

Sha Tin District Council
Minutes of the 4th Meeting of
the Health and Environment Committee in 2018

Date : 12 July 2018 (Thursday)
Time : 2:30 pm
Venue : Sha Tin District Council Conference Room
 4/F, Sha Tin Government Offices

<u>Present</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Time of joining the meeting</u>	<u>Time of leaving the meeting</u>
Mr WONG Yue-hon (Chairman)	DC Member	2:30 pm	6:50 pm
Mr HO Hau-cheung, SBS, MH	DC Chairman	2:30 pm	6:32 pm
Mr PANG Cheung-wai, Thomas, SBS, JP	DC Vice-Chairman	2:30 pm	5:56 pm
Mr CHAN Billy Shiu-yeung	DC Member	2:30 pm	4:37 pm
Mr CHAN Kwok-keung, James	”	4:03 pm	4:51 pm
Ms CHAN Man-kuen	”	2:30 pm	5:20 pm
Mr CHAN Nok-hang	”	2:39 pm	4:48 pm
Mr CHING Cheung-ying, MH	”	2:30 pm	6:35 pm
Mr CHIU Chu-pong, Sunny	”	2:36 pm	6:50 pm
Mr CHIU Man-leong	”	4:18 pm	6:50 pm
Mr HUI Yui-yu, Rick	”	2:39 pm	3:15 pm
Mr LAI Tsz-yan	”	2:30 pm	6:50 pm
Ms LAM Chung-yan	”	2:30 pm	6:10 pm
Mr LEE Chi-wing, Alvin, MH	”	5:13 pm	6:35 pm
Mr LEUNG Ka-fai, Victor	”	2:30 pm	5:22 pm
Mr LI Sai-hung	”	2:38 pm	6:50 pm
Mr LI Sai-wing	”	2:30 pm	5:52 pm
Mr LI Wing-shing, Wilson	”	2:30 pm	5:28 pm
Mr MOK Kam-kwai, BBS	”	2:42 pm	3:57 pm
Mr NG Kam-hung	”	2:42 pm	4:43 pm
Ms PONG Scarlett Oi-lan, BBS, JP	”	3:08 pm	5:58 pm
Mr PUN Kwok-shan, MH, JP	”	2:48 pm	6:35 pm
Mr SIU Hin-hong	”	2:30 pm	6:30 pm
Mr TING Tsz-yuen	”	2:30 pm	5:45 pm
Mr TONG Hok-leung	”	2:30 pm	6:14 pm
Ms TSANG So-lai	”	2:57 pm	5:06 pm
Ms TUNG Kin-lei	”	3:01 pm	6:50 pm
Mr WAI Hing-cheung	”	2:30 pm	6:50 pm
Mr WONG Fu-sang, Tiger	”	2:30 pm	6:50 pm
Mr WONG Hok-lai	”	2:30 pm	6:50 pm
Mr WONG Ka-wing, MH	”	2:40 pm	6:32 pm
Ms WONG Ping-fan, Iris	”	2:30 pm	6:50 pm
Mr YAU Man-chun	”	2:38 pm	3:49 pm
Mr YIP Wing	”	2:30 pm	6:32 pm
Mr YIU Ka-chun, MH	”	2:30 pm	6:50 pm
Mr YUNG Ming-chau, Michael	”	2:30 pm	6:50 pm
Mr MOK Man-lok, Mannix (Secretary)	Executive Officer (District Council) 1 / Sha Tin District Office		

In Attendance

Ms CHENG Yuen-yi, Janny
Mr LAI Wing-chi, Derek

Ms MOK Kit-ye

Mr LEE Chee-kwan

Mr PANG Tak-chiu

Mr YUEN Chun-kit, Derek

Title

Acting Assistant District Officer (Sha Tin)
District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Sha Tin) /
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Housing Manager (Tai Po, North & Shatin 3) /
Housing Department
Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Regional N) 4 /
Environmental Protection Department
Deputy District Leisure Manager (Sha Tin) 2 /
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Senior Executive Officer (District Council) /
Sha Tin District Office

In Attendance by Invitation

Professor LI Kam-tao, Philip

Ms Stephanie YEUNG

Mr CHAN Chung-wai, Chris
Ms YEUNG Yu-shan, Alice

Mr LEUNG Wai-yiu, Anthony

Mr YIP Sin-hang

Ms KWOK Ka-yu, Kave

Mr CHAN Ka-shing, Kenny
Ms WONG Sze-wing, Elsa

Title

Deputy Hospital Chief Executive (Planning and Community Services) /
Prince of Wales Hospital / Hospital Authority
Senior Manager (Communications and Community Relations) /
Prince of Wales Hospital / Hospital Authority
Executive Officer (General) / Sha Tin District Office
Senior Field Officer (Avian Influenza) /
Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department
Veterinarian (Avian Influenza Surveillance) /
Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department
Wetland & Fauna Conservation Officer (Enforcement) /
Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department
Assistant District Leisure Manager (Sha Tin) 3 /
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Executive Assistant (District Council) 5 / Sha Tin District Office
Executive Assistant (District Council) 8 / Sha Tin District Office

Absent

Ms YUE Shin-man (Vice-Chairman)
Mr CHENG Tsuk-man
Mr MAK Yun-pui

Title

DC Member	(Application for leave of absence received)
”	(”)
”	(”)

Action**Welcoming Remarks**

The Chairman welcomed members and representatives of government departments to the fourth meeting of the Health and Environment Committee (HEC) of the year.

Applications for Leave of Absence

2. The Chairman said that the Secretariat of the Sha Tin District Council (STDC) had received the applications for leave of absence in writing from the following members:

Ms YUE Shin-man	Official commitment
Mr CHIU Man-leong	”
Mr MAK Yun-pui	”
Mr CHENG Tsuk-man	Other reasons

3. Members unanimously approved the applications for leave of absence submitted by the members above.

Confirmation of the Minutes of the Meeting Held on 10 May 2018

(HEC Minutes 3/2018)

4. Members unanimously confirmed the above minutes of the meeting.

Matters Arising

Responses of the Relevant Government Department to Matters Arising from the Previous Meeting

(Paper No. HE 28/2018)

5. The Chairman said that he had written to the Civil Aviation Department (CAD) and expressed dissatisfaction with the absence of a CAD representative at the HEC meeting to answer members' further questions. The HEC later received a written reply from the CAD, which said that it did not send a representative to the meeting because it had basically responded to related questions in writing.

6. Members noted the above paper.

Discussion Items

2018-2019 Revised Work Plans and Funding Applications of Working Groups under the Committee

(Paper No. HE 29/2018)

7. The Chairman pointed out that under Order 40(6) of the Sha Tin District Council Standing Orders, “‘a standing working group’ should draw up the work plan for the first quarter of each financial year, and submit it to the relevant committee for endorsement. Any amendment to the work plan should be submitted to the relevant committee for endorsement. ‘The standing working group’ should submit the work plan to the STDC for endorsement if necessary.” In order to let the Working Groups under the Committee start the preparatory work as soon as possible, the Working Groups had approved the 2018-2019 work plans and relevant funding applications.

8. Members unanimously endorsed the above paper.

Updated Membership Lists of Working Groups under the Committee

(Paper No. HE 30/2018)

9. Members unanimously endorsed the above paper.

2018/19 Work Plan of the New Territories East Cluster

(Paper No. HE 31/2018)

10. The Chairman said that only one round of speeches would be allowed since there were many items on the agenda today. He welcomed representatives of the Hospital Authority (HA) to the meeting for the sake of the said paper. He asked the HA to provide more information on the Redevelopment of Prince of Wales Hospital (PWH), Phase 2, in addition to the briefing on

the work plan. Professor Philip LI, Deputy Hospital Chief Executive (Planning and Community Services) of the PWH of the HA briefly introduced the contents of the paper.

11. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) the latest news reports said that antihypertensive drugs used in hospitals contained carcinogens. But the Secretary for Food and Health said that patients could continue taking the drugs and needed not worry. He asked how many patients were involved in the New Territories East Cluster (NTEC) or Sha Tin. He wondered whether patients would stop medication by themselves before their next follow-up appointments because of concerns, and whether hospitals would accelerate the process of drug replacement for that reason;
- (b) due to coordination with physical or occupational therapies, such services could only be provided on weekends. He asked whether more manpower was deployed or whether employees were asked to work overtime. He was worried that employees would be more likely to suffer from work injuries if they did not have adequate rest;
- (c) the issue of mental health services in Ma On Shan had also been mentioned at the meeting of the Education and Welfare Committee (EWC). He asked whether cheaper psychotropic drugs had more side effects. Some patients might stop medication by themselves due to the many side effects. He wondered whether doctors would prescribe better drugs if patients complained about side effects;
- (d) he understood that after the inclusion of acute beds into in-patient services, 13% to 15% of beds were added in each ward in general. Hospital staff might be overwhelmed if there was an increase only in beds but not in manpower. He asked whether the HA would consider setting up more day rehabilitation centres or employing more people in future to cope with the problem; and
- (e) although Children's Hospital was not located in the Sha Tin district, he wondered whether members could be informed of its operation before its opening. In addition, he asked whether child patients in New Territories East would be referred to the Children's Hospital.

12. The views of Mr CHAN Nok-hang were summarised below:

- (a) he hoped that the HA could replace the problematic antihypertensive drugs for patients as soon as possible. If patients stopped medication by themselves, their conditions might be affected; and
- (b) a female resident told him that her mother had been admitted to Queen Mary Hospital (QMH). But she lived in Sha Tin and found it inconvenient to take care of her mother. He asked whether patients could be transferred to hospitals in Sha Tin upon doctors' approval, so that their families could take good care of them.

13. Mr Thomas PANG said that it was a good thing to increase the healthcare manpower, since members in the community often complained about long waiting time in hospital. Some people had to wait for more than an hour just to get several medicines. The demand for medical services was constantly increasing. Members might not be able to get a thorough

picture from the work plan alone. For example, they might wanted to know whether there was improvement regarding the waiting time for first appointment at specialist out-patient clinics or the medical manpower. Some charts and illustrations might be desirable. The Phase II expansion project of the PWH had commenced. He asked whether all the items had been approved by the Legislative Council, and whether members could help convey some issues to the Government, so as to expedite related works.

14. Ms CHAN Man-kuen remembered that the quotas for general out-patient (GOP) services had been increased in previous years, 8 000 of which were in Sha Tin, which was helpful for local residents. She asked how many of the 24 150 additional quotas would be assigned to Sha Tin, and whether the HA had reviewed the matter after the increase in the previous year. She said that members had suggested introducing evening out-patient (EOP) services at Yuen Chau Kok General Out-patient Clinic. She asked whether the HA would consider providing relevant services with an increase in manpower.

15. The views of Mr PUN Kwok-shan were summarised below:

- (a) it was a good thing for hospitals to offer outreach services. He asked whether the assessment service would be extended to the elderly community centres; and
- (b) he enquired about the effectiveness of adding posts in mental rehabilitation services. The PWH was promoting public-private partnership (PPP) programme. Some participants were given a telephone number. But their calls were never answered and their messages were never replied to. He hoped that the HA would make improvements.

16. The views of Mr Wilson LI were summarised below:

- (a) on page 10, it was mentioned that more and more people in Hong Kong were having eye problems. He asked about the specific increase in the quota for the visual field test for glaucoma. He wondered whether the percentage could be provided in future for a better understanding of the number;
- (b) there was always an acute shortfall of beds in public hospitals during the influenza peak season, and private hospitals would provide assistance. He asked the HA whether there was any measure to further alleviate the problem; and
- (c) some anti-hypertensive drugs contained carcinogens and needed to be recalled due to the contamination of the raw materials in the Mainland. He wondered whether a complete recall was necessary in that case. He hoped that Professor LI could provide more explanations as to how patients taking related drugs would be treated and whether greater prudence should be exercised.

17. The views of Mr TING Tsz-yuen were summarised below:

- (a) as regards psychiatric out-patient services, he knew that many mental patients were not aware of their own illnesses, and few of them sought psychiatric out-patient services on their own. He asked whether resources could be mobilised to identify mental patients and to persuade them into receiving treatment. He enquired about the availability of psychiatric services in New Territories East apart from the ones in the PWH;

- (b) a female resident had complained to him that she went to the PWH for delivery and thought services in the hospital were good. However, there were many visiting doctors from overseas in the PWH in recent days. She understood the needs for academic exchanges. But many of those visiting doctors spoke foreign languages and could not communicate with patients. She hoped that the HA could arrange interpretation services in future; and
- (c) in another case, a resident had lung cancer and needed to take an anti-cancer drug called “PD1”, which, however, was not included in the drug formulary. The drug cost \$70,000 per dose and more than \$200,000 for four doses. Therefore, he hoped that HA would consider including the drug into the formulary.

18. Ms Scarlett PONG said that at the previous HEC meeting, the HA had mentioned that ‘E-Fill’, a pilot programme of Drug Refill Services, which had been already implemented in Tuen Mun and Sha Tin. She hoped that the HA could provide a briefing on the progress, such as any suggestions or complaints received. She asked the HA to provide related information after the meeting if it did not have the same at hand. At the EWC meeting this morning, it had been mentioned that many mental patients failed to take their medicine on time. She wondered how the HA would strengthen follow-up to ensure better care for mental patients discharged from hospital.

19. Mr Tiger WONG said that mental patients were taken care of by medical social workers during their stay in hospital and by those from community centres after their discharge. Some patients might resist new social workers because they did not know them well. He hoped that in future the HA could allow social workers from community centres to provide services for patients who were still in hospital or who were about to be discharged, so that they could get to know and trust each other sooner.

20. The views of the Chairman were summarised below:

- (a) as for strengthening of the PPP programme, he asked about the cost-effectiveness of the programme and the reactions of participants; and
- (b) members were all concerned about the antihypertensive drugs. He wondered whether the HA could arrange for early replacement if patients had concerns.

21. Professor Philip LI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the antihypertensive drugs contained only minimal amounts of carcinogens and had no immediate impact on health. He understood people’s concerns. However, upon assessing relevant risks and benefits, experts believed that patients could continue with the drugs for the time being in order to control their blood pressure. Doctors would prescribe other drugs as appropriate during follow-up consultations. Hospitals had set up hotlines for members of the public to consult pharmacists on the matter;
- (b) as regards occupational and physical therapies, the HA had increased manpower instead of asking employees to work overtime. The HA also cared about the occupational health of its employees;

- (c) regarding psychotropic drugs, the HA paid attention to whether patients followed doctors' instructions and whether the drugs would cause side effects. Both elderly and young patients could experience side effects after taking drugs, which would affect their regular medication. New drugs were constantly launched in the market. Psychiatric drugs with little side effects were not particularly expensive. And the HA would not prescribe such drugs on fewer occasions only for cost consideration. The HA had a mechanism for and expert teams to review the introduction of new drugs;
- (d) in some cases, the HA increased beds in existing wards. However, under the current work plan, the 60 additional medical beds would be set up in a new ward in the PWH, and more doctors, nurses, ward attendants as well as allied health professionals, would be recruited. He was aware that members were interested in learning more about Children's Hospital. He promised to convey members' aspiration to the hospital;
- (e) for individual cases, it would be feasible for patients to be transferred from QMH to the PWH if they wished so, subject to the decision of the medical team at QMH. If they so desired, patients and their families could file an application with QMH, which would contact the PWH for appropriate arrangements;
- (f) as for the waiting time for drug dispensing services, pharmacies had heavy daily workload but the express dispensing system launched a couple of years ago had improved the situation. The overall waiting time could be shortened under the express dispensing system if the patient needed to collect only one drug. The policy applied if a patient needed to collect only one drug, which reduced the overall waiting time. For specialist out-patient services, the overall waiting time was long and the actual time could be provided for the HEC after the meeting;
- (g) regarding the redevelopment of the PWH, the first instalment had been approved by the Legislative Council, while another instalment which involved a larger sum was pending approval;
- (h) over 8,000 additional GOP quotas would be allocated to Sha Tin in 2018/19, while 24 750 quotas were allocated to the NTEC. There were several clinics in Sha Tin and each clinic was allocated with additional quotas. The HA was aware of the public demand for EOP services and it also studied the matter regularly. However, the launch of related services would require not only additional doctors and nurses, but also the provision of comprehensive supports. The HA needed to review the cost-effectiveness of the practice;
- (i) at present, hospital outreach services mainly covered elderly homes and seniors at home. The HA would work with district elderly community centres where appropriate. The Project on Peer Support Service was intended to help psychiatric patients and it was introduced only after HA Central Coordinating Committee in Psychiatry's discussion. He said that he was a kidney specialist himself. On many occasions he would ask his patients to help each other by sharing their experience of sickness and treatment;
- (j) as for the PPP programme, he was not very clear about the response to telephone consultation for the time being. He asked members to provide related information

after the meeting. However, as far as he was aware, the scheme was going smoothly, with satisfactory reactions from participants;

- (k) Mr Wilson LI had mentioned glaucoma-related data. He said that he did not have related information at hand but promised to provide the same after the meeting;
- (l) as for the shortfall of beds, there were actually other plans to help patients at the same time. For example, doctors and nurses at the A&E Department would examine suspected cases of influenza and arranged for related patients to have earlier follow-up consultations, so that the patients needed not to be hospitalised. Besides, hospitals would send geriatric specialists and outreaching nurses to the A&E Department to handle cases involving elderly people. In addition, there were discharge lounges in hospitals. Patients to be discharged could get some rest in the lounge first and their beds could be vacated earlier;
- (m) he was aware that psychiatrists were very concerned about the follow-up treatment of serious mental patients in the community. There were also teams to provide services for elderly mental patients at home or in elderly homes;
- (n) psychiatric specialist out-patient services were available not only at the PWH, but also in several areas in New Territories East. For example, both Sha Tin Hospital and Tai Po Hospital had psychiatric wards. And Alice Ho Miu Ling Nethersole Hospital provided psychiatric specialist out-patient services as well as psychiatric in-patient services for children and youths. Although there were no in-patient psychiatric wards in the North District, there was a psychiatric specialist clinic;
- (o) as regards the presence of obstetricians and gynaecologists from overseas, he explained that due to the shortage of medical practitioners in Hong Kong, the HA engaged non-locally-trained doctors by means of limited registration, subject to the approval by The Medical Council of Hong Kong. If patients and their families had difficulties communicating with overseas doctors, related hospitals would certainly arrange interpretation services;
- (p) drugs for treating lung cancer were complicated. There were many different targeted drugs, and some of them were quite expensive. The HA had launched different schemes to help patients in need, such as the Samaritan Fund and the Community Care Fund; and
- (q) the HA would launch the “E-Fill” programme within this year. The programme was intended to serve patients with longer follow-up period. For example, if patients needed to have follow-up consultations after 18 or 24 weeks, pharmacists would follow up on their medication during the period in order to check the effectiveness and side effects of related drugs. As the scheme was still an early stage, there was no effectiveness analysis report for the time being.

22. The Chairman declared that the meeting was adjourned for five minutes.

Strategy and Work for Improvement of Environmental Hygiene in Hong Kong
(Paper No. HE 20/2018)

23. The Chairman welcomed Mr Derek LAI, District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Sha Tin) of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) to the meeting. Mr Derek LAI briefly introduced the paper.

24. The views of Mr HO Hau-cheung were summarised below:

- (a) in terms of law enforcement, the FEHD had issued more than 40 000 fixed penalty tickets against public cleanliness offences across the territory. He would like to know the figure of the Sha Tin District. As for unauthorised bills and posters, over 2 300 fixed penalty tickers had been issued, and 373 of them were issued in the Sha Tin District, with an average of one ticket per day. 6 800 fixed penalty tickets had been issued against illegal shop extension across the territory and only 52 were issued in the Sha Tin District, with an average of one ticket per week;
- (b) the problem of water seepage had been discussed several times, but it was not highlighted in the paper. He said that shirking the responsibility to building management organisations was falling short of the public's expectation;
- (c) in view of problems relating to wet markets, the Government had allocated \$2 billion to launch a 10-year Market Modernisation Programme. The installation of air-conditioning sytem in Tai Wai Market required the consent of at least 85% of the tenants, who would need to pay for the air-conditioning bills as well. He personally found it unreasonable. He wondered why they did not need to pay for electricity and other miscellaneous fees but were expected to share the air-conditioning bills, which already was covered by the rent; and
- (d) he was disappointed and concerned about the FEHD's environmental hygiene strategy, because the FEHD showed no creativity in addressing and failed to target long-lasting problems. Paragraph 29 of the paper mentioned "zero tolerance". He said that he would carefully review the number of fixed penalty tickets issued by the FEHD next year.

25. Mr Thomas PANG said that everyone was concerned about environmental hygiene issues. And his fellow party members had just met the Secretary for Food and Health for related discussion. The STDC had always mentioned different environmental hygiene black spots. But the annual work reports had always failed to mention whether the problems had been duly solved. He hoped that the FEHD considered including in future work reports the progress of dealing with the hygiene black spots mentioned by the STDC.

26. Mr NG Kam-hung said that unauthorised display of bills could be found across Sha Tin. Bus stops, railings, road signs and light boxes, etc., were covered by bills. Some of the bills even covered the direction on road signs. And some were even posted at Tin Sum Police Station. He asked the FEHD how the problem could be addressed.

27. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) as regards the problem of illegally parked bicycles, “Gobee.bike” had announced its closure and members were concerned about the subsequent disposal of related bicycles. As far as he was aware, half of the resources for the bicycle clearance operation had been invested in clearing shared bicycles. He asked whether the FEHD would arrange more resources to reinforce the clearance in view of the closure of the shared bicycle company;
- (b) as for the unauthorised display of posters and signage, the FEHD did not deal with unauthorised commercial posters in a timely manner. But the FEHD took prompt actions with the District Lands Office, Sha Tin (DLO/ST) against DC Members’ banners whenever they forgot to leave related contact numbers. Besides, the DLO/ST was not active in clearing illegal structures. For example, pallet trucks were left on the ground in Yan On Estate and nobody took any actions. He asked how the FEHD would deal with the problem; and
- (c) a dessert store in Yuen Long and a cooked food stall at On Chun Street often violated rules but continued their businesses even after all their points had been deducted. The cooked food stall eventually closed down only because the property owner had increased the rent. He wondered how the FEHD could properly regulate food premises under such circumstances.

28. The views of Mr LI Sai-hung were summarised below:

- (a) he asked whether the FEHD could deploy personnel for law enforcement at night. There were many snack shops in Tai Wai, where the staff conducted cleansing in early hours and poured dirty water on the ground. Besides, many people bought food and then consumed the same at Exit B of the MTR Tai Wai Station. As a result, there was a lot of garbage in the planters every morning. In addition, the business environment in Tai Wai had changed. Many outlet malls had appeared. Goods were piled along the streets in the morning and miscellaneous items were left there after business hours. A lot of areas were affected, including Tai Wai Road, Mei Tin Road, Grandway Garden, Grandeur Garden and Glamour Garden. The problem persisted since the outlet malls were open outside the FEHD’s office hours. He hoped that the FEHD could deal with the problem; and
- (b) there were many tenement buildings on both sides of Tai Wai Road. The problem of dripping air-conditioners was getting worse, especially this year. He hoped that FEHD would follow up the problem.

29. The views of Mr CHING Cheung-ying were summarised below:

- (a) he hoped that the FEHD would actively follow up the environmental hygiene problems in housing estates in Sha Tin. As the contract between the FEHD and cleansing contractors was not detail enough, contractors were unwilling to deploy vehicles to housing estates and collect bulky waste, resulting in large piles of junk. Estate management offices and even the Housing Department were blamed by residents but they still could not ask the FEHD to solve the problem. He asked the FEHD to keep such disturbances off housing estates;

- (b) the paper said that the FEHD had inspected food premises for 9 000 times in the Sha Tin District, with an average of two to three hundred times a day. He was suspicious of the claim and did not find such inspections effective. He said that there were often reports about environmental problems in food premises. Even middle-end food premises in New Town Plaza did not have satisfactory hygiene conditions. He asked whether the FEHD could step up law enforcement so that food premises would pay more attention to the hygiene in food processing; and
- (c) there were environmental hygiene problems in the management of wet markets. Some tenants placed goods on the passageway and obstructed access. Fish stalls made the ground wet and slippery and sometimes splashed water at passers-by. He said that the hygiene conditions were better at places (such as Lung Hang Market) managed by Link Asset Management Limited (the Link).

30. The views of Ms TUNG Kin-lei were summarised below:

- (a) she had recently inspected Tai Wai Market with the Superintendent. And the hygiene conditions in the market that day was the best for many years. But problems relapsed after the inspection. Worse still, many local residents complained to her that some tenants felt that the FEHD had different standards in terms of law enforcement. Some tenants had their goods confiscated by the FEHD while some just received verbal warnings. She hoped that the FEHD would not condone violations of tenants placing their goods at will and should strengthen law enforcement; and
- (b) at the refuse collection point at Fo Tan San Mei Street there was a lot of bulky waste such as tyres and fire extinguishers. While such waste was not to be cleared by the FEHD, it still posed a public hygiene problem. She hoped that different government departments could work with each other on the matter. She said that she had seen tyres being left untreated there for three months.

31. Mr Tiger WONG thanked the Superintendent and FEHD staff for their efforts in disposing of waste from village houses in rural areas. Residents sometimes discarded rubbish next to litter containers and contractors just ignored the matter. But when he notified the FEHD, the rubbish would be cleared afterwards. In rural areas, rubbish was often taken out by children to litter containers, which might be too tall for the children. As a result, rubbish was simply discarded on the ground and attracted wild boars, causing hygiene problems. In fact, even if contractors did not collect rubbish, they would eventually ask the FEHD for help. He asked whether the FEHD had considered asking contractors to clean up the vicinity of refuse collection points as well. Otherwise the accumulation of rubbish would affect the environmental hygiene.

32. The views of Mr WONG Ka-wing were summarised below:

- (a) he expressed disappointment about the work of the FEHD, which, with just a couple of words, shifted the responsibility back to estate management offices and owners in terms of the water seepage problem. In many cases, water seepage was caused by residents upstairs, but most of them were unwilling to handle the matter. Eventually victims still needed to turn to the FEHD for follow-up actions. Besides, a case often involved several departments. The FEHD would first conduct the colour dye test. If no problem was found with the drainage point, the

Water Supplies Department (WSD) would examine the water meter. But the WSD would have no more responsibilities if there was no water leak at the meter. And if the Buildings Department (BD) found no problem with the building structure, the problem remained unsolved despite the long period of time consumed. The biggest problem was that the Government entrusted the matter to property management companies, which could not effectively deal with the matter since prosecution was involved. Eventually, owners had to spend some 10,000 to 20,000 dollars and engage other companies for testing on their own. It would be a costly and time-consuming process. He hoped that the Government would intervene in order to reduce the processing time and the losses for both parties. However, the FEHD's strategy was to batting the ball back to property management companies or owners' corporations (OCs), which was irresponsible; and

- (b) as for dripping air-conditioners, there were only single-digit prosecutions in the Sha Tin District as a whole, but the problem was actually prevalent. In April this year, the Ombudsman had pointed out that FEHD had been inadequate in dealing with the water seepage problem. Most buildings in Sha Tin were at least 30 years old. He hoped that the FEHD would pay adequate attention to the problems of water seepage and dripping air-conditioners. The Government should do more in legislation, education and publicity, so that members of public knew what to do with water seepage.

33. The views of Ms LAM Chung-yan were summarised below:

- (a) the paper was mainly the work report for 2017 and only a small part was about the work strategies for future. She was particularly concerned about mosquito and rodent problems. Although the rodent infestation rate was not high in the Sha Tin District, she had actually received a lot of public complaints in that regard. Some residents had even seen rats in their houses. She wondered whether the rodent infestation rate reflected the actual situation. There were rats running rampant after renovation works. She wondered why the Government did not take the initiative to conduct random inspections and carry out preventive work in places with renovation works; and
- (b) for the prevention of rodents, she suggested installing rat guards in housing courts. She asked whether the Government would further promote the devices to owners and even install the devices for them, so that residents would be protected from rodent nuisance.

34. The views of Mr CHAN Nok-hang were summarised below:

- (a) recently, there were many newspapers reports about the serious rodent infestation in the Sha Tin District. He asked whether the FEHD had actively communicated with OCs or property management companies for rodent prevention and control;
- (b) trapping stickers for biting midges were not used as often as before, due to the opposition of environmentalists. But such stickers had a good effect. He wondered whether the FEHD would consider re-installing them;

- (c) at present, the water seepage problem was prevalent across the territory. Due to limited manpower, the FEHD did not follow up on individual cases until sometime after receiving requests for assistance from the public. He asked whether the FEHD would procure new testing devices to enhance efficiency; and
- (d) the problem of dripping air-conditioners existed in many housing estates but remained unresolved. When the dripping sources could be spotted with bare eyes, he asked why the FEHD did not send letters to relevant residents requesting improvements and even imposed penalties if they did not do so.

35. The views of Mr LAI Tsz-yan were summarised below:

- (a) the paper said that bicycles at railings would be cleared. But many shared bicycles were still parked illegally on the streets. He asked the FEHD how they could be cleared;
- (b) the FEHD was gradually reducing the use of trap stickers for biting midges, but the infestation was serious at bus stops. He wondered whether other measures would be taken in place of trap stickers;
- (c) as for the rodent problem, many private housing estates complained about rats in buildings. He asked whether there was any way to compel estate management offices to properly do their job in rodent control; and
- (d) coordination alone could not address the water seepage problem. He hoped that the FEHD could do more.

36. The Chairman asked members to note that Mr CHIU Man-leong had returned to the conference room.

37. The views of Mr TONG Hok-leung were summarised below:

- (a) many stores were recently affected by rodent infestation. He had invited government departments for inspections. And he learned that conventional measures, such as rat poison or cage traps, were adopted to address the problem. He wondered whether the FEHD would keep pace with the times and consider using more updated appliances in order to increase the efficiency of mouse trapping;
- (b) wet markets managed by the Link were popular, while those managed by the FEHD were less frequented because of management problems. Installing air-conditioners alone would not be enough as the environment was poor, with wet and slippery ground and narrow aisles. He asked the FEHD to properly manage its wet markets with resolve and determination; and
- (c) in respect of the cityscape in Tai Wai, there was a problem of unauthorised display of posters and signage. Some members of the public displayed signage without authorisation but the FEHD could not deal with the problem properly. He opined that the Government should enforce the law faithfully. As regards the problem of signage, he was aware that the FEHD had prosecuted a person, who, however, intensified the violation afterwards. And the FEHD seemed to be at a loss to deal

with the problem. He hoped that the Government would actively deal with matter.

38. The views of Mr WONG Hok-lai were summarised below:

- (a) his constituency was close to hillside. And the infestation of mosquitoes and biting midges was serious in such places as Mei Chung Court. However, no ovitraps were placed at those locations. Therefore, the index failed to reflect the actual situation. He wondered whether more ovitraps could be placed;
- (b) the most serious illegal parking of bicycles in Sha Tin involved the shared ones. Apart from clearing illegally parked bicycles at railings, the FEHD should also deal with ordinary and shared bicycles parked indiscriminately on pavements;
- (c) as regards the water seepage problem, the paper batted the ball back to OCs and owners' committees, who might not be necessarily able to deal with conflicts between property owners in an effective manner. The colour water test adopted by the FEHD was time-consuming and the resident upstairs might not necessarily make improvements, which was disturbing for the victim as a result. At present, there were new methods to test water seepage and he wondered whether the FEHD would consider using them; and
- (d) there were publicity bills for various property developments across Tai Wai, and the situation had not improved. He hoped that the FEHD could provide the related prosecution figure.

39. The views of Mr PUN Kwok-shan were summarised below:

- (a) the FEHD attached great importance to the rodent control, which was carried out by contractors and pest control teams. He asked whether rodent control operations were carried out in Tin Sam Village on a monthly basis. He said that the rodent problem there had not been alleviated, probably due to the large number of food premises there. On behalf of food premises owners, he asked whether captured rats should be turned to the FEHD and how the rats could be handled in a more hygienic manner;
- (b) there were kapok trees along Che Kung Miu Road and Tin Sam Street. He asked whether the FEHD could coordinate with the contractors of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) to clear the white fibres;
- (c) the FEHD did not have many vehicles for collecting household waste, which however, was in great quantity since there were many old housing estates in Sha Tin. He asked whether such waste would be removed only when the FEHD was notified each time. He hoped that the related mechanism could be improved; and
- (d) there was a large ancient banyan tree at Tin Sam Street, with many birds roosting in it and leaving many droppings on the roadside. He hoped that the FEHD would strengthen the cleansing. He wondered whether the FEHD would conduct an avian flu test on the bird droppings.

40. The views of Ms Iris WONG were summarised below:

- (a) she had invited the LCSD, the FEHD and the Highways Department (HyD) to send staff to Shek Mun Interchange Bridge for cleansing, with discussion on the division of responsibility beforehand. She opined that the FEHD should take the initiative to clean up rubbish in planters on the roadside. She had also seen bulky waste such as construction waste in planters. She believed that the hygiene conditions would improve if government departments could communicate and coordinate better with each other;
- (b) as for mosquito and rodent problems, due to the hot weather this year, there would be a lot of rats near any construction works. The FEHD should better advise relevant constructors to take appropriate measures during projects, so as to minimise the chances of rats running to other places; and
- (c) a lot of bulky waste were left on streets for long time. She understood that it was the responsibility of the HyD. But she believed that the hygiene conditions could improve if the FEHD helped report related violations.

41. The views of Mr CHIU Man-leong were summarised below:

- (a) when he met with the Secretary for Food and Health, he also mentioned the rodent problem and hoped that the Food and Health Bureau (FHB) would consider adopting the rodent infestation rate. The FHB said that while there was currently a related index, the information was inadequate. If the rodent infestation rate was available, he hoped that the FHB could provide related figures for members of the public, who could then monitor the effectiveness of rodent control. He pointed out that rodent problem had been serious in Ma On Shan recently, as several rats had been spotted in houses. He hoped that the FEHD would deploy more resources and manpower and would strengthen cooperation with other departments to address the problem; and
- (b) as for the environmental hygiene on footbridges and in pedestrian subways, there were often public complaints about bad odours in the subway near Sai Sha Road and the MTR Tai Shui Hang Station, with many pets fouling the place. He knew that the place was managed by the HyD, but it was not as professional as the FEHD in hygiene management and did not cleanse the place frequently enough. He hoped that the FEHD could help cleanse footbridges and pedestrian subways regularly.

42. The views of Mr LI Sai-wing were summarised below:

- (a) Ma On Shan was facing with the rodent problem. He believed that the FHB and the FEHD were aware of the situation, but they had not taken any targeted measures. He hoped that the FEHD would launch a large-scale rodent control campaign in the Sha Tin District. Members could also contact stakeholders in their constituencies for the purpose. The campaign would be more effective if it was led by the Government; and

- (b) the FEHD's work in publicity and education was currently inadequate. Members of the public were often unaware of the seriousness of the rodent problem. The FEHD should step up publicity and education on rodent prevention measures.

43. Mr YIP Wing said that the FEHD seemed to have only two channels to promote solutions to the rodent problem, namely "Keep Clean Ambassador Ah Tak" and Facebook. He wondered how effective the two approaches were in improving environmental hygiene.

44. The views of the Chairman were summarised below:

- (a) he enquired about the quantity and effectiveness of summonses against illegal shop extensions. It might not be effective if only one summons was issued per day; and
- (b) "Gobee.bike" might not clear its bicycles left on streets after its closure. He asked whether service costs would be recovered from the company if the FEHD had to clean up the bicycles.

45. Mr Derek LAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) regarding prosecution work, the FEHD had set up 19 dedicated enforcement teams and 19 teams dedicated in the handling of cleanliness offences between 2017 and 2018. Each consisted of one senior foreman and four foremen, the teams strengthened prosecution against hygiene black spots. The FEHD would provide the prosecution figure of the Sha Tin District in the paper;
- (b) as regards illegal shop extensions, street management involved a number of government departments. The FEHD, for its part, was responsible for environmental hygiene and actions against obstruction of cleansing and against illegal hawking. It also enforced the law as appropriate in accordance with the Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance and the Summary Offences Ordinance;
- (c) the Government had enacted a related fixed penalty ordinance in order to deal with illegal shop extensions more effectively. From 2016, when the ordinance came into force, to June 2018, a total of 102 fixed penalty tickets had been issued in the Sha Tin District;
- (d) as regards the water seepage problem, the FEHD did not shirk the responsibility to property management companies. Instead, it encouraged property management companies/OCs/Mutual Aid Committees/owners' committees/other resident's groups to actively participate in the management of their buildings. It was hoped that staff of property management companies could participate in the daily management of private housing estates and help resolve the problems of water seepage and dripping air-conditioners based on the principle of harmony. The FEHD would handle each case of water seepage or dripping air-conditioner. If there was evidence proving that nuisance was caused, it would issue a "nuisance notice" and request the relevant resident to remove the nuisance within a specific time or face prosecution. At present, the FEHD adopted the colour water test to examine water seepage and to deal with suspected drainage problems. The Joint Offices for Investigation of Water Seepage Complaints had set up a task force and

might study other alternatives;

- (e) as for the rodent problem, the FEHD organised a territory-wide interdepartmental anti-rodent campaign each year. The first phase of 2018 was carried out from 8 January to 16 March, and the second phase from 2 July to 7 September. Apart from the anti-rodent campaign, the FEHD also carried out anti-rodent operations in targeted areas in order to enhance related work locally and to strengthen rodent control in a multi-pronged manner;
- (f) in respect of publicity and education, the FEHD had started running a TV and radio announcement entitled “Follow three rules to eliminate rodents” in April 2017. And a new version would debut on 16 July. Besides, the FEHD also distributed leaflets, organised seminars and promoted the message through the Facebook page of “Keep Clean Ambassador Ah Tak”;
- (g) regarding the management of private housing estates, the FEHD offered advice and also technical assistance if necessary, to relevant government departments, such as the HD and the LCSD, in respect of their rodent control work;
- (h) the FEHD conducted surveys for the rodent infestation rate in places with rodent infestation, by measuring the percentages of baits consumed by rats and making year-on-year comparison. The rodent infestation rate was 2.6%, 2.7% and 2.6% for the first half, the second half and the whole year of 2017 in the Sha Tin District, respectively, compared with the figure of 3% for the entire territory. While the index in Sha Tin was the lowest in Hong Kong, the rodent problem would change along with various factors. The index reflected only the situation of the surveyed area at a certain time, but not necessarily the complete picture of the rodent infestation in that area. The FEHD would conduct targeted anti-rodent operations in different areas upon receive public complaints;
- (i) as regards mosquito control, the FEHD had already set up four pest control inspection teams in May 2017 to strengthen inspections of construction sites and to take enforcement actions against sites with mosquito infestation. Besides, there were 20 mobile pest control teams in Sha Tin District. In addition to increasing manpower, the FEHD would step up publicity and education. Besides, the FEHD had introduced the ovitrap index and had started conducting surveillance at 57 locations on a semi-month basis starting from July, compared with 52 locations on a monthly basis before. The new surveillance point of Sha Tin was Wo Che. Besides, Mei Tin Estate was the surveillance point of Tai Wai and ovitraps were set up there;
- (j) as regards the illegal parking of bicycles, he believed that “Gobee.bike” would recover its bicycles after its clousre. As for other illegal parked bicycles, the Sha Tin District Office (STDO) would need to coordinate and arrange for relevant government departments to take joint actions. And the FEHD would try its best to support the work of other relevant departments;
- (k) the FEHD had strengthened enforcement against unauthorised display of bills and posters and took special actions from 10 June to 11 July and issued 19 summonses in Tai Wai. As regards handwritten signage, while it was usually difficult to identify the culprits, the FEHD had successfully instigated prosecutions before.

Besides, the FEHD deployed plainclothes officers to inspect different places and would promptly instigate prosecution if necessary;

- (l) as for the Market Modernisation Programme, the FEHD had just set up a task force to fully review wet markets and cooked food markets across the territory, in terms of their refurbishment, installation of air-conditioners, daily operation, positioning, cost and revenue, among others; and
- (m) as for the rodent problem or waste collection in specific areas, he promised to take follow-up actions with relevant members after the meeting.

46. The Chairman stated that no voting was necessary for this item on the agenda and declared the end of related discussion.

Extension of Service Opening Hours of Chik Fai Street Refuse Collection Point at Tai Wai
(Paper No. HE 32/2018)

47. Mr Derek LAI briefly introduced the paper.

48. Mr LI Sai-hung said that although Shing Ho Road was not within his constituency, the FEHD had also consulted him on the extension of service opening hours of the refuse collection point on the road. On the contrary, Chik Fai Street was within his constituency, but the FEHD had not consulted him beforehand. As regards Shing Ho Road refuse collection point, he asked whether the FEHD had reviewed the effectiveness and impact after extending the service opening hours. He believed that it was feasible to extend the service opening hours of Chik Fai Street refuse collection point, as many people actually disposed of rubbish at night. However, he wondered whether the FEHD compared the proposal with the effectiveness of the extension for Shing Ho Road refuse collection point.

49. Ms TUNG Kin-lei agreed with Mr LI Sai-hung and said that the FEHD would debrief members on related preparations before an on-site inspection, in terms of the need to extend the service opening hours, the manpower arrangements after the extension, the placement of refuse containers, etc. However, the FEHD only provided a paper and did not arrange an on-site inspection this time. Members of the public had little objection to the extension of service opening hours of Shing Ho Road refuse collection point. But it was not the case for Chik Fai Street refuse collection point, since some residents were sensitive to noise. She hoped that FEHD staff would monitor the situation after the extension. And she hoped that the refuse containers would not be placed outside the refuse collection point, so as to minimise the noise nuisance to residents. She hoped that the FEHD staff could properly cover the refuse containers so as not to attract rats.

50. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) he said that the FEHD had not consulted the HEC, as two of his fellow members had pointed out. Since the HEC had a better understanding of the local situation, it was advisable for the FEHD to consult members for early follow-up. He wondered whether the Superintendent could promise that members would be consulted in advance in similar cases in future;
- (b) Chik Fai Street refuse collection point was located under Grandeur Garden and he asked what kind of refuse was collected there. The collection of refuse from

residential buildings was normally completed by 11:00 pm. He wondered where refuse came from between 11:30 pm and 1:30 am. If it was refuse generated by food premises, he wondered whether the merchants should dispose of the refuse themselves. For housing estates in his constituency, such as Yan On Estate and Chevalier Garden, the management companies assisted in finding contractors to do the job; and

- (c) many members of the public were already in bed between 11:30 pm and 1:30 am. He understood that it would be difficult to arrange for additional manpower to monitor the collection of refuse. However, if people did not follow the rules when disposing of rubbish, it might cause nuisance to the residents. He asked the FEHD how it would handle the situation.

51. Mr Derek LAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) he admitted that he had not consulted Mr LI Sai-hung and Ms TUNG Kin-lei before submitting the paper and promised to make improvements in future. However, he and Mr LI Sai-hung had met with the OC Chairman of Grandeur Garden, who said that the proposed extension was due to the fact that much rubbish was piled at the refuse collection point near the car park at night and in the early morning;
- (b) during the extended hours, there would be staff on duty to strengthen the refuse collection service. Among others, the staff would instruct members of the public to put waste into the refuse containers. The main door of the refuse collection point would remain closed and only the side door would be open. Besides, no machinery would be used and only limited illumination would be maintained; and
- (c) the refuse collection point accepted only household waste, as well as commercial waste not exceeding 100 litres.

52. The Chairman asked the Superintendent to follow up the matter with relevant members after the meeting and declared the end of related discussion.

Proposal for Refurbishing Tin Sam Village Public Toilet and Kwei Tei Street Public Toilet
(Paper No. HE 33/2018)

53. Mr Derek LAI briefly introduced the paper.

54. The views of Mr PUN Kwok-shan were summarised below:

- (a) he said that he had expressed his opinions on the refurbishment of Tin Sam Village Public Toilet many times. Now he felt disappointed with the proposal. Progress had been made by changing the male-to-female toilet cubicle ratio to 1:2, assigning baby-care rooms and installing more urinals. However, the entire proposal failed to consider green measures such as ventilation, lighting transmission, exhaust fans, solar energy, etc., about which he was surprised and disappointed;
- (b) there was a refuse room next to the public toilet as usual. With the upcoming introduction of the waste levy scheme, he opined that it was necessary to install

Internet protocol cameras near the public toilet and the refuse room, in order to monitor the disposal of construction waste and domestic bulky waste;

- (c) besides, the refuse room had reached its capacity and some refuse containers were placed outside. Sewage accumulated on the roadside when there was rain and caused stench, which reached as far as Lung Hang Estate. The proposal, however, did not consider refurbishing and expanding the refuse collection point at the same time. Therefore he opined that the works would be of no avail at all. The refuse collection point had a duty office space for storing its accessories, but the storage space was not adequate. In addition, the refuse collection point had always had a sewage problem, with sewage flowing to the parking spaces next to it, which was not considered in the refurbishment works, either. Therefore, he urged the FEHD to consider addressing the sewage problem of the refuse collection point;
- (d) in view of the introduction of the waste levy scheme, he opined that the refuse collection point should be expanded; and
- (e) he asked the Superintendent whether the FEHD staff responsible for the refurbishment project could be invited for an on-site inspection after the meeting.

55. Mr LI Sai-hung said that he occasionally received complaints about Tin Sam Village Public Toilet. Some of them were about cleanliness, but stench was the biggest problem, which had been in existence for several years. He had earlier inspected the site and found that the stench came from the food waste and food sauces on the ground of the refuse collection point next to the public toilet. He believed that the place had not been cleansed for a long time and the stench reached as far as Tin Sam Street. He opined that the FEHD should actively cleanse the ground and the refuse containers.

56. Mr Thomas PANG welcomed the proposal for refurbishing the public toilet. As regards Kwei Tei Street Public Toilet, he pointed out that a public housing estate would be completed next to it, and the refurbishment would be completed in March 2019. He wondered whether the refurbishment would be aligned with the completion of the public housing estate. As there would be much construction waste at the site, he was concerned that the public toilet would become dilapidated very soon after the refurbishment, with the lack of communication among relevant government departments.

57. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) he enquired about the current number of users of Kwei Tei Street Public Toilet. According to the paper, after the refurbishment, there would be 3 toilet bowls, 2 urinals and 2 wash basins in the men's room, and 5 toilet bowls and 3 wash basins in the ladies' room. Besides, there would be one baby-care room and one parent-baby cubicle in the men's room as well as in the ladies' room, in addition to one accessible toilet. He said that the picture in Annex IV showed a larger cubicle in the men's room and one in the ladies' room, with the same design as the accessible toilet. He asked whether those cubicles were for use by disabled persons. He hoped that the Superintendent could provide a reply after consulting the Architectural Services Department (ArchSD); and

- (b) regarding the number of cubicles, he wondered whether there was any established standard for the numbers of squatting pans and toilet bowls, and whether it was impossible to install more cubicles. Besides, he asked whether the refurbished toilet would be covered with non-slippery materials.

58. Ms Scarlett PONG cited a magazine article saying that there was an access leading from a barbecue site to Kwai Tei New Village. Therefore, Kwei Tei Street Public Toilet was necessary. And she opined that the female-to-male toilet cubicle ratio would be more appropriate at 2.5:1.

59. Mr Derek LAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the FEHD did not have related information about green building at the moment. He did not know whether green elements would be added in related works. But the FEHD could consider the proposal of installing internet protocol cameras. As for whether the refuse collection point next to the public toilet could be refurbished and expanded at the same time, he said that the idea could be considered in future refurbishment works;
- (b) the FEHD would pay more attention to the problem of the sewage of refuse collection point flowing into the public toilet and the sewage problem of the public toilet per se. Among others, the FEHD would engage a contractor for cleansing. As Kwei Tei Street was close to a public housing site, the public toilet was widely used by site workers as well as passers-by;
- (c) he did not have relevant information about the standard for the ratio of squatting pans and toilet bowls. Dehumidifiers would be installed in newly-built public toilets in future, but the FEHD needed to verify whether it was the same case for refurbished toilets; and
- (d) the access to the men's room and that to the ladies' rooms remained unchanged, while there was a separate access to the accessible toilet. The larger cubicles were intended for parents with children and were not accessible ones. As regards the cubicles in the picture in Annex IV, he promised to consult the ArchSD before replying to Mr Michael YUNG later.

60. The Chairman said that the Superintendent could follow up the matter with relevant members after the meeting if he did not have some of the relation information on hand at the moment. He declared the end of related discussion.

Questions

Question to be Raised by Ms TUNG Kin-lei on the Wild Monkey Problem in Tai Wai
(Paper No. HE 21/2018)

61. The views of Ms TUNG Kin-lei were summarised below:

- (a) she thanked the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) for their work in the past two months, as the nuisance caused by wild monkeys to "Six-Mei Area" (i.e. May Shing Court, Mei Chung Court, Mei Park Court, Mei Ying Court, Mei Tin Estate and Mei Lam Estate) had been reduced. She hoped

that the AFCD could continue to implement relevant measures. And she hoped that the FEHD could replace all litter bins with the pedal type in “Six-Mei Area”. She had recently found that some pedal bins in Heung Fan Liu Street were damaged and opined that the design might need to be improved; and

- (b) the wild monkey had run rampant again in the past week, when they allegedly snatched food from a teenage girl at the minibus stand at Mei Chung Court. She knew that the AFCD had captured the alpha male and the culprit monkeys over the past two months. She wondered whether the problem recurred because the AFCD had slacked off recently. The barrier nets installed at Hin Keng Estate effectively prevented monkeys from entering residential apartments. She wondered whether the Housing Department (HD) would provide assistance or subsidy for the installation of such devices, or take other measures to prevent wild monkeys from causing nuisance to residents.

62. The views of Mr PUN Kwok-shan were summarised below:

- (a) nowadays, the problem of wild monkeys not only affected “Six-Mei Area”, but also “Amah Rock”. The animals started causing nuisance at the hill behind Lung Hang Estate as well. He asked whether the AFCD could join him for an inspection of the cages for capturing wild monkeys after the meeting. He wondered whether the AFCD had conducted assessment on sterilized monkeys to see if they had emotional changes after the procedure, such as whether they would attack people more often; and
- (b) on behalf of Mr TONG Hok-leung, he thanked the AFCD for joining the inspection of Lakeview Garden the day before.

63. The views of Mr LI Sai-hung were summarised below:

- (a) he was asked by Mr WONG Hok-lai to enquire whether covered litter bins would be installed in “Sze-Mei Area” (i.e. May Shing Court, Mei Chung Court, Mei Tin Estate and Mei Lam Estate), so as to prevent environmental hygiene problems caused by scavenging monkeys. He asked whether prosecutions had been instigated against people who fed wild monkeys in “Sze-Mei Area”;
- (b) he had received complaints from residents of Golden Lion Garden Stage 1, hoping that the AFCD would follow up on the problem of wild monkeys and wild boars. He and the AFCD staff had inspected Chui Tin Street together, when AFCD staff said that they would try their best to address the problem by capturing and sterilizing the animals, among others. He asked whether the AFCD could share the effectiveness of sterilization of wild monkeys and predict the number of wild monkeys in future; and
- (c) he thanked the AFCD and the FEHD for joining his earlier inspection of Chui Tin Street. Later, the AFCD also put up banners reminding members of the public not to feed wild monkeys or wild boars. He had received public complaints that someone placing food at Kak Tin Village refuse collection point for feeding wild boars. He asked the FEHD whether there were recent prosecution figures on feeding wild monkeys and wild boars.

64. Mr YIP Sin-hang, Wetland & Fauna Conservation Officer (Enforcement) of the AFCD gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) currently, the AFCD inspected the neighbourhoods of Mei Chung Court and May Shing Court every day. As for the case of monkeys snatching food from a girl on 10 July, the AFCD had promptly deployed staff to follow up and had captured the culprit monkeys. Generally speaking, captured monkeys would be sent to animal management centres for observation. Later they would be sterilised and released to the wild if they were found suitable for such procedures upon assessment. As regards monkeys causing nuisance on the hill behind Lung Hang Estate, the AFCD would arrange an inspection after the meeting and would place cages at appropriate locations to capture the animals;
- (b) starting from 2007, the AFCD arranged contraceptive and sterilization operations for monkeys in Kam Shan, Lion Rock and Shing Mun Country Parks. So far the AFCD had conducted such operations on more than 2 200 monkeys, while 1 500 of them underwent minimally invasive surgeries. From this year, the AFCD had extended the contraceptive programme to areas frequently disturbed by monkeys, such as Heung Fan Liu. The contraceptive programme had been carried out for more than a decade. During the year, the AFCD would study changes, including emotional changes, in monkeys before and after sterilization;
- (c) according to the annual population survey conducted by Ocean Park Conservation Foundation, the contractor of the programme, the birth rate of monkey troops had dropped from 60% in 2009 to 35% in recent years, while the monkey population had fallen from about 2 300 in 2009 to about 1 800 today; and
- (d) the AFCD had also commissioned experts to study how to improve the design of litter bins in order to prevent monkeys from scavenging for human food. The AFCD wished to control the food sources to reduce the nuisance caused by monkeys straying into residential areas for food.

65. Mr Derek LAI responded that the FEHD had installed a total of five pedal bins in “Six-Mei Area” to prevent monkeys from scavenging for food, including one in Heung Fan Liu Street, two in Pik Tin Street and two in Hin Tin Street. The FEHD was now preparing to deploy more pedal bins as necessary. And it would solve the problem of rebounding covers of litter bins. He could not provide the prosecution figures for members until he had solicited related information.

66. Ms MOK Kit-yee, Housing Manager (Tai Po, North & Shatin 3) of the HD responded that the HD would not assist Mei Chung Court or May Shing Court in installing facilities against wild monkeys, since the two housing courts had set up OCs, which had engaged property management companies for daily management. If members considered that the measures at Hin Keng Estate were effective, she could provide the information for the relevant OCs and property management companies for reference.

67. The Chairman said that although the number of wild monkeys had dropped, the nuisance they caused seemed to have increased. He hoped that the AFCD would later study why wild monkeys preferred straying into residential areas rather than staying on hills in recent years. He declared the end of discussion on the matter.

Question to be Raised by Mr CHAN Billy Shiu-yeung on the Wild Pigeon Problem at Sha Kok Street

(Paper No. HE 22/2018)

68. The Chairman said that he had received a written document from Mr Billy CHAN, stating that he had asked Mr Sunny CHIU to continue with the question on his behalf. The Chairman agreed to the arrangement.

69. The views of Mr Sunny CHIU were summarised below:

- (a) he said that he would continue with the question on Mr Billy CHAN's behalf. The AFCD responded that apart from education, there was nothing particular they could do to prevent members of the public from feeding wild pigeons. However, the problem would not have occurred if education had been effective. He wondered whether the Government's publicity and education were adequate and whether there were other ways to solve the problem;
- (b) Mr Billy CHAN opined that the FEHD did not instigate adequate prosecutions against people feeding birds and fouling public places. People were seen feeding wild pigeons opposite the hawker stalls at Sha Kok Street every day, but there were only nine prosecutions a year, with less than one case per month, which was indeed unacceptable. The number would not have been so low if FEHD staff had inspected the location every day. Besides, Mr Billy CHAN hoped that the FEHD would increase the frequency of deploying street washing vehicles. There were a lot of birds gathering on top of Sha Kok Community Hall and causing nuisance to nearby residents. The HD cleansed the location only once per month. He asked whether the frequency could be increased to once per week;
- (c) both the FEHD and the AFCD had put up larger publicity banners, which was commendable. The AFCD had mentioned the "pigeon repellent spray". He would like to know how it was used and he hoped that the AFCD would provide a sample for members to see its effectiveness; and
- (d) according to the AFCD's responses, it seemed that capturing wild pigeons was not illegal. He wondered whether members of the public had the right to capture the birds. He also wondered what the Police would do with reported cases of people capturing wild pigeons. He asked whether the AFCD could count the number of wild pigeons across the territory.

70. The views of Mr SIU Hin-hong were summarised below:

- (a) the problem of pigeons in Fo Tan was also very serious. The problem had started a decade ago and had now gone out of control. He was most worried that wild pigeons would excrete indiscriminately and spread diseases. He hoped that the AFCD would deal with the problem actively;
- (b) the number of wild pigeons had multiplied over the past decade or so. He asked the AFCD whether it was legal or illegal for members of the public to capture the birds. He opined that the Government failed to do an adequate job in education and that a deterrent effect would be impossible unless more severe penalties were imposed. The FEHD had issued only nine summonses against feeding feral birds

between 2017 and 2018, with less than one summons per month. The prosecution figure was low; and

- (c) he had tried many ways driving away pigeons but none of them seemed to work. However, he had never used black kites, which, as far as he knew, were a natural enemy of wild pigeons. He asked the AFCD whether it was legal or not for members of the public to keep black kites.

71. Mr WONG Hok-lai asked whether the FEHD could provide the prosecution figure on illegal feeding of wild pigeons. He also enquired about the ingredients of “pigeon repellent spray”.

72. Ms Alice YEUNG, Senior Field Officer (Avian Influenza) of the AFCD gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the AFCD understood that education was a long-term strategy. In future, it would continue to strengthen measures in that regard, including organising roving exhibitions, producing publicity videos, as well as putting up banners and distributing leaflets at locations where wild pigeons gathered. In future, the AFCD would consider engaging a consultant company to study how the nuisance caused by wild pigeons could be reduced, such as whether pigeon contraceptive drugs were suitable for use in Hong Kong, so as to control the breeding of the birds. The AFCD would also count the number of wild pigeons across the territory, in order to review the effectiveness of related measures in future;
- (b) according to the Wild Animals Protection Ordinance (Cap. 170), no wild birds should be disturbed or hunted. Wild pigeons were not feral birds, however, animal welfare issues might be implicated if members of the public captured the birds. For example, they might violate the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Ordinance (Cap. 169) if the birds were subjected to unnecessary suffering. Therefore, the AFCD did not encourage members of the public to capture wild pigeons on their own. If wild pigeons often gathered in some places, property management companies could consider installing “bird control spikes”;
- (c) the AFCD had samples of the “pigeon repellent spray” and could provide them for management companies for trial use if necessary. The “pigeon repellent spray” was made from natural ingredients and had a smell that pigeons disliked and accordingly were driven away. Its effectiveness would be subject to other factors, such as weather. For example, it might be less effective if there was rain after use. Interested members could contact the AFCD for samples; and
- (d) at present, the FEHD could regulate the feeding of feral birds by enforcing relevant ordinances. Therefore, legislation amendment was not considered at the moment.

73. Mr Anthony LEUNG, Veterinarian (Avian Influenza Surveillance) of the AFCD responded that there were overseas studies on the control of wild pigeons with black kites. However, the approach was usually adopted in open areas such as airports, since black kites needed much space for gliding. The approach had been tested in some foreign cities, but the results were mixed. It was even opposed by some animal rights advocates, since it was bloody when black kites preyed on wild pigeons. And the approach might not be applicable in Hong

Kong with so many high-rise buildings. Besides, black kites were protected wild animals in Hong Kong and members of the public could not keep them without authorisation.

74. Mr Derek LAI responded that bird feeding in public places was not a violation under the Fixed Penalty (Public Cleanliness and Obstruction) Ordinance (Cap. 570), unless people doing so dirtied public places. In that case, the FEHD would instigate prosecutions against offenders. The FEHD had instigated a total of 19 prosecutions between January 2017 and July 2018, all involving people feeding birds and causing dirtiness to public places. One of the persons prosecuted was a repeat offender, who drove to the place by car in the morning, left the food there and then went away. The FEHD had issued summonses to the person at the beginning and the end of June, respectively. The AFCD needed time to review the detailed prosecution figures of each area.

75. Ms MOK Kit-ye responded that the HD resorted to education, regulation and penalty at the same time. In respect of education, the HD put up notices reminding members of the public not to feed wild animals. As for regulation, it conducted inspections and implemented the demerit points system. In addition, she said that the top of Sha Kok Community Hall was not necessarily cleansed once a month. The frequency was increased whenever necessary, such as when there was accumulation of bird droppings, bad odour or public complaints.

76. Mr Alvin LEE said that there was a lack of quorum in the conference room.

77. The Chairman said that due to the lack of a quorum at present, the meeting would be adjourned for 15 meetings according to Order 12(2) of the Sha Tin District Council Standing Orders. He asked the Secretary to summon the members not present.

78. Since a quorum was still not present after 15 minutes, the Chairman announced the adjournment of the meeting at 6:50 pm, and decided to postpone the discussion on the remaining three questions and two information papers to the resumption of the meeting. The resumption of the meeting was scheduled to be held at 2:30 pm on 17 July 2018 (Tuesday).

79. The meeting was adjourned at 6:50 pm.

Sha Tin District Council Secretariat
STDC 13/15/40

July 2018