

Sha Tin District Council
Minutes of the 5th Meeting of
the Education and Welfare Committee in 2019

Date : 12 September 2019 (Thursday)
Time : 10:00 am
Venue : Sha Tin District Council Conference Room
 4/F, Sha Tin Government Offices

<u>Present</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Time of joining the meeting</u>	<u>Time of leaving the meeting</u>
Ms LAM Chung-yan (Chairman)	DC Member	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr WONG Fu-sang, Tiger (Vice-Chairman)	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr HO Hau-cheung, SBS, MH	DC Chairman	10:24 am	2:04 pm
Mr PANG Cheung-wai, Thomas, SBS, JP	DC Vice-Chairman	11:05 am	11:38 am
Mr CHAN Billy Shiu-yeung	DC Member	10:12 am	2:04 pm
Ms CHAN Man-kuen	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr CHAN Nok-hang	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr CHING Cheung-ying, MH	”	10:10 am	2:04 pm
Mr CHIU Chu-pong, Sunny	”	10:25 am	2:04 pm
Mr CHIU Man-leong	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr HUI Yui-yu, Rick	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr LAI Tsz-yan	”	11:03 am	2:04 pm
Mr LEUNG Ka-fai, Victor	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr LI Sai-hung	”	10:20 am	2:04 pm
Mr LI Sai-wing	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr LI Wing-shing, Wilson	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr MOK Kam-kwai, BBS	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr NG Kam-hung	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Ms PONG Scarlett Oi-lan, BBS, JP	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr PUN Kwok-shan, MH, JP	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr SIU Hin-hong	”	10:14 am	2:04 pm
Mr TING Tsz-yuen	”	10:45 am	2:04 pm
Mr TONG Hok-leung	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Ms TSANG So-lai	”	10:43 am	2:04 pm
Ms TUNG Kin-lei	”	10:23 am	2:04 pm
Mr WAI Hing-cheung	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr WONG Ka-wing, MH	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Ms WONG Ping-fan, Iris	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr WONG Yue-hon	”	10:00 am	2:04 pm
Mr YAU Man-chun	”	10:14 am	2:04 pm
Mr YIP Wing	”	10:09 am	2:04 pm
Mr YIU Ka-chun, MH	”	10:07 am	2:04 pm
Mr YUNG Ming-chau, Michael	”	10:14 am	2:04 pm
Ms YU Wai-ting, Amy (Secretary)	Executive Officer (District Council)1/ Sha Tin District Office		

In Attendance

Ms CHAN Lai-na, Laura

Ms CHENG Siu-ling, Katy

Ms NG Suk-min

Mr YUEN Chun-kit, Derek

TitleHousing Manager (Tai Po, North, Shatin1)/
Housing DepartmentChief Liaison Officer/
Sha Tin District OfficeSenior Liaison Officer (East)/
Sha Tin District OfficeSenior Executive Officer (District Council)/
Sha Tin District Office**In Attendance by Invitation**

Ms YIP Sau-mei, Joyce

Mr WONG Tsz-hei, Christopher

Ms CHIANG Lam

Mr CHAN Ping-ching, Roy

Ms CHAN Yee-chi, Elaine

TitleChief School Development Officer (Shatin)/
Education BureauSenior School Development Officer (Shatin) 2/
Education BureauSenior School Development Officer (Shatin) 5/
Education BureauAssistant District Social Welfare Officer (Shatin) 1/
Social Welfare DepartmentAssistant District Social Welfare Officer (Shatin) 2/
Social Welfare Department**Absent**

Mr CHAN Kwok-keung, James

Mr WONG Hok-lai

Title

DC Member (No application for leave of absence received)

” (”)

Action

The Chairman welcomed all members and representatives of government departments to the 5th meeting of the Education and Welfare Committee (EWC) of this year.

Application for Leave of Absence

2. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had received application for leave of absence in writing from the following member:

Mr Thomas PANG

Official Commitment

(Mr Thomas PANG arrived at the conference room at 11:05 am.)

3. Members unanimously approved the application for leave of absence submitted by the member above.

Confirmation of the Minutes of the Meeting Held on 11 July 2019

(EWC Minutes 4/2019)

4. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had received proposed amendments regarding Paragraphs 35, 36(a), 42, 53(a) and 55 of the above paper submitted by the Education Bureau (EDB) before the meeting. Members were invited to refer to the paper on the table and the

EDB was requested to supplement information to members on the proposed amendments.

5. Ms Joyce YIP, Chief School Development Officer (Shatin) of the EDB said that the proposed amendments were mainly to ensure consistency of terminology, replacing “no car policy” with “zero car policy”, and to clarify that the English Schools Foundation (ESF) would implement the “zero car policy” in all grades of relevant schools.

6. Members unanimously confirmed the above meeting minutes.

7. The Chairman reminded attendees that observers were making video recordings in the audience.

Matters Arising

Responses of the Relevant Government Departments to Matters Arising from the Previous Meeting

(Paper No. EW 22/2019)

8. Mr Wilson LI said, in the reply from the Security Bureau, it was mentioned that “with respect to the requirement for reducing the one-way permit quota, 150 per day was the upper limit while the quota would not necessarily be fully used”; however, an average of 157 Mainland residents came to the territory with a one-way permit per day in 2016. He asked if the Government would regulate situations where the number of people coming to the territory exceeded the upper limit of the quota. Also, although he agreed with the need for the reunion of cross-border families in China and in the territory, the capacity of the latter was limited. When the Government failed to strictly implement the quota, and many new arrivals were middle-aged, there was little help in increasing the labour force. The Government should consult with the Mainland to review the upper limit of the quota and strive for the right to approve applications for one-way permit.

9. The Chairman said that members noted the views of Mr Wilson LI and the relevant issue could be discussed further in the future.

Discussion Item

2019/20 Work Plan of Sha Tin District School Development Division of the Education Bureau

(Paper No. EW 23/2019)

10. The Chairman welcomed Ms Joyce YIP, Ms CHIANG Lam, Senior School Development Officer (Shatin) 5, and Mr Christopher WONG, Senior School Development Officer (Shatin) 2 of the EDB to the meeting.

11. Ms Joyce YIP, Ms CHIANG Lam and Mr Christopher WONG introduced the contents of the paper.

12. The views of Mr CHING Cheung-ying were summarised below:

- (a) he said that the roads inside Sun Chui Estate had been seriously congested since 11:00 am the past Sunday, which might have been caused by the activity held by the ESF Island School inside the estate, as a huge volume of private vehicles

were entering and leaving via Chui Tin Street. He opined that there was insufficient prior communication between the ESF and parents, and there was not enough parking spaces or road space in Sun Chui Estate; and

- (b) some primary schools in the district were unable to participate in the “School Improvement Programme” due to campus structural issues. He asked about the number of primary schools in the district that could not carry out campus expansion due to this issue. He took Christian Alliance H. C. Chan Primary School as an example. Campus expansion works was limited as the school was located above a car park. He asked whether the EDB would give priority to the school to relocate when the ESF returned the temporary school premise in the future or if it would make other priority arrangements.

13. Mr PUN Kwok-shan said that a student living in Tai Wai had been allocated a Secondary One place at a school in Ma On Shan. His parents were dissatisfied with the result of the allocation and had not yet visited the school to complete the registration procedures. However, the attempts to “knock on the doors” of other schools were unsuccessful and the recruitment of transfer students would only begin in the middle of this month. He asked how the EDB could help the student. Also, he would like to know whether the EDB had communicated with the Housing Department (HD) to provide assistance in addressing the repair needs of kindergarten school premises.

14. The views of Ms Iris WONG were summarised below:

- (a) she said that she had accompanied the EDB in the deliberation regarding the “zero car policy” with the International Christian School (ICS) on 9 September this year, and ICS asked whether the scope of the policy was limited to the school premises but not applicable to vehicles parking on public roads. She asked whether the EDB had guidelines explaining the scope of roads covered by the “zero car policy” to avoid causing adverse effects and worsening traffic congestion around the school;
- (b) ICS recruited students from all districts in the territory, so it was difficult for ICS to invite tenders and reorganise routes for school bus services. She suggested that the EDB and ICS focus on discussing the possibility of only recruiting students from individual districts. And she opined that the “zero car policy” was doing more harm than good to the community because parking spaces were insufficient in Shek Mun Estate;
- (c) residents who had just moved into Shek Mun Estate Phase II during the summer holiday told her that it was too hasty to handle the school transfer procedures for their children with only several weeks before school started. She suggested that the EDB provide assistance in advance to residents, place relevant application forms at estate management offices and simplify the procedures for submitting applications, so that parents would not have to process school transfer applications at the EDB’s office at Landmark North; and
- (d) she cited the survey result of the weight of students’ school bags that, in general, a primary school student’s school bag weighed 4.5 to 5 kg, and opined that the EDB should urge schools to change school policies so as to reduce the

burden on students.

15. The views of Ms TUNG Kin-lei were summarised below:

- (a) she hoped that the EDB could promise that the site of the temporary school premises of TWGHs Shui Chuen O Primary School in Mei Lam Estate would no longer be used as school premises after the relocation of the temporary school premises in 2022. The Tai Wai area lacked social welfare and recreational facilities and the location could only accommodate “matchbox-style school premises”. In addition, the vacant school premises that was formerly the school premises of Sung Lan Middle School had been converted to a primary school to deal with the shortage of primary school places. She asked when the EDB would announce the information of the sponsoring bodies of primary schools and the commencement of the admission process; and
- (b) she pointed out that the intake of residents of Chun Yeung Estate in Fo Tan would start intake at the end of this year. She asked that, except for delivering relevant letters through the HD, whether the EDB could collaborate with the HD to obtain information of the families with the need of school transfer, so that the EDB could hold seminars at the new estates to introduce to parents the school net in the district, the allocation of school places and various procedures to alleviate parents’ worries. The EDB could also learn more about the views of the community.

16. The views of Mr Wilson LI were summarised below:

- (a) he agreed with the arrangement of the EDB to increase Secondary 1 (S1) places gradually, as the need for S1 places was expected to reach its peak in 2024-2025;
- (b) the school encountered quite a few difficulties in the selection of a suitable school bus operator. Since school bus services had to cater to students that lived farther away from the school, the service charge was high. He asked what policies the EDB had to assist schools in addressing the difficulties in tendering for school buses and to provide more motivation for school bus operators to operate relevant services; and
- (c) quite some school buses violated traffic rules by boarding and alighting at places where stopping was not allowed. He said that residents relayed to him that some school bus drivers let students get off at places with double yellow lines near Wu Kai Sha MTR Station for convenience’s sake, which was dangerous. He hoped the EDB could monitor school bus services.

17. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) he proposed extending the existing “zero car policy” at Island School to other Direct Subsidy Scheme Schools (DSS) and asked whether the EDB had added terms of “zero car policy” and specified relevant penalties when entering into new service agreements with DSS;

- (b) 2 secondary schools and 1 primary school would be relocating in 2022. He asked the EDB how many classes would be re-organised in these vacant school premises. He said that there were only 22 classrooms in Free Methodist Mei Lam Primary School, so the development of the school was restricted. And the new primary school building at Au Pui Wan Street in Fo Tan had 24 classrooms instead of 30. He asked why the EDB did not let schools establish more classrooms in view of the growing population in the Sha Tin District. The classrooms could be used for other purposes even if the number of school-age children decreased in the future; and
- (c) quite a few public housing estates were to be completed and occupied successively in the coming year, such as Shek Mun Estate and Yan On Estate Phase II, Chun Yeung Estate in Fo Tan and Kam Chun Court, but school places of pre-primary education were insufficient. He asked about the planning of the EDB.

18. The views of Mr SIU Hin-hong were summarised below:

- (a) the EDB should formulate specific and easily measurable targets, and review them in due time. He asked which aspects of education quality was the goal of improving education quality referring to;
- (b) he opined that the EDB could assist schools to promote training courses during summer vacation to teach students time management. He asked about the differences in the functions of a school social worker and a student guidance teacher, and what role the social worker service could play during the summer vacation; and
- (c) he opined that the non-means-tested travel subsidy scheme should be extended to cover green minibus.

19. Mr LI Sai-hung added that, regarding the traffic congestion at Chui Tin Street the previous Sunday mentioned by Mr CHING Cheung-ying, illegal parking was serious on that day in Sun Chui Estate and many vehicles occupied crossings places, making it impossible for members of the community and wheelchair users to use pavements. He hoped that the ESF would adequately communicate with participants before holding such activities to avoid parking violations and road congestions.

20. Mr WONG Yue-hon said that around 60 non-profit-making local kindergartens in the district were participating in the Kindergarten Education Scheme, and asked about the number of them that were kindergartens under the Social Welfare Department (SWD). He pointed out that many kindergartens located in old public housing estates were unable to expand their scale to organise pre-nursery classes due to incompliant fire service equipment. As a result, parents had to arrange for their children to enrol in kindergartens outside the estates and to return to the kindergartens in the estates, posing the problem of bridging. He hoped that the EDB could consult with the HD to improve fire service equipment or provide financial support to kindergartens renting premises in housing estates. Also, a new kindergarten would be opening in Shek Mun Estate but the information of the kindergarten was unavailable online. He suggested that the EDB provide the information of all kindergartens in the district online several months before the commencement of school, including whether the schools

were whole-day or half-day, school fees and the number of places, for the parents' reference.

21. Ms Scarlett PONG said that she was pleased to see the completion of new school premises in Fo Tan as scheduled, and opined that parents' associations were very important. In addition, she urged the EDB to collaborate with other government departments to improve the situation of illegal parking and road conditions in Fo Tan, to speed up the construction of the recreation and cultural centre for more parking spaces and to build a footbridge connecting Fo Tan Road to Au Pui Wan Street to ensure the safety of students attending school in the area in the future.

22. The views of the Chairman were summarised below:

- (a) she would like to learn more about the mechanism and time required for the EDB to handle vacant premises, and pointed out that the Island School would return the premises in the school year of 2021/22, and asked when the EDB would decide whether the site would continue to be used for school purposes or be returned and used for other purposes;
- (b) she asked that whether the school premises arrangement of kindergartens was one of the policy areas of the EDB, since the work plan of the EDB mainly mentioned the school premises of secondary and primary schools. She said that a kindergarten in Hin Keng had ceased operation for years and recently its premises was borrowed by a kindergarten in the Tai Po District which needed urgent reconstruction. And she heard that the kindergarten would be moving out of the district within 2 years. As there were a trend of decline in the number of school-age children, she asked that whether the vacant premises would be converted into community facilities or be used for other purposes by then;
- (c) only 3 schools in the district participated in the "Opening Up School Facilities for Promotion of Sports Development Scheme" in the last school year, and a total of 22 activities were held. She opined that schools in the district were not actively participating in the scheme, and asked whether it was because not a lot of organisations applied to hold activities or the schools had concerns, such as security and cleaning issues;
- (d) also, only 4 schools opened up their parking spaces to school buses this school year. She learned that the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department had applied to a school in the district for borrowing parking spaces but was refused. She asked whether the EDB would take the initiative to learn about the concerns of the schools and provide more assistance to enable more schools to participate in the scheme; and
- (e) some schools in the district were built along hills, or were affected by hygiene problems of adjacent housing estates. The issues of mosquito and rat infestation were still serious even with adequate preventive measures. She asked whether the EDB had any supporting measures to assist the schools.

23. Ms Joyce YIP gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) regarding the traffic congestion at Sun Chui Estate due to the activities held by

the Island School the previous weekend mentioned by individual members, she said that, before holding activities, the school should communicate with the persons concerned in the community to discuss details of the activities and transport arrangements appropriately to promote community integration. The EDB would follow up on the incident with the school to avoid similar situations in the future;

- (b) in addition to providing assistance for “matchbox-style school premises” with inadequate space to carry out improvement works and to enhance school facilities, the long-term goal of the EDB was to reprovise this type of school premises. She cited that the EDB had reprovise the school premises of the relevant primary school in Fo Tan and the school premises of the former Sung Lan Middle School, and the result of the allocation of school premises would be announced by the beginning of October this year. Also, quite a few members were concerned about the issue of school relocation and traffic planning of schools. She said that the EDB would discuss with schools, relevant government departments and members as early as possible, and when reviewing proposals of sponsoring bodies, the EDB would pay attention in particular to the domain of learning and teaching and the provision of quality education. If the overall assessment results were comparable, the EDB would give priority to the sponsoring bodies who had operated schools with good performances in the district before;
- (c) the EDB would consider whether they could coordinate staff arrangement and the procedures so that the families that had newly moved in would not need to process school transfer procedures at the EDB’s Regional Education Office at Landmark North, and would arrange with the HD to distribute the relevant application forms as early as possible. She added that when members of the public moved into newly completed estates, they would receive application forms for school transfer. They could submit the forms upon completion by fax or by post without travelling to the Regional Education Office at Landmark North to verify their identities and addresses. She understood that parents might not be aware of the relevant arrangements concerning the specific form, and the EDB would improve its practice;
- (d) regarding the issue mentioned by Ms Iris WONG that the parents of the newly moved in families only had several weeks to complete school transfer procedures for their children, she said that the relevant application had no deadline. She encouraged members to directly contact the EDB by phone or e-mail, etc., upon receipt of enquiries or opinions from members of the public, and they would contact parents for information and follow up on the matter;
- (e) she could understand the difficulties that schools had encountered in the invitation of tender for school bus services. The EDB would discuss the difficulties in depth at meetings of associations of heads of secondary and primary schools to learn how the EDB could provide support;
- (f) the EDB would handle the temporary school premises of TWGHs Shui Chuen O Primary School at Mei Lam Estate, which would be relocating in 2022, according to established procedures, and she noted members’ views and would

further relay them to the EDB and follow up on them; and

- (g) the work report of the EDB mentioned that there was a total of 82 schools offering kindergarten education in the district, among which 40 schools ran pre-nurseries. The EDB would discuss with the HD on how to help kindergartens with the need to improve fire service equipment in school premises to comply with relevant standards for service expansion. She said that the EDB planned the number of places of early childhood education in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines, providing 500 whole-day and half-day places each for every 1 000 children aged 3 to 6 years old and would ensure that the kindergartens in new housing estates were providing enough places with the above standard.

24. Ms CHIANG Lam gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the mechanism of Secondary School Places Allocation was different from the subdivided district school net of primary schools. The EDB regarded the whole Sha Tin District as 1 school net. Therefore, she pointed out that students living in Tai Wai could be assigned a place in secondary schools nearby or further away in Ma On Shan. Students must visit the assigned schools in person for to complete the admission procedures. Student could apply for places with other schools on their own if they were not satisfied with the results of allocation. They could also enquire about the places remaining in their districts or other districts through the EDB and the EDB would provide as much assistance as possible; and
- (b) a total of 130 schools participated in the “Opening Up School Facilities for Promotion of Sports Development Scheme” across the territory in the school year of 2017/18, while only 1 school participated in the scheme in the Sha Tin District and opened up its facilities to 3 sports organisations for 7 sports events. The situation had improved significantly in the school year of 2018/19 when 3 schools in the district participated in the scheme and a total of 4 sports organisations held 22 sports events. She said that the EDB would continue to encourage schools to participate in the “Opening Up School Parking Spaces to Student Service Vehicles Scheme” in addition to the scheme above. This scheme of opening up school facilities was launched in the school year of 2019/20 and was still in the pilot phase. A total of 37 schools in the territory participated, among which 4 were from the Sha Tin District. The EDB would continue to learn about the schools’ considerations and concerns regarding participating in the scheme, so as to follow up on the issue and motivate more schools to participate.

25. Mr Christopher WONG said that the EDB would consult relevant schools and the government departments concerned in the hope that the schools could take practical measures to improve traffic conditions. The EDB would not generally disclose the contents of the terms of individual service contracts. When processing the applications for the renewal of service contracts, the EDB would consider devising appropriate and practical terms for improving traffic conditions according to the situation of individual schools.

26. Ms Joyce YIP gave a consolidated supplementary response as follows:

- (a) the EDB would discuss with the associations of heads of secondary and primary schools on how to improve the issue of excessively heavy school bags through school policies and recommended that schools follow the EDB's Guidelines on Reducing the Weight of School Bags;
- (b) the EDB had decided on the number of classrooms for the new primary school premises at Au Pui Wan Street in Fo Tan in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines of the Planning Department, and had also took the number of school-age children in the district into consideration and made estimations and planning;
- (c) the EDB would positively consider the suggestion of devising easily measurable targets. In addition, she said that the EDB had returned the 3rd to 6th floor of the school premises of SAHK Ko Fook Iu Memorial School to other government departments. Members could directly contact the HD and the Planning Department if they had any opinions, or the EDB could also contact the departments for them; and
- (d) she said that she would follow up on the relocation and relevant issues of the individual kindergartens in the district that she mentioned with the Chairman after the meeting.

27. The Chairman said that Mr Thomas PANG had arrived at the conference room to attend the meeting and asked members to take note of it.

28. Ms Iris WONG said that she hoped the EDB could balance the needs of the school and the community to use the roads when discussing the transport arrangements with ICS. In addition, she could not obtain information of the Hong Kong Christian Service Pario Kindergarten (Shatin) (Pario Kindergarten) newly opened in Shek Mun Estate, such as enrolment and the number of school places. Also, she asked the EDB whether the school would cause traffic issues to the community.

29. Mr SIU Hin-hong said that the EDB had not responded to his question on whether the functions of discipline masters and school social workers overlapped, and the suggestion on how schools could manage students' vacation. He hoped that non-governmental organisations could organise summer activities for students to participate in.

30. Mr Michael YUNG asked that whether the EDB had communicated with ICS and Hong Kong Baptist University Affiliated School Wong Kam Fai Secondary and Primary School (HKBUAS) nearby to introduce practical measures to solve the traffic issues at the location. The traffic flows of both schools caused congestion at the Shek Mun Interchange and affected the lives of several hundred thousand residents in Ma On Shan. He asked the EDB if there were any solutions. Moreover, he opined that the EDB might as well slightly relax the regulations on the number of classrooms if the vacant premises would continue to be used as schools, so that schools could increase the number of classrooms for other purposes in case of need. If schools would relocate in the future, this arrangement would help to attract other sponsoring bodies to operate schools on a larger scale.

31. Mr Wilson LI said that the issue of traffic congestion was severe in Ma On Shan and the Kowloon-bound roads in Ma On Shan were extremely congested after school commenced. While the Transport Department (TD) would be carrying out a number of road improvement projects, he hoped the plans of the Government could be more forward-looking. The EDB should collaborate more closely with all departments to meet the needs of a growing population. Also, the participation in the schemes of opening up school facilities and parking spaces introduced by the EDB was unsatisfactory. He proposed that schools lend parking spaces to government vehicles while the spaces originally occupied by the Government could be rented to members of the public, thereby increasing parking spaces in the community.

32. Ms Joyce YIP responded that Hong Kong Christian Service Parlo Kindergarten newly opened in Shek Mun Estate was undergoing renovation work during the summer vacation and the school was still consolidating information as the new school year had just started. The EDB had been in contact with the kindergarten and would inform Ms Iris WONG if there was further information.

33. Mr Christopher WONG said that ICS had adopted the suggestion of the TD to actively make good use of the area of the school for parents to pick up and drop off students since school started in mid-August this year, which had operated smoothly so far. At present, the school parking lot could accommodate 12 private cars at the same time for parents to pick up and drop off children. The school had also arranged the routes for teachers and students to access and egress the school via the parking lot to prevent them from crossing the exit of the parking lot and affecting the traffic flow. The police had strengthened enforcement against illegal parking nearby. Also, the EDB wrote to ICS in late August this year asking the school to come up with specific plans to further improve the traffic congestion nearby during the periods before and after school. The EDB would also continue its discussion with the school and other departments on feasible arrangements, including revising the terms of the service contracts.

34. Ms Joyce YIP added that the relevant arrangement of ICS of making good use of the parking lot mentioned by Mr Christopher WONG was implemented in the morning before classes started. Recently, the school had agreed to study whether it would be possible to cooperate with HKBUAS on school bus services and employ the same service contractor to provide more options of bus routes for students of both schools to reduce the number of private cars picking up and dropping off students. The details of execution of the proposal, such as the service flow and insurance arrangement, would take time to work out. The EDB would keep the Chairman of the Traffic and Transport Committee (TTC) and local DC Members updated on the latest progress of the issue in the future.

35. Ms CHIANG Lam gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the EDB would continue to encourage schools to open up facilities so that more sports events could be held;
- (b) at present, the “Opening Up School Parking Spaces to Student Service Vehicles Scheme” introduced by the EDB and the TD aimed to allow school buses to park inside schools. The EDB would report to members if there were any changes; and
- (c) school counsellors and social workers had their respective responsibilities and

work manuals. At the meeting in August this year, commissioners consulted non-governmental organisations and schools in the district on issues relevant to how to support students troubled emotionally, etc., and the EDB would also work with closely with non-governmental organisations.

36. Mr Michael YUNG said that the EDB should not only inform the Chairmen of the EWC and the TTC of the latest development on the relevant transport arrangements of the schools, but all members and affected persons should be informed of the relevant information.

37. Ms Joyce YIP said that the EDB would actively contact members who had questions or concerns about the progress of school transport arrangements and other matters and maintain good communication with all parties.

38. The Chairman said that there were many improvements in the work of the EDB over the past 4 years. She hoped the EDB would communicate even better with members in the coming year so that every member could have a better understanding of the work of the EDB and its collaboration with other departments. In response to the concerns expressed by members at the meeting, including the status of school places, enrolment arrangements and reprovisioning of vacant school premises, etc., she hoped the EDB could release relevant information in full in the future. Also, she said that the scheme to open up school parking spaces for school buses would help free up space in the community and make some parking spaces available to the public.

Questions

Question to be Raised by Mr WAI Hing-cheung on the New Town Plaza Incident
(Paper No. EW 24/2019)

39. The views of Mr WAI Hing-cheung were summarised below:

- (a) since the incident of conflict at New Town Plaza, he had received lots of comments from members of the public of his constituency and other districts saying that they or their families suffered emotional distress. In the response of the SWD, only 2 out of the 55 requests for assistance in the district were related to the incident and nearly 70% of the requests were primarily about emotional distress. He opined quite a few young people were in need of emotional support but had not taken the initiative to seek help and it might lead to serious consequences. He asked the SWD why the non-governmental organisations in the district had not kept a record of the number of requests for help affected by the incident and how many non-governmental organisations were providing counselling services in the Sha Tin District;
- (b) the SWD and the EDB responded that the service of “two school social workers for each school” would not be affected during the summer vacation. He asked how many students had returned to school to seek counselling from the social workers. In addition, he opined that the SWD was too passive in providing emotional support to principal officials and should be more active in providing appropriate services to people having emotional problems;
- (c) regarding the response of Kai Shing Management Services Limited (affiliated to Sun Hung Kai Properties Limited), the people affected by the incident of

conflict at New Town Plaza included not only their employees but also staff of the merchants. He asked how the New Town Plaza service office would support the merchants and what experience they had learned to restore public confidence in New Town Plaza so that they would still regard the plaza as a safe place; and

- (d) the response from the Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF) was quite long. In the response, it repeatedly referred to the measures to ensure the mental health of police officers. He would like to know whether the pre-employment psychological assessment for interviewers implemented since April 2010 had been set up by the HKPF in response to the shooting incident of TSUI Po-ko in 2006 and whether police officers who joined the service earlier had participated in the relevant psychological assessment. He also asked whether the HKPF would assess the psychological and mental state of police officers periodically to see if they were suitable for performing relevant duties. He added that troubled police officers might not take the initiative to seek help for fear of being labelled, and was concerned whether police officers with poor psychological qualities would be responsible for enforcement, as the HKPF needed a large number of staff to handle the recent social events.

40. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) he asked whether there would be a preliminary assessment made by the staff of Integrated Family Service Centres before cases were referred to social workers, psychiatric units or psychologists in the SWD's procedures in handling cases of emotional distress, and how many cases were followed up by a doctor eventually;
- (b) whether the schools in the Sha Tin District had reported to the EDB about the requests for assistance from students and the relevant figures due to the recent social events. If students were emotionally unstable or were even harming themselves, how the EDB would support them; and
- (c) the HKPF only responded in writing to members' questions and did not send any representative to attend the meeting. He commented that the HKPF was accustomed to one-way reporting and asked whether they did not intend to communicate with those representing the community on matters of public concern, such as the recent performance of police officers when they were on duty and their psychological qualities. He said that even though police officers of all ranks were required to receive psychological assessment before starting the job, one's psychological status would change over time or events, and asked how the HKPF would assess whether a police officer was suitable for his duty. He pointed out that Mr LI Sai-hung had been beaten by a commander at Tai Wai MTR Station and that police officer had previously treated reporters with violence, and asked whether the officer had received relevant assessment before he carried out frontline duty.

41. The views of Mr LAI Tsz-yan were summarised below:

- (a) he asked about the contents of the pre-employment psychological assessment

and whether in-service police officers would receive relevant assessment regularly. He opined that emotions affected many police officers at work, endangering public safety. He asked how we could deal with police officers on duty with unstable emotions and whether there were guidelines on carrying arms when on duty; and

- (b) on the day of 14 July when the incident of conflict happened at New Town Plaza on, he saw police officers entered private housing estates with arms, and some police officers became emotionally unstable during the period and pointed guns at residents, threatening their safety. He asked how the HKPF would handle the above situation. In addition, he pointed out that he had received enquiries from more than a dozen members of the public who were very scared by the sight of police officers walking around the estate with shields or batons and wanted to know what had happened. They had also expressed their distrust of the HKPF. Therefore, he asked how the HKPF could alleviate the tension between the police and the public and restore public confidence, and said that there would be an provisional motion.

42. The Chairman said that since the HKPF had not sent representatives to attend the meeting, she asked the Secretariat to convey the views and questions of members to the HKPF and invite the HKPF to submit supplementary information. Then, the attending departments, the SWD and the EDB were invited to respond to members' enquiries.

43. Mr Roy CHAN, Assistant District Social Welfare Officer (Shatin) 1 of the SWD gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) he believed that the number of residents with emotional distress in the district was higher than the number of requests for assistance received by the SWD. The SWD encouraged people with emotional distress to seek help from Integrated Family Service Centres if necessary, and members of the public should also keep an eye on the emotion of those around them and advise those in need to seek early assistance. He continued that as help seekers were troubled by family or mental health issues, they would relatively easily be affected by the extensive media coverage recently on social events and develop emotional problems; and
- (b) when handling requests for assistance, the SWD would first have social workers assess the conditions of the persons concerned and they would be referred to the Clinical Psychology Unit if necessary for appropriate counselling services. Besides, the SWD was in contact with other departments while promoting mental health awareness, and all departments could refer civil servants or their families in need to the SWD for follow-up. Under the existing mechanism, the SWD did not require non-governmental organisations to report the number of requests for assistance received to the SWD on individual social events.

44. Ms Elaine CHAN, Assistant District Social Welfare Officer (Shatin) 2 of the SWD gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) in order to strengthen the mental health and stress tolerance of young people, the SWD had allocated resources to more than 400 secondary schools across the

territory to implement “two school social workers for each school” since the 2019/20 school year. In response to the social events in recent months, the SWD had in particular deployed resources to urge organisations providing services to schools to commence services for more than 220 secondary schools from mid-July to the end of August this year, which would be before the start of the new school year. In addition to taking care of the needs of students, the SWD had also focused on providing support for school social workers in the district. A series of sharing sessions and orientation activities were held since August this year to help them meet the challenges when school started and establish a collaborative network in the district. Clinical psychologists had also been arranged to explain methods of handling students’ emotions to school social workers and counselling teachers, and to care for the personal emotions of the social workers;

- (b) given that the recent social controversy had caused emotional distress to some young people and their families, the SWD had written to social welfare organisations responsible for youth services and/or Integrated Family Service Centres / Integrated Services Centres to support and encourage them to strengthen emotional support for young people and their families during this challenging time, and to flexibly deploy manpower to strengthen outreaching service, emergency support, counselling and other work. Non-governmental organisations operating youth services could also expand their service targets from young people aged 24 or below to those aged 29 or below, according to the circumstances and their capabilities. The SWD would consider the impact of the current special circumstances and handle with flexibility in the review of the service performance of relevant social welfare organisations under their Funding and Service Agreements this year. Also, the SWD would also invite organisations to propose projects that met the needs of young people and their families at present, and if there were suitable projects, the SWD would provide resources in support;
- (c) to further support young people with emotional distress, the SWD encouraged youth service units to refer cases to the Clinical Psychology Unit of the SWD for services. Meanwhile, the Government had set up 5 Cyber Youth Support Teams this year to better reach out to at-risk and hidden youths through the online platform. The service of Integrated Community Centre for Mental Wellness had also been strengthened and its service targets expanded to include secondary students. Schools or members of the community were welcomed to refer young people in need to the centre for follow-up; and
- (d) she pointed out that, seeing that the mental health of many members of the public, as well as family relations, had been affected by social events, the SWD had established community care working groups with non-governmental organisations providing various welfare services in the district to jointly plan the introduction of special projects in the Sha Tin District, such as dispatching the Mobile Van for Publicity Service on Mental Wellness to provide 10 roving street counter activities in each community in the Sha Tin District this year. In addition to providing mental health education, it would also provide residents with simple screening assessments, preliminary counselling and instant emotional support and referral services on the spot, etc., so as to identify more hidden people in need and to provide timely support to the residents in the Sha

Tin District.

45. Ms CHIANG Lam gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the EDB had issued relevant guidelines to secondary and primary schools across the territory in late August this year and the contents covered how schools should support students' emotions and behaviours, etc. Most schools had also set up task forces prior to the commencement of school to deal with the foreseeable difficulties after school had started. She said that, as students might not necessarily take the initiative to seek help regarding personal emotional problems, the EDB had reminded teachers to keep an eye out for abnormal psychological conditions in students and had reminded teachers to care for them; and
- (b) the EDB kept close contact with principals of secondary and primary schools, and the principals would also keep the EDB informed of the situations of the school in due time. If schools found that students had emotional problems after school started, they would arrange for social workers and counsellors to support students' needs or open classrooms for counselling purposes. Most secondary schools in the district had been in smooth operation since the start of the new school year, and most students were willing to communicate with the counsellors. In primary schools, there were not many requests for assistance and the situation remained largely as usual. Moreover, the EDB was also concerned about the psychological well-being of teachers and teachers could obtain services from social workers and counsellors if necessary.

46. Mr WAI Hing-cheung expressed his concern that civil servants and school teachers would not ask for help even when needed to avoid being labelled as emotionally distressed or to avoid affecting their work. Therefore, he asked what other ways the SWD would use to contact those refraining from medical treatment besides deploying the Mobile Van for Publicity Service on Mental Wellness and whether the measures were sufficient. Moreover, he stressed that the pre-employment psychological assessment of police officers was implemented 4 years after the shooting incident of TSUI Po-ko, i.e., in 2010, while TSUI Po-ko joined the HKPF in 1993. It showed that psychological assessments were necessary both before and after the recruitment of police officers to ensure that they had good psychological quality to carry out their duty.

47. Mr Michael YUNG emphasised that he was very concerned about the mental status of police officers on duty, and the pre-employment psychological assessment alone was not enough to determine whether the police officers could maintain a good psychological state in the future when they were under pressure at work and facing public criticism. Police officers were equipped with lethal arms when they were on duty and even on leave. He did not want to see another CHU King-wai in the HKPF. Besides, although not all police officers addressing the conflict at New Town Plaza on 14 July were necessarily from Sha Tin or New Territories South Police District, he urged the SWD to review whether the current support for police mental health services was adequate, or whether seminar and other activities should be held to help police officers and raise their awareness in this respect.

48. The Chairman asked whether the SWD had available information showing people originally in a poor mental state had become more unstable under the influence of social

unrests in recent months, and how the SWD would further reach out to members of the public who were reluctant to actively seek assistance and whether there were proactive measures to be taken to alleviate emotional problems of the public and to repair their relationship with each other.

49. Mr Roy CHAN said that the SWD had maintained liaison with the HKPF on district level and welcomed the police to refer staff or their families in need to the SWD for follow-up, and would contact the police on matters that members were concerned about.

50. Ms Elaine CHAN added that, in addition to non-governmental organisations actively approaching people in need through outreaching services, the SWD also understood that strengthening public awareness and the education of emotional and mental problems were extremely important in dealing with cases that refrained to seek help. The SWD would cooperate and establish working groups with different service units of non-governmental organisations through carrying out large-scale community programmes in the district to continually reach out to people of different age groups, help residents learn more about mental disorders and understand their own needs, and identify their needs in various aspects such as emotions and interpersonal relationships in advance, and provide consultation services, immediate emotional support and referral services.

51. The Chairman said that she understood that many members were very concerned about the psychological state of police officers and asked the Secretariat to convey their views and to request a response from the HKPF. Also, she said that she had received a provisional motion from Mr LAI Tsz-yan. She agreed to handle it and asked for members' views.

52. Mr Rick HUI said he was the mover of the provisional motion.

53. The Chairman said that Mr LAI Tsz-yan had just indicated at the meeting that there would be a provisional motion, and asked the Secretariat why the provisional motion received was raised by Mr Rick HUI.

54. Ms Amy YU, Executive Officer (District Council) 1 of the Sha Tin District Office said that Mr LAI Tsz-yan had just mentioned that there would be a provisional motion but the mover of provisional motion she received subsequently was Mr Rick HUI.

55. The Chairman and the Vice-Chairman asked whether the Sha Tin District Council Standing Orders (Standing Orders) had specified the procedures for handling provisional motions.

56. Ms Amy YU said, according to the procedures, members had to first submit the provisional motion to the Secretary, and the provisional motion would be submitted to the Chairman for reference after the Secretary had made a record of it, and the mover of the provisional motion she received was Mr Rick HUI.

57. The Chairman said that she understood and invited Mr Rick HUI to introduce his provisional motion.

58. Mr Rick HUI said that he was concerned about the use of violence by the police when dealing with conflicts between the police and the public. The response of the HKPF to the questions had not mentioned how the police would prevent police officers in a poor mental

state from using excessive violence. He hoped that police officers could remember their vows when they took office and stay calm when addressing conflicts between the police and the public. Therefore, he proposed the following provisional motion:

“The Education and Welfare Committee of the Sha Tin District Council is strongly concerned about the mental and psychological states of police officers, and requests the formulation of measures to stipulate that any police officer who verbally or physically insults or provokes members of the public while on duty at the scene of conflicts between the police and the public will be suspended immediately for investigation and receive psychological counselling and treatment.

Moreover, police officers should read out the following police vow 3 times every time they set off for the scene of conflicts between the police and the public: ‘I will execute the powers and duties of my office honestly, faithfully and diligently without fear of or favour to any person and with malice or ill-will toward none’ to ensure that the police officers on duty will adhere to the spirit of ‘Serve with Pride and Care’, handle conflicts in a positive mental state, and always remember the original intention of the vow.”

Mr YAU Man-chun, Mr YIP Wing, Mr Michael YUNG, Mr Wilson LI, Mr Sunny CHIU, Mr LAI Tsz-yan, Mr TING Tsz-yuen, Mr CHING Cheung-ying, Mr Billy CHAN, Mr CHAN Nok-hang, Ms TSANG So-lai, Mr LI Sai-hung, and Mr NG Kam-hung seconded the motion.

59. Mr MOK Kam-kwai said that he would propose to revise the motion.

60. Mr TONG Hok-leung expressed regret over the contents of the provisional motion, and opined that it was ostensibly concerned about the mental state of the police but was in fact intended to attack the work of enforcement of the police, which had little to do with the question raised by Mr WAI Hing-cheung on the mental health of police officers.

61. Mr HO Hau-cheung appreciated the question raised by Mr WAI Hing-cheung, as it focused on the mental distress caused by the conflicts between the police and the public in recent months and covered various levels extensively, including exploring the impact of the incident on all stakeholders such as the police, members of the public, students and staff of the plaza. However, he opined that the provisional motion was biased to only focus on the HKPF, and the Sha Tin District Council (STDC) should give suggestions from an overall perspective. It was said among the people that the HKPF was the most innocent, members of the public were the most helpless and violence was the most unscrupulous. No one wanted conflicts to happen, and yet the police officers, as law enforcers, were already under great pressure as they had to handle problems as ordered. He added that as the current social unrest was still going on, and the police was still carrying out their duties as ordered, the STDC should not focus only on the police. The provisional motion should raise comprehensive suggestions on each concern raised by Mr WAI Hing-cheung. Although he was not ruling out the possibility that some police officers were mentally troubled and “overreacted”, but most of them were devoted to their duties. Also, members were not professionals, he doubted if requesting police officers to read out the vow 3 times would be effective in relieving their mental stress, and was afraid that it could backfire.

62. Mr Sunny CHIU disagreed with the views of Mr TONG Hok-leung and opined that the provisional motion had no intention of persecuting the police. It just requested police officers

to read out the vow before heading to the scene of conflicts for law enforcement. The motion had taken into account the fact that police officers did lose control when dealing with recent conflicts and that the police should bear great responsibility. It was reasonable that they were concerned about their mental state when they carried out their duty. He asked whether the Chairman would request the HKPF to respond to the concerns of members.

63. The Chairman reiterated that she would convey the concerns and questions of and from members to the HKPF through the Secretariat and invite the HKPF to respond to them. The HKPF was not a standing representative of the EWC. Although the Secretariat had invited the HKPF to send representatives to attend the meeting, the HKPF replied that they could not do so. She said that she would now handle the provisional motion.

64. Mr LAI Tsz-yan asked whether there would be a limit on the number of speeches for the discussion of the provisional motion.

65. Ms Amy YU said that the Standing Orders did not mention a limit on the number of speeches in motion discussions.

66. The Chairman said that there were still 2 questions to be discussed on the agenda and there were other meetings in the afternoon. Therefore, she hoped to address the provisional motion as soon as possible.

67. Mr Rick HUI said that the Secretariat responded that there was no limit on the number of speeches in motion discussions, so he hoped that the Chairman would not restrict members' expression of their views. Although there were meetings in the afternoon, the EWC could resume the meeting on the following Tuesday.

68. The Chairman wanted to know the number of members that would like to express their views and hoped that members could give concise speeches without repetition.

69. Mr Rick HUI disagreed with the views of Mr TONG Hok-leung and Mr HO Hau-cheung that reading the vow would lower the morale of police officers and cause them to be even more out of control. He said that many police officers might have already forgotten about the contents of their vow when they took office. The purpose of the motion was to help police officers to be more vigilant when they read out the vow to not lose the sense of propriety in law enforcement so as not to aggravate the conflicts. He asked Mr HO Hau-cheung whether the police officers who provoked or insulted demonstrators were suitable to continue enforcement of the law, and whether it was unreasonable to ask them to leave the scene of demonstration for psychological counselling.

70. Mr YAU Man-chun opined that the Chairman was being unfair in presiding over the meeting and expressed his disappointment. There had been constant conflicts between the police and the public since June in the territory, and he hoped to educate police officers not to provoke the emotions of demonstrators through the motion to avoid situations that were out of control. As President Xi Jinping said, "by obeying the Party's command, we can fight and win and maintain excellent conduct". Everyone was proud of the police officers in the territory before June, but then the image of the police was destroyed. The Police should improve their image and restore the public's trust in them. He pointed out that police officers reading out their vow would help them keep calm and reduce conflicts, just as prayers could calm believers, and he hoped members could support the motion.

71. Mr YIP Wing disagreed that reading out the vow would cause police officers to lose control. He said that vows were also taken at weddings, and many couples would remind each other not to forget the promises they made on the wedding day when they had an argument. Since June this year, demonstrations and conflicts had been happening constantly, including the incidents where the police stormed into New Town Plaza on 14 July and chased and attacked demonstrators at the MTR station in late August. These incidents showed that many police officers had lost control and forgotten the vow they made when they joined the HKPF.

72. Mr Wilson LI said that everyone was very concerned about the mental state of police officers. At the previous meeting, members had relayed the views of members of the public to the police, while the representative of the police mentioned that police officers were also human beings and had emotions, but he pointed out that police officers should be professional. The image of police officers had improved in the recent decades; however, many members of the public now doubted if the police could be trusted. He cited the Yuen Long incident of attack as an example, where it took the police 39 minutes to arrive at the scene, which created doubts among members of the public. Also, the police once said that it was inappropriate for some police officers to describe demonstrators as “cockroaches”. He opined that the term implied serious hatred and discrimination and doubted whether the police could deal with these internal problems. He went on to say that the Government was the initiator of the conflicts in recent months and police officers were armed with lethal weapons when carrying out enforcement actions. He hoped the police could handle conflicts with a positive attitude and good psychological quality.

73. Mr NG Kam-hung hoped that the Secretariat would clarify that there was no limit in the number of speeches in the deliberation of provisional motions according to the Standing Orders and that there would be a resumption of the meeting on the following Tuesday. Also, he opined that the police could do as proposed in the motion and the contents did not mean to condemn any party. He responded that the view of Mr HO Hau-cheung that police officers might lose control if they had to read out the vow 3 times was illogical. If Mr HO Hau-cheung made a slip of the tongue, he would accept his apology. He hoped that the Chairman could allow all members to express their views as nobody wanted to see things getting worse.

74. Mr TING Tsz-yuen said that he was determined to become a policeman when he was young but his parents were against it. The good image that police officers had established in the past had changed significantly recently. The provisional motion intended to show concern for the mental state of the frontline police officers. He opined that the views of Mr HO Hau-cheung could be referred to and the proposal that the SWD should take the initiative to assist police officers and provide psychological counselling could be added to the motion. If the Government had announced to withdraw the Fugitive Offenders Ordinance amendment bill in early June, the police would not be in such a position.

75. Mr Michael YUNG said that police officers were under great pressure in the handling of conflicts, the spirit of the motion was to show concern for the psychological well-being of police officers. It was said that important words needed to be repeated 3 times, and therefore police officers should pause and read out the vow they made when they took office 3 times before they carried out their duty to remind themselves of the commitment of “Serve with Pride and Care” to the public on that day. He hoped that police officers could maintain a positive mental state whenever they faced public conflicts and avoid cases like that of Mr CHU King-wai in the future. He stressed that it was exactly because some police officers used unreasonable violence against demonstrators when on duty that the provisional motion was proposed here to ensure that police officers had good psychological quality and the wording

used in the motion was against police officers.

76. The Chairman said that she would listen to the suggestion of Mr YAU Man-chun to allow more members to comment on the issue, and she hoped members could value meeting time and try to avoid the need for the resumption of the meeting.

77. Mr HO Hau-cheung said that several members quoted the speech he made just now, but they took it out of context and what they said was not what he meant. He had worked in education for 34 years and had been in touch with different types of students. If teachers took coercive measures such as forcing naughty students to recite school rules, the students would be even less likely to obey. He pointed out that the provisional motion raised represented the entire STDC and it was not advisable to demand the police to act accordingly without knowing the effect of the measure as none of them were professionals. All members of the public across the territory had been affected by the recent social conflicts and the question raised by Mr WAI Hing-cheung took all walks of life into account. The motion put forward by members should not only target the police but members should suggest the Government to give its full attention to and support the mental health of different people.

78. The Chairman said that she received the amended motion submitted by Mr MOK Kam-kwai and agreed to handle it as it was not contradictory to the original motion.

79. Mr MOK Kam-kwai proposed the following revised motion:

“The Education and Welfare Committee of the Sha Tin District Council is strongly concerned about the ongoing social conflicts in recent months which have brought great pressure upon the psychological and mental states of members of the public, medical personnel, social workers, students and law enforcement officers. Government departments are requested to actively support communities, schools and families, to provide appropriate mental and psychological counselling as well as treatment to relieve negative emotions in society.”

Mr HO Hau-cheung seconded the motion.

80. Mr Rick HUI objected to the revision of the motion and opined that it made the specific measures in the original motion vague. Since they had a practical proposal, the task of looking for a solution of the problem should not be passed onto the Government. He cited an example and asked when naughty students disrespected the school rules, whether a school would tear off the school rules page in the handbook so that they did not even have to abide by the rules. He said that the revision of the motion harmed the spirit of the original motion and was disrespectful to members and Sha Tin residents.

81. Mr YAU Man-chun said the revised motion had not provided any proposal better than the original measure of repeating the vow 3 times. The number of times could be changed, but if the measure was cancelled, he asked what other proposals members had to alleviate the emotions of police officers to prevent them from losing control emotionally. If members considered reading out the vow ineffective or even have counter-productive, he asked whether they were assuming that all police officers were unable to control personal emotions. He suggested that Mr MOK Kam-kwai propose another provisional motion, otherwise they would propose to revise the motion again.

82. Mr Sunny CHIU said that the words “law enforcement officers” should not be used to replace that of “the police” in the revision of the motion. The SWD had explained earlier about how it would support members of the public with emotional problems. At present, the enforcement of the police was out of control, and some frontline police officers provoked members of the public with words and actions and had mental health issues, so they should be suspended for investigation and psychological counselling. He went on to say that the revised motion made no mention of the matter of concern in the original motion. He hoped members could propose another provisional motion and not be prejudicial so that everyone could express their own views and opinions.

83. Mr LAI Tsz-yan said that the specific suggestion in the original motion was deleted in the revised motion. He asked that why the STDC could not make specific suggestions to government departments. Although they were not professionals, at least members had been giving suggestions to various government departments and personnel, such as engineers and doctors, on different issues in the past 4 years of their term. He pointed out that the feasibility of the proposals should be examined by government departments, which could also decide whether they needed to be revised or not. He opined that if police officers would lose control after reading out the vow, it meant they were not sincere in serving members of the public. He hoped Mr MOK Kam-kwai and Mr HO Hau-cheung could retain the contents of the original motion.

84. Mr HO Hau-cheung said he proposed to revise the motion because the original motion was defective. He explained that if members were concerned about the current social situation, their proposal should be comprehensive. It would not be desirable to replace professional opinions with their opinions, or it could be counter-productive. He went on to say that the measure mentioned in the original motion was not convincing enough and he wanted to maintain the image of the STDC. Individual members were personally affected by this social incident, so it was not necessarily a good thing to propose a motion against the police at this time, and he asked members to reconsider.

85. Mr NG Kam-hung said that it was not rare for there to be 2 provisional motions during discussion at a meeting, but this revised motion was too different from the original version. Their goal was the same as that of the Chief Executive, which was “stop violence and curb disorder”. Their proposals might not be professional enough, but the HKPF could still consider them. The number of times of reading out the vow was not the most important, but this vow was only applicable to police officers. He hoped that members would allow more than 1 provisional motion.

86. Mr Michael YUNG said that members should work together and consider combining the 2 motions with different contents to cover not only the concern for the mental health of all sectors but also to keep the proposal for the police. He pointed out that it was because of the impartial report by Radio Television Hong Kong that everyone saw clearly that the police described demonstrators as “cockroaches” at the scene of the conflicts while members of the public called the police “black police”, and he deplored it. He hoped members could stop arguing and combine the 2 motions with different contents.

87. Mr TONG Hok-leung opined that the revised motion was more comprehensive. Different people in society were under great pressure including staff of the STDC. It would be too simple and naive to think that the problem could be solved with police officers reading out the vow 3 times. He asked members whether law-breakers would make no mistakes again just by reading out “I would not break the law” 3 times.

88. The Chairman said that although the time was 1:30 pm and the meeting should end by then, members could continue with the discussion of this motion if they wish to.

89. Mr CHAN Nok-hang opined that the original motion was quite reasonable and there was no intention against the police. The psychological conditions of police officers had been very unstable, and the goal of their actions was no longer to disperse the public but to make arrests, so repeating the vow was very important. The act aimed to help and remind police officers of their original intention, and self-treatment was more effective than psychological counselling.

90. Mr LAI Tsz-yan said that the STDC was supposed to provide suggestions to all government departments. Their suggestions should be submitted to government departments for assessment to see whether they could be adopted, and they should issue responses regarding the proposals. He opined that concrete motions did not necessarily had to be proposed by professionals. If members thought the motion was against police officers, they could propose different motions that covered all walks of society, even the demonstrators.

91. Mr WONG Yue-hon said that every member of the public in the territory had been affected by the social unrest in recent months, and he hoped the Government could attend to the emotional issues of all people. While demonstrators obeyed the law, law enforcement officers also enforced the law according to regulations. If the motion was to ask the Government to try to support police officers so that they could remain calm, he would support the motion. But he did not believe that the method of the original motion to require police officers to read out the vow 3 times before carrying out their duty would be effective.

92. Mr CHING Cheung-ying said most members and members of the public opposed to the police's use of tear gas in residential areas. Mr Rick HUI's motion was very reasonable and he hoped that police officers could reflect on whether their behaviours were serving members of the public and striving for excellence. He opined that there was no need for members to focus on the number of times of repeating the vow or its effectiveness. The police should consider the proposal and reflect on whether their actions in recent months were for the sake of the public. He hoped that members would seek common ground while reserving differences in the revision of the motion and include the views of Mr MOK Kam-kwai in it.

93. Mr SIU Hin-hong said that in psychology, repeating something 3 times could be used in hypnotherapy and it was called the "self-actualisation method"; however, it was ineffective in other situations. He opined that the SWD should play a leading role in providing support to different people affected in society, including demonstrators. He opined that when demonstrations subsided, the emotions of police officers would calm down subsequently, so there was no need to put forward an ineffective motion.

94. The Chairman said she had received a revised motion from Mr YAU Man-chun, and agreed to handle it.

95. Mr YAU Man-chun said that he had further revised and combined the 2 motions upon integrating the views of members of different viewpoints, and proposed the following revised motion:

"The Education and Welfare Committee of the Sha Tin District Council is strongly concerned about the ongoing social conflicts in recent months which have brought

great pressure upon the psychological and mental states of members of the public, medical personnel, social workers, students and the Police. Government departments are requested to actively support communities, schools and families, to provide appropriate mental and psychological counselling as well as treatment to relieve negative emotions in society. In addition, the Committee requests authorities to formulate measures to stipulate that if any police officer verbally or physically insults or provokes members of the public while on duty at the scene of conflicts between the police and the public, such police officer will be suspended immediately for investigation and receive psychological counselling and treatment.

Moreover, the Committee urges police officers to read out the following police vow 3 times every time they set off for the scene of conflicts between the police and the public: ‘I will execute the powers and duties of my office honestly, faithfully and diligently without fear of or favour to any person and with malice or ill-will toward none’ to ensure that the police officers on duty would adhere to the spirit of ‘Serve with Pride and Care’, handle conflicts in a positive mental state, and always remember the original intention of the vow.”

Mr Rick HUI, Mr YIP Wing, Mr Michael YUNG, Mr Wilson LI, Mr Sunny CHIU, Mr LAI Tsz-yan, Mr TING Tsz-yuen, Mr CHING Cheung-ying, Mr Billy CHAN, Mr CHAN Nok-hang, Ms TSANG So-lai, Mr LI Sai-hung, and Mr NG Kam-hung seconded the motion.

96. Mr CHAN Nok-hang requested for an open ballot and was supported by 4 members.

97. Mr WONG Yue-hon asked whether there would be a vote on the revised motion raised by Mr MOK Kam-kwai after voting on the motion raised by Mr YAU Man-chun.

98. Ms Amy YU said that according to Order 20 of the Standing Orders, the Council should first take a vote on the amended motion. If amendment to the original motion was moved by more than 1 member, the Council should first deal with the amendment moved at a later time.

99. Mr CHIU Man-leong said he would further revise the motion.

100. The Chairman asked Mr MOK Kam-kwai to read out his revised motion, and said that she and Mr Tiger WONG were not seconders.

101. Mr Michael YUNG said he would propose another revised motion, because the Standing Orders did not limit the number of times that members could propose revision to a motion.

102. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had reminded her that according to the Order 19 of the Standing Orders, members who had already proposed a revised motion could not propose another revised motion, so Mr MOK Kam-kwai’s further revised motion was rejected. She said there would be a vote on the revised motion proposed by Mr YAU Man-chun.

103. Mr LI Sai-wing proposed to adjourn the meeting for 10 minutes before the vote to allow members in need to use the washroom.

104. The Chairman adjourned the meeting for 5 minutes.

(The meeting resumed.)

105. The Chairman put the motion to the vote and, as the Council should first deal with the amendment moved at a later time, the revised motion proposed by Mr YAU Man-chun would be voted on first.

106. Members did not pass the provisional motion in paragraph 95 with 15 affirmative votes, 17 negative votes, and no abstention votes. The details were as follows:

Members who voted in the affirmative (15)

Mr TING Tsz-yuen, Mr YAU Man-chun, Mr NG Kam-hung, Mr LI Sai-hung, Mr Wilson LI, Mr Michael YUNG, Mr Rick HUI, Mr Billy CHAN, Mr CHAN Nok-hang, Ms TSANG So-lai, Mr CHING Cheung-ying, Mr YIP Wing, Mr Sunny CHIU, Mr WAI Hing-cheung and Mr LAI Tsz-yan.

Members who voted in the negative (17)

Mr Tiger WONG, Mr HO Hau-cheung, Mr LI Sai-wing, Mr CHIU Man-leong, Ms LAM Chung-yan, Mr YIU Ka-chun, Mr TONG Hok-leung, Mr Victor LEUNG, Mr MOK Kam-kwai, Ms CHAN Man-kuen, Ms Iris WONG, Mr WONG Yue-hon, Mr WONG Ka-wing, Ms TUNG Kin-lei, Mr PUN Kwok-shan, Mr SIU Hin-hong and Ms Scarlett PONG.

107. Members unanimously endorsed the provisional motion proposed by Mr MOK Kam-kwai in paragraph 79 with 32 affirmative votes. The details were as follows:

Members who voted in the affirmative (32)

Mr TING Tsz-yuen, Mr Tiger WONG, Mr YAU Man-chun, Mr HO Hau-cheung, Mr NG Kam-hung, Mr LI Sai-wing, Mr LI Sai-hung, Mr Wilson LI, Mr CHIU Man-leong, Ms LAM Chung-yan, Mr YIU Ka-chun, Mr TONG Hok-leung, Mr Michael YUNG, Mr Victor LEUNG, Mr MOK Kam-kwai, Mr Rick HUI, Mr Billy CHAN, Ms CHAN Man-kuen, Mr CHAN Nok-hang, Ms TSANG So-lai, Mr CHING Cheung-ying, Ms Iris WONG, Mr WONG Yue-hon, Mr WONG Ka-wing, Mr YIP Wing, Ms TUNG Kin-lei, Mr Sunny CHIU, Mr PUN Kwok-shan, Mr WAI Hing-cheung, Mr LAI Tsz-yan, Mr SIU Hin-hong and Ms Scarlett PONG.

108. The Chairman said that as the meeting had overrun, she was adjourning the meeting at 2:04 pm, and decided to leave the remaining 2 questions, 1 information item and 2 information papers for discussion at the resumption of the meeting.

Date of Next Meeting

109. The resumption of the meeting was scheduled to be held at 2:30 pm on 17 September 2019 (Tuesday).

110. The meeting was adjourned at 2:04 pm.

November 2019