

**Sha Tin District Council**  
**Minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> Meeting of**  
**the Health and Environment Committee in 2017**

**Date** : 9 November 2017 (Thursday)  
**Time** : 2:30 pm  
**Venue** : Sha Tin District Council Conference Room  
 4/F, Sha Tin Government Offices

<b><u>Present</u></b>	<b><u>Title</u></b>	<b><u>Time of joining the meeting</u></b>	<b><u>Time of leaving the meeting</u></b>
Mr WONG Yue-hon (Chairman)	DC Member	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr HO Hau-cheung, SBS, MH	DC Chairman	2:30 pm	6:26 pm
Mr PANG Cheung-wai, Thomas, SBS, JP	DC Vice-Chairman	2:30 pm	3:42 pm
Mr CHAN Billy Shiu-yeung	DC Member	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Ms CHAN Man-kuen	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr CHAN Nok-hang	"	3:00 pm	4:03 pm
Mr CHENG Tsuk-man	"	2:41 pm	3:10 pm
Mr CHING Cheung-ying, MH	"	2:37 pm	6:16 pm
Mr CHIU Chu-pong, Sunny	"	2:30 pm	3:28 pm
Mr CHIU Man-leong	"	2:30 pm	5:37 pm
Mr HUI Yui-yu, Rick	"	2:30 pm	6:14 pm
Mr LAI Tsz-yan	"	3:33 pm	6:38 pm
Ms LAM Chung-yan	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr LEE Chi-wing, Alvin	"	5:40 pm	6:21 pm
Mr LEUNG Ka-fai, Victor	"	3:00 pm	6:16 pm
Mr LI Sai-hung	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr LI Sai-wing	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr MAK Yun-pui	"	2:41 pm	3:13 pm
Mr MOK Kam-kwai, BBS	"	2:50 pm	4:53 pm
Mr NG Kam-hung	"	2:30 pm	3:21 pm
Ms PONG Scarlett Oi-lan, BBS, JP	"	2:30 pm	4:53 pm
Mr PUN Kwok-shan, MH	"	2:30 pm	4:36 pm
Mr SIU Hin-hong	"	2:30 pm	4:50 pm
Mr TING Tsz-yuen	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr TONG Hok-leung	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Ms TUNG Kin-lei	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr WAI Hing-cheung	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr WONG Fu-sang, Tiger	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr WONG Hok-lai	"	2:53 pm	5:48 pm
Mr WONG Ka-wing, MH	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Ms WONG Ping-fan, Iris	"	2:30 pm	4:53 pm
Mr YAU Man-chun	"	2:30 pm	3:25 pm
Mr YIU Ka-chun	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr YUNG Ming-chau, Michael	"	2:30 pm	6:38 pm
Mr MOK Man-lok, Mannix (Secretary)	Executive Officer (District Council) 1 / Sha Tin District Office		

**In Attendance**

Mr WONG Tin-pui, Simon  
Mr TSAI Yu-sing, Eric

Mrs TANG FUNG Shuk-yin

Mr CHAN Cheuk-pui

Ms CHUI Mei-chun

Mr YUEN Chun-kit, Derek

**Title**

Assistant District Officer / Sha Tin District Office  
District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Sha Tin) /  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department  
Senior Housing Manager (Tai Po, North and Sha Tin) 1 /  
Housing Department  
Environmental Protection Officer (Regional North) 43 /  
Environmental Protection Department  
Deputy District Leisure Manager (Sha Tin) 2 /  
Leisure and Cultural Services Department  
Senior Executive Officer (District Council) / Sha Tin District Office

**In Attendance by Invitation**

Mr TSE Lok-man, Alex  
Mr CHONG Hon-ming

Mr LAU Tak-cheung, Vetus

**Title**

Senior Project Manager 335 / Architectural Services Department  
Senior Health Inspector (Market Management) Sha Tin /  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department  
Director / Percy Thomas Partnership (HK) Limited

**Absent**

Mr CHAN Kwok-keung, James  
Mr LI Wing-shing, Wilson  
Ms TSANG So-lai  
Mr YIP Wing  
Ms YUE Shin-man

**Title**

DC Member	(Application for leave of absence received)
”	( ” )
”	( ” )
”	( ” )
”	( ” )

**Action****Welcoming Message**

The Chairman welcomed members and representatives of government departments to the 6th meeting of the Health and Environment Committee (HEC) this year.

**Application for Leave of Absence**

2. The Chairman said that the Secretariat of Sha Tin District Council (STDC) had received the applications for leave of absence in writing from the following members:

Mr James CHAN	Official commitment
Mr Wilson LI	”
Ms TSANG So-lai	Sickness
Mr YIP Wing	”
Ms YUE Shin-man	”

3. Members unanimously endorsed the application for leave of absence submitted by the members above.

**Confirmation of the Minutes of the Meeting Held on 14 September 2017**

(HEC Minutes 5/2017)

4. Members unanimously confirmed the above minutes.

**Matters Arising**

Responses of Government Departments to Matters Arising from the Previous Meeting  
(Paper No. HE 55/2017)

5. In respect of the question raised by Mr Thomas PANG, the Chairman responded that the written response given by the Civil Aviation Department (CAD) after the meeting had been recorded in the paper.
6. Members noted the above paper.

**Discussion Items**

Installation of Air-Conditioning System at Tai Wai Market by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department  
(Paper No. HE 56/2017)

7. Mr Eric TSAI, District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Sha Tin) of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) briefly introduced the paper.
8. The views of Ms TUNG Kin-lei were summarised below:
- (a) she thanked Superintendent Mr TSAI and the former Superintendent for their efforts to strive for the installation of air-conditioning system at Tai Wai Market. They had been working with store tenants to seek the installation of air-conditioning system since 2011. She was pleased to see that the Government listened to members' views and sped up the installation, but she opined that the scheme still had room for improvement;
  - (b) the works would be implemented in three phases, lasting 18 months in total. She opined that the duration was too long. Stall tenants would have no income for 8 months, which would have a significant impact on them, and the rent-free period of two months was too short. According to past experience, the equipment of many store tenants would have to be retired after the market was closed, and the purchase of new equipment was necessary. Therefore, she hoped that the FEHD could consider extending the rent-free period to 12 months. In addition, as the works would commence at the end of 2019, close to the Chinese New Year and the Winter Solstice, she hoped that the FEHD could defer the works;
  - (c) she enquired whether those store tenants whose stalls needed to be demolished and relocated were given priority to choose stalls. Separately, she enquired whether air-conditioning charges could be waived after the completion of the works; and
  - (d) the hawking problem on Chik Fai Street remained, and she enquired what actions the FEHD would take.

9. The views of Mr HO Hau-cheung were summarised below:

- (a) he strongly supported the installation of air-conditioning system at Tai Wai Market. The installation of air-conditioning system had been sought since more than ten years ago, but the FEHD did not do so for technical reasons. The hot air emitted after the installation of air-conditioning system would affect residents on higher floors of Grandeur Garden. Now with the efforts of everyone, it finally became true;
- (b) in respect of the installation of ventilation ducts, residents were concerned about the effect of noise and hot air in the future because they did not know the details. The FEHD should release information to explain to the public;
- (c) he enquired whether the works period could be shortened, and whether the FEHD could find another place to set up a temporary market. He opined that finding another place to set up a temporary market would bring some benefits. Store tenants could continue their business, and residents would not have to worry about where to buy groceries. The problem at Chik Fai Street could also be mitigated. As there was little space available in Tai Wai, members indicated that the key project of Sha Tin was the Creation of Space. With a five-a-side football pitch to be completed next year, he opined that the FEHD could consider using the space of the football pitch temporarily;
- (d) there had always been the problem of illegal placing of sundries by shops on Chik Fai Street. He enquired whether this problem would deteriorate due to the closure of the market; and
- (e) Tai Wai Market had a history of 30 years. Originally it was established for the purpose of rehousing temporary store tenants. Even if an air-conditioning system was installed, its setting was still unable to cater for a new type market. Therefore, the STDC generally opined that the solution in the long run was to construct a municipal complex.

10. Mr Rick HUI supported the installation of air-conditioning system. He opined that the complete closure of the market for eight months was too long. The living of the store tenants would be affected, and it would also cause inconvenience to residents. As to the market under the management of Link Asset Management Limited, the prices of goods were high while management was not satisfactory. He enquired whether the establishment of a temporary market or other options was considered, and whether the details of other options and the technical challenges encountered could be explained. He enquired whether the rents would rise in the future due to the installation of air-conditioning system.

11. Mr PUN Kwok-shan said that the market needed to be closed completely for the works. He enquired how compensation was calculated. The alteration would affect the bus stop in the vicinity. The transformer room and the switch room were close to the bus stop on Mei Tin Road, and ventilation louvres were adopted for the design of windows. He enquired whether the FEHD had assessed if the heat emission and electromagnetic radiation would affect residents waiting for buses, and what countermeasures were taken.

12. Mr Tiger WONG said that he supported this scheme. He enquired the FEHD which type of cooling system and ventilation system were adopted, and whether the air was filtered

by water-based filtering machine before emission. He hoped that the FEHD could explain information of the ventilation.

13. The views of Mr LI Sai-hung were summarised below:

- (a) the installation of air-conditioning system had been discussed for a long time. He knew that the FEHD had listened to members' views. For example, in respect of the unduly long duration of the installation, corresponding adjustment had been made. Tenants requested the extension of the rent-free period. He understood that the departments concerned were subject to restrictions, but he hoped that the FEHD would consider this special circumstance and reduce their loss. He enquired whether air-conditioning charges could be reduced at discretion, and whether subsidy could be granted during the period of closure. He enquired whether store tenants could apply for half rent reduction during Phase One and Phase Two of the works;
- (b) the owners' corporation of Grandeur Garden was concerned that supporting stands would be installed on the ceiling in the works. If that was the case, he enquired whether this would affect the structure of Grandeur Garden, or whether there was any measure to ensure that Grandeur Garden would not be affected. He enquired which department would be held responsible if there was impact that incurred any loss; and
- (c) he was concerned that the long period of closure of the market would affect the environment in the vicinity. For example, a goods distribution yard would emerge and block the access to Grandeur Garden. Recently, residents of Grandeur Garden had complained that vegetable stalls would leave sundries on the road after business hours. He hoped that the FEHD could deal with this matter and take preventive measures.

14. The views of Mr Thomas PANG were summarised below:

- (a) he had been studying the installation of air-conditioning system since the 1990s. Now he was gratified to know that the installation was practicable;
- (b) the equipment of tenants might need to be retired as a result of the works. The FEHD should consider how to make compensation. Regarding the closure period of the market, November to December was the peak season of the market. The closure of the market during this period would cause inconvenience to residents. He opined that it would be preferable to close the market when the weather turned warm, e.g., from February to March 2020; and
- (c) the problem of accumulation of refuse was serious on Chik Fai Street and Mei Tin Road and caused street obstruction. Separately, it seemed to be a waste that the best location was now used as a switch room. He enquired whether the FEHD had considered fully utilising the location between the front of the market and these two roads. He was not sure whether this was feasible, and he understood this proposition was a significant change. He put forward this for discussion by members.

15. The views of Ms Scarlett PONG were summarised below:

- (a) she supported the installation of air-conditioning system at Tai Wai Market, but the works period was too long and should be shortened. Moreover, the closure of the market during the Chinese New Year period was not preferable. The experience of Jubilee Garden Market was to carry out the works at night where possible. She enquired whether the same could be done at Tai Wai Market, so as to accelerate the works. Moreover, she enquired whether the works could be implemented in phases, without affecting other store tenants;
- (b) she opined that the rent-free period should be extended and that the subsidy should be increased. She enquired whether the works would have any adverse effect on the residents of Grandeur Garden before and after its commencement; and
- (c) she opined that the FEHD was somewhat misleading by saying that there was a ten-month rent-free period, because eight of the ten months was the closure period, and the actual rent-free period was two months only. She opined that the FEHD needed to extend the rent-free period and increase the subsidy.

16. The views of Mr WONG Hok-lai were summarised below:

- (a) he supported the installation of air-conditioning system at Tai Wai Market. In respect of the period of complete closure, it was eight months from October 2019 to June 2020. This would cause a significant effect on the tenants. He asked whether the market could be closed partly instead of completely; and
- (b) he enquired whether the operating cost of the air-conditioners would be transferred to tenants after the installation. He hoped that the increase of rents would not be too much. As the eight-month closure would have a significant impact on the tenants, he enquired whether the subsidy could be increased.

17. The views of Mr WAI Hing-cheung were summarised below:

- (a) he enquired whether the FEHD had made any study and analysis as to why there were operators outside Tai Wai Market that competed with the tenants of the market. He opined that this was worth discussing;
- (b) in respect of the cessation of operation for eight months, he was concerned that a chaos would occur in Tai Wai, because the supply would decrease while residents still had to buy groceries. Probably more operators would place their goods on the street illegally;
- (c) he enquired whether lessons had been learnt from the problems arising after the installation and upgrading of air-conditioning system at Sha Tin Market. He enquired the Superintendent whether he could share relevant experience and how to avoid similar problems from reoccurring at Tai Wai Market. He enquired what changes had taken place technically 30 years later today, making it feasible for the installation of air-conditioning system at a place where it was not possible in the past;

- (d) he enquired whether the installation of air-conditioning system alone could improve the quality of the market. He opined that the existing market had been obsolete, including restrictions in terms of space available and hawking. He remembered that he had enquired ten years ago whether Sha Tin could redevelop markets;
- (e) he had heard that the tenants of Sha Tin Market were concerned about losing customers and stable income during the period of closure;
- (f) members were concerned whether residents in the vicinity would be affected after the installation of the air-conditioning system. The air-conditioning system of the mall at Shatin Centre previously caused noise nuisance to residents, but now caused nuisance to residents of Shatin Plaza after the improvement;
- (g) he had no objection if the store tenants agreed to the commencement of the works after the Chinese New Year. However, if the works commenced after the Chinese New Year and was completed in winter, the outcome of the installation might not be known. He opined that the FEHD should discuss the schedule of works with the store tenants; and
- (h) the FEHD emphasised that it would help store tenants seek half rent reduction, that the air-conditioning charges would not be passed to the public, and that the store tenants would not incur additional expenses as a result of the installation of the air-conditioning system. He remembered that when the improvement works for the goods lift of Sha Tin Market was implemented more than two years ago, the goods lift was not available for use. Store tenants were unable to move their goods to the second floor. Two days before the lift service was suspended, he, the Market General Association and major store tenants, made a difficult decision to install metal supports and hoists at the rear entrance to Sha Tin Market to lift seafood to the second floor. These installations were still here two years later today. The FEHD said that it could only obtain funding for half of the costs and the store tenants were responsible for the removal. He put forward this example for members' reference, reminding members that they had to ensure that the FEHD would keep its promise when they asked anything from the FEHD.

18. The views of Mr TONG Hok-leung were summarised below:

- (a) he thanked the FEHD for going to the market to discuss with members and the store tenants. The residents and store tenants had long been looking forward to the installation works. What the store tenants were most concerned about was the compensation issue. Eight months of closure was too long. The complete fitting-out of Lung Hang Market took three months only. The rent-free period was not enough to compensate the loss of the store tenants. He hoped that the FEHD could continue discussing compensation with the store tenants;
- (b) Tai Wai Market was the most important place to buy food in Tai Wai area. He hoped that the installation works could be rolled out as soon as possible, and that the works period could be shortened. He enquired whether the environment of the streets in the vicinity would be affected during the period

of closure, and whether the FEHD had considered establishing a temporary market; and

- (c) in respect of the municipal complex in Tai Wai, provided that Tai Wai Market did not undergo complete fitting-out, the result might not be most desirable even if an air-conditioning system was installed. He hoped that the Government could consider the overall development of Tai Wai area.

19. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) the fifth picture of the briefing showed that the entrance on Chik Fai Street was steps. There should be an access ramp, but the new design would remove it. There was only one entrance on Chik Fai Street. If the disabled had to turn to Mei Tin Road to access the market, he was worried that they would file complaints with the Equal Opportunities Commission. He enquired whether the entrance on Chik Fai Street would be narrowed in the future, which would make the access crowded;
- (b) as the owners' corporation of Grandeur Garden did not want the air handling unit to be fixed to the ceiling of the market, the FEHD deployed the air handling unit on the ground close to the fish stalls. He understood that electrical appliances should be kept away from water. He enquired the FEHD whether it had assessed whether the air handling unit would be affected by water, and whether a waterproof design was adopted for the doors to the air handling unit room;
- (c) in respect of the deployment of hoses at different places, he enquired whether an air-cooled system or a water-cooled system was adopted for the air handling unit, whether Legionnaires' disease would be caused if it was a water-cooled system, and how the FEHD would maintain the system if it was an air-cooled system; and
- (d) Phase Three of the closure of the market spanned important festivals including the Chinese New Year and the Winter Solstice, the period when the weather was the coolest. He believed that store tenants were unwilling to cease operation. He enquired the FEHD whether it could adjust the sequence of works to avoid this period and shorten the works period.

20. The views of the Chairman were summarised below:

- (a) many works at Sha Tin Market were carried out at night time to enable store tenants to continue operation in the morning. He enquired whether such approach could be adopted at Tai Wai Market, so as to shorten the time of closure;
- (b) he enquired whether air-conditioning charges and rents could be handled separately. He wondered whether the works was scheduled at the end of the year in order to be in line with financial year. He enquired the FEHD whether it could review the funding arrangement to make the works period more flexible; and



- (c) a member mentioned the metal supports at Sha Tin Market. He opined that the FEHD should demolish them as soon as possible for the sake of public safety.

21. Mr Eric TSAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) he thanked members for their valuable views. In respect of the waiver of rents after the eight-month closure of the market, according to the existing mechanism, rents for the eight-month period of complete closure would be waived, and rents for two additional months after the reopening of the market would also be waived. Rents would be waived for a total of ten months. The works would be implemented at parts of the market. Store tenants might be affected by the works in Phase One and Phase Two, and they could apply for half rent reduction according to the schedule of the works;
- (b) in respect of the schedule of the works, the works would be commenced in December 2018 if funding was approved by the Legislative Council successfully. If store tenants thought it better for the works to commence after the Chinese New Year, it could be further discussed. The exact schedule of the works could only be determined after the application for funding was approved and the tendering for the works was completed;
- (c) the rents and air-conditioning charges were handled separately. Even if the market rent freeze was lifted, only rents would be affected. Regarding the waiver of air-conditioning charges after the installation, in the consultation with store tenants earlier, they had already expressed their willingness to bear air-conditioning charges. The cost of the works was paid by the Government with a lump sum funding, and would not transfer to store tenants or affecting the rents;
- (d) in respect of noise, sound absorption devices would be installed in the plant room of the air-conditioning system. Staff members would also be sent to Grandeur Garden to experience the actual conditions on-site;
- (e) in respect of the environmental issues on Mei Tin Road and Chik Fai Street during the works period, which were of concern to members, the shops on these two streets were operated on private lots, and they would certainly be prosecuted if they extended to public area;
- (f) in respect of the effect on the residents of Grandeur Garden, the FEHD had been discussing with the owners' corporation and the estate office. They were concerned that the works would come into contact with the waterproof layer of the estate. Therefore, in the design, the ceiling of the market was not used. As to whether working could be carried out at night, the rules of the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) should be complied with. In the past, complaints had been received from residents that there was noise nuisance caused by goods delivery at 5:00 am in the morning, though the noise as measured by the EPD was 28 dB to 31 dB only. The circumstance at Sha Tin Market was somewhat different. As it was an independent building, works repair could be carried out at night, thereby reducing the effect on store tenants and residents in the vicinity;

- (g) the problems which occurred at Sha Tin Market included dripping of water from air-conditioners and strong wind in some places. The FEHD would follow up these problems with the contractor in the future. As to the issue of electromagnetic radiation, the transformer was provided by CLP Power Hong Kong Limited (CLP), and should comply with relevant requirements and laws;
- (h) the expenditure of major works would not be restricted to one financial year, but would be expensed in different financial years depending on the progress of the works. Therefore, there was room for discussion in relation to the time of commencement of the works;
- (i) the FEHD had explored whether there was any place to set up a temporary market in Tai Wai. Now no appropriate locations had been found;
- (j) in respect of hot air emission, hot air would be emitted only at the location close to Mei Tin Road. In addition, measures would be adopted in the design so that the hot air would not affect residents waiting for buses. In addition, Mei Tin Road was spacious and heat could be easily dissipated and would not make people feel stuffy ;
- (k) a sprinkler system would be installed behind the chicken stalls to filter the air of the chicken stalls before releasing it to Chik Fai Street. Moreover, there was a certain distance between the released air and the residents. The existing entrances to the market had not been narrowed;
- (l) even if the Superintendent was transferred, the FEHD would definitely follow up matters promised; and
- (m) for the whole works, two chicken stalls, three wet goods stalls and two fish stalls had to be relocated. For the purpose of the installation of air-conditioning system, currently 27 stalls had been frozen from tendering. Store tenants would definitely succeed in the bidding for stalls as long as they wished to continue operation at Tai Wai Market. The remaining stalls would be offered for public tendering. Currently the number of fish stalls fell short by one. If the number remained insufficient in the end, the FEHD would consider altering other stalls to meet the demand.

22. Mr Alex TSE, Senior Project Manager 335 of the Architectural Services Department (ASD) gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) he understood that members were concerned about the works period. The ASD would also roll out the works as soon as possible to reduce the impact on residents. Therefore, the works was implemented in three phases. Phase Three would take a relatively long time due to the large scope of market. If the works was divided into more phases, it would give rise to other problems such as fire escape being blocked;
- (b) regarding the date of commencement, if the application for funding was successful, the actual date of commencement could be discussed further. Every market had its unique characteristics. As Tai Wai Market was located beneath Grandeur Garden, the time required might also be different;

- (c) in respect of noise and environmental protection, as the power company had specific requirements on the electrical transformer room, the ASD would design according to the requirements. In response to the member's concern about the air handling unit might be affected by flooding even though it was deployed indoors, he confirmed that there would be floor drainage facilities in all air handling unit rooms. As residents of Grandeur Garden were concerned that various hoses hung beneath the ceiling might affect the waterproof layer, the hoses had been arranged to be hung beneath cross beams; and
- (d) in respect of carrying out works at night, it would be considered subject to environmental protection ordinances.

23. Mr Vetus LAU, director of Percy Thomas Partnership (HK) Limited gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) in respect of the electrical transformer room and air handling unit room facing Mei Tin Road, an air absorption design was adopted for all lower louvres, and only the higher were for the purpose of releasing air to Mei Tin Road, and they were at a height over the bus stop;
- (b) in respect of vibration and noise, there were sound absorption devices at the air inlets and outlets. In response to the requirements of the Department of Health (DH) and the FEHD, all poultry stalls had to install an independent exhaust system and filter the air with water before releasing it. Therefore, the air released onto Chik Fai Street had been treated;
- (c) according to the design, no air-conditioning equipment would be hung on the ceiling. All air handling units were installed on the ground with concrete support. Springs were mounted beneath the air handling units to reduce vibration. There were also sound absorption devices at the joints of hoses to the air handling units;
- (d) the air handling unit rooms had to be deployed at different places at the market, because if they were concentrated at one place, there would be only one air hose to transmit chilled air, the loss of pressure difference would be greater as the air hose was too long. Separate deployment could reduce the loss of pressure difference by reducing the length of a single hose. The air-conditioning system used air-cooling, which meant that there would be no concern of Legionnaires' disease. No hanging parts would be installed on the ceiling. Instead, the joints of the existing connection of structural cross beams would be utilised to support the air hoses, and devices would also be provided at the joints of hoses to reduce noise and absorb sound;
- (e) the case of the chicken stalls was rather extraordinary. They had to be set at places close to the street, while for the whole market, only spaces on Chik Fai Street close to the street. The access at Grandway Garden was a fire engine access which should not be blocked. Separately, CLP required the electrical transformer room to be accessible 24 hours a day, so that the engineering workers could access it for the purpose of repairs any time. Therefore, the poultry stalls could only be placed near Chik Fai Street, which was also the

closest place to the loading and unloading point. This was the most desirable site. The need to remove an access for the disabled was because of the consideration that there were still two accesses for the disabled and the effect was minimal; and

- (f) usually there was a 12-month defects liability period for works. If it was found that the works failed to meet requirements of the design or contract within 12 months following completion, the contractor was responsible for making proper rectification.

24. Ms TUNG Kin-lei put forward a provisional motion below:

“Tai Wai Market has a history of more than 30 years since its official opening in 1985. The store tenants have been seeking the installation of air-conditioning system for years. In the Chief Executive’s 2017 Policy Address published on 11 October this year, out of the sympathy for store tenants of Tai Wai Market for the difficulties in their operation and the sympathy for the residents in Tai Wai for their trouble in shopping, the Chief Executive confirmed the acceleration of the installation of the air-conditioning system at Tai Wai Market. The store tenants of Tai Wai Market and the residents in Tai Wai are pleased for the move.

The installation of air-conditioning system will be implemented in three phases over a period of 18 months, of which, the market will be closed completely for eight months for the works. The store tenants are feared to have no income and suffer a serious loss due to the cessation of operation. Unfortunately, the FEHD only grants ten-month half rent reduction and two-month rent-free period to store tenants. Such relief cannot make up for the loss in full and was not enough to maintain a living. Therefore, the Health and Environment Committee of the Sha Tin District Council requests that:

- 1) the progress of installing the air-conditioners be expedited and the duration of works be shortened
- 2) the air-conditioning works be implemented by district and stage
- 3) the rent-free period be extended to 12 months
- 4) exemption of air-conditioning fee be granted after the completion of the works
- 5) those store-operators with stores to be removed will be granted priority to pick their stores without going through the internal bidding process.”

Mr TONG Hok-leung seconded the motion.

25. Mr HO Hau-cheung said that the calculation of the rent-free period was controversial. Therefore, he opined that the motion should express the request for the rent-free period clearly.

26. The views of Ms Scarlett PONG were summarised below:

- (a) she opined that the request for the rent-free period set out in the motion meant that the original rent-free period of the eight-month closure was not included,

and an additional rent-free period should be added after the completion of the works; and

- (b) she opined that Item 5 should also explain what “permanent placement” was.

27. Mr SIU Hin-hong enquired how to define the waiver of air-conditioning charges. He opined that the rent-free period and the waiver of air-conditioning charges should be explained.

28. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) the Superintendent said that the store tenants whose stalls needed to be demolished and relocated would be relocated and placed. The FEHD seemed to have completed Item 5 of the motion. Restricted auction meant that the tenderers who were willing to offer higher prices would be successful. Therefore, there was no way to do this “without going through internal tendering” as stated in the motion;
- (b) he understood that there would be no air-conditioning charges from Phase One to Phase Three of the works. There would be air-conditioning charges only after the completion of Phase Three of the works. He enquired the FEHD whether such understanding was correct; and
- (c) he enquired whether there was any problem if two store tenants would only offer the upset price after discussion.

29. Ms LAM Chung-yan suggested the mover to include the request of establishing a temporary market in the motion.

30. The views of Mr WAI Hing-cheung were summarised below:

- (a) regarding Item 3 and Item 4 of the motion, he enquired how the 12-month rent-free period was determined. In respect of air-conditioning charges, he enquired whether there were any store tenants had the charges waived permanently; and
- (b) he enquired the FEHD whether the proposed waiver of rents and air-conditioning charges differed from the existing arrangement and whether it would cause complaints by store tenants of other markets, and whether this arrangement would set a precedent if it differed from past practice.

31. Mr MOK Kam-kwai enquired that in respect of tendering, since the upset price was 75% of the open market rents, whether the store would be leased at a 25% discount if two store tenants agreed in private not to make a tender offer.

32. The views of the Chairman were summarised below:

- (a) in respect of Item 3 of the motion, he suggested that it should be stated clearly that it was an extra extension of the existing rent-free period. Item 4 of the motion should also state clearly the period of waiver of air-conditioning charges; and

- (b) he enquired the FEHD how it calculated the rents after the tendering and whether the tendering was open.

33. Mr Eric TSAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) seven stalls had to be demolished and relocated, including two chicken stalls, three wet goods stalls and two fish stalls. The tendering would be a restricted auction among these few affected store tenants, similar to the existing tendering for flower markets. For example, there would be two new chicken stalls in the future, and now two chicken stalls needed to be demolished. Therefore, the tenants of the existing two chicken stalls would tender for the new stalls they preferred, and the tendering process would be open. All stalls would be valued by the Rating and Valuation Department before leasing. Because of the relocation, 75% of the valued open market rents would be set as the upset price of the tender; and
- (b) if store tenants agreed in private not to make a tender offer, as in a similar case at Tai Po Market in the past, the Independent Commission Against Corruption had intervened.

34. Ms TUNG Kin-lei revised her provisional motion as follows:

“Tai Wai Market has a history of more than 30 years since its official opening in 1985. The store tenants have been seeking the installation of air-conditioning system for years. In the Chief Executive’s 2017 Policy Address published on 11 October this year, out of the sympathy for store tenants of Tai Wai Market for the difficulties in their operation and the sympathy for the residents in Tai Wai for their trouble in shopping, the Chief Executive confirmed the acceleration of the installation of the air-conditioning system at Tai Wai Market. The store tenants of Tai Wai Market and the residents in Tai Wai are pleased for the move.

The installation of air-conditioning system will be implemented in three phases over a period of 18 months, of which, the market will be closed completely for eight months for the works. The store tenants are feared to have no income and suffer a serious loss due to the cessation of operation. Unfortunately, the FEHD only grants ten-month half rent reduction and two-month rent-free period to store tenants. Such relief cannot make up for the loss in full and was not enough to maintain a living. Therefore, the Health and Environment Committee of the Sha Tin District Council requests that:

- 1) the progress of installing the air-conditioners be expedited and the duration of works be shortened
- 2) the air-conditioning works be implemented by district and stage
- 3) the rent-free period be extended for another four months after the completion of the works, exemption of air-conditioning fee be granted during the rent-free period
- 4) those store-operators with stores to be removed will be granted priority to pick their stores without going through the internal bidding process

- 5) the arrangements for setting up a provisional market be zealously studied.”

Mr TONG Hok-leung seconded the motion.

35. Members unanimously endorsed the provisional motion in paragraph 34.
36. The Chairman said that the Paper should be put to vote.
37. Members unanimously endorsed the above paper.
38. The Chairman announced a three-minute break.

**Motion**

Motion by Ms YUE Shin-man on Requesting the Government to Promote the “Keep Clean” Campaign throughout the Territory to Improve Hygiene Condition  
(Paper No. HE 57/2017)

39. The Chairman said that he had received Ms YUE Shin-man’s power of attorney before the meeting to appoint Mr LI Sai-wing to put forward the motion on her behalf. He agreed to the power of attorney and asked Mr LI Sai-wing to briefly introduce the content of the motion.
40. Mr LI Sai-wing asked whether he was the mover or the trustee.
41. The Chairman responded that Mr LI Sai-wing was entrusted to put forward the motion.
42. Mr LI Sai-wing put forward the motion below:

“Bacteria and viruses proliferate readily in the scorching summer. Hygiene in various districts has not been ideal lately and the street cleanliness has been deteriorating. The problems caused by mosquitoes and rodents were extremely severe. Hence, the Health and Environment Committee of the Sha Tin District Council requests the Government to step up its effort to facilitate city-wide cleansing and strenuously eliminate the potential hygiene hazards in the community in order to minimise the risks of spreading diseases and arouse the awareness of environmental and personal hygiene among the general public. The suggested measures include:

- (I) set up the “Funds for Improving Community’s Environmental Hygiene” which led by the STDC, to allow the STDC to use the funds at its discretion to improve the community’s environment;
- (II) regularly hold ‘territory-wide hygiene black spot reporting campaign’ for the public to report black spots to the FEHD, and request the FEHD to formulate performance pledges by promising to properly handle reports from the public within a limited period of time;
- (III) community environmental hygiene indices be formulated for the 18 districts in

order to get hold of the environmental hygiene conditions in various districts promptly, and to introduce improvement measures immediately;

(IV) increase resources and manpower, reinforce the training of the front-line cleaning staff, increase the frequency of street cleansing by staff and mechanical street sweepers, and increase the frequency of daily refuse collection;

(V) the promotion of the pilot scheme on the installation of Internet Protocol cameras in the 18 districts in Hong Kong be carried out as soon as possible, and use the closed circuit television system to help monitor and prosecute habitual litter bugs;

(VI) step up efforts to take enforcement action and initiate prosecution against restaurants and shops obstructing streets, and enhance inter-departmental joint action to better handle the problem;

(VII) introduce a “quality-oriented” tender mechanism for outsourced service, and stipulate all requirements clearly in the tender documents for outsourced contractors so as to ensure the quality of cleansing services;

(VIII) strengthen the STDC’s involvement of outsourced services, including giving advice on aspects such as the tendering, selection, contractual negotiation and monitoring mechanism, as well as relaying to the Government the comments collected from the public..”

Mr TONG Hok-leung seconded the motion.

43. The views of Mr TING Tsz-yuen were summarised below:

- (a) he enquired whether Item I of the motion requested the STDC to use its own funds to set up the Fund or requested the FEHD to allocate funds. Item VIII and Item I were similar, both regarding the devolution of authority. He opined that instead of setting up a fund, it would be better to ask the Government to upgrade the STDC to an urban council, so as to enable the STDC to manage the community improvement works;
- (b) regarding Item V of the motion, he opined that there was no need to install so many CCTV cameras to arrest litter bugs. Members had requested departments concerned to install cameras in Ma On Shan to deal with illegal motor racing, but there had been no positive response so far. Therefore, he opined that the FEHD should increase manpower; and
- (c) if no revision was made, he tended to oppose to this item of motion.

44. The views of Mr Michael YUNG were summarised below:

- (a) Item IV of the motion requested the increase of the number of rubbish bins and the frequency of rubbish collection every day. However, currently the Government wished to reduce the number of rubbish bins on the street and narrow the opening of the rubbish bins. If the number of rubbish bins was requested to be increased, whether it was expected to restore the previous number or to provide more rubbish bins;



- (b) he understood that the Sha Tin District Office (STDO) led a promotion and collaboration group. Sha Tin District selected to address the hygiene problem. He enquired whether Item I wished to pass the resources of the promotion and collaboration group to the STDC;
- (c) he understood that a Paper on the pilot plan of the FEHD to install Internet Protocol cameras had been endorsed at the last meeting. He enquired the FEHD whether Internet Protocol cameras were installed in all districts; and
- (d) regarding Item VII of the motion, he understood that in government tendering, not only prices but also the quality of companies were considered. He enquired what “quality-based” meant, through what channel the views were collected and how they were collated afterwards. If the STDC was to process this, he was not sure whether the Secretariat of the STDC had sufficient manpower to do it.

45. The Chairman enquired what the weighting of value and service quality was respectively under the tendering mechanism of the FEHD. He hoped that the Superintendent could answer members’ questions first.

46. Mr Eric TSAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) in order to act in concert with the the Environment Bureau (ENB) on the implementation of the Municipal Solid Waste Charging Ordinance, the FEHD was reducing the number of rubbish bins on the street, while the opening of the rubbish bins had also been narrowed to avoid residents putting large bags of rubbish into the rubbish bins on the street. The ENB would also provide corresponding education;
- (b) in respect of the pilot plan to install Internet Protocol cameras in the 18 districts, the paper of the last meeting mentioned that two locations were selected for the pilot run. This project was to be promoted to the 18 districts. It was estimated that the installation of all cameras would be completed in mid-2018; and
- (c) in respect of tendering, the assessment would consist of technical score and tender price, which accounted for 30% and 70% respectively.

47. The views of Mr LI Sai-hung were summarised below:

- (a) he enquired where the funds of the “Funds for Improving Community’s Environmental Hygiene” were from;
- (b) he opined that the motion focused more on the punishment mechanism than prevention. He doubted whether so many cameras were necessary for punishing litter bugs; and
- (c) he enquired whether Item VIII of the motion requested the FEHD to disclose tender documents to the public for review. As the FEHD already had its own tendering mechanism, he did not see any point in Item VIII.

48. The views of Mr HO Hau-cheung were summarised below:

- (a) he opined that the intention of the motion was good, and that it could deal with the current poor hygiene condition in the district;
- (b) the improvement strategy was actually for the STDC and the FEHD. The suggestions for the FEHD could enhance its measures;
- (c) strategies for the STDC should be included. If he understood the motion correctly, it requested the Government to allocate funds. In this aspect, reference could be made to the cooperative relationship between the Leisure and Cultural Services Department and the STDC, but there was much room for further discussion as to how to operate and process;
- (d) Item VIII of the motion requested that the STDC's involvement in outsourced services should be enhanced. He opined that the STDC would have difficulty in doing so, because the whole district involved much work related to residents' livelihood, and if all work was participated in this form, he feared that the STDC could not bear it. He suggested changing it to "strengthen the STDC's supervision of outsourced services", "the STDC will be responsible for collecting public opinions on outsourced services"; and
- (e) he suggested changing "as soon as possible" in the first sentence of Item V of the motion to "expedite".

49. The views of Mr WONG Hok-lai were summarised below:

- (a) he asked how the community environmental hygiene indices for the 18 districts mentioned in Item III of the motion were defined. He opined that objective indices might not be formed;
- (b) he asked in respect of Item VIII of the motion, how the collection of public opinions could be achieved, and whether the STDC could handle it; and
- (c) he further asked where the funds of the "Funds for Improving Community's Environmental Hygiene" were from, whether the funds received would be used to employ outsourced contractors to carry out cleansing work, and if so, whether it would overlap with the duties of the FEHD.

50. The views of Mr Billy CHAN were summarised below:

- (a) Item II of the motion requested the FEHD to formulate a performance pledge stipulating that FEHD must handle reported cases within a specified period of time. He enquired how the specified period of time and hygiene black spots were defined. He enquired how the community environmental hygiene indices were defined; and
- (b) Item VIII of the motion requested the introduction of a "quality-based" tendering mechanism. However, as the FEHD already had a tendering mechanism, he asked whether this item was repeated. Separately, he wanted to know how the STDC's involvement could be enhanced, whether it was the

STDC that was responsible for reviewing tender documents, and how public opinions were collected.

51. Mr WAI Hing-cheung opined that the motion put forward should not be too lengthy or contain too many details. He enquired whether there was the need to include Item IV of the motion if the pilot plan to install Internet Protocol cameras was promoted to the 18 districts.

52. The Chairman said that in order to align with the policy of waste levying, it was necessary to reduce the number of rubbish bins. Therefore, he had reservations on the item of the motion which requested an increase in the number of rubbish bins.

53. Mr LI Sai-wing thanked members for their views. After discussing with the seconder, Mr TONG Hok-leung, he revised the motion as follows:

“Bacteria and viruses proliferate readily in the scorching summer. Hygiene in various districts has not been ideal lately and the street cleanliness has been deteriorating. The problems caused by mosquitoes and rodents were extremely severe. Hence, the Health and Environment Committee of the Sha Tin District Council requests the Government to step up its effort to facilitate city-wide cleansing and strenuously eliminate the potential hygiene hazards in the community in order to minimise the risks of spreading diseases and arouse the awareness of environmental and personal hygiene among the general public. The suggested measures include:

(I) increase the Government’s resources and the ‘Funds for Improving Community’s Environmental Hygiene’ for the STDC to use at its discretion to improve the community environment;

(II) regularly hold ‘territory-wide hygiene black spot reporting campaign’ for the public to report black spots to the FEHD, and request the FEHD to formulate performance pledges by promising to properly handle reports from the public within a limited period of time;

(III) increase resources and manpower, reinforce the training of the front-line cleaning staff, increase the frequency of street cleansing by staff and mechanical street sweepers, and increase the frequency of daily refuse collection;

(IV) expedite the promotion of the pilot scheme on the installation of Internet Protocol cameras in the 18 districts in Hong Kong, and use the closed circuit television system to help monitor and prosecute those who dump refuse without authorisation;

(V) step up efforts to take enforcement action and initiate prosecution against restaurants and shops obstructing streets, and enhance inter-departmental joint action to better handle the problem;

(VI) introduce a “quality-oriented” tender mechanism for outsourced service, and stipulate all requirements clearly in the tender documents for outsourced contractors so as to ensure the quality of cleansing services;

(VII) strengthen the STDC’s supervision of outsourced services, including giving

advice on aspects such as the tendering, selection, contractual negotiation and monitoring mechanism, as well as relaying to the Government the comments collected from the public.”

Mr TONG Hok-leung seconded the motion.

54. The Chairman announced that the motion in paragraph 53 was endorsed by 12 affirmative votes, 7 negative votes and two members opted not to vote.

### **Questions**

Question to be Raised by Mr HUI Yui-yu, Rick on Disposal of Bulky Domestic Waste in Sha Tin

(Paper No. HE 51/2017)

55. The views of Mr Rick HUI were summarised below:

- (a) the contracts made between the FEHD and refuse collection service contractors did not set out the proportion of grab-mounted lorries to be provided by the contractor. He opined that there was a problem with this practice. Whenever residents complained to the FEHD about bulky domestic waste which should be disposed of, and the contractor of the FEHD failed to provide any grab-mounted lorry, the FEHD would arrange a compactor truck to handle it. If a compactor truck was used, cleaning workers in their fifties or sixties had to load the bulky domestic waste onto the truck manually, which would cause work injuries easily. Therefore, he opined that it was necessary for the FEHD to set out the proportion of grab-mounted lorries in the next contract;
- (b) recently the problem of bulky domestic waste had been improved. He hoped that the Housing Department (HD) and the FEHD would continue to cooperate with each other closely; and
- (c) the FEHD said that vehicles from other areas dumped refuse at Sun Chui Estate illegally. However, regardless of the cause, the FEHD had the responsibility to clear the refuse as soon as possible. He hoped that the HD could provide the FEHD with opinions and make proper communication, with a view to increasing the number of grab-mounted lorries provided by contractors.

56. Ms CHAN Man-kuen hoped that the Chairman would adhere to the principle that only two members in addition to the member originally asking the question were allowed to raise further questions.

57. The Chairman responded that he would only allow two other members to raise further questions.

58. The views of Mr LI Sai-wing were summarised below:

- (a) the problem of bulky domestic waste had been troubling communities. He agreed to Mr Rick HUI's view and opined that the FEHD should consult estate

offices when preparing new contracts in the future;

- (b) there was a similar problem at Yiu On Estate. He opined that the number of grab-mounted lorries in Sha Tin District was insufficient. Bulky domestic waste usually accumulated for more than five to six days. Residents often complained to the estate offices and Members. He enquired whether the lack of grab-mounted lorries was a result of insufficient resources;
- (c) during the current days of dry weather or around the Chinese New Year, it was a peak season for fitting-out. He enquired whether the FEHD had any improvement measure, or whether there was any difficulty to tell members in order to relay the matter to the related bureaux; and
- (d) the condition at private housing estates was also serious. Some estates employed cleaning companies on their own to dispose of the waste because they could not wait that long for the FEHD to do it. He hoped that the FEHD could allocate more resources to deal with the problem during this period.

59. The views of Mr LI Sai-hung were summarised below:

- (a) before 2015, the Government had not yet begun to dispose of bulky domestic waste separately. The FEHD's refuse collection vehicles could clear all waste in a one-off manner and needed not employing cleaning workers to dispose of bulky domestic waste on a daily basis. Now the practice had been changed, but the FEHD did not have a deeper understanding on the working conditions of frontline cleaning workers;
- (b) the conditions at Sun Chui Estate were very serious. The highest record in June was that the waste accumulated at Sun Chun House for 35 days before being disposed of. The conditions were slightly improved after the meeting between mutual aid committees, the FEHD and the HD in August, but resumed the original state one month later;
- (c) he opined that as a result of the old age of estates such as Sun Chui Estate and Sun Tin Wai Estate, coupled with the issue of the HD's policies, many residents needed to move, producing waste which tended to fill up grab-mounted lorries. For example, when the FEHD removed the waste at Sun Chun House and Sun Yee House these two days, two vehicles were fully loaded instantly. He had requested the FEHD to send grab-mounted lorries to Sun Chui Estate and Sun Tin Wai Estate at least once every five days to remove the waste; and
- (d) he inspected these places every day, and he was aware that the FEHD and the HD had implemented improvement measures after their meeting. For example, patrol had been stepped up, the number of refuse collection points had been reduced from four to two, and the refuse collection points area had been enclosed. He hoped that the FEHD and the HD could enhance communication and increase their efforts of cleaning and make proper arrangements for the new contracted refuse collection vehicles to prevent deterioration of the problem.

60. Mr Eric TSAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the contracts made between the FEHD and refuse collection service contractors did not require contractors to provide grab-mounted lorries, but the existing contractors had provided additional grab-mounted lorries. The FEHD would also gather opinions and consider the request to increase the number of grab-mounted lorries in new contracts;
- (b) regarding the problem of bulky domestic waste at Sun Chui Estate, the FEHD had found earlier that vehicles from other area dumped refuse at Sun Chui Estate. After discussion with the HD, the estate office had sent personnel to carry out patrols, and the conditions had been improved recently. The FEHD had also set up a communication mechanism with the HD, and the FEHD would be notified to take follow-up actions when large amount of waste was found to accumulate;
- (c) he reiterated that after being notified by the HD, vehicles could not be despatched immediately to remove the waste because the vehicles had other duties assigned, but the FEHD could send vehicles to remove the waste where possible. He said that for putrescible refuse, the FEHD had arranged cleaning every day, while given the relatively low impact of domestic waste on the environment, priority would be given to the removal of putrescible refuse when allocating resources;
- (d) a member said that waste accumulated at certain places for 36 days. He said that it was not that FEHD failed to send staff to remove the waste for 36 days, but just that every time it could not be removed thoroughly, and that people continued to dump waste there. He said that refuse collection would not stop except on the first day of the Chinese New Year; and
- (e) the EPD always reminded residents to deliver bulky domestic waste to the landfill directly when they moved or during the fitting-out, so as to avoid increasing the load of refuse collection points at estates.

61. Mrs TANG FUNG Shuk-yin, Senior Housing Manager (Tai Po, North and Sha Tin) 1 of the HD responded that, for Sun Chui Estate, frontline staff had been arranged to step up patrol, and the conditions had been improved. The HD would continue to monitor the conditions at each estate, including Sun Chui Estate and Sun Tin Wai Estate, and would keep contact with the FEHD and Members and take appropriate actions.

62. Mr LI Sai-hung put forward the following suggestions:

“Without considering the operating procedures of frontline refuse cleaning exactly, the Government implemented the separate disposal of domestic refuse and discarded furniture in October 2015, and forcibly changed the model for the disposal of discarded furniture at public housing estates, resulting in a community problem eventually. In the meantime, the number of transfer of public rental housing tenants has been rising in recent years. The number of furniture waste has been increasing continuously, resulting in the deterioration in the accumulation. In addition to affecting environmental hygiene, this has also increased the workload of frontline workers. Given the insufficient number of grab-mounted lorries and frequency of

cleaning, the cleaning workers have to load bulky furniture onto compactor trucks. This has caused occupational safety issues as well as difficulty in implementation. Apparently the Government had not find out the actual conditions before implementing the policy, resulting in a significant difference between the increase of waste and the estimate, which in turn the existing contractual arrangement could not meet up the actual conditions and the situation spun out of control.

I strongly request that the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department must understand the operating procedures for the frontline refuse cleaning in order to ensure that the new cleaning contract in October 2018 will include appropriate clauses to increase the efficiency of removing discarded furniture at public housing estates, increase the frequency of cleaning by grab-mounted lorries to reduce the burden of frontline cleaning workers and report the revisions of the new contract to the Sha Tin District Council. Meanwhile, I request the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department to inform the Environmental Protection Department of the working conditions of the frontline refuse collection staff and review the need of the communities carefully before implementing the refuse charging policy, with a view to implementing the new policy properly and ensuring good environmental hygiene for the communities.”

63. Mr Rick HUI put forward the following suggestions:

“I request the FEHD to consult stakeholders in the district thoroughly before entering into the next term of waste collection service contract, set out in the contract the proportion of grab-mounted lorries to be provided by the contractor, and present the content and details of the contract at future meetings.”

64. The Chairman announced the end of this agenda.

Question to be Raised by Ms LAM Chun-yan on Assessing Rodent Problem in the District and Information Dissemination  
(Paper No. HE 58/2017)

65. The views of Ms LAM Chun-yan were summarised below:

- (a) many residents in the district had complained about the serious rodent problem. The size of rodents was larger compared with that in the past. She hoped that the FEHD could respond with more details;
- (b) she enquired how the reference indices were calculated, and what the reason for the upward trend in the index of Sha Tin District was. The paper said that the index was considered high if it was above 10%, but the indices of all districts were below 10%. She enquired whether that meant the rodent problem was not serious throughout Hong Kong. She enquired how the indices should be understood;
- (c) she opined that the FEHD was in a somewhat passive position. Residents could only release information on the website. Some residents suggested making complaints actively to reflect the problem by complaint figures. Took Hin Keng Estate for example, rodent nests could be easily found in the estate. She had discussed with other members before the meeting, and found out that

similar problems existed in many Tenants Purchase Scheme (TPS) estates. She enquired the FEHD whether it should enhance the communication with the estates;

- (d) the FEHD responded that the prevention of the rodent problem relied on the close collaboration between residents and the Government in order to obtain satisfactory outcome. She believed that the cleaning companies of the estates were more important partners of the FEHD. She enquired the FEHD whether it had made proper communication. The District Administration Scheme of the STDO included anti-mosquito work, while there was a mobile communication contact group for the anti-mosquito work to release information. She wanted to know whether this practice could be used as a reference for the anti-rodent work;
- (e) she enquired the FEHD whether the deterioration of the rodent problem was a result of some major works in progress in the district; and
- (f) rodenticide might not be able to kill rodents. She enquired the FEHD whether there was the problem of drug-resistance and how the FEHD should deal with it.

66. The Chairman said that Mr Alvin LEE had returned to the meeting room and he asked members to note it.

67. The views of Mr LI Sai-hung were summarised below:

- (a) he received views from many residents in Tai Wai area that the number of rodents in the area had increased. The rodent problem in the estates under the HD, such as Sun Chui Estate, had been mitigated, but in the area of Tai Wai, the problem was serious. He wondered whether it was because the FEHD's supervision on the dumping of kitchen waste by restaurants in Tai Wai was insufficient;
- (b) some residents said that there were no cats in Tai Wai area. They suspected that the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department had captured all stray cats, eliminating the natural enemies of rodents. As cats were not allowed to be kept at Tai Wai Market, he wondered if the FEHD had any measure to deal with the matter; and
- (c) he enquired how the severity of the rodent problem was measured by the Rodent Infestation Rate (RIR). He enquired whether it could reflect the severity of the problem with the number of rodents captured and the number of dead rodents found.

68. Mr HO Hau-cheung said he noticed that the number of rodents was far greater than that of cats. He wondered if the FEHD had conducted any research in this respect. One of the indicators for the preparation of the RIR was the rodent baits taken, and whether the baits were placed well would have an effect on the index. He wanted to know when and how the policies were made, and now that the problem was serious, whether the authority would review these policies where appropriate to make improvement.



69. Mr Eric TSAI gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) apart from publishing on the FEHD's website, the RIR was announced through press release upon the completion of investigation every time;
- (b) he agreed that the management companies were also partners of the FEHD. Whenever a rodent problem in the estates was reported, the Pest Control Team of the FEHD in Sha Tin would conduct a site inspection and provide advice. Rodents appeared because they found food and the anti-rodent work was not done properly. Therefore, the FEHD had always been enhancing its educational efforts. As for the rodenticide, the one being used for the present was adopted in many countries. Rodents would die of anticoagulation after taking the rodenticide without developing drug-resistance;
- (c) the FEHD would take prosecution actions if any restaurant was found dumping refuse indiscriminately. The FEHD had launched a community anti-rodent plan earlier, with Phase One targeted restaurants and market in Tai Wai. The anti-rodent work in Tai Wai area would continue. Currently, the FEHD would place cages and baits after the market closed every night, and would continue to monitor the conditions; and
- (d) the Pest Control Advisory Section was responsible for the RIR and it was prepared for all 18 districts in Hong Kong to monitor the conditions throughout Hong Kong. As for the members' suggestions on RIR, he would refer them to the Pest Control Advisory Section. According to the latest information, the RIR for Sha Tin in 2017 was 2.5%.

70. Ms LAM Chung-yan said that she wanted to put forward a provisional motion.

71. The Chairman said that as a member had already put forward a provisional motion and a quorum was not present at the meeting, he declared the meeting adjourned for 15 minutes.

72. As a quorum was not yet present 15 minutes later, the Chairman announced at 6:38 pm that the meeting was adjourned. He decided to extend to the next meeting the questions not discussed at this meeting. The information paper would be circulated to members for their consideration. He said that the discussion on the above questions had been completed and that they would not be discussed again at the next meeting.

73. Ms LAM Chung-yan enquired whether she could put forward the provisional motion at the next meeting.

74. The Chairman responded that she could put forward a motion to be included into the Agenda of the next meeting.

#### **Date of Next Meeting**

75. The next meeting was scheduled to be held at 2:30 pm on 11 January 2018 (Thursday).

76. The meeting was adjourned at 6:38 pm.

Sha Tin District Council Secretariat  
STDC 13/15/40

December 2017