

Minutes of the 3rd Special Meeting of
the Traffic and Transport Committee (2016-2017) of
the Tuen Mun District Council

Date : 28 July 2017 (Friday)

Time : 12:53 p.m.

Venue : Tuen Mun District Council (TMDC) Conference Room

<u>Present</u>		<u>Time of Arrival</u>	<u>Time of Departure</u>
Mr SO Shiu-shing (Chairman)	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr YIP Man-pan (Vice-chairman)	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr LEUNG Kin-man, BBS, MH, JP	TMDC Chairman	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr LEE Hung-sham, Lothar, BBS, MH	TMDC Vice-chairman	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr TO Sheck-yuen, MH	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr CHU Yiu-wah	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Ms KONG Fung-yi	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr NG Koon-hung	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr CHAN Yau-hoi, BBS, MH, JP	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Ms WONG Lai-sheung, Catherine	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr LAM Chung-hoi	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr TSUI Fan, MH	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr CHAN Man-wah, MH	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr CHAN Manwell, Leo	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr CHEUNG Hang-fai	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Ms CHU Shun-nga, Beatrice	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Ms SO Ka-man	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr MO Shing-fung	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr KAM Man-fung	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	1:07 p.m.
Mr YEUNG Chi-hang	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr YAN Siu-nam	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr TAM Chun-yin	TMDC Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr IP Chun-yuen	Co-opted Member	12:53 p.m.	End of meeting
Mr TSANG Tak-lung, Sam (Secretary)	Executive Officer (District Council) 2, Tuen Mun District Office, Home Affairs Department		

By Invitation

Mr Brian LAM

Assistant Operations Manager, Citybus Limited

In Attendance

Mr MOK Ka-sing, Mark

Senior Transport Officer /Tuen Mun 1, Transport Department

Miss Flora MA

Senior Transport Officer/Tuen Mun 2, Transport Department

Miss CHAN Hoi-ting, Gillian

Assistant District Officer (Tuen Mun) 2, Home Affairs
Department

Absent

Mr KWU Hon-keung

TMDC Member

Ms CHING Chi-hung

TMDC Member

Ms HO Hang-mui

TMDC Member

Ms LUNG Shui-hing, MH

TMDC Member

Mr TSANG Hin-hong

TMDC Member

Mr NG Kwai-wah

Co-opted Member

Mr LAI Yu-lok

Co-opted Member

I. Opening Remarks

The Chairman welcomed all attendees to the 3rd special meeting of the Traffic and Transport Committee 2016-2017 for following up on “Request for Rationalisation of Routes B3A and B3M” (TTC Paper No. 24/2017).

2. The Chairman reminded Members that any Member who was aware of a personal interest in a discussion item should declare the interest before the discussion. The Chairman would, in accordance with Order 39(12) of the Tuen Mun District Council (“TMDC”) Standing Orders, decide whether the Member who had declared an interest might speak or vote on the matter, might remain in the meeting as an observer, or should withdraw from the meeting. All cases of declaration of interests would be recorded in the minutes of the meeting.

II. Absence from Meeting

3. The Secretariat had received an application for leave of absence from Ms CHING Chi-hung on the ground of sickness.

(Post-meeting note: Ms CHING had submitted a medical certificate after the meeting in accordance with Order 42(1) of the TMDC Standing Orders; therefore, TTC granted her leave of absence from the meeting.)

III. Matters Arising

(A) Request for Rationalisation of Routes B3A and B3M

(TTC Paper No. 24/2017)

(Paragraphs 96 – 105 of the Minutes of the 2nd Special Meeting)

(Paragraphs 42 – 57 of the Minutes of the 9th Meeting)

4. The Chairman welcomed Mr Brian LAM, Assistant Operations Manager of Citybus Limited (“Citybus”) to the meeting; following on, he said in the 9th meeting of the TTC held on 12 May 2017, it was resolved to hold a special meeting to follow up on the captioned agenda item and to request the Transport Department (“TD”) and Citybus to consider Members’ proposals regarding the improvement of the Route B3 series.

5. Mr LAM of Citybus said Route B3M offered services for off-peak hours and the buses running B3M were those transferred from other bus routes after peak hours. As the

role of B3M was to support the services of Route B3X, it would involve a lot of extra bus resources to adjust the routing and service hours of B3M. At present, B3M's frequency and carrying capacity met with demands. Concluding all of the aforesaid factors, Members' proposal was considered as not practicable. Citybus would continue to monitor the changes in the number of passengers for B3A and B3M and make adjustments if necessary.

6. Mr MOK Ka-sing, Mark, of the TD said the department and Citybus had examined the rerouting proposal for B3M. If B3M's routing were to be changed and expanded to become a full-day service, the bus company would need to increase a great lot of bus resources for peak hours. As the number of passengers did not show any significant increase and to optimise the use of resources, the department had reservations on the rerouting proposal, but it would continue to monitor the relevant services and make adjustments if necessary.

7. Members made the following comments:

- (i) A Member was disappointed with the replies of the TD and Citybus. Currently, when B3A arrived at Fu Tai, the bus was already full. With the continual development of Area 54, Tuen Mun, the demand for B3A service would only increase with time. Therefore, she suggested that the route of B3A could be changed not to pass Fu Tai and that of B3M could be changed to go along Castle Peak Road to Fu Tai. It could both increase the carrying capacity of B3M and rationalise the two routes. In addition, Citybus had previously cut down a lot of services provided by Route 629 on the Hong Kong Island, hence there should be a lot of idle bus resources available for use. Yet, the rerouting proposal of B3M was rejected on the ground of insufficient resources, which was unconvincing. As a franchised bus company, Citybus enjoyed fuel tax concessions and should logically provide better bus services for the citizens. She requested the TD and Citybus to re-consider the relevant proposal;
- (ii) A Member said there were two Routes - B3 and B3X, serving the Tuen Mun town centre, so he considered it wrong to say B3M gave support to B3X. As Yan Tin Estate was due for intake, the additional population in the district would be as many as 40000 to 50000, so he queried the assertion made by the department and

the Citybus that the number of passengers for the B3 series would not be increased. He reckoned that the passenger volume for B3A would increase a great deal in the future. He also considered the routing of B3A unsatisfactory and proposed that it should not pass Fu Tai while that of B3M should go along Castle Peak Road. On the one hand, it could broaden the areas served by the B3 series; on the other hand, it could rationalise all the routes of the B3 series. When Citybus commenced the B3M service, it had not consulted the DC; on this occasion, it refused to accept TTC's improvement proposals for B3M as well. He urged Citybus to face up to the problem of the unsatisfactory service of B3M;

- (iii) A Member said the TTC convened a special meeting for discussing the services of the B3 series, showing that all Members were very concerned about it; however, he was very disappointed that Citybus was reluctant to accept Members' improvement proposals. As a franchised bus company, Citybus should not solely focused on profits. Moreover, as B3X was already very profitable, Citybus should try to improve the services of other routes. If Citybus was successful in rationalising Routes B3A and B3M, he believed that their passenger volumes would also increase. If Citybus was not competent in operating B3M and B3A, the TD should invite other contractors to operate the services of the 2 routes by tender;
- (iv) A Member said the actual frequency of B3X was higher than that shown on the timetable, almost at a 1-minute interval; yet, Citybus said there were insufficient resources to improve the services of B3M. So, he queried whether Citybus was using most of the resources to serve non-local residents. Furthermore, he reckoned that the proposal merely required Citybus to divert some of the resources from B3X to B3M without changing the supporting function of B3M for B3X. In the long run, the TD and Citybus should review the routing and service performance of the whole B3 series and the TD should also issue an open tender for B3M and B3A;
- (v) A Member said Citybus was pooling its resources to serve travellers from Mainland China, which was unfair to the local residents. In addition, if B3M was changed to run along Castle Peak Road, it could absorb the new passengers of Hoh

Fuk Tong, San Wai Tsai, San Hui Village, Wong Ka Wai, Prime View Garden, and Fu Tai. He suspected that Citybus refused to consider the rerouting proposal because it was unwilling to offer the \$2 per trip concession for senior citizens; and

- (vi) A Member said the B3 series currently did not cover the places surrounding the Castle Peak Road, so he/she proposed B3M to run along Castle Peak Road to Fu Tai, and B3A not to pass Fu Tai (to shorten the journey).

8. The Chairman said that the \$2 per trip concession for senior citizens was a subsidy from the government and the bus company was collecting the full fare. In addition, Citybus had already rationalised many bus routes on the Hong Kong Island, so it should have sufficient resources to improve the services of the B3 series. If Citybus was incapable of operating routes other than B3X, he suggested the TD to issue a new tender for B3M and B3A.

9. Members made the following comments in the second round of discussion:

- (i) A Member said B3A ran at a lower frequency but with a long journey, so many residents living along the route of B3A chose to take Route B3X which travelled a shorter journey. Therefore, he viewed that overall, it would be more convenient to the residents if B3A was changed not to pass Fu Tai and B3M was changed to start journey from Chi Lok or Sam Shing. Furthermore, he again requested the TD to issue a new tender for B3A and B3M;
- (ii) A Member said if Citybus was unwilling to put in resources to improve the services of B3A and B3M, he would concur in the suggestion of having B3A and B3M operated by other contractors;
- (iii) A Member said the B3 series had been neglecting the residents living along Castle Peak Road, so he/she wished B3M to go along Castle Peak Road. He/she reckoned that the demand for B3A would increase upon the intake of Yan Tin Estate; and
- (iv) A Member said if B3A did not pass Fu Tai, the journey could be shortened by 14

minutes, and changing the route of B3M to go along Castle Peak Road could attract more passengers, so he strongly urged Citybus to reconsider the relevant proposal.

10. Mr MOK of the TD said B3M served the non-peak hours with the first bus departing at 9:50 a.m. Expanding the service of B3M to an all-day service would involve the transfer of other buses serving at peak hours, the TD and the bus company would have to carefully deal with this proposal. At present, B3M departed from the Tuen Mun Bus Terminus at the MTR Station and went via Hung Kiu to the Shenzhen Bay. The route was fast and direct. If B3M was changed to travel along Castle Peak Road, the journey would be longer, and the frequency would certainly be affected; so, at the present stage, the TD would not consider such arrangement for B3M. In addition, the loading of B3A during the peak hours in the morning was around 40% to 50%, which met the demand of the passengers. The department noted Members' requests and would pay close attention to the developments in the district and make timely adjustments with the bus company for the effective and appropriate use of the resources.

11. The Chairman summarised that the TTC would continue to discuss this issue in the next meeting. He requested the TD to report on the progress of "Provision of Cross-boundary Bus Service between Tuen Mun and Lok Ma Chau" in the next meeting.

TD, Citybus

IV. Any Other Business and Date of Next Meeting

12. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:28 p.m. The next meeting would be held at 9:30 a.m. on 15 September 2017 (Friday).

Tuen Mun District Council Secretariat

Date: 8 August 2017

File Ref: HAD TMDC/13/25/TTC/17