

Sha Tin District Council
Minutes of the 2nd Meeting of
the Health and Environment Committee in 2016

Date : 10 March 2016 (Thursday)
Time : 2:30pm
Venue : Sha Tin District Council Conference Room
 4/F, Sha Tin Government Offices

<u>Present</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Time of joining the meeting</u>	<u>Time of leaving the meeting</u>
Mr WONG Yue-hon (Chairman)	DC Member	2:30 pm	7:44 pm
Ms YUE Shin-man (Vice-Chairman)	"	2:30 pm	6:32 pm
Mr HO Hau-cheung, BBS, MH	DC Chairman	2:33 pm	7:44 pm
Mr CHAN Billy Shiu-yeung	DC Member	2:33 pm	6:45 pm
Ms CHAN Man-kuen	"	2:30 pm	7:44 pm
Mr CHENG Tsuk-man	"	3:07 pm	6:32 pm
Mr CHING Cheung-ying, MH	"	2:30 pm	7:44 pm
Mr CHIU Chu-pong, Sunny	"	2:33 pm	6:45 pm
Mr CHIU Man-leong	"	2:30 pm	6:45 pm
Mr HUI Yui-yu, Rick	"	2:30 pm	6:45 pm
Mr LAI Tsz-yan	"	3:01 pm	7:24 pm
Ms LAM Chung-yan	"	2:30 pm	7:44 pm
Mr LEUNG Ka-fai, Victor	"	2:30 pm	3:32 pm
Mr LI Sai-hung	"	2:37 pm	5:30 pm
Mr LI Sai-wing	"	2:30 pm	3:32 pm
Mr LI Wing-shing, Wilson	"	2:30 pm	6:51 pm
Mr MOK Kam-kwai, BBS	"	2:30 pm	6:31 pm
Mr NG Kam-hung	"	2:32 pm	6:50 pm
Ms PONG Scarlett Oi-lan, JP	"	2:30 pm	7:25 pm
Mr PUN Kwok-shan, MH	"	2:30 pm	7:07 pm
Mr SIU Hin-hong	"	2:34 pm	6:32 pm
Mr TING Tsz-yuen	"	2:30 pm	7:44 pm
Mr TONG Hok-leung	"	2:30 pm	7:23 pm
Ms TSANG So-lai	"	3:03 pm	6:32 pm
Ms TUNG Kin-lei	"	2:33 pm	7:44 pm
Mr WAI Hing-cheung	"	2:30 pm	6:53 pm
Mr WONG Fu-sang, Tiger	"	2:30 pm	7:27 pm
Mr WONG Hok-lai	"	2:30 pm	7:24 pm
Mr WONG Ka-wing	"	2:30 pm	7:23 pm
Ms WONG Ping-fan, Iris	"	2:30 pm	7:27 pm
Mr YAU Man-chun	"	2:33 pm	4:53 pm
Mr YIP Wing	"	2:30 pm	7:44 pm
Mr YIU Ka-chun	"	2:30 pm	7:39 pm
Mr YUNG Ming-chau, Michael	"	2:30 pm	7:44 pm
Mr CHU Ho-fai, Kelvin (Secretary)	Executive Officer (District Council)1 / Sha Tin District Office		

In Attendance

Mr WONG Tin-pui, Simon
Mr TSAI Yu-sing, Eric

Ms TANG FUNG Shuk-yin
Mr CHAU Wai

Ms CHUI Mei-chun, Flora

Mr YUEN Chun-kit, Derek

In Attendance by Invitation

Mr LEUNG Ting-pong, Roger

Mr CHENG Hing-wai, Henry

Mr LAU Yip-ming, Raymond
Mr TONG Cheung
Mr LAI Kwai-cheung

Ms NG Ka-ling, Sarah
Mr LOK Wan-pak, Henry
Mr LEUNG Ka-fung
Dr LOH Lai-ting, Taron

Dr SHUM Shui-fung, Bobby

Dr LEE On-on, Joanne

Dr CHU Chun-wa, Jim

Ms TAM Yan-wun, Yvonne
Ms CHAU Suet-mui, Fiona
Professor CHAN Siu-chee, Sophia, JP
Mr POON Chung-yan
Mr CHAN Ying-kin
Mr KAN Hon-shing
Mr WONG Sui-kan

Title

Assistant District Officer / Sha Tin District Office
District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Sha Tin) /
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Senior Housing Manager (Sha Tin) / Housing Department
Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Regional North) 4 /
Environmental Protection Department
Deputy District Leisure Manager (Sha Tin) 2 /
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Senior Executive Officer (District Council) / Sha Tin District Office

Title

Senior Executive Officer (Planning) 1 /
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Environmental Protection Officer (Special Waste & Landfill
Restoration)(33) / Environmental Protection Department
Senior Estate Surveyor (Southeast) / District Lands Office, Sha Tin
Engineer (Sha Tin 1) / Transport Department
Senior Engineer (Kowloon and New Territories South 1) /
Drainage Services Department
Architect / 107 / Architectural Services Department
Senior Architect / 13 / Architectural Services Department
Senior Project Manager 222 / Architectural Services Department
Senior Medical & Health Officer (Community Liaison) (1) /
Department of Health
Head of New Territories Division, Forensic Pathology Service,
Regulatory Affairs and Health Services / Department of Health
Fisheries Officer (Aquaculture Environment) /
Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department
Senior Fisheries Officer (Aquaculture Fisheries) /
Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department
Assistant Secretary for Food & Health (Health) 3
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food & Health (Health) 1
Under Secretary for Food & Health
Director / AECOM Asia Company Limited
Executive Director / AECOM Asia Company Limited
Senior Engineer / Sewerage Projects 5 / Drainage Services Department
Chief Engineer / Sewerage Projects / Drainage Services Department

Absent

Mr PANG Cheung-wai, Thomas, SBS, JP
Mr CHAN Nok-hang
Mr MAK Yun-pui
Mr CHAN Kwok-keung, James
Mr LEE Chi-wing, Alvin

Title

DC Vice-Chairman (Application for leave of absence received)
DC Member (")
" (")
" (No application for leave of absence received)
" (")

Welcome Message

The Chairman welcomed all members and representatives of government departments to the second meeting of the Health and Environment Committee (HEC) of this year.

Application for Leave of Absence

2. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had received the application for leave of absence in writing from the following members:

Mr Thomas PANG	Attendance at a meeting or an activity of an organisation under the Chinese Government
Mr CHAN Nok-hang	Sickness
Mr MAK Yun-pui	Sickness

3. Members unanimously endorsed the application for leave of absence submitted by the members above.

Confirmation of the Minutes of the Meeting Held on 27 January 2016 (HEC Minutes 1/2016)

4. Members unanimously endorsed the above minutes of the meeting.

Discussion Items

Relocation of Sha Tin Sewage Treatment Works to Caverns - Environmental Impact Assessment and Progress Report (Paper No. HE 2/2016)

5. The Chairman welcomed representatives of the Drainage Services Department and the consultant firm to attend the meeting.

6. Mr WONG Sui-kan, Chief Engineer / Sewerage Projects of the Drainage Services Department said that the department made consultation with the HEC on 7 November 2013 in relation to the relocation plan and submitted funding application to the Legislative Council after obtaining support from DC Members; that his department commenced surveying and design work on 29 September 2014; and that he was reporting to DC Members the progress and the results of Environmental Impact Assessment.

7. Mr CHAN Ying-kin, Executive Director of the AECOM Asia Company Limited gave a brief introduction of the content of the paper.

8. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) he asked when the Drainage Services Department would upload the environmental impact assessment report to the website of the Environmental Protection Department for public information and hoped he would be explained the content of the paper after the meeting;
- (b) he asked what it meant by advanced sewage treatment technology;

- (c) according to the paper, the department conducted an air quality and odour impact assessment based on Annex 4 and Annex 12 of the Technical Memorandum on Environmental Impact Assessment Process. He asked whether a baseline study was conducted, and whether it was done before and after installation of a monitoring station in Chevalier Garden;
- (d) according to the paper, the maximum odour level of neighbouring residence and facilities was estimated less than one odour unit, far below the upper limit of five odour units permitted under Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance. Chevalier Garden would be 700 metres away from the ventilation shafts proposed in the feasibility study and the odour level at Chevalier Garden would be less than one odour unit. Existing ventilation shafts are more than 1 000 metres away from Chevalier Garden, and the odour level was also less than one odour unit. Would the odour be actually further diluted after the change of ventilation shaft location;
- (e) he asked why the Environmental Impact Assessment was not conducted until now, when helicopter noise impact had been noted earlier in the study;
- (f) he wanted to know the noise sources and what corresponding measures the concerned department would take;
- (g) in respect of the water quality impact assessment, Mui Tsz Lam was a water gathering ground of the Water Supplies Department. He asked what the concerned department had done in respect of water quality indicators, sewage discharge, toxic substances and baseline study;
- (h) he asked what the concerned department actually had done in respect of ecological baseline studies;
- (i) the main entrance of the construction site was at A Kung Kok Street, and the back door entrance was at Mui Tsz Lam Road via A Kung Kok Street. If an accident occurred at A Kung Kok Street, the back door entrance could not function. He asked what the concerned department would do by then ; and
- (j) he asked what facilities would be provided to benefit local residents after completion of construction.

9. The views of Mr PUN Kwok-shan were summarised below:

- (a) he wanted to know how to test the effectiveness of the ventilation shaft on odour dilution and whether it would be affected by weather;
- (b) he asked the distance between the sewage treatment works and the ventilation shaft and how to maintain the caverns at negative pressure conditions; and
- (c) the sewage treatment process must produce sludge. He wanted to know the daily quantity of sludge produced and how to treat, store and transport the sludge.

10. The views of Mr CHIU Man-leong were summarised below:
- (a) he asked whether to adopt Options 1 and 2 simultaneously to ease the traffic congestion at A Kung Kok Street in respect of the traffic arrangement;
 - (b) he wanted to know the existing cost of the project;
 - (c) the land near Kam Tai Court in Area 73, namely the existing vehicle detention pound of the Customs and Excise Department, would be used as a temporary car park for a term of one to two years and then used as the construction site for this project. He opined it was unacceptable that the project would occupy 5 hectares of land and wondered why the whole plot of land would be occupied. He had proposed a motion for construction of leisure and cultural facilities at the site at a meeting of the committee of the last term and the motion was passed. He demanded that the concerned department review the area of the site that this project would take up;
 - (d) he wanted to heighten the hoarding to prevent nuisance to the residents as dump trucks would pass Kam Tai Court in respect of the traffic arrangement of Option 2; and
 - (e) he hoped the concerned department would establish a community liaison group, comprising neighbouring residents, landlords, representatives of nearby estates, DC Members and other stakeholders, in order to monitor the impact of construction work on residents during the construction period.
11. The views of Mr CHING Cheung-ying were summarised below:
- (a) he asked how many dump trucks would travel daily to and from the site during the construction period for transport of rocks produced by blasting, and how many dump trucks would travel to and from the sewage treatment works for transport of the sludge produced after service commencement;
 - (b) he asked whether the sludge would be re-used. If yes, where it would be used;
 - (c) he asked whether the recycling water discharged could be recycled; and
 - (d) he asked if there was room for improvement for treatment of odour.
12. The views of Ms Iris WONG were summarised below:
- (a) the ventilation shafts of this design were closer to Pictorial Garden, Castello and an infirmary in A Kung Kok. The former ventilation shafts were 700 metres away from such buildings with an odour level of less than one odour unit, while less than one odour unit was still recorded from a distance of more than 1 000 metres. She wondered why it still needed to be relocated;
 - (b) she asked whether the concerned department had conducted an impact assessment on the use of explosives on Pictorial Garden and Castello;

- (c) a lot of elderly persons and people with chronic diseases lived in A Kung Kok. She asked whether the concerned department had assessed the vibration impact from explosives on them;
- (d) although it would prevent vehicles from travelling to and from A Kung Kok Street and Tai Chung Kiu Road in the morning, traffic congestion of the said roads and Shek Mun Interchange was still serious in the afternoon. The concerned department was expected to consider implementing traffic control measures in the afternoon when conducting traffic impact assessment;
- (e) she asked whether the concerned department would consider relocating refuse transfer stations into caverns since most obnoxious facilities cause the traveling around of large vehicles and odour emission; and
- (f) Hong Kong was sometimes humid and windless. She asked whether the concerned department would test whether the odour would be accumulated under this circumstance. As the ventilation shaft was close to an infirmary in A Kung Kok, she wondered if the health of patients there would be affected. She was afraid that the residents of Pictorial Garden would be affected as southeastern winds always prevailed in Hong Kong.

13. The views of Mr MOK Kam-kwai were summarised below:

- (a) Mui Tsz Lam Village was located in a water gathering ground without water supply and sewers. No housing was constructed there as the cost of an environmental-friendly septic tank was high;
- (b) he asked whether the concerned department had evaluated the impact of explosion on the houses at Mui Tsz Lam; and
- (c) he hoped sewers would also be built for Mui Tsz Lam Village when establishing a sewage treatment works.

14. The views of Ms Scarlett PONG were summarised below:

- (a) she asked if there was any difference between such new sewage treatment works and the old one at Stanley in terms of sewage treatment technology;
- (b) the paper mentioned that the concerned department would study other ways to reduce waste and recycle materials. She asked what types of waste and materials the paper referred to;
- (c) she asked how frequent grit would be transported to the landfill, and what impact it would cause to the neighbouring residents; and
- (d) she asked whether treated sewage could be used for other purposes, such as watering flowers and plants.

15. The views of Mr Tiger WONG were summarised below:

- (a) he asked whether treated sewage could be used for toilet flushing in buildings, and whether the Government had formulated a plan for construction of such facilities;
- (b) Castello was also close to the sewage treatment works. But a roving exhibition of the third stage did not include the area of Castello. He hoped residents of the district would also be consulted; and
- (c) residents of Castello might not understand the content of the project and odour unit. He hoped the concerned department would conduct brief consultation with residents of Castello after the meeting.

16. Mr NG Kam-hung said that according to information of the Civil Engineering and Development Department, the sewage treatment works inside caverns was located at the passage of two geological fault lines. He asked whether the construction of various facilities of the sewage treatment works would be affected, and whether it would pose a hurdle to funding application if the plant was affected by the fault lines.

17. Mr CHAN Ying-kin gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) Environmental Impact Assessment Report was a legal document. They had negotiated with the concerned department and were expected to submit the Environmental Impact Assessment Report in the middle of 2016 according to the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance. The report would be uploaded to the website of the Environmental Protection Department based on chronology of the ordinance for public inspection;
- (b) the technology adopted by the existing Shatin Sewage Treatment Works had been used for a long time and recorded very stable and reliable performance. For the future sewage treatment works in caverns, the design team hoped to adopt advanced modern technology, including moving bed biofilm reactor technology and aerobic granular sludge technology that had been widely applied overseas, further improving the performance of the sewage treatment process in terms of space occupancy and efficiency;
- (c) details of each research item in the report would be explained to the DC Members again in the stage of public inspection;
- (d) background investigation, baseline measurement, assessment and testing had been conducted in various locations in Sha Tin while performing Environmental Impact Assessment on odour, water quality and noise etc.;
- (e) it was expected that helicopters would be needed during the construction period and therefore it was specially mentioned in this work report;
- (f) in terms of odour, the assessment incorporated the analysis of odour sample taken in the existing sewage treatment works and its computerised mathematical model to calculate the impact on surrounding environment. Less than an odour unit means the smallest quantity of or no odour. Technically

speaking, the level of dilution would increase as the distance from the ventilation shaft increased. As the odour level was less than an odour unit, it would be hard to even recognise the existence of odour;

- (g) the ventilation shaft was around 180 metres above the ground and located at the height of Nui Po Shan. The former location proposed in the feasibility study stage was dozens of miles higher than the current location, requiring longer and more complicated surface pipes to connect. Technically speaking, the current location was better and could also meet the environmental requirements according to the evaluation;
- (h) the tunnel connecting main caverns and ventilation shaft was 500 metres long;
- (i) caverns would be installed with ventilation facilities to pump air inside so as to keep the entrance of the tunnel at negative pressure conditions;
- (j) sludge produced during the sewage treatment process would be dehydrated and transported out of caverns for further treatment;
- (k) it was proposed to adopt Options 1 and 2 of temporary traffic arrangement at the same time after discussion;
- (l) for Area 73, Drainage Services Department had discussed with the Customs and Excise Department to arrange relocation of its vehicle detention pound for provision of temporary site for construction. The area of District 73 is close to 5 hectares. To meet the requirements of other uses such as a bicycle park, the concerned department had minimised the area of the temporary works site to about 3 hectares only. It was extremely small relative to the scale of the caverns project;
- (m) for Option 2 of the temporary traffic arrangement, the hoarding could be heightened at riverside locations during construction to reduce the impact of noise and dust etc.;
- (n) the concerned department would establish a community liaison group as appropriate, generally before commencement of construction. Stakeholders from various sectors of the community would be invited to join to provide opinions;
- (o) currently, 12 vehicles for transporting sludge was traveling to and from Shatin Sewage Treatment Works daily. After taking into account the future sewage increment, a maximum of more than 20 vehicles for transporting sludge would be expected to travel to and from the future sewage treatment works in caverns, with a trivial impact on road users;
- (p) the main purpose of this project to relocate the sewage treatment works to caverns, and treated water would be continued to be discharged to Kai Tak River via Tolo Harbour Effluent Export Scheme, so that the sewage treatment level could remain unchanged, namely secondary treatment level, with environmental protection considered. The concerned department had also studied the use of part of recycled water for toilet flushing. But its cost

efficiency was lower than that of the current seawater flushing system;

- (q) evaluation on vibration from blasting covered facilities of Castello and A Kung Kok Shan Road. As the vibration on the buildings that were closer to works site than Castello was less than the low level of 5 mm per second, the project profile did not specifically mention Castello as the vibration should be even more minimal. The concerned department could provide supplemental information to individual members after the meeting;
- (r) the concerned department noted the traffic conditions near Tai Chung Kiu Road and Shek Mun Roundabout, and could consider appropriate restriction on entrance of works vehicles during rush hours in the afternoon if necessary during the construction period;
- (s) this project did not include Mui Tsz Lam Village. The concerned department had reported to the Water Supplies Department and Environmental Protection Department the circumstances of Mui Tsz Lam Village. It was understood that Water Supplies Department and Environmental Protection Department had studied on the extension of water supply and drainage facilities to Mui Tsz Lam Village;
- (t) Stanley Sewage Treatment Works were designed in early years and its sewage treatment facilities in caverns had not been covered and installed with deodorisation facilities at that time. Sources of sewage odours in the currently proposed Shatin Sewage Treatment Works in caverns would be covered to control the odour. Sludge disposal facilities and transportation vehicles would be fully covered to avoid odour disturbance. The air taken from covered area would be deodorised through biological treatment and activated carbon before being discharged at the height of Nui Po Shan. As compared with Stanley Sewage Treatment Works, Shatin Sewage Treatment Works in caverns was more advanced and comprehensive in terms of control of potential environmental impact and equipment;
- (u) the project would produce 5 million tonnes of sand and gravel. The concerned department was discussing with various departments to study the uses of the sand and gravel, such as being used as building materials;
- (v) they did not have the information of the Civil Engineering and Development Department mentioned by DC Members on hand. But geological information from earlier detailed study and site survey did show that geology of Nui Po Shan was very suitable for construction of caverns; and
- (w) special consideration had been paid to sensitive buildings in the Environmental Impact Assessment, such as the Cheung Ancestral Hall. Assessment results showed that vibration from blasting was less than the low level of 5 mm per second. Mui Tsz Lam Village was much farther away from the works sites than such buildings. Therefore, no impact was expected.

18. Mr WONG Sui-kan gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) regarding the water supply problem of Mui Tsz Lam Village, it was understood that the Water Supplies Department had commenced preliminary design and conducted a feasibility study of water supply. They would further communicate with the Water Supplies Department to obtain the latest information;
- (b) on sewage discharge, they would further communicate with the Environmental Protection Department to learn about the schedule of village sewerage gradually implemented in Sha Tin and Tai Po Districts. They would further contact individual DC Members after the meeting;
- (c) Phase 3 Public Engagement had been held in Kwong Yuen Commercial Centre adjacent to Castello. If necessary, the concerned department was willing to go to Castello to explain project content to its residents;
- (d) this project did not include relocation of refuse transfer stations to caverns. They would relay opinions to relevant departments for follow-up;
- (e) the concerned department also attached importance to Area 73. Part of the buildings of the sewage treatment works would be located in the district suggested in an earlier proposal, occupying one hectare of land. The current design had relocated the administration building to entrance of the caverns and used high-rise development so as to minimise the use of land;
- (f) DC Members suggested there should be a certain distance between the geological fault lines and the location of caverns. The concerned department might study it in details to ensure the construction work would not be affected;
- (g) according to the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance, reports should be submitted in accordance with the required procedures. After receipt of reports, the Environmental Protection Department would have 60 days for technical assessment before public consultation. The report of the current stage was preliminary. The concerned department was in the process of collecting opinions of various departments on this preliminary version to improve its content. The report was not yet available for public inspection as some amendment might be required;
- (h) the Government had its established policies on compensation of community facilities. DC Members could raise their opinions, which the concerned department would relay to relevant departments;
- (i) technically speaking, an odour unit of less than 1 was the minimum unit, a level that the odour was hardly recognisable. The former location of the ventilation shaft had a bigger impact on the environment. The currently proposed location involved construction of a ventilation tunnel underground so the overall plan had a smaller impact on the environment; and
- (j) for emergencies, there were main and side entrances in the caverns. In case an emergency occurred in A Kung Kok Street, if Mui Tsz Lam Road was not blocked at the same time, firemen could still enter the caverns. The concerned

department also considered the construction of a tunnel connecting locations besides A Kung Kok Street, such as Shek Mun. But the tunnel required was too long and the involved cost would be too high.

19. The Chairman hoped the concerned department could calculate as soon as possible how many hectares of land in Area 73 would be used and follow up with DC Members and also hoped the Environmental Protection Department could note the proposal of relocating refuse transfer stations. He suggested that the concerned department should follow up the Environmental Impact Assessment reports and entrance problems of A Kung Kok Street with individual DC Members, and residents of Pictorial Garden and Castello should be invited to join the community liaison group in the future.

Reprovisioning of Sha Tin Fu Shan Public Mortuary
(Paper No. HE 3/2016)

20. The Chairman welcomed Professor Sophia CHAN, Under Secretary for Food & Health and Dr Bobby SHUM, Head of New Territories Division, Forensic Pathology Service, Regulatory Affairs and Health Services of the Department of Health, and representatives of the Food and Health Bureau, Department of Health, Architectural Services Department and Transport Department to attend the meeting.

21. Professor Sophia CHAN and Dr Bobby SHUM gave a brief introduction of the content of the paper.

22. The views of Mr TING Tsz-yuen were summarised below:

- (a) he fully supported the reprovisioning plan of Fu Shan Public Mortuary. As the convenor of concern group for consumer interests regarding columbaria, he always discussed with the concerned department on how to increase supply of columbarium and mortuary. He opined that the reprovisioning plan could help ease the high-price problem of privately-run columbarium;
- (b) the current occupancy rate of mortuaries should be over 80%. He hoped the concerned department could commence the works as soon as possible; and
- (c) the paper contained no information of coach parking area. According to the current planning, 45 private vehicle parking spaces were expected to be provided. He wanted to know how to calculate the result. Vehicles were often parked outside the mortuary. He opined that 45 vehicle parking spaces might not be enough.

23. The views of Mr HO Hau-cheung were summarised below:

- (a) he had been in negotiation with representatives of Lakeview Garden and stakeholders of Po Fook Memorial Hall. As the development was restricted by factors such as objective environment and planning, causing traffic congestion in the district and serious disturbance to local residents, he hoped the Government should take the opportunity to solve traffic problem in the district while implementing the reprovisioning plan;

- (b) he supported the reprovisioning of Fu Shan Public Mortuary. Besides increasing the number of private vehicle parking spaces, he recommended the entrance of the car park be changed from Yau On Street to Lower Shing Mun Road, and the vehicles transporting dead bodies use the entrance in Yau On Street; and
- (c) he opined that after reprovisioning the mortuary, the concerned department should fully use the parking spaces of the existing mortuary, which would be open to large coaches for parking and boarding and alighting to solve the illegal parking problem at Yau On Street.

24. The views of Mr CHING Cheung-ying were summarised below:

- (a) Fu Shan Public Mortuary had been long overcrowded so he supported the reprovisioning plan;
- (b) he asked the concerned department how to enhance the public transport services in the district such as green minibus services;
- (c) as these parking spaces were very inadequate, he opined parking spaces for staff should be open to the public at night. As 45 private vehicle parking spaces were not sufficient, additional parking spaces should be added;
- (d) he opined public vehicles should use the entrance of Lower Shing Mun Road and entrance of Yau On Street should be used by the vehicles transporting dead bodies; and
- (e) the concerned department also needed to enhance ancillary facilities of crematorium and columbarium in addition to Mortuary.

25. The views of Mr TONG Hok-leung were summarised below:

- (a) he supported the reprovisioning plan in principle. However, he hoped the concerned department could take this opportunity to solve the traffic problem in the district in the long term;
- (b) he previously exchanged views with the chairman of the owners' corporation of Lakeview Garden and village representative and residents of Tai Wai New Village and learned that the illegal parking problem was very serious there. Residents of Lakeview Garden raised several demands, including settlement of the illegal parking problem, increase in the number of parking spaces, setting up boarding and alighting points for full-sized buses;
- (c) he hoped Transport Department could put up fences along the pavement to prevent illegal parking of vehicles on the pavement;
- (d) the Government had not given any notice to or consulted residents of Lakeview Garden and Tai Wai New Village in advance. He hoped a liaison group could be established in future to communicate with and collect opinions from the residents;

- (e) there were no leisure grounds in Tai Wai New Village. He hoped leisure grounds could be provided for neighbouring residents in the reprovisioning plan; and
- (f) he hoped the Government could address residents' concerns in relation to connection of a footbridge and pavement with the existing and reprovisioned mortuaries.

26. The views of Mr MOK Kam-kwai were summarised below:

- (a) the traffic around Tai Wai New Village was always congested during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung Festivals. Also, there were no green minibus services. To protect the safety of the residents, he hoped the parking spaces in the reprovisioned mortuary could be open to the public 24 hours a day and additional number parking space could be provided; and
- (b) he hoped leisure grounds in the district could be increased.

27. The views of Mr PUN Kwok-shan were summarised below:

- (a) he did not agree that reprovisioning of the mortuary would bring only small external traffic and pedestrian flow into the area as set out in the paper. He opined that some stakeholders from Lower Shing Mun Road to Yau On Street would be affected, including Tai Wai New Village, Pui Kiu College, Po Fook Memorial Hall and service reservoirs of the Water Supplies Department;
- (b) traffic congestion in the district was serious now. Storage capacity of dead bodies of the extended mortuary would be 3.8 times of the current capacity. In considering such purpose together with other uses, the Transport Department should widen the roads and improve the pedestrian crossing facilities;
- (c) Po Fook Memorial Hall currently had no suitable place to house refuse containers and refuse collection vehicles. He hoped this problem could be also solved while reprovisioning the mortuary; and
- (d) he hoped a liaison group could be set up for stakeholders to participate in the program.

28. The views of Ms CHAN Man-kuen were summarised below:

- (a) she opined the reprovisioning plan helped solve social problems, but attendees had expressed concerns about the problem of transport ancillary facilities due to the traffic chaos and the parking of large vehicles in the district, posing a danger to pedestrians and drivers. She hoped the said problems could be solved when implementing the reprovisioning plan; and
- (b) she hoped the concerned department could consider conducting a traffic impact assessment and increasing the number of parking spaces.

29. The views of Mr WONG Hok-lai were summarised below:
- (a) the illegal parking problem in Lakeview Garden was serious. But the concerned department provided 45 private vehicle parking spaces only. He asked whether the concerned department would provide parking spaces for coaches;
 - (b) storage capacity in the reprovisioned mortuary substantially increased to 830 dead bodies, imposing additional pressure on the nearby traffic conditions. 45 private vehicle parking spaces were not sufficient to accommodate the demands. He hoped the concerned department could reconsider how to improve the nearby traffic conditions;
 - (c) Fu Shan Public Mortuary was in the vicinity of Lower Shing Mun Road and Yau On Street and green minibus services would be affected;
 - (d) he asked the concerned department about how to proceed greening works; and
 - (e) he asked the concerned department about how to reduce the impact of smoke and odour produced from small-sized incense burners on the environment.
30. The views of Ms Scarlett PONG were summarised below:
- (a) after a previous visit to Fu Shan Public Mortuary, she opined that the overall design, ancillary facilities, work flow and infection control of the existing mortuary were not satisfactory. In addition, improper design of the workplace for identifying dead bodies was no different to a disrespect to ancestors;
 - (b) she hoped the concerned department could accommodate the needs of full-sized buses' passengers for boarding and alighting and their safety, and put up fences along the pavement to prevent illegal parking; and
 - (c) she hoped that parking spaces for private vehicles, full-sized buses and trucks could be increased, and that Po Fook Memorial Hall could arrange parking spaces for its coffin vans itself, instead of allowing the coffin vans to be parked on the street illegally. Generally speaking, she supported the reprovisioning plan.
31. The views of Ms TUNG Kin-lei were summarised below:
- (a) the existing mortuary was equipped with outdated facilities. She supported the reprovisioning plan but opined the concerned department should spare no efforts in solving the traffic problems; and
 - (b) problems of parking spaces and illegal parking caused disturbance to local residents. She hoped the local traffic and environment could be improved together when implementing the reprovisioning plan. In addition, disturbance to residents by wild animals occurred occasionally. She was worried that more monkeys would be attracted into the district in future after the reprovisioning of the mortuary.

32. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) he said more than 10 private vehicle parking spaces were reserved for doctors of the Department of Health. The district currently lacked parking spaces for full-sized buses and was faced with the problem of illegal parking. Additional 45 private vehicle parking spaces would be provided after reprovisioning of the mortuary. Currently, there was 23 private vehicle parking spaces with on-street parking meters in Yau On Street and additional 10 such parking spaces would be provided in Lower Shing Mun Road. But the concerned department did not address the parking arrangement for coaches and problem of passenger boarding and alighting at the entrance of Po Fook Memorial Hall;
- (b) the concerned department did not provide information such as floor plan and ideas of the new mortuary and it was difficult for DC Members to understand the design;
- (c) he suggested the concerned department report the revised content of the reprovisioning plan in the future meeting after collecting members' opinions; and
- (d) he declared interest that his friend was living in Lakeview Garden.

33. The views of Mr WAI Hing-cheung were summarised below:

- (a) due to the current high utilisation rate of Fu Shan Public Mortuary, he did not oppose the reprovisioning plan;
- (b) the Government considered establishing a public mortuary in each of the five districts. He asked why the mortuary in Sha Tin was selected to be reprovisioned first; and
- (c) he did not think that the Transport Department had solved the traffic problem in the district proactively. Proposed increase in parking spaces did not help solve problems of illegal parking and insufficient parking spaces. The Transport Department should actively find out the solutions.

34. The views of Ms Iris WONG were summarised below:

- (a) the expansion plan of Fu Shan Public Mortuary was imminent, to which stakeholders raised no objection. But the concerned department did not address the long-standing traffic problems of the surrounding areas. She hoped parking spaces could be added in Yau On Street so as to solve the illegal parking problem;
- (b) she agreed with the opinions of the owners' corporation of Lakeview Garden, including connecting the existing and new mortuaries with a footbridge, facilitating mortuary staff and relatives to travel between the mortuaries and Yau On Street; and
- (c) she hoped the concerned department could address the concerns of the owners' corporation of Lakeview Garden.

35. Mr Rick HUI said that according to the paper, it was estimated the total storage capacity of dead bodies of various public mortuaries to reach 1 300, and this reprovisioning plan was designed to accommodate the said demand. He said the total capacity of remaining public mortuaries together with Fu Shan Public Mortuary after reprovisioning would have reached 1 080. The need for expansion of other public mortuaries would decline. He hoped the concerned department could explain to the neighbouring residents why Fu Shan Public Mortuary was selected as the target of reprovisioning and expansion and report mortuary projects of other districts at the same time.

36. The Chairman asked the Transport Department whether the number of parking spaces in the reprovisioning plan was sufficient to meet the existing and future demands.

37. Professor Sophia CHAN gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the concerned department had engaged a transport consultant to conduct a traffic impact assessment of the district. The figures of the concerned department was in line with those provided by the owners' corporation of Lakeview Garden;
- (b) the traffic flow during daytime and night-time was monitored by the concerned department, including flow of private vehicles and illegal parking circumstance. The preliminary view was that the new parking spaces, after reprovisioning of Fu Shan Public Mortuary, was sufficient to meet demand. The concerned department also noted the calls of various parties for new parking spaces of private vehicles and large vehicles;
- (c) in response to the questions raised by members, including insufficient parking spaces, illegal parking, lack of parking spaces for large vehicles, the preliminary proposal after negotiation of several departments was that the area surrounding the outdoor body farewell booth of the existing mortuary, after reprovisioning, would be converted into parking spaces for large vehicles. The concerned department would submit application to the relevant authorities in relation to the said proposal as soon as possible;
- (d) there would be some difficulties in terms of timing and planning if the number of storeys of the toll car park in the reprovisioned mortuary needed to be added. But the concerned department would discuss with the Architectural Services Department and maximise the number of new private vehicle parking spaces where possible after reprovisioning of the mortuary;
- (e) the Transport Department had added 10 private vehicle parking spaces with on-street parking meters at Lower Shing Mun Road and would discuss with the Highways Department the possibility of further increase. The concerned department would also follow up and hoped it could address the demands by members and the public;
- (f) the procedure of claiming back dead bodies in the mortuary was processed during daytime, while 24-hour operation of receiving dead bodies was available. Toll car park of the reprovisioned mortuary would be open around the clock;

- (g) members suggested a comprehensive planning from mortuary, cremation to columbarium be conducted. The concerned department had an overall planning in place and was expected to report on the Shek Mun Columbarium Project to DC Members in future meetings;
- (h) the concerned department would continue to communicate with the residents regarding the demands of the owners' corporation of Lakeview Garden; and
- (i) a body farewell booth would be set up indoors of the reprovisioned mortuary. The initial plan of the Department of Health was that the existing mortuary would be used for drilling, emergency and administration purposes after the reprovisioned mortuary commenced operation. Therefore, mortuary staff and visitors need not travel frequently between the existing and new mortuaries. So it was unnecessary to build a footbridge connecting existing and new mortuaries.

38. Mr TONG Cheung, Engineer (Sha Tin 1) of the Transport Department gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the concerned department had prepared a traffic impact assessment report in relation to the development project. According to the traffic impact assessment report, the development project did not create high traffic flow. It was expected the adjacent road junctions and roads were able to accommodate the increased traffic flow after completion of the project;
- (b) for the problem of illegal parking in Yau On Street, figures of private vehicle illegal parking shown in the traffic impact assessment report were in line with those provided by the owners' corporation of Lakeview Garden, showing more cases of illegal parking of private vehicles at night-time. Based on figures from Lakeview Garden, about 80 private vehicles parked along Yau On Street at peak time, including 23 private vehicles parking in vehicle parking spaces with on-street parking meters. At most off-peak periods, about 30 to 40 vehicles parked there. 45 private vehicle parking spaces would be provided in the reprovisioned mortuary and 10 vehicle parking spaces with on-street parking meters would be added at Lower Shing Mun Road, which could reach a total of 78 private vehicle parking spaces at Yau On Street area after counting the existing 23 vehicle parking spaces with on-street parking meters. It could meet the demand in the district;
- (c) in addition, the traffic impact assessment report showed that about 4 to 5 trucks and large coaches parked in Yau On Street at peak time in the morning while about 3 trucks and large coaches on average parked there at other times. The said figures were also in line with those figures provided by local residents;
- (d) the concerned department would consider the proposal that fences and pedestrian crossings be added in the relevant road sections, taking into account the future traffic circumstances and needs;
- (e) entrances at Lower Shing Mun Road and Yau On Street should comply with relevant design standards. The reprovisioning of Fu Shan Public Mortuary needed to cope with operations in case of disasters, including access for the

large vehicles of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) transporting dead bodies. Due to this reason, in designing vehicle access, the Architectural Services Department would take into account the need to ensure smooth flow of large vehicles. Therefore, the arrangement of access locations for relevant vehicles was made. In addition, vehicular flow capacity of Yau On Street was 800 vehicles per hour. According to the traffic impact assessment report, the road section was able to cope with the future additional traffic flow to and from the reprovisioned Fu Shan Public Mortuary;

- (f) the current traffic mode there was different from that of normal commercial buildings or shopping malls. As seen from the traffic impact assessment report, the greatest number of private vehicles, namely 80, went to and parked at Yau On Street area within a 30-minute interval during 7 pm to 8 pm and 30 to 40 vehicles parked there at most other times. Therefore, it was believed that 45 private vehicle parking spaces in the reprovisioned Fu Shan Public Mortuary could not only meet additional parking needs arising from the reprovisioned mortuary but also help ease the tight demands for parking spaces in the surrounding area; and
- (g) currently there was no information showing that there would be large development projects.

39. Ms Sarah NG, Architect / 107 of the Architectural Services Department gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the concerned department conducted a study on vehicular access locations, taking into account the needs from local community and operation of the reprovisioned mortuary, including use of large vehicles by the FEHD in case of disasters to transport dead bodies. The reprovisioned mortuary needed to ensure smooth access for these vehicles;
- (b) the carriageway of Yau On Street was 7.3 metres wide. There were more passengers boarding and alighting at the vehicle access points near Po Fook Memorial Hall and the traffic flow there was heavier. When the large vehicles transporting dead bodies moved from the reprovisioned mortuary building to Yau On Street, they might cross opposite lane, thereby affecting the traffic and posing a danger. The carriageway of Lower Shing Mun Road was wider, which was about 9 metres, providing more room for access of large vehicles transporting dead bodies, and was a safer way. Access points of vehicles transporting dead bodies of the reprovisioned mortuary would be set at Lower Shing Mun Road; and
- (c) in respect of the design, greening elements would be added to the exterior wall and rooftop of the main building for integration into the surrounding environment. It would also comply with the guidelines by the Development Bureau that required to set aside no less than 20% of total green area with greening as an important design element.

40. Dr Bobby SHUM gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the storage capacity of dead bodies of the existing three public mortuaries, with an average utilisation rate up to 89%, was insufficient. In Fu Shan Public Mortuary, for example, its actual storage sometimes exceeded the pre-set level of 216 bodies. The mortuary would take temporary measures to store dead bodies when necessary. For example, movable storage devices would be installed in passages of the refrigeration body store for separate storage of dead bodies. As this arrangement was not satisfactory and might affect the operation, there was a need for reprovisioning Fu Shan Public Mortuary to improve the insufficient storage capacity of dead bodies currently and meet the additional demand of body storage arising from ageing population. In addition, a buffer capacity of body storage should also be provided as a large space for body storage required for dealing with emergent disasters;
- (b) the body storage capacity of the reprovisioned Fu Shan Public Mortuary was formulated based on long-term capacity needs and buffer capacity required for coping with disasters. Therefore, while the body storage capacity of the reprovisioned Fu Shan Public Mortuary would reach 830 dead bodies, the number of cases for handling dead bodies was expected to increase by 90% only by 2031. Increased pedestrian flow brought by the reprovisioned mortuary was mainly affected by number of cases of handling dead bodies and therefore the actual pedestrian flow would not rise by several times;
- (c) in addition to the reprovisioning plan of Fu Shan Public Mortuary in Sha Tin, the reprovisioning plan of Victoria Public Mortuary in Hong Kong Island was also underway;
- (d) none of the 45 private vehicle parking spaces in the reprovisioned Fu Shan Public Mortuary was reserved for exclusive use of staff of the Department of Health. The staff could park at parking spaces of the existing mortuary if necessary;
- (e) the utilisation rate of incense burners of Fu Shan Public Mortuary was not high. Only about one-third of bereaved relatives would use the body farewell facilities of the mortuary and do incense burning to a small extent only. Some incense burner products that met environmental protection requirements and were designed to reduce smoke emission were also available in the market; and
- (f) body farewell rooms were set up indoors of the reprovisioned mortuary so that wild animals would not be attracted to the area.

41. Mr LEUNG Ka-fung, Senior Project Manager 222 of the Architectural Services Department said that greening elements would be included in the exterior wall and rooftop, which was based on intelligent environmental protection, in respect of building design. The parking spaces were designed to meet the needs of members of various sectors. They would follow up and consider adding more private vehicle parking spaces in the toll car park of the building.

42. The Chairman opined that the members had responded favourably to the reprovisioning plan but hoped the concerned department could follow up the traffic problems.

He opined it was unnecessary to set up obnoxious facilities such as mortuaries, cemeteries and landfills at each district, and it was reasonable to set up the said facilities based on actual needs. He suggested the concerned department should show information such as design drawings and parking space arrangement of the reprovisioned mortuary in future meetings.

43. The Chairman asked members if they agreed to discuss the two provisional motions put forward by Mr TING Tsz-yuen and Mr TONG Hok-leung respectively.

44. Members agreed to discuss the two said provisional motions.

45. Mr TING Tsz-yuen put forward the following provisional motion:

“The Health and Environment Committee of the Sha Tin District Council requests that when reprovisioning Fu Shan Public Mortuary in Sha Tin, the concerned department shall better arrange transport ancillary facilities along Yau On Street, Yau Ting Street and Lower Shing Mun Road and conduct comprehensive consultation with local residents; that the concerned department shall work on improving service facilities of Fu Shan Public Mortuary to shorten the waiting time; and that the concerned department shall also consider implementing the Columbarium Development Scheme in Sha Tin as soon as possible so as to ease the inadequate supply of columbaria in Hong Kong.”

Mr Wilson LI seconded the motion.

46. Ms Iris WONG said that it was unnecessary to put forward a motion at this meeting in relation to the Columbarium Development Scheme in Shek Mun, Sha Tin and hoped that the wording “the concerned department shall also consider implementing the Columbarium Development Scheme in Sha Tin as soon as possible so as to ease the inadequate supply of columbarium in Hong Kong” could be deleted. She suggested members pay a site visit to Shek Mun to look into the local situation.

47. The Chairman said the concerned department would arrange members to pay a site visit to the columbarium.

48. Mr TING Tsz-yuen said that the concerned department mentioned the supply of mortuary, crematorium and columbarium as an overall plan and columbarium might not be necessarily set up in Shek Mun.

49. Mr Michael YUNG put forward the amended motion as follows: “the concerned department shall also conduct consultation on the Columbarium Development Scheme in Sha Tin and address local opposition so as to ease the inadequate supply of columbarium in Hong Kong”.

50. Mr YIU Ka-chun opined it was improper to request for implementation of the Columbarium Development Scheme in Sha Tin without consultation. If reprovisioning of mortuary and construction of columbarium were thought to fall under the same group of ancillary facilities, a territory-wide consultation should be made. He suggested the motion proposer add the wording “Hong Kong”.

51. The Chairman opined that the main point of discussion of this meeting was the reprovisioning plan of Fu Shan Public Mortuary and its impact on the traffic of local community, and hoped the mover could accept the recommendation of other members.

52. Mr TING Tsz-yuen put forward the amended provisional motion as follows:

“The Health and Environment Committee of the Sha Tin District Council requests that when reprovisioning Fu Shan Public Mortuary in Sha Tin, the concerned department shall better arrange transport ancillary facilities along Yau On Street, Yau Ting Street and Lower Shing Mun Road and conduct comprehensive consultation with local residents; that the concerned department shall work on improving service facilities of Fu Shan Public Mortuary to shorten the waiting time; and that the concerned department shall also consider implementing a territory-wide columbarium development scheme as soon as possible and consulting stakeholders so as to ease the inadequate supply of columbaria in Hong Kong.”

Mr Wilson LI seconded the motion.

53. Members unanimously endorsed the provisional motion in paragraph 52.

54. Mr TONG Hok-leung put forward the following provisional motion:

“The Health and Environment Committee of Sha Tin District Council supports the Government in principle to plan well ahead to actively solve the problem of insufficient public mortuaries, and strongly demands that the concerned department increase public parking spaces, improve transport facilities of the surrounding areas and solve the long-standing problems of illegal parking and traffic congestion in the district while reprovisioning Fu Shan Public Mortuary”

Mr MOK Kam-kwai seconded the motion.

55. Members unanimously endorsed the provisional motion in paragraph 54.

56. The Chairman hoped the concerned department could cope with the traffic problem seriously. Members unanimously endorsed the above paper in relation to the reprovisioning of Fu Shan Public Mortuary.

Recommendation of Representatives for Market Management Consultative Committees
(Paper No. HE 4/2016)

57. Mr Eric TSAI, District Environment Hygiene Superintendent (Sha Tin) of the FEHD thanked Members of the previous Sha Tin District Council who participated in the Market Management Consultative Committees, including Mr WAI Hing-cheung, Ms YUE Shin-man and Mr WONG Yue-hon of Sha Tin Market; Ms TUNG Kin-lei, Mr LEE Kam-ming and Mr TANG Wing-cheong of Tai Wai Market; Ms Scarlett PONG of Fo Tan Cooked Food Market (East and West). They provided valuable opinions on the operation and promotion plan of the markets and other related matters. He gave a brief introduction of the content of the paper.

58. Members unanimously endorsed the above paper.

Extension of Opening Hours of Shing Ho Road Refuse Collection Point
(Paper No. HE 5/2016)

59. Mr Eric TSAI gave a brief introduction of the content of the paper.
60. The views of Ms TUNG Kin-lei were summarised below:
- (a) due to the current unsatisfactory environmental conditions of Shing Ho Road Refuse Collection Point, she hoped the concerned department could commence improvement works as soon as possible;
 - (b) residents were worried that they would suffer noise disturbance after the extension of service time. It would be better if a service operator would be stationed there or the gates would be closed; and
 - (c) there were more merchants in Tai Wai Market to use the refuse collection point. Extension of service time helped improve the street hygiene but its operation should be monitored to avoid disturbance to local residents.
61. The views of Mr HO Hau-cheung were summarised below:
- (a) he hoped the concerned department could study the reason why there was still garbage outside the refuse collection point at midnight. He wondered whether the extension of service time for two hours could solve the problem; and
 - (b) he agreed a trial run for three months and asked the concerned department about the measures to take to avoid garbage dumping outside the refuse collection point.
62. The views of Mr WAI Hing-cheung were summarised below:
- (a) as mentioned by the FEHD, rubbish was often dumped outside individual collection points at midnight. He asked whether it referred to all refuse collection points in Hong Kong or Sha Tin Refuse Collection Point and wondered why only the service time of Shing Ho Road Refuse Collection Point was extended;
 - (b) he opined that it was more probable for restaurants to dump rubbish outside the station as they would dispose of food waste before closing;
 - (c) he hoped to learn from the concerned department the criteria for determining the extension of service time to 1:30 am; and
 - (d) he suggested those restaurants closing at late night should borrow or lease large rubbish bins for use nearby the station so as to reduce disturbance to local residents.
63. The views of Mr Rick HUI were summarised below:
- (a) the concerned department should make a site investigation to identify who dumped rubbish at midnight so as to find a right remedy to the problem; and

- (b) Mr LI Sai-hung made a site investigation at Shing Ho Road Refuse Collection Point before 6:00 am on 24 February 2016 and after 5:00 am on 7 March 2016, respectively. He found that the refuse collection point was clean and dry and a lot of room existed inside large rubbish bins. Therefore, he opined that the concerned department should consider whether there service time still needed to be extended for avoidance of disturbance to the neighbouring residents.

64. The views of Mr WONG Hok-lai were summarised below:

- (a) many restaurants at Shing Ho Road closed late at night. Extended service time of refuse collection points to 1:30 am might not help; and
- (b) he hoped to learn from the concerned department the criteria for determining the extension of service time;

65. Mr Eric TSAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the concerned department made the proposed extension of service time only after site investigation. There were many restaurants in Tai Wai, most of which would transport their rubbish to the refuse collection points for disposal only after they closed at 1:00 am. To tackle the problem, the concerned department proposed extending the service time to ensure the rubbish to be disposed of inside the refuse collection point;
- (b) only a few restaurants operated until 2:00 am to 3:00 am. A trial run for three months first was determined after considering the refuse quantity and demand;
- (c) the concerned department had reminded restaurants that they should dispose of their rubbish inside the refuse collection point. But now most restaurants still operated after the closing of the refuse collection point. In addition to prosecution against offenders of littering, the concerned department also hoped to provide the facilities required so as to improve environmental hygiene;
- (d) the concerned department also noted that residential buildings were adjacent to the refuse collection point. Therefore, a worker would be arranged to be stationed there to tell residents to put rubbish into rubbish bins lightly. Large machinery at the refuse collection point would cease operation and the gate would be closed so as to reduce impact to the neighbouring residents;
- (e) large rubbish bins of the concerned department could be lent to restaurants for use and restaurants could move them back to the refuse collection point after use. However, as streets in Tai Wai were generally narrow and residents' access would be affected if large rubbish bins were placed at the roadside, and noise would be produced when moving the rubbish bins back to the refuse collection point, causing disturbance to residents; and
- (f) there were six main refuse collection points in Sha Tin and no similar problems arose from other refuse collection points. The concerned department would report to members the progress again and conduct a review after the trial run for three months.

Proposed Estimates and Funding Proposals of Local Organisations under Expenditure Head 4 (Health and Environment) of 2016/2017
(Paper No. HE 6/2016)

66. Members unanimously endorsed the above paper.

Questions

Question to be raised by Ms PONG Scarlett Oi-lan on Investigation of the Pollution Issue of Shing Mun River and Improvement Measures
(Paper No. HE 7/2016)

67. The views of Ms Scarlett PONG were summarised below:

- (a) she asked whether similar problem of river dyeing had occurred before; if yes, whether sources of the problem were found or prosecution were made at last; whether the number of prosecution could be provided after the meeting; and how the concerned department would prevent the occurrence of similar incidents;
- (b) the representatives of the Environmental Protection Department said the flow interceptors had been tested and it was found that sewage could flow to drain inlets from nearby public sewerage via the flow interceptors. Besides the said facilities, she asked whether the concerned department had worked with the Drainage Services Department to investigate the conditions of other drains to ensure no leakage from the cracks of drains;
- (c) according to the test results on water quality from 13 to 14 December 2015, water of a nullah contained a small quantity of domestic sewage. She asked whether the concerned department had re-collected water samples for testing subsequently. She also asked whether the above situation was an individual case or a regular one;
- (d) according to the test results, she asked whether the concerned department considered that water discoloration of Fo Tan nullah was caused by industrial sewage;
- (e) a large blue area in the river showed it contained a certain quantity of pollutants and should not be the result of general domestic sewage. Test results showed that cadmium level drastically decreased on 14 December. She asked about the views of the concerned department on this result. She also asked whether the concerned department would conduct an investigation on the industries that produced cadmium and their discharge facilities;
- (f) under the current mechanism, if public drainage facilities were damaged accidentally which would possibly affect the water quality of Shing Mun River, the Drainage Services Department would inform the affected Water Sports Centre. She asked how the said mechanism worked and how long it took to inform the centre;

- (g) the Environmental Protection Department might consider setting up water quality monitoring stations at Shing Mun River and continuous monitoring of water quality or release of simple information, such as pH value and dissolved oxygen, for information of citizens participating in water sports. She also hoped that the concerned department could release data on water quality regularly for monitoring by members;
- (h) the level of sludge accumulated in the river was too high to commence dragon boat training that met the standards. She asked for the reason of not clearing the sludge near Hong Kong China Dragon Boat Association for protection of the health of water sports athletes;
- (i) she suggested that the Government should improve water quality in stages and set up a reporting mechanism on water quality for citizens participating in water sports. In short term, she opined that it was necessary to establish an inter-departmental working group designated to deal with dead fishes and pollution of Shing Mun River and Tolo Harbour and identify the reason of these two problems as soon as possible and whether they were inter-related, and report the information to the Sha Tin District Council; and
- (j) as the water quality of Shing Mun River continuously deteriorated, she opined the Government needed to consider setting up water quality monitoring stations at Shing Mun River, for information of citizens before participating in water sports. In long term, she suggested that the Government should formulate a long-term water improvement scheme for Shing Mun River and its tributary and establish a monitoring mechanism for abrupt or extreme weather conditions for the river and nearby waters and take action in response to the circumstance.

68. The views of Mr HO Hau-cheung were summarised below:

- (a) the dead fish incident was not usual, and causes of dead fish could be found in past incidents. The current incident had aroused concern and panic of local residents; and
- (b) the incident involved many government departments. He asked whether various departments worked together to discuss and follow up the incident and whether a lead department existed to be responsible for dealing with similar cases in the future.

69. The views of Mr PUN Kwok-shan were summarised below:

- (a) there had always been dead fish at Shing Mun River and no various departments involved could find out the causes;
- (b) the paper mentioned parasitic infection only, and he opined that more information should be provided to expand the test range to viruses, bacteria and fungi, etc.;
- (c) the Environmental Protection Department was responsible for the water quality of Shing Mun River. But the concerned department did not provide members

with specific information in relation to accidental damage of drainage facilities or discharge of untreated sewage into rivers. He hoped to know whether offenders of illegal discharge had been penalised in past three years; and

- (d) antibiotics in the rivers in Hong Kong exceeded the standard. He asked whether antibiotics were related to the dead fish incident.

70. Dr Jim CHU, Senior Fisheries Officer (Aquaculture Fisheries) of the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the scope of fish pathogen testing could include bacterial infection and viral infection. However, the said test requires the use of live bodies, such as affected and fish that was alive. Dead fish could only undergo the parasites test;
- (b) the impact of antibiotics on fish could be assessed only with the information of the type and dose of antibiotics; and
- (c) many cultured fishes died in several fish culture zones of Tolo Harbour, which was likely to be caused by red tides. The Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department was responsible for coordinating subsequent follow-up work of dead fish in fish culture zones caused by red tides.

71. Mr Henry CHENG, Environmental Protection Officer (Special Waste & Landfill Restoration) 33 of the Environmental Protection Department gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) after receiving a complaint that the rivers near a nullah were dyed, the Environmental Protection Department would conduct an investigation. If the sources of pollution were found, the concerned department would demand that the party involved stop discharging dyeing materials. If it failed to find the sources, the concerned department would still follow up the matters;
- (b) the concerned department would regularly inspect the water quality of individual points at Shing Mun River and Fo Tan Nullah, and grasp the status of water quality based on such figures. Investigation would be conducted on sources of sewage if unusual circumstance was found, and follow-up would be made;
- (c) the concerned department would contact the Drainage Services Department on sewage matters to investigate the situation of nearby drains, such as whether breakage, leakage and reverse flow, etc. existed;
- (d) the Environmental Protection Department inspected the concerned industrial area to ensure proper discharge of sewage of individual units. If problems were found, the concerned department would immediately advise and recommend the party involved to take remedial actions. The party would be prosecuted if it violated the laws and sufficient evidence had been collected;

- (e) the Drainage Services Department would inspect and repair the drains in the coming months and arrange workers to clear sludge near Man Lai Court in Tai Wai;
- (f) the concerned department took water samples monthly at ten points of Shing Mun River for testing, released the report on its website in the past few months, and also uploaded figures of *Escherichia coli* and dissolved oxygen to its website monthly; and
- (g) long-term and continuous monitoring was not probable based on the current resources. Based on certain indicators, laboratories needed to take several days to process the samples and no immediate result would be available.

72. Mr CHAU Wai, Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Regional North) 4 of the Environmental Protection Department gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the Environmental Protection Department and Drainage Services Department would take a series of joint operation, including inspection of all industrial buildings at Fo Tan industrial area, such as checking whether there was any improper sewer connection;
- (b) the sewage produced from cleaning facilities of open car parks and platforms might probably flow into Fo Tan Nullah. The concerned department had sent letters to all property management companies in the concerned industrial estates to avoid the said situation;
- (c) the Drainage Services Department would inspect the drainage of Fo Tan industrial area via closed-circuit TV to detect any cracks for prompt repair;
- (d) some old villages in Tai Wai were installed with dry weather flow interceptors, causing flow of domestic sewage into Tai Wai Nullah if the interceptor was blocked. The Drainage Services Department would increase the cleaning frequency to once a month and install sensors at appropriate locations to detect whether the interceptors were blocked and advise the villagers not to pour sewage or rubbish into the storm water drain;
- (e) due to geographical factors, sludge at a section of Shing Mun River near Man Lai Court in Tai Wai was prone to accumulate. The Drainage Services Department would commence large-scale clearing activities in the coming few months;
- (f) the concerned department could increase the number of dry weather flow interceptors, and members were welcome to give their recommendations on locations of interceptors;
- (g) if improper sewer connection or leakage of sewage from villages were found, the concerned department would advise and recommend the parties involved to take remedial actions or adopt interception methods. The party would be prosecuted if it violated the laws and sufficient evidence had been collected;

- (h) the concerned department would report to the HEC the results of the said actions;
- (i) the working group or lead department responsible for this matter might differ depending on the circumstance or the district involved. The wide-encompassing problem of dead fish included flow of external dead fish into Shing Mun River. The Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department took the lead in dealing with red tides and providing technical support for fish pathogen testing; the FEHD was responsible for clearing the dead fish and the Drainage Services Department was responsible for clearing the bottom of the river. The Environmental Protection Department would take the lead in dealing with pollution or water quality protection of Shing Mun River; and
- (j) the concerned department had set up a task force to take water samples of Shing Mun River monthly and then upload information to its website, the details of which could be given to the members after the meeting.

73. Mr LAI Kwai-cheung, Senior Engineer (Kowloon and New Territories South 1) of the Drainage Services Department gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) a trunk sewerage at Yuen Wo Road collapsed last year. The concerned department would directly inform the relevant parties such as rowing associations, if the trunk sewerage was blocked during repair, causing flow of sewage into Shing Mun River or Fo Tan Nullah; and
- (b) the concerned department regularly inspected the sewers. Its goal was to complete inspection of all sewers once via closed-circuit TV within five to ten years. As an incident of river dyeing in Fo Tan occurred recently, the concerned department would advance the date of inspecting sewers in Fo Tan, and it was expected to complete in the middle of the year.

74. Mr Eric TSAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the concerned department continuously contacted and cooperated with the Drainage Services Department on clearance of dead fish from last December to this January; and
- (b) the concerned department cleared dead fish in Shing Mun River daily and did clearance in the river bank of Man Lai Court. A liaison system with the Marine Department was established in early February this year in relation to arrangement of increase in clearance vessels.

75. Mr Simon WONG, Assistant District Officer of the Sha Tin District Office said that Sha Tin District Office could coordinate with various governmental departments in follow-up of water quality of Shing Mun River. He welcomed members to reflect their opinions to the Sha Tin District Office.

Question to be Raised by Mr YIP Wing on the Use of Vacant Land in Ma On Shan for Recreational Purposes
(Paper No. HE 8/2016)

76. The views of Mr YIP Wing were summarised below:

- (a) a grassland located between Block 6 of Vista Paradiso and Christian Alliance Toi Shan H.C. Chan Primary School near Sai Sha Road, and the vacant land at the south of Block 1 of Baycrest were for recreational purpose but wire meshes were put up around the lands for years. Many people saw the said vacant land as a place to dump rubbish;
- (b) the performance of the concerned department in cleaning up the rubbish was unsatisfactory. He asked whether the said land need not be managed after enclosure and whether the area would be re-opened for public use;
- (c) the Government developed a part of the said land as open space in 2012, including construction of a footpath and installation of seats and lighting facilities. But wire meshes by the footpath still existed, and local residents demanded reopening of the area. Last year, after the typhoon, only trunks of the collapsed trees were sawed off, only the roots of the trees remained. He asked whether the concerned department would clean it up; and
- (d) he asked whether public access is dangerous as there was a cave under the land near Vista Paradiso.

77. The views of Mr CHING Cheung-ying were summarised below:

- (a) there was an environmental hygiene problem of the land but the Government paid no attention to it;
- (b) for improvement of environmental hygiene, he asked whether there was any government department responsible for the coordination work; and
- (c) the District Lands Office, Sha Tin, allowed the vacant land become deserted for a long time with weeds growing all over it, mosquitoes breeding and accumulation of rubbish. It dealt with the problem only after receipt of complaints. Such way of handling the problem was not satisfactory.

78. The Chairman pointed out that many government lands were not inspected by the staff of the District Lands Office, Sha Tin regularly. They conducted regular mowing and sprayed anti-mosquito oil only. They cleared piled rubbish only after receipt of complaints. Such way of handling was not satisfactory. He hoped to understand how the inspection mechanism worked and how the rubbish was cleared. If the problem was caused by sub-contractors, the District Lands Office, Sha Tin should monitor the sub-contractors. He hoped that the concerned department would follow up with individual members after the meeting regarding the cavern problem.

79. Mr Eric TSAI said that these two parcels of land were under management by the District Lands Office, Sha Tin, and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department respectively. FEHD did not clean up the rubbish at the said enclosed grassland, and the

concerned department would be responsible for the cleaning works of its lands. To enhance anti-mosquito work, FEHD sprayed the place with spray insecticides on the outside of the land as far as possible.

80. Mr Roger LEUNG, Senior Executive Officer (Planning) 1 of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) these two lands underwent some works by way of District Minor Works Programme. The concerned department would commence planning work based on regional development, demographic changes and priorities of recreational facility projects of the Sha Tin District Council;
- (b) the concerned department submitted progress reports of recreational facilities to the Culture, Sports and Community Development Committee every April for members' discussion on priorities of recreational facility projects;
- (c) the District Facilities Management Committee (DFMC) had a mechanism in place for members' discussion and expression of opinions on minor district works project;
- (d) the open space of Vista Paradiso was originally enclosed entirely. At the request of the local community and DC Members, some projects were commenced first, namely in the open space of Sai Sha Road in Ma On Shan. Generally, after completion of the open space in compliance with the standard, the Leisure and Cultural Services Department would not enclose the land; and
- (e) the land of Baycrest currently underwent some greening work projects and no facilities were available for public use. Therefore, it was not open to public use temporarily. Members might raise recommendation on the said land and the concerned department would study on the feasibility of such recommendations.

81. Mr Raymond LAU, Senior Estate Surveyor (Southeast) of the District Lands Office, Sha Tin gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) regarding the request for reopening of the said land, the land would be delivered for use to such governmental department which intended to use the land for long-term development or temporary use. The land would remain enclosed until delivery of the land to prevent illegal occupation;
- (b) staff of the District Lands Office, Sha Tin, inspected the land three times a week to check whether rubbish was accumulated. If yes, a sub-contractor would be deployed to clean it up;
- (c) putting up wire meshes was intended as a temporary measure to prevent illegal occupation; and
- (d) sub-contractors of the Land Control Group were responsible for inspection work. Places with more complaints would be inspected more frequently, and garbage or weeds would be cleared if any.

82. Mr Simon WONG said the DFMC had discussed and endorsed the strategies of District Minor Works Programme for the coming year at the meeting on 23 February. He welcomed members to raise proposals on the uses of vacant lands so as to meet local needs.

Information Papers

Statistical Overview of Sha Tin District Environmental Hygiene Service (as at 31 January 2016)

(Paper No. HE 9/2016)

Sha Tin District Anti-mosquito Campaign 2016 (First Phase)

(Paper No. HE 10/2016)

Sha Tin District Anti-rodent Campaign 2016 (First Phase)

(Paper No. HE 11/2016)

Sha Tin District Year-end Clean Up 2016

(Paper No. HE 12/2016)

83. Members noted the above papers.

Date of Next Meeting

84. The next meeting was scheduled to be held at 2:30 pm on 12 May 2016 (Thursday).

85. The meeting was adjourned at 7:44 pm.

Sha Tin District Council Secretariat
STDC 13/15/50

May 2016