

**The 6th Meeting of
The Traffic and Transport Committee (TTC) of
the Kowloon City District Council (KCDC)**

Date: 12 November 2020 (Thursday)
Time: 2:30 p.m.
Venue: Conference Room, Kowloon City District Office,
7/F, Kowloon City Government Offices,
42 Bailey Street, Kowloon

Present:

Chairman: Mr LEE Hin-long
Vice-chairman: Mr FUNG Man-tao, Joshua
Members: Mr WONG Wing-kit
Mr LAI Kwong-wai
Miss CHAU Hei-man
Mr PUN Kwok-wah, JP (Arrived at 2:43 p.m.)
(Left at 5:05 p.m.)
Mr KWOK Tin-lap
Mr LAM Tak-shing (Arrived at 2:42 p.m.)
(Left at 7:07 p.m.)
Mr YUM Kwok-tung, Pius
Miss MAK Sui-ki, Jakki
Mr SIU Leong-sing (Arrived at 2:40 p.m.)
(Left at 4:15 p.m.)
Mr WONG Kwok-tung, Daniel
Mr TSANG Kin-chiu (Left at 6:05 p.m.)
Mr YEUNG Chun-yu (Left at 7:05 p.m.)
The Hon LEE Wai-king, Starry, SBS, (Arrived at 2:46 p.m.)
JP (Left at 6:37 p.m.)
Mr HE Huahan (Arrived at 2:43 p.m.)
(Left at 3:55 p.m.)
Dr KWAN Ka-lun (Arrived at 2:43 p.m.)
(Left at 7:48 p.m.)
Mr MA Hei-pang (Arrived at 2:43 p.m.)
Mr NG Po-keung, MH (Arrived at 2:46 p.m.)
(Left at 7:05 p.m.)
Mr CHO Wui-hung, MH (Arrived at 2:55 p.m.)
(Left at 6:05 p.m.)
Mr CHEUNG King-fan (Arrived at 2:45 p.m.)
Mr YANG Wing-kit (Arrived at 2:42 p.m.)
(Left at 4:18 p.m.)
Dr KWONG Po-yin (Arrived at 2:41 p.m.)

<u>Absent:</u>	Ms LEUNG Yuen-ting Mr HO Hin-ming, BBS, MH	
Secretary:	Miss LEE Cheuk-yan, Charmaine	Executive Officer (District Council) 1, Kowloon City District Office
<u>In Attendance:</u>	Mr KAN Yiu-chun, Melvin	Assistant District Officer (Kowloon City)
	Mr LEUNG Yat-kiu, Silas	Senior Transport Officer / Kowloon City 2, Transport Department
	Ms YUE Ka-ka	Senior Transport Officer / Kai Tak and Kowloon Bay, Transport Department
	Mr MACK Ting-kai	Engineer / Hung Hom, Transport Department
	Ms LUK Nga-yee, Christine	Engineer / Kowloon City, Transport Department
	Mr WONG Siu-cheung	Operation Officer (Kowloon City), Hong Kong Police Force
	Mr PO Yiu-wa	Officer-in-charge, Traffic Team (Kowloon City), Hong Kong Police Force
	Mr HO Chi-kin	Officer-in-charge, Traffic Team (Sau Mau Ping), Hong Kong Police Force
	Mr CHIU Tsz-wai	Project Coordinator / Kowloon East (District), Highways Department
	Mr YIP Yuk-tsang	District Engineer / Hung Hom, Highways Department
<u>Attendance by Invitation:</u>		
Item 2	Mr WU Man-kit	Electronic Engineer / Project 1/1, Transport Department
Item 3 to 5	Ms Joyce WAN	Assistant Public Affairs Manager, Citybus Limited / New World First Bus Services Limited
	Mr Alan LAI	Senior Operation Officer, Citybus Limited / New World First Bus Services Limited
	Mr WONG Tsz-kin	Manager (Operations), Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited

	Mr Jeff TAM	Manager (Public Affairs), Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited
Item 10 to 12	Miss CHAN Ka-man, May	Senior School Development Officer (Kowloon City) 3, Education Bureau
	Mr CHOW Ho-ming, Maurice	School Development Officer (Kowloon City) 31, Education Bureau
	Mr Alan Erickson	Student Welfare and Safety Principal, Stamford American School
	Ms Pinky NG	Head of Communications, Stamford American School
	Mr Ben LEI	Public Affairs Consultant, Stamford American School
	Mr CHAN Chi-fung	Senior Executive Officer / Driving Test 1, Transport Department
	Mr CHAK Ka-lin	Senior Driving Examiner, Transport Department
Item 13	Mr LEUNG Cho-ming	Senior Engineer, Highways Department
	Mr KWAN Chun-him, Martin	Engineer, Highways Department
	Mr HO Chi-shing, Andy	Senior Resident Engineer, Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture
	Ms CHAN Wing-shan, Sandy	Resident Engineer, Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture
Item 14	Mr CHOCK Chi-tung	Senior Engineer, Highways Department
	Mr LEUNG Lap-yin	Engineer, Highways Department
	Mr KWAN Chi-ching, Will	Senior Associate, WSP (Asia) Limited
Item 15	Mr TANG Lai-yin, Ricky	Senior Engineer / Walkability 4, Transport Department
	Ms CHAN Fung-ping, Inness	Engineer 9 / Walkability, Transport Department
	Mr CHAN Wing-ngai, David	Senior Engineer 5 / Special Duties, Highways Department
	Mr CHEN Wei	Engineer 13 / Special Duties, Highways Department

Item 17	Mr LO Fu-yin	Engineer / Transport Services 1/6, Electrical & Mechanical Services Department
Item 18	Mr TANG Yiu-hang	Chief Health Inspector (Kowloon City), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
	Mr SHAM Chi-wai	Senior Health Inspector (Kowloon City), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Item 21	Mr YIU Siu-hung, Edmond	Senior Estate Surveyor / South East Kowloon (District Lands Office, Kowloon East), Lands Department

* * *

The Chairman of the Traffic and Transport Committee (TTC) welcomed Members, representatives of government departments and organisations to the meeting. **The Chairman** said that the Secretary of the Committee received the sick leave application from Mr HO Hin-ming earlier and Members had no objection to approving the leave. **The Chairman** approved the leave application.

The Chairman reminded Members to declare interests in accordance with the Standing Orders. He also said that if and when the number of Members present at the meeting was less than 12, he would adjourn the meeting according to the Standing Orders. Lastly, he reminded attendees to turn off the ringers on their mobile phones or switch them to vibration mode, and remain silent during the meeting.

Item 1

Confirmation of Minutes of Last Meeting

1. **The Chairman** said that Members should have received the minutes of meeting from the Secretariat. He had made amendments before the meeting but the Secretariat did not forward the paper in relation to the amendments and he had placed the photocopies at the seats of Members and those of the representatives of the Secretariat and the District Office (DO). If the attendees were interested in the

amendments to the minutes of meeting, they could get a copy from him.

2. **The Chairman** enquired the Committee whether it would confirm the amended version of the minutes of the 5th meeting.

3. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** raised objection to the confirmation of the amended minutes of meeting.

4. **Mr SIU Leong-sing** said that the minutes of meeting should truly reflect the proceeding of the meeting and he supported the amendments.

5. **Mr Pius YUM** agreed that the minutes of meeting should truly record the items at the meeting that day and the views expressed by the officials and Members present at the meeting. He supported the amendments proposed by the Chairman and made additions to the discussion on the Demand for Protecting the Reasonable Rights of Drivers and Passengers.

6. **Mr KWOK Tin-lap** supported the amendments and said that the minutes of meeting should truly reflect the proceeding of that meeting. Without the consent of the District Council (DC), no tempering of the minutes of meeting based on the likes of the Administration and some government officials should be allowed.

7. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** pointed out the DO had stated that the agenda item was incompatible with the functions of the District Councils under the District Councils Ordinance and should not be included into the discussion items. Thus he objected to the confirmation of the amended minutes of meeting. He said he would not participate in the voting and would withdraw from the meeting if the minutes of meeting were confirmed by all means.

8. **The Chairman** said that there would be no forced confirmation of the minutes of meeting.

9. **Mr PUN Kwok-wah** agreed to the views of **Mr YANG Wing-kit** that no discussion should be held on that agenda item. Instead he asked whether discussion items at future meetings that had no substantial contents would also be recorded. If a precedent was set now, there would be many similar records in the future.

10. **Miss CHAU Hei-man** pointed out it was stated in the Kowloon City District

Council Standings Orders that the agenda items should be decided by **the Chairman**. Because of the dereliction of duty by the Secretariat, no record was made to the minutes of meeting accepted by **the Chairman**. Members in fact had discussion on that agenda item at the meeting. Thus she viewed that a complete and true record of the agenda items approved by **the Chairman** should be recorded. Thus, she supported the amendments by the Chairman.

11. **Miss Jakki MAK** supported the amendments to the minutes of meeting. She stated that the minutes of meeting should truly record the discussion on the agenda item that day. The failure of the Secretariat in making records led the **Chairman** to move a step forward by taking over the duty of the Secretariat to make amendments accordingly. Thus she supported the amendments to the minutes of meeting.

12. **Mr WONG Wing-kit** supported amending the minutes of meeting. As the Secretariat failed to execute its duty in writing the minutes of meeting under the District Council Standing Orders, he thus supported the amendments made by the Chairman.

13. As no more discussion was proposed by Members, **the Chairman** put the amended minutes of meeting adopted by the Committee to a vote, the result of which was as follows:

Agree	: 14 votes	(Mr Joshua FUNG, Mr WONG Wing-kit, Mr LAI Kwong-wai, Miss CHAU Hei-man, Mr KWOK Tin-lap, Mr Pius YUM, Miss Jakki MAK, Mr SIU Leong-sing, Mr Daniel WONG, Mr TSANG Kin-chiu, Mr YEUNG Chun-yu, Dr KWAN Ka-lun, Mr MA Hei-pang and Dr KWONG Po-yin)
-------	------------	---

Object	: 0 vote
--------	----------

Abstention	: 1 vote	(Mr LEE Hin-long)
------------	----------	-------------------

14. **The Chairman** announced that the minutes of meeting after amendment were confirmed.

15. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** raised the issue of rules of meetings and advised to rule that the voting just then did not comply with the agenda of the meeting. The original minutes of the previous meeting instead of the amended one as referred to in the

agenda should be confirmed. He stated that the vote was not in compliance with the requirements under the agenda and asked to rule that the vote just then was illegal and did not comply with the agenda of the meeting.

16. **Mr SIU Leong-sing** raised the issue of rules of meetings. During the vote, **Mr YANG Wing-kit** spoke without the Chairman's consent and he hoped that he would make a ruling on **Mr YANG's** act.

17. **Mr KWOK Tin-lap** stated that during the vote, **Mr YANG Wing-kit** re-entered the conference room before the result of the vote was announced. He asked whether **Mr YANG** was considered to have cast an abstention vote.

18. **The Chairman** asked the Secretary whether she had noticed that situation.

19. **The Secretary** said Mr YANG Wing-kit had left the conference room when the votes were counted.

20. **The Chairman** said the observation by the Secretary should prevail and then made the following ruling in respect of the issue of the rules of meetings raised by **Mr YANG Wing-kit** and **Mr SIU Leong-sing**:

- (i) as the minutes of meeting were prepared by the Secretary, though he had informed the Secretary earlier his intention to amend the minutes of meeting, the Secretariat did not distribute the relevant paper to Members. As such, he proposed amendments at the meeting in accordance with the Standing Orders. According to the established practice, Members were allowed to make amendments to the inaccurate or incorrect points in the minutes of meeting before or at the meeting. Thus it was ruled that the amendments made just now and the resolution complied with the rules of meetings and they were the final ruling by the **Chairman** and no more debate was allowed;
- (ii) **the Chairman** noted the issue of rules of meetings raised by **Mr SIU Leong-sing** and stated that warning would be given when the same situation occurred.

21. **Miss Jakki MAK** mentioned the issue of rules of meetings, stating that after the issue was raised by **Mr SIU Leong-sing**, **Mr YANG Wing-kit** spoke from his

seat again and **the Chairman** was asked to make a ruling.

22. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** made clarifications.

23. **The Chairman** said that if what was mentioned by **Mr YANG Wing-kit** was not about the rules of meetings, he should stop speaking the issue of rules of meeting was not the same as clarifications.

24. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** asked whether he could make clarifications and showed his dissatisfaction.

25. **The Chairman** asked **Mr YANG Wing-kit** to stop speaking and stated that since **Mr YANG Wing-kit** did not cause too much disturbance at the meeting just then, no warning was given this time. However, if there were Members contravening the Standing Orders or interrupting the order of the meeting, corresponding ruling would be made.

26. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** raised the issue of rules of meetings.

27. **The Chairman** said that if they were not about the rules of meetings, he would be asked to stop speaking immediately.

28. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** said by the power of the **Chairman**, he would know that the minutes of meeting amended last time had to be confirmed and he had the right to revise the wordings of the agenda. However, no revision was made by the **Chairman** and the original version was adopted. He stated that the confirmation made during the vote just now was in respect of the amended minutes of the last meeting. The agenda passed and that of the present meeting were not the same. He enquired whether it was a non-compliance of the agenda and whether the voting was unlawful.

29. **The Chairman** stated that the amendments this time had been sent to the Secretariat for distribution and the **Secretary** would be asked to explain later whether she had received them or why they were not distributed. She also had to explain why there was no record of the relevant agenda but Members could still discuss it:

- (i) the minutes of meeting were related to the discussions on the agenda which was drafted by the Secretary and any Member could propose

amendments to them. If **Mr YANG** or other Members viewed that the wordings were not related to the matters they showed concern but censures, they could always propose amendments. If there was no objection, it was unnecessary to put it to a vote. But if there were objections such as that raised by **Mr YANG** at the very beginning, it would be put to a vote; and

- (ii) **the Chairman** advised Members if they had queries about the matters that would soon be put to a vote or they had questions about the rules of meetings, their enquires should be raised before the vote. If they were raised after the vote, the **Chairman** had no right to raise objections to the decision made by the Committee.

30. **The Chairman** viewed that there were still many items pending discussion and thus hoped to start discussions on other agenda items.

Item 2

Matters Arising

Request for Considering the Installation of Average Speed Camera Systems in Kowloon City District (Paper No. 98/20)

31. **Mr WU Man-kit, Electronic Engineer / Project 1/1 of Transport Department** (TD) reported that technical testing on the Average Speed Camera Systems in Kowloon City District (Systems) which was jointly undertaken by the Transport Department (TD) and the Hong Kong Police (HKPF) was mainly to test the reliability and feasibility of the Systems to be applied to the roads in Hong Kong. If the testing was successful, the Systems would be widely used on other roads including the East Kowloon Corridor.

32. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** said the TD did not provide a specific reply. Members of the public had long been disturbed by the noise nuisance cause by speeding vehicles. If only detection was used, it would not be able to solve the problem faced by the public every night. Thus she requested the TD to make elaborations on the study, the schedule for the commencement and review of the work, etc.

33. **Mr WU Man-kit of TD** stated that the technical testing started on the West Kowloon Corridor and Tsuen Wan Road on 3 October lasted for a period of 6 months.

If the testing was successful, the TD would study the feasibility and standards to be applicable to other roads in the light of the testing results and would also apply for funding with LegCo. As for speeding on the East Kowloon Corridor, it was believed that the Police would pay close attention to the problem and take different enforcement actions to prevent speeding.

34. **Mr Pius YUM** enquired about the objective and specific standards for determining whether the testing was successful, such as the number of vehicles caught for speeding by law enforcement bodies or the number of complaints against speeding at relevant locations decreased. He also said that before the commencement of the work, there should be objective standards in place. It was pointed out that there were often discussions about the “cup matches” at Central Kowloon Route, Hung Hom District, To Kwa Wan District, Ma Tau Wai Road, etc. under the TTC agenda. Residents reflected that they were always disturbed at night and members of different constituencies had submitted papers on the subject and it was hoped that the representative of the TD would elaborate.

35. **The Chairman** enquired whether there was provision of indicator.

36. **Mr WU Man-kit of TD** replied that the present one was a technical testing mainly to test the reliability and accuracy of the Systems on the roads of Hong Kong. It would also test whether the Systems would be affected by the weather of Hong Kong. The TD would collect relevant data during the testing including the number of failure in the past 6 months such as mechanical faults and whether there was deviation of the data from the standard they set. The TD would assess the feasibility of the Systems on the roads of Hong in the light of the data. If it was proven that it was technically feasible, a decision on its installation locations would be made. As the Systems would be applied to road sections with fewer exits, there should be sufficient distance between the exits of the road sections to allow the Systems to calculate the average speed of vehicles. The TD would be able to collect sufficient data after 6 months for relevant technical assessment on the benchmark for the conduct of road sections.

Concern about Disturbances to Residents Caused by Speeding of Vehicles and Modified Cars in Hung Hom at Midnight
(Paper No. 99/20)

37. **Mr PO Yiu-wa, Officer-in-charge, Traffic Team (Kowloon City), Hong**

Kong Police Force (HKPF), said that Paper No. 25 tabled at the meeting contained the actions and details during the two long weekends in October 2020 taken by the Police against modified cars, speeding and illegal motor racing and it was prepared in accordance with the requests made by Members last time. He supplemented that the Traffic Department of Kowloon West had taken 113 actions against speeding and illegal modification of vehicles in October.

38. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** enquired whether 100 vehicles committing speeding from September 26 to 4 October and the 200 vehicles committing the same offence from October 23 to 26 mentioned in Paper 25 tabled at the meeting referred to the whole Kowloon West Region or just Kowloon City District.

39. **Mr Pius YUM** asked the representative of the TD to read the details of Paper No. 25 tabled at the meeting pointing out that apart from speeches made by Members, the TD should also make reference to the official figures released by other government departments. The TD's representative should give thought to why Mr HO placed the "Average Speed Camera Systems" under Matters Arising and why Mr HO viewed that no specific reply was given by the TD's representative and asked for explanations. He continued to say that the figures provided by the Police showed that the problem was very serious and he enquired the Police about the locations of the illegal motor racing and the number of vehicles involved.

40. **Mr PO Yiu-wa of HKPF** replied that such actions covered the whole Kowloon West Region, Hung Hom and Kowloon City Division. Within the Kowloon West Police District, speeding of vehicles were mainly found on a few elevated roads and in Kowloon City District such as Princess Margaret Road, East Kowloon Corridor, Hung Hom Road to Tsim Sha Tsui connecting Salisbury Road to Route 3 where actions were taken to detect speeding and against illegal modification of vehicles.

41. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** said she understood that speeding routes covered the whole West Kowloon Police District and pointed out that there were less illegal activities during the weekends of last month and this showed the effect of law enforcement actions against the illegal activities. She also said that since the problems were identified and solution was found, staff deployment for other actions could be made. The actions were appropriate and effective. She also suggested strong combat actions be taken during long holidays or weekends to root out the problem so that the residents would not be disturbed. As the results of the enforcement actions were obvious, detailed figures could be referred to the TD for

arranging the introduction of supplementary tools to assist the Police in taking enforcement actions. She said that dissatisfaction among members of the public would be aggravated if the departments concerned were trying to offload the responsibility among them.

42. **Mr PO Yiu-wa of HKPF** noted **Dr KWONG Po-yin's** views and stated that the Traffic Kowloon West would continue to take enforcement actions against speeding and modification of vehicles during long holidays or weekends and cross-district large scale actions would be taken together with colleagues of other police regions (for example, the joint action taken with New Territories South Regional Headquarters on the connecting elevated roads from 23 to 24 October). He also said that the Police would take relevant actions during weekdays.

43. **Mr Pius YUM** felt regretted that **Mr WU Man-kit of TD** left the conference room during the discussion of the matters arising and said when he spoke earlier, he had reminded **Mr WU Man-kit of TD** to pay attention to the official figures provided by another government department. However **Mr WU Man-kit of TD** made no response and then left. He was dissatisfied with the attitude of the representatives of government department in response to the requests by Members. He asked the Police to consider making earlier arrangements to prevent the holding of "Kowloon City Cup" during Xmas, New Year and the Lunar New Year.

44. **The Chairman** said the Secretariat had reminded Members that **Mr WU Man-kit of TD** was only to attend to discuss matters relating to "Average Speed Camera Systems". If there were other transport issues, it was believed that these would be handled by the standing representative of TD. He said that the four TD representatives at the meeting could respond to the views made by **Dr KWONG**, **Mr YUM** and **the representative of HKPF** if they had anything to supplement.

45. **Mr MACK Ting-kai, Engineer / Hung Hom of TD** said he had noticed the figures and the number of illegal modification vehicles when enforcement actions were taken listed in Paper 25 tabled at the meeting and he believed that his colleagues had received relevant information had taken follow-up actions. He noted **Mr YUM's** views and would exchange views with his colleagues and have internal communications on the enforcement figures by the Police.

46. **The Chairman** asked the Secretariat to list out the matters arising that needed to be discussed when preparing the agenda in the future or else Members

would have difficulties in making preparations.

New Items

Item 3

Request for Increasing the Number of Runs for Citybus Route 22

(Paper No. 89/20)

Item 4

Request to Citybus for Restoring the Normal Schedule of Runs for Routes E23 and E23A at the Soonest

(Paper No. 109/20)

Item 5

Request to KMB for Tackling the Problem of Lost Trips for Route 8P and Correcting Inaccurate Information in APP 1933

(Paper No. 110/20)

47. **Mr HE Huahan** introduced Paper No. 108/20.
48. **Mr KWOK Tin-lap** introduced Paper No. 109/20.
49. **Mr KWOK Tin-lap** introduced Paper No. 110/20.
50. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** said he noticed Route E23 and E23A had resumed the normal schedule of runs on 4 October but there were no Route A23 runs up to the present and the residents were greatly affected. Some of them had to walk to Kai Tak and others even had to walk to Trade and Industry Department to take the bus to the airport. It was hoped that the bus company concerned would resume its runs of A23 as soon as possible. He already reflected at the last meeting that “APP 1933” provided inaccurate information and he had experienced it himself. He once waited for Route 5 and expected that the bus would soon arrive. However, he got to check “APP 1933” again when there was no bus coming after waiting for a very long time and then found that the time of arrival of the bus had changed. He thus missed the chance of shifting to other vehicles. He did not know whether there were “ghost buses” as the KMB staff wanted to meet the target rate of buses in service or on the run and asked the KMB representative to provide an explanation on it. He continued to point out that residents would consider the fare for taking different bus routes and they would choose the cheaper route even though they had to wait a little bit longer if there was not too much difference in the waiting time between different routes. It was hoped that attempts would be made by the company to enhance the accuracy of the

application to allow residents to decide the routes to be taken in order not to waste their time.

51. **Mr LAM Tak-shing** said the application had all along failed to provide convenience to the residents and Members and sometimes there were “buses chasing one and another” and the time of arrival between them was very short. At the last-term DC meeting and the previous TTC meetings, the company had promised to follow up, made adjustments and review the application. Thus he enquired about the results and the effectiveness of the investigation.

52. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** stated many members viewed that the “ghost buses” problem was very serious and enquired about the progress of the promise by the bus company to improve the application and the progress about the installation of a Global Positioning System (GPS) on buses. She continued that she took the bus every day but did not encounter any “ghost buses” recently though there were delay of runs. In addition, she enquired about the installation of the bus tracking facilities and the progress of the study on that application. Though lessons were resumed in schools, the students finished earlier than usual. Thus the after-school hours of many secondary school students did not tie in the usual busy hours of the buses. The delay of buses might result in the students going home later for lunch. As students needed to go home for lunch, they might be home as late as 3:00 p.m. for lunch as the buses were always full during those hours. She cited an example that the students of La Salle College had difficulty in taking buses back to Whampoa. She thus suggested the bus company to have coordination with schools and adjust and increase the runs on that route and make improvements for the students to go home for lunch. When the after-school hours returned to normal later, depending on the routes concerned, the bus company could coordinate with the schools for its runs again such as Route 12A and 11K.

53. **The Chairman** said applications on the arrival of their buses were provided by the KMB, Citybus and the NWFB. It was hoped that the KMB would make concerted efforts to improve the accuracy of the arrival time of its buses. According to his own experience and reflection by residents, the accuracy of the KMB application would be lower when there were traffic accidents. Furthermore, Route 86S in Shatin also run on a school bus route and its service from Shatin Station to Ma On Shan was earlier amended from the normal school hours to between 12:00 noon and 2:00 p.m. There were also many student passengers on Route 17 in our District and it was hoped that the KMB would coordinate with the TD to provide more runs

during the after-school hours for the routes with more student passengers by making reference to other districts to allow them to go home as soon as possible to avoid students gathering in the streets.

54. **Ms YUE Ka-ka, Senior Transport Officer / Kai Tak and Kowloon City of TD**, noted the request by **Mr HE Huahan** to increase the number of runs for Citybus Route 22. She stated that because the present average patronage of Route 22 in a busiest hour in October was 50%, thus no consideration to increase its runs was made at present. The TD and Citybus would continue to pay heed to the passenger demand and its change, and detailed discussion would then be made.

55. **Mr Silas LEUNG, Senior Transport Officer / Kowloon City 2**, replied as follows:

- (i) on the referral by Members, the TD conducted a survey on Route E23 and E23A and observed last Thursday that there were late runs and lost trips for Route E23 and immediate improvement was made. The TD had asked Citybus to pay heed to its service level and make proper arrangements for its runs. Because of the pandemic this year, the Government introduced a series of measures to lower people's flow to avoid social contact as well as to restrict the number of incoming passengers. As the said route was mainly to serve the passengers of the land border crossings and the airport, its patronage had dropped by 40 to 50%. Depending on passenger demand, the TD would continue to pay heed to its service level and would review its number of runs with the bus company;
- (ii) the survey on the runs of Route 8P by the TD showed that the bus was running according to schedule during afternoon rush hours. However, because of busy traffic on its way, there was delay in the arrival of a bus at mid-way stops such as the stop at Tsim Sha Tsui Pier. According to observation, no passengers had to wait for more than one run at the stop at Tsim Sha Tsui Pier as a result of the delay. The TD would continue to monitor the patronage of the route and flexibly rescheduled its runs through referral or regular surveys and then report to Members when required; and
- (iii) as for the KMB's application, he said that sometimes flipping was

detected during enquiries made to the bus arrival time and had tried to enquire the KMB about it. The KMB stated that the present reception of signals was not stable and improvements to it were being made. He would ask the KMB representatives to provide the technical details. He believed that the application was able to provide the accurate arrival time to passengers and hoped that the KMB would explain the problem and report the renovation progress when appropriate.

56. **Mr WONG Tsz-kin, Manager (Operations), Kowloon Motor Bus Co. (1933) Ltd (KMB)**, replied as follows:

- (i) a random survey on the runs of Route 8P in October found that all buses set off punctually at the terminus. However, as a result of the road traffic condition, there might be buses arriving at Tsim Sha Tsui Ferry Pier about 20 minutes late on some days. The data showed that such cases usually happened on Friday and surveys were conducted on other bus routes on Friday but found that the impact on every Friday varied. As such, the KMB would firstly attend to the traffic condition closely and if congestion persisted, it would then discuss the arrangements with the TD; and
- (ii) after the resumption of classes, the KMB sent its staff to the school district to check the traffic condition there and increased its runs at around 1:00 p.m. during the after-school hours. Continued attention would be paid to it and corresponding changes would be made if there was any change in the resumption arrangement for the classes.

57. **Mr Jeff TAM, Manager (Public Affairs) of KMB** replied as follows:

- (i) as for the estimated time of arrival system, the KMB had upgraded its hardware and software and the GPS system on buses was renovated earlier. The accuracy of the arrival time was enhanced resulting in lesser complaints from the community. The KMB would continue to make improvements to correct the error at times;
- (ii) an investigation on the inaccuracy of the information about runs of Route 8P was also conducted and it was found that reception of

signals was easily affected by the rather enclosed environment of Laguna Verde. KMB would make improvements on individual routes such as Route 8P; and

- (iii) as for the cases of “ghost buses”, he stressed the KMB had handed its data on runs to TD which would examine the set-off time of buses. The set-off time of buses was strictly arranged in accordance with the KMB’s performance pledge. However, because of the road condition, the buses might fail to arrive or arrive late at stops leading to discrepancy with the pledge. It was considered very unsatisfactory but to some extent, the bus company was also a victim. He stressed that the KMB did not change the information on runs by interpolating its application.

58. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** stated the department representative did not answer his question. He enquired about the resumption of the normal run of Route A23 again. He always used the Citybus’ application and found that its estimated time of arrival was inaccurate and residents had difficulty in estimating the arrival time of buses. It was hoped that Citybus would calibrate its application to improve its accuracy.

59. **Mr HE Huahan** said he understood the standard about the patronage rate and the increase of the runs of Route 22 and hoped that the TD and Citybus would consider the difficulty encountered by the students living in Kai Tak Area, the number of which was on the increase, but only a run of Route 22 was provided every 30 minutes. There were only two runs to facilitate the students to go to school and it would arrive at Kai Shing Road Stop at about 6:50 a.m. and 7:20 a.m. If there was traffic congestion for the 7:20 a.m. run, the students would be late for school. As such, they could only choose to take the 6:50 a.m. bus and it was hoped that Citybus would consider making the following adjustments in response to the present situation:

- (i) in response to the needs of students to take Route 22, the bus company should adjust its set-off time to provide more chances for the students to get on the bus to improve its 50% patronage rate;
- (ii) as there were many students in Kai Tak Area going to the schools in Ho Man Tin area, the KMB especially arranged an empty bus departing from Richland Gardens. It was hoped that the Citybus would copy the arrangements made for Route 17 to increase the

number of runs for Route 22 from 6:50 a.m. to 7:20 a.m. to ease the problem faced by students; and

- (iii) as there were no passengers at the Kai Tak Cruise Terminal, the everyday patronage rate of Route 22M was near zero. He suggested to fine-tune the runs of Route 22M during the hours i.e. between 6:30 a.m. and 7:30 a.m. when students were going to school, i.e. extending the route to Regal Hotel, Kowloon City Road or even Kowloon Tong area to increase the patronage rate with a view to improving to the insufficient runs of other routes. He hoped that the department concerned would seriously study the feasibility of his suggestions and have discussions on them.

60. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** stated bus routes that had letter A in their number had no passenger at present. However, in the wake of the announcement by the Government that there would be a daily quota of 2 000 inbound travellers back to Hong Kong via the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge (HZMB) from the end of the month and the route was a main route to HZMB, the number of Hong Kong inbound travellers would increase after quarantine was exempted. She enquired whether the bus companies had made preparations in respect of the schedule of runs of the relevant routes and whether the public had to make arrangements by themselves. In addition, she asked about the discussion and coordination between relevant organisations and the Government if the relevant traffic arrangements were kicked off at the end of the month.

61. **Mr LAM Tak-shing** asked relevant departments about the arrangements in respect of routes that had letter A in their number and whether their runs would be suspended or cut in the light of the patronage. He also pointed out that the public had no way to get relevant information and hoped that relevant departments would inform Members and the residents beforehand about such arrangements for them. It was also hoped that its application would provide stable service and the KMB would continue to monitor and review its service to ensure its smooth operation.

62. **Ms Joyce WAN, Assistant Public Affairs Manager of Citybus** replied as follows:

- (i) she noted the views to increase the runs of Route 22 raised by **Mr HO**. According to the patronage record of October, the maximum

average hourly patronage rate of the routes to Kowloon Tong and Kai Tak was 40 to 50%, mostly recorded in the afternoon rush hours at about 5:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m. and it was observed that the service of that route was able to meet passenger demand for the time being. In special days such as the days the schools resumed classes, there were more passengers waiting for individual runs but her colleagues found that they could still get on the bus. In the light of the actual situation and the availability of resources, Citybus would make appropriate adjustments to cope with passengers' needs;

- (ii) she noted Members' views on providing additional runs of Route 22 from 6:50 a.m. to 7:20 a.m. and a study on it would be conducted with her colleagues;
- (iii) as for Route E23 and E23A, because of the pandemic, the patronage rate of individual border crossings, the airport and tourist routes were surprisingly low. Thus service had to be suspended and runs on special schedule were arranged earlier and at present. However, she pointed out that service for Route E23 and E23A had returned to the pre-pandemic level. She noted the service of individual runs might be unstable and close attention would be paid to it and appropriate adjustments would be made when required;
- (iv) as for Route A23, its service was still suspended temporarily as the patronage rate of individual airport routes was very low. Citybus together with the TD would pay close heed to the passenger volume and flow of people and would update its service arrangements on the social platform or Citybus web page; and
- (v) in response to the clearance service operations implemented by the Government at the end of the month, passengers could take Route B3X from Shenzhen Bay Port to Tuen Mun Town Centre and there was Route B5 running from Hong Kong Port, HZMB to Sunny Bay Station. Citybus and the TD would maintain close contact and pay attention to the situation in the two ports so as to enhance service to meet passenger demand.

63. **Mr Alan LAI of Citybus** stated that after the resumption of classes by

schools, staff of his company conducted site inspection, finding that generally there were more student passengers on Route 22 departing from the Cruise Terminal at 7:10 a.m. In the first few days after the resumption of school, there were in fact more passengers but not to the extent that they failed to board the bus. According to their observation, even though there were more students and accompanying parents, seats on the upper deck were still available. As the journey from Kai Ching Estate to Kowloon Tong was less than 20 minutes, many students did not go to the upper deck but stayed in the middle of the lower deck. The drivers were informed by internal circular to advise the passengers to go to the upper deck or to move to the inner part of the compartment. Outdoor staff would also be deployed to monitor the situation to note passengers' demand for review purposes.

64. **Ms YUE Ka-ka of TD** stated that together with Citybus, they would continue to note the passenger volume and take follow-up actions.

65. **Mr Silas LEUNG of TD** said quarantine at border crossings and the clearance measures there would change in response to the varied condition of the pandemic. Thus TD would have communication with Citybus on the future passenger volume of the buses to the border crossings and the airport and would keep Members and the public informed when appropriate. He said there was concern on the service of the bus routes to schools but as school hours varied as a result of the pandemic, students went home after attending the school for half day. The investigation by TD showed that the bus companies had adjusted their runs appropriately to meet passengers' demand. TD would ask the bus companies to continue noting the demand of student passengers and make appropriate arrangements.

66. **Mr Pius YUM** said he noticed Citybus had made announcements on the vacant seats at the upper deck and understood that an electronic screen showing the number of vacant seats at the upper deck was installed on most of the KMB buses though it was always shown that the system was under testing. He pointed out that when new buses were introduced by the franchised bus companies, the provision of the display screen was a basic facility required by the TD. He enquired whether that requirement was applicable to Citybus. If Citybus was included, he enquired whether it was because of the aging problem of its vehicles on relevant routes that such facility was not upgraded for the time being.

67. **Mr YANG Wing-kit** hoped the TD would first understand the situation of Route A23 before any review was made. He pointed out that there was no bus service

from To Kwa Wan to HZMB port for the residents of Kai Tak and at lower To Kwa Wan Road. Residents of at lower To Kwa Wan Road, Grand Waterfront and Yick Fung area had to go to upper To Kwa Wan Road to take Route A22 while the residents in Kai Tak had to go to the stop at the Trade and Industry Department. Thus it was hoped that the TD and Citybus would consider the actual demand when adjusting the runs. Furthermore, he pointed out that the public relied on technology for maximising the use of time and the road conditions might lead to deviations. He hoped that Citybus and the NWFB would conscientiously review the accuracy of the application on their schedule of runs or else the residents would miss the runs.

68. **Mr KWOK Tin-lap** had the following views on Route 8P and the application:

- (i) in the relevant TTC papers on 24 September, he pointed out that 3 site inspections were conducted. The first one was conducted in the evening of 25 September from 6:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. during which it was found that there was a run for every 11 to 12 minutes by Route 8P and the service was provided by No. MP6528, LF6071, PC6429 and MT1422 from 5:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. It was noted that if any problem was simply caused by congestion, not just four vehicles should be deployed to provide the service on that day. It was doubted that the bus company had real intent to provide one run every 11 to 12 minutes;
- (ii) he was at the Tsim Sha Tsui Pier at about 6:20 p.m. on 25 September and it was shown in the application that the bus would soon arrive. However, the run was lost and he asked the KMB to provide data for reference by the KMB; and
- (iii) he noticed only four runs were provided from 6:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. on 6 October which showed very great discrepancy between the service provided and its pledge to provide a run in every 11 to 12 minutes. Thus, the data were provided for reference purposes.

69. **Ms Joyce WAN of Citybus** noted Members' views on the mobile application. As there were unforeseen incidents on roads and that would affect the journey time of buses. In view of that, a Global Positioning System (GPS) was installed on the buses to enable the application to update the real location of the buses regularly and Citybus had earlier fine-tuned its application to include the unforeseen

incident mode and obstruction encountered. Thus if their journey was obstructed or the buses were unable to move on, the situation and the location of the buses would be shown to facilitate passengers to estimate the time needed for their journey.

70. **Mr Silas LEUNG of TD** thanked **Mr YANG** for his concern on Route A23 and TD would have appropriate communication with Citybus and provide reports when necessary. In addition, he thanked **Mr KWOK** for providing the data in respect of Route 8P. The TD would ask KMB to closely follow up the situation and investigation would also be conducted from time to time.

71. **Mr WONG Tsz-kin of KMB** thanked **Mr KWOK** for providing the data. However it might not be able to state the then actual situation at present and he said he would check that day's situation and then provide a reply to **Mr KWOK**.

72. **The Chairman** asked relevant organisations or departments to hand in the data that needed to be provided to the Secretariat after the meeting for distribution to all Members of the Committee.

Item 6

Request for Following up the Problem of Damaged Minibus Stop Signages Failing to Show GMB Route Numbers As Soon As Possible
(Paper No. 111/20)

Item 7

Concern over the Arrangements for Kowloon GMB Route 6
(Paper No. 112/20)

Item 8

Proposal to the Transport Department for Introducing Special GMB Route 8X During Peak Hours
(Paper No. 113/20)

Item 9

Concern over the Low-floor Wheelchair Accessible Public Light Bus Trial Scheme
(Paper No. 114/20)

73. **Mr NG Po-keung** introduced Paper No. 111/20.

74. **Mr Silas LEUNG of TD** introduced Paper No. 112/20.

75. **Mr KWOK Tin-lap** introduced Paper No. 113/20.

76. **Mr CHEUNG King-fan** introduced Paper No. 114/20.

77. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** stated she understood the arrangements of the TD for Kowloon GMB Route 6 and its attempt to offer adequate service by means of Route 26A and 13C but no adequate support was rendered to the residents of Oi King Street area by Route 6X. She tried that route before the service of Route 26A officially commenced last month and found that there was overlapping in part of the routes of 26A and 26 but they failed to cater to the needs of the residents of Oi King Street, Harbour Place and Stars by the Harbour to the Tsim Sha Tsui and Jordan areas. She pointed out that earlier she had asked the minibuses operators about their operation and her original intention was to put forward the matters for discussion at the meeting after more data were collected in December. However, according to the “Standing Orders”, no repeated discussion on identical agenda items could be held within half a year. Thus she would like to invite TD, the minibuses companies and Members to conduct discussions on improvement to the routes and requested continued discussions on relevant matters after more data on the routes were collected in December.

78. **Mr Pius YUM** supported continued discussion on relevant matters under Matters Arising. He noticed that previously there was a minibus stop off King Fu Building at Tak Ming Street but as the present Route 26A did not go via King Man Street, residents of Whampoa Estate had to walk to Royal Peninsula, Harbour Place or Whampoa Garden to board the minibus. Residents’ views and enquiries on the inclination of the operators were received earlier and it was hoped that some adjustments would be made on some of the runs.

79. **Mr LAM Tak-shing** pointed out that there were damaged minibus stops in Hung Hom and To Kwa Wan. Generally, the stops bore no signages or there was only a plastic stick on them and it was worried that they would easily fall. It was hoped that TD would urge the minibus companies to improve or to remove the stops as soon as the routes were cancelled or changed. Signages should be provided along the routes where there were minibuses running so that the public would clearly know the place to wait for the minibuses. He continued to point out that as there were many people going to the peripheral area of Hung Hom and Tsim Sha Tsui via those routes, he requested TD to call for tender for Route 6 and 6X to facilitate local residents. In addition, he thanked the TD for accepting residents’ views on Route 26A and make it

easy for students or residents to go Tsim Sha Tsui.

80. **Dr KWAN Ka-lun** supported the continued discussion of the matter. As most of the residents only learnt of the operation of Route 26A recently and they might not know the location of its stops or its schedule of runs. It was hoped that more views could be collected from the residents or passengers such as information about its route, or schedule of runs at different timeslots for the provision of constructive and pragmatic suggestions for discussion at the next meeting.

81. **The Chairman** said that after Route 6 and 6X stopped running, Route 26A had become one of the main alternatives. The route of Route 26A and that of Route 6 was similar in many ways and he enquired whether the TD would consider calling tender for Route 26A independently when it called for the next-round tender for Route 2 and 2A in the light of the difference between Routes 26A and 26. In addition, he believed that the TD had also taken note of the views by individual civic organisations and the relevant plans detailing the ways to improve the routing of Routes 26A and 13C. Furthermore, after the operation of Route 26A, some residents reflected that they were inconvenienced since it did not travel via Oi King Street. He enquired whether a review would be made or the views of the civic organisations be re-considered for the operation of the route or adjustment to the route would be made after it was operated for some time. Also, the Chairman said the agenda item would be incorporated into the Matters Arising of the next meeting and he hoped that there would be more data and information available by then or even invited the operators to report the operation. He enquired the TD about the information it had in hand and its positioning.

82. **Mr Silas LEUNG of TD** said that residents responded favourably to the adjusted route of Route 26A. As for the data, only 12 days' data since its implementation on 1 November to the present were collected, i.e. only the operation data of last week were collected. As one week's data were not sufficient to reflect the situation, TD would ask the operator to provide more data and would continue to monitor the operation of that route and report the operation data when appropriate. If adjustment on the route was required, a report would be made to Members. As for Route 6 and 6X, the TD had stated that the operation of those two routes were not desirable. Though Route 26A would go to places to which no service was provided by Route 6 and 6X, because of the many public transport alternatives available, the TD thus had no plan to call for tender again for its service. He noted **Mr KWOK's** suggestions on Route 8X, but its arrangement involved the deployment of the

operator's vehicles which might affect its present service. He understood residents' desire for point-to-point service and a review would be made in the light of the overall traffic arrangements in the District. He thanked **Mr NG** and **Mr LAM** for their suggestions on the minibus signages, but Route 110 was within the purview of the New Territories Regional Office. He had referred it to his colleagues for requiring the operators to provide complete signages at its terminal and along its way and the TD had also asked the operators of the area to take note of the condition of the signages. Inspections would be carried out to monitor the situation and if Members found any special conditions, they could refer them to the TD for follow-up actions.

83. **The Chairman** enquired whether the franchise of Route 26A followed that of Route 26, the main route or a group was formed with another branch line.

84. **Mr Silas LEUNG of TD** stated that Route 26A was an auxiliary service route of Route 26 and the routing of Route 26 had been adjusted to provide circular service between Whampoa Garden and Canton Road in Tsim Sha Tsui.

85. **Ms YUE Ka-ka of TD** gave a reply on the low-floor wheelchair accessible public light bus (PLB). She said that after approval was given to the operation of GMB Route 90A and 90B, there was a review submitted to the Transport Tribunal about the decision on the selection of their operator. As such, the TD could only award a temporary right to run the route to the operator who was allowed to operate the route on a temporary basis from March 2019. The Transport Tribunal passed a verdict in July the same year and then the TD awarded an official operation right and a passenger service licence to run that route by the operator in September this year under which the operator was required to provide a brand new low-floor wheelchair accessible PLB for that route within one year. It was understood that the operator was making arrangements to purchase the vehicle from the supplier and the TD would continue to follow up the matter. It was hoped that the low-floor wheelchair accessible PLB would soon be put into service.

86. **Mr CHEUNG King-fan** stated he had a site visit in the Hong Kong Children's Hospital in respect of the low-floor wheelchair accessible PLB trial scheme and had communication with the PLB company. He understood that whether service could commence within one year commencing September would depend on the time of purchase of the vehicle. Also, the PLB company hoped that TD would make suggestions on the supporting facilities of the new vehicle as it would be wider and bigger than the normal PLB in terms of design and the size of facilities and thus

required bigger stops. He enquired whether there were parking spaces in the Hong Kong Children's Hospital and its surrounding area or else the PLB might be subject to penalty due to illegal parking frequently which would affect its operation. He hoped that the TD would render assistance to the PLB company and discuss with the Hong Kong Children's Hospital about the provision of a parking space for it.

87. **Ms YUE Ka-ka of TD** noted the views and suggested the operator to conduct a trial run before the commencement of service of the low-floor wheelchair accessible PLB. As for its parking location, generally the PLB operators needed to find a parking space for their vehicle. Thus the TD could not promise to find a parking space for the operator. However, it would liaise with the Hong Kong Children's Hospital enquiring whether it would allow the low-floor wheelchair accessible PLB to be parked in the hospital to facilitate the provision of service to service users.

88. **The Chairman** instructed the Secretariat to make arrangements for the continued discussion of Paper No. 112/20 and ask the TD to collect relevant data. The representative of the operator, Kellis Ltd, would be invited to participate in the discussion depending on circumstances.

Item 10

Request for Addressing the Traffic Problems at Stamford American School on Man Fuk Road (Paper No. 115/20)

89. **Mr Joshua FUNG** introduced Paper No. 115/20.

90. **Ms Christine LUK, Engineer / Kowloon City of TD** stated that since the opening of the school, TD had been paying attention to the traffic conditions during its before-and-after-school hours. After classes began this term, there were TD staff at site to observe the traffic condition. She understood there was pressure on traffic after the schools started half-day tuition in the forenoon. To some extent, there would be pressure on the traffic of the surrounding areas such as Man Fuk Road no matter there was half-day or whole day tuition. In view of the transport demand in the nearby areas, the TD suggested marking a No-stopping Restriction Zone from 7:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. at the two bay areas near the international school in Man Fuk Road and the measure was accepted by the school. Apart from that, the TD would also pay heed to the number of learner-drivers near the school during the before-and-after-

school hours from time to time. Regarding the traffic condition before the opening of that school, as it was formerly the New Method College, this implied that the site for school use was not changed and thus the TD viewed it unnecessary to conduct a traffic impact assessment (TIA) again.

91. **Mr Maurice CHOW, School Development Officer (Kowloon City) 31, Education Bureau**, stated that since the opening of the school, the Education Bureau (EB) had been paying attention to its nearby traffic condition before-and-after-school hours and every school year inspection on the traffic condition was conducted there. He understood that the condition might not be too satisfactory sometimes, the EB thus made coordination proactively to discuss the ways to improve the traffic condition there with Mr FUNG, the school and the residents. The EB was mainly paying a coordination and communication role.

92. **Mr Alan Erickson, Student Safety and Welfare Principal of Stamford American School**, stated he had been with that school since its opening in August 2017 in Hong Kong and he was responsible for the operation and transport matters of the school. The school had all along accorded top priority to the safety of students, school campus matters and the residents and those were his responsibilities. He cooperated with the local residents, school staff and the school bus operator to ensure that traffic was smooth at Man Fuk Road. The school provided half-day tuition in September and the students were off school at 12:35p.m. That would undoubtedly exert pressure on traffic in the nearby areas. As many schools finished lessons at roughly the same time and he viewed that it would happen in other districts too. He also noted the traffic problem at Man Fuk Road and Pui Ching Road. Starting from last Thursday, the school resumed whole-day tuition and the students were off school at 2:35 p.m. In recent two weeks, some measures to improve the traffic condition were taken by the school including arranging additional staff to direct traffic off the school and monitoring student pick-up by parents. The school also adjusted the time and order by which the students left school and such measures gradually began to take effects. Traffic condition at Man Fuk Road was improved last week and the school was optimistic that the traffic condition there would be improved day after day. Furthermore, the school was making efforts to make multi-prong improvements in respect of the flow of students outside the school, the school buses and parents and one of the measures was to encourage students taking the school bus. As the pandemic was rampant, the number of students taking the school bus decreased mainly because parents were doubtful about the hygienic condition of the school buses. They were also worried that social distancing might not be observed by the

students inside the school bus. The school would continue to promote the school bus service and planned to install GPS system on board all the school buses to enable parents to know the departure and arrival time of the school buses. The greatest advantage of the GPS system was that it was able to track the school bus routes. It was believed that after the installation of the GPS system, more parents and students who were unwilling to use the school bus service previously would take the school bus. The first important step was to increase the number of students taking the school bus.

93. **Mr Pius YUM** raised the following views/enquiries:

- (i) The TD did not respond to whether consideration would be made to prohibit learner drivers driving into the Waterloo Hill area during the before-and-after-school hours of Stamford American School but only listing the figures and the impact on the public by such restriction in the reply paper. However, the Waterloo Hill residents were continuously impacted by learner drivers and it was hoped that the TD would give a positive reply on whether the requests of the two DC members would be accepted.
- (ii) the school provided school bus service and encouraged parents and students to use that service. The school buses were mainly used to send students to the nearby MTR station. He enquired about the proportion of students taking school buses arranged by the school in this school term under the pandemic; and
- (iii) he showed dissatisfaction towards the TD pointing out that the premises of Stamford American School was the former New Method College which was a private school. Under normal circumstances, more parents of international schools would ferry their children to and from school by private cars than those of the non-international schools and he viewed that the TD had wrongly assess the situation by conducting the assessment without consultation.

94. **Mr Joshua FUNG** raised the following views/enquiries:

- (i) the school postponed its off-school time to 2:45 p.m. to avoid parents picking up children during the afternoon off-school hours of other

schools but the traffic congestion problem remained to be very serious. As Waterloo Hill only had one traffic lane, vehicles needed more than half an hour to drive out of Pui Ching Road. It was hoped that the school would make long-term proposal including consideration to compel students to take the school bus or arranging different off-school time slots. He also pointed out that though the school had encouraged its students to take the school bus, only 320 out of its 650 students did so and there were still many parents ferrying their children to and from school by private cars. He enquired if the school could provide statistics on the students taking private cars; and

- (ii) he showed dissatisfaction towards the TD's inappropriate handling. The TD, as a department responsible for planning and managing the transport matters in the community, should in no case fail to conduct a traffic impact assessment. The change of a private school into an international school would bring about entirely different situations. At the Traffic and Transport Committee (TTC) meeting on 2 March 2017, his predecessor had raised the above question. Mr. CHEUNG Chi-wa, the then Engineer of the TD stated that the road off the school was wide and the picking up and dropping off of passengers there would cause no traffic congestion. Thus he viewed that the TD had the responsibilities to manage traffic and asked the TD to provide specific suggestions and solution to the school or community and enquired whether the EB had made relevant proposals and received relevant information.

95. **Ms Christine LUK** responded as follows:

- (i) as for the learner driver problem during the before-and-after school hours, it was found that its proportion was not high when looking back to the traffic survey conducted after the operation of the school but the statistics was not updated. After listening to the views expressed a traffic survey was conducted again to study the proportion of learner driver vehicles to the overall vehicle trips during the before-and-after school hours for another review; and
- (ii) as for whether a private school was required to conduct the TIA, she

stated that generally if the development involved land use change, the TD would ask the applicant to submit a TIA report on submission of application and would provide views on the report. Before the operation of the private school, it had provided a report on its routine operation. According to the present mechanism, as there was no land use change in that road section, there was no need for its applicant to submit a TIA report.

96. **Mr PO Yiu-wa of HKPF** stated that Kowloon City Police District had more schools than other police districts. During the before-school hours, strategic means would be employed by the Police for traffic flow management at different locations to ease traffic congestion. His colleagues stationed in Kowloon City Police District would be deployed for traffic control at Man Wan Road, Man Fuk Road and Pui Ching Road during the before-school hours every day.

97. **Mr Maurice CHOW of EB** stated that when the school applied for registration, the EB had made enquiries with the Town Planning Board (TPB). The TPB raised no objection to the registration of the school as it involved no change in the use of its school premises and it was changed from a private school to an international school. Thus no special information would be supplemented.

98. **Mr Alan Erickson of Stamford American School** responded as follows:

- (i) the provision of subsidy to students taking the school bus was one of the ways to increase the number of students taking the school bus. There were 20 students taking the subsidized school bus to Ho Man Tin and Yau Ma Tei during the last term. He viewed that because of the pandemic, there were fewer students taking the school bus than under normal circumstances. The school just finished discussing the school bus fees and the new school bus routes for the next term, hoping that the number of students taking the school bus would increase during the next school term. He viewed that some students who intended to take the school bus had shifted to other transport mode because of the pandemic. The school would continue to promote its school bus service;
- (ii) as for the school's transport plan in the longer run, its measures to be taken would depend on the strategy of the school and the opportunity

available. The school population was mostly young students from kindergarten to Form 4. The school found that after their promotion to Primary 6 and Form 2, most of them were not ferried to and from school by their parents and they would then take the school bus or other public transport mode. The trend in the past 3 years showed that the older students were not ferried to and from school by their parents and they would take the school bus or other public transport mode. In the past years, the school took into consideration the traffic condition when arranging after-school extra-curricular activities. After lessons were finished at 2:45p.m, a series of extra-curricular activities were arranged for the students of different age groups from 3:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m. including sports and music activities. The school found that there were about 30% of its students taking part in those activities meaning that about 30 to 35% of its students would stay at the school up to 4:00 p.m. or 5:00 p.m. i.e. not all students would leave school at 2:45 p.m. to 3:00 p.m. and traffic in the surrounding areas at 3:00 p.m. would be smooth as the students would leave school at different hours. However, because of the pandemic, starting from January last year, all extra-curricular activities were cancelled. After the slowing down of the pandemic, the school would resume the extra-curricular activities and it was believed that it would help reduce the traffic flow greatly;

- (iii) as what was mentioned by the school before, the number of students taking the school bus this year had decreased. The school planned to install GPS system on board the school buses in about December or January hoping to enhance parents' confidence on the school bus service. That measure would not only lead to more students taking the school bus but would also enable parents who did not use the school bus service to be aware of the bus routes. Furthermore, in the wake of the on-going development of the school, it would grasp the ways to make better arrangements for its students to leave school and also ease the flow of students outside the school. The school resumed whole-day tuition last week and positive measures to reduce the traffic flow to avoid impact on the Man Fuk Road residents were taken by the school after according priority to safety. The school was willing to listen to the views of parents and residents to improve its traffic arrangements to facilitate the local residents; and

- (iv) as for the survey data, the school had no chance to conduct a survey in the past months. It decided to send questionnaires to parents in January to collect information on the number of students intending to take the school bus, parents intending to ferry their children to and from school and the students intending to walk home after school. A similar survey was conducted by the school in 2018 and its findings had helped the school to promote its school bus service to parents ferrying their children to and from school and to encourage students to take the public transport mode.

99. **Mr Joshua FUNG** raised the following views/enquiries:

- (i) under the pandemic, many primary and secondary schools finished lessons in the afternoon at roughly the same time but if whole-day tuition was resumed, their off-school hours would still coincide with those of the international school. Also, no extra-curricular activities would be held because of the pandemic. He thus queried about the effectiveness of such practice. Even if extra-curricular activities were arranged, they could not be held in the same state as before within a short span of time. In addition, the school had been in operation for 3 years and it should try to get hold of the relevant statistics as soon as possible to judge whether the current measures to encourage students to take the school bus and to reduce the number of private cars involved were effective. He further pointed out that the school's ultimate target was to have 1 000 students but the present 650 students had already paralysed traffic. If the school took in more students, the traffic flow of the Waterloo Hill area would be beyond its capacity and it would also be impacted by the learner drivers;
- (ii) in its reply to the DC members, the TD stated that no obstruction would be caused to traffic. Except that the mechanism prohibited conducting a TIA, the TD should know that after the opening of the international school, there might be traffic congestion in the district. The last-term DC member raised the problem in March 2017 and discussion was held from June to July. The view of the TD at present that there was no need for a TIA report was a problem relating to mechanism. He also enquired the TD about its criteria for TIA and

was dissatisfied with the TD's failure to get hold of the statistics provided by the school and its lack of planning in the past 3 years; and

- (iii) he enquired about the terms of reference of the EB in the matters and the role played by the EB in the specific arrangements.

100. **Mr Pius YUM** viewed that the TD had to some extent shifted the problem to the EB. The EB assessed that a TIA report was not needed when New Method College was changed to an international school and thus the TPB had no comments on the impact of traffic. He was dissatisfied with the two departments and viewed that the present problem was resulted from their view that no TIA was needed. Previously there were more parking spaces in that area and the driving instructors would give driving instruction there. He asked the departments concerned to accept the views by Members by restricting learner driver activities during the before-and-after-school hours and asked the TD to take remedial measures.

101. **Ms Christine LUK** replied as follows:

- (i) she clarified the a TIA report needed to be conducted by the applicant and then submitted to the TD for examination. As the school use was not changed then, the school thus did not submit any TIA report;
- (ii) she said that after the opening of the school, the TD had been paying attention to the traffic condition. Apart from the beginning of the school term, traffic was generally smooth. As the special condition of this year was different from that of last years, the TD had all along been examining the traffic control measures there in order to make improvements; and
- (iii) as for the exact time restricting learner driver activities in Man Fuk Road, the TD needed to have a better understanding of the proportion of learner driver activities there during the before-and-after-school hours before a decision could be made. She reiterated that the TD had all along been following up the views by Members, conducting at-site inspections and assessment as well as making responses.

102. **Mr Maurice CHOW of EB** stated that when communicating with the school,

it was learnt that the school had been adjusting the school hours in the light of the traffic condition. The school was different from the main-stream schools, for example, the main-stream schools would usually start lessons at 8 a.m. but the school started its lessons at 7:30 a.m. and more extra-curricular activities were arranged so that more students would stay at school after classes. Its off-school hours were different from those of the local schools, which would thus have less impact on traffic. He said he understood the efforts made by the school.

103. **The Hon Starry LEE** said she hoped the EB and the TD would fully realise the situation and pointed out that not just the assessments by the education organisations, but many other TIAs also under-estimated the actual traffic flow. Thus, she viewed that the relevant departments had failed to fully realise the congested traffic flow on roads which not only occurred in the school district of Kowloon City but also in the New Territories areas. She requested the representatives of the TD to jot it down and reflect the facts to their Department. If the TD did not look at the problem squarely, residents would have more views and their grievances would aggravate. Also, similar incidents were found in the applications by many new buildings and she hoped TD would improve and review the effectiveness of other TIAs.

104. **Mr Joshua FUNG** reiterated the deficiency of the TD's traffic assessment measures and there were also problems in its system. As there were no assessments in the past, it was hoped that the TD would accept the views that the time for the learner driver activities should be adjusted in response to the before-and-after-school hours to ensure improvement was made to the traffic congestion problem. He also hoped that the survey and options proposed by the school would be implemented and communication would be maintained to report the progress and schedule to the Committee regularly. Also, he requested the Police to enhance enforcement during the above time slots when there were more parents parking their vehicles or other vehicles parking on the pavement.

105. **Mr Pius YUM** was dissatisfied with the reply of the TD, stating that unless there were not many learner drivers during the before-and-after-school hours, or else the learner drivers should be prohibited to drive into the area in order to solve the traffic congestion problem. Also, the TD earlier viewed that there was no need for assessment and trusted the school expert for their views. As such, the TD could only resort to road management now. He said that the learner drivers drove slower than other drivers and the problem brought about by even one learner driver vehicle would

be greater than that of the private cars. If the problem was to be improved, it must be tackled from road management in respect of the learner driver activities.

106. **Mr Alan Erickson of Stamford American School thanked the Chairman and Mr FUNG.** Since the operation of the school, he understood there were traffic problems. Apart from providing a safe environment for its students to go to and leave school, the school would cooperate with the community, DC, the Police and the TD to ensure the safe use of roads by the residents for a win-win situation. The school did not have the slightest intention to inconvenience the residents and would continue to listen to different views to ensure smooth traffic flow for the convenience of all parties.

107. **The Chairman** hoped that the department representatives would follow up the views of Members.

(Post-meeting notes: As a result of the 2019 pandemic, the school resumed face-to-face lessons in late September by stages and half-day school was provided by the school. Findings of the traffic survey conducted by the TD during the normal days at the beginning of December at Man Fuk Road showed that there were 25 learner driver vehicles in one hour during the off-school hours which was about 6% of the total traffic flow. However, as the off-school hours of schools in the district would vary as a result of the control measures against the pandemic (face-to-face lecture was temporarily suspended again recently), the TD thus viewed that a study to assess the appropriateness and feasibility to prohibit learner drivers entering Man Fuk Road during the actual off-school hours should be made after the off-school hours returned to normal. At present, there were not many roads in Kowloon suitable for learning driving and if the learn to drive activities were further prohibited in the district, it would have great impact on the learner drivers and might aggravate the road traffic condition of those roads suitable for learning driving.)

Item 11

Request for Addressing the Problem of Learning to Ride Motorcycles Illegally at King Tak Street and Relocating the King Tak Street Driving Test Route

(Paper No.116/20)

Item 12

Request for Limiting the Number of Learner Driver Vehicles in Ho Man Tin District

(Paper No. 117/20)

108. **Mr Joshua FUNG** introduced Paper No. 116 and No. 117/ 20.

109. **Mr CHO Wui-hung** said that there were repeated discussions by Members of the previous terms about the Ho Man Tin Driving Test Centre including relocating the test centre at King Tak Street and reducing the number of learner drivers taking the test, and there was suggestions by Members that the driving test centre be relocated from Ho Man Tin. However, the TD made no further response after promising to take follow-up actions. He enquired whether there were progress reports on the removal of the driving test centre or the reduction of the number of learner drivers.

110. **The Hon Starry LEE** said that there were current-term Members and Members of the previous terms raising the question on the use of some spots in the district as driving test centres and they had repeatedly asked the TD to respond. In the wake of the occupation of many new buildings, there was conflict between the learner driver vehicles and other vehicles as well as conflicts resulting from learner drivers having to wait for a long time during the learning process which might lead to traffic incidents and that was very unsatisfactory. Thus, it was hoped that the TD would face the issue squarely and respond.

111. **Mr CHAN Chi-fung, Senior Executive Officer / Driving Test 1 of TD,** replied as follows:

- (i) the TD would try its very best to balance the need of traffic in different districts and also the need of the nearby residents and the learner drivers when arranging the driving tests. Regarding the present two centres in Ho Man Tin, the TD made concerted efforts to strike a balance between the demand for the driving tests and minimise the impact on local students;
- (ii) as for the setting of driving test quotas, the TD would adjust the number of driving tests to be taken in the light of the actual needs; and
- (iii) as for the removal of the driving test centres, the TD had been making efforts to find suitable places to relocate the driving test centre to ease the pressure on the centre. However, no suitable

locations were found and the TD would continue with its efforts.

112. **Mr PO Yiu-wa of HKPF** responded to the problem of learning to drive motorcycles in Ho Man Tin District or the King Tak Street area illegally, saying that the Police would resort to the usual three-pronged measures in terms of publicity, education and enforcement:

- (i) as for publicity and education, the Police would communicate with the operators renting motorcycles to learner drivers, asking them to remind learner drivers to note the regulations such as not to learn and practise driving on certain streets and to pay heed to the safety matters. And they were reminded that the complex road conditions of the district might lead to other traffic problems while they were practising driving. Pamphlets would also be distributed to the operators for distribution to learner drivers; and
- (ii) take enforcement actions during the time and at places where learning to drive was not allowed. Apart from enforcement actions taken in Kowloon City Police District, joint actions were also taken with Traffic Kowloon West and the TD's Driving Test Section from time to time. The Police said it would pay attention to the existing problems arising from learning driving in the district.

113. **Miss Jakki MAK** raised the following views/enquiries:

- (i) in its reply, the TD said its test centres were not fully utilised and adjustments would be made to suit the actual situation. However, the TD replied that in 2019 the monthly average driving tests arranged in Pui Ching Road were 782 cases, Chung Yee Street 1 331 cases and Tin Kwong Road 904 cases. She pointed out that observation on the actual traffic condition of Ho Man Tin showed that traffic congestion was caused by the learner drivers and driving test candidates in Chung Yee Street, Fat Kwong Street, Chung Hau Street, etc. Thus it was requested that the number of driving tests should be restricted and reduced; and
- (ii) she pointed out that though no observation was carried out by the Police at that location constantly, 100 fixed tickets were already

issued during its regular actions in 2020. The situation should not be dismissed and she enquired whether TD would take into consideration Members' views.

114. **Mr Pius YUM** enquired the TD about the widening of the area from Tin Kwong Road to Chung Hau Street and Fat Kwong Street in the past 25 years. He said he got the impression that only Sheung Shing Street area near the old Ho Man Tin Estate was turned into a roundabout when the estate was demolished and vehicles entering and leaving Ho Man Tin Estate had to go via Sheung Shing Street, resulting in the increase of traffic flow there. As for the buildings in its major area, Celestial Heights was 11-year-old and there was not much redevelopment in the Sheung Shing Street area. However, the Urban Renewal Authority (URA) would redevelop the buildings in Mei Sin Tung Road in the future and Ho Man Tin Estate and King Man House could basically accommodate the population of the old estate. Together with the population of ONE HOMANTIN, Mantin Heights and Grand Himm and the buildings in Fat Kwong Street and also Cascade and Dragon View, the residential units in the area greatly increased in 25 years' time, resulting in a growth in the population. Even though it was viewed in the past that the area was a good choice for providing a driving test centre, it was no longer the case at present. He requested the relevant departments to keep abreast of the latest development together with local residents and Members.

115. **Mr WONG Wing-kit** raised the following views/enquires:

- (i) the Government announced earlier that the subsidy ceiling of the Continuing Education Fund (CEF) was increased from \$10,000 to \$20,000 and the driving instruction lessons run by the Hong Kong School of Motoring were newly listed. He expected that the number of driving test candidates would surge and enquired the TD about its corresponding measures to control the number of learner drivers in Ho Man Tin area while the number of candidates were on the increase;
- (ii) he conveyed residents' views to the Police, pointing out that traffic flow off Sheung Lok Street Garden was comparatively low and it was quite quiet there. Many learner drivers were found learning and practising driving there after 9:00 p.m. every day. It was hoped that the Police would follow-up the matter.

116. **Mr Joshua FUNG** raised the following views/enquires:

- (i) he understood that the TD was unable to answer the question on the removal of the driving test centre in Ho Man Tin today. However, he pointed out that there were 3 017 cases of learner drivers learning to drive in 2019 i.e. about 100 candidates taking the driving test every day. With the data in hand, the TD was asked to adjust the driving test arrangements to restrict the number of learner drivers in the near future;
- (ii) he enquired about the number of learner drivers exceeding the limit and the criteria for corresponding actions in response to the traffic flow. The TD did not conduct assessments on the traffic flow nor any relevant surveys in an ever changing community. He suggested the TD to reform its assessment system;
- (iii) as the TD stated there were difficulties in removing the driving test centre at King Tak Street, apart from enforcement actions and communication by the Police, the TD was asked to suggest whether there were other specific solutions to ease the traffic congestion problem; and
- (iv) for the sake of promotion and deterrent effects, it was suggested that the Police or the TD should put up banners at King Tak Street or Perth Street Sports Ground to show the fines for illegal learner drivers.

117. **Mr CHAK Ka-lin, Senior Driving Examiner of TD**, responded as follows:

- (i) as for the arrangements for the number of driving test to be taken in Ho Man Tin District, there was impact on the part of the driving test route in Tin Kwong Road caused by road diversion due to the construction of the Shatin to Central Link (SCL). In order to avoid impact on the normal driving test service, arrangements were made for some of the driving tests to be taken in Chung Yee Street. Following the completion of the SCL, the TD would arrange some of the tests taken at Chung Yee Street to be taken at Tin Kwong Road in

the light of the actual situation. Heep Yunn Primary School by the side of Tin Kwong Road finished school at 3:00 p.m. before the pandemic and many parents parked their vehicles at the car park of the driving test centre when ferrying their children to and from school. Thus the TD needed to strike a balance between the number of driving tests to be taken at the two driving test centres in response to the actual situation;

- (ii) as for the problem caused by motorcycles at King Tak Street, apart from the call to the car rental service companies by the Police, letters were also sent to the private driving schools by the TD earlier, asking them to remind learner drivers renting the motorcycles to observe relevant regulations when learning driving. They were particularly reminded that King Tak Street area was a restricted area and no practicing should be done there; and
- (iii) earlier on, the TD found a suitable place at Sheung Lok Street for testing the Figure 8 balance skill but no suitable replacement for the King Tak Street driving test route was found up to now. The TD would make full use of the two locations to triage the driving tests to balance the needs for driving tests and those of the nearby traffic.

118. **Mr PO Yiu-wa of HKPF** responded as follows:

- (i) the Police also noted there were learner drivers practising driving at Sheung Lok Street after 9:00 p.m. as mentioned by Mr WONG Wing-kit. The Police could not summon them while they were practising driving but publicity would be enhanced later. The Police would summon those learner drivers violating the regulations and he noted the views raised by Mr WONG Wing-kit.
- (ii) he noted Mr Joshua FUNG's views about putting up banners bearing warning and publicity wordings in the vicinity of King Tak Street. Communication would be made with the Police Public Relations Branch about the procedures for putting up banners at public places.

119. **Mr Pius YUM** again enquired about the roads that had been widened in the areas around Tin Kwong Road to King Tak Street and Chung Hau Street and Fat

Kwong Street in the past 25 years.

120. **Ms Christine LUK of TD** stated that there was no relevant information at present and would reply later after checking the information.

(Post-meeting note: In order to coordinate with the demands of the different residential developments in the District, such as the redevelopment of Ho Man Tin Estate and the development of nearby residential estates, many traffic improvement measures had been implemented such as corresponding improvement measures, redevelopment and widening (of roads) were taken place in Sheung Lok Street, Sheung Fu Street, Fat Kwong Street etc.

To relieve traffic congestion on the existing east-west road across Central Kowloon, the Government was building the Central Kowloon Route for the provision of a fast alternative route for the east-west traffic across Kowloon. Apart from the Central Kowloon Route, the Kwun Tong Line Extension was already in service extending the Kwun Tong Line from Yau Ma Station to Ho Man Tin Station and Whampoa Station providing convenience for passengers to transfer from Ho Man Tin Station to To Kwa Wan, Kowloon City and Kai Tak via the future Tuen Ma Line which achieved the further improvement of the public transport network in the District. Following the completion of the above major road and railway construction, it was believed that it would improve the traffic condition in Ho Man Tin).

121. **Mr Pius YUM** viewed that the TD was handling the issue about learner driver centres in a different manner. The TD said the to-and-off-school hours of Heep Yunn Primary School would be considered first in a bid to control the number of learner drivers on the roads, thus for the time being, the candidates taking the driving test in Chung Yee Street would not be arranged to drive in Tin Kwong Road. However, the TD said it would not consider the to-and-off-school hours of the international school. He said there was a need to examine the relevant statistics in both cases. The population of the area were on the increase during the past 25 years and the TD was asked to consider whether it was appropriate to arrange a large number of candidates taking driving test in urban areas. Also, the candidates were worried that the many private cars in the area would affect their passing rate. He continued to point out that the problem would in no case be solved if the TD continued to turn a deaf ear to the views and proposals of Members.

122. **Mr CHAK Ka-lin of TD** responded to the question about Stamford

American School, stating that the present driving test route would first go via Man Fuk Road and would not overlap with that in Chung Yee Street. One month before the opening of Stamford American School, he had sent letters to all driving instructor organisations advising their learner drivers not to go via Man Fuk Road from 3:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m. as the school was asked about their off-school hours before. On the day the school was opened, the TD conducted an at-site inspection. As the school might have adjusted its off-school hours, the TD would again call for the driving instruction organisations to advise their learner drivers not to go via Man Fuk Road.

123. **The Chairman** hoped that the relevant departments would follow up the issue raised by Mr YUM and keep the Committee informed of any progress by writing.

Item 13

Concern over the Works Safety of the Central Kowloon Route (Paper No. 118/20)

124. **Mr WONG Wing-kit** introduced Paper No.118/20 and moved a motion seconded by Mr SIU Leong-sing and Mr Joshua FUNG.

125. **Mr LEUNG Cho-ming, Senior Engineer of the Highways Department (HyD)**, said that there were two accidents at the Central Kowloon Route recently. The first one happened on 14 October at night during which an excavator accidentally fell into the shaft while the contractor was performing winching works at a construction site in Ho Man Tin. As the contractor had safely enclosed all winching areas before the works and prohibited other people from entering the winching area, thus nobody was hurt in the accident. After the accident, staff of the Labour Department (LD) had an at-site investigation and issued a “suspension notice” to the contractor suspending all winching works at that construction site. That suspension notice was still valid at present. The other accident happened on 18 October at night. The office of the contractor of the construction site in Ho Man Tin was on fire but the Police and the Fire Services Department initially viewed that there was no doubt about its cause. After the incident, the contractor found that the fire might be caused by electrical appliances inside the office. Repeated meetings in respect of the two accidents were held by the works team to examine the safety management system of the works, particularly the winching procedures and the safe use of electrical appliances to prevent recurrence of similar incidents. In addition, the works team would enhance safety examination to ensure safety at the construction site.

126. **Miss Jakki MAK** enquired whether all other works in the construction site were suspended apart from the winching works. In addition, besides the investigation by the LD, investigation on the incident would be conducted by an independent organisation arranged by the HyD or not, and if so, at what intervals were appliances of the construction sites be checked to ensure proper maintenance and safety.

127. **Mr WONG Wing-kit** enquired whether the findings of the investigation by the LD would be made public. He also enquired whether the internal structure of the shaft where the accident took place was affected and whether the accident would delay the whole project.

128. **Mr CHO Wui-hung** stated that he learnt of the comments by professionals from the social media video and the newspapers showing that the incident might be caused by the incapability and insufficient experience on the part of the operator. Though the exact reasons were still unknown and the investigation report was awaiting, the public might think that it was incredible. The HyD and the contractor should be well-experienced and he viewed that the present incident could have been avoided. He said that the incident might involve insufficient supervision and failure to follow the supervision procedures. Also, the public were concerned whether there were omissions and supervision problems in other aspects of the works. Thus it was hoped that relevant departments would conduct a full and detailed investigation and make public its findings so that the public would regain their confidence.

129. **Mr LEUNG Cho-ming of HyD** replied as follows:

- (i) as for the investigation, it was now being undertaken by the LD to find out the cause of the accident. The HyD would keep close contact with the LD and Members would be informed when further news were available;
- (ii) The HyD had been paying close attention to construction site safety and was very concerned about the present accident. Thus, it would prudently examine the safety management system of the whole construction site with the consulting company and the contractor, particularly winching safety in order to avoid the recurrence of similar incident. As for the winching equipment, they would be checked once a month;

- (iii) the works team had initially examined the internal structure of the shaft and viewed that it was generally safe. Detailed examination would be conducted after the LD had approved resumption of work by the contractor;
- (iv) the Department was now assessing the impact on the whole project by the suspension notice and different measures would be implemented when the situation required to ensure the works would be completed in time;
- (v) the Department understood that Members and the public might be worried after seeing the video online. Thus, apart from the winching process, the works team would again review the safety management system and management measures of the construction site where the incident was involved so as to avoid the recurrence of similar incidents; and
- (vi) the Department had urged the consulting company to tighten supervision on the safety performance of the contractor, requiring him to strictly implement the safety management system and various safety measures to ensure safety throughout the course of works.

130. **Miss Jakki MAK** stated that both the HyD and the contractor should enhance the safety awareness of their staff and provide training to them. She stressed that the online video showed that when the excavator accident happened, the staff immediately rushed to the scene to see what had happened and that was inappropriate. The video showed that the winching chain swung back because of the centripetal force and that would lead to injuries or death. Thus relevant departments were reminded to provide safety training to staff, to review whether the then decision was wrong and remind staff the importance of safety.

131. **Mr LEUNG Cho-ming of HyD**, thanked Miss Jakki MAK for her reminder and said that he totally agreed with her the importance of staff safety. Training to enhance workers' safety awareness was provided by the Department after the incident.

132. **The Chairman** put the following motion to a vote: "Our Committee requested the Government to appoint an independent organisation to investigate the

causes of the chain-accident at the Central Kowloon Route and inform the public of the investigation findings. Also, the Government and the contractor should take all possible measures to protect the safety of workers to avoid the recurrence of similar incidents” and the results of the voting were as follows:

Agree	: 12 votes	(Mr Joshua FUNG, Mr WONG Wing-kit, Mr LAI Kwong-wai, Miss CHAU Hei-man, Mr KWOK Tin-lap, Mr Pius YUM, Miss Jakki MAK, Mr Daniel WONG, Mr TSANG Kin-chiu, Mr MA Hei-pang, Dr KWONG Po-yin and Mr LEE Hin-long)
Object	: 0 vote	
Abstention	: 5 votes	(Mr LAM Tak-shing, Mr PUN Kwok-wah, Mr NG Po-keung, Mr CHO Wui-hung and Mr CHEUNG King-fan)

133. **The Chairman** said that motion was adopted.

Item 14

The Special Scheme under the Universal Accessibility Programme (Paper No. 119/20)

134. **Mr CHOCK Chi-tung, Senior Engineer of HyD**, stated that at the last TTC meeting, it was agreed that the HyD could conduct a preliminary survey on the pedestrian subway of Oi Ma Estate. The survey findings were reported at this meeting and discussion on the way forward would also be held.

135. **Mr LEUNG Lap-yin, Engineer of HyD** introduced Paper No. 119/20, stressing that as there were a few steps near Tun Man House, the HyD suggested to convert them into a ramp. As the previous discussion with the Housing Department (HD) was only on the provision of a lift, thus details of the conversion needed to be discussed. It was hoped that Members would choose the pedestrian subway OM01 listed in the Appendix as a priority project under the Special Scheme.

136. **Miss Jakki MAK** agreed to the above works as it enhanced accessibility of the Oi Man Estate residents. The option needed to be accepted by the HD before investigation works could be carried out by the HyD. She enquired about the time needed for the works and the site needed to be enclosed and its impact. In addition,

that pedestrian subway was the only way for the residents of Oi Man Lower Estate to Oi Man Upper Estate and the plaza. She pointed out that the investigation works should provide details about its nearby areas including whether there were public utilities, water pipes or other facilities, or else, there would be a delay and other derivative problems.

137. **Mr CHO Wui-hung** supported the project and raise the following views/enquires:

- (i) the HyD showed in Table 1 of its paper that no proposal on the construction of a lift was received but he suggested to the housing manager of the estate to build a lift in the estate and had conducted an at-site inspection. He asked whether the HyD had got the information from the HD;
- (ii) there was a Bombax Ceiba Tree (Cotton Tree) near the lift of Tun Man House. If a lift was built at that proposed location, it might affect the roots of the tree. He asked whether the tree would be removed or the works might be carried out away from that location; and
- (iii) there was a taxi stand in front of the lift near the safety island. If the TD considered narrowing the road surface, it should consider its impact on the vehicular access.

138. **Mr CHOCK Chi-tung of HyD** responded as follows:

- (i) previous experience in carrying out works in the urban area showed that it usually involved diversion of underground pipes. The works would take about three years to complete and the actual works period could be confirmed after the investigation;
- (ii) as for the suggestions from the public, the paper set out the information received by the HyD which did not cover the information held by the HD. The Department would take note of it; and

- (iii) as for whether part of the pedestrian subway needed to be narrowed, whether there was provisional diversion of the road traffic or effects
- (iv) on the nearby trees during the works, since the works were only at its preliminary stage, the Department would appoint a consultancy for detailed investigation if Members chose the pedestrian subway OM01 as a priority project under the Special Scheme. The detailed investigation would cover impacts on existing traffic and the nearby trees and later the proposals together with a drafted plan of the lift would be submitted to the TTC for consultation.

139. **Mr CHO Wui-hung** supplemented that Chung Man House was facing west and if the trees were removed, the lift might be affected by the sun in the west. Thus its design and materials, such as the strong heat from the sun in the west and the heat-resistant strength should be taken into consideration. A few lifts in the area were facing similar situation.

140. **Mr Pius YUM** enquired whether there would be air-conditioning inside the lifts installed under the Universal Accessibility Programme. If yes, the problem caused by the heat of the sun in the west could be addressed and he suggested using tinted glasses. In addition, he requested the Department to give a definite reply on whether the provision of air-conditioning in the lifts under the Universal Accessibility Programme was a standard design as there was air-conditioning in the lifts installed in Whampoa Street, Whampoa Garden and other places in Hung Hom.

141. **Mr CHOCK Chi-tung of HyD** responded that in the detailed design stage of the lift, consideration would be given to its sitting direction, the direction of the sun, shelters in its vicinity, the use of concrete or glasses as heat-resistant materials, etc. As for the lifts under the Universal Accessibility Programme, starting from mid-2013, under the policy of environmental protection, energy-saving and carbon emission reduction, the HyD adopted the mechanical ventilation system as the design standard to replace the previous air-conditioning system design.

142. **The Chairman** said the TTC agreed to the implementation of the OM01 project unanimously.

Item 15**Construction of a Canopy above the Pedestrian Walkways at Hong Kong Eye Hospital and Hong Kong Children's Hospital
(Paper No. 120/20)**

143. **Ms Inness CHAN, Engineer 9 / Walkability of TD**, introduced Paper No. 120/20.

144. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** raised the following views/enquiries:

- (i) at present, there were shade structure with seats and a bus stop outside the Hong Kong Eye Hospital (HKEH) with a heavy flow of people there before and after office hours. Thus, it was enquired whether the works would reduce the area of that location and what arrangements would be made for the people waiting for buses there;
- (ii) people would usually go to the HKEH by ground transportation. He wondered if the people flow statistics only counted the people queuing up for buses or just the people walking on the pavement; and
- (iii) the road section was a suitable choice or not and its actual effectiveness.

145. **Mr Ricky TANG, Senior Engineer / Walkability 4 of TD** responded as follows:

- (i) it was hoped that as a response to the 2019 Policy Address, improvements would be made to the walking environment from the entrance/exit of the HKEH to the nearby traffic spots for visitors and staff of the hospital. Thus the works were implemented based on the policy instead of the flow of people but the views of the Hospital Authority (HA) would be considered. The staff and visitors needed to go via that road section to and from the hospital and the bus stops and that cover was thus built;
- (ii) as for the impact on the people waiting for the buses during the course of construction , he hoped to have Members' views about its

route at the initial stage. The discussion with the HyD on the flow of people or those waiting for the buses would be held at the design stage to explore the temporary arrangements and reports would be submitted to the Committee as appropriate; and

- (iii) as for the demolition of the bus stops, Members' views about the route were noted at the present initial stage. The TD was glad to communicate with the bus companies to fine-tune the condition of the pavement to improve its environment for the provision of a better walking environment for both the people waiting for the buses and pedestrians.

146. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** showed dissatisfaction on the building of a cover over that road section. She pointed out that there were already two shade structures with seats and two covered bus stops adjacent to each other at the construction location. The above four shade structures were located at the staircase and slope off the entrance/exit of the hospital. Some of the facilities needed to be demolished if the proposed works were to be carried out. She said that it was not inappropriate to suggest improvements to the environment in the Policy Address. There was no logic in carrying out relevant works and re-building part of the facilities after demolition as this caused a waste of public money. She enquired about the reasons for identifying a location with shade structures for the works and whether the public money was used properly in such case.

147. **Mr Pius YUM** declared interests, saying that he had repeated operations on his eye and medication was frequently applied for pupillary dilation after which light should be avoided for a short period of time. The HKEH would always perform pupillary dilation on its patients and for the above reasons he supported relevant works. He hoped the HKEH would consider building a cover at the staircase section as it was the main entrance/exit of the hospital. It was hoped that the HKEH would take into consideration the above situation and keep its facilities such as the seats, etc. to benefit the public.

148. **Miss CHAU Hei-man** stated that the intention to provide a cover over the pavement was good. However, the public and Members found that the building of a cover over Hung Hom Road where there were bus stops and seats on the passageway was not a good decision. The road section of outside the HKEH was not wide and if it was narrowed as a result of the works, it could be foreseen that the elderly and

people in need would be inconvenienced. Though the guideline provided that the road should be at least 1.5-metre wide during construction, it was worried that the narrow passageway would impact the road users when there were many people getting on and alighting from buses at the nearby bus stops during the before-and-after office hours.

149. **Mr Ricky TANG of TD** responded as follows:

- (i) he understood that there were bus stops, minibus stops and seats at that location. The area under the present bus stop cover was relatively narrow and might not be able to shelter passengers from the rain. For the provision of a better walking environment, it was hoped that the works of the new cover would integrate with the existing facilities to cover the whole pavement so as to take care of the public transport commuters as well as the people going to and from the hospital;
- (ii) he understood that the existing facilities beneficial to the public should be maintained including seats and the bus arrival information display panels. Thus, coordination would be made with the relevant people including the bus company personnel with a view to maintaining the existing facilities for the convenience of the mobility-handicapped and wheelchair users particularly; and
- (iii) as for the cover for the staircase, that staircase was within the premises of the HA and the Department was willing to forward relevant views to the HA for follow-up actions and consideration.

150. **Mr David CHAN, Senior Engineer 5 / Special Duties** responded to the traffic arrangements and the inconvenience caused to pedestrians during construction. Generally when improvement works were carried out on the pavement, the contractor would make temporary traffic arrangements which had to be approved by relevant departments such as the TD and the Police to minimise impact on the public.

151. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** was not satisfied with the relevant replies, saying that according to the experience in Hung Hom Estate, the bus stop was still there and only the cover of the pavement was separated. The shade structures in front and behind were funded by DC's District Minor Works Programme. After integration, they were

still separated and no difference was identified. She said the current situation was that no coordination was made despite repeated works and the location was facing west. She enquired the way to order the demolition of that bus stop by the bus company and whether the works had to be paid by the funds under the Policy Address. She pointed out that minor works could also include repairs and refurbishment.

152. **Mr Ricky TANG of TD** noted Members' views. He pointed out that the plan was now at the initial stage and no integration with the surrounding environment was further discussed with the bus company. He hoped that the pavement could be improved to provide a pleasant environment to pedestrians and the people waiting for the bus. The Committee would be informed when further information and design were available. It did not have to wait till the works were carried out.

153. **Mr Pius YUM** stated that relevant departments should conscientiously listen to Members' views and enquiries. He opined that the replied by relevant department just now did not answer the questions raised by Dr KWONG. He then pointed out that the public information disclosed showed that there was a cover at the above location. If actions were taken by simply following the order under the unpractical Policy Address prepared by the Chief Executive without making any actual observation, the questions raised by Dr KWONG would in no way be realised. He then asked relevant departments to coordinate with the bus company to remove the bus stop cover when the works were being carried out in order to minimise impact on the people waiting for buses. Because of the sitting direction of that location, it was facing the sun in the west. If the existing cover was retained, the public would have to stand closer to each other and near the road before they were covered by the shade structure. When there were buses approaching the stop, people waiting for buses might collide with pedestrians. In addition, if the relevant departments just followed the unpractical order from the Chief Executive, his question on whether a cover could be built above the 11 steps off the HKEH would not be referred to the HA by the TD. He asked relevant departments to conscientiously forward the views and pointed out that if there were patients having pupillary dilation, the ensuring impact might be very serious. He stated that a cover should be built above those 11 steps in order to protect the HKEH users.

154. **Mr Daniel WONG** stated he agreed to the suggestions in principle. He had used that road section several times and found that it was quite quiet there as there was the HKEH on one side and then the Kowloon City Magistrates' Courts which processed criminal cases was a little bit foreword. During day time, most of the

people waiting for the buses were from the magistrates' courts, a relatively comfortable environment would be provided if the cover could be extended to the Kowloon City Magistrates' Courts. As for the question on the west direction and discussion with the bus companies, he viewed that the expected scale of the works might not be covered by the District Minor Works Programme. He said that during the application under the District Minor Works Programme, many questions might emerge such as many of the underground cables might not be handled. If the project was implemented, the only design and technical problem that merited discussion would be the coordination to be made during construction in order to keep the existing seats of the bus stop. If the works were implemented, people from the HKEH and the magistrates' courts would be happy. He said that he had discussed the problem with Mr TSANG Kin-chiu and Mr TSANG supported the project in principle.

155. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** said she was not opposed to the Universal Accessibility Programme.

(Post-meeting notes: It was a pedestrian cover project involving location and site selection. She asked about the feasibility to move forward or set back the cover. In addition, she asked whether the need for the relevant facilities at the entrance of the HKEH was because the Policy Address required that improvements be made on the road to the hospital. Discussion might be held with the HKEH for a location without any cover in front or behind the proposed location but not one with shade structures.)

156. **Mr Ricky TANG of TD** said he had communication with the HA to study whether both sides of the initial route under the present proposal could be extended to Kowloon City Magistrates' Courts or HA in the west. However, as the TD found that the existing pavement was relatively narrow, there would be impact on people flow if the works of the cover was to be extended. Also, the present traffic flow at Argyle Street did not allow the widening of pavement by narrowing the traffic lanes of Argyle Street. After communication with the HA, the initial feasible location of the pedestrian cover was the one introduced in the papers. It was the proposal that improvement might be made after consultation between the TD and the HA. He said that views of Members were noted and would be considered during the further design process including consideration to maintain the existing seating for the convenience of the public. As for the possibility to add a cover above the steps, the TD would positively take follow-up actions with the HA.

157. **The Chairman** hoped that the two departments, after listening to Members'

views, would report any follow-up actions to be taken to the Committee.

Item 16

Request for Revealing the Schedule of Lift Construction Works at Dyer Avenue Flyover on Hung Hom Road

(Paper No. 121/20)

158. **Mr KWOK Tin-lap** introduced Paper No.121/20 and said he would monitor its progress with Miss CHAU Hei-man, hoping that the impact on residents by the works would be minimised. The works were to facilitate the residents to and from Exit A of Whampoa Station in the long run after its completion.

159. **The Chairman** instructed the Secretariat to forward Mr KWOK's views to the Works Management Group under the "Universal Accessibility Programme" of the HyD.

Item 17

Request for Improving the Lift Failure Problem at the Footbridge Connecting Chatham Road North and Wuhu Street

(Paper No. 122/20)

160. **Mr LAM Tak-shing** introduced Paper No. 122/20.

161. **Mr LO Fu-yin, Engineer / Transport Services 1/6 of Electrical & Mechanical Department (EMSD)** stated that earlier among the three lifts in Wuhu Street, the service of No. 2 Lift in the middle was suspended for a longer period of time because its faulty main parts needed replacement. The Department had asked the contractor to purchase the parts and the contractor, in order to expedite the process, was willing to shift the parts from other projects. Repairs were completed on 3 November and its service was back to normal. At present the three lifts were in use by the public.

162. **Miss CHAU Hei-man** enquired about the reasons for the faulty parts as those three lifts had not been in service for not long time but their three cables were rarely in normal operation at the same time. Some residents opined that the fault was not due to long time operation or ageing of the parts. The lift on the ground floor of the DC was damaged by rain and she enquired whether the reasons for the damage could be identified.

163. **Mr LAM Tak-shing** reminded the relevant departments to thoroughly check the parts or components after this meeting and to make proper acquisition preparation before the emergence of the problems. He also hoped that regular inspection and maintenance would be undertaken by relevant departments after the meeting to ensure the smooth operation of the escalators.

164. **Mr LO Fu-yin of EMSD** responded on the reasons for the damage. It was caused by water dripping from the ceiling and some parts got wet all the time. They had communication with the HyD and the ceiling was repaired on 12 October by the HyD. At the same time the EMSD also urged the contractor to purchase the parts in order to resume operation as soon as possible. The EMSD would also carry out inspection once a week on every Wednesday to ensure efficient operation of the lifts under regular maintenance in order to reduce inconvenience caused to the residents to the minimum.

165. **Mr Pius YUM** enquired about the schedule and interval for the maintenance by the contractor and whether a notice on it would be put up. If it was found that longer time was needed for the acquisition of some parts, the public should be informed, for example, by putting up notice to explain the situation to the public.

166. **Mr LO Fu-yin of EMSD** replied that regular inspection on the escalators would be conducted every Wednesday at around 2:00 p.m. The inspection would last for about 2 hours and the three lifts would be separately inspected to ensure there were two lifts operating at the same time. The contractor was told to disseminate clearer and more transparent information.

Item 18

Request for Improving the Traffic Congestion at Nga Tsin Wai Road and the Occupation of Meter Parking Spaces by Goods As Soon As Possible (Paper No. 123/20)

167. **Mr NG Po-keung** introduced Paper No. 123/20.

168. **Mr TANG Yiu-hang, Chief Health Inspector (Kowloon City) of Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD)** said that the duty of the FEHD was to maintain environmental hygiene including cleaning streets and taking special actions would be taken when necessary. Shops stocking up goods on the pavement

would be prosecuted if they obstructed street cleaning. From January to October this year, a total of 22 prosecutions were instituted.

169. **Mr PO Yiu-wa of HKPF** responded that the Special Duty Traffic Squad set up at the beginning of September mainly aimed at street management and communication would also be made with the colleagues of the Cleansing Section of the FEHD as well for taking joint actions from time to time. They would not only remove the miscellaneous articles placed on pavements but also the foam boxes, plastic boxes, wood planks and carton planks on roads, which would pose potential danger to pedestrians. The Police took relevant actions in Nga Tsin Wai Road yesterday during which almost all miscellaneous articles placed on the streets were cleared. Starting from the beginning of September the “Regular Action Plan” would be undertaken in Nga Tsin Wai Road and Hau Wong Road for traffic control at specified peak hours. Also, to conduct actions would be taken to ease the traffic flow and for road diversion in places and at hours when there was congestion or potential danger to pedestrians and the results were satisfactory. The possibility of taking relevant actions on other streets in the district would not be ruled out.

170. **Mr NG Po-keung** raised the following enquiries:

- (i) as there were only individual shops occupying the metred parking spaces, he asked if the FEHD would take similar actions and impose fines if the same shop committed the offence repeatedly. From January to October this year, the FEHD only instituted 22 prosecutions. If only a few prosecutions were instituted against the same shop and the fine was low, the deterrent effect would be nominal; and
- (ii) he enquired about the prosecution figures by the Police at Nga Tsin Wai Road.

171. **Mr Pius YUM** reminded the Police to bear in mind the importance for enforcement actions at the black spots in Ming On Street in Hung Hom.

172. **Mr TANG Yiu-hang of FEHD** replied as follows:

- (i) the fixed penalty was \$1 500;

- (ii) for deterrent effects, when the Department found that miscellaneous articles were placed on roads, prosecution would be instituted; and
- (iii) summons would be served on the unlicensed hawkers who were required to appear in court where fines would be ordered by the judge depending on the circumstances.

173. **Mr PO Yiu-wa of HKPF** replied as follows:

- (i) no prosecution statistics were available at present. It was difficult to find the owners of the miscellaneous articles placed on roads and thus no prosecution could be instituted against them. Thus, only removal actions could be taken every time; and
- (ii) the police took two relevant actions at Ming On Street and the results were satisfactory. Relevant actions would be taken in Kowloon City, Ming On Street, Hung Hom, Sheung Heung Road and Ha Heung Road.

174. **Mr NG Po-keung** thanked the Police and the FEHD for taking the joint action yesterday. That location was a black spot and complaints from the residents were always received. It was hoped that the two departments would list that location as a black spot and pay continued attention to illegal parking there.

Item 19

Strong Request for Strengthening Law Enforcement at Traffic Black Spots in Hung Hom Old District and Establishing No Parking Zones on the Road Surface

(Paper No. 124/20)

Item 20

Call for Proper Handling of Problems Related to Traffic Black Spots at the Junction of Ma Tau Wai Road and Man Yue Street (near the down Slope Side of Fat Kwong Street in Hung Hom)

(Paper No. 125/20)

175. **Mr LAM Tak-shing** introduced Paper No. 124/20.

176. **Mr KWOK Tin-lap** introduced Paper No. 125/20.

177. **Mr PO Yiu-wa of HKPF** replied as follows:

- (i) regarding Hung Hom Old District, it was incorporated into the trial spot under the “Regular Action Plan”. Meetings were conducted with people causing traffic congestion including operators of the funeral industry and recycling industry, drawing their attention to the problem and exploring improvement plans which were now in progress. Illegal parking and deposition of miscellaneous articles on roads would be handled in the same way; and
- (ii) regarding the situation at the junction of Ma Tau Wai Road and Man Yue Street, response to it was made in Paper No. 21 at the meeting. After the incident, prosecution actions and publicity work were proceeded at that location by Kowloon City District Traffic Team and Hung Hom Division from time to time. Also external resources including the Hong Kong Road Safety Patrol of Kowloon West Regional Headquarters would continue to conduct publicity and take enforcement actions at that location. An analysis on the traffic accident black spots in the district was made by the Police and it was found that most of the accidents involved senior pedestrians. He hoped that external resources including the Road Safety Patrol and Members would assist with the publicity work.

178. **Mr MACK Ting-kai of TD** responded as follows:

- (i) he showed concern over illegal parking in Hung Hom Old District particularly at locations causing obstruction to pedestrians crossing the roads and blocking their views. TD was planning to mark no-stopping restriction zones around the clock at some pedestrian crossings in Hung Hom Old District including Baker Street near Chatham Road North, the junction of Winslow Street and Lo Lung Hang Road and also Bulkeley Street and Kun Yam Street. Also a district consultation was conducted earlier and if the findings were positive, relevant arrangements would be arranged as soon as possible. During the consultation, there were some opposition views and communication was being made with the objectors in a bid to convince them to support the option. He hoped that the no-stopping

restriction zones would be marked as soon as possible so as to minimise the effect on traffic safety caused by illegal parking; and

- (ii) he showed concern about the traffic accident at Fat Kwong Street and would conduct a survey in response to the investigation findings by the Police for considering implementation of appropriate traffic measures. After the accident, the Department immediately checked the traffic condition at that junction including vehicle flow there, change of lane by vehicles and the pedestrian crossing facilities. Drivers and pedestrians were reminded of the complex condition at that junction where there were many vehicles as well as many vehicles changing lanes. The Department was now studying the addition of traffic signs there as short-term measures to remind pedestrians and drivers that there might be similar incidents from time to time at that location. The relevant work required was in progress and Mr KWOK Tin-lap would be informed of the follow-up actions if any.

179. **Mr LAM Tak-shing** said that the matter had been repeatedly mentioned in the paper but still no improvement was seen. He thanked the relevant departments for their efforts but viewed that these were not adequate. He viewed that yellow lines, double yellow lines or a restriction zone should be painted at the bend. As residents had repeatedly reflected that problem and thus it was hoped that discussion on it should continue for the relevant departments to make elaborations.

180. **The Chairman** said that the agenda would be included into the Matters Arising of the next meeting.

Item 21

Follow-ups for the Application for Space Allocation for a Temporary Car Park at Lot No.1B3 in Muk On Street (Paper No. 126/20)

181. **Mr CHEUNG King-fan** introduced Paper No. 126/20.

182. **Mr Edmond YIU, Senior Estate Surveyor / South East Kowloon (District Lands Office, Kowloon East) of Lands Department (LandsD)**, said that a total of 6 objection letters were received. Coordination was now being made and replies from

relevant departments on the feasibility of a temporary car park were pending. At present, no decision was reached yet. A reply on the feasibility of the temporary car park would be provided to **Mr CHEUNG** when the relevant departments had reached a consensus.

183. **Mr CHEUNG King-fan** said that the car park did not necessarily had to be built at Lot No. 1B3. Residents' views should not be neglected as there was serious illegal parking problem in the district because of the lack of a temporary car park. He asked whether the LandsD would coordinate after the consultation. If not, study could be made for a temporary car park in other areas in the district. Also, there were motorcycles and bicycles parking illegally at the back lane of Tin Chai Lane and Ko Fei Lane. There were even motorcycles plying on the inner streets, reflecting the serious shortage of motorcycle parking spaces. He noticed that actions targeted at the motorcycles illegally parked in the district were taken by the LandsD by serving clearance notices on them. It was hoped that the Department would conscientiously explore ways to provide a temporary car park in other places in the district.

184. **Mr Edmond YIU of LandsD** said that the Department had regularly inspected the land in the district which was left vacant with no long-term development to see whether it was suitable for use as a temporary car park in order to ease the parking problem. However, as land suitable for that purpose was lacking in Kai Tak, there was no place suitable for use as a temporary car park. If suitable places were identified, priority consideration would be made by the Department and discussion would be held with the TD on the feasibility for temporary car park use.

185. **Mr CHEUNG King-fan** said he received consultation on the use of Lot No. 1J3 recently but residents objected to the development plan. That site was left vacant as there was no timetable for its development into a purpose-built complex. It was hoped that the LandsD would consider turning the site into a temporary car park. °

186. **Mr Edmond YIU of LandsD** said study on the use of Lot No. 1J3 by different departments could be made to see whether that piece of land would be surrendered. Coordination to tie in with its long-term development would be made when considering its feasibility for being used as a temporary car park.

187. **Mr Pius YUM** enquired about the vacant or public land in the district and its use for Members to have a better understanding of the situation.

188. **Mr Edmond YIU of LandsD** said he could provide information on the vacant and public land but their land use development timetable had to be provided by other departments. Most of the land in Kai Tak Development Area was for infrastructural use by the Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) and their long-term development timetable needed to be enquired with individual departments or their reply was awaiting.

189. **Miss CHAU Hei-man** stated she noted the Department would have studies on the land that would not be used for the time being and enquired about the timetable for the reply. She also pointed out that everyone hoped that places would be provided to accommodate the vehicles illegally park on streets. Many people going into Kai Tak would notice the large number of vehicles there including private cars, minibuses, taxis, etc. Whenever there were Members requesting for studies on the problem in their papers, the departments concerned would just reply that the studies were underway. Thus, the departments were requested to provide a definite reply on the timetable and the factors under consideration.

190. **Mr Edmond YIU of LandsD** said in his reply that taking Lot No. 1J3 as an example, it was now for temporary use by different departments and part of the lot was used as storage areas. As for the comments by Members that the use should not be renewed after its expiry, the Department would discuss with them the difficulties they might encounter when removing goods. The Department would inspect the progress of relevant works before the expiry of the use in general. If no renewal would be made with all those departments, all of them were required to vacate the land instantly. Many problems would then emerge in the absence of any alternative land for use including discontinuation of the works in progress and compensation claimed by contractors. The Department needed to consult the relevant departments and further information about this would be provided later. Repeated consultation might be need if they encountered difficulties.

191. **Mr Pius YUM** hoped the HyD and the relevant departments would communicate with the manager of the construction sites to remind them that the vehicles concerned should be parked inside the site. There were a few public and private housing estates in the district where children on the roads during to-and-off-school hours and the dumpers were so high that they might block children's vision and pose danger to residents. He hoped that the HyD would advise the relevant departments to park their vehicles inside the construction sites.

192. **Mr LAI Kwong-wai** pointed out that Paper No. 5 at the meeting showed there were 6 objection letters. He asked about the total number received and whether there views showing support or other suggestions or opinions. It was hoped that the Department would give details.

193. **Mr Edmond YIU of LandsD** said no information was available at the present meeting. Yet he could recall that 19 consultations were conducted. Some did not respond and some showed support. The Department's top priority was to handle the objection views as nearby residents would be affected by the temporary use and thus their views merited priority treatment when concluding the feasibility of the suggestions.

194. **Mr KWOK Tin-lap** said that taking Hok Yuen Laguna District as an example, illegal parking was very serious there and it was hoped that more parking spaces would be provided. He said he had an inspection in Shing Kai Road and Muk On Street and found that there were serious illegal parking problems on some of the roads in Kai Tak. He felt surprised about the ways the consultations were conducted by the Department in which only emphasis was placed on the strong objection views. Though there were lots of supporting views, the Department would not consider them and the interest of all the residents. It was hoped that the Department would deal with the present situation seriously.

195. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** said the TD's consultation also had similar problem. If there was illegal parking when unloading goods, that would constitute a reason not to carry out the works. She said consultation had its inherent deficiency and hoped that the system could be improved. She pointed out that of course every objection view on noise nuisance, environment, congestion, etc. should be taken into consideration but the supporting views and other opinions also merited consideration. She requested to continue discussion on the agenda for relevant departments to account for the progress.

196. **The Chairman** stated he agreed to include the remaining discussions on the agenda into Matters Arising of the next meeting.

197. **Mr Pius YUM** said he had reservations on the inclusion of the agenda into Matters Arising and hoped that the Department would provide a reply to the Committee when further information was available.

198. **The Chairman** said if there was further information, the relevant departments could provide a reply to the Secretariat for passing on to Members.

Item 22

Proposal of Constructing a Lift and a Pedestrian Walkway between Sheung Lok Street Garden and the New Wing of Ko Shan Theatre in Ho Man Tin (Paper No. 127/20)

199. **Mr WONG wing-kit** introduced Paper No. 127/20.

200. **The Chairman** said that the agenda item was related to the purview of Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) and viewed that elaboration should be provided by the LCSD. He was disappointed that there was no reply from the LCSD.

201. **The Secretary** said she had asked the LCSD about the reply to the paper but was told by the LCSD that it was mainly responsible for venue management and the installation of a lift was within the jurisdiction of the party from which approval was given. Thus, there was no reply for the time being. There was also no reply from Ko Shan Theatre. As the service there was not provided within the LCSD building and a reply would only be given after the TD implemented the proposal.

202. **The Chairman** said that apart from the proposal in respect of Ho Man Tin District, Members of To Kwa Wan District also received such a proposal. He enquired whether the TD would consider studying the proposal.

203. **Mr MACK Ting-kai of TD** stated that according to the proposal, it was a hillside lift. The work done by the TD was laid out in Paper No. 15. At present, the TD focused its resources on the 114 proposals received from 2009 to 2017 and the proposal concerned was a new proposal apart from the 114 proposals. New studies on that new proposal were arranged by the TD in December 2017. Thus, the TD was now concentrating its resources in handling the 114 old proposals while the new proposal would be considered after the 114 old proposals were screened. The TD took note of the proposal.

204. **Mr Wong Wing-kit** enquired as follows:

- (i) the TD and the LCSD were to be responsible for the relevant

proposal. Yet he asked if a third department was involved;

- (ii) in the reply made in Paper No. 15 at the meeting, it was said the new proposal was not within the 114 hillside elevator systems and efforts would be focused on the implementation of the current plans. He enquired about the timetable for the assessment and follow-up actions of the new proposal after its commencement and whether assessment by different stakeholders of the District would be allowed;
- (iii) among the 114 hillside elevator systems, he enquired about the number in Kowloon City District and also the figure of those in progress or those yet to commence;
- (iv) while studying the criteria set by the Department, it was found that there would be some deletions. He enquired if there was sufficient space for carrying out the proposal, whether there were similar facilities within 300 metres where the lift was to be constructed, if the construction of the hillside elevator system would involve insurmountable difficulties or technicality, and whether the heritage and precious trees nearby would be affected; and
- (v) during the vetting process, the TD would mainly consider two aspects, i.e. social-effectiveness and cost-effectiveness. Priority would be accorded to the one that scored higher rating. He asked if the works were to be carried out within 4 to 6 years, re-assessment would be made again in response to the updated population, policy or different needs to meet the demands or not.

205. **Mr MACK Ting-kai of TD** responded as follows:

- (i) screening for the construction of the hillside elevator system was mainly done by the TD and it would cooperate with other engineering departments after its implementation. At present, there was no information on whether a third department would participate and supplementary information would be provided to Members later;
- (ii) a consultancy study was taken forward by the TD in December 2017 as the 2009 old assessment system needed to be revised and a report

was made to the Hillside Elevator System Group of Legislative Council Panel on Transport in November 2019. The new mechanism won the support of all members at that meeting. At the present stage, initial technical assessment and planning of routes of the hillside elevator systems were carried out according to the new mechanism and thus no timetable could be provided at present. The views received by the TD were territory-wide but not district-based and the 114 proposals covered all districts of the territory and each proposal would be screened in accordance with the assessment mechanism.

- (iii) there were two proposals involving construction in Kowloon City District including the one in Dyer Street near Wing Wing Building and its initial route was from Man Tai Street to Dyer Street near Wing Wing Building and the second one was to link up with Fat Kwong Street Footbridge to Man Yue Street Staircase. The two projects were now being vetted and the result would be released after the completion of the whole process;
- (iv) independent rating under the screening criteria would be done according to the social-effectiveness and cost-effectiveness. Those criteria would be definitely beneficial to the public, well-recognised and cost-effective. The potential technical and regional difficulties or even the existence of heritage and trees might affect the screening. If difficulties or technical problems or similar situation emerged during the screening process, an in-depth study or screening might be required; and
- (v) as for whether re-assessment was required when the project was unsuccessful and there were changes in the environment after a few years, he stated that at present no similar case was spotted and no information was available. Supplementary details would be provided to Members after communication with his colleagues.

206. **Mr Pius YUM** enquired the Department about the screening direction in respect of the two projects of Kowloon City District and whether one would be chosen or both would be proceeded but with different progress only.

207. **Mr MACK Ting-kai of TD** stated that the two projects were included in the

114 projects. During the rating and screening process, all the rating criteria including regional constraint, difficulties, cost and social-effectiveness would carry weight and there would be no choice between the two as mentioned by Members. He stressed that the final choice would depend on the ratings.

Item 23

Publicity Programme on Road and Cycling Safety in Kowloon City District (Paper No. 128/20)

208. **Miss Charmaine LEE, Executive Officer (EO) 1 of Kowloon City District Office (KCDO)**, introduced Paper No.128/20.

209. **The Chairman** said that details of the activity were adopted at the last meeting at which the original publicity programme on the Road Safety in Kowloon City District was amended to include cycling safety. As some of the takeaway cyclists did not understand and could not read Chinese, it was stipulated in the publicity materials and videos that the commonly-used foreign languages should be included. Public activities under the Programme would be conducted including group activities for the takeaway cyclists to enhance their awareness on cycling safety and publicity materials and souvenirs would be handed out to publicise road safety and to provide information for cyclist road users.

210. **Mr Pius YUM** said Members were very supportive to the funding and a video on cyclists cycling on the covered passageway of Hung Hom Station was received. Members reflected relevant topic and public's views on that at the meetings in May and June. He also pointed out that members of other district councils reflected that after the paper was passed, no letters were issued by the District Office (DO). He thus asked the DO when letters would be sent to consult relevant organisations to see whether they were interested in the publicity activities to promote road and cycling safety in the District.

211. **The Chairman** stated that the responsibility of the Secretariat was to send out invitation letters to relevant organisations but it needed to act under the DO's instructions. Thus, he asked the Secretariat to provide a reply on the situation after the proposal was adopted and enquired the DO about its views on the Programme and whether it would hinder or shelf the relevant activities. If no, whether invitation letters would be sent out and activities would be promoted according to established procedures.

212. **Miss Charmaine LEE, EO 1 of KCDO**, said it was expected that relevant letters would be sent out in late November or early December.

213. **Mr Melvin KAN, Assistant District Officer (ADO) of KCDO**, said that invitation letters in respect of the present funding application would be sent out as soon as possible.

214. **Dr KWONG Po-yin** noted the reply by Mr Melvin KAN, ADO of KCDO but reiterated that she wanted to know whether there was any hindrance. Previously, road safety activities were conducted in the District and funding application was made at the TTC meetings. The great disturbance caused to the public by the cycling safety problem was repeatedly raised at this year's meetings and the present programme aimed at the soonest resolution of the problem by the resources of the Committee. She pointed out that previously the TD and the HKPF were invited to conduct similar activities but a lot of time was needed for its implementation. The DC provided an opportunity for the effective use of the community's resources to improve our community. It was hoped that the Home Affairs Department (HAD) or the Secretariat would send out the invitation letters as soon as possible. Because of the urgency of the activities and the previous funding application for the production of publicity materials or other materials were allocated, it was hoped that the DO would complete the task in accordance with the established procedures and timetable.

215. **The Chairman** instructed the Secretary to note the unanimous adoption of the publicity activities in respect of the Publicity Programme on Road and Cycling Safety in Kowloon City District. He asked the Secretariat to prepare the invitation letters and to implement the established procedures as soon as possible.

Item 24

Any Other Business

216. **The Chairman** said the Study on Public Transport Demand in Kowloon City District was adopted at the Committee's last meeting. When the minutes of the meeting were noted, it was hoped that the Secretariat and ADO of the KCDO would provide a reply on its progress and the progress of the drafting of the invitation letters as MTR Tuen Ma Line was expected to be in full operation in the third quarter of 2021. Friends of the **Chairman** who were familiar with the railway matters said the operation might be advanced to meet the schedule. Thus, it was very urgent and he

said he would pay close heed to the matter together with Members in order to know the progress of the agenda relating to the livelihood of the public and traffic. Members might be able to help in case there was hindrance or difficulties.

217. **Miss Charmaine LEE of the Secretariat** stated the transport study was temporarily suspended.

218. **Mr Melvin KAN, ADO of KCDO**, said that technically speaking it was not suspended and was in progress under the established procedures. However, according to the Guidelines on Application for District Council Funds, the Director of Home Affairs had to play the goal-keeping role. Time to handle it was needed but he said he fully understood the importance and urgency of that transport demand study and would reflect it to the HAD to expedite its progress. It was hoped that elaboration could be made at the next meeting.

219. **Miss Charmaine LEE of the Secretariat** said invitation letters on the transport demand study would be sent out but it might be a little bit late.

220. **The Chairman** said that as the present meeting was the last regular TTC meeting in 2020, he sincerely hoped that ADO of the KCDO and the Secretariat would help because many members of the public had been asking about the study which would have impact on the mode and planning of next year's bus route programme. The Committee's discussions would also hinge on the Study which bore great importance on the TTC's work next year. Though the Director of Home Affairs was playing a goal-keeping role, the decision by the DC should also be respected as the study was a consensus reached by the Committee. It was hoped that progress of the work would be known as soon as possible.

221. **Mr Pius YUM** asked whether the invitation letters could be sent out before 20 November. The time factor was important as there was a time limitation. If it was dragged on for too long to December, it would be more difficult to handle.

222. **Mr Melvin KAN, ADO of KCDO**, said that he understood the urgency of the matter. As the matter was beyond his control he was unable to provide an exact date.

223. **The Chairman** asked the Secretariat to inform the **Chairman** and Members instantly once the exact date was known.

224. **Mr KWOK tin-Lap** hoped that staff of the HAD would not postpone the distribution of the letters in respect of the funding for the community involvement programme till 29 March 2021.

Item 25

Date of Next Meeting

225. **The Chairman** declared that the next meeting would be held on 12 January 2021 (Tuesday) at 2:30 p.m. and the deadline for the submission of papers would be 24 December. **The Chairman** declared at 7:52 p.m. that the meeting was adjourned.

226. The minutes of this meeting were confirmed on 4 March 2021.

The Chairman

The Secretary

Kowloon City District Council Secretariat
March 2021