

(Translation)

Minutes of the 10th Meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (1/17-18)

Date: 23 May 2017

Time: 2:30 p.m.

Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Mr CHUNG Wai-ping, SBS, MH (Chairman)

Mr WONG Wai-kit (Vice Chairman)

Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH

The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael, BBS, JP

Mr KOO Yeung-pong, MH

Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris

Mr LI Hung-por

Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis

Ms LAM, Lam Nixie

Mr LAM Faat-kang, MH

The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben, JP

Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones

Mr CHAN Sung-ip, MH

Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly

Mr WONG Ka-wa

Mr KOT Siu-yuen

Mr CHOW Ping-tim

Mr CHENG Chit-pun

Mr LO Siu-kit

Mr TAM Hoi-pong

In Attendance:

Miss YIP Kam-ching, Jenny, JP District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr CHONG Kong-sang, Patrick Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr CHAN Shiu-man, Simon Senior Executive Officer (District Management), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr HUEN Yeuk-hon, John Senior Liaison Officer (1), Tsuen Wan District Office

Ms LEE Lai-kiu, Winnie Senior Liaison Officer (2), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr CHAN Lok-wing District Commander (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force

Miss KWOK Sze-wai, Venus Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan) (Acting), Hong Kong Police Force

Mr WONG Kwok-chun, Alex	District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing), Social Welfare Department
Mr LO Kam-lun, Alan	District Lands Officer (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department
Mr TSE Hing-chit	Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department
Mr TO Chi-keung, Gary	Chief Transport Officer/NT South West (Acting), Transport Department
Mr WONG Hon-kit	Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan), Housing Department
Ms KHATTAK Nasreen	District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Mr LAM Chi-keung, Desmond	Chief Engineer/NTW 2 (New Territories West), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms CHEUNG Yuk King, Dilys	Chief Leisure Manager (New Territories West), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr CHENG Kwok-kuen, Chris	District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Miss LAM Siu-yung, Daisy (Secretary)	Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr LAU Shun-tak, Donald	Executive Officer I (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office

For discussion of item 4:

Mr NG Kwok-chi	Regional Officer of New Territories West, Independent Commission Against Corruption
Ms IP Sau-hing, Rita	Senior Community Relations Officer, ICAC Regional Office (New Territories South West), Independent Commission Against Corruption

For discussion of item 5:

Dr K M CHOY	Chief Manager (Service Transformation), Hospital Authority
Mr Kelvin CHENG	Manager (Transformation Projects), Hospital Authority
Dr YIU Yuk-kwan	Chief of Service, Department of Family Medicine & Primary Health Care, Kowloon West Cluster, Hospital Authority

For discussion of item 6:

Dr LOH Lai-ting, Taron	Senior Medical & Health Officer (Community Liaison)1, Department of Health
------------------------	---

For discussion of item 7:

Mr CHU Wing-hing, Ken

Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Waste Reduction & Recycling)⁵, Environmental Protection Department

Mr CHAN Yu-keung, Alex

Environmental Protection Officer (Waste Reduction & Recycling)¹², Environmental Protection Department

For discussion of item 8:

Mr LEUNG Wing-kee

Senior Telecommunications Engineer (Broadcasting Support), Office of the Communications Authority

Mr LEE Shun, Wilson

Telecommunications Engineer (Broadcasting Support)³, Office of the Communications Authority

For discussion of item 9:

Mr Daniel LEUNG

Chief Personal Data Officer, Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data

Mr Anthony CHAN

Senior Personal Data Officer, Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data

For discussion of item 10:

Mr TSE Man-hong, Kane

Engineer/ Tsuen Kwai 1, Drainage Services Department

Mr LEUNG Hin-tat, Norman

Senior Maintenance Engineer/South West, Highways Department

Ms NG Wai-ki

Maintenance Engineer/Tsuen Wan, Highways Department

Mr LAM Heung-kan

District Engineer/New Territories West (Islands, Tsuen Wan, Kwai Tsing), Lighting Division, Highways Department

Mr CHOY Lap-shing, Eddie

Senior Building Surveyor/D5, Buildings Department

For discussion of item 11:

Mr LEUNG Hin-tat, Norman

Senior Maintenance Engineer/South West, Highways Department

Ms NG Wai-ki

Maintenance Engineer/Tsuen Wan, Highways Department

For discussion of item 13:

Mr CHEUNG Kim-hung

Engineer/Tsuen Wan 2, Transport Department

For discussion of item 14:

Mr NG Cheuk-yiu

Immigration Task Force Commander, Immigration Department

Mr YUNG Wai-kwok

Senior Immigration Officer (Investigation) Task Force, Immigration Department

Action

I Opening Remarks and Introduction

The Chairman welcomed the Members and representatives from the government departments to the 10th meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (TWDC) and introduced:

- (1) Mr LAM Chi-keung, Desmond, who replaced Mr LAM Lap-tak, Daniel, to assume the post of Chief Engineer/NTW 2, Civil Engineering and Development Department;
- (2) Mr TO Chi-keung, Gary, who attend this meeting on behalf of Mr MOK Ying-kit, the successor of Mr YUEN Hong-shing, Honson, assuming the post of Chief Transport Officer/NT South West, Transport Department (TD); and
- (3) Miss KWOK Sze-wai, Venus, Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan) (Acting) (RCRO(TW)(Atg.)), Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF) who attended this meeting on behalf of Ms LAU Chui-ying, Bo.

2. The Chairman reminded Members that in accordance with sections 17(1) and 27 of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders (the Standing Orders) that any Member who wished to move a motion or ask any question at a meeting of the Council was required to give the Secretary a notice in writing ten clear working days before the meeting. Thus, he reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 25 July 2017 and the deadline for submission of paper was 10 July 2017. The Chairman asked Members to speak as concise as possible because there were many items on the agenda. In addition, according to section 28 of the Standing Orders, unless otherwise agreed by the Chairman, Members could speak and make supplementary remarks once for each agenda item at the meeting and each Member could speak up to three minutes.

II Item 1: Confirmation of Minutes of the 9th Meeting held on 28.3.2017

3. The Chairman said the Secretariat had received one proposed amendment from Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris, prior to this meeting. The proposed amendment was stated as follows:

- (1) in line 13 of paragraph 55 of the captioned minutes, “荃灣西站至海盛路之間的政治土地” (the political land between Tsuen Wan West Station and Hoi Shing Road) should be amended as “荃灣西站至海盛路之間的政府土地” (the government land between Tsuen Wan West Station and Hoi Shing Road).

4. The minutes of the 9th meeting were confirmed with proposed amendment.

III Item 2: Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meetings

(A) Paragraphs 5-19 of the Minutes of the Meeting held on 28 March 2017: Visit of Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation to Tsuen Wan District Council

5. The Chairman stated that Members had discussed the above issue at the TWDC meeting held on 28 March 2017. The supplementary information submitted by the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department on 5 May 2017 had been distributed to Members for perusal.

IV Item 3: Introduction on the Civil Engineering and Development Department's Role and Works in Tsuen Wan District
(TWDC Paper No. 3/17-18)

6. The Chairman stated that as the Director of Civil Engineering and Development was unable to attend this meeting due to some other paramount engagements, this agenda item would not be discussed at this meeting.

V Item 4: 2017/18 Work Plan of the Independent Commission Against Corruption (ICAC) Regional Office (New Territories South West)
(TWDC Paper No. 4/17-18)

7. The Chairman stated that the ICAC Regional Office (New Territories South West) introduced its work plan to Members every year. The representatives from the ICAC attending the meeting were:

- (1) Mr NG Kwok-chi, Regional Officer of New Territories West (RCNTW);
and
- (2) Ms IP Sau-hing, Rita, Senior Community Relations Officer, ICAC Regional Office (New Territories South West).

8. RCNTW of the ICAC introduced the key features of the work plan for the current year, including the continued implementation of "All for Integrity" programme and enhancement of district liaison work, strengthening the public participation of and the work for youth probity through the activities of the 20th Anniversary of the ICAC Club, enhancement of cross-media publicity and intensifying the education of prevention of corruption for the public and private sectors as well as the grassroots. He invited the TWDC to co-organise the promotional activities for "All for Integrity" programme 2017/18.

9. The Chairman asked if Members agreed that the TWDC would co-organise a series of activities for "All for Integrity" programme in 2017/18 at district level.

10. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC would co-organise a series of activities for "All for Integrity" programme in 2017/18 with the ICAC.

VI Item 5: General Outpatient Clinic Public-Private Partnership Programme of Hospital Authority
(TWDC Paper No. 5/17-18)

11. The Chairman stated that the Hospital Authority (HA) submitted the paper to introduce its General Outpatient Clinic Public-Private Partnership Programme (the Programme) to Members. The representatives from the HA attending the meeting were:

- (1) Dr K M CHOY, Chief Manager (Service Transformation) (CM(ST));
- (2) Mr Kelvin CHENG, Manager (Transformation Projects) (M(TP)); and
- (3) Dr YIU Yuk-kwan, Chief of Service (CS), Department of Family Medicine & Primary Health Care (DFM&PHC), Kowloon West Cluster.

12. CM(ST) and M(TP) of the HA introduced the details of the Programme as well as the progress of the implementation of the Programme by the HA and collected Members' views on the Programme. In addition, CS, DFM&PHC, Kowloon West Cluster of the HA introduced the latest progress of the Programme in Tsuen Wan district.

(Note: Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis joined the meeting at 2:56 p.m.)

13. Mr LO Siu-kit said that many residents had made enquiries on when the Programme would be extended to Tsuen Wan after the HA launched the first phase of the Programme. He noted that the HA would start to extend the Programme to cover Tsuen Wan in 2017/18. He hoped that the HA would implement the Programme in Tsuen Wan as soon as possible and identify more doctors to participate in the Programme because the information of doctors' participation was not available upon the discussion of participation of the Programme with the doctors in Tsuen Wan district of late and it was difficult for the elderly to make appointment by phone or by queuing in person for the general outpatient service in Tsuen Wan district which was a relatively aging community. Moreover, he enquired about the result of the Programme of other districts upon implementation, so that he could tell the residents about the details of the Programme. He stated that patients with chronic diseases could participate in the Programme but they could only seek ten consultations under the Programme. The limit of ten consultations was not enough for them. He enquired whether the patients with chronic diseases could return to the public hospitals for consultations after the ten subsidised consultations under the Programme were completed.

14. Mr KOO Yeung-pong stated that the patients of Tsuen Wan district would be invited for participation in the Programme starting from July 2017. He enquired on the number of patients to be invited; and whether the participating patients could also choose the private doctors in the districts other than Tsuen Wan district or the patients in all districts over the territory could share the network of the doctors for more choices.

15. Mr WONG Ka-wa said he welcomed the Programme because it could be seen from other districts that the pressure of some sessions of the general outpatient service was relieved and the waiting time of the patients was shortened after the Programme was implemented. He enquired whether the service of the Lady Trench General Out-patient Clinic and Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic in Tsuen

Wan had reached saturation. Besides, he hoped that the patients in Tsuen Wan district could choose to seek consultations in other districts, apart from visiting the clinics in Tsuen Wan district for patients' convenience.

(Note: Mr KOT Siu-yuen joined the meeting at 3:08 p.m.)

16. Mr CHENG Chit-pun said he welcomed the extension of the Programme to cover Tsuen Wan because he noted that many residents, particularly the patients with chronic diseases, had expressed their appreciation on the Programme upon implementation in other districts for acquisition of drugs without waiting for long. He enquired the status of discussions of participation in the Programme between the HA and private doctors, the number of private doctors who undertook to participate in the Programme and the number of eligible patients in Tsuen Wan district; and whether a proper ratio was maintained for the private doctors and patients and whether the Programme was in short supply for the demand. In addition, the patients worried that the private doctors would ask them to attend unnecessary check-ups frequently or prescribe more expensive drugs for them. Thus, he wished to know whether the HA had set up any monitoring mechanism for this.

17. Mr LAM Faat-kang stated that he welcomed the Programme because it helped relieve the pressure of the healthcare system. He enquired whether the patients with chronic diseases who suffered from blood glucose problems or hypertension under invitation of participation of the Programme could seek consultations for other episodic diseases. He pointed out that the number of consultations received by patients from private clinics was limited to ten; however, the private clinics would only make prescription of drugs for three days. It was obvious that the drugs were insufficient for these patients. Thus, he enquired how the HA handled this situation.

18. M(TP) of the HA responded as follows:

- (1) seeking consultations across districts was allowed under the Programme. The patient could freely choose one participating private doctor as the family doctor in the districts under implementation of the Programme. As at 15 May 2017, a total of 278 private doctors were available for patients' choice;
- (2) in mid-January 2017, the HA invited the doctors in Tsuen Wan district to become the service providers under the Programme in writing. As at 15 May 2017, a total of 12 private doctors in Tsuen Wan district participated in the Programme. The HA welcomed the doctors who had interest to enrol for participation of the Programme anytime for providing service to the general public;

- (3) according to the experience gained from the same type of programme, each patient completed seven subsidised consultations on average every year. Hence, the ten subsidised outpatient service provided under the Programme every year would likely be sufficient for meeting the patients' needs. If the patient sought further consultations after the ten consultations were completed, they could opt to seek consultations from private doctors by paying fees on their own or from the general outpatient clinics of the HA. The elderly who had joined the Health Care Voucher Scheme could use the vouchers to pay for the fees of the said further consultations;
- (4) the HA would timely conduct reviews by taking into consideration of incorporation of other types of chronic diseases for the Programme; and
- (5) the private doctors would prescribe drugs for up to three days according to the clinical conditions of individual patients who suffered episodic illnesses such as cold, flu, diarrhoea, vomiting and abdominal pain without charging them additional fees. For cases of chronic diseases, the private doctors would prescribe the drugs in the List of Specific Drugs under the Programme, subject to the clinical conditions and HA's past records of the patients.

19. CM(ST) of the HA responded as follows:

- (1) the patients under invitation of the Programme had received check-ups from the general outpatient service of the HA over a year. The HA had an idea of the drugs taken by the patients through the electronic platform. The participating private doctors could prescribe their own drugs or purchase the drugs listed for the Programme from the HA's drug suppliers at specified prices;
- (2) the HA had assured the patients that during the consultations with the private doctors, they would be prescribed the drugs which were formerly prescribed during their consultations with the general outpatient service of the HA. The patients under the Programme mostly suffered from hypertension. The participating private doctors would make diagnosis for and give treatments to the patients individually subject to the conditions and drugs taken by the patients;
- (3) a stable supply of drugs was of paramount importance to the care of the patients with chronic diseases. After the patient chose the suitable doctor, the HA would create an electronic record for the patient under the patient's consent. By doing so, the participating private doctor would be able to refer to the record and the patient would be prescribed with the drugs during consultation with the private doctor;
- (4) in case of the change of patients' conditions, they could choose to return to the general outpatient clinics of the HA to receive treatments or seek consultations from the private doctors;

- (5) although not until mid-2014 did the HA implement the Programme, the HA had implemented another public-private partnership (PPP) programme of the same type in the New Territories since 2008-09. According to the experience gained from this programme, each patient completed about seven subsidised consultations on average every year. Hence, the ten subsidised outpatient service provided under the Programme every year would likely be sufficient for meeting the patients' needs. The more familiar with the patients, the more the doctors understood the patients' needs and the patients would be under the more proper care of the doctors;
- (6) in the mid-term review of the Programme which was completed in the first quarter in 2016, the HA found that some patients wished to seek consultations in the regions of their workplaces or in other districts. Seeking consultations across districts was currently allowed under the Programme. The patient could freely choose one participating private doctor as the family doctor in the districts under implementation of the Programme; and
- (7) the list of participating private doctors was uploaded to the webpage of the HA. Members could request for a copy of the list from the HA if necessary.

20. CS, DFM&PHC, Kowloon West Cluster of the HA responded as follows:

- (1) the HA zoned Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic into Kwai Tsing district. It was not mentioned when the details of the Programme of Tsuen Wan district was given because the Programme had been implemented in Kwai Tsing district and covered the patients in Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic; and
- (2) both Kwai Tsing district and Tsuen Wan district were under the management of Kowloon West Cluster of the HA. As the locations of the general outpatient clinics in these two districts were very close to each other, so the patients of these two districts were currently using the service of the clinics of both districts.

21. Mr WONG Ka-wa stated that and the residents in Lei Muk Shue would mostly seek consultations from Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic in Lei Muk Shue. As some of the private hospitals, such as Hong Kong Adventist Hospital, still had room for providing service, he suggested that the HA should cooperate with these private hospitals for relieving the number of people waiting for the service of public hospitals on one hand, and for effective use of the service of private hospitals on the other.

22. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said he had no comments for the Programme and he supported it for the major direction because it had already been implemented in other

districts and residents were eagerly looking forward to it. He noted that Hong Kong Adventist Hospital still had room for providing service, he thus enquired whether the Programme would be extended to cover the specialist outpatient clinics; and whether the HA would work in collaboration with Hong Kong Adventist Hospital to expedite the waiting time of the specialist outpatient service in Tsuen Wan district.

23. The Chairman stated that the TWDC paper under this agenda item was about the Programme and the specialist outpatient service should be under further study by the HA.

24. CM(ST) of the HA responded as follows:

- (1) the service scope of the HA's PPP had commenced since 2008. The HA was granted a fund of \$10 billion to generate investment return for funding the PPP programmes and initiatives after support was gained from the Legislative Council (LegCo) and the Government in 2015-16;
- (2) besides the Programme, other PPP programmes included but not limited to the provision of Computed Tomography and Magnetic Resonance Imaging services for patients from selected cancer groups, provision of haemodialysis service for the end-stage renal failure patients, and the Colon Assessment PPP Programme which catered for the growing demand of assessment for colon illnesses from the general public; and
- (3) under the dual track approach of the public and private services, the HA would continue to communicate with members of the public and patient groups and maintain a close collaboration with the relevant stakeholders, with a view to exploring the feasibility of other PPP programmes which would cater for the new demand for healthcare services from the general public.

25. Mr CHOW Ping-tim said according to the HA's paper, 43% of the patients with chronic diseases suffered from hypertension and 35 000 patients would be benefitted after the Programme was fully rolled out in 18 districts. He thus enquired how many of those 35 000 people were the patients with chronic diseases suffered from hypertension that accrued to 43% in ratio, the ratio of the people in these two cohorts, the reduction of the number of patients with chronic diseases under the Programme, whether the HA was contented with the speculation that 35 000 patients would be benefitted from the Programme, and whether more patients would be benefitted from the Programme. He added that among the large number of people who suffered from hypertension, those who were well-off or refused to wait for the general outpatient service generally sought consultations from the private doctors. He pointed out that patients were encouraged to wait for one year for the service of HA's general outpatient clinics in the first place and receive treatments from the private doctors thereafter. He enquired whether the HA would offer some quotas for the private doctors, so that the private doctors could make referrals to the HA for their

patients to participate in the Programme. It helped the smooth implementation of the Programme because the patients could participate in the Programme without having to wait for the general outpatient service of the public hospitals. He further added that the most appealing of all, the Programme allowed the patients with chronic diseases to treat their chronic diseases at private clinics on one hand, and to seek consultations for other illnesses such as cold and flu from private doctors within the quota of ten consultations on the other. He hoped that not only could the patients of the public hospitals seek consultations at the private clinics through the Programme, the eligible patients of the private clinics could also participate in the Programme, in order to achieve the integration of the public and private service.

26. CM(ST) of the HA responded as follows:

- (1) in 2015-16, approval was sought from the LegCo for the Government's allocation of \$10 billion to the HA to set up the PPP Endowment Fund. At that time, the HA told the LegCo that a total of some 35 000 quotas would be provided for patients under the Programme as it was implemented till 2020-21. As to whether the number of quota would be increased, it depended on the consensus from Members, Government and our society in future. The HA believed that the Programme was likely to be developed continuously and its way forward was solely subject to the Government's initiative in future;
- (2) due to the aging population and patients' needs, the demand for healthcare service was on the surge. Assuming each patient under the Programme received ten consultations a year, a total of some 350 000 consultations would be provided under the Programme. In the HA's yearbook, the general outpatient clinics provided five to six million consultations a year. Despite the fact that the 350 000 consultations provided under the Programme roughly amounted to 6% to 7% of the total number of consultations provided by the HA's general outpatient clinics, the HA would not reduce the quota of general outpatient service. In the long run, the PPP was conducive to making improvements for the general outpatient service;
- (3) the consultation service under the Programme was provided by the private doctors. Therefore, most important of all, it very much depended on the private doctors who were willing to participate in the Programme. The role of the HA was to assist the patients from the HA's general outpatient service to change to seek consultations at the private clinics; and
- (4) the HA would conduct a full review on the Programme and study the way forward of the development of the Programme in one or two years.

27. The Chairman stated that Members supported the Programme and hoped that the HA would take Members' views into consideration. He thanked the representatives from the HA for making introduction of the Programme and hoped that more private doctors in Tsuen Wan district would participate in the Programme for the benefits of the members of the public.

VII Item 6: Strongly Request for Comprehensive Improvement of Service and District Facilities of Dental Care for the Elderly Aged 65
(TWDC Paper No. 6/17-18)

28. The Chairman stated that Mr WONG Ka-wa submitted the paper. The representative from the department responsible for giving response was Dr LOH Lai-ting, Taron, Senior Medical & Health Officer (Community Liaison)¹ (SM&HO(CL)¹), Department of Health (DH). Besides, the written reply of the Food and Health Bureau (FHB) was tabled at the meeting.

29. Mr WONG Ka-wa introduced the paper.

(Note: Ms LAM, Lam Nixie left the meeting at 3:43 p.m.)

30. SM&HO(CL)¹ of the DH responded as follows:

- (1) the DH understood Members' concern on the dental health of the elderly;
- (2) the DH hoped that the dental service would be provided for the elderly in need. Currently, a total of 11 government dental clinics under DH provided free emergency dental services at General Public Sessions every week for the general public. In addition, the 18 elderly health centres, from a family medicine perspective, provided health assessment, counselling, treatment and health education services, including oral examination and offer of oral care advice, as well as making referrals as appropriate for the elderly aged 65 or above when necessary;
- (3) providing comprehensive dental care services to the public would involve substantial financial resources. Only a few countries around the world could meet all the dental care needs of their citizens solely with public resources. The oral health of the members of the public might be far from the standard due to the lack of knowledge of dental care and health education. The Government's policy on dental care sought to raise public awareness of oral health and oral hygiene and encourage proper oral health habits through promotion and education;
- (4) besides the publicity work on health promotion, the Government had pooled resources to provide emergency dental services for the public, as well as accorded priority to people with special needs, especially the elderly with financial difficulties. Besides, the Government provided the special grant for dental treatment through the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme for the recipients who were aged 60 or above, disable or medically certified to be in ill health; and

(5) in recent years, the Government had launched a series of initiatives to focus on the care to the people with special needs for dental treatments, including the provision of dental care service support such as the Outreach Dental Care Programme and Community Care Fund Elderly Dental Assistance Programme to the low-income people and elderly with special needs. In the 2017 Policy Address, the Government proposed to lower the eligibility age for the Elderly Health Care Vouchers from 70 to 65, so that more elderly persons would be benefitted. The eligible elderly might also use the Elderly Health Care Vouchers for the primary healthcare services provided by the privately-run market, including the dental services.

31. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly was of the view that there was still much room for improvement for the elderly dental services. Therefore, he would submit paper to the TWDC once in a while to request the departments concerned to make improvements for the elderly dental services. He added that some elderly started to queue up for free dental services at about 3:00 a.m. to 4:00 a.m. It was upsetting to let it happen. He thus enquired why the 11 government dental clinics failed to provide full-day service and doubted if the resources pooled for the service were so scarce. He hoped that the Government would have a deep thought of this. He pointed out that undoubtedly, more elderly had been benefitted through the Community Care Fund; however, all the beneficiaries should undergo an asset test. As a result, the elderly with small amount of savings who were not benefitted from the Community Care Fund could only queue for the free dental services or give up treatments when they had dental problems. Hence, he hoped that the Government could provide the comprehensive and non-asset-tested dental services for the elderly. Moreover, he opined that the dental education of the DH was not comprehensive enough, although the dental education for children was better. On the dental education for the elderly, the DH had never organised any talks on dental knowledge and primary oral examinations jointly with the councillors' offices or elderly centres. He thought that the earlier the preventive work, the more favourable for the elderly. It would also help slim the chance of dental problems for the elderly. So, he hoped that the Government would allocate more resources to the dental services.

32. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that the high expenses on denture could not be fully covered by making payment in Health Care Vouchers of \$2,000 which were provided for the elderly every year. He enquired why the Government provided the dental services for the elderly through paying administrative fees to the Community Care Fund, instead of directly providing the dental services for the elderly. He hoped that the Government would study the feasibility on the direct provision of dental care and comprehensive healthcare services for the elderly. In addition, he expressed dissatisfaction at the FHB which did not send representatives to attend the meeting.

33. SM&HO(CL)1 of the DH responded that the DH would relay Members' views on the number of sessions of outpatient dental clinics, comprehensiveness of dental services and amount of Health Care Vouchers for the elderly to the respective service units of the DH.

34. The Chairman hoped that the department concerned would take Members' views into consideration.

VIII Item 7: Green Recycling in Housing Estates

(TWDC Paper No. 7/17-18)

35. The Chairman stated that Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris, submitted the paper. The representatives from the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr CHU Wing-hing, Ken, Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Waste Reduction & Recycling)⁵ (SEPO(WR&R)⁵); and
- (2) Mr CHAN Yu-keung, Alex, Environmental Protection Officer (Waste Reduction & Recycling)¹².

Besides, the written reply of the EPD was tabled at the meeting.

(Note: The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben joined the meeting at 4:00 p.m.)

36. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris introduced the paper.

37. SEPO(WR&R)⁵ of the EPD responded as follows:

- (1) the recycling of waste at source and the downstream of the recycling chain were closely linked and associated with each other. The Government had all along supported the development of the recycling industry. It was mapped out in the Hong Kong Blueprint for Sustainable Use of Resources 2013-2022 that a target was set up to reduce the per capita rate of municipal solid waste disposal by 40% by 2022;
- (2) on the overall operation, the recycling industry mainly collected the recyclables and needed support on all fronts. In this connection, the Government set up the Recycling Fund for application of the recycling industry by allocation of \$1 billion in 2015 so as to subsidise the manpower, equipment or publicity as required for the recycling industry in implementation of projects. Besides, the EPD had given support to the recycling operations, e.g. by setting up the EcoPark in Tuen Mun to provide the long-term land and primary ancillary facilities with affordable rents for the recycling industry, with a view to advocating and encouraging the recycling industry to invest in the advanced technique and value-added production. Currently, 12 sites in the EcoPark were granted to the private recyclers for collection of various types of recyclables;

- (3) on the land support for the recycling industry, the EPD worked in collaboration with the Planning Department (PlanD) and Lands Department to identify the short-term tenancy (STT) sites for the recyclers and a total of 32 STT sites were currently in use by the recyclers;
- (4) the EPD had reserved 16 designated berths at the Public Cargo Working Areas (PCWAs) exclusively for recyclers' bidding and use in order to tie in with the mode of operation of the recyclers in consolidation of waste paper at the PCWAs for export by shipment after collection of waste paper at the upstream;
- (5) the EPD was concerned about the problem of the classified recyclables failing to reach the recyclers as appropriate after the members of the public made every effort for separation and selection of recyclables. The Government proposed that the solid waste charging would be implemented in 2019 the soonest. The EPD also planned to set up the outreach teams to visit various housing estates, industrial and commercial premises to offer direct support for the general public, including the public education on clean recycling and assistance in identifying the recyclers as appropriate to collect the classified recyclables, etc. As the outlets for some recyclables such as plastic were not ensured, the Government would study on the feasibility of including the waste plastic bottles in the producer responsibility scheme; and
- (6) the EPD believed that the relevant measures, upon adoption, were conducive to enhancing the quality of the recyclables and their values would be increased through export or other logistical arrangements, with a view to advocating the development and operation of the recycling industry.

38. Mr TAM Hoi-pong opined that it was doubtful whether the recyclables were recycled at the end of the day. Hence, he hoped that the EPD would enhance the tracking and monitoring work so as to monitor the contractors for the whereabouts of the recyclables after they collected the recyclables. He pointed out that the recyclers had to make classification of the recyclables because mostly the sundries were always mixed with the recyclables in the recycling bins. He thought that it took time to conduct the public education and enquired whether the EPD had requested the recyclers to undergo the process of classification of the recyclables again when contracting out the service. Otherwise, it was very likely that the recyclers would dispose the sundries at the landfills. Given that the recycling value of the plastic bottles was low and the solutions for recycling of plastic bottles were not available under the Recycling Fund, he hoped that the Government would provide subsidies for the recyclers of plastic bottles and address the problem at source. In addition, he thought that it was difficult to find out the sites of recycling bins for glass bottles and thus enquired about the details of the promotion of recycling of glass bottles.

39. Mr CHENG Chit-pun stated that the Government promoted environmental protection actively and many people would take the initiative to classify the waste into different categories. However, there were no recyclers who handled these classified waste. For example, recycling of plastic bottles and glass bottles were not available in many housing estates. Even worse, some members of the public found that the recyclables were disposed at the end of the day. He opined that the Government should address the problem directly by encouraging the local recycling industry and setting up a fund in order to subsidise the recycling work and logistic fees of the recycling of waste at a cost which was lower than the market price. In addition, the Government should consider enhancing the local demand for the recycling products, say, to purchase the paper containing wood-pulp from renewable forests during procurement, in order to power the recycling work. By doing so, the local recycling industry would be promoted on the basis of demand from market.

40. Mr LAM Faat-kang said that the green work of the housing estates in his constituency area was carried out satisfactorily, but there were difficulties in conducting the recycling work. The contractor of the three-coloured recycling bins of the housing estate was pleased to handle the recyclables and the classification of waste at source was properly done by the housing estate. However, there were difficulties in conducting the recycling work for glass bottles. At last, the glass bottle could not be recycled in the housing estate. He opined that the Government should encourage the enterprises to carry out the green work, but the eligibility for application of the funds or loans under the Government policies was currently too rigid. Hence, he suggested that the Government should stipulate the substantive policies targeting at green work, such as provision of rental concession, tax concession and low-interest capital loan, so as to offer a number of incentives for the recycling industry to continue its operation. He stated that the EPD had recently launched an advertisement of promotion of recycling of glass bottles which was fairly attractive, but the EPD did not duly make corresponding arrangements for recycling of glass bottles. As a result, the recycling work for glass bottles was not effective.

41. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis supported the proposal on requesting the Government to set up a fund to subsidise the recycling work for waste at the cost which was lower than the market price. She thought that disposal of recyclables at landfills after the recyclables was collected by the recyclers could be prevented through the proposal. Besides, she hoped that the EPD could formulate measures, including the offer of awards or certificates for the private housing estates, so as to encourage the private housing estates to take part in the green programmes. She also enquired whether the EPD had established a mechanism on registration of recyclers. She noted that the recycling work of some housing estates was handled by the cleansing contractors. However, the concerted efforts of the residents of these housing estates would go down the drain because the cleansing workers would only handle the valuable waste such as waste paper and aluminium cans but the

valueless waste such as plastic bottles would be disposed into the rubbish bins. She was of the view that the EPD could provide guidelines for these housing estates and request the cleansing contractors concerned to pass the recyclables to the recyclers under the EPD and did not make disposal casually.

42. Mr MAN Yu-ming said that the concept of green recycling had been discussed for long and a positive effect was brought to our society. He pointed out that the recycling work would mostly be interrupted due to the improper recycling work in latter stage, even though the recycling and classification were properly done at the initial stage. Therefore, he thought that the Government only took one step at a time and did not take careful consideration of the green recycling work. He added that the EPD was making abortive effort to reserve the berths for the barges of waste paper because there were not many barges for export of waste paper for processing overseas due to the continual price decrease in recycling of waste paper. He opined that the allocation of \$1 billion for setting up the green fund by the Government was a good measure. However, he hoped that the Government would take a careful consideration of the measure on allocation of land for the use of the green industry because the land resources were scarce and valuable. On the other hand, he thought that the Government should enhance the subsidy and management systems for the green industry as well as encouraging and assisting the green industry in the export of recyclables. Furthermore, the Government should strengthen the green education of the public housing estates to raise residents' awareness of environmental protection, so as to facilitate the implementation of the municipal solid waste charging in future.

43. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben stated that the Government had stipulated a subsidy system for waste recycling. The sum of the tendering was \$900,000 a month for the recyclers to carry out the recycling work. He hoped that when making approval for the above tender, the Government would consider whether the recyclers had set up their own factories for recycling work; otherwise, it was likely that the recyclers would make disposal of the recyclables at landfills upon collection. In fact, not many recyclers had set up their own factories for recycling work, but he still hoped that the Government would take this into consideration when selecting the contractors. Besides, he opined that the Recycling Fund should fully subsidise the production chain for recycling so as to ensure the outlets of the recyclables as appropriate. He noted that many recyclers were willing to allocate resources to construct the recycling factories, but the EPD failed to provide assistance for them. Hence, he hoped that the EPD would pay more attention to this.

44. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris said that the factors including the provision of physical locations for operation and applicable subsidies should be taken into consideration when supporting measures were devised for the recycling industry. The most important factors were the market equilibrium and the price of the end products because it was believed that the investors would never be willing to run

business in loss, even though the matching fund was set up for provision of subsidies for the business. He opined that the EPD just sought for a balance by adoption of the current practice but failed to assist the recycling industry in handling the major problem; therefore success was hardly reached. Besides, he pointed out that currently, the problem of re-production at the downstream of the recycling chain should be handled. Although the EPD had mentioned about recycling in its response, this had nothing to do with the said problem. He added that the recycling dilemma would emerge when the price of the products made by recycling materials dropped following the sharp increase of the quantity of recycling materials as time went by. He also thought that the EPD should be accused of its measure of land allotment because the recyclers were allowed to cease construction and hoard the land after they bid it successfully. The land would be changed for property development when it was rezoned after some years. Thus, it was predictably more difficult to achieve the goal of recycling industry under such a measure. Furthermore, he was of the view that even though no subsidy would be offered for the recycling industry, there were still costs in the recycling operations. For example, the costs would be derived from disposal of waste paper at landfills for the EPD and the general public. He reiterated that the non-profit-making organisations and District Councils (DCs) were able to assist in promotion of environmental protection, but the EPD was solely counted on handling the major problem of the recycling industry.

45. SEPO(WR&R)5 of the EPD responded as follows:

- (1) the contractors of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) were responsible for collection of the recyclables from the recycling bins at the roadside of the public areas. The EPD noted that the FEHD had set up a monitoring system for operation of the contractors, including duly handling the recyclable in accordance with the requirements in the tender;
- (2) the Steering Group on the Modification of Recycling and Refuse Collection Facilities in Public Places led by the Secretary for the Environment would consider a trial run on the provision of mixed bins replacing the recycling bins for collection of recyclables at public places and further classification would be done after the recyclables were delivered to the collection points;
- (3) the EPD would gradually enforce the subsidiary legislation in 2017-18 for implementation of the producer responsibility scheme on the glass beverage containers. The Government would grant contracts to engage contractors to collect and process the glass beverage containers, in order to solve the problem of recycling of glass beverage containers;
- (4) the EPD would study the feasibility of implementation of the producer responsibility scheme for plastic bottles, with an aim to promulgate the commitment of the shared costs for handling the products among the producers, importers and product users and provide the ancillary facilities for solving the problem of recycling of plastic bottles;

- (5) the Government had stipulated the green procurement policy and encouraged the departments to make green procurement according to the the green procurement list of products and services, which covered 150 types of products and services, when procurement of products and services was required. In 2016, various government departments had procured a total of 12 million litres of B5 diesel which was 5% biodiesel blended with 95% EURO V diesel for the use of various types of government vessels, machinery and vehicles;
- (6) the Government, the Secretariat of the Recycling Fund and the Advisory Committee on Recycling Fund had noted the difficulties encountered by the recycling industry in application of the Recycling Fund. Hence, the facilitating measures, such as provision of matching fund to subsidise the recyclers in purchase of equipment or device, were launched in early January 2017 to bring convenience to the recyclers in application of the Recycling Fund for enhancing the efficiency of operation;
- (7) the EPD would grant the certificates of appreciation to the housing estates which achieved outstanding results under the Programme on Source Separation of Waste every year; and
- (8) following the implementation of solid waste charging in 2019 by the EPD, the cleansing contractors were required to deliver the recyclables to the recyclers; otherwise fees would be charged from the cleansing contractors for the disposal of recyclables as refuse. The EPD hoped that the recyclables collected through the joint efforts of the general public would duly be delivered to the recyclers.

46. The Chairman thanked the representatives from the EPD for attending the meeting and requested the EPD to take Members' views into consideration.

IX Item 8: Request to Follow Up on the Problem of Reception of Digital Television Broadcasting in Ma Wan

(TWDC Paper No. 8/17-18)

47. The Chairman stated that Mr CHAN Sung-ip submitted the paper. The representatives from the Office of the Communications Authority (OFCA) responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr LEUNG Wing-kee, Senior Telecommunications Engineer (Broadcasting Support) (STE(BS)); and
- (2) Mr LEE Shun, Wilson, Telecommunications Engineer (Broadcasting Support)³.

48. Mr CHAN Sung-ip introduced the paper.

49. STE(BS) of the OFCA responded as follows:
- (1) due to the low terrain of Ma Wan which was shadowed by tall buildings in its vicinity, there was a problem of reception of digital terrestrial television (DTT) in Ma Wan. In 2013, the OFCA and television stations had conducted a number of on-site tests in Ma Wan. The results of tests showed that as the location of Solar Tower facilitated the reception of DTT signals more effectively, it was suitable for construction of a television (TV) signal small transposer. Hence, the OFCA granted a licence to Ma Wan Rural Committee (MWRC) in April 2014 for construction of a TV signal small transposer. At present, the problem of reception of DTT had been solved; and
 - (2) technically, the construction of a TV signal small transposer in Ma Wan was a better solution.

50. Mr CHAN Sung-ip enquired whether the OFCA had discussed with the TV stations on construction of a new TV signal small transposer in Ma Wan. He said that MWRC had to pay the repair and maintenance fees of over \$2,000 for the TV signal small transposer each month. Also, MWRC had to pay the fees for extra repair of parts for the TV signal small transposer by self-funding. He added that the OFCA committed to ensuring the reception of digital TV broadcasting for 99% of the places in Hong Kong. However, many villages were still troubled by the problem of reception of TV at present. So, he hoped that the OFCA would provide solutions for the problem.

51. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben stated that every citizen had the right of watching TV programmes and MWRC assisted in addressing the problem of reception of TV by collecting funds for payment of relevant fees. However, he thought that the relevant expenditures should not be undertaken by MWRC as a long-term commitment. Instead, the Government should provide assistance for this. He added that the Communications Authority (CA) was held responsible for seeking assistance from the TV stations for installation of the transposer. In fact, the Government had provided assistance to solve the problem of reception of TV in the past. For example, the CA had previously assisted in the construction of a transposer at Block 2 of Waterside Plaza because Tsuen Wan town centre was no longer covered by the Golden Hill DTT station due to the construction of Panda Hotel and New Haven. Nowadays, the same problem emerged in Ma Wan but the construction and relevant expenditures of a self-funded TV signal small transposer were undertaken by the residents in Ma Wan. It was really unfair. Hence, he hoped that the Government would provide assistance for bearing the relevant fees or seeking assistance from TV stations for the maintenance of the TV signal small transposer in Ma Wan.

52. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that the CA should bear the main responsibility for the problem concerned. He also enquired whether it was stipulated that Ma Wan and rural areas should be able to receive the signal of digital TV broadcasting when the OFCA granted licence for the new TV stations. He pointed out that the OFCA should be solely held responsible for the failure of reception of signal of digital TV by the residents of Ma Wan, even though there was a relatively small population in Ma Wan in early years, after the commitment of coverage rate of digital TV had reached 99% of the population was made. He noted that the Government would not make payment to MWRC for the repair and maintenance fee of \$2,000 each month, so he hoped that the OFCA would construct a station which covered all areas in Ma Wan and bore all repair and maintenance fees.

53. Mr TAM Hoi-pong enquired whether the Government was responsible for provision of digital TV service. If the Government was responsible for provision of digital TV service, he further enquired why MWRC had to bear the repair and maintenance fees for the TV signal small transposer in Ma Wan. He was of the view that the Government should bear the repair and maintenance fees concerned.

54. Mr LAM Faat-kang opined that the government departments should be held responsible for monitoring the contractors and that the organisations which were granted the licences from the OFCA should comply with the requirements of the licences. He pointed out that it was unfair to the residents of Ma Wan who formed the 1% of the population of failure to receive the signal of digital TV broadcasting after being ruled out from the coverage rate of 99% of the population of the DTT service. He further pointed out that the OFCA should fulfil its obligation of requesting the organisations which were granted the licences by the OFCA to reach the relevant standards and that MWRC should not construct a self-funded transposer. He was of the view that the Government should be responsible for the follow-ups on this matter.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael joined the meeting at 4:50 p.m.)

55. STE(BS) of the OFCA responded as follows:

- (1) at present, there were 29 DTT stations after DTT was officially launched in 2007;
- (2) currently, DTT signals were transmitted through radio waves, which was affected by the terrain and other obstacles. As Hong Kong had a hilly terrain, it was practicably infeasible to reach a coverage rate of 100% by any broadcasting network. In fact, the number of residents in remote areas was very small, so the Government stipulated that the coverage rate of the TV broadcasting reached 99% of the population;
- (3) the reception of DTT signals were weakened due to the obstacles in some areas. The technically feasible methods included the installation

of TV booster, adoption of TV reception cables of better receiving features and adjustment of reception cable to a suitable direction/location. Besides, the residents could consider the construction of self-funded TV signal small transposer in order to improve the overall reception of the DTT in those areas; and

- (4) according to the OFCA's record, besides Ma Wan, the self-funded TV signal small transposers for better reception of DTT were also found in some other areas in Hong Kong.

56. The Vice Chairman pointed out that according to the Government, 99% of the population over the territory could receive digital TV broadcasting after the digital broadcasting was officially launched. However, regrettably, many rural areas still failed to receive the digital TV broadcasting nowadays. Thus, he enquired whether the coverage rate really reached 99% of the population. The CA could intervene with the construction of primary facilities in order to improve the poor reception of TV signals. He enquired why the CA did not consider actively intervening with the construction of primary facilities in Ma Wan and under what conditions the CA would actively intervene with the construction of primary facilities for reception of TV signals in Ma Wan.

(Note: Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones joined the meeting at 4:55 p.m.)

57. STE(BS) of the OFCA responded as follows:

- (1) DTT signals were transmitted through radio waves. At present, there were a total of 29 DTT stations. As the factor of co-channel interference should be taken into consideration when design was carried out for each station, it was considerably difficult to extend the scope of coverage of the station;
- (2) the OFCA was well aware that members of the public had the need and the right of watching TV programmes. However, a significant consideration of engineering should be taken for the construction of a new station. The OFCA would discuss with the TV stations and consider the engineering feasibility on various fronts as far as possible;
- (3) the OFCA believed that it was understood that the repair and maintenance fees of the TV signal small transposer which was constructed through self-funding should be borne by the owner of the TV signal small transposer; and
- (4) the TV signal small transposer which was constructed through self-funding was a better solution to the problem of reception of TV signals in Ma Wan. The OFCA and TV stations could conduct the on-site tests in Ma Wan in order to explore other feasible ways for improving the reception of TV signals.

(Note: Mr LI Hung-por joined the meeting at 4:56 p.m.)

58. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis said it was stipulated in the contract between the OFCA and TV stations that the coverage rate of the digital TV service should reach 99%. Hence, it was still reasonable if the villages and squatter houses in remote areas were not covered by digital TV broadcasting. However, it was unreasonable if the villages built many years ago or densely populated were not covered by digital TV broadcasting. She opined that the Government should target at the reception of TV for 100%, instead of 99%, of the citizens, even though it was stipulated in the contract that the coverage rate should reach 99%. She hoped that the OFCA would solve the problem of reception of TV for the residents who failed to receive digital TV signals.

59. Mr KOO Yeung-pong said that the technical problem had already been solved and the only problem pending for solution was whom should be responsible for the repair and maintenance of the TV signal small transposer in Ma Wan. Currently, MWRC was responsible for the TV signal small transposer. In other words, the residents of Ma Wan were deprived of watching free TV programmes. He added that the premises in other areas affected by the same problem of reception of digital TV broadcasting signals were not required to pay the fees, alike that mentioned by a Member who indicated that the OFCA had constructed a transposer in Tsuen Wan town centre to solve the problem of failure to receive digital TV broadcasting signals in Tsuen Wan town centre. Hence, he hoped that the OFCA would adopt the same option to solve the problem of Ma Wan. He was of the view that it was improper for MWRC to bear the repair and maintenance fees for the TV signal small transposer as a long-term commitment. The construction of another TV signal small transposer by OFCA or TV stations was certainly justifiable.

60. Mr LO Siu-kit expressed his dissatisfaction at the OFCA. He pointed out that Ma Wan was a convenient place which was different from other islands. Over the years, MWRC took up the repair and maintenance for the TV signal small transposer through self-funding, but the OFCA had never provided any practical solutions. He said that when there was the problem of poor reception of digital TV broadcasting signals in his constituency area, the OFCA had assisted in conducting tests. He understood that it was unlikely that the Government would take over the management of the existing TV signal small transposer in Ma Wan. But he hoped that the OFCA would provide Members with the timetable for solving the problem concerned, so that Members could explain to the villagers and MWRC.

61. Mr MAN Yu-ming said that Ma Wan was not covered, although the coverage rate of digital TV reached 99%. He added that TV stations could earn from advertisements when broadcasting the free TV programmes, so the government departments should exercise regulatory control over the TV stations by requesting the

TV stations to strengthen the service for Ma Wan. This was also an opportunity for the TV station to promote its business. He thought that the Government should abandon the old rules and adopt a forward-looking strategy in discussion with the broadcasting authorities in order to solve the problem concerned.

62. Mr CHAN Sung-ip enquired whether the OFCA would construct a new TV signal small transposer in Ma Wan. Besides Ma Wan, Sham Tseng and Ting Kau were also troubled by the problem of reception of digital TV broadcasting signals.

63. STE(BS) of the OFCA responded as follows:

- (1) the OFCA reiterated that the coverage rate of digital TV service had reached 99% of the Hong Kong population;
- (2) as time went by and following the completion of new premises, the status of coverage of digital TV was ever changing. The OFCA would conduct the surveys and tests on the reception of digital TV from time to time; and
- (3) technically, the OFCA would conduct the on-site tests in Ma Wan with TV stations to study the practicable methods to elevate the effectiveness of the reception of DTT in the affected areas on one hand, and liaise with the Members, TV stations, residents and developer of Ma Wan to learn more about the problem of the TV signal small transposer in Ma Wan and the practicable solutions on the other.

64. Mr WONG Ka-wa proposed that Members should submit paper to request the TWDC to construct a transposer in Ma Wan for the full coverage in Ma Wan.

65. The Chairman stated that nowadays, the number of tall buildings was increasing. Only the OFCA had the power to discuss with the TV stations and the OFCA was held responsible for seeking solutions. Hence, he requested the OFCA to discuss with the Members after the meeting.

X Item 9: Request the Government to be Concerned about the Problem arising from the Use of Drones

(TWDC Paper No. 9/17-18)

66. The Chairman stated that Mr MAN Yu-ming and Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones, submitted the paper. The representatives from the Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data (PCPD) responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr Daniel LEUNG, Chief Personal Data Officer (CPDO); and
- (2) Mr Anthony CHAN, Senior Personal Data Officer.

Besides, the written replies of the Housing Department (HD), Civil Aviation Department (CAD) and PCPD were tabled at the meeting.

67. Mr MAN Yu-ming introduced the paper.

68. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones said that many residents were concerned about the problem of drones. He opined that the emergence and use of drones were capable of proof for the advancement of technology. Hence, he supported the use and limited control of drones; otherwise, the development of technology would be hindered. He wished to know whether currently there was a safety guideline and control of drones in place. Members of the public worried very much about the issue of personal privacy. He pointed out that the geographical environment of Hong Kong was relatively special. The buildings were closely aligned to each other and many public housing estates were right next to the parks and other public places. He commended the HD for the practice of forbiddance of the use of drones within the area of the public housing estates. However, it was found that at present, the drones, which were controlled by someone else outside the area of the public housing estates managed by the HD, flew near to the public housing estates. As there was no proper channel for residents to make complaints, they could only resort to making reports to the Police. Yet, when the police officers arrived at the scene, the drones under complaint were out of sight and it was difficult to exercise control over them. He worried that adverse impact would be brought to the personal privacy of residents due to the problem of drones. He enquired the Government whether there were any measures for taking prosecution against the users of drones or appealing the users of drones to pay attention to the personal privacy of the general public. He understood that the use of drones deemed necessary when the application of engineering was required, in order to film the water seepage or other problematic facilities on rooftops of buildings. However, the status of privacy of the residents in the flats of the buildings was also captured when the drones filmed in the air. He worried about it and suggested that the PCPD should issue a guideline or request the purchasers of the drones to sign a charter to declare that they would respect the personal privacy of others and would not film the status of personal privacy of others in the drone-shot videos causally.

69. CPDO of the PCPD responded as follows:

- (1) the PCPD attached great importance to the issue of invasion of privacy by drones;
- (2) the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance (Chapter 486) (the Ordinance) was technology-neutral. The PCPD was aware that technology developed rapidly nowadays; however, the use of technology should be in compliance with the requirements of the Ordinance and relevant data protection principles;
- (3) in the past three years, the PCPD had only received two complaints about drones. Although there were not many complaints, the PCPD, as a statutory organisation for the enforcement of the Ordinance, was aware of its own responsibility of making public announcement on the issue of privacy due to drones and raising public awareness of the importance of protection of and respect for personal data and privacy;

- (4) in March 2017, the PCPD updated the Guidance on CCTV Surveillance and Use of Drones (the Guidance) which aimed to bring the general public's attention to the rules on drones in use, including careful planning for the flight path and keeping the drones away from residence when in use. Also, suggestions on the use of filming functions of the drones and storage of images captured by drones were provided and points to note for security and post of notices for the images were given in the Guidance. The Guidance could be downloaded from the PCPD's webpage or obtained from the offices of the PCPD. The PCPD would distribute the Guidance to members of the public at the locations as appropriate on a regular basis; and
- (5) according to the interpretation of the Ordinance, "personal data" referred to the information relating to a living person, which was kept in record for access to or processing, could be used to directly or indirectly identify that person. Thus, the images filmed by drones without recording were not the "personal data" under the Ordinance. In addition, according to the court's previous guidelines, the collection of personal data did not include the filming of a person for the purpose for which that person could not be identified. To the contrary, the filming of a person for the purpose for which that person could be identified should be in compliance with the requirements of the Ordinance and data protection principles.

70. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben stated that drones were becoming more popular and the retail price was low, but members of the public were generally unaware of the restriction of the locations in use of drones. He thought that currently, there was no clear guideline or legislation for this and enquired whether the CAD would stipulate a clear guideline and enact legislation for drones; otherwise, invasion of privacy would be common. He learnt that drones were used for attacks and surveillance in the foreign countries, so he hoped that the PCPD would give suggestions to the CAD for enacting legislation and exercise regulatory control as appropriate, with a view to facilitating the continued development of the new technology and its use by the general public.

71. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly said he was concerned about the possibility of filming of households by the drones flying over the densely populated public or private housing estates. Besides, he enquired whether privacy was invaded if the collection of data was initially purposeless but the data was eventually used or disclosed.

72. Mr MAN Yu-ming said he was not only worried about the invasion of privacy due to the use of drones, but also worried about the dangers that would be caused by the drones flying over the densely-populated areas because there was no

clear legislation for forbiddance or control of drones flying in those areas. He noted that the HD would give advice to and stop the people who used drones within the area of the public housing estates, if any. However, it would be difficult to stop them if they used the drones in the midnight and actually, there was no law and regulation for enforcement by the staff of the HD. Hence, he was of the view that there was a need to enact legislation for drones. Besides, he thought that the Government should carry out the publicity on the safe and legal use of drones for the general public. Furthermore, the Government should definitely enact legislation for regulatory control of drones to ensure the residents' safety, especially when the public safety and property safety were threatened. He pointed out that the said problems arising from the use of drones were not only encountered by the public housing estates, but also encountered by the private buildings near the rural areas. He requested the departments concerned to pay more attention to this.

73. Mr WONG Ka-wa thanked the PCPD for sending representatives to attend the meeting out of respect for the DC. He thought that other departments did not respect the DC, so they did not send representatives to attend the meeting. He pointed out that the drones developed rapidly and certain types of drones were used for courier service in foreign countries. He opined that the Government and the departments concerned should enact legislation for the use of drones by drawing reference from other countries or establish a mechanism of registration of the use of drones in order to strike a balance among various parties. Moreover, the personal privacy in the venues of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) could also be safeguarded by enacting legislation. The drones would be forbidden to enter the LCSD's venues.

74. Mr KOO Yeung-pong enquired whether the PCPD had received any complaints about violation of the Ordinance by drones; and whether the complaints were handled according to the existing legislation. He was of the view that the residents would stop worrying too much if the use of drones was covered under the existing legislation.

75. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones stated that besides the issue of privacy, the departments concerned should also review the existing legislation of drones. He learnt that the CAD had drawn up a detailed guideline on the use of drones but it deserved further discussion as to whether the guideline could be enforced practicably. The regulatory control of the drones was in doubt when the drones were not allowed to stay in the air within 50 metres away from the buildings, any persons, vehicles and vessels. He had received a complaint. The complainant pointed out that a drone flew outside his residence and the complainant knew where the operator of the drone was, i.e. the drone in use and the operator of the drone were in different places. It was difficult to carry out the law enforcement work under the existing legislation. Thus, he opined that the departments concerned should consider the stipulation of the

provisions of legislation in more details, so that the use of drones was under certain degree of regulatory control, without hindering the development of the drones. In addition, he wished to know if successful prosecution had been made against the invasion of privacy due to the use of drones; if no, the existing legislation was ineffective in achieving deterrent effect and the message of protection of personal privacy when the drones were in use could not be disseminated to the users of drones, making members of the public feel worried.

76. Mr CHOW Ping-tim enquired the HKPF whether shooting at drones by air guns was illegal.

77. CPDO of the PCPD responded as follows:

- (1) data users were regulated by the Ordinance for collection of personal data when they collected and used the personal data through filming the images of individuals for personal identification subsequently, even though the collection of data was initially purposeless;
- (2) in the past three years, the PCPD only received two complaint cases about the drones and no prosecution was instituted;
- (3) the PCPD would communicate with other government departments from time to time in order to carry out the work for stipulation of protection of privacy; and
- (4) the PCPD, which was a statutory organisation for enforcement of the Ordinance, would certainly handle any offences against the Ordinance in a serious manner.

78. The Chairman thanked the representatives from the PCPD for attending the meeting and hoped that the departments concerned would take Members' views into consideration. Besides, he said some law enforcement departments wished that the law enforcement work could be carried out with the aid of video camera systems, but this might be in breach of the Ordinance. Therefore, he hoped that the PCPD would send representatives to attend the DC's meetings again in future to explain the details to the Members.

79. As the Chairman was required to take up other urgent matters, the meeting would be temporarily chaired by the Vice Chairman.

XI Item 10: Concern about the Situations of the Rear Lanes in Tsuen Wan District

(TWDC Paper No. 10/17-18)

80. The Acting Chairman stated that Mr KOO Yeung-pong, the Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben and Mr LO Siu-kit submitted the paper. The representatives from departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr Kane TSE Man-hong, Engineer/Tsuen Kwai 1 (E/TK1), Drainage Services Department (DSD);

- (2) Mr CHOY Lap-shing, Eddie, Senior Building Surveyor/D5 (SBS/D5), Buildings Department (BD);
- (3) Mr LEUNG Hin-tat, Norman, Senior Maintenance Engineer/South West (SME/SW), Highways Department (HyD);
- (4) Ms NG Wai-ki, Maintenance Engineer/Tsuen Wan (ME/TW), HyD;
- (5) Mr LAM Heung-kan, District Engineer/New Territories West (Islands, Tsuen Wan, Kwai Tsing) (DE/NTW(I,TW,KwT)), Lighting Division, HyD; and
- (6) Ms KHATTAK Nasreen, District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan) (DEHS/TW), FEHD.

81. Mr KOO Yeung-pong introduced the paper.

82. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben said that the problem of stagnant water in rear lanes in Tsuen Wan district was not addressed. In the past, the HyD would assist in making improvement for the ground surface of the rear lanes. In recent years, however, it was found that the HyD did not carry out the said improvement work. As a result, the hygienic condition of the rear lanes became very poor because the pipelines of the rear lanes were covered with oil and sewage. Hence, he hoped that the HyD would assist in making improvement for the ground surface of the rear lanes and that the BD would follow up the problem of seepage of sewage from the overflowing sewage pipes. Besides, he found that some trees grew on the external wall of the rear lanes and the passers-by of the rear lanes would probably be hit by the trees. He opined that the management of the rear lanes was very important and hoped that various departments would duly handle the work under their purview.

83. Mr LO Siu-kit stated that there were many rear lanes in his constituency area. He thought that the government departments should undertake the maintenance work for the rear lanes in a more proactive manner. He pointed out that the Monitoring Group on Public Health and Food Safety under the Environmental and Health Affairs Committee found that the ground surface of rear lanes caved in and the drainage channels broke and burst during the inspections of rear lanes. As a result, the rodent infestation and pest problem came up. He added that as a murder happened in a rear lane in early years, he was also concerned about the problem of light beams in rear lanes. The department concerned finally arranged for installation of a lighting system at the rear lane where the murder happened after he had struck for it year after year. However, the lighting system could not be successfully installed due to the technical problem. Moreover, he noted that the rear lanes became wet and damp due to the lack of pipe outlets after the sewage from broken rainwater pipes drained onto the ground surface of the rear lanes. Thus, he enquired whether the departments concerned had drawn up the timetable for the joint actions for review of rear lanes and how the departments accorded priorities to the repair and maintenance work for the rear lanes.

84. SME/SW of the HyD responded as follows:
- (1) in general, the HyD conducted inspection for pedestrian roads once every three months and conducted inspection for rear lanes in Tsuen Wan district on a weekly to monthly basis;
 - (2) the HyD would arrange its staff to clear the pipelines at the rear lanes, repair the damaged pedestrian roads and handle the construction waste disposed at the rear lanes. The HyD handled about eight to ten cases each month; and
 - (3) the HyD would maintain communications with Members to learn more about the rear lanes in poor condition in order to enhance the repair and examination for the ground surface of rear lanes.
85. DE/NTW(I, TW, KwT), Light Division of the HyD responded as follows:
- (1) the Lighting Division of the HyD would provide lightings for the rear lanes under the management of the HyD. As for the rear lanes which were not under the management of the HyD or other units in provision of lightings, the Lighting Division of the HyD would study on the provision of lighting systems on a need basis individually at the request of the localities; and
 - (2) the Lighting Division of the HyD would provide lightings for the rear lanes subject to the practical circumstances individually and feasibility of installation of street lamps at the locations concerned.
86. E/TK1 of the DSD responded as follows:
- (1) every year, the DSD would draw up a preventive repair plan for the following year according to the experiences and information gained from the drainage work in respective districts. The sewage pipes at most of the locations as mentioned in the paper were included in the said yearly repair plan of the DSD. Also, the DSD would carry out the clearance work for these sewage pipes for three to five times every year;
 - (2) the DSD received reports of drainage blockage occasionally and would arrange for urgent repair and clearance work after the receipt of the reports; and
 - (3) the DSD would continue to stay alert to and deal with the drainage problems for the rear lanes.
87. SBS/D5 of the BD responded as follows:
- (1) the BD was committed to carrying out the repair and maintenance work for the systems and pipelines which caused blockage to water drainage and taking law enforcement actions as well as timely issuing the demolition orders for various types of unauthorised building works which caused serious flooding and environmental hygienic problems, including the unauthorised building works on the ground surface;

- (2) the BD would carry out the law enforcement actions for the unauthorised building works on the ground surface during the large-scale operations; and
- (3) the unauthorised building works were not necessarily situated on the rear lanes of the private land. They might be situated on the government land. According to the Buildings Ordinance, the BD could only issue the demolition order for the unauthorised building works on the private land.

(Note: Mr KOO Yeung-pong left the meeting at 5:47 p.m.)

88. DEHS(TW) of the FEHD responded as follows:

- (1) as there were some relatively old premises in Tsuen Wan town centre, the FEHD had all along been concerning about the environmental hygiene in Tsuen Wan district and would enhance the cleansing and clean-up service for the rear lanes; and
- (2) the FEHD would arrange the on-site inspections of the rear lanes with Members from time to time. The FEHD would inform the relevant government departments to follow up the problems other than those of environmental hygiene as soon as possible, if any of them was spotted during the said on-site inspections.

89. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben said as the water pipes was worn and torn in old areas and many people lived in one “subdivided flat”, the sewage problem became very serious and drainage blockage was caused. The DSD was thus required to carry out the clearance work for the pipes in a number of times each month. As the captioned problem involved the environmental hygiene, he hoped that the DSD, BD, HyD and FEHD would arrange for on-site inspections with Members in order to make improvement for the environment of the rear lanes.

90. Mr LAM Faat-kang stated that the problem of the rear lanes in Tsuen Wan district was significantly improved after the “SARS” epidemic. However, the FEHD was solely held accountable for all the responsibilities for the problem of rear lanes after many years. In fact, the problems from building structures, pipelines and lightings should be followed up and handled by other departments. He suggested that the district councillors of the constituencies concerned should communicate with the government departments concerned more frequently in order to make improvement for the problem of rear lanes, so that the environment of the old areas in Tsuen Wan would be improved.

91. Mr MAN Yu-ming said despite the fact that Tsuen Wan district underwent a steady and rapid development, there were different kinds of problems in the rear lanes of Tsuen Wan district, including law and order, hygiene and building structures, etc.

He noted that the departments headed by the FEHD had taken an active approach in handling the problems of the rear lanes, but problems such as rodent infestation and sewage frequently occurred because the properties were aging and there was no carefully-designed repair plans for the district. He agreed that the departments lacked initiative, as indicated by a Member, because most of the operations were jointly initiated by the district councillors of the constituency areas or adjacent areas or not until public concern was aroused did the departments handle the problems hastily before the problems were gradually kept low profile. Hence, he was of the view that the departments should solve the problems at source relentlessly and actively under planning. Also, the drainage and land administration problems should be eradicated, so that they would not emerge time and again.

92. The Acting Chairman enquired whether various departments would consider conducting the inter-departmental joint on-site inspections.

93. SME/SW of the HyD responded that the HyD would actively participate in the joint on-site inspections.

94. SBS/D5 of the BD responded as follows:

- (1) the BD welcomed the conduct of joint on-site inspections; and
- (2) there were ten rear lanes as mentioned by Members which involved many locations in the district. Thus, the BD would be able to focus on taking actions to combat the problem of unauthorised building works and issue the order for follow-ups through the arrangement of joint on-site inspections.

95. E/TK1 of the DSD responded that the DSD was pleased to participate in the joint on-site inspections.

96. DEHS(TW) of the FEHD responded that the conduct of joint on-site inspections was a good suggestion.

97. The Acting Chairman stated that the joint on-site inspections would be a long-term task. He suggested that the joint on-site inspections of the rear lanes concerned would be conducted during the peak time of rodent infestation and pests problem in summer. He also sincerely invited the Members concerned and government representatives to participate in the joint on-site inspections. Members agreed the said arrangements.

(Note: Mr LI Hung-por and the Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben left the meeting at 5:55 p.m.)

98. The Chairman resumed the chair.

(Note: Mr CHOW Ping-tim left the meeting at 5:56 p.m.)

99. The Chairman thanked the representatives from the departments for attending the meeting. He hoped that Members and departments would step up the joint effort to beautify the rear lanes of Tsuen Wan district in order to create a better cityscape for the general public in the district.

XII Item 11: Request to Expedite the Replacement of All Slip-resistant Tiles for Pedestrian Roads in Tsuen Wan District and Concern about the Repair and Maintenance of the Tiles of Pedestrian Roads

(TWDC Paper No. 11/17-18)

100. The Chairman stated that the Vice Chairman and Ms LAM, Lam Nixie submitted the paper. The representatives from the HyD responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr LEUNG Hin-tat, Norman, SME/SW; and
- (2) Ms NG Wai-ki, ME/TW.

101. The Vice Chairman introduced the paper.

102. SME/SW of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) usually, the tiles in question would be fully replaced during the repair of tiles carried out by the HyD. Rarely did the HyD make replacement of only one or two pieces of tiles;
- (2) in the past three years, the HyD had made replacement of tiles for Tsuen Wan town centre for a number of times. For example, the tile replacement works were carried out for Hau Tei Square and Sha Tsui Road two years ago;
- (3) the HyD did not draw up any directions or plans for replacement of the old-style tiles across the territory including Tsuen Wan district because the tiles of some steep roads were still in good condition, although the old-style tiles were not applicable for steep roads under certain circumstances;
- (4) among all the complaints received by the New Territories Regional Office of the HyD, around 30% was forwarded via the mobile phone apps of the Government hotline 1823. Members of the public could report to the HyD through other various channels and Members could contact the HyD directly; and
- (5) as regards the replacement of tiles in a large scale, the HyD not only took the manpower and resources into consideration, but also the nuisances brought by the replacement works to the affected shop owners. Besides, the HyD needed to communicate with the affected shop owners for many times in order to ensure the smooth implementation of the replacement works.

103. Mr WONG Ka-wa said the HyD had undertaken earlier that the glue would no longer be applied for the tiles of pedestrian roads. However, the glue was still subsequently applied for the tiles of the pedestrian roads in Lei Muk Shue Estate near Wo Yi Hop Road. Members of the public tripped over the pedestrian road because the road surface thus became slippery. He hoped that the HyD would arrange its staff to conduct an on-site inspection.

104. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones stated that Tsuen Wan district had all along been troubling by the problem of tiles of pedestrian roads. He added that the road surface would become uneven soon after it was paved with concrete while the ground surface would look good and smooth after it was paved with tiles. As the HyD was required to carry out the slab resurfacing works regularly, he thus enquired whether the HyD would change to resurface the concrete ground with slabs. In addition, he had received complaints about uneven road surface from residents. However, due to the miscommunications, the HyD only carried out the replacement works for the tiles of a small section of a pedestrian road in relation to the complaint and the road surface pending for replacement of tiles remained uneven. As a result, not until the residents lodged complaints again through phone calls did the HyD carry out the replacement works for tiles. Hence, he hoped that the HyD would arrange the repair technicians to refurbish the uneven road surface at one go when they carried out the repair works at the scene.

105. Mr MAN Yu-ming said that the steep road in the vicinity of Shek Wai Kok was refurbished with slip-resistant tiles. He hoped that the HyD would arrange its staff to conduct an on-site inspection to see if the remaining old tiles could be replaced by the slip-resistant tiles for the said location. He added that the HyD would arrange its staff to carry out the repair works soon after receiving complaints; however, the problem remained unresolved because the road surface became uneven again shortly after the repair works. Thus, he enquired whether this was due to the default of engineering techniques or the terrain of the locations concerned as no improvement was made for the uneven road surface although the HyD had conducted the on-site inspection and changed the ways of implementation of repair works earlier. He hoped that the HyD would review this problem and enhance the technical skills for the repair works besides paying more attention to the tiles of Shek Wai Kok Estate. Otherwise, the residents could not be soothed, followed by production of waste and safety problem.

106. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael stated that the uneven road surface was commonly seen at the two sides of carriageways and he had already received three cases merely last month. He enquired whether the road unevenness emerged during the replacement works or due to the frequent use after the replacement works; and how the HyD maintained the quality of the road surface. He also wished to know

whether the tiles were recently replaced; and whether the unevenness of the tiles was actually caused by the damages due to the use after the replacement works.

107. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis noted that the HyD would pave the steep roads with slip-resistant tiles. Thus, she enquired the HyD whether all the steep roads in Tsuen Wan were paved with slip-resistant tiles and hoped that the HyD would provide the relevant records. She hoped that the HyD would carry out the works for the steep roads which were not paved with slip-resistant tiles, if any. Also, she hoped that the HyD would adopt the slip-resistant tiles gradually when carrying out the refurbishment works for level roads so as to ensure the safety of the general public and prevent slips.

108. Mr LO Siu-kit pointed out that there were some difficulties in carrying out the road refurbishment works. He noted that the HyD had time and again coordinated with the shop owners for the large-scale tile-paving works for Sha Tsui Road and Hau Tei Square. He opined that the HyD should revise the design for Yeung Uk Road Market because the road surface of the entrance of the market was very slippery. The HyD should study the adoption of different materials or slabs for paving the road surface of the entrance of the market. He added that the HyD was very effective in replacing the tiles for the areas under its management, but the repair works for the gratings of the telecommunications service providers was held up and the tiles around the gratings were affected. Hence, he hoped that the HyD would study how to punish the telecommunication service providers for the delay of repairs of the gratings; and enclose the gratings so that the tiles around them would not be affected. Moreover, he noted that the HyD continued to improve the repair technique, but it was not effective in the application of glue for the tiles of the pedestrian roads due to the terrain of Tsuen Wan. Hence, he hoped that the HyD would study the better options to handle the problem concerned.

109. The Vice Chairman said the road surface unevenness was a daily problem for all and there were always special reasons for frequent repair works for the road surface, including the damages to the road surface due to a large number of passers-by or run-over by vehicles. Besides, he noted that the hard layer was adopted by the HyD to pave the road surface in some places. Compared to the sandy layer for paving the road surface, the hard layer was more durable in use. Hence, he suggested that after collecting the views from localities and making assessments as appropriate, the HyD should adopt the hard layer to pave the road surfaces which were always under complaints or repairs currently, so as to reduce the frequency of repairs in future.

110. SME/SW of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) currently, the HyD used the slip-resistant tiles for tile replacement works and the old-style tiles were no longer used for the works;

- (2) the HyD had all along been improving the method of paving the tiles for pedestrian roads. In the past, the HyD only used sand to pave the pedestrian roads. But now, the HyD used sand and cement to pave the pedestrian roads, so that the bottom layer of the road surface was harder and more durable;
- (3) a number of projects were conducted by the organisations on the carriageways, but sometimes the road surface refurbishment works was not carried out effectively after the projects completed. Besides, soil erosion of the roads nearby was likely to emerge due to the seepage of aged underground water pipes. The HyD would try the best to carry out the repair works; and
- (4) the HyD would invite the complainants or Members to re-examine the sites in question after carrying out the repair works, with a view to achieving satisfactory results in the repair works carried out by the HyD for the complainants and slimming the chances of triggering problems at the road surface near the sites for repair works.

111. The Chairman summarised that there were various reasons for road surface unevenness. Members also understood that the HyD had been making progress in its repair techniques. It was hoped that the repair technique would reach the best level. He was of the view that the HyD was dedicated to its work and undertook to carry out the repair works and follow-ups according to the views of complainants for provision of the optimal service. Hence, he hoped that the HyD would work closely with the district councillors of the constituencies concerned to handle the road surface problem in Tsuen Wan district.

XIII Item 12: Request the Government to Expediently Study the Feasibility on Construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway and Setting up of an Intermediate Station in Tsuen Wan West
(TWDC Paper No. 12/17-18)

112. The Chairman stated that the Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael and Mr CHENG Chit-pun submitted the paper. Besides, the written replies of the Transport and Housing Bureau (THB) and Mass Transit Railway Corporation Limited (MTRCL) were tabled at the meeting.

113. Mr CHENG Chit-pun introduced the paper.

114. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael said it was believed that the proposal under this agenda item came up very well ahead of the time, so that the THB and MTRCL were unable to send their representatives to attend this meeting. He added that the Government of the current term would explain the railway proposals after 2030 at the meeting of the Panel on Transport of the LegCo in June. He would request for initiating the study of construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway under “Hong

Kong 2030+” at the said meeting. In order to solve the problem of over-crowdedness of the train compartments of the West Rail, he opined that it was necessary to strike for the construction of the fifth cross-harbour railway to link up Tuen Mun and Tung Chung, through Kau Yi Chau to Hong Kong Island West. According to the Government, the pre-condition for construction of this railway was to complete the works for Kau Yi Chau, so there was much resistance to this proposal. He pointed out that the West Rail would be under a big crisis after the development of Yuen Long South, Kam Tin South and Hung Shui Kiu in future. The difference between Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway and Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway was that Tsuen Wan West was accessible through Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway, but there were not many passengers who boarded or alighted at Tsuen Wan West. Also, 30% of the passengers in the West Rail would interchange at Mei Foo Station for Tsuen Wan line, heading for the factory sites such as Cheung Sha Wan. More importantly, the passengers of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway would be able to reach Kowloon directly. He further pointed out that the Government had earlier opposed to the construction of Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway due to the high construction cost of Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway which should connect with the West Rail, and the traffic congestion problem caused by the in-take of the properties near City Point upon their completion. In addition, the existing policy was that a medium capacity railway line would be constructed when the population reached 30 000; and that a heavy railway station would be constructed when the population reached 50 000. The population around the intermediate station as proposed in the paper was less than 50 000. For example, there was a population of 40 000 in So Kwun Wat; there was a total population of 30 000 in Ting Kau, Sham Tseng and Tsing Lung Tau; and there was a total population of about 30 000 in Skyline Plaza and Belvedere Garden. He said that a maximum of six train compartments could be provided for a medium capacity railway line with the hourly capacity of a total of 60 000 passengers. The advantages of the medium capacity railway line were that the train could go along the hill slopes and run across steep slopes and sharp turn safely. Also, the platform of the train station only required a smaller land allotment which was suitable for Tsuen Wan district. Therefore, he opined that the construction of the medium capacity railway line which was in a lower cost was more feasible. He added that reference could be drawn from the previous proposal on Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway for the railway routes of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway, i.e. after reaching Skyline Plaza, the trains of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway passed Lei Muk Shue, Kwai Chung East and Kwai Chung North as well as Shek Lei of a population of 40 000 before arriving at Mei Foo, where land allotment was confirmed for construction of railway for further connection with Nam Cheong for interchange to Tung Chung line heading for the Hong Kong Island. He stated that the train routes for Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway could include East Rail line and Shatin to Central Link from Lei Muk Shue to Sha Tin and Tai Wai, but it was difficult to identify a site in Tai Wai for construction of a railway. Moreover, if a railway was constructed in Tai Wai, the

cost effectiveness would be relatively low due to the increase of construction cost by 30% to 40%. He thought that the traffic problem of Lei Muk Shue, Kwai Chung and Shek Lei could be solved through Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway and that the intermediate station at Skyline Plaza would facilitate the residents of Belvedere Garden and Skyline Plaza to take the West Rail without having to take a walk for 15 minutes. Hence, he hoped that Members would support the proposal.

115. Mr LAM Faat-kang stated that although the THB and MTRCL did not send representatives to attend the meeting, he thought that the proposal deserved the support from the TWDC Members because the Member concerned had made full preparations for information and data required for the proposal. He pointed out that the Government had all along been advocating a railway-based network which was complemented by other public transport. It could be seen that there was a need to construct Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway. Besides, there were always serious road traffic congestions because the new towns in Tuen Mun were developed; the usage of Tuen Mun Road had almost reached a saturation level; and there was a speed limit for the roads linking to the airport. In future, there would probably be traffic gridlocks in the New Territories West after the cross-harbour tunnel from the airport to Tuen Mun was commissioned. Hence, he was of the view that the construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway, including the presumption of Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway as well as Tsuen Wan and Shatin Railway, was a forward-looking proposal. Moreover, Member's proposal on construction of a medium capacity railway line was practicably feasible, so he supported the proposal and thought that the Government should take further consideration of this.

116. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly supported the construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway. He pointed out that Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway had been discussed for long. The problem concerned was still pending for solution, even though the West Rail was completed for public use. The people in Tuen Mun should take other public transport or private vehicles if they went to Tsuen Wan or other places in urban areas. Also, the residents who went to work or school were seriously affected by the traffic gridlocks due to the traffic accidents frequently happened in Tuen Mun Road. Hence, he thought that a railway from Tuen Mun to urban areas should be constructed. Besides, as the trains of railway lines generally would not go via the public housing estates, the residents of the public housing estates were always required to take the shuttle buses to reach the railway stations. It was very time-consuming and ineffective. He further pointed out that there were more than 30 000 residents in Lei Muk Shue, not to mention the population of Shek Wai Kok and Cheung Shan, and many people would go to visit Shing Mun Reservoir via Lei Muk Shue. He believed that more people would take a walk from Lei Muk Shue to Shing Mun Reservoir and Country Park if the trains of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway went via Lei Muk Shue. He suggested that the Government should conduct a study as soon as possible and hoped that the proposal on Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway would be implemented.

117. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones said he had put forth the proposal on Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway. He opined that the West Rail had reached a level of saturation, consideration should be taken into the construction of a new route to serve the residents, in particular, those in Belvedere Garden, Cheung Shan, Shek Wai Kok and Lei Muk Shue and that the details of the routes could be discussed later. He pointed out that the Government and TD were working on the development of transport network which was chiefly based on an approach of public transport carriage. As a result, the residents in more remote areas would have difficulties in using the public transport. Hence, he was of the view that the proposal on the construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway deserved consideration. Besides, he noted that the Government opposed to the construction of Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway mainly due to the excessively high construction cost. Thus, the Government should take further consideration of the construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway at a lower construction cost as proposed in the paper which was conducive to benefitting more residents, saving time on transport and promoting the land development.

118. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris opined that at present, there was a great need for the construction of a railway at Castle Peak Road between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan. He had put forth his views on the routes of the railway during the discussion of “Hong Kong 2030+” at the TWDC full council meeting earlier. His suggestions, however, were slightly different from the current proposal on Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway. The route proposed by him would finally reach Shatin after passing via Lei Muk Shue, Cheung Shan, Shek Wai Kok and Shing Mun River. He thought that it would be more desirable if Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway passed via Shatin because this could not only solve the problem of the lack of railway connection between the New Territories East and the New Territories West due to the restriction of the existing direction of railway mainly from the South to the North, but also tie in with the approach of the planning for the downward shift of the commercial gravity in future. He pointed out that the Government opposed to the construction of Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway mainly due to the high construction cost, under-population of the areas concerned and the impact brought to the landscape of Yuen Long after Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway was completed. His proposal on the light rail could solve the above three problems at one go. He thought that the terminal of the new railway should be set up in Shatin because according to the statistics in 2015, the ratio of residents in Tuen Mun taking bus to the workplace was higher than those taking MTR and this could be found in only a few areas among the 18 districts. In fact, there was no railway station at Tuen Mun Ferry Pier and Leung King Estate. The residents could reach the Hong Kong Island or their workplaces directly by bus and they usually did not take MTR which was not a direct route to them. Hence, he was of the view that the relevant factors like this should be taken into consideration when the railway system was under study. He

thought that a mixed train system could be adopted. The speedy trains provided service for the passengers at the major train stations such as Sam Shing, Sham Tseng, Belvedere Garden and Lei Muk Shue, etc. and the regular trains provided service for the passengers at the train stations with lower pedestrian flow, so as to facilitate the residents to take the trains after leaving home.

119. Mr WONG Ka-wa supported the construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway. He stated that the TWDC had discussed Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway and arranged for preparation for a study report earlier. He was disappointed that the proposal was not supported by the Government. He thought that at present, most important of all, Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway should be constructed to connect the areas including Castle Peak Road in order to foster the development of Tsuen Wan and other districts. He said that a concern group led by the Chairman of TWDC was formed when Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway was under study previously. The study on Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway was conducted after the funds were pooled by the TWDC and Tuen Mun district. The study report on Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway was submitted to the Government for consideration. Hence, he suggested that the DC of this term should pool funds with other relevant districts to prepare a study report on the feasibility of construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway.

120. Mr TAM Hoi-pong had reservation over the proposal on construction of Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway. As a supporter to environmental protection, he opined that railway would play a leading role in future. However, in recent years, he found that the railway development was over-emphasised in the transport network in Hong Kong. Serious traffic problem would occur once there were railway disruptions. He was of the view that a progression had been made from the “priority to the railway” to the “dominance by the railway”. He also forecast that the alignment of the railway was at a high level of technical difficulty and a huge sum of expenditure would be involved. Thus, he did not support the proposal on construction of Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway and setting up of an intermediate station in Tsuen Wan West.

121. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris said the problem of competition among other transportation modes would occur after the railway connected Kowloon. At present, it was valuable for local people to have the bus service running at a high frequency from Tuen Mun to Kowloon or Hong Kong Island and directly reaching some housing estates. He opined that a transport network had already been available for access to the urban areas from the New Territories West. Hence, the construction of Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway would certainly gain support. He put forth his proposal on connection with Shatin, so that a new railway line would be created for connection between Tsuen Wan and Shatin.

122. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael stated that he always looked for the practicably feasible options. He also understood that the construction of a railway of 5 km or 6 km going through the hills might prove too costly; that land supply in Tai Wai was too tight for construction of a railway; and that the Government would make postponement by a number of reasons. Hence, he thought that there was plenty of land around Mei Foo which was of great potential for construction of railway as it was technically feasible. He cared about the needs from Kwai Chung district, Shek Lei and Kwai Chung East and Kwai Chung North because he was a DC Member of Tsuen Wan district and a LegCo Member of the New Territories West. If 40 000 to 50 000 residents in Kwai Chung East and Kwai Chung North were taken into consideration, the railway under discussion should connect Mei Foo without heading to Shatin. He said that his proposal on the railway could solve the transport problem of Lei Muk Shue, Kwai Chung East and Kwai Chung North at one go; otherwise such a problem could never be solved. Moreover, after the medium capacity railway line such as the South Island line started operation, it was found that the trains of medium capacity railway line had a better function of going uphill, as compared to the trains of regular railway lines. Thus, he opined that the construction of a medium capacity railway line for Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway was a feasible option.

123. The Chairman said it was good to put forth new concepts which had broadened the vision and dimension for construction of Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway as struck by the concern group of Tsuen Wan district and Tuen Mun district. He added that the traffic load of Tuen Mun Road was too heavy. It was greatly beneficial to the transport network and economic development of coastal areas after Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway was constructed. He opined that from a macro perspective, the proposal on Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway was developed from the angle of the New Territories West; on the other hand, the room for development would be much larger if the railway network was constructed in Tuen Mun to connect Tsuen Wan, Shatin, Tai Po and Yau Tong because it tied in with Shatin to Central Link and brought an impact to the North District. It could be seen that Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway was very favourable and constructive and it also reactivated the development of railway network. He hoped that Members would collect more information for detailed discussion and follow-ups. As other districts were involved in the proposal on Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway, the TWDC should seek the intention for the basis for cooperation of the proposal from the DCs concerned before the joint discussion and study on the proposal started, or else it would not be successful if the TWDC was the only party to conduct a study on the proposal.

124. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael said the existing seven railways included the Northern Link, which let the West Rail connected Lok Ma Chau and soon the New Territories East as well as the New Territories West. Following the connection with the North, the railway line would be developed southbound along the East Rail

and Shatin to Central Link. By that time, two railways would be too much. Besides, the Government opposed to Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan Railway due to the excessively high construction cost. After all, the cost of construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway in Mei Foo should be the lowest. The construction cost of the railway would be much higher if the railway was constructed round the hill heading to Shatin.

125. Mr WONG Ka-wa stated that over the years, Members hoped that a railway would be constructed along Castle Peak Road. He enquired whether the Chairman of the TWDC would lead the four DCs concerned, including the Tuen Mun District Council, TWDC, Kwai Tsing District Council and Sham Shui Po District Council, to pool funds for the study of the proposal concerned.

126. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael said Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway was a railway line which connected Lei Muk Shue after reaching the Skyline Plaza and headed for Mei Foo via Kwai Chung East and Kwai Chung North. The advice from the DCs, including Yuen Long District Council, should be sought because the service of West Rail would probably not be available for the residents in Yuen Long after Hung Shui Kiu was developed.

127. The Chairman stated that the majority of the TWDC Members supported the proposal on the construction of Tuen Mun and Kowloon Railway. He requested the Members concerned to collect more information for communication with and in-depth study by the DCs concerned. He was of the view that a study could be firstly conducted if the districts concerned found there was a need for construction of a railway and the substantive routes of the railway could be further discussed. He added that as the proposal was in the preliminary stage, he would seek the intention of the DCs concerned on the basis for cooperation before the follow-up work was discussed.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael and Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris left the meeting at 6:55 p.m. and 6:56 p.m. respectively.)

XIV Item 13: “Strongly Request to Improve the Traffic Safety of Lei Muk Shue Estate and Wo Yi Hop Road”
(TWDC Paper No. 13/17-18)

128. The Chairman stated that Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr WONG Hon-kit, Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan) (CM/M(W,T&T)), HD;
- (2) Mr CHEUNG Kim-hung, Engineer/Tsuen Wan 2 (E/TW2), TD;
- (3) Mr CHAN Lok-wing, District Commander (Tsuen Wan) (DC(TW)), HKPF; and
- (4) Miss KWOK Sze-wai, Venus, PCRO(TW)(Atg.), HKPF.

Besides, the written reply of the TD was tabled at the meeting.

129. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly introduced the paper.
130. E/TW2 of the TD responded as follows:
- (1) the TD would like to make apologies for the absence from meeting of its staff who were responsible for Wo Yi Hop Road;
 - (2) there were two lanes at Uphill Wo Yi Hop Road and there were pedestrian roads by the side of the two lanes. There were railings along the roadside, except the exit and entrance for vehicles on the road; and
 - (3) the TD was currently studying the provision of crash barriers at the location of the accident after the traffic accident happened earlier. It was hoped that the passers-by and bus passengers waiting at the pedestrian road would be under greater protection.
131. DC(TW) responded as follows:
- (1) in the recent six months, the number of the deceased in traffic accidents happened at Wo Yi Hop Road had greatly increased from zero during the first six months last year to three during the first six months this year;
 - (2) the traffic black spots were proposed by the TD. Although Wo Yi Hop Road had not been proposed as a traffic black spot by the TD, the Police regarded Wo Yi Hop Road as a traffic concern point at the meeting on traffic on 28 April 2017 so as to seek for the feasible improvement measures for implementation. The Traffic Unit of the HKPF would conduct an assessment for Wo Yi Hop Road. The decision on carrying out the anti-speeding operation at Wo Yi Hop Road would be made after taking into consideration of various factors including the safety of the general public and enforcement staff. The Traffic Division of New Territories South of the HKPF would strengthen its patrolling work at Wo Yi Hop Road and its Hong Kong Road Safety Patrol would also carry out the publicity and education work for the elderly and night time scavengers; and
 - (3) the installation of the speed enforcement camera was taken up by the TD, not the HKPF.
132. CM/M(W,T&T) of the HD responded as follows:
- (1) the HD would identify the necessary improvements to be made for the design of the public transport interchange (PTI) in accordance with the relevant planning and by enforcement of the advice from the traffic and transport authorities; and
 - (2) the HD noted that the proposal on enhancement of the safety of the PTI of Lei Muk Shue Estate was discussed at the meeting of the Traffic and Transport Committee (T&TC) of the TWDC this month. It would be

followed by an on-site inspection. The staff of the HD and departments concerned would explain to Members the feasibility and restrictions of the proposal at the scene during the on-site inspection.

133. District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing), Social Welfare Department (SWD) responded as follows:

- (1) besides the outreach social workers for the youth at risk, the SWD set up a support service team at The Hong Kong Society for the Aged (SAGE) Tsuen Wan Multi-service Centre for the Elderly which was mainly responsible for the outreach work of the hidden and singleton elderly;
- (2) the SWD would relay Members' concern to the SAGE, so that the outreach team would pay attention to the safety of the nighttime elderly scavengers; and
- (3) the SWD welcomed Members to give advice or information to the SWD, so that the outreach team could focus on the care for the elderly with welfare needs.

134. Mr WONG Ka-wa stated that many years ago, as there was a sharp increase on the number of the casualties in traffic accidents happened at the lane of Downhill Wo Yi Hop Road, the departments concerned provided the speed detecting device and metal railings at the location off the fire station. However, there was no metal railing at the lower part of Downhill Wo Yi Hop Road and some vehicles parked across the pedestrian road over there. Hence, he hoped that the departments concerned would advise the general public to obey the laws when crossing the road. He pointed out that traffic accidents were attributed to the pedestrians' attitudes of crossing the road and the drivers' manners of driving. The accidents took place mainly because of the jaywalkers who subsequently died or got injured in the accidents. He hoped that the TD would provide the traffic data of Wo Yi Hop Road so as to see if the traffic load of Wo Yi Hop Road had reached a level of saturation.

135. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly expressed dissatisfaction at the TD's staff responsible for Wo Yi Hop Road who was absent from this meeting. He said the TD was responsible for proposing the traffic black spots and installation of the speed enforcement cameras, but it did not offer any advice in respect of the situation of Wo Yi Hop Road to the DC. He pointed out that Wo Yi Hop Road was a dangerous place for the general public and motorists. The road surface of Wo Yi Hop Road was uneven and the pedestrian island on the road was not safe at all. The upcoming vehicles always dashed away at high speed that might cause traffic accidents. He criticised the TD for shutting its eyes to such a serious traffic accident. He also hoped that the TD and HKPF would make arrangement of the on-site inspections with Members.

136. Mr WONG Ka-wa said he was of the view that traffic accidents would frequently happen at the bus terminal of Lei Muk Shue Estate when it was commissioned because the bus terminal without a roof cover was criss-crossed with traffic lanes. At that time, he had relayed the problem to the TD and the TD had carried out the improvement works. Moreover, the HD had undertaken to conduct a study and provide a roof cover for the bus terminal; however, no action was taken by the HD till present. Hence, he hoped that the HD would provide a timetable for the DC and carry out the enhancement works by following the timetable after the on-site inspection, in order to prevent the accidents.

137. The Chairman requested the HD, TD and HKPF to make arrangement of the on-site inspection with Members at Wo Yi Hop Road.

138. E/TW2 of the TD responded that the TD was pleased to assign its staff as appropriate to conduct the on-site inspection.

139. CM/M(W,T&T) of the HD responded that the Chairman of the T&TC was currently making arrangement of the on-site inspection.

140. The Chairman summarised that the problem concerned would be referred to the T&TC for follow-ups. He hoped that the departments concerned would draw up proper solutions after the on-site inspection.

XV Item 14: Law Enforcement on Working for Rewards by the Arrivals of Hong Kong as Related to the Issue on the Foreign Performers of Performance Venues for Independent Music
(TWDC Paper No. 14/17-18)

141. The Chairman stated that Mr TAM Hoi-pong submitted the paper. The representatives from the Immigration Department (IMMD) responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr NG Cheuk-yiu, Immigration Task Force Commander (ITFC); and
- (2) Mr YUNG Wai-kwok, Senior Immigration Officer (Investigation) Task Force.

142. Mr TAM Hoi-pong introduced the paper.

143. ITFC of the IMMD responded as follows:

- (1) the IMMD had all along attached great importance to combating the illegal employment activities. The reports on illegal employment activities would be handled cautiously and analysed carefully by the IMMD;
- (2) the IMMD would timely assign the officers to take law enforcement actions at the workplace under suspicion of employment of illegal

- workers, carry out inspections at the black spots and work in collaboration with various law enforcement authorities to combat the offences of illegal employment according to the circumstances;
- (3) under the existing legislation, any person, except those who possessed the right of abode or right to land of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, who came to Hong Kong for employment or training should apply for the visa or entry permit for employment or training beforehand. Any person, as a visitor who came to Hong Kong, was not allowed to take up the paid or unpaid employment or take part in or establish any business without the approval from the Director of Immigration. The offenders would be liable on conviction to the maximum penalties of a fine of \$50,000 and two years' imprisonment. As to whether the visitors' participation in activities constituted an employment, it varied from case to case, depending on the actual circumstances of the activities by taking into consideration whether the activities were for commercial purpose or involved an employment contract or rewards. Any person or the personnel who assisted in making arrangements for the activities could make enquiries to the IMMD when in doubt about the application of employment visa in respect of the relevant activities;
 - (4) since 2015 till present, the IMMD had received two reports on dancing or singing and two reports on the conduct of Taoism funeral ceremonies in Tsuen Wan district. Irregularities were not found from these four cases upon investigation;
 - (5) according to the Summary Offences Ordinance (Chapter 228), any person who wandered abroad, or placed himself or herself in any public place, street or waterway to beg or gather alms, committed an offence. Although the visitors who begged did not violate the condition of stay, they would likely be liable to the prosecution for the breach of the Summary Offences Ordinance (Chapter 228);
 - (6) the IMMD would remind the general public that it was not worth the risk to employ illegal workers through the TV and radio announcements in the public interest, conferences and press releases. The employers had the explicit duty to inspect any prospective employees' or performers' identity documents and make reasonable enquiries regarding them during recruitment. The prospective employees could be under employment only when no reasonable doubt concerning the lawful employability of the person was cast. The IMMD would continue to carry out the publicity and education work through different channels to remind the general public of the importance of obeying the laws and the severity of committing the offences; and
 - (7) the IMMD would not give comment for the case of Hidden Agenda which was under investigation. Overall speaking, where the activities

were for commercial purpose; the box office receipts were involved; participants of the activities were ticketed; and the organiser put up various advertisements for the activities, the IMMD would remind the organisers to ensure that the employment visa of the performers should be approved as appropriate before the performers participated in the relevant activities; otherwise they would likely be in violation of the Immigration Ordinance (Chapter 115). The IMMD would take law enforcement actions after receiving the reports. The performers would be detained for investigation if any irregularities were found during the law enforcement actions.

144. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly enquired about the staff deployment for the law enforcement actions taken by the Police and IMMD. Moreover, he hoped that more cultural activities would be held in Hong Kong, including the performance by overseas cultural workers in Tsuen Wan district by invitation. However, there was a hearsay from the community that not many cultural performers applied for performing in Hong Kong because the IMMD had exercised a strict control when the application of entry of the overseas cultural performers was under vetting. He hoped that the IMMD would conduct a review of this and streamline the vetting process, so that more overseas cultural workers were able to perform in Hong Kong.

145. Mr WONG Ka-wa stated that there were problems such as begging and someone dressed as a monk appealed for money in Tsuen Wan. He wished to know whether the law enforcement actions against such illegal acts were taken by the Police or IMMD; and the details of the relevant law enforcement procedures.

146. Mr KOT Siu-yuen said that the foreign domestic helpers always cooked at Lo Tak Court during holidays. He wished to know if these helpers had breached the conditions of stay or certain laws and regulations.

147. Mr TAM Hoi-pong enquired whether the IMMD could provide the figures on the reports about Hidden Agenda. Besides, he said that Hidden Agenda would make early announcement on the date and venue of its performance. However, the people who were employed in Hong Kong for on-street begging and conduct of funeral ceremonies in religious venues without any employment visa would never disclose the details of their illegal acts in advance. Hence, he earnestly hoped that the IMMD would pay attention to these unexpected illegal acts, instead of the reports of working for rewards by the arrivals of Hong Kong for the public activities such as cultural performances only.

148. ITFC of the IMMD responded as follows:

- (1) there were about 100 officers who worked for the Task Force. They were responsible for the cases of breach of conditions of stay over the

- territory. The IMMD would arrange for manpower as appropriate to take law enforcement actions, according to the circumstances of the cases or the size of the venues. For example, a squad of about ten law enforcement officers was assigned to carry out the investigation for the case of the stalls in Mong Kok;
- (2) the IMMD would carry out the joint operations with the Police from time to time. On the other hand, the IMMD took law enforcement actions on a regular basis. The officers of the IMMD would exercise restraint and make attempts to continue to handle the problems when meeting with rudeness or resistance. However, if the problem remained unsolved or some people became agitated or lost control, the officers of the IMMD would seek assistance from the Police when necessary after evaluating the circumstances of the scene;
 - (3) the Government had all along attached great importance to all external exchange activities of the cultural, arts and sports troupes. On the other hand, the IMMD had all along processed the applications of visa or entry permits for the cultural, arts or sports activities or events in a pragmatic manner in pursuant to the Immigration Ordinance. The IMMD would also maintain a close liaison and coordination with the organisers of the activities or events and adopt the streamlining initiatives as appropriate taking into consideration the dates or circumstances of the activities or events, including streamlining the procedures for visa or entry applications and according priority to urgent applications in order to meet the actual needs of the participants or organisers. For example, the overseas singers who held concerts in Hong Kong were required to make applications for visa. Many organisers were well aware of this arrangement. The IMMD would not carry out inspection if it was found that the visa of the persons concerned was approved after receiving the report. The IMMD considered that a performance involving box office receipts presented by a person who stayed in Hong Kong for one single day was hardly classified as a non-commercial activity and a non-job-related cultural exchange. Also, according to the Immigration Ordinance, the people from the overseas were required to make application of visa to Hong Kong. Thus, the IMMD would remind the overseas applicants that they could take part in the activities in Hong Kong only after their visa were approved by the IMMD;
 - (4) begging could be handled in accordance with the Summary Offences Ordinance (Chapter 228); however, this Ordinance was not enforced by the IMMD. Nevertheless, the IMMD would exchange information with the HKPF from time to time and include the Mainland beggars upon conviction in a monitoring list as informed by the Police, in order to examine their purpose of visit to Hong Kong again in future;

- (5) the foreign domestic helpers did not breach their conditions of stay if they cooked and shared food with friends in gatherings at somewhere during holidays. However, it might be an offence if they sold the food to other people because they were only permitted to do the chores in the residence of their employers and they were not permitted to sell any food in the streets. The foreign domestic helpers would be detained for investigation if there were sufficient evidence to prove that they had breached the laws when the IMMD carried out the law enforcement work. The IMMD hoped that Members could understand that there were difficulties in adducing evidence for this type of cases, but the IMMD would continue to carry out the law enforcement work to combat the offences;
- (6) in fact, the IMMD handled the case of Hidden Agenda only after receiving the report but the details and information of the person who made the report would not be disclosed; and
- (7) the IMMD would never be selective in taking law enforcement actions based on the scale of the activity or the nationality of the persons involved. The IMMD would handle the cases according to the priority of the reports. For better use of resources, the IMMD was unable to carry out inspections for various premises actively, but corresponding law enforcement actions would be taken according to the information received or the priority and urgency of the reports.

149. The Chairman reminded Members that the TWDC had all along discussed the subject matters in relation to Tsuen Wan at district level, instead of the subject matters of any affairs of other district. The Chairman further pointed out that the paper originally submitted by Mr TAM Hoi-pong was about the affairs of other districts which were not directly related to Tsuen Wan district. After that, Mr TAM Hoi-pong submitted paper again and pointed out that he considered that the matters in relation to Tsuen Wan district should be discussed, so a discussion in brief was held at the full council meeting. The Chairman reiterated that the TWDC should only discuss the practical subject matters directly related to Tsuen Wan. It was not suitable for the TWDC to discuss the subject matters which were proposed simply out of presumption or supposition. In addition, he thanked the representatives from the IMMD for attending the meeting and requested the IMMD to take Members' views into consideration.

XVI Item 15: Crime Brief for Tsuen Wan District – Comparison of Crime Statistics between March to April 2017 and March to April 2016
(TWDC Paper No. 15/17-18)

150. DC(TW) of the HKPF reported the situation of the crimes in Tsuen Wan district.

XVII Item 16: Crime Brief for Ma Wan – March to April 2017
(TWDC Paper No. 16/17-18)

151. The Chairman stated that the HKPF submitted the revised paper at the meeting.

152. DC(TW) of the HKPF reported the situation of the crimes in Ma Wan.

XVIII Item 17: Proposal for Tsuen Wan District Council Additional Funds Allocation in 2017/18
(TWDC Paper No. 17/17-18)

153. The Secretary introduced the paper.

154. Members unanimously endorsed the proposal for additional funds allocation.

XIX Item 18: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan Safe and Healthy Community Steering Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 18/17-18)

155. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that the Chairman was the Honorary President of the Tsuen Wan Safe and Healthy Community Steering Committee (the Committee); that Mr CHAN Sung-ip was the Vice Chairman of the Committee; and that the Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben, Mr WONG Ka-wa and Mr LO Siu-kit were Members of the Committee for declaration of interest of their membership of the Committee.

156. The Chairman stated that he was the Honorary President of the Committee but he did not have the personal pecuniary interest. According to section 48(13) of the Standing Orders, as he had made declaration of interest, the meeting would be temporarily chaired by the Vice Chairman.

157. The Acting Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. No Member made declaration of other interest.

158. The Acting Chairman decided that the Members who had declared their membership of the Tsuen Wan Safe and Healthy Community Steering Committee might not speak and vote but they might remain in the meeting as observers, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

159. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1) Tsuen Wan Safe and Healthy Community Day	74,960.00

160. The Chairman resumed the chair.

XX Item 19: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan District Office

(TWDC Paper No. 19/17-18)

161. The Secretary introduced the paper.

162. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of interest. No Member made declaration of interest.

163. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding applications:

	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Applying Organisation/ Co-organiser</u>	<u>Amount Approved</u> (\$)
(1)	2017/18 Tsuen Wan District Private Buildings Building Management Certificate Course	Hong Kong Institute of Housing	18,940.00
(2)	Arts Performance Enjoyment of Families in Tsuen Wan 2017	Tsuen Wan Culture & Recreation Co-ordinating Association Limited	400,000.00

XXI Item 20: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan District Civic Education Committee

(TWDC Paper No. 20/17-18)

164. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones, Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly and Mr CHENG Chit-pun were the Members of the Tsuen Wan District Civic Education Committee (the Committee) for declaration of interest of their membership of the Committee.

165. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. No Member made declaration of other interest.

166. The Chairman decided that the Members who had declared their membership of the Tsuen Wan District Civic Education Committee might speak and vote, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

167. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding applications:

	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Applying Organisation/ Co-organiser</u>	<u>Amount Approved</u> (\$)
(1)	“Live a Green Life Love Our Earth” Environmental Protection Competition	Yuen Yuen Institute Social Service Department	24,270.00
(2)	“Love Home, Love HK, Love Our Earth” One-day Eco-trip	Yuen Yuen Institute Social Service Department	21,148.00

XXII Item 21: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan Committee for Celebration of Reunification of Hong Kong with China
(TWDC Paper No. 21/17-18)

168. The Secretary introduced the paper.

169. The Chairman declared his Presidentship of the Tsuen Wan Committee for Celebration of Reunification of Hong Kong with China (the Committee) but he did not have the personal pecuniary interest. Besides, the Vice Chairman and Mr CHAN Sung-ip declared their Vice Chairmanship of the Committee.

170. As the Chairman and the Vice Chairman had made declaration of interest, according to section 48(13) of the Standing Orders, Members unanimously agreed that the meeting would be temporarily chaired by Mr MAN Yu-ming.

171. The Acting Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. No Member made declaration of other interest.

172. The Acting Chairman decided that the Members who had declared their membership of the Tsuen Wan Committee for Celebration of Reunification of Hong Kong with China might not speak and vote but they might remain in the meeting as observers, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

173. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1)	Celebration Events of the 20 th Anniversary of Reunification of Hong Kong with China by All Sectors in Tseun Wan - Cultural and Arts Activity	598,800.00

174. The Chairman resumed the chair.

XXIII Item 22: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan Arts Festival Coordinating Committee

(TWDC Paper No. 22/17-18)

175. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that the Vice Chairman, Mr MAN Yu-ming, Mr LAM Faat-kang, Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly, Mr KOT Siu-yuen, Mr WONG Ka-wa and Mr LO Siu-kit were the Members of the Tsuen Wan Arts Festival Coordinating Committee (the Committee) for declaration of interest of their membership of the Committee.

176. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of interest. No Member made declaration of interest.

177. The Chairman decided that the Members who had declared their membership of the Tsuen Wan Arts Festival Coordinating Committee might not speak and vote but they might remain in the meeting as observers, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

178. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Applying Organisation/ Co-organiser</u>	<u>Amount Approved</u> (\$)
(1)	The 27 th Tsuen Wan Arts Festival	Yuen Yuen Institute Social Service Department	1,012,000.00

XXIV Item 23: Information Papers

179. Members noted the contents of the following information papers:

- (1) Report of District Facilities Management Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 23/17-18);
- (2) Report of Culture, Recreation and Sports Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 24/17-18);
- (3) Report of Traffic and Transport Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 25/17-18);
- (4) Report of Community Building, Planning and Development Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 26/17-18);
- (5) Report of Social Services and Community Information Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 27/17-18);
- (6) Report of Coastal Affairs Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 28/17-18);
- (7) Report of Environmental and Health Affairs Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 29/17-18);
- (8) Report of District Management Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 30/17-18);

- (9) Items Endorsed by Circulation by the Tsuen Wan District Council during the Period from 21 March 2017 to 15 May 2017 (TWDC Paper No. 31/17-18); and
- (10) Financial Statement of Tsuen Wan District Council Funds as at 15 May 2017 (TWDC Paper No. 32/17-18).

180. Mr KOT Siu-yuen reported the results of the Tsuen Wan district in the 6th Hong Kong Games and invited Members to attend the dinner for appreciation of good work which would be held at 6:30 p.m. on 28 May 2017 at Panda Hotel, Tsuen Wan.

XXV Item 24: Any Other Business

181. The Chairman stated that a letter from Young Artists Development Foundation was received earlier to apply for display of the TWDC logo on the flag which would be used at the flag delegation session of the opening ceremony of the “HK Youth Drawing Day 2017” which would be held on 8 July 2017 (Sunday) at Chater Garden, Central. The “HK Youth Drawing Day 2017” was one of the celebration events for the 20th Anniversary of the Establishment of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region. It aimed to introduce arts for the community together with the youth in the district.

182. Members unanimously endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from Young Artists Development Foundation.

183. The Chairman stated that the the Women’s Commission would continue to launch the “Funding Scheme For Women’s Development” (the Funding Scheme) in 2017/18. A sum of \$53,000 would be distributed through each of the 18 DCs to women’s groups in districts and relevant non-governmental organisations in organising more activities for promotion of women’s development at the district level and building harmonious communities. The theme for the Funding Scheme in 2017/18 was “Women’s Employment”. It was hoped that the projects would be held at the district level to facilitate women in unleashing their potential, enhance women’s employability and create an environment that enabled women to work. He suggested that this matter should be referred to the Social Services and Community Information Committee (SSCIC) for follow-ups.

184. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC supported the Funding Scheme and referred this matter to the SSCIC for follow-ups.

185. The meeting was temporarily chaired by the Vice Chairman.

186. The Acting Chairman stated that the EPD had served a notice earlier that the EPD would continue to implement the Community Participation Programme in

Environmental Protection for the current year by provision of funding of \$200,000 to each DC under the theme of “Reduce Your Waste and Clean Recycle in Your Community” through organising various campaigns for expansion of the community mobilisation in order to cultivate the value of “Use Less, Waste Less, Clean Recycle” amongst the public at the community level for practice of green lives. Last year, the Environmental and Health Affairs Committee (EHAC) undertook the follow-ups on the funding and campaigns. He suggested that this matter should be referred to the EHAC for follow-ups.

187. Members unanimously agreed that this matter was referred to the EHAC for follow-ups.

188. The Acting Chairman stated that a letter from the Director of Planning was received earlier to invite the TWDC to serve as a supporting organisation for “Hong Kong ∞ Impression” exhibitions and activities which aimed to demonstrate the city planning and infrastructure development of Hong Kong over the past 20 years, elaborate the vision of Hong Kong which would become a liveable, competitive and sustainable Asia’s world city and disseminate an impression that Hong Kong was a forward-planning and proactive city. The PlanD also hoped that the TWDC would endorse the application for the use of the TWDC logo on the upcoming publicity materials and websites.

189. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC served as a supporting organisation for “Hong Kong ∞ Impression” exhibitions and activities and endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from the PlanD.

190. The Acting Chairman stated that the LCSD would continue to organise the “Sport for All Day” on 6 August 2017 (Sunday) under the theme of “Stay Active, Let’s Dance” this year. As a token of appreciation from the LCSD for the TWDC’s funding provision for encouraging local organisations to organise the cultural and sports activities in support of the “Sport for All Day” on 6 August 2017, the TWDC was included in the list of supporting organisations of the “Sport for All Day 2017” which was uploaded to the LCSD’s website for the public.

191. The Acting Chairman stated that in order to express the appreciation for the Water Supplies Department (WSD) for bringing benefit of a stable fresh water supply for the villages by replacement of fresh water mains of a total length of about 4.2 km for 14 villages in Tsuen Wan district under the implementation of the “Replacement and Rehabilitation Programme of Water Mains” as well as the WSD’s prompt actions for the replacement and repair of water mains in Tsuen Wan district, he suggested that a letter of appreciation should be sent to the WSD in the name of the TWDC. It was hoped that the WSD would continue to monitor the status of the water mains and carry out the related works as required, so that a sustainable, stable and comprehensive water supply service was available for members of the public.

192. Members unanimously agreed that a letter of appreciation was to be sent to the WSD in the name of the TWDC.

(Post-meeting Note: The Secretariat had sent a letter of appreciation dated 23 May 2017 to the WSD for its implementation of the “Replacement and Rehabilitation Programme of Water Mains” in Tsuen Wan district.)

193. The Acting Chairman stated that the meeting-cum-luncheon between LegCo Members and TWDC Members would be held on 26 May 2017 (Friday). Members who had made enrolment should attend the meeting on time.

194. The Acting Chairman stated that the first duty visit of the TWDC would be held from 3 June 2017 (Saturday) to 5 June 2017 (Monday) and the destination of the duty visit was Zhuhai City. The aim of the duty visit was to tap into the experience in the development of traffic and coastal facilities in Zhuhai which were conducive in taking forward and advocating improvements for the traffic and coastal facilities in Tsuen Wan district. The provisional itinerary of the duty visit included the visit to Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge, Traffic Police Command Centre of Zhuhai Public Security Bureau, Hengqin New Area Planning Exhibition Hall, Gaolan Port Planning Hall and Zhuhai City Records Authority, etc. He said that the Members and Co-opted Members who had made enrolment should gather on time on the day of departure.

195. The Acting Chairman stated that this was the last time for Mr CHAN Shiu-man, Simon, Senior Executive Officer (District Management) of the Tsuen Wan District Office to attend the TWDC meeting before his retirement. On behalf of the TWDC, he would like to thank Mr CHAN for his service and contributions to the TWDC in previous years and wished him good health.

196. The Acting Chairman reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 25 July 2017 and the deadline for submission of paper was 10 July 2017.

XXVI Adjournment of Meeting

197. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:15 p.m.

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat
June 2017