

(Translation)

Minutes of the 1st Special Meeting of
Environmental and Health Affairs Committee (1/18-19)

Date: 23 May 2018 (Wednesday)
Time: 11:00 a.m.
Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Members

Mr CHOW Ping-tim (Chairman)
Mr CHENG Chit-pun (Vice Chairman)
Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH
The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael, BBS, JP
Mr LI Hung-por
Ms LAM, Lam Nixie
Mr LAM Faat-kang, MH
Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones
Mr WONG Ka-wa
Mr WONG Wai-kit
Mr LO Siu-kit, MH
Mr TAM Hoi-pong

Co-opted Members

Ms CHOW Chin-tung
Ms YU Sui-wan

Government Representatives

Ms KHATTAK Nasreen	District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Mr CHAN Kwok-hung	Chief Health Inspector 1 (Tsuen Wan), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Miss TAI Tsz-yan, Angie	Executive Officer (Development), Tsuen Wan District Office

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat Representatives

Miss LAM Siu-yung, Daisy	Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr LEE Nelson (Secretary)	Executive Officer (District Council) 1, Tsuen Wan District Office

Attendance by Invitation:

For discussion of item 1

Mr CHAN Simon	Property Services Manager/PM24, Architectural Services Department
---------------	---

Miss TANG Kit-ye	Architect, Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Limited, Consultant Engaged by the Architectural Services Department
Ms NG Sze-chung, May	Executive Officer (Planning) 4, Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Absent:

Members

Mr KOO Yeung-pong, MH
Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris
Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis
The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben, JP
Mr CHAN Sung-ip, MH
Mr KOT Siu-yuen
Mr CHUNG Wai-ping, SBS, MH

Co-opted Members

Mr LAM Kwok-on
Mr LAM Fook-chuen
Mr CHUNG Ho-yin

The Meeting

I Opening Remarks and Introduction

The Chairman welcomed the Members and representatives from the government departments to the 1st special meeting of the Environmental and Health Affairs Committee (EHAC).

2. The Chairman said that for Members' information, Mr CHUNG Wai-ping, Mr CHAN Sung-ip, Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris and Mr CHUNG Ho-yin were absent with apologies.

3. The Chairman reminded Members that according to Section 15(3) of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders (the "Standing Orders"), "in the course of a meeting of the Council, all persons attending or sitting in on the meeting at the place of the meeting shall switch off all devices which might emit sound and shall not use any telecommunications devices for conversation" in order to ensure the smooth progress of the meeting.

II Item 1: Request for an Overall Improvement of the Facilities and Hygienic Condition of the Public Toilets in Tsuen Wan District

(EHAC Paper No. 17/18-19)

4. The Chairman welcomed the representatives of the government departments who specially joined the meeting, including:

- (1) Ms KHATTAK Nasreen, District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan) (Dist Env Hygiene Supt (TW)) of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD);
- (2) Mr CHAN Kwok-hung, Chief Health Inspector 1 (Tsuen Wan) of the FEHD;
- (3) Mr CHAN Simon, Property Services Manager/Project Management 24 (PSM/PM24) of the Architectural Services Department (Arch SD);
- (4) Miss TANG Kit-ye, Architect of the Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Limited (Llewelyn-Davies); and

- (5) Ms NG Sze-chung, May, Executive Officer (Planning) 4 (EO(P)4) of the FEHD.
5. Architect of the Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Limited introduced the paper.
6. The Chairman said that the EHAC would discuss the refurbishment design of Tak Wah Park Public Toilet first.
7. The views, enquiries and suggestions of Members were summarised as follows:
- (1) he agreed to the number of water closet cubicles in Tak Wah Park Public Toilet (Mr LO Siu-kit);
 - (2) he enquired whether the hand dryer near the entrance of the male toilet could be mounted on the wall between the lavatory basins and urinals instead to make space for the entrance (Mr LO Siu-kit);
 - (3) he enquired whether the 909-millimetre-wide corridor between the water closet cubicles in the female toilet would be wide enough for users to pass through (Mr LO Siu-kit);
 - (4) he hoped that 12 water closet cubicles would be provided in the female toilet (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
 - (5) he opined that it was inconvenient for users to use the accessible urinal which was located at the end of the access in the male toilet, as the users had to pass through all the other urinals first (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
 - (6) he requested the Arch SD to improve the ventilation system and set the air outlets of the system upward or towards the direction away from the minibus stop (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
 - (7) he enquired whether the partitions of the water closet cubicles in the male toilet were connected to the ground (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
 - (8) he did not agree to the adoption of the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer in the public toilets of high patronage. Also, the hand dryer near the entrance of the public toilet might cause obstruction to the access (Mr TAM Hoi-pong);
 - (9) he requested the Arch SD to take the situations of the district concerned into account before conducting the trial run of the new design. He suggested that the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer should not be retained and the notices on the trial run of the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer should be put up (Mr TAM Hoi-pong);
 - (10) she requested the FEHD to pay attention to the slow refilling of the flush cisterns of watercloset toilets in the public toilets and the drain blockage in female toilets (Ms YU Sui-wan);
 - (11) he hoped that the FEHD would finalise the design and commence the works as soon as possible. He believed that the Arch SD and FEHD had the relevant guidelines for designing public toilets (Mr LAM Faat-kang);
 - (12) as the EHAC decided at its meeting on 3 May 2018 that the refurbishment design of the public toilets would be discussed at a special meeting, the FEHD formally sought views from Members on the design at this special meeting (the Chairman);

- (13) Members should determine the number of water closet cubicles in Tak Wah Park Public Toilet and whether the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer would be adopted (the Chairman);
- (14) he suggested that urinal troughs instead of urinals should be provided in the male toilet to make better use of the space for patronage of the toilet by more people at the same time. The urinal troughs should be decorated to create a more pleasing environment (the Chairman);
- (15) he opined that the adoption of materials in light colours would be highly presentable at first after the completion of the public toilet refurbishment. However, as the cleansing contractors engaged by the FEHD would not clean all the joints between the tiles carefully, he proposed to adopt materials in deep colours to make the stains less obvious (the Chairman);
- (16) he opined that the provision of air-conditioning in public toilets would significantly improve the environment therein and prevent damage to or deterioration in the outlook of the equipment and pipes inside the public toilets caused by humidity. However, he was worried that the installation of air-conditioning system would cause delay to the refurbishment works and poor maintenance would arise in future (the Chairman);
- (17) he enquired whether it was necessary to provide an accessible urinal in the public toilets as an accessible toilet was already provided (the Chairman);
- (18) she enquired whether children's toilets would be provided (Ms YU Sui-wan);
- (19) she agreed that urinal troughs would bring convenience to users of different ages (Ms YU Sui-wan); and
- (20) urinal troughs would be more suitable for children than urinals and the accessible urinals with handrails would be more suitable for the elderly. He hoped that a more people-oriented design would be adopted and the accessible urinal near the access would be provided (the Chairman).

8. PSM/PM24 of the Arch SD responded as follows:

- (1) according to the FEHD's design guidelines, the separate hand dryer should be mounted near the entrance of the toilet;
- (2) the distance of 909 millimetres between water closet cubicles in the female toilet referred to the distance between the doors of two water closet cubicles, which included the floor drain;
- (3) the proposal on provision of 12 water closet cubicles in the female toilet should be in compliance with the FEHD's design guidelines; and
- (4) the location of the accessible urinal as shown in the paper was the only location that met the requirement of the reservation for space at this stage.

9. Architect of Llewelyn-Davies responded as follows:

- (1) it was necessary to reserve space in front of an accessible urinal. If 11 urinals were retained, the accessible urinal could only be provided at the location under the current design. If fewer urinals were provided, the accessible urinal would be relocated to the side of the access;
- (2) the female toilet could not be expanded due to its structural constraint;

- (3) as a space of about 300 millimetres was to be reserved in the water closet cubicles in the female toilet for installation of facilities including the water pipes, drain holes and sensors, the width between the water closet cubicles in the female toilet would be about three feet only. As users would generally line up outside the access instead of outside the water closet cubicles, the space was sufficient for access by users;
 - (4) after refurbishment of the public toilets, a pump room would be provided to replace the traditional storage-type flush cisterns. The flush cistern would be refilled with flushing water immediately after flushing, which greatly shortened the time needed for refilling flushing water;
 - (5) the outlet drains in the public toilet would be revamped after refurbishment of the public toilets in order to prevent blockage;
 - (6) the basic ventilation facilities would be provided in the public toilets, including the louvre windows on the walls and vents near the entrance for air circulation. Fans would be provided in the public toilets and underneath the lavatory basins in order to keep the ground dry;
 - (7) pursuant to the Buildings Ordinance, one accessible urinal should be provided for a public toilet with two or more urinals. If the EHAC agreed to reduce the number of urinals, the accessible urinal could be relocated to the side of the access; and
 - (8) according to the FEHD's design manual, one children's water closet cubicle for children should be provided for every eight water closet cubicles. Therefore, a water closet cubicle suitable for children was included in the new design. A baby seat would also be provided in one of the water closet cubicles of the male and female toilets.
10. The views, enquiries and suggestions of Members were summarised as follows:
- (1) he suggested that wall tiles should be paved around in replacement of stainless steel urinal troughs together with enhancement to the outlook, with a view to bringing out an impression of revitalisation after the refurbishment. He hoped that the FEHD would reconsider the colours for materials such as the wall tiles (the Chairman);
 - (2) he enquired whether the separate hand dryer could be placed outside the entrance of the public toilet (the Chairman);
 - (3) he hoped that the number of ventilation facilities in the public toilet would be doubled so as to solve the odour problem (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
 - (4) as every lavatory basin would be equipped with a hand dryer, the separate hand dryer only served as a back-up and might not be frequently used. In addition, as the separate hand dryer might obstruct the access if it was placed near the entrance of the public toilet which was not ideal. He hoped that the hand dryer would be relocated (Mr LO Siu-kit); and
 - (5) he enquired whether the indicative signs in different colours for the male and female toilets would be put up outside the entrances of the public toilet (Mr LO Siu-kit).
11. EO(P)4 of the FEHD responded as follows:
- (1) it was recommended in the FEHD's design guidelines that urinal troughs should be replaced by urinals in the refurbished public toilets. The FEHD would consider

adopting the EHAC's suggestion of the adoption of the urinal troughs in the public toilet;

- (2) it was also recommended in the latest design guidelines that the separate hand dryers should be provided near the entrance. However, FEHD would make a decision subject to the actual situations; and
- (3) the public toilet under the aforesaid design was subject to some Members' suggestions that the separate hand dryer should be mounted near the entrance of the public toilet by making reference to the users' procedure in use.

12. Architect of Llewelyn-Davies responded that light boxes would be placed outside the entrances of the male and female public toilets respectively and the walls of the public toilets would be painted with graphics in different colours for easy identification.

13. EO(P)4 of the FEHD responded that the colours of the public toilets would be determined by the Tsuen Wan District Environmental Hygiene Office of the FEHD.

14. Dist Env Hygiene Supt (TW) of the FEHD said that the FEHD would decide the colours of the public toilets according to the EHAC's suggestions.

15. The Chairman stated that the EHAC should decide whether 11 or 12 water closet cubicles would be provided in the female toilet. He enquired whether a nappy changing table would be provided in the accessible toilet and whether the nappy changing table could be mounted on the wall adjacent to the entrance of the public toilet.

16. Architect of Llewelyn-Davies responded that as the nappy changing table was mounted on the wall between the water closet cubicles and lavatory basins, if the number of water closet cubicles was increased to 12, there would be smaller space for changing nappies and it would be inconvenient. Pursuant to the Buildings Ordinance, a specific dimension of space without obstruction and the smooth access for wheelchair users should be ensured for provision of the accessible toilet. Thus, mounting of nappy changing table on the wall inside the accessible toilet was not recommended.

17. The Chairman said that the EHAC agreed to retain the design of 11 water closet cubicles in the female toilet. Besides, he enquired whether the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer would be adopted for each lavatory basin or for two out of the five lavatory basins.

18. The views, enquiries and suggestions of Members were summarised as follows:

- (1) it was unreasonable to reduce the number of lavatory basins in all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer owing to environmental protection. She thought that it was unnecessary to adopt fewer lavatory basins in all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer only because not every user would use the hand dryers (Ms LAM, Lam Nixie);
- (2) he thought that it was undesirable if the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer would be adopted for some lavatory basins only. As a separate hand dryer was provided at the entrance of the public toilet, he suggested that the all-in-one design of

- lavatory basin/hand dryer should be adopted for all the lavatory basins, so that users could decide whether to use the hand dryers or not (Mr LO Siu-kit);
- (3) he opined that the users who did not want to line up for using the hand dryers would be discouraged from using the toilet rolls in the water closet cubicles after the adoption of the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer (Mr LAM Faat-kang);
 - (4) he agreed that the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer should be adopted for all lavatory basins and proposed to exclude the separate hand dryer, so as to prevent obstruction to the access of the public toilet caused by users of the separate hand dryer (Mr MAN Yu-ming);
 - (5) she thought that the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer might lead to the problem of forming a queue for the hand dryers. She suggested that one hand dryer should be provided in-between for every two lavatory basins (Ms YU Sui-wan);
 - (6) he opined that the equipment such as the hand dryers was prone to damages and he hoped that the Arch SD would provide repair service for damaged facilities in the public toilet as soon as possible (Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones);
 - (7) he thought that it was undesirable to install electrical appliances above lavatory basins. Therefore, he proposed to ban the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer or adopt the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer in-between two lavatory basins and a notice should be put up atop (Mr TAM Hoi-pong); and
 - (8) he opined that it would be more convenient for users if the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer was adopted for all lavatory basins (the Vice Chairman).

19. Dist Env Hygiene Supt (TW) of the FEHD said that the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer was on trial run in a pilot scheme. She suggested that the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer should be adopted for all lavatory basins but she would respect the decision made by the EHAC.

20. The Chairman said that the EHAC agreed to retain the separate hand dryer and asked Members to vote on the adoption of the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer for all lavatory basins or for three lavatory basins only.

21. The Chairman stated that after voting, six votes were received in favour of the adoption of the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer for all lavatory basins and two votes were received in favour of the adoption of the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer for three lavatory basins. The Chairman announced that the all-in-one design of lavatory basin/hand dryer would be adopted for all lavatory basins in Tak Wah Park Public Toilet.

22. The Chairman said that the EHAC had given its views on the design of Tak Wah Park Public Toilet. He hoped that the FEHD would work on bringing the revitalised and special features to the public toilet upon soliciting the views and completion of the refurbishment works. He also enquired when the refurbishment works would be completed.

23. EO(Planning)4 of the FEHD enquired whether the EHAC wished to replace urinals with urinal troughs in the public toilets.

24. The Chairman stated that it would be more appropriate to adopt urinal troughs if the urinal troughs installed by the FEHD were not made of stainless steel.

25. Architect of the Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Limited responded that as there was running water for the urinal troughs, the urinal troughs made of stainless steel would be more durable. She enquired whether the EHAC would consider reducing one urinal in order to make space for relocating the accessible urinal to the side of the access.

26. The Chairman said that the current location of the accessible urinal was unacceptable as it would cause obstruction to other users. The layout of the public toilets should be finalised by the FEHD. He also enquired what improvements would be made to the ventilation system in the public toilets.

27. Architect of the Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Limited responded that the air ventilators would be installed above the urinals and in each water closet cubicle to extract the air to the headroom of the toilet or towards the direction with lower user flow.

28. The views, enquiries and suggestions of Members were summarised as follows:

- (1) If there was improvement to the ventilation system, observation on its effectiveness of the prospective improvement could be made in the first place (Mr WONG Ka-wa); and
- (2) the existing equipment was insufficient to solve the odour problem in the public toilet. He hoped that the power of the ventilation systems would be enhanced and the locations of the air outlets would be carefully designed so as to avoid affecting the pedestrians (Mr LO Siu-kit).

29. Architect of Llewelyn-Davies briefed on the design of the Tsuen Wan Multi-storey Carpark Building Public Toilet as follows:

- (1) at present, there were five water closet cubicles, seven urinals, four lavatory basins and one attendant room in the male toilet. There were ten water closet cubicles, six lavatory basins, one attendant room and one accessible toilet in the female toilet;
- (2) there were five water closet cubicles in the newly-designed male toilet, and one of them was for the elderly. One of the five urinals was an accessible urinal and there were five lavatory basins. The quantity of the facilities provided was in compliance with the requirement in the FEHD's design guidelines;
- (3) there were eight water closet cubicles, four lavatory basins and one attendant room in the newly-designed female toilet. Although there would be fewer water closet cubicles as compared to the existing female toilet, the patronage demand could still be met according to the FEHD's statistics on patronage;
- (4) the colours of pastel blue and pink would be applied for easy identification of the male toilet and female toilet; and
- (5) the design of the ventilation system would be the same as that in Tak Wah Park Public Toilet.

30. The views, enquiries and suggestions of Members were summarised as follows:
- (1) he opined that the FEHD should pay attention to the frequency of refilling liquid soap to maintain the regular provision of liquid soap. He proposed that the FEHD should study whether there was any automatic liquid soap refilling system available in the market to replace the manual refilling (the Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael);
 - (2) as the cleansing work was outsourced, he requested the FEHD to include this into the terms of the tenders and contracts and step up the monitoring of the performance of the contractors (the Chairman); and
 - (3) he opined that liquid soap would be wasted if the nozzle of a soap dispenser did not direct the stream of liquid soap to the right position. He requested the FEHD to ensure that the stream of the liquid soap could be directed from the nozzle of the soap dispenser straight to the users' hands (Mr TAM Hoi-pong).
31. The Chairman stated that the aforesaid problems could be solved by the manually-operated liquid soap dispensers. He asked Members whether the sensor-activated soap dispensers or manually-operated soap dispensers should be provided in the public toilets.
32. The EHAC agreed to adopt the sensor-activated liquid soap dispenser.
33. The views, enquiries and suggestions of Members were summarised as follows:
- (1) it was inconvenient for users to reach the accessible urinal as it was located at the end of the access in the male toilet, and the users had to pass through all the other urinals first (Mr LO Siu-kit);
 - (2) he had reservations on the projection that the fewer number of water closet cubicles could still meet the demand. He hoped that the number of water closet cubicles for the elderly would be increased from two to three in the female toilet (Mr LO Siu-kit);
 - (3) he enquired whether the lavatory basins could be relocated aside the entrance of the male toilet to make space for the provision of the accessible urinal (Mr LO Siu-kit); and
 - (4) he enquired if the separate hand dryer could be embedded in the wall (the Chairman).
34. PSM/PM24 of the Arch SD responded that the thicker wall was the pre-condition for installation of the wall-embedded hand dryers. The brick walls in the public toilet were not thick enough for the installation of the wall-embedded hand dryers.
35. Architect of the Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Limited responded as follows:
- (1) to comply with the provisions of the Buildings Ordinance, it was necessary to provide an accessible urinal in the public toilet. Accessible toilets were mainly provided for the wheelchair users and the accessible urinals were provided for the people who were not wheelchair users, including persons with mobility or visual impairment; and
 - (2) he agreed that the separate hand dryer could be relocated to another wall and hoped that the EHAC would allow the FEHD's trial run of different types of designs.

36. The views, enquiries and suggestions of Members were summarised as follows:
- (1) he suggested that the nappy changing table for babies should be relocated to the original location of the separate hand dryer to make space for the lavatory basins which could be relocated farther away from the urinals. By doing so, some space would be freed up for provision of the accessible urinal without reducing the number of urinals (Mr LO Siu-kit);
 - (2) he agreed that the separate hand dryer would not be provided if the number of urinals was increased (Mr LO Siu-kit);
 - (3) he hoped that the FEHD would improve or enhance the power of the ventilation system (Mr LO Siu-kit);
 - (4) he enquired whether the separate hand dryer could be placed outside the public toilet (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
 - (5) he enquired whether the newly-designed ventilation system would be more advanced than the existing one (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
 - (6) he hoped that the FEHD would revise the design according to the Members' views (the Chairman); and
 - (7) he enquired when the refurbishment works would be completed (the Chairman).

37. PSM/PM24 of the Arch SD responded that the Arch SD would enhance the power of the ventilation system as far as practicable in compliance with the FEHD's design guidelines.

38. EO(P)4 of the FEHD responded that the FEHD noted the EHAC's views on the enhanced ventilation system and would spare no effort to make improvement as long as it was technically feasible. The FEHD and Arch SD would conduct a preliminary examination of the proposed refurbishment design for the public toilet project on 31 May 2018 and would endorse the design at the Working Group meeting in June 2018. She enquired whether the refurbishment works of the two public toilets could be carried out concurrently.

39. Architect of Llewelyn-Davies responded that the works would commence in nine months after the endorsement at the Working Group meeting and the works would take about nine months for completion if all went smoothly.

40. Dist Env Hygiene Supt (TW) of the FEHD responded that the FEHD proposed to carry out the refurbishment works of the two public toilets concurrently.

41. The Chairman stated that the EHAC endorsed the proposal on carrying out the refurbishment works of the two public toilets concurrently.

III Item 2: Any Other Business

42. The Chairman said he learned that the Dist Env Hygiene Supt (TW) of the FEHD would be posted out from Tsuen Wan district. As the Dist Env Hygiene Supt (TW) had all along been dedicated to working together with the EHAC on the improvement of environmental hygiene in Tsuen Wan with great achievement, he hoped that she would remain in her post until the term of the current District Council (DC) expired in order to help oversee the environmental

improvement works already launched or to be launched shortly in Tsuen Wan district for smooth completion of these works. He said that the EHAC would write to the Chief Secretary for Administration to express the EHAC's aspiration that the Dist Env Hygiene Supt (TW) could remain in her office until the end of the current term of the DC.

IV Adjournment of Meeting

43. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 12:42 p.m.

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat

26 June 2018