ms CHENG Nga-see, Ellen, Chief Engineer/Lantau 4 of the Civil Engineering and Development Department, Mr SZE Wang-cho, James, Project Manager (Planning and Engineering Study), Dr LEUNG Kam-shing, Team Leader (Town Planning) and Mr Perry POON, Team Leader (Transport Modelling) of Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited to the meeting to present the paper.

27. Mr Jacky WU, Ms Ellen CHENG and Mr NG Kim-wai introduced the preliminary proposals for four aspects of the proposed Kau Yi Chau Artificial Islands (KYCAI) (including the reclamation extent, broad land use, strategic transport infrastructure and possible financing options).

28. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) The ageing and declining population of Hong Kong was a serious problem. According to the population estimates released by the Government, the total population of Hong Kong was 7.33 million, representing a decrease of 68 000 or 0.9% compared with 2021 and a decrease of 40% compared with 2019. According to the population projections released by the Census and Statistics Department, the population of Hong Kong was projected to peak at 8.22 million in 2043, but people aged 65 and above would account for 30.6% of the population and the proportion of elderly would continue to increase. Due to factors such as ageing population, deaths by natural causes and the declining fertility rate, the population would drop to 7.72 million in 2066, representing a decrease of about 500 000 from the peak and people aged 65 and above would account for about one-third of the population. The ageing population would lead to a shrinking labour force. In addition to reduced tax revenue, it would also increase medical and welfare expenditures. If the Government could not make ends meet, it would eventually lead to a debt crisis. However, the paper did not mention anything about ageing population. During the public engagement for Hong Kong 2030+, the Government pointed out that there would be about 326 000 private residential units aged 70 years and above by 2046. He understood that the Government intended to launch a district redevelopment plan, but the paper did not provide the proportion of elderly people living in aged buildings or the problems that the elderly would face when redevelopment took place in the district. He opined that Hong Kong would simultaneously face many problems by then, including the ageing population and fiscal deficits.
- (b) He opined that the Study Team had underestimated the cost of the reclamation works. The cost estimate had increased from the \$500 billion in 2018 to \$580 billion in 2022. Since the depth of waters around Kau Yi Chau was 12 to 15 metres, coupled with the strong current in the Victoria Harbour, the construction would be arduous and the cost would be even higher. In addition, the main material of the reclamation works for the artificial islands would be marine sand, and

about 300 million tonnes of it would be needed. Based on the market price in 2021, the cost of fill material had reached \$30 billion. Therefore, he opined that the current estimate of \$580 billion was an underestimation. Cost overruns occurred in many previous mega projects in Hong Kong. For example, due to shortage of marine sand supply, the reclamation cost for the Third Runway system had risen sharply. In the end, the Airport Authority had to pay an additional \$8 billion, increasing the reclamation cost estimate of the Third Runway system from \$15.26 billion to \$23.28 billion. Other projects with cost overruns included the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge (HZMB), the Liantang Boundary Control Point, the West Kowloon Cultural District, the Chek Lap Kok Airport and the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link. He opined that the Study Team should learn from previous projects and be more cautious, as well as obliged to explain all the details to the public.

- (c) He opined that the Study Team had overestimated the project's revenue. In 2017, fiscal surplus had reached \$180 billion. At that time, the projection of the future financial position had been optimistic. However, the world had seen rapid changes since 2019. In the face of the COVID-19 epidemic, the Russo-Ukrainian War and the US dollar interest rate hike, the global economy had gone into recession. Deficit for the 2020-21 financial year had risen to \$257.6 billion, which is the highest in 20 years. In addition, investors and developers were very sensitive to market changes, making Government financing difficult. Taking the land auction in February as an example, the Government had resumed three parcels of land due to unsuccessful tendering, namely the Siu Ho Wan Depot Property Development, the residential site at Cape Road, Stanley, and Urban Renewal Authority's Kwun Tong Town Centre Development Areas 4 & 5 "mega" commercial project. Hence, it was evident that the Government had overestimated the land sale revenue. He opined that the Government should use brownfield sites for long-term development, as proposed by the Task Force on Land Supply in 2018. Statistics at that time showed that the proposal had gained support from the vast majority of members of the public. He also cited findings of a survey conducted by Greenpeace earlier, which stated that development of brownfield sites would only cost \$33 billion and could provide nearly 140 000 residential units. Therefore, the Government should adopt that proposal.
- (d) He hoped that the Study Team would give a response. If the original proposal was not feasible, other proposals should be considered.

29. Mr Ken WONG expressed his views as follows:

- (a) The "15-minute neighbourhood" concept of the artificial islands was appealing. Peng Chau was in the proximity of the artificial islands. The Study Team had mentioned that there would be ferry service



connecting the two islands. By then, should Peng Chau residents change their travel pattern from taking a ferry to Central to travelling to artificial islands first for interchanging another ferry to Central? Who would bear the additional transportation costs?

- (b) Ferry routes might need to be diverted in the early stages of the reclamation, how long would the journey time be increased? Would the costs involved be borne by passengers or the Government?
- (c) Many villages and islands were in the proximity of the artificial islands, but were not connected by roads. Taking Peng Chau as an example, he estimated that the journey time between the artificial islands and Peng Chau by ferry would just be five minutes. Therefore, he suggested that the Study Team consider providing other convenient modes of transportation during the planning stage, such as providing road connection between the artificial islands and Peng Chau so that Peng Chau could be integrated into the “15-minute neighbourhood of the artificial islands”. He took the HZMB as another example. Peng Chau was in the proximity of the HZMB. However, according to the Government’s suggested route, residents would have to take a ferry to Central, then interchange at Sunny Bay by train, and then take a bus, making the journey very circuitous. Alternatively, residents might choose to depart from Discovery Bay to Tung Chung, but the fares would be expensive. The third method was to take a 20-minute taxi ride from Disneyland. In conclusion, adding road connection would be the best approach, which would not only shorten the journey time, but also improve the provision of medical and rescue services.
- (d) At present, the utilisation rates of the fire services equipment and the sports centre in Peng Chau were low. If roads connecting the artificial islands were added, residents on both islands could share the facilities. He said that many rural infrastructure were obsolete and medical services were insufficient. The Government should improve the transport network and add roads connecting the artificial islands so that the public could have easy access to the facilities and services on the islands.

30. Mr FONG Lung-fei expressed his views as follows:

- (a) The reclamation works required the dredging of marine mud, and would easily lead to environmental pollution, affecting the environment and ecology of neighbouring islands. He took the Palm Jumeirah island in Dubai as an example. After the completion of reclamation works, the local government still had to spend several hundreds of million dollars to conduct monitoring and maintenance works on the Palm Jumeirah and its neighbouring islands. He enquired the Government if extra resources would be required for conducting relevant works upon the completion of reclamation works of the KYCAI.

- (b) The KYCAI was close to islands such as Peng Chau. He enquired if the reclamation works would cause any impact on the environment of these islands, such as the problem of seawater intrusion.

31. Ms WONG Chau-ping opined that the KYCAI was a large-scale project, and the Government should take into account the needs of neighbouring islands, such as ancillary transport facilities during the planning stage. The Government often overlook the needs of residents in the Islands District when planning development projects. She opined that the Government should listen to the views of the local community and make use of resources efficiently.

32. Mr Jacky WU gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) The water depth of the reclamation extent of the KYCAI was about 4 to 12 metres. The water depth at the east of Kau Yi Chau was relatively deep (water depth of about 12 to 15 metres), and the three islands were located at the shallower waters at the north, west and south of Kau Yi Chau (average water depth of about 8 metres). To enhance construction efficiency and cost effectiveness, we recommended reclamation in relatively shallower waters. The proposed reclamation extent also minimised the impacts on the existing fairways and anchorage areas as far as possible.
- (b) At least about 50% of the fill materials for reclamation was inert construction waste, i.e. public fill, while the remaining was mainly manufactured sand, i.e. a by-product of quarries. With proper arrangement on the supply of fill materials, it was expected that marine sand would not be used for the reclamation works.
- (c) The report submitted by the Task Force on Land Supply not only recommended the Government to use brownfield sites as the only option for land supply, but also recommended the Government to develop the KYCAI, which could provide about 1 000 hectares of land for meeting the medium to long-term land demand of Hong Kong. The Government would adopt multi-pronged approach in the next decade to provide about 3 200 hectares of developable land, including developing brownfield sites.
- (d) The Government had been performing well in the financial management of public works. From 2012 to 2022, a total of 535 Category A projects were completed with an actual expenditure of about \$151 billion, which accounted for 90% of the total original Approved Project Estimates (APE) (about \$169 billion). It could be seen that although there was individual public works project that needed to apply for additional funds from the Finance Committee, the overall cost and progress management of the Capital Works Programme (CWP) had maintained good performance. Not only could the projects under the CWP be

completed within the original APE, but also there was a surplus. Therefore, Members did not have to worry about cost overruns for the project.

- (e) The Study Team had already adopted a more conservative estimate of land sale revenue in view of the current economic situation. At the current stage, the Government opined that the land sale revenue of the KYCAI was still higher than the construction cost. In addition, the project would bring economic growth and social benefits, including the provision of land for public housing and the construction of strategic transport infrastructure.
- (f) Regarding the transport in Peng Chau, the paper submitted this time mainly explained the proposed strategic road and railway links. The Study Team would plan the road network on the artificial islands in the next stage. There were different opinions in the society on whether roads should be built to connect the artificial islands and Peng Chau. The Study Team was open to Members' suggestion and would explore its feasibility in the next stage, taking into account different factors such as traffic, rescue services and medical needs, possible impact to the environment and cost-effectiveness.
- (g) Upon completion of the artificial islands, the journey times of the ferries from Peng Chau to Central and from Mui Wo to Central would only increase by about five minutes. It was estimated that it would take about five to ten minutes to travel from Peng Chau to the artificial islands, and then about 15 minutes to transfer to Central by railway. Therefore, the required travel time would be similar. In addition, the journey times of the ferries from Discovery Bay, Lamma Island and Cheung Chau to Central should be approximately the same as at present.
- (h) The Tung Chung East and the Third Runway reclamation works adopted the deep cement mixing (DCM) method and the non-dredged technology. Since marine mud would not be dredged, the impact on the environment could be reduced.
- (i) In formulating the proposed "Three-island configuration", factors including ecology, water quality, engineering feasibility, marine traffic and port operation had been fully taken into account.
- (j) In accordance with the design standards and with reference to the assessment report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change of the United Nations, and having taken into account the flooding risk under extreme weather conditions and climate change, the Study Team had adopted a progressive adaptive approach to formulate a preliminary plan for the artificial islands that can tackle coastal hazards. The following three elements were included:

- (i) Site formation level: the average site formation level of the artificial islands would be approximately 7.5 metres above the Principal Datum. The highest site formation level (for locations in the east, southeast and south that were exposed to the wind) would be approximately 9 metres above the Principal Datum;
  - (ii) Coastal Resilience: flexibility would be reserved in the design to strengthen coastal infrastructure facilities in the future to cope with actual needs, such as raising the height of wave walls;
  - (iii) Buffer zone between the shoreline and the development area: a waterfront promenade of 20 to 30 metres wide would serve as a buffer zone between the shoreline and the building development areas on the islands to keep building developments away from the shoreline and reduce the impact of severe weather on the public.
- (k) Apart from engaging professional consultants, the Study Team had also set up the Expert Panel on Reclamation and Coastal Resilience (the Expert Panel) comprising of three independent expert members, including Professor Joseph LEE Hun-wei and two renowned professors from overseas and Mainland China. After review, the Expert Panel agreed with the Study Team's strategy and preliminary plan for dealing with coastal hazards.

33. Ms April KUN gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) The Government adopted a multi-pronged approach to address the problem of land shortage. The KYCAI was one of the solution spaces for meeting the medium to long-term land requirements under the "Hong Kong 2030+", a territorial spatial development strategy. Recently, there had been news reports saying that the population showed signs of decline, but it was still unknown whether the population of Hong Kong would rise again in the medium to long-term. As a responsible Government, we had to make comprehensive preparation in terms of land use planning for the possible rebound of population in the future.
- (b) Apart from meeting the medium to long-term housing needs, the Government also needed to make good preparation for the future economic development. According to the Policy Address released in 2022, the Government needed to continuously create strong impetus for growth by "competing for talents" and "competing for enterprises". To achieve the above objectives, the Government needed more land to support Hong Kong's economic development and seize the opportunities arising from national strategies such as the National 14th Five-Year Plan and the Greater Bay Area development, in particular, to strengthen and enhance Hong Kong's status as an international financial centre. In this respect, the planning of the territory's third Central Business District (CBD3) on the artificial islands, together with other economic activities

outside its CBD, providing a total of 270 000 employment opportunities, would be crucial to the future development of Hong Kong.

- (c) The public highly concerned about the issue of “double ageing” in Hong Kong, including the ageing of buildings and population. The Government had to gear up to tackle the problem. The artificial islands could offer decanting spaces to support the chain flows arising from the redevelopment of old urban districts of Hong Kong Island and Kowloon, making Hong Kong more liveable while alleviating land shortage. According to the preliminary proposal of the artificial islands, the project could provide 190 000 to 210 000 residential units. Details of the development would be further refined in the next stage.
- (d) Concerted efforts from various parties were required to address the issue of ageing population. The artificial islands project was still at the preliminary planning stage. When developing the detailed design in the next stage, the Study Team would take into account the issue of ageing population, and plan the housing design and supporting facilities specifically for different age groups.

34. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) On page 3 of the discussion paper, it was stated that the shallowest depth of the waters in which the KYCAI was to be built was 8 metres, while the deepest depth was 12 to 15 metres, instead of 4 metres as the Study Team had mentioned just now.
- (b) It was inappropriate that the estimated revenue to be generated by the KYCAI project was calculated with reference to the data under favourable economic conditions. Given the economic downturn in Hong Kong global economic uncertainty, and considering that the Government had recorded a deficit of over \$200 billion for the year 2020, fiscal deficits would be unavoidable in the coming few years. The Government should be more prudent on the estimation.
- (c) He suggested that the Government should carry out reclamation works in the waters near Siu Ho Wan and To Kau Wan. Thus, apart from the provision of over 2 000 hectares of land, the connection with the Greater Bay Area and the “15-minute neighbourhood” concept could also be achieved. Many infrastructure projects had already been constructed near the location, including the Hong Kong International Airport (HKIA) and the HZMB. Also, the works would have less impact on the environment than the KYCAI project. He opined that the KYCAI project was a waste of money. He hoped the Government would cease the project before it was too late and bear in mind the interests of our next generation. Otherwise, if our fiscal reserves were used up, the younger generation would have to pay heavy taxes in the future.

- (d) With regard to the consultation, he opined that the Study Team should make reference to the approach of the Task Force on Land Supply. During the 5-month consultation period from April to September 2018, the Task Force had appointed organisations such as The University of Hong Kong and the Chinese University of Hong Kong to carry out the consultation work. During the period, booklets and leaflets were published, a website was launched, and 25 short videos, television announcements and animations were filmed to explain the land shortage issue in detail. In addition, the Task Force also set up a Facebook page and a YouTube channel, produced dedicated television programmes, published the chairman's blogs and held 185 public engagement activities for members of the Task Force to make direct contact with the public and stakeholders and listen to different views on land supply and related issues. The estimated cost of the KYCAI alone was over \$500 billion. Together with the relevant infrastructure and the topside property development projects, the overall cost would amount to over \$1 000 billion. Hence, the Government should not release information about the KYCAI only through its website.

35. Mr Ken WONG expressed his views as follows:

- (a) The Study Team said that upon completion of the KYCAI, the ferry journey time from Peng Chau to Central would be increased by five minutes. He asked the Study Team how the data was derived.
- (b) Upon completion of the artificial islands, although the journey time from Peng Chau to the KYCAI would be five minutes only, the Study Team did not provide any details of the transportation cost. If Peng Chau residents took the train to Central via the KYCAI, would the transportation cost be the same as the current fare of the ferry trip from Peng Chau to Central? Since the operation cost of ferry services included maintenance cost and salary expenses which would not be reduced despite the shortened journey time, he believed that the ferry operator would not reduce the fares significantly. Assuming that the fare of a ferry trip from Peng Chau to the KYCAI was over \$10, and the train to the urban area also cost more than \$10, then the transportation cost for a single journey could amount to over \$30. The transportation expenses of the residents would increase significantly.
- (c) He opined that the Study Team should treat Peng Chau as the “fourth island” when carrying out the planning. At present, some village houses in Peng Chau were more than 50 years old. The Study Team could consider launching redevelopment projects in Peng Chau to make full use of existing land resources.
- (d) The breakwaters materials kept being washed away during the construction of the Hei Ling Chau Typhoon Shelter by CEDD, CEDD eventually had to conduct multiple remedial works to reinforce the

breakwaters. Since the closest two islands of the proposed KYCAI shared the same orientation with Hei Ling Chau, he was concerned that the reclamation works would face the same problem and the project would eventually experience cost overruns due to the remedial works required.

- (e) He opined that the Study Team should explain all the details to the public during the public consultation, including the transportation cost for taking the railway via the KYCAI, how the five-minute journey time was calculated and the vessel type to be used for the ferry route. In addition, he hoped that the Government would consider building a road to connect Peng Chau with the KYCAI.

36. Mr HO Siu-kei said major projects such as the HKIA, the HZMB and the KYCAI were all located in the Islands District, but these projects only focused on future development and could not benefit the residents and stakeholders of the Islands District. Therefore, it was difficult for such projects to gain the support of the residents. He hoped that the Government would listen to the views of the local community and the prevailing livelihood issues would not be overshadowed by future developments.

37. Mr FONG Lung-fei expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Extreme weather accelerated the melting of ice in the South Pole and the North Pole, causing the global sea level to rise. Although the Study Team said that contingency measures would be in place in the KYCAI project, he was still worried that the erosion of reclamation fill materials would affect nearby low-lying areas. He took a village house in Tai O as an example, saying that although the village house was more than 10 metres away from the seashore, a large amount of sand and stones were carried by the waves to its door step during the passage of Typhoon Hato. He opined that the loss of reclamation fill materials was inevitable, and suspected that the materials might be washed to the three sub-sea road tunnels crossing the Victoria Harbour. Moreover, the project might cause a change to the water depth of Victoria Harbour, he therefore questioned if the traffic of large vessels would be affected.
- (b) When a water current encountered obstacles, vortexes would be formed. He was worried that the reclamation works of the KYCAI project would affect the water flow in the vicinity. He pointed out that swells often appeared in the waters near Green Island, which had once caused vessels passing by to sink. Housing estates in Hong Kong Island East were also hit by rough waves whenever a typhoon struck due to the reclamation works carried out. He opined that the Study should assess if the KYCAI project would affect nearby areas including Macau, Hong Kong Island and the Islands. He said that the public was very concerned about the said issue and he hoped the Government could provide the details.

- (c) The Government was currently experiencing a fiscal deficit. He was worried that the Government would not be able to afford the expenditure for both the KYCAI project and the development of the New Territories North at the same time. He hoped that the Government could consider prudently whether the construction of the KYCAI was necessary.

38. Ms WONG Chau-ping said the KYCAI was a mega-scale project which would have far-reaching impact on the nearby islands, but the residents were unable to benefit from it. She hoped PlanD could give a response in this regard.

39. Mr WONG Man-hon expressed his views as follows:

- (a) It had been ten years since the KYCAI project was proposed. At the early stage of the consultation, the Government had indicated that a road would be constructed to connect South Lantau, but the plan was then abandoned. As the reclamation works of the KYCAI project would affect the traffic of the Islands District, he asked whether the Government would formulate a scheme to provide subsidies to the tens of thousands of Islands District residents to be affected.
- (b) The residents of South Lantau accepted the development approach of “Development in the North; Conservation for the South” on the premise that a road connecting the north and south of Lantau would be constructed. CEDD had stated earlier that studies would be conducted on the north-south road link on Lantau, but nothing concrete had come up so far, thus causing dissatisfaction among the residents.
- (c) With regard to the land use planning, he pointed out that there were sufficient land resources on Lantau Island, but the question was how to make better use of the land. For the past ten years, the development of Hong Kong had remained stagnant, and it was time for Hong Kong to catch up expeditiously. However, the Government should at the same time attend to the needs of villagers living in rural areas. Pak Mong, Ngau Kwu Long and Tai Ho San Tsuen in Tung Chung East were close to the HZMB and the new development area in Tung Chung East, but the villagers could not benefit from the project. These villages were still in lack of emergency vehicular accesses and sewage facilities. He agreed that Hong Kong needed to develop, but he hoped the Government would not neglect the rural areas, so that all parties could share the fruits of developments.

40. Mr HO Chun-fai expressed his views as follows:

- (a) The reclamation works had commenced as early as ten years ago. The residents of South Lantau were in support of the project, and hoped that a road connecting the Hong Kong Island would be constructed to drive the economic development of South Lantau. However, the Government later revised the development plan, which made residents



very dissatisfied and even lost confidence in the project. If the Government wanted to gain the support of the residents, the concerned road should be implemented in response to their demand.

- (b) As for “Conservation for the South”, he hoped the Government would optimise the policy to make good use of land and boost tourism.

41. The Chairman said that due to the limited meeting time, the Study Team was unable to respond to all the questions raised by Members in the meeting. He asked about the consultation period of the KYCAI project, and said that Members could express their views to the Government before the end of consultation period.

42. Mr Jacky WU gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) Members or the public could submit their views before the end of March 2023. The Study Team noted Members’ views and would take follow-up actions. Members could also submit their views through the study website. The Study Team would continue to liaise with Members with regard to the KYCAI project.
- (b) He understood that Members concerned about the reclamation works and its impacts. The Government had gained experience from the reclamation works in Tung Chung East and mastered the reclamation technology, it was therefore believed that the loss of fill materials could be effectively controlled. The Study Team also welcomed Members’ visit to the Tung Chung Community Liaison Centre to learn more about the reclamation works.
- (c) The journey time of the ferry to or from Peng Chau was calculated with reference to the speed of fast ferry. Members were welcomed to provide views on subsidy to ferry fare.
- (d) The Study Team reiterated that they would investigate the feasibility of the provision of ferry services between the KYCAI and the nearby islands, so that residents of the islands could benefit from the diverse employment opportunities and enjoy the, leisure, entertainment and medical facilities on the artificial islands.
- (e) The KYCAI would be able to accommodate approximately 500 000 residents. As there were different islands nearby, it was believed that many residents of the KYCAI would travel to the nearby islands for tourism and recreation, thereby driving the economic development of these islands.

43. Mr Raymond IP gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) It was mentioned in the discussion paper that the water depth at the east of Kau Yi Chau was about 12 to 15 metres. The Study Team had

avoided this deep water area when designing the KYCAI. At present, the proposed locations of the three artificial islands had a water depth of about 4 to 12 metres, with an average water depth of about 8 metres. Of the proposed locations of the artificial islands, around 48% of the area had a water depth of about 8 to 10 metres and around 40% of the area had a water depth of about 6 to 8 metres.

- (b) On the financial aspect, it was anticipated that the capital works expenditure would exceed \$100 billion per year in the coming few years. This amount of the expenditure, together with the cash flow of this project, would amount to about 4% of the gross domestic product (GDP) of Hong Kong. With reference to the peak of the Hong Kong Airport Core Program in the 1990s which the Government spending on capital works accounted for about 6% of GDP, it could be seen that the Government had the ability to bear the works expenditure.
- (c) With regard to the consultation, the Study Team had made an interim report to the Panel on Development of the Legislative Council at the end of December 2022, immediately followed by public engagement activities including the launch of the study website and the uploading of short videos to the blog of the Secretary for Development to introduce the preliminary proposals for the KYCAI project, as well as explanation on matters of public concern on Facebook. The Study Team had also reached out to individuals and groups from different sectors earlier, including professional institutes, the financial sector and economists, the Town Planning Board and the Land and Development Advisory Committee etc. With the advanced technology nowadays, the Study Team encouraged the public to express their views through different channels, including email, post, fax and the electronic comment form on the study website.
- (d) The Study Team attached great importance to the views of the public and representatives of the local community. In addition to this briefing, the Study Team had also given briefings on the preliminary proposals for the KYCAI to the Tsuen Wan District Council and the Central and Western District Council as well as would visit the Tuen Mun District Council and Yuen Long District Council soon. Moreover, other concern groups, including green groups, had also met.
- (e) The Study Team was holding exhibitions at the City Gallery in Central and the Tung Chung Community Liaison Centre about the preliminary proposals for the KYCAI; and roving exhibitions across different districts in Hong Kong. The Study Team welcomed Members to express their views through different channels at all times so as to enable refining the preliminary proposals.

44. Mr Jacky WU said that CEDD noted Members' concerns about the traffic network between the north and south of Lantau. CEDD had already completed the

Study on Traffic, Transport and Capacity to Receive Visitors for Lantau last year, and had commenced the Feasibility Study on Road Network Enhancement to South Lantau in March 2023 for a target completion in 2025 to formulate a suitable proposal. CEDD would report the study progress to the district council in due course.

45. Ms April KUN said the development of the artificial islands could not only accommodate a population of about 500 000 to 550 000, but also benefit residents of the surrounding islands with the diverse employment opportunities and the public leisure and entertainment facilities provided on the artificial islands. Upon the completion of the artificial islands, exchanges among the nearby islands would increase significantly. It was expected that residents of the artificial islands would visit different areas of the Islands District for sightseeing and consumption, hence boosting the economic growth of the Islands District. The Study Team had been refining and further developing the design in this regard, including enhancing the connectivity between the artificial islands and the nearby islands, so that the residents of the Islands District could further benefit.

46. Mr Jacky WU said that the Study Team had fully examined whether the KYCAI project would impose impact to the surrounding areas under extreme weather. The results showed that the project would not affect the islands in the vicinity of Lantau Island, nor would it increase the flooding risk on the Hong Kong Island. As for the flooding risk in individual areas, CEDD had completed a study earlier and the results showed that there were 26 areas with a higher flooding risk which required improvement works. The responsible team would take follow-up actions and would consult respective district councils in due course.

47. Mr Ken WONG said that ferry services had time limits and no overnight service was provided, therefore it was not an ideal mode of transportation. If there was no land transport between Peng Chau and the KYCAI, Peng Chau residents would prefer maintaining the status quo and taking the ferry to Central than travelling to Central via the artificial islands.

48. The Chairman expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He understood that Members still had many comments and enquiries. He suggested that Members express their comments and enquiries to the Secretariat before 31 March, so that the Secretariat could refer them to the Study Team for follow-up. Further meetings could be arranged for discussion, if necessary.
- (b) Although the Head of the SLO had mentioned the development of the KYCAI would not bring changes to the traffic time, he opined that the development would have far-reaching impact on the transportation of the Islands District. At present, residents of Lantau South could take a 35-minute direct ferry to Central. However, after the completion of the KYCAI, residents would need to take the ferry to the KYCAI first, then take the railway to the HKU Station and then to Central after passing through several MTR stations. In addition, the pier was at a certain

distance from the station, which would be a 3-minute walk at minimum. As for the elderly, the travelling time might be longer. Therefore, the traffic time might not necessarily be similar with the present condition. Moreover, the fare for a ferry trip between the KYCAI and the other islands could be expensive. The existing information provided by the Government was not sufficient to prove that the KYCAI project would enhance the accessibility of the Islands District. On the contrary, it might increase the residents' travelling expenses. In view of the multiple interchanges that would be required in the future, he questioned how the relevant authorities could ensure that the journey would be more convenient with the travelling time and fare remaining unchanged.

- (c) He opined that the chance of constructing a road to connect Mui Wo West via Hei Ling Chau in the future was very slim, but he was pleased to learn that the CEDD would conduct a feasibility study on the north-south road link on Lantau in March 2023.
- (d) Although the engagement period for the KYCAI would be completed by end March 2023, Members would continue to maintain communication with the Government. He thanked the guests for their presence.

(Post-meeting note: Comments and suggestions of Mr Ken WONG had been referred to the SLO of the CEDD for follow-up on 7 March.)

(Mr YUNG Chi-ming left the meeting at around 3:55 p.m.)

#### IV. Question on the disbursement of consumption vouchers (Paper IDC 4/2023)

49. The Chairman said that the question had been forwarded by the Financial Secretary's Office to the Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (FSTB) for follow-up, and the written reply had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

50. Mr FONG Lung-fei briefly presented the question.

51. The Chairman said the FSTB stated in the written reply that it had contacted the Member and had already dealt with the cases. He asked Mr FONG if further follow-up actions by the FSTB were required with regard to the question.

52. Mr FONG Lung-fei said the FSTB did not need to take further follow-up actions.

#### V. Question on the sale of Yu Nga Court in Tung Chung (Paper IDC 5/2023)

53. The Chairman welcomed Mr TSANG Chi-yuen, Housing Manager (Hong Kong Island and Islands 8) of the Housing Department (HD) to the meeting to respond to the question. The written reply of the HD had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

54. Mr FONG Lung-fei briefly presented the question.

55. Mr TSANG Chi-yuen gave a response as follows:

- (a) The HD had contacted its Development and Construction Division upon receipt of the question and had provided a written reply to Members. The HD had also contacted Mr FONG afterwards and it was learnt that some of the owners of Yu Nga Court flats used to live in public rental housing units and they, after purchasing the flats in Yu Nga Court, opined that flats under the Home Ownership Scheme (HOS) were smaller than public rental housing units of the same area. The HD responded in the written reply that the area of a public rental housing unit was measured on the basis of “internal floor area”, whereas the area of a HOS flat was measured on the basis of “saleable area” as defined by the Residential Properties (First-hand Sales) Ordinance (the Ordinance). The difference was that “saleable area” included enclosing walls while “internal floor area” did not.
- (b) It was stipulated in Section 8 of the Ordinance that saleable area was to be measured from the exterior of the enclosing walls of the residential property and included the area of the balcony and internal partitions.
- (c) If owners of Yu Nga Court flats had questions about the measurement of “saleable area”, they could contact the management office or the HD for enquiries.

56. Mr FONG Lung-fei asked whether the measurement of saleable area for the public rental housing flats for sale included the area of the walls.

57. Mr TSANG Chi-yuen said the HD had received enquiries from the media about the measurement of saleable area for the public rental housing flats for sale (such as the flats under the Green Form Subsidised Home Ownership Scheme). He said the HD would state clearly the “saleable area” and “internal floor area” of the flats for sale.

VI. Question on the Tuen Mun - Tung Chung - Tai O ferry service  
(Paper IDC 6/2023)

58. The Chairman welcomed Ms PO Pui-man, Karen, Chief Transport Officer/Planning/Ferry Review and Ms CHOI Siu-man, Sherman, Senior Transport Officer/Planning/Ferry 2 of the TD, Mr Leo LEE, Director, Commerce, Mr Yuson IP, Senior Operations Manager and Mr HU Xiaobo, Deputy Manager, Technical Department of the Fortune Ferry Company Limited (Fortune Ferry) to the meeting to

respond to the question. The written reply of the TD had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

59. The Chairman briefly presented the question.

60. Ms Karen PO said that there were two main reasons for the suspension of the “Tuen Mun - Tung Chung - Sha Lo Wan - Tai O” ferry service in December 2022 and January 2023. One was the impact of sea conditions and monsoons, and the other was vessel breakdowns. The TD and Fortune Ferry had arranged a larger vessel that could withstand stronger winds, and it was expected to deploy for full-trip sailings in the first quarter of 2023. It was believed that the number of ferry service suspension due to adverse sea conditions could be minimised under the new arrangement. To reduce the incidence of vessel breakdowns, Fortune Ferry would continue to inspect the vessels according to the inspection checklist before departure every morning, and would prepare sufficient spare parts for emergency repair when necessary, so as to resume normal ferry service as soon as possible. In addition, the TD had also requested Fortune Ferry to disseminate information through online platforms and the media promptly when there was a need to suspend the ferry service, so that affected passengers would be informed and could use other means of transport.

61. Mr HO Siu-kei said that although the TD had explained that the suspension of ferry service was attributed to equipment failure and rough sea conditions, residents could not understand why ferries of Fortune Ferry could sail to Tung Chung and Sha Lo Wan but not to Tai O, which was just two to three kilometres away from Sha Lo Wan. Decisions to suspend the ferry service when the Tropical Cyclone Warning Signal No. 3 or No.8 or the Black Rainstorm Warning Signal was in force were understandable, but residents could not accept Fortune Ferry’s suspension of ferry service while the winds were not strong. They suspected that there was ineffective monitoring on the part of the TD.

62. The Chairman expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Since the launch of the ferry route, Fortune Ferry’s service performance had been average and Members had not received many complaints from residents. However, there had been six times of service suspension (accounting for one-tenth of the total service time) in the recent two months, which were too frequent. The operator might have a misunderstanding that the ferry route was operated for tourists and no residents would use the service, thus leading to the frequent and sudden suspension of service recently.
- (b) Upon notice of Fortune Ferry’s service suspension, Members would immediately post the news on Facebook to inform the residents. However, more than half of the over 2 600 residents in Tai O were elderly people aged 65 above. These elderly residents did not know how to use Facebook, so they did not know about the service suspension until they arrived at the pier. Passengers were frustrated at the short notice by Fortune Ferry. In comparison, in times of typhoon, residents

were able to make early preparation as weather forecasts would be made.

- (c) At present, there were Kaito ferry services to and from many locations in the Islands District, such as the ferry from Aberdeen to Lamma Island and Peng Chau, and the ferry from Cheung Chau to Discovery Bay. There was not frequent suspension of such Kaito ferry services, and only the service of the particular route operated by Fortune Ferry was often suspended due to monsoon in the past two months. The public could not understand why the tour boats with a capacity of 20 passengers and the fishing boats could still sail on the sea in times of monsoon, but the service of ferries which had a larger volume had to be suspended. Most of the residents of Tai O were fishermen. They were familiar with ships and sea conditions, so they could not understand the frequent service suspension of Fortune Ferry.
- (d) The Chairman used to communicate directly with Fortune Ferry to solve problems in the past. However, in view of the seriousness of the problem and the wide discontent among residents, he thus brought the question to this meeting, so that members of the public could know the response of Fortune Ferry and the solution.

63. Regarding the reason of the suspension of the “Tuen Mun - Tung Chung - Sha Lo Wan - Tai O” ferry service in December 2022 and January 2023 under unfavourable sea conditions, Ms Karen PO said the TD had approached Fortune Ferry to understand the situation. Fortune Ferry explained that there might be safety considerations for its vessels currently in use to serve Tai O under strong monsoon winds, and the captains had decided to suspend the service in light of their professional judgment and the actual sea conditions in order to safeguard the safety of the passengers and the crew. To minimise the occurrence of similar situations, Fortune Ferry had arranged trials of using larger vessels that were more wind resistance, and was adjusting the vessel speed to meet the daily operation needs. The TD and Fortune Ferry expected that the vessel with higher wind resistance would be ready for service in the first quarter of the year to minimise service suspension.

64. Mr Yuson IP said the construction of the HZMB and the Third Runway at the HKIA had modified the currents, leading to particularly strong swells in the waters between Sha Lo Wan and Tai O. The vessels used previously would wobble under such circumstance and were deemed unfit to sail to Tai O. As for the Sha Lo Wan section of the route, since the navigation channels in Tung Chung were taken instead of the Tai O waters, it was therefore proper for the vessels to sail through the section of the route. Fortune Ferry would provide ferry trips to Sha Lo Wan as far as practicable to serve the residents of Sha Lo Wan.

65. Mr Ken WONG asked about the type, size and capacity of the existing and new vessels.

66. Mr FONG Lung-fei suggested that Fortune Ferry should consider the vessel models currently used on the Hong Kong - Macau route.

67. Mr HO Siu-kei asked whether the problem could be resolved after the introduction of the new vessels.

68. The Chairman made a summary and raised three questions: (1) Which vessel type was used by the operator at present and what was the capacity? (2) What was the difference between this vessel type and the work ships for the Third Runway? If the operation of the work ships for the Third Runway was not suspended, why did the operator have to suspend the ferry service? (3) He asked the TD to seek confirmation from experts on whether the construction of the HZMB and the Third Runway had affected the currents in the nearby waters and the navigation of Fortune Ferry's vessels, so that Members could explain the situation to the residents. Lastly, he asked whether the occasional suspension of the ferry service could be avoided or improved after the larger vessels were put into service in the future.

69. Ms Karen PO said she would consult the relevant departments on the issues raised by the Chairman and revert to the Secretariat afterwards.

70. Mr HU Xiaobo said that the vessels currently in use were 16.54 metres long with a capacity of 94 passengers. The Sha Lo Wan Pier was suitable for berthing vessels of less than 20 metres in length due to its small size. The new vessels were catamarans of 28 metres in length and 7.6 metres in width with a capacity of 170 passengers, which were larger than the vessels currently in use. A catamaran could withstand monsoon winds due to its greater stability, therefore the probability of service suspension could be reduced. He said that vessels plying between Hong Kong and Macao were close to 40 metres long, therefore they could not be moored to the piers along the ferry route concerned.

71. Mr Ken WONG suggested that when there was a need for service suspension due to strong monsoon winds, Fortune Ferry should modify the route to operate the ferry service between Tai O and Tuen Mun, and provide an additional route between Tai O and Sha Lo Wan, because these channels were still suitable for navigation as the sea condition was relatively calm. He asked if Fortune Ferry's new vessels were suitable for small piers such as the Sha Lo Wan Pier.

72. Ms Karen PO said that Fortune Ferry was making adjustments of the new vessel to cope with the daily operation. Upon completion, full sailing trials and berthing trials would be conducted to ensure that the existing journey time and schedule would not be affected. It was expected that the new vessel would be ready for service by the end of March this year.

73. Mr Leo LEE said that the company had considered Mr Ken WONG's suggestion to provide additional ferry service between Tuen Mun and Tai O when necessary. This arrangement would be made if the company had additional vessels and manpower for deployment.

74. The Chairman concluded that the problem of service suspension could hopefully be alleviated after the new vessels were put into service. He asked the TD



to make a reply after the meeting on the impact of the construction of the HZMB and the Third Runway on nearby waters.

(Post-meeting note: The written reply provided by the TD after the meeting had been forwarded to Members for perusal on 10 March this year.)

VII. Question on the progress of the “Subsidy Scheme to Extend Fibre-based Networks to Villages in Remote Areas”  
(Paper IDC 7/2023)

75. The Chairman welcomed Mr LO Tsz-him, Andrew, Principal Regulatory Affairs Manager (Market & Competition 12) and Ms WONG Nga-ting, Alice, Project Manager (Market & Competition 12) of the Office of the Communications Authority (OFCA), and Mr WONG Siu-fai, Mr CHAN Tai-yuen, Thomas, Mr Cliff KO, Mr CHOY Chung-ching, Mike and Mr TANG Chi-fung, Billy, Representatives of Hong Kong Telecommunications Limited (HKT), to the meeting to respond to the question. The written reply of the OFCA had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

76. Ms LAU Shun-ting briefly presented the question.

77. Mr Andrew LO gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) The Subsidy Scheme to Extend Fibre-based Networks to Villages in Remote Areas (the Subsidy Scheme) covered 235 villages and was grouped under six projects, among which Project 5 and Project 6 involved Lantau Island, Cheung Chau, Peng Chau and Lamma Island. HKT had been selected as the fixed network operator (FNO) for the projects through the tender exercise, therefore the company was invited by the OFCA to this meeting to give an account of the progress of the projects.
- (b) With regard to the laying of submarine fibre-based cables, the three submarine fibre-based cables under the Subsidy Scheme would connect Hong Kong Island with Lamma Island, Lantau Island with Cheung Chau, and Lantau Island with Peng Chau respectively. The laying of the submarine fibre-based cables could only be conducted with the approval of the Marine Department, the EPD and the LandsD. HKT had obtained the approval and permits from these departments in the end of 2022 and was currently arranging for the implementation of the works by work vessels. It was expected that the laying of the submarine fibre-based cables would be completed before the second quarter of 2023.
- (c) With regard to the installation of overland fibre-based networks, it was expected that the rollout of fibre-based networks for the 13 villages on Lamma Island would be completed by the end of 2023. As for the over 50 villages on Lantau Island, Cheung Chau and Peng Chau, it was

expected that rollout of fibre-based networks for most of the villages would be completed by the end of 2024.

78. Mr WONG Siu-fai said that the laying of submarine fibre-based cables was slightly postponed due to the epidemic. After the approval was issued by the relevant departments in the end of 2022, the work vessels from Mainland were unable to come to Hong Kong as scheduled. In addition, some of the crew members could not come to Hong Kong for work because of infection. As a result, the vessel company could only rearrange for the implementation of the works in April to May this year. It was expected that the works could be completed in June this year and fibre-based network services would then be made available to the residents of the various villages gradually.

79. Mr HO Siu-kei asked the OFCA when residents of Lantau Island would be able to use fibre-based broadband services after the laying of the fibre-based cables.

80. Mr Ken WONG said that at present, there was only one provider providing broadband service in Peng Chau. The residents always complained about the expensive charge. The charge for broadband service at a speed of 300Mb/s was as high as \$300 to \$400, which was several times the price of similar services in the urban area. He asked when new operators would join the broadband service market of the district.

81. Mr Eric KWOK said that the laying of fibre-based cables in Ham Tin Tsuen, Pui O had been completed, but residents had not yet been notified by the telecommunication service providers of the provision of fibre-based broadband services. The residents were still using basic broadband services that cost over \$400.

82. Mr HO Chun-fai said that the selected FNO was very sloppy in the laying of fibre-based cables on roads. Cables installed on the ground were covered with mud and sand only. When the mud and sand were washed away by the rain, the cables would be exposed and residents could be tripped easily. He hoped the selected FNO could pay attention to the issue and provide contractors with guidelines on safe and correct installation.

83. Ms LAU Shun-ting asked whether the permits required for the submarine cable works had all been granted, and whether everything was ready for the commencement of the works.

84. Mr Andrew LO made a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) According to the requirements stipulated in the contract, the selected FNO was expected to complete the laying of submarine cables before 2024. Based on the current schedule, it was expected that the laying of submarine cables could be completed in 2023, ahead of the completion date set out in the contract.
- (b) All the permits required for the works were granted and the submarine cable works could commence as soon as the work vessels arrived in

Hong Kong. On the other hand, installation of overland fibre-based networks was also in progress.

- (c) The main purpose of the Subsidy Scheme was to meet the demand for high-speed broadband services in villages in remote areas of Hong Kong. Through the Subsidy Scheme, fibre-based backbone networks would be extended to the vicinity of the entrances of those villages which were not yet connected to the fibre-based networks, in order to improve the quality of telecommunication services in the villages as well as the entire area. Villages with fibre-based networks already extended to the vicinity of their entrances would not be covered by the Subsidy Scheme.
- (d) The Subsidy Scheme could also improve the networks within the villages. The selected FNO had commenced the relevant works with the aim of providing villagers with high-speed broadband services.

85. Mr HO Chun-fai asked how long it would take to complete the roll-out of fibre-based networks for the entire Islands District.

86. Mr Andrew LO said that as stipulated in the contract, the construction period was six years, which meant that the works had to be completed by 2026. Subsidies would only be disbursed to the selected FNOs in phases by the OFCA upon completion of the works specified in compliance with the requirements stipulated in the contracts. This would encourage the selected FNOs to expedite the project delivery.

87. Mr WONG Siu-fai said the installation of overland fibre-based networks had been underway. After the installation of the submarine fibre-based cables, fibre-based broadband services would be made available to the residents gradually.

88. Mr Andrew LO gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) The OFCA was responsible for monitoring the quality of the works under the Subsidy Scheme and urging the selected FNOs to carry out the construction works in accordance with the standards stipulated in the contracts. The excavation works on roads, including the road reinstatement works, should also meet the requirements of the Highways Department (HyD). The OFCA would carry out acceptance inspections based on the contractual requirements. In case the quality of works under the Subsidy Scheme was found not up to par, Members could inform the OFCA so that the OFCA would follow up with the selected FNOs.
- (b) The OFCA understood that there were fewer choices in the Islands District in terms of FNOs as compared to the urban areas. According to the contracts, the selected FNOs were required to open up at least half of the capacity of the subsidised network facilities for use by other FNOs for free. Such a requirement could allow other FNOs to also provide

broadband services to the villages concerned by sharing the use of the subsidised facilities, thereby offering more choices to villagers. Service charges were expected to be able to peg at a competitive level under the market mechanism.

89. Mr Eric KWOK said optical fibre cables had been installed at the entrance of Ham Tin Tsuen on Chi Ma Wan Road in Pui O. As stated by the OFCA, the subsidised fibre-based networks should be open for use by other FNOs for provision of services. However, the PCCW Limited, the sole telecommunication service provider in Ham Tin Tsuen, still used copper wires to provide network service and charged a high price for that. He asked the OFCA whether other FNOs would be introduced to the market to bring in more competition and lower the service charges, and whether the existing copper wires in the village would be replaced with optical fibre cables.

90. Ms WONG Chau-ping asked how the OFCA could ensure the quality of the works carried out by the selected FNOs.

91. Mr Andrew LO made a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) It was believed that fibre-based networks had already been extended to the vicinity of the entrance of the village mentioned by the Member, therefore the village was not covered by the Subsidy Scheme. Although fibre-based networks had been extended to the vicinity of the entrances of some villages, the network speeds of broadband services in these villages were slower than those in urban areas because copper cables were still used in networks within the villages concerned for provision of services. The OFCA would continue to encourage the telecommunication service providers to improve the telecommunication networks within the villages.
- (b) In terms of works quality, the selected FNOs were contractually required to comply with the relevant requirements of the various government departments. If any works were found failing to meet the relevant standards during the acceptance inspections, the OFCA would ask the FNOs concerned to make improvements, and subsidies would only be disbursed after it was confirmed that the works met the relevant requirements.

92. The Chairman concluded as follows:

- (a) He suggested that Mr Eric KWOK could check after the meeting if Ham Tin Tsuen was covered by the Subsidy Scheme and raise the question again if necessary.
- (b) He asked the OFCA to conduct the acceptance inspections stringently. He said that the construction standards adopted for the rural road works mentioned by Mr HO Chun-fai were the standards of the Home Affairs Department, and asked whether the standards were the same as those of

the LandsD and the HyD, and whether there were contract loopholes that would make it easier for the contractors to pass the acceptance inspections. He requested the OFCA to look into the details after the meeting and provide a written reply. The Chairman suggested that Mr HO Chun-fai could provide photos of the works quality problems to the OFCA for follow-up.

(Post-meeting note: The written reply provided by the OFCA after the meeting had been forwarded to Members for perusal on 14 March this year.)

VIII. Question on the low pay for the outsourced cleaners of Mun Tung Estate  
(Paper IDC 8/2023)

93. The Chairman welcomed Mr NG Chung-ho, Dicky, Property Service Manager/Service (Hong Kong Island and Islands)4 of the HD to the meeting to respond to the question.

94. Mr Eric KWOK briefly presented the question.

95. Mr Dicky NG responded as follows:

- (a) The current property management service contract for Mun Tung Estate would expire in July this year, and the tendering exercise for the new contract had been completed in November last year. In addition, in the marking scheme for tender evaluation of the Hong Kong Housing Authority (HA), the weighting of committed wage rates to non-skilled workers had been raised. It was believed that when the new contract took effect, the wages of the cleaners would increase accordingly.
- (b) Under the current mechanism, in accordance with the service contracts signed with the HA, service contractors had to make adjustments to the committed wage rates of all non-skilled workers annually based on the contract price fluctuations. The HA must uphold the contract spirit. Therefore, it should not force the service contractors to raise the wage rates agreed in the service contracts that were awarded under the original tender evaluation marking system. This arrangement was also in line with the Government's practice.
- (c) Due to the epidemic, the HA had, in accordance with the current mechanism, required the service contractors to perform extra hours of cleansing duty in the light of the actual situation of different housing estates and the additional service demand. As the epidemic had greatly increased the workload of cleaners, the Government made use of the Anti-epidemic Fund to provide Anti-epidemic Hardship Allowance (AHA) to frontline cleaners and security officers of the service contractors since March 2020. The cleaners were eligible for a

monthly AHA of \$1,000 from March to September 2020 and a monthly AHA of \$2,000 from February to June 2022.

96. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) He thanked Mr NG for his explanation, and added that he hoped to voice for the cleaners by presenting this question. The cleaners faced a heavy workload and their duties were of an obnoxious nature, but their monthly pay was just over ten thousand dollars. Nowadays, consumer prices stood high, their wages were not enough to cover their daily living expenses. He opined that it was unreasonable for the cleaners to receive a minimum wage of \$11,000 to \$12,000 per month.
- (b) Cleaners had to take up additional work due to the epidemic, but the contractors refused to hire additional manpower or raise the wage rates, which was unfair to the cleaners. As one of the major employing government departments, the HA had the responsibility to treat the frontline cleaners with fairness and humanity.
- (c) He cited the record of working hours kept by employers, saying that the average monthly wage was \$15,300, which was higher than the average monthly wage of \$14,500 of the cleaners working in Yat Tung Estate. He hoped Mr NG could reflect the figures to the HA and urged the HA not to set the monthly wages of the cleaners at the minimum wage level of only \$11,000 to \$12,000.

97. Mr Dicky NG noted the views of Members.

IX. Question on the improvements to the facilities of Mun Tung Estate  
(Paper IDC 9/2023)

98. The Chairman welcomed Mr NG Chung-ho, Dicky, Property Service Manager/Service (Hong Kong Island and Islands)<sup>4</sup> of the HD to the meeting to respond to the question. The written reply of the EMSD had been distributed to Members for perusal before the meeting.

99. Mr Eric KWOK briefly presented the question.

100. Mr Dicky NG responded as follows:

- (a) The HD attached great importance to the facility problem at JoysMark and had already conducted a review and a feasibility study. The works section planned to install guard rails at five suitable positions on the roof of JoysMark, so as to prevent children from climbing out of the roof while playing there. The works would commence in mid-April this year.

- (b) With regard to the malicious damage to SAIL Early Child Development Centre (SAIL), the HD had requested the property service contractor of Mun Tung Estate to step up patrols. The situation had improved and no such complaints had been received in the past six months. The works section conducted an on-site inspection and a feasibility study. The HD would contact SAIL later to discuss if the works were necessary.
- (c) With regard to the lift operation problem, according to the record, there were two lift failure events in Mun Tung Estate in January 2023. One was a lift door jam caused by external objects such as sand and stones, and the other was a motor failure. After the removal of the external objects and the replacement of the motor by the contractor, the lifts resumed normal operation. With regard to the problem of the lifts being overloaded when it carried only seven to eight passengers as mentioned by the Member, the HD had carried out tests for the three lifts in Mun Wo House, Mun Tung Estate with the EMSD on February 14 this year. The lifts, with a rated load of 900 kg, did not show any warning of overloading when loaded with less than 900 kg of weight in the tests and the overload indicators were in normal operation. He explained that the sign of full loading would be displayed when the lifts were loaded with about 80% of its rated load. Meanwhile, the “full-load bypass” function would be enabled and the lifts would descend to the ground floor directly. This function enabled the lifts to reach the ground floor as soon as possible to set down passengers and pick up new ones, so as to maintain the overall efficiency.

101. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) There had been accidents in which children fell and were injured while playing in the past three years. He was pleased to learn that a solution was finally found for the problem. He asked the HD to invite Members for a site visit when carrying out the guard rails installation works.
- (b) With regard to the HD’s meeting with SAIL, he hoped the HD would provide an exact date.
- (c) He asked the electrical and mechanical section of the HD to step up lift inspections and follow up on maintenance stringently to avoid further lift failures, thereby securing the safety of Mun Tung Estate residents. He also suggested that the sign “Capacity: 12 persons” in the lifts be replaced with the sign “Capacity: 900 kg”.

102. Ms WONG Chau-ping hoped that the HD could follow up on the recurrent noise nuisance on the podium floor of Mun Tung Estate and near the table tennis tables at night, and instruct the property service contractor to step up patrols.

103. Mr Dicky NG responded that he would notify Members before the installation of guard rails and when meeting with SAIL. In addition, he would also ask the

contractor to step up patrols in the vicinity of the table tennis tables.

104. The Chairman said an adult weighed about 75 kg, which multiplied by 12 would equal 900 kg. It was a statutory requirement to display inside a lift the rated load in number of passengers or weight, therefore the signs should not be changed.

X. Progress Report of Major Projects in Islands District  
(Paper IDC 1/2023)

105. The Chairman welcomed Mr CHOW Siu-hong, Vincent, Senior Engineer/15 (Lantau) of the CEDD to the meeting to present the paper.

106. Mr Vincent CHOW briefly presented the paper.

107. Mr Eric KWOK expressed his views as follows:

- (a) Regarding the “Greening Master Plan (GMP)s of the Southwest and Northeast New Territories – priority greening works” on page five of the paper, he hoped that the CEDD could make reference to the Airport Authority’s Cherry Blossom Garden project along Chek Lap Kok South Road. He said the project was very successful and had attracted many flower viewers. He suggested that the CEDD should include iconic flowers in its future greening projects.
- (b) Regarding the “Hospital Authority Supporting Services Centre” on page 13 of the paper, he said that the original plan for the site near the North Lantau Hospital was to build the second phase of the hospital in public-private partnership, but it was later changed to facilities including a central food production unit, a data centre and a laundry centre. He also suggested opening Chui Kwan Drive to alleviate the heavy traffic in Tung Chung West.
- (c) Regarding the “Construction of San Shek Wan Sewage Treatment Works and Pui O Village Sewerage” on page 29 of the paper, drainage excavation works were currently underway. Every evening, buffaloes would travel from Pui O back to San Shek Wan via the road section. He suggested that signs should be erected during the road opening works to remind drivers to beware of buffaloes, so as to avoid accidents and casualties. In addition, as road opening works were currently underway on the slope from Bui O Public School to San Shek Wan, when there were buses or other vehicles stopping at the road section, the traffic flow would be obstructed. He hoped the CEDD could reflect the problem to the contractor.

108. Mr Vincent CHOW said Members’ views were noted and would be forwarded to the departments responsible for the relevant projects for follow-up.



(Post-meeting note: The CEDD's written reply that consolidated the responses from the various departments with regard to the major projects in Islands District had been forwarded to Members for perusal on 3 April this year.)

XI. Proposed set up of a working group on duty visit  
(Paper IDC 3/2023)

109. The Chairman asked Members to consider the proposal set out in the paper. He suggested that a working group be set up first, with him and the Vice-chairman Mr WONG Man-hon being the Convenor and Vice-convenor of the working group respectively.

110. Members noted and unanimously endorsed the paper.

(Members voted in favour included: the Chairman Mr Randy YU, the Vice-chairman Mr WONG Man-hon, Mr CHAN Lin-wai, Mr Ken WONG, Mr HO Chun-fai, Mr HO Siu-kei, Ms WONG Chau-ping, Mr Eric KWOK, Mr FONG Lung-fei and Ms LAU Shun-ting.)

XII. Reports on the Work of the IDC Committees  
(Papers IDC 10-12/2023)

111. Members noted and unanimously endorsed the papers.

(Members voted in favour included: the Chairman Mr Randy YU, the Vice-chairman Mr WONG Man-hon, Mr CHAN Lin-wai, Mr Ken WONG, Mr HO Chun-fai, Mr HO Siu-kei, Ms WONG Chau-ping, Mr Eric KWOK, Mr FONG Lung-fei and Ms LAU Shun-ting.)

XIII. Date of Next Meeting

112. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:55 p.m. The next meeting would be held on 17 April 2023 (Monday) at 2:00 p.m.

-END-