

Sai Kung District Council
Working Group on Hiram's Highway Improvement Project
Minutes of the Second Meeting in 2020

Date: 10 June 2020

Time: 9:30 a.m.

Venue: Sai Kung District Council Conference Room,
3/F, Sai Kung Tseung Kwan O Government Complex

Present

Mr HO Wai-hong, Stanley (Convenor)

Ms LEUNG Hin-yan (Vice-Convenor)

Ms CHAN Ka-lam, Debby

Mr CHAU Yin-ming, Francis, BBS, MH

Mr CHENG Chung-man

Mr CHUNG Kam-lun

Ms FONG Kwok-shan, Christine

Mr LAM Siu-chung, Frankie

Mr LAU Kai-hong

Mr LEE Yin-ho, Ryan

Mr LUI Man-kwong

Mr WONG Shui-sang

Mr YU Tsun-ning

Mr YUNG Hon-wa, Terence (Secretary) Executive Assistant (District Council)6, Sai Kung
District Office

In Attendance

Mr CHOW Tat-wing, Cyrus Assistant District Officer (Sai Kung)1, Sai Kung District Office

Mr CHENG Chi-wing, Ken Senior Liaison Officer (1), Sai Kung District Office

Ms NG Wai-ching, Maria Liaison Officer i/c (Sai Kung), Sai Kung District Office

Mr CHIU Leung-ye, Louie Liaison Officer i/c (PSW), Sai Kung District Office

Ms LEUNG Yuen-hei, Marjory Senior Engineer/Hiram's Highway, Highways Department

Ms SIU Tung, Cindy Engineer 1/Hiram's Highway, Highways Department

Mr LAM Kwok-chuen Engineer 2/Hiram's Highway, Highways Department

Mr WANG Ran, Thomas Engineer/Sai Kung, Transport Department

Ms LEE Yuk-ping Senior Land Executive/Acquisition,
District Lands Office, Sai Kung

Ms YAU Chi-yan Land Executive/Acquisition 2, District Lands Office, Sai Kung

Mr OR Wai-tak Assistant Manager/Clearance (1) (Sai Kung), Lands Department

Mr CHICK Wai-man Clearance Officer/Clearance (1) (Sai Kung), Lands Department

Mr LAM Hoi-ching Engineer/Sai Kung, Drainage Services Department

Mr MAK Tak-ming, Stephen	Director of Infrastructure, Meinhardt Infrastructure and Environment Limited
Mr WONG Man-kai, Neil	Chief Resident Engineer, Meinhardt Infrastructure and Environment Limited

Speakers

Mr Barry Hill	Friends of Sai Kung
Mr Stanley LEE	Hong Kong History Study Circle
Ms YIM Fong-man	Pak Sha Wan Tsuen
Mr SHEK Sze-ming	Pak Sha Wan Tsuen Committee
Mr Anven WU	Luk Mei Tsuen Mutual Aid Committee
Mr WAN Ka-ho	Ho Chung Che Kung Temple
Mr CHEUNG To-shing	Ho Chung Village
Mr YUNG Chi-yip	Tai Chung Hau Village Mutual Aid Committee
Ms HO Chung-ming	Sun On Tsuen
Mr TSANG Ka-kau, Thomas	Thomas Tsang Surveyors Limited

Absent

Mr CHEUNG Wai-chiu
Mr LAI Ming-chak
Mr YIP Brandon Kenneth

Welcome Remarks

The Convenor welcomed Members of the Sai Kung District Council (SKDC) and attendees to the meeting of the Working Group, in particular:-

- Mr Thomas WANG, Engineer/Sai Kung, Transport Department
- Mr LAM Hoi-ching, Engineer/Sai Kung, Drainage Services Department

I. Confirmation of Minutes of the 1st Working Group on Hiram's Highway Improvement Project (HHIPWG) Meeting held on 27 February 2020

2. The Convenor noted that the Secretariat had not received any proposed amendment to the above meeting minutes before the meeting. There being no other proposed amendment at the meeting, the Convenor declared that the above minutes were confirmed.

II. Deputations/individuals express views on Hiram's Highway Improvement Project

3. The Convenor said the Working Group had invited representatives of deputations and residents

in Sai Kung district to attend this meeting to express their views to the Highways Department (HyD).

4. The views of the speakers were consolidated as follows:

Improvement options for Hiram's Highway

- The speakers held different views about the tunnel scheme and the on-line widening scheme.
- They opined that it was not necessary to carry out road widening works in Sai Kung Town Centre.

Historic buildings and heritage

- They were concerned about the cultural heritage along Hiram's Highway, such as the British-style posting boxes and milestones.
- They were concerned about the protective measures for the Kwun Yum Temple in Pak Sha Wan during the works period.

Public consultation

- They considered that the works lacked comprehensive consultation and suggested that the Government should enhance communication with the affected residents and stakeholders.
- They considered that the previous arrangements for organising local consultation forums were undesirable.
- The Lands Department (LandsD) had posted notices on land resumption matters without notifying the village representatives in advance, which made residents and the elderly feel worried. They believed that the relevant arrangements required improvements.
- They asked about the details of the public consultation for Stage 2 Project, including whether plans had been displayed prominently in Sun On Tsuen.

Impact of on-line widening on residents and the environment

- It was suggested that an environmental impact assessment of the works should be carried out.
- They were worried that the on-line widening scheme would affect the building structures of Pak Sha Wan Tsuen, the Kwun Yum Temple in Pak Sha Wan and Sun On Tsuen as well as the neighbourhood relationship. They suggested that the Government should remove obstacles to the compensation arrangements and offer local rehousing to residents affected by the land resumption.
- They enquired whether the ramp and the lay-bys on Hiram's Highway near Sun On Tsuen would be removed and asked about the impact of the works on roadside residential buildings, including air quality, noise, etc. In addition, as the proposed noise barriers would affect the scenery, air ventilation and property price of residential buildings, they considered that the Government should only commence the works after studying the

improvement options or making reasonable compensation.

- It was suggested that HyD should enhance the arrangements of the pedestrian crossing at Tai Chung Hau Village to reduce the impact on villagers.
- Footbridges were suggested to be provided in suitable places.

Drainage problems

- It was suggested that HyD and the Drainage Services Department (DSD) should handle the flooding problem in Luk Mei Tsuen, Nam Pin Wai and Tai Chung Hau properly.

Planning and development of Sai Kung

- To alleviate the traffic congestion on Hiram's Highway, it was suggested that the Government should suspend the processing of planning applications in Sai Kung.
- The Government was asked to consider the current situation and long-term development of Sai Kung Town.

5. Ms Marjory LEUNG, Senior Engineer/Hiram's Highway, HyD, responded as follows:

Improvement options for Hiram's Highway

- As the traffic congestion on Hiram's Highway was very serious, it was necessary to widen the road to increase the traffic capacity.

Historic buildings and heritage

- According to the cultural heritage impact assessment of the works project, most of the heritage along the highway (such as the British-style posting boxes, memorial arches and historic buildings) would not be affected. Moreover, three milestone markers and one water pump were required to be reprovisioned to nearby areas in response to the road works.

Public consultation

- HyD had conducted several consultation exercises in Pak Sha Wan to collect views and optimise the design proposal.
- HyD would discuss with the District Lands Office, Sai Kung (DLO/SK) after the meeting to explore whether there was room for improvement in the posting of notices on land resumption.
- HyD would meet with residents along the highway affected by the clearance to discuss the arrangements for land resumption. General ex-gratia compensation or public housing arrangements would be provided to the eligible affected residents. In addition, the Government would continue to maintain close liaison with residents along the highway and the stakeholders during the detailed design stage of the project.
- Apart from being uploaded to the Internet, plans involving land resumption had also been

hung up in the affected areas along the highway during the gazettal period. As the gazettal period had ended on 3 March this year, HyD was handling the views received during the period and would submit all the correspondence with the objectors to the Chief Executive in Council afterwards for consideration of whether to authorise HyD to carry out the works under Cap 370.

- Since 2016, HyD had been carrying out ground investigations, design and relevant assessment work, and had also maintained close communication with SKDC. Moreover, HyD had consulted the stakeholders about the revised design.

Impact of on-line widening on residents and the environment

- Although the Stage 2 Project was not a designated project listed in the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance, HyD's consultant had conducted an environmental study and assessed the impact of the works on the environment according to the standard and guidelines specified in the works technical circular. The relevant executive summary had been uploaded to the project website. Based on the result of the study, the impact of the project on the environment, water quality, ecology, etc. were all within acceptable levels after appropriate measures were taken.
- During the works period, pedestrian flow would be kept smooth and two-lane traffic would be maintained as far as practicable.
- The contractor would handle problems related to building structures prudently and conduct regular monitoring. The construction sites were required to maintain a certain distance from the buildings to avoid affecting the structures.
- The arrangement of pedestrian crossing facilities at Tai Chung Hau was being reviewed. Relevant result would be explained to the stakeholders of Tai Chung Hau Village after the review was completed.

Drainage problems

- HyD would collaborate with DSD to inspect the situation of Nam Pin Wai and seek solutions to resolve the flooding problem as soon as possible.
- DSD was conducting a feasibility study on the drainage proposal for Tai Chung Hau.
- HyD would study with the Water Supplies Department (WSD) and DSD to incorporate the water supply and flood protection works into the Stage 2 Project to be implemented concurrently so as to reduce the impact on residents and the traffic in the future.

6. Mr OR Wai-tak, Assistant Manager/Clearance (1) (Sai Kung), LandsD, responded that although the process of a freezing survey was required to be kept confidential, LandsD would still explore the feasibility of notifying the village representatives or the village offices concerned in advance.

7. Mr Neil WONG, Chief Resident Engineer, Meinhardt Infrastructure and Environment Limited (Meinhardt), responded as follows:

- Although the drains in Luk Mei Tsuen were not within the scope of Stage 1 Project, the contractor had used water pumps to assist in clearing up the accumulated water when flooding occurred in Luk Mei Tsuen.
- The consultant had been in communication with the representative of the Che Kung Temple and had regularly monitored the condition of the Che Kung Temple during the works period. The monitoring results had been kept below the alert level. After the completion of the works near the Che Kung Temple, the consultant would follow up on the damaged parts of the joss paper burner with the representative of the Che Kung Temple.

8. Mr LAM Hoi-ching, Engineer/Sai Kung, DSD, responded as follows:

- DSD would collaborate with the Home Affairs Department, HyD and Meinhardt in studying the flooding case in Luk Mei Tsuen. If blockage of drains was found, DSD could arrange clearance work of drains by high pressure water jetting.
- DSD would follow up on the flooding situation in Ho Chung New Village.
- DSD would seek co-operation with HyD to carry out the river improvement works for Tai Chung Hau and the Stage 2 Project simultaneously.

9. Mr Stephen MAK, Director of Infrastructure, Meinhardt, responded that the ramp in front of the house at No. 35 Sun On Tsuen would be retained while the three lay-bys near the village would be reprovisioned nearby. Meinhardt would discuss the relevant arrangements with the stakeholders of Sun On Tsuen during the detailed design stage.

10. Mr Thomas WANG, Engineer/Sai Kung, Transport Department (TD), responded that TD would add public parking spaces to government sites and public utilities as far as practicable under the principle of “single site, multiple uses” and request the developers’ provision of parking spaces in private development projects for use by the public based on the upper limits stipulated in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines. It was necessary to rely on the Hiram’s Highway Improvement project to solve the traffic problems of Sai Kung, instead of relying solely on individual minor works projects.

11. The Convener thanked all speakers for expressing their views.

III. New Items

(A) Progress Report of Hiram’s Highway Improvement

I. Hiram's Highway Improvement Stage 1

12. Ms Marjory LEUNG of HyD gave a brief introduction of the background information on the Hiram's Highway Improvement project and the follow-up work related to the public consultation.

13. Mr Neil WONG of Meinhardt introduced the progress of Stage 1 Project based on the presentation slides shown.

14. The Convenor explained the situation of the flooding occurred in Sai Kung in early June based on the photos shown.

15. The Members' views were consolidated as follows:

Drainage and flooding issues

- Members asked about the department responsible for the investigation into the causes of the flooding as well as the progress and the result of the investigation. They also asked about the ordinance(s) specifying that the relevant department was required to be responsible.
- They suggested the provision of large catchment areas at suitable locations and the improvement of drainage channels before the completion of the Stage 1 Project.
- They asked HyD whether such a serious flooding incident was already expected before the commencement of the works.
- They were worried that the works would weaken the natural drainage and absorption capacity of soil in the vicinity of Hiram's Highway.
- They asked the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) whether water samples had been collected at the location of the flooding incident for testing. If not, it was suggested that the Working Group write to EPD to make such a request.
- The Government had carried out the Ho Chung River Improvement Works project, which completely altered the natural setting of areas in the vicinity of Ho Chung River but failed to address the flooding problem along the river.
- They took the view that the Government had underestimated the amount of rainfall in Sai Kung district, and suggested that DSD, HyD and the consultant should review whether it was necessary to enhance the drainage capacity of pipelines to avoid the recurrence of flooding.
- As the absorption capacity of trees and soil would affect the discharge of rainwater, they asked whether the relevant departments had made an assessment of the impact of soil stabilisation and tree removal on the absorption capacity.
- They enquired about the information on the box culverts provided near the gate in Pak Wai.
- They asked about the number of slopes that required maintenance and the number of shotcreted slopes.

Public consultation

- They suggested that HyD should conduct consultation forums in Sai Kung district in a timely manner to explain the works details to residents and listen to their views. Moreover, they asked HyD to provide a schedule of the consultation in the future.
- They asked about the stakeholders to whom HyD had distributed pamphlets on the “Information for Road Scheme under Gazettal” regarding the Stage 2 Project.
- They enquired about the target groups of the consultation from January to March 2020.
- They enquired whether the Working Group would conduct public consultation forums in the district.

Historic buildings and heritage

- They were worried that the Kwun Yum Temple in Pak Sha Wan would encounter the same problems as the Che Kung Temple, and suggested carrying out maintenance work before the commencement of the works.

Transplantation and replanting of trees

- They asked about the progress and scope of the tree transplantation, and the number of trees to be transplanted.

16. Ms Marjory LEUNG of HyD responded as follows:

Drainage and flooding issues

- HyD had requested resident site staff to carry out detailed investigation into the causes of the flooding. In addition, HyD would follow up on the claims lodged by residents due to the flooding according to the works contract.
- HyD had been urging the contractor to keep the site clean and clear the channels regularly in the course of the works to prevent blockage of the catchment system by miscellaneous objects and maintain the normal operation of drainage systems within the area of the works.
- HyD had deployed staff to arrive at the scene on the day of the flooding to learn about the situation and requested the contractor’s clearing of the road drainage system and enhancement of temporary pumping measures as soon as possible to prevent another flooding caused by the rainstorm. The contractor had subsequently deployed additional staff to stand by on the site to assist in clearing the drainage with the use of water pumps and tools.
- The road drainage system and the stormwater drainage system were two separate systems. The road drainage system was managed by HyD and designed in accordance with the departmental guidelines of HyD while the stormwater drainage system was managed by DSD and designed in accordance with the Stormwater Drainage Manual of DSD. Road drainage system was designed to cater for “50-year return” rainstorms.
- The scope of the Stage 2 Project would be reviewed to enhance the drainage capacity of

locations that were more prone to flooding.

Public consultation

- In February this year, HyD had distributed pamphlets on the “Information for Road Scheme under Gazettal” to the stakeholders in the district, including SKDC, the Sai Kung Rural Committee, the Hang Hau Rural Committee, village representatives of various villages and fishermen’s representatives, as well as owners’ corporations, owners’ committees, mutual aid committees and estate management offices, etc. along Hiram’s Highway. In addition, HyD had distributed the pamphlets to all Members of the Sai Kung Area Committee, heads of schools, the Sai Kung Kai Fong Committee, the Sai Kung Chamber of Commerce, the Sai Kung Food and Beverages Association, the Sai Kung Yacht Club, the Kwun Yum Temple in Pak Sha Wan and the Tsung Tsin Mission Sai Kung Church, etc. In view of the epidemic, HyD was unable to send a large number of mails at that time, so it could only provide the pamphlets for the representatives of the above major stakeholders. However, HyD had mentioned in the letter that the pamphlet had been uploaded to the website and persons in need of more pamphlets had been invited to contact HyD.
- Since 2013, HyD had conducted 28 consultation meetings with the stakeholders in the district. Details such as the dates and target groups of the forums had been uploaded to the project website. After the large-scale forum held in 2016, HyD had conducted a total of seven consultation meetings, the details of which were also available on the website.

Transplantation and replanting of trees

- Information on the replanting of trees for the Stage 1 Project had been uploaded to the project website and the relevant links would be provided after the meeting for reference by Members of the Working Group.

17. Mr Neil WONG of Meinhardt responded as follows:

Drainage and flooding issues

- The road drainage system of the Stage 1 Project was designed according to the guidelines of HyD – capable of catering for “50-year return” rainstorms. The rainstorm on 6 June transcended such an expectation to a great extent.
- According to the preliminary investigation, it could not be ruled out that the blockage was caused by the large amount of garbage on the hill being washed into the drainage channel. Meinhardt was carrying out the relevant follow-up work, and was liaising with the affected households and commercial tenants. The mechanism for insurance claims had also been activated according to the works contract.
- The works on box culverts in the vicinity of Wing Ho Yuen in Hing Keng Shek had been completed, while the works on the retaining wall and desilting pit were yet to be completed. The consultant would provide photos of the box culverts after the meeting.

- To address the concerns about the drainage problems at the northern gate of Marina Cove, intercepting channels would be provided in the vicinity of Luk Cheung Road and Ping On Road, and additional intercepting channels would be added to the northern gate of Marina Cove. The relevant works had reached the detailed design stage. Moreover, to improve the discharge of muddy water generated from the works, the contractor had installed seven sets of wastewater treatment plants on site. It was noted that some locations in the hilly areas of Hing Keng Shek where the problem of yellowish muddy water might take place had been referred to the relevant departments to follow up.
- Many slopes near Yu Chai Chung Village had collapsed after the rainstorm.
- The “return period” definition reflected a possibility of occurrence of rainstorms under different time and rainfall intensity variants. Hence, it was not appropriate to assess the return period of a rainstorm based on average amount of hourly rainfall, given the fluctuation of its intensity over a period.
- Supplementary information on the absorption capacity of soil and the impact of tree removal on the drainage capacity, etc. would be provided after the meeting.

Historic buildings and heritage

- The consultant had started to communicate with the Che Kung Temple, arranged for independent structural engineers to carry out vibration measurement and regular site investigations such as piling works before the commencement of works. The monitoring results showed that the works did not increase the severity of the original cracks in the Che Kung Temple.

Transplantation and replanting of trees

- The tree planting had yet to commence. The first stage of tree planting work would commence in areas near the southern and northern gates of Marina Cove; reports would be made to SKDC in the light of the growth of those trees. Information on the planting of trees had been uploaded to the project website.

18. Mr LAM Hoi-ching of DSD responded as follows:

- DSD initially considered that the flooding incident was caused by the high-intensity rainfall for three consecutive hours on 6 June. There might also be the possibility that the blockage of stormwater drains was caused by the sand, silt and garbage being washed into the drains together with the heavy rain.
- DSD had deployed emergency teams to Sai Kung district to provide emergency support, clear blocked drains and drain excessive water. Moreover, the contractor would clear up locations where blockage had occurred during heavy rains.
- The Ho Chung River Improvement Works project was designed based on the “50-year return period” standard. He would relay the views of SKDC Members on improving Ho Chung River to the Flood Control Section of DSD after the meeting.

- The works design of DSD would be carried out according to the Stormwater Drainage Manual issued in 2018. In addition, DSD commenced an 18-month “Drainage Improvement Works in Sha Tin and Sai Kung – Investigation” in 2019. The relevant site survey and investigation work was currently in progress.

19. The Convenor and the Vice-Convenor concluded as follows:

- It was hoped that a public consultation forum could be conducted in the district, and that the departments, including HyD and DSD, would attend the forum upon invitation.
- HyD did not notify residents of the changes in the coverage of the works, which had caused concerns among them. Therefore, it was suggested that HyD should conduct more extensive consultation on the design of Stage 2 Project in future.
- It was suggested that the Government should formulate various measures to reduce damages to residents’ properties arising from flood and consider factors, such as soil absorption and interception, in the course of the remedial works.
- They enquired about the feasibility of the provision of embedded cisterns along Hiram’s Highway.
- It was suggested that the flood mitigation measures in the vicinity of Ho Chung and Pak Wai should be improved based on the standard of a rainstorm “once in 100 years”.
- HyD was required to submit supplementary information after the meeting on the box culverts at Marina Cove, the impact of the felling and replanting of trees on the absorption capacity of soil and the elaboration of “50-year return period”, etc.

Hiram’s Highway Improvement Stage 2

20. Ms Marjory LEUNG of HyD gave a brief introduction of the procedures for handling the objections during the gazettal period. She said, after the epidemic had become more stabilised, HyD would meet with the affected residents to explain matters related to land resumption, compensation and rehousing, etc.

21. Mr Stephen MAK of Meinhardt reported on the progress of Stage 2 Project based on the presentation slides shown.

22. The views of Members were consolidated as follows:

Improvement options

- Members asked about the justifications for the widening of Hiram’s Highway to a four-lane carriageway and requested HyD’s submission of the relevant reports.

- It was suggested that HyD should study more options of alignments for the tunnel scheme to lower the impact on residents and the environment and reduce the expenditure incurred by land resumption.

Impact of the works on the environment, residents and scenery

- They asked about the impact of the works on the scenery of residential areas, including Sun On Tsuen and Sun King Terrace.
- They were worried that the works would affect the structure of buildings along Hiram's Highway.
- They enquired about the frequency of the regular monitoring of building structure by HyD and the relevant criteria.
- They asked about the increase in the chance of memorial arches being affected by traffic accidents after the road widening and the implementation of relevant protective measures.
- They enquired about the noise levels in the course of the works and after the road widening, the impact on air quality of the footpaths on both sides, the decrease in the distance between food premises and the carriageway, whether occupational safety and health of staff of food premises had been taken into consideration, as well as the impact of tree removal on the temperature of the footpaths on both sides of Po Tung Road.
- They enquired whether the green belts along Hiram's Highway and the coastal protection area near The Giverny would be affected.
- They asked about the land resumption and compensation arrangements for Pak Sha Wan Tsuen, and asked the Government to enable the affected residents to choose to be locally rehoused or relocated to public housing.

Public consultation

- They considered that HyD's arrangements for the distribution of pamphlets and the posting of notices were undesirable and it was necessary to conduct another large-scale consultation again. Moreover, it was suggested that every affected household along the highway should be consulted during the detailed design stage.

Arrangements for the replacement of drains and water mains

- They enquired about the locations and total length of water mains and drains proposed to be replaced, and whether the works related to Port Shelter Sewerage would be carried out together with the Stage 2 Project in a bundling approach.
- They enquired whether stormwater drains could be laid under footpaths or other places that did not affect the traffic.

Matters related to the traffic impact assessment and the traffic capacity

- They asked about the current number of vehicles entering Sai Kung Town via Hiram's Highway.

- They enquired whether the traffic capacity of Sai Kung Town could cope with the increase in traffic flow in the future. Moreover, they suggested imposing a limit on the traffic flow of Hiram's Highway, and improving the existing traffic congestion problem in Sai Kung Town or constructing car parks.
- The scope of the traffic impact assessment was requested to be provided.

Other matters

- It was suggested that the unclaimed urn graves should be properly handled and placed.
- They asked about the criteria for the retrofitting of noise barriers and the dualling works.
- They suggested that cycle tracks should be provided along Hiram's Highway, in particular the road section between Sha Kok Mei and Wang Kong Tsuen.

23. Ms Marjory LEUNG of HyD responded as follows:

Impact of the works on the environment, residents and scenery

- HyD was engaging a consultant to produce photomontages covering the entire scope of the project.
- The provision of road facilities such as crash barriers would be taken into consideration to preserve the memorial arches in Sai Kung Town.
- The coastal protection area next to The Giverny was not within the current scope of the project. Members were invited to refer to the environmental study report for the relevant plans, and HyD would provide the relevant information after the meeting.
- During the detailed design stage, HyD would examine the buildings and heritage adjoining to the sites and formulate a monitoring programme. Generally speaking, HyD would monitor buildings once a month, while historic buildings would be monitored once a week. The alert level, alarm level and action level for the settlement readings of residential blocks were 13 mm, 20 mm and 25 mm respectively. HyD would take corresponding actions depending on the degree of settlement. If the action level was reached, it was necessary to suspend the works and investigate the causes. Regarding historic buildings, HyD would impose stricter standards. Taking the Che Kung Temple as an example, HyD would monitor the alert level, alarm level and action level in various aspects: the figures for the frequency of vibrations were 3 mm, 4 mm and 5 mm per second respectively; the figures for inclination were 1:2000, 1:5000 and 1:10000 respectively; and the settlement readings were 6 mm, 8 mm and 10 mm respectively.
- HyD would carry out transplantation or compensatory planting of trees as appropriate according to the works technical circular issued by the Development Bureau to reduce the impact on the environment.

Matters related to the traffic impact assessment and the traffic capacity

- During the design process, HyD had taken into consideration the land use and the

development intensity specified in the outline zoning plans related to Sai Kung district and development projects approved as at May 2018. In addition to the uses or developments frequently permitted under the outline zoning plans, applications must be submitted to the Town Planning Board to obtain its permission for other uses/proposed new development projects. Furthermore, applicants were required to submit relevant technical assessments to prove the feasibility of the proposed development and that no unacceptable negative impact would be caused on the area.

- If construction sites were too close to residential blocks, the relevant buildings would be inspected and consideration would be given to the need for taking protective measures prior to the works. Those buildings would be inspected periodically during the works period and would also be inspected after the completion of the works.
- Regarding issues such as the occupational health and safety of food premises on Po Tung Road and the temperature difference, supplementary information would be provided after the meeting.

Public consultation

- HyD would study how to improve the consultation work during the detailed design stage and would continue to maintain communication with the stakeholders during the detailed design stage.

Arrangements for the replacement of drains and water mains

- As the traffic flow of Hiram's Highway was very high, the implementation of any of the road closure measures would lead to serious traffic congestion on Hiram's Highway. Therefore, it was difficult to carry out large-scale drainage and water main improvement works.
- DSD intended to implement foul water system works to extend Port Shelter Sewerage to Tai Chung Hau, Ta Ho Tun, Kau Sai San Tsuen and Pak Sha Wan, etc. Regarding flood control, DSD had commenced the "Drainage Improvement Works in Sha Tin and Sai Kung – Investigation" and was carrying out the relevant site survey and investigation work, including the provision of box culverts near the section of Hiram's Highway in Tai Chung Hau. Furthermore, WSD was carrying out water main replacement works in Pak Sha Wan, but part of the water main works had yet to be carried out due to traffic considerations. WSD hoped that the above water main replacement works could be carried out together with the Hiram's Highway Improvement project. HyD would continue to maintain communication with WSD and DSD, and conduct studies with the relevant departments during the detailed design stage on carrying out the works simultaneously to reduce the impact of road opening on residents and the traffic.
- The impact of the works on air quality had been included in the environmental impact assessment report. After implementing various mitigation measures, the works would only have a localised and temporary impact on air quality. The situation would not be

significant and no severe impact would be caused to the surrounding areas. After the completion of the works, the Air Quality Objectives for sensitive receivers such as carbon dioxide, respirable suspended particulates and fine suspended particulates would be attained.

- As the footpath on both sides of Hiram's Highway had a limited space, it was impossible to lay all public facilities underneath the footpath. Therefore, it was inevitable that some water mains had to be laid underneath the road.

Other matters

- The Civil Engineering and Development Department would review the feasibility of the construction of cycle tracks.
- The design details of the Kwun Yum Temple section would be provided after the meeting.

24. Mr Stephen MAK of Meinhardt responded as follows:

Improvement options

- Careful consideration had been given to the alignment for the tunnel scheme to come to an option with the least impact on residents and the environment. Moreover, the alignment of the tunnel was required to be close to the level of the existing road surface. Therefore, its entrance/exit and link roads would pass through the existing villages. If a tunnel was to be built underneath the villages, the future development of the villages would be affected.

Impact of the works on the environment, residents and scenery

- The coastal protection area next to The Giverny was not within the scope of Stage 2 Project. EPD was already aware of the situation.
- As the works in Sai Kung Town did not involve piling works and bulk excavation, the impact on the buildings was less significant.
- The provision of noise mitigation measures, such as low noise materials or noise barriers, had been taken into account in the works project so as to alleviate the impact of noise on residents.

Matters related to the traffic impact assessment and the traffic capacity

- The traffic conditions in Sai Kung Town and the proposals were set out in the traffic impact assessment report.
- Information related to the traffic impact assessment would be provided after the meeting.

Other matters

- Noise mitigation measures had been recommended according to the relevant technical guidelines while the design of noise barriers would be carried out during the detailed design stage.

- HyD and the consultant had undergone lengthy discussions on the design of the road section near the Kwun Yum Temple in Pak Sha Wan before reaching a consensus on the existing arrangement of a single four-lane carriageway.

25. Mr Neil WONG of Meinhardt added that if urn graves were found on the site before the works, resident site staff would notify the nearby village representatives to track down the contact person concerned. If the urn graves remained unclaimed, the consultant would work with the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department to remove them.

26. Mr Louie CHIU, Liaison Officer i/c (PSW), Sai Kung District Office (SKDO), said if urn graves were found within the site, DLO/SK would post notices at the scene and in nearby villages in order to contact the family members of the deceased. If family members of the deceased were contacted successfully, DLO/SK would discuss the relocation arrangements with them; if family members of the deceased were still not found after notices were posted, those cases would be handed over to SKDO for follow-up and the District Officer would consider whether to agree to the removal of the urn graves. In such case, the Government would not reimburse any removal allowance.

27. Mr Cyrus CHOW, Assistant District Officer (Sai Kung)1, SKDO, added that if urn graves were required to be removed, DLO/SK would post a one-month notice under normal circumstances, during which SKDO would notify the nearby village representatives and maintain communication with the rural committee concerned. SKDO would carry out the relevant procedures having regard to actual circumstances. It might take more than one month to handle some of the cases, and those urn graves might not be removed immediately upon expiry of the time limit set out in the notice.

28. Ms LEE Yuk-ping, Senior Land Executive/Acquisition, District Lands Office, Sai Kung, responded that if the funding application of the project was approved by the Finance Committee of the Legislative Council, LandsD would gazette the project according to the Roads (Works, Use and Compensation) Ordinance and notify the affected private land owners. In addition, LandsD would post notices at the corresponding locations and notify the owners, and the titles to the private land concerned would be reverted to the Government after three months. If the affected owners neither agreed to nor accepted the compensation from the Government, they could submit the relevant information and assessments. If they still disagreed with the Government's actions in the end, they could apply to the Lands Tribunal for further processing. Eligible squatter or structure licensees could be allocated a public housing unit, while shops would receive ex-gratia payments.

29. Mr Thomas WANG of TD responded as follows:

- It was necessary to consider the actual circumstances of each junction to decide whether the provision of a central reservation was required.

- After the completion of the works, there would be multiple roundabouts to facilitate the alteration of traffic direction.
- The executive summary of the traffic impact assessment report had been uploaded to the project website. A comparison between the situation of Hiram’s Highway in 2027 and 2037 in the absence and presence of the proposed road widening works had been set out in the summary. Moreover, the report showed that it was necessary to increase the traffic capacity of the road so as to alleviate the congestion problem of Hiram’s Highway.
- TD would provide public parking spaces in suitable premises of government organisations or community organisations as far as practicable under the principle of “single site, multiple uses”. Furthermore, developers would be requested to provide parking spaces in private development projects, with the number of parking spaces reaching the upper limit stipulated in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines.

30. Mr LAM Hoi-ching of DSD pointed out that it was difficult to carry out excavation works on the busy Hiram’s Highway under normal circumstances. However, he would look into other feasible drainage works proposals with the relevant division of DSD after the meeting.

31. The Convenor said the drainage problems in the vicinity of Hiram’s Highway were pressing. To cope with the severe weather in Hong Kong in the next few years, it was necessary to handle the drainage works independently as soon as possible to enhance the drainage capacity of Sai Kung rural areas. Moreover, he suggested writing to EPD in the name of the Working Group to request an investigation into the causes of the serious flooding in Sai Kung a few days ago and the taking of enforcement actions against the irregularities or unlawful acts involved.

IV. Motion referred by the Traffic and Transport Committee meeting

(SKDC(TTC) Paper No. 115/20)

(SKDC(TTC) Paper No. 133/20)

(A) Urge the Government to address the problem of traffic congestion on Hiram’s Highway and to study and implement 13 minor improvement works projects

32. The Convenor said the above motion had been carried at the third meeting in 2020 of the Traffic and Transport Committee and referred to the Working Group for follow-up.

33. Members noted SKDC(TTC) Paper Nos. 115/20 and 133/20.

34. The views of Members were as follows:

- Members asked HyD and TD to consider the feasibility of the 13 minor works projects. As some of the pedestrian crossings were in a very dangerous situation, they suggested according priority to those which were more feasible.
- HyD was requested to provide justifications for the proposed works that were not feasible and provide statistics on the four-lane improvement option and the 13 minor works for comparison.
- The departments were asked to respond to questions related to the traffic impact assessment report as far as practicable.
- If HyD took the view that the traffic capacity of Hiram's Highway was insufficient, the actual situation should be reflected to the Planning Department. Otherwise, the continued development of residential buildings under insufficient traffic capacity would only create a vicious cycle for the traffic in Sai Kung.
- They asked about the upper limit on the traffic capacity and the numbers of units and vehicles that could be accommodated after the widening of Hiram's Highway to a four-lane carriageway.
- HyD did not take into account the scenery of the rural areas when implementing the works. To prevent Sai Kung rural areas from turning into a luxury residential area in the future, it was suggested that the Government should consider the long-term development of Sai Kung when approving planning applications for development projects.
- They asked about the traffic capacity of Sai Kung Town Centre and the impact of the widening works on it.

35. Mr Thomas WANG of TD said the implementation of the above 13 minor works alone were not sufficient to increase the traffic capacity of Hiram's Highway. The above suggestion could not solve the problem of traffic congestion on Hiram's Highway.

36. Ms Marjory LEUNG of HyD said the Hiram's Highway Improvement project aimed to solve the problem of traffic congestion on Hiram's Highway as soon as possible and improve its resilience to traffic accidents/emergency incidents. Therefore, HyD hoped that the works could be implemented as soon as possible to solve the problem of traffic congestion on Hiram's Highway. In addition, as it was necessary to provide additional lanes at individual locations when implementing the 13 minor works projects, land resumption matters might be involved.

37. Mr Stephen MAK of Meinhardt said the consultant had conducted a preliminary review of the selected sites and contents of the 13 minor works. Some of the proposed works were not feasible as land resumption matters were involved. Moreover, some of the proposed works at junctions had a low traffic flow for left/right turns. Therefore, the relevant works could not effectively alleviate the problem of traffic congestion on Hiram's Highway and increase the resilience of the road.

38. The Convenor said he did not mean that the 13 minor works projects could address all problems.

Instead, he hoped that the works projects could alleviate the existing traffic problems in the short term. Therefore, he asked HyD and TD to handle the 13 works projects and the Hiram's Highway Improvement project separately and to explore the feasibility of the works projects after the meeting. He suggested that this item should be retained.

V. Any Other Business

39. There was no other business.

VI. Date of Next Meeting

40. The next meeting was yet to be scheduled.

Sai Kung District Council Secretariat

October 2020

Ref: HAD SK DC 13/40/36