### **Sha Tin District Council** Minutes of the Special Meeting of the Traffic and Transport Committee in 2021

: 2 December 2021 (Thursday) Date

**Time** : 2:30 pm

**Venue**: Sha Tin District Office Conference Room 441

4/F. Sha Tin Government Offices

<u>Present</u>	<u>Title</u>	Time of joining	Time of leaving		
		the meeting	the meeting		
Mr HUI Lap-san (Chairman)	DC Member	2:30 pm	3:51 pm		
Mr MAK Yun-pui, Chris	DC Chairman	2:30 pm	3:51 pm		
Mr SIN Cheuk-nam	DC Vice-Chairman	2:30 pm	3:51 pm		
Mr CHENG Chung-hang	DC Member	2:30 pm	3:51 pm		
Mr CHOW Hiu-laam, Felix	,,	2:30 pm	3:51 pm		
Mr CHUNG Lai-him, Johnny	,,	2:30 pm	3:51 pm		
Mr WAI Hing-cheung	,,	2:30 pm	3:51 pm		
Ms CHEUNG Lam-yee, Alison	Executive Officer (Di	istrict Council)4, Sha	Tin District Office		
(Secretary)					

<u>In</u>	Αı	<u>tter</u>	<u>ıda</u> ı	nce	<u> </u>				<u>Title</u>						
	_	-				-							_		-

Mr LAM Fong-tat, James Assistant District Officer (Sha Tin)1

Mr HO Kin-nam, David Senior Executive Officer (District Council) (Atg),

Sha Tin District Office

Officer-in-charge, District Traffic Team (Shatin District), Mr WONG Pui-kai

Hong Kong Police Force

Senior Transport Officer/Shatin, Transport Department Ms YUEN Nga-man

Mr MAN Cheung-kong, Thomas Engineer/Shatin 1, Transport Department

#### In Attendance by Invitation **Title**

Mr CHE Kin-wong, Eric Chief Transport Officer/Bus/Bus Safety, Transport Department Mr WONG Pui-chung, William Senior Transport Officer/Bus/Bus Safety, Transport Department Mr Jeff TAM Manager (Public Affairs),

The Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited and

Long Win Bus Company Limited

Manager (Operations), Mr Rob LIU

The Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited and

Long Win Bus Company Limited Officer (Planning and Development),

The Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited and

Long Win Bus Company Limited

#### Absent **Title**

Mr CHAN Chung-yi

Dr LAM Kong-kwan DC Member (Application for leave of absence received) (No application for leave of absence received) Mr MOK Kam-kwai, BBS

The Chairman of the Sha Tin District Council (STDC) welcomed members and representatives of government departments and organisations to the meeting.

2. <u>The Chairman of the STDC</u> reminded members that the press was taking photographs and making video and audio recordings.

#### **Election of Chairman and Vice-Chairman of the Committee**

3. The Chairman of the STDC said that the office of Chairman and Vice-Chairman of the Traffic and Transport Committee (TTC) of the STDC became vacant on 12 July and 8 October 2021 respectively. According to Orders 34(4) and 4(3) of the "Sha Tin District Council Standing Orders" (the Standing Orders), if the office of Chairman and Vice-Chairman were both vacant, an election for such office shall be held at this meeting. The STDC Secretariat (the Secretariat) served all members with the nomination forms and election procedure for the TTC Chairman and Vice-Chairman on 23 November 2021. Nominations for the TTC Chairman and Vice-Chairman closed at 1:30 pm on 2 December 2021. By the end of the nomination period, the Secretariat had received one valid nomination form for the TTC Chairman. The nominee had confirmed in writing on the nomination form his consent to the nomination and acceptance of the office of the TTC Chairman if elected. Details of the nomination for the TTC Chairman were as follows:

<u>Candidate</u>	<u>Nominator</u>	<u>Seconders</u>
Mr HUI Lap-san	Mr SIN Cheuk-nam	Mr Chris MAK
		Mr Johnny CHUNG

- 4. <u>The Chairman of the STDC</u> reconfirmed with the candidate Mr HUI Lap-san his consent to the nomination and acceptance of the office of TTC Chairman when being elected.
- 5. <u>The Chairman of the STDC</u> said that as there was only one candidate, he declared in accordance with the Standing Orders that Mr HUI Lap-san was elected as Chairman of the TTC.

(The remaining meeting was chaired by Mr HUI Lap-san, Chairman of the TTC.)

6. <u>The Chairman</u> said that by the end of the nomination period, the Secretariat had not received any nomination form for the TTC Vice-Chairman. As there were no candidates, the Chairman announced that the office of the TTC Vice-Chairman was temporarily vacant and the election of Vice-Chairman would be held at the next TTC meeting.

#### **Application for Leave of Absence**

7. <u>The Chairman</u> said that the Secretariat had received an application for leave of absence in writing from the following member:

Dr LAM Kong-kwan Official commitment

8. The TTC approved the application for leave of absence submitted by the member above.

#### **Discussion Item**

#### A Traffic Accident near the Junction of Tai Po Road and Tsing Sha Highway on 18 November

- 9. <u>The Chairman</u> welcomed representatives of government departments and organisations to the meeting.
- 10. <u>Mr SIN Cheuk-nam</u> asked about details of the follow-up actions taken by different government departments and the bus company after the accident.
- 11. The views of Mr Felix CHOW were summarised below:
  - (a) he said there were allegations that The Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited (KMB) had arranged for bus captains to drive four or more routes in the same shift, and he considered that such arrangement might cause confusion to bus captains when driving. Therefore, he wished to know how the KMB arranged duty schedules for bus captains and whether improvements would be made;
  - (b) he said some bus captains had reflected that according to the KMB's guidelines, if a bus misrouted during the journey, the bus captain had to stop the bus at once and report to the main station, and to wait for further arrangements from the KMB. He wanted to know how the KMB would respond in such case. He was of the view that it might put pressure on bus captains if the KMB would penalise or dismiss them for this reason;
  - (c) he said that the Transport Department (TD) set up the Working Group on Enhancement of Safety of Franchised Buses (Working Group) and created the post of Safety Director after the Tai Po Road double-deck bus overturning incident in 2018, but the Working Group was not seen making any follow-up actions or recommendations on bus safety. He asked about the work details of the Working Group and information on the post of Safety Director;
  - (d) he suggested that the TD actively intervene in bus safety to avoid conducting a review only after occurrence of an accident;
  - (e) he said the TD had mentioned that legislation might be introduced in the future to fully regulate the wearing of seat belts by passengers. He wanted to know the details of the TD's enforcement of such measure and the relevant penalties;
  - (f) he indicated that the TD had provided grants for installation of seat belts on buses registered from 2016 onwards, but many of the airport buses that had been in service since 2013 were also successively diverted to operating district bus routes. He hoped that the TD would undertake to retrofit seat belts on all buses to ensure the safety of passengers;
  - (g) he pointed out that the TD had conducted a study on the mental state of bus captains driving under fatigue. He wished to know the progress of the study, and whether the state of bus captains after meal and its relationship with fatigue would be covered in the study; and

- (h) he said that some bus trade unions would like to meet with the TD to discuss the KMB's service and working conditions, but they were not entertained. He suggested that the TD meet with trade union representatives on a regular basis to listen to the views of frontline staff.
- 12. Mr Chris MAK asked about details of the follow-up actions taken by the bus company with regard to the accident victims or their families, including compensation and insurance arrangements, and whether follow-up actions and compensation had been in place for their psychological conditions.
- 13. The views of Mr WAI Hing-cheung were summarised below:
  - (a) he wanted to know whether the department(s) concerned and the bus company had a thorough understanding of the cause(s) of the accident and whether the accident was attributed to a single or multiple causes;
  - (b) he asked about how the department(s) concerned and the bus company would prevent similar accidents from happening in the future having learned the lessons from the accident; and
  - (c) he wished to know whether the cause(s) of the accident was/were related to the bus captain's misrouting, and whether the TD or the bus company had established any guidelines on the above situation and what the details were.
- 14. <u>Mr Johnny CHUNG</u> enquired about the statistical data of the accident location over the past few years so as to find out whether the road concerned was of defective design or in lack of signs.
- 15. The views of the Chairman were summarised below:
  - (a) as far as he knew, the bus captain involved had to drive two routes on the day of the accident. In the past few months, more than 10 bus routes in Sha Tin District had to reduce their frequencies or were even cancelled. He would like to know whether, under the above circumstances, there was still a shortage of bus captains, resulting in the same bus captain having to serve several routes, which might be the cause of the accident; and
  - (b) he asked about the minimum penalty when a bus captain misrouted during the journey and it was necessary for the KMB to penalise the bus captain for that.
- 16. <u>Mr Eric CHE, Chief Transport Officer/Bus/Bus Safety of the TD,</u> gave a consolidated response as follows:
  - the Government was devoted to ensuring the safety and reliability of franchised bus (FB) services for the public. To step up the relevant efforts, the TD set up the Committee on Enhancement of Franchised Bus Safety in 2019 to enable the Government, FB companies and relevant experts to discuss, study and implement measures to further enhance FB safety in Hong Kong. Under the steer of the Committee, the following measures had been implemented by the FB companies: installation and enhancement of in-vehicle devices/technologies to assist safe driving, enhancing the working environment

of bus captains, and strengthening safety performance management;

- (b) for installation and enhancement of in-vehicle devices, all new buses procured from July 2018 onwards were required to have all their passenger seats installed with seat belts, and be equipped with electronic stability controls (ESCs), which could enhance vehicle stability and reduce the risk of overturning, as well as speed limiting retarders (SLRs), which could control the maximum speed when going downhill. The TD had conducted a cost-benefit analysis on the existing buses equipped with these two devices. In the light of the findings, the bus companies would arrange to retrofit about 4 000 buses with ESCs and SLRs and install seat belts to all seats on the upper deck of about 1 900 buses. The Government had already earmarked \$500 million to fund the project;
- (c) the above installation work commenced progressively in the third quarter of 2020. The TD aimed to complete the installation of seat belts in three years while ESCs and SLRs in four years. As at late November 2021, there were 833, 1 152 and 1 159 buses retrofitted with seat belts, ESCs and SLRs respectively, involving a total government subsidy of about \$167 million;
- (d) the bus companies had also been testing various advanced driver assistance systems, including collision avoidance and lane keeping alert systems, as well as driver monitoring systems. As at the end of 2020, Citybus Limited (Citybus) and Long Win Bus Company Limited (LWB) had installed at their own cost the above two systems on their buses that operated the routes covering the airport and North Lantau, and would continue to monitor the use of the systems and their operational performance on different routes so as to determine whether to install them on buses of all other routes;
- (e) the TD promulgated the latest "Guidelines on Bus Captain Working Hours, Rest Times and Meal Break" (the Guidelines) in February 2018 and all bus companies had fully implemented the prescribed and improved driving and rest time arrangements. In 2020, the Government approved a total of 17 applications initiated by the bus companies for provision of workstation or rest facilities. With regard to safety management performance, the TD had worked out a new set of 19 safety performance indicators, which had been adopted by all bus companies since 2020;
- (f) to make good use of the electronic data recording devices (commonly known as the "black boxes") installed on FBs and in line with the recommendations of the Independent Review Committee on Hong Kong's Franchised Bus Service (IRC), the TD and the bus companies had fully implemented the measures of generating real-time alerts and exception reports on speeding and harsh deceleration, and also instituted a set of tightened common thresholds in late 2020;
- (g) the bus companies had completed a risk assessment for each route, including an assessment of the actual road conditions, the environment and other road users' activities, and provided appropriate and adequate instructions to bus captains taking into account the specific driving environment of each bus route;

- (h) since the publication of "The Independent Review Committee's Report on Hong Kong's Franchised Bus Service" (the Report) in 2019, the TD had reported regularly to the Legislative Council (LegCo) on the progress of the recommendations in the Report; and
- (i) over the past few months, the TD had been studying and strengthening the legislative requirements for installation of seat belts on buses, and hoped to submit the draft legislation to the LegCo for scrutiny when it was finalised. The enforcement practices under the new legislation would make reference to the prevailing legislative arrangements, and would be undertaken by the enforcement agencies.

## 17. Mr Jeff TAM, Manager (Public Affairs) of the KMB and LWB, gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the KMB was saddened by the traffic accident and extended its deepest condolences to the victims and their families. The KMB would cooperate fully with the Police in the investigation. It had also obtained contact information of the families of the deceased and injured, and would provide all appropriate assistance;
- (b) all the injured in the accident had been discharged from hospital. The KMB would continue to maintain contact with them and deal with the matter in accordance with the regular internal mechanism to understand their needs and take follow-up actions;
- (c) the bus captain in question had been in service for 18 years, responsible for driving Route Nos. 46P, 46X and 88K, and had been driving Route No. 88K since 2015. All three were pre-assigned routes. The bus captain had received relevant route training and was very familiar with the routes. Of these, Route Nos. 46P and 88K were not similar;
- (d) the bus involved aged six years and passed the vehicle examination on 3 November 2021. The bus captain was scheduled to rest on the day before the incident (i.e. 17 November 2021) and had taken a dinner break of more than one hour before driving the one-way journey in question. The training, rest day schedule and rest time of the bus captain were all adequate and in compliance with the relevant government guidelines;
- (e) to the knowledge of the KMB, the current scopes of the Police's investigation included the speed of the bus, the driving attitude of the bus captain and the road conditions at the time of the incident. The KMB would cooperate in the investigation. However, as the investigation was still on-going, the KMB was not in a position to comment on the details;
- (f) before dealing with compensation and insurance matters, the KMB had to thoroughly understand the cause(s) of the incident and make an assessment, based on which the KMB would take appropriate follow-up actions;
- (g) if a bus captain misrouted during the journey, he/she should make self-correction, i.e. carry passengers to the right stop. If the bus captain required

assistance, he/she should park the vehicle in a safe place and contact the KMB, which would give instructions to him/her for completing the journey. The KMB would, depending on the incident, assess on an individual basis whether to impose penalty on the bus captain, which may not necessarily be the case;

- (h) all buses procured by the KMB from April 2018 onwards were equipped with seat belts for all seats. On the other hand, following the recommendations in the Report, the KMB was installing seat belts on the upper deck of buses registered from 1 January 2016 onwards in phases in accordance with the plan and timetable provided by the TD. Upon completion of the installation, the KMB would deal with the installation of seat belts on buses registered before 1 January 2016; and
- (i) the KMB was constantly expanding its workforce and recruiting bus captains to meet its operational needs.

# 18. <u>Mr WONG Pui-kai, Officer-in-charge, District Traffic Team (Shatin District) of the Hong Kong Police Force, gave a consolidated response as follows:</u>

- (a) the Police had arrested the bus captain involved, and the case was under investigation by the Special Investigation Team of Traffic, New Territories South. As the case was at the investigation stage, the Police could not disclose the details. The Police would continue with road safety publicity and education as well as rigorous law enforcement. The Police would also provide full support in case of any road improvement works by the TD; and
- (b) the Police currently did not have the statistics on the accident location over the past few years, and would provide Mr Johnny CHUNG with supplementary information after the meeting.

#### 19. The views of Mr Felix CHOW were summarised below:

- (a) he said that there were frequent complaints from residents in Sha Tin District about bus companies reducing trips or operating "phantom buses". He was concerned about the monitoring capability of the TD and would like to know the details of its monitoring work;
- (b) he said that the TD had not taken into account the safety of bus captains in the provision of bus safety devices. There were several accidents in Hong Kong in which bus captains were killed when their buses hit the tail lifts of the vehicles in front. However, no air-bags were installed on existing buses. He suggested that the TD cover the safety of bus captains in the study;
- (c) he asked whether the TD would set a ceiling on the number of routes to be driven by bus captains per shift in the Guidelines;
- (d) he said there were sources saying that a bus captain of Route No. 72 was complained by a large number of passengers for misrouting to Shing Mun Tunnel from the original route to Tai Po Road, and received a "final warning" from the KMB at last. He wanted to know whether the number of complaints received had an impact on the penalty imposed on bus captains; and

(e) he was concerned about the roster arrangements and treatment of bus captains. The bus captain in the accident was still driving the trip in question after meal. He would like to know whether the post-meal drowsiness would affect his judgment, and suggested that the TD and the KMB cover such situation in their study.

#### 20. The views of Mr SIN Cheuk-nam were summarised below:

- (a) he said that only the revised version of the Guidelines in 2018 was available online, in which there was no cap on the number of routes to be driven by bus captains per shift. He wished to know whether the Guidelines would be revised in this regard and whether various departments and bus companies would review the Guidelines in the light of the accident;
- (b) he said some bus captains revealed that several serious bus accidents in the past in Hong Kong occurred after the bus captains had their meals, and suggested that the departments concerned look into this factor;
- (c) he would like to know the number of buses that had been fully installed with seat belts or their percentage in relation to the total number of buses;
- (d) he suggested that the TD meet with trade union representatives to listen to their views; and
- (e) he asked about the number of buses that had been installed with driving recorders, and suggested that the KMB could consider installing the device so that cause(s) could be identified in the event of an accident.
- 21. <u>Mr Johnny CHUNG</u> said that the road section of the accident adopted the traditional kerb design. He wanted to know the necessary conditions in terms of road design for adopting cushion barrier, which he believed could prevent vehicles from overturning.

#### 22. The views of Mr Chris MAK were summarised below:

- (a) he was of the view that the KMB had not considered whether there were issues with its management policies or guidelines, and suggested that the KMB and the TD consider capping the number of routes responsible by bus captains. It could prevent them from driving several routes within a short period of time, reducing the chance of making mistakes; and
- (b) he suggested that the KMB and the TD meet with trade union representatives to listen to their views.

#### 23. The views of the Chairman were summarised below:

(a) he observed that different video clips of operating buses could be found on the Internet and the driving recorders might have been purchased by bus captains at their own cost. He would like to know whether the bus companies had considered or would consider universal installation of driving recorders on buses, or whether they would provide grants to bus captains to purchase such device; and (b) he wanted to know the reasons why buses were not equipped with air-bags and whether the bus companies would install safety equipment such as air-bags on buses procured in the future to ensure the safety of bus captains.

### 24. Mr Eric CHE gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) the TD had commenced a study on fatigue management of bus captains, which was however still ongoing and the findings were not yet available. The TD would convey members' views on the post-meal state of bus captains to the experts and explore whether to cover it in the study;
- (b) the TD would step up its efforts in appealing and promoting to the public and other motorists through appropriate channels, such as the Road Safety Council, that they should avoid opening the tail lifts in the event of vehicle breakdown for prevention of accidents;
- (c) to standardise bus captain training in the bus industry, the TD, in collaboration with the bus companies, had drawn up the "Practice Note on Training Framework for Franchised Bus Captains", which included induction courses, advanced courses, new route training courses, new bus training courses, driving skills improvement courses, etc., with a view to enhancing bus captains' alertness level and proper driving skills and reducing the chance of accidents; and
- (d) the TD had recently met with bus trade unions to listen to their views on bus captains' roster arrangements and other opinions. The TD would reflect the views to the bus companies and encourage them to maintain good communication with their staff.
- 25. <u>Ms YUEN Nga-man, Senior Transport Officer/Shatin of the TD,</u> said that the TD was concerned about the operation and service level of each route. Upon receipt of complaints, the TD would immediately follow up with the bus companies and send staff to conduct onsite investigations from time to time to monitor the service and operation of the routes.
- 26. <u>Mr Thomas MAN, Engineer/Shatin 1 of the TD,</u> gave a consolidated response as follows:
  - (a) Tai Po Road (Tai Wai), the location of the accident, was a major road of standard dual carriageway with a speed limit of 50 km/hour and concrete crash barriers on both sides. Between 2016 and October 2021, there was no traffic accident at the junction in question, except for a traffic accident involving a motorcycle at about 50 metres before the upstream in 2017, in which one person was seriously injured;
  - (b) approximately 45 metres before the bifurcation concerned, there was a directional sign on the right-hand side of the road indicating that the left approach road of the coming bifurcation was to Kowloon West, and the right to Tai Wai. There was also an overhead directional sign at the bifurcation indicating that the left approach road was to Kowloon West, the airport and Tai Po Road, and the right to Tai Wai. According to the TD's observation during peak hours, the traffic flow at the road section was not heavy and motorists did

not have much difficulty in changing lanes at the bifurcation. The TD had not received any complaints from members of the public about the road signs there in recent years and therefore considered the directional signs at the scene clear and adequate; and

(c) cushion barriers were normally installed at bifurcations on expressways with a speed limit of 70 km/hour or above. As the speed limit of the accident location was 50 km/hour, cushion barriers were not installed. The TD would take follow-up actions based on the findings of the Police's investigation report accordingly.

#### 27. Mr Jeff TAM gave a consolidated response as follows:

- (a) in respect of bus captains misrouting during the journey, the KMB would assess on an individual basis whether or not to impose penalty on the bus captain depending on the nature of the incident, rather than on the number of complaints lodged by passengers. Factors to be considered by the KMB included the responsibility of the bus captain and whether the incident was caused by negligence or accident, etc.;
- (b) the KMB and LWB together had installed seat belts on all seats of over 870 buses in total, accounting for about 30% of the total number of buses, and would keep retrofitting seat belts on buses according to the timetable;
- (c) the KMB would maintain communication with the TD. In case of new guidelines issued by the TD, it would study the feasibility together with the TD and cooperate. Also, the KMB had all along been liaising with bus captains and the trade unions to listen to their views;
- (d) all KMB buses were equipped with driving recorders on the front. Due to privacy and internal code, the KMB would not upload the video clips to the Internet:
- (e) the KMB had implemented the recommendations in the Report successively such as the introduction of ESCs, SLRs, driving indicators and the creation of the post of Safety Director. In addition to the above recommendations, the KMB had also invested its own resources to improve equipment to enhance the safety of bus captains and driving, including the installation of monitoring systems, driver assistance systems and parking sensors, etc.; and
- (f) the KMB would provide supplementary information on air-bags after the meeting.

#### 28. The views of Mr Chris MAK were summarised below:

(a) he would like to know whether the TD would consider mandating all large public transport operators to implement the various recommendations in the Report and requiring them to meet certain safety requirements before they could be considered for licensing; and

(b) he said that departmental representatives were normally seated on the two sides of the conference room and there were spare seats at the main table in the conference room at present. He suggested that at future meetings, apart from some staff of the Secretariat, departmental representatives could also be seated at the main table to facilitate exchanges.

#### 29. The views of Mr SIN Cheuk-nam were summarised below:

- (a) he said that the franchises of the bus companies would expire in 2023 and suggested that the TD include the various safety requirements in the factors of consideration for renewal:
- (b) he would like to know whether there were any recommendations relating to driving recorders in the Report and whether the TD had provided grants to the bus companies for installation of the device; and
- (c) he pointed out that the KMB had indicated in 2019 that it had arranged for bus captains to drive no more than three routes per day, but now there were still bus captains required to drive four routes and the relevant requirement was not specified in the Guidelines. He would like to know the details and whether the KMB had encountered any difficulties in the arrangement.

#### 30. The views of Mr Felix CHOW were summarised below:

- (a) he hoped that the TD would undertake to review the Guidelines and set a ceiling on the number of routes to be driven by bus captains per shift;
- (b) he pointed out that the TD currently provided grants for installation of seat belts on buses registered from 2016 onwards, but some buses registered in 2015 or 2014 were of the same model with a service life of about 18 years. He suggested extending the scope of the grants to buses registered from 2013 onwards; and
- (c) he suggested improving the design of the bus windows, and relayed some views that passengers could be thrown out of the bus easily when it overturned. He asked if the TD would follow up on the glass design.
- 31. Mr Johnny CHUNG said that although there were certain requirements for installation of cushion barriers, a vehicle ramming into the kerb at the speed of 50 km/hour could generate a force large enough to make it bounce over. He suggested that where circumstances permitted, the TD should consider installing cushion barriers at bifurcations with lower speed limit but high traffic flow.

#### 32. The views of the Chairman were summarised below:

(a) he would like to know whether the driving recorders currently installed by the KMB were for recording external traffic or in-vehicle conditions, and if not the former, whether the TD would provide grants to the KMB for installation of the device;

- (b) he said that a few years ago, there was an accident in Lam Tin in which Citybus Route No. 681 lost control, ploughed into an inclined kerb and overturned. He proposed that the TD consider revising the speed limit requirement for provision of cushion barrier; and
- (c) he said that many bus captains and trade unions had requested to drive a single route, and hoped that the departments concerned and the bus companies would consider this as far as possible.
- 33. Mr Jeff TAM gave a consolidated response as follows:
  - (a) driving recorders were used to record external traffic; and
  - (b) the KMB required bus captains to drive no more than three routes per day and would follow up on any cases where bus captains drove more than three routes. It was a common arrangement among bus companies for bus captains to drive more than one route due to operational needs. When scheduling bus captains for duty, the KMB would ensure that they had received driving training on the routes concerned and that they were medically fit before implementing the arrangement.
- 34. Mr Eric CHE gave a consolidated response as follows:
  - (a) he added that all new buses procured from July 2018 onwards must be fitted with seat belts on all passenger seats and equipped with ESCs and SLRs. As the frame structure of some old buses did not meet the requirement for retrofitting seat belts on all seats, the installation of seat belts would involve major structural changes; and
  - (b) bus companies had to allow a certain degree of flexibility in manpower arrangement. When bus captains were responsible for more than one route, bus companies could flexibly deploy manpower to cope with unexpected incidents to meet passenger demand. The TD encouraged bus companies to maintain good communication with their staff and listen to the views of bus captains and trade unions to reach a consensus.
- 35. <u>The Chairman</u> asked members whether they agreed to deal with the provisional motion put forward by Mr Felix CHOW.
- 36. Members agreed to discuss the provisional motion put forward by Mr Felix CHOW.
- 37. Mr Felix CHOW put forward the provisional motion as follows:

#### "Provisional Motion

The Traffic and Transport Committee of the Sha Tin District Council is deeply saddened by the serious traffic accident taking place at Tai Po Road – Tai Wai on 18 November, in which one person died and 12 were injured. To prevent recurrence of fatal traffic accidents, the Committee urges the relevant authorities to deal with the following:

- 1. the Committee strongly demands that franchised bus companies review the scheduling arrangements for bus drivers, provide them with reasonable working hours, meal breaks and rest time, enhance their benefits and strengthen their training to ensure good driving attitudes with emergency response capabilities.
- 2. the Committee strongly demands that the authorities explore improvements to bus structures and safety devices, such as strengthened vehicle body, improved window design, provision of air-bags at bus drivers' seats, universal installation of seat belts and upgrading of speed limiters, in order to enhance the containment capability of buses and reduce the risk of injury to bus drivers and passengers in case of traffic accidents.
- 3. the Committee demands that the authorities review the design of the road section concerned, including road signs, speed limit, as well as design of the crash barriers and kerbs, etc. to safeguard the safety of road users.
- 4. the Committee demands that the authorities meet with various trade union representatives of franchised bus companies on a regular basis to learn about and follow up on the difficulties and challenges faced by frontline bus drivers at work, and urge the bus companies to make improvement and enhance the service quality of franchised buses.
- 5. the Committee demands that the authorities take enhancing bus safety into consideration for renewal of bus franchises."

Mr Johnny CHUNG, Mr CHENG Chung-hang, Mr WAI Hing-cheung, Mr Chris MAK and Mr SIN Cheuk-nam seconded the motion.

- 38. <u>The Chairman</u> asked members whether they agreed to pass the provisional motion stated in paragraph 37.
- 39. Members unanimously passed the provisional motion stated in paragraph 37.
- 40. Mr Felix CHOW hoped that the KMB would review the lessons learned from the accident and considered that the TD should step up its efforts in regulating bus companies so that improvement measures would not be proposed only after the occurrence of accidents, thereby offering safer bus services to passengers.
- 41. Mr Chris MAK added that "enhancing bus safety" in the provisional motion referred to the 45 recommendations listed by the IRC, which the TTC requested to be taken into consideration during bus franchise renewal.
- 42. <u>The Chairman</u> said that the accident was still at the investigation stage and hoped that the Police could inform the TTC of the details when the investigation progress had reached a stage where information could be made public.
- 43. <u>Mr SIN Cheuk-nam</u> hoped that the Police could update the TTC on the accident at the next TTC meeting.
- 44. <u>Mr WONG Pui-kai</u> responded that he would convey the views to the departments concerned.

## **Date of Next Meeting**

- 45. The next meeting was scheduled to be held at 10:00 am on 14 December 2021 (Tuesday).
- 46. The meeting was adjourned at 3:51 pm.

Sha Tin District Council Secretariat STDC 13/15/45

June 2022