

(Translation)

Minutes of the 22nd Meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (1/2019)

Date: 28 May 2019

Time: 2:30 p.m.

Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Mr WONG Wai-kit, MH (Chairman)

Mr CHAN Sung-ip, MH (Vice Chairman)

Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH

The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael, BBS, JP

Mr KOO Yeung-pong, MH

Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris

Mr LI Hung-por

Mr YAU Kam-ping, BBS, MH

Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis

Ms LAM, Lam Nixie

Mr LAM Faat-kang, MH

The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben, BBS, JP

Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones

Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly

Mr WONG Ka-wa

Mr KOT Siu-yuen

Mr CHOW Ping-tim

Mr CHENG Chit-pun

Mr LO Siu-kit, MH

Mr TAM Hoi-pong

In Attendance:

Miss YIP Kam-ching, Jenny, JP

District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr CHOW Chun-hun, Gary

Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Ms CHOY Po-san, Nancy

Senior Executive Officer (District Management), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr HUEN Yeuk-hon, John

Senior Liaison Officer (1), Tsuen Wan District Office

Ms LEE Lai-kiu, Winnie

Senior Liaison Officer (2), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr Kerry Paul Lee CAREW

District Commander (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force

Ms LAW Man-ching, Vio

Acting Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force

Ms MA Sau-ching, Annisa	District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing), Social Welfare Department
Miss LO Pui-yiu, Sapphire	District Lands Officer (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department
Mr YIM Wai-hung	Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department
Ms LUI Hiu-fai, Monica	Chief Transport Officer/NT South West, Transport Department
Mrs TANG FUNG Shuk-yin	Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan), Housing Department
Mr CHAN Kwok-hung	Acting District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Mr TSANG Lap-kei, Freddie	Acting Chief Engineer/West 2, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms HO Sau-fan, Fanny	Chief Leisure Manager (New Territories West), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr AU YEUNG Wai-ming, Arthur	Acting District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Miss LAM Siu-yung, Daisy (Secretary)	Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr LAU Shun-tak, Donald	Executive Officer I (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office

For discussion of item 3:

Dr Cheung Tin-cheung, JP	Director of Buildings, Buildings Department
Ms CHAN Wai-ming, Stella	Chief Building Surveyor/D, Buildings Department
Ms WONG Fung-sang, Mandy	Administrative Assistant/Director of Buildings, Buildings Department

For discussion of item 4:

Mr CHAN Chung-ching, Thomas, JP	Director of Lands, Lands Department
Ms LOU Yin-ye, Joanne	Senior Estate Surveyor/Training, Lands Department

For discussion of item 5:

Ms Jodi LEUNG	Regional Officer of New Territories West, Independent Commission Against Corruption
Ms Rita IP Sau-hing	Senior Community Relations Officer, ICAC Regional Office (New Territories South West), Independent Commission Against Corruption

For discussion of item 6:

Mr Patrick LAU	Senior Manager, Building Rehabilitation, Urban Renewal Authority
Mr SO Ngai-long	Senior Manager, Community Development, Urban Renewal Authority
Mr CHAN Chi-wai	Acting Senior Engineer/General Legislation 5, Electrical and Mechanical Services Department
Mr TSE Man-ho, Charles	Engineer/General Legislation 5/2, Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

For discussion of item 7:

Professor LAU Chi-pang, JP	Chairman, Advisory Committee on Built Heritage Conservation
Mr LEE Hong-nin, Robin	Chief Assistant Secretary (Works) 2, Development Bureau
Mr CHAN Wai-kin, Raymond	Project Manager (Heritage Conservation) 1, Development Bureau
Mr CHAN Chun-hin, Kevin	Assistant Project Manager (Heritage Conservation) 2, Development Bureau

For discussion of item 8:

Mr TANG Kam-fai, Keith	Principal Project Coordinator/Parking, Transport Department
Mr FUNG Siu-cheuk, Peter	Engineer/Strategic Studies 10, Transport Department
Mr FONG Ka-ho, Brad	Senior Engineer, Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited
Miss CHIONG Hoi-ki, Jenny	Assistant Engineer, Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited

For discussion of item 9:

Ms WONG Fan-ni, Jasmine	Senior Manager (New Territories South) Promotion, Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr CHEUNG Wa-on, Derek	District Planning Officer/Tsuen Wan & West Kowloon, Planning Department

For discussion of item 10:

Mr CHANG Wai-pong, Stephen	Maintenance Surveyor (Tsing Yi & Tsuen Wan), Housing Department
Ms LO Kit-man	Housing Manager (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi & Tsuen Wan 7), Housing Department
Mr SZETO Wai-tun	Engineer/NTW (Distribution 1), Water Supplies Department

For discussion of item 11:

Dr LUK Wan
Chief of Services, Department of Family Medicine
& Primary Health Care, Kowloon West Cluster,
Hospital Authority

For discussion of item 12:

Mr CHEUNG Sau-cheong, Andrew
Senior Environmental Protection Officer
(Assessment & Noise)¹, Environmental
Protection Department

Ms LAM Yuen, Annie
Public Relations Manager – External Affairs, Mass
Transit Railway Corporation Limited

Mr CHAN Yiu-chung, Jacky
Senior Public Relations Executive – External
Affairs, Mass Transit Railway Corporation
Limited

For discussion of item 13:

Mr LAU Wing-hang, Will
Senior Transport Officer/Tsuen Wan, Transport
Department

For discussion of item 14:

Mr LAU Wing-hang, Will
Senior Transport Officer/Tsuen Wan, Transport
Department

I Opening Remarks and Introduction

The Chairman welcomed Dr Cheung Tin-cheung, the Director of Buildings (DB) of the Buildings Department (BD), Mr CHAN Chung-ching, Thomas, the Director of Lands (DL) of the Lands Department (LandsD), Members and Representatives from government departments to the 22nd meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (TWDC) and introduced:

- (1) Ms LUI Hiu-fai, Monica, who attended the meeting for the first time and replaced Mr LAU Kin-kwok to assume the post of Chief Transport Officer/NT South West (CTO/NTSW), Transport Department (TD);
- (2) Mr TSANG Lap-kei, Freddie, Acting Chief Engineer/West 2, Civil Engineering and Development Department, who attended this meeting on behalf of Mr WONG Chi-hung;
- (3) Mr AU YEUNG Wai-ming, Arthur, Acting District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan), Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) who attended this meeting on behalf of Mr CHENG Kwok-kuen, Chris;
- (4) Ms LAW Man-ching, Vio, Acting Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF), who attended this meeting on behalf of Ms TANG Wai-han, Olivia; and
- (5) Mr CHAN Kwok-hung, Acting District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD), who attended this meeting on behalf of Mr KUAN Man-hou.

2. The Chairman reminded Members of sections 17(1) and 27 of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders (the “Standing Orders”) that any Member who wished to move a motion or ask any question at a meeting of the Council was required to give the Secretary a notice in writing ten clear working days before the meeting. Thus, he reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 30 July 2019 and the deadline for submission of paper was 15 July 2019. The Chairman asked Members to speak as concise as possible because there were many items on the agenda. In addition, according to section 28 of the Standing Orders, unless otherwise agreed by the Chairman, Members could speak and make supplementary remarks once for each agenda item at the meeting and each Member could speak up to 3 minutes.

3. The Chairman reminded that the persons sitting in on the meeting in the public gallery should keep quiet and refrain from speaking. According to section 15(2) of the Standing Orders, if a person attending or sitting in on a meeting of the Council misbehaved in such a way as to disrupt the orderly conduct of the meeting, the Chairman might issue warnings to the person. The Chairman might order the person to leave the place of the meeting if the person persisted in his or her misbehaviour despite warnings. Moreover, Members’ attention was drawn to the rule of filming that any Member who wished to film should make application to the Chairman in advance and the Member himself or herself was to be filmed only, exclusive of any other persons at the scene notwithstanding the Chairman’s approval was granted for such an application. Also, the media workers who entered the Main Conference Room should wear the admission pass showing their identity and register with the staff of the TWDC Secretariat; otherwise filming at the Main Conference Room was not allowed.

II Item 1: Confirmation of Minutes of the 21st Meeting held on 26.3.2019, Minutes of the 3rd Special Meeting held on 25.4.2019 and Minutes of the 4th Special Meeting held on 7.5.2019

4. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had not received any proposed amendments to the minutes before this meeting. The minutes were confirmed without amendment.

III Item 2: Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meetings

5. The Chairman said that there were no matters arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael and Mr CHOW Ping-tim joined the meeting at 2:38 p.m.)

IV Item 3: Visit of Director of Buildings to Tsuen Wan District Council

6. The Chairman welcomed Dr CHEUNG Tin-cheung, the DB of the BD who visited the TWDC and introduced the work of the BD to Members. The other representatives from the BD attending the meeting were:

- (1) Ms CHAN Wai-ming, Stella, Chief Building Surveyor/D; and
- (2) Ms WONG Fung-sang, Mandy, Administrative Assistant/Director of Buildings.

(Note: Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones, Mr CHENG Chit-pun, Mr LAM Faat-kang and Mr WONG Ka-wa joined the meeting at 2:44 p.m., 2:49 p.m., 2:52 p.m. and 2:57 p.m. respectively.)

7. DB introduced the work of the BD.

8. The Chairman stated that as there were many items on the agenda of this meeting, each Member could only speak once for this item up to 3 minutes.

9. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael said that the BD was in charge of a broad scope of work. Its major duty was to stipulate the standards for all buildings and ensure that all buildings were in compliance with these standards. He pointed out that the pre-set settlement upper threshold adopted for suspension of works in Light Rail Tin Wing Stop was at first 20 mm. Subsequently, it was relaxed to 80 mm and recently, it was further relaxed to 150 mm. He enquired whether the standards prescribed by the BD could be revised anytime. In addition, any person who intended to carry out alterations or additions works was advised to consult Building Professionals for advice and make formal application for approval and consent from the BD; otherwise, illegal structures or unauthorised building works (UBW) were created upon completion of works and the flat owner should remove them within the specified timeframe. Yet, the additions works of Hung Hom Station of the Mass Transit Railway Corporation Limited (MTRCL) commenced before the approval and consent from the BD were obtained. The BD, however, did not request the MTRCL to carry out the removal works. He opined that the BD had adopted double standards and hoped that the BD would give response to this.

10. Mr KOO Yeung-pong stated that there were many UBW in his constituency area. However, some single-block buildings were served with the removal orders from the BD only after the completion of building maintenance works. The flat owners made enquiries to the BD as to whether the UBW could be removed during the next building maintenance works, but the BD did not permit them to do so. He suggested that the BD should handle this situation flexibly and that the inspections by the consultant companies should be arranged as early as possible, so that the removal orders could be served to the flat owners before the building maintenance works. Besides, some flat owners intended to submit the building plans for protruding window grilles, but the BD advised the flat owners to remove them in the first place because they were considered as UBW and the re-construction works for the window grilles could be carried out after approval was made. He believed that the building structure might be affected due to the alterations and the safety, quality and hygiene of buildings could not be ensured. Moreover, there were many "subdivided flats" in Tsuen Wan which caused the fire safety problem and hygiene problem from misconnection of water pipes. He enquired whether the BD would carry out the monitoring work and he could provide the relevant information. He also enquired whether the BD would launch the new water seepage test in Tsuen Wan district on a pilot basis.

11. Mr LO Siu-kit said under the previous mechanism, once unauthorized and unconsented erection of scaffolding for signboards at the buildings from the BD was detected, the erection works should be suspended upon reporting to the Police.

However, at present, the BD no longer made approval and issued letter of consent, and the responsible persons of the works were only required to submit application of minor works to the BD within seven days after the completion of erection of signboards whereas the owners' corporations (OCs) were unable to stop them from doing so. Yet, the OCs or respective flat owners whom were helpless to pursue litigation against the giant companies erecting the signboards were held responsible for removing the signboards when problem arose. He therefore hoped that the BD would consider whether the prevailing legislation of the signboards was appropriate. Besides, the Operation Building Bright was completed in 2016. Some of the buildings were served with the removal orders from the BD shortly after the maintenance works was completed and the flat owners of these buildings were required to pay the maintenance fee again. He requested the BD to issue the removal orders as early as possible to the buildings in which the maintenance works were about to begin or to issue the removal orders and notices of mandatory window inspection and mandatory building inspection concurrently.

12. Mr CHENG Chit-pun stated that he always sought assistance from the Joint Office for Investigation of Water Seepage Complaints (the "JO") upon receipt of complaints on water seepage of external walls or upper/lower floors of buildings from members of the public. However, many members of the public needed to engage surveyors at their own expense because the JO was unable to find out the source of water seepage due to insufficient humidity. They were in despair and felt helpless because the charge of the test was in general about HK\$20,000. Thus, he enquired the BD about the three pilot areas and the effectiveness of the new water seepage test; and when the BD would extend the new water seepage test to cover Tsuen Wan district.

13. Mr LAM Faat-kang appreciated the BD for benefitting the flat owners through its building maintenance work. The problem of UBW also existed in the villages in his constituency area. He thought that the UBW in villages was a historic problem. Some of the UBW in villages served as the shield from sunlight. Given that the BD had relaxed the policy for the villages to install the solar panels, he opined that the owners of the villages could replace the UBW with the up-to-standard solar panels through alteration works. However, under the prevailing policy, the owners were required to remove the UBW before making application of installation of solar panels. He pointed out that such a practice drained manpower and resources as well as bringing adverse impact to the environment. He hoped that the BD would make arrangements flexibly. Besides, the UBW of village houses included fences which were only 80 cm high in general. It was dangerous for children to climb over the fences. To ensure safety, the owners had already increased the height of the fences to more than one metre; however, the owners were required by the BD to remove the fences. The LandsD also held that the fences should be removed because they were not in compliance with the standards which were set out in the original building plans. He was of the view that the humanitarian approach should be adopted in addressing the said unlawful situations, even so. The Government should also review whether the existing regulations were outdated.

14. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis learnt that many owners of the rooftops made application of installation of solar panels through Feed-in Tariff scheme. She hoped

that the BD would tie in with the scheme as far as practicable and leniently approve the application of installation of solar panels at private areas from owners. She also enquired whether the BD would leniently process the application of installation of large amount of solar panels at communal podiums of different blocks of housing estates. Besides, she enquired whether the water tanks in the water pump rooms of the newly-built premises were in general the concrete water tanks or fibreglass water tanks; and whether the BD stipulated the requirement of submission of building plans for replacement of water tanks in or before 2003; and whether the old building would be required by the BD to replace the fibreglass water tank with the concrete water tank if the concrete water tank of the old building was replaced by the fibreglass water tank in 2003 without submission of building plan to the BD. Moreover, she enquired whether the BD only referred the said situation as that “with imminent danger” and that “without imminent danger”. She learnt from the meeting of the Environmental and Health Affairs Committee that the JO would adopt the new water seepage test during the year. She thus enquired when the new water seepage test would be implemented, and whether maintenance order would be issued and penalty would be imposed after the test.

15. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie said she frequently contacted the JO because there were many old private premises in her constituency area. The blocks of flats of housing estates built in the 1990s had reached 20 to 30 years of age with serious water seepage problem. According to the BD, there were a total of 36 600 water seepage cases as at 2018. Followed by the increase in the number of old buildings, it was believed that the figures on water seepage cases would be on the rise. She was concerned about the improvement initiatives of the BD and hoped that the BD would carry out the investigation of the source of water seepage practicably. She pointed out that the JO usually failed to identify the source of water seepage through colour water test and the flat owners had to engage the surveyors to conduct the tests. Each household was affected by the water seepage for three to four years on average, thereby imposing pressure on the flat owners. Besides, after the mandatory building inspection was conducted, the OCs generally failed to solve the problems about rehabilitation due to the lack of knowledge. Also, disputes among flat owners were caused by the high maintenance cost. Some of the large-scale housing estates would soon be included in the mandatory building inspection due to the building age. To avoid disputes, she hoped that the BD would provide assistance for the OCs of these housing estates proactively.

16. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris stated that it was dangerous when the UBW on rooftops were blown away by typhoon “Mangkhut”, and fortunately, there were no casualties. However, as many residents were worried about the safety problem arising from the UBW, he maintained liaison with the BD in respect of the UBW. Yet, due to the limited law enforcement power and manpower constraints, perhaps, the BD was confined to the issuance of advisory letters and was unable to carry out the practical enforcement actions. As far as he knew, the cases of the UBW had been accumulated for years because it took ten years to carry out the follow-up work after the first advisory letter was issued. He suggested that the BD should enhance its establishment and study the corresponding measures in order to ensure the public safety. He pointed out that the air-conditioners of old premises in urban area and rural area were not equipped with condensation drain pipes. As a result, water

dripping from these air-conditioners had caused the poorer street environment. Even worse, the stream of the condensation water of the air-conditioners flowed down to the ground along the external walls of some of the premises, thereby causing the external walls of these premises to become darkened or bulged. However, the FEHD was not in a position to handle the cases of water dripping from the upper floor units or the cases of water dripping at night time. Therefore, many cases were not successfully prosecuted. He opined that the most effective way was to install the condensation water pipes for the air-conditioners. He also enquired whether the BD had any measure of fostering the flat owners to install the condensation water pipes for the air-conditioners in order to improve the environment. Moreover, compared to the old system, things had improved under the BRAVO (Building Records Access and Viewing On-line); however, the BD still had to process a great deal of clerical duties including issuance of letters, prosecution documents and approval on building plans. He enquired whether the BD had already worked out any solutions to enhance the in-house systems for achieving greater work efficiency; and whether the management and design of the existing premises could be processed by the Building Information Modelling (i.e. the “BIM”).

(Note: The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben joined the meeting at 3:29 p.m.)

17. The Chairman said that on addressing the problem of water seepage and leakage of premises, the BD usually identified the contractors to conduct the tests only after the FEHD conducted the first round of investigation. However, the JO usually failed to identify the source of water seepage and the flat owners had to engage the technical personnel to handle the problem. He thought that the major difference on conducting the investigation of water seepage between the government departments and the surveyors was the Government could exercise the public powers including the request for cooperation from the general public. Although it took longer, the improvement work could be carried out after bringing the people involved to the court upon identification of the source of the water seepage. On the contrary, members of the public were required to pursue litigation through civil proceedings after the surveyors carried out the tests. Therefore, he held that the JO, BD and FEHD should take a leap forward to handle the investigation of water seepage and leakage of premises. Besides, he learnt that members of the public had difficulties in following up the cases by contacting the relevant staff of the BD due to the constraints on its resources and manpower. The BD therefore, in his opinion, should enhance manpower and resources. Moreover, some of the contractors adopted a lax attitude towards the investigation work and thus the noticeable source of water seepage could not be identified. He hoped that the BD would conduct a full review on the management issue of the contractors, adopt the new water seepage test in Tsuen Wan as soon as possible and consolidate the orders of different schemes and programmes.

18. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben pointed out that the division of work in the JO was not clear-cut and the JO was affiliated to the FEHD and BD. He thus enquired which department was the dedicated department. He also hoped that the BD would undertake the task and recruit more professional staff. Currently, the contractors were responsible for carrying out the tests but some of them were underperformed. Also, the contractors adopted the same tests which were ineffective in solving the water seepage problem. Therefore, he suggested that apart from

contractors, the BD should identify the professionals to solve the problem on the spot. Besides, he pointed out that the urban redevelopment was based on its value. He hoped that the BD would keep in view the status of the premises. He was of the view that the status of the premises should qualify as a parameter of redevelopment. For instance, a number of premises in Tsuen Wan district were built with salt water. These premises were prone to the risk of collapse due to the lack of concrete support if they were not redeveloped. He therefore suggested that the BD should set up a database of aged concrete buildings in Hong Kong and should include the premises which lacked concrete support into the redevelopment projects after carrying out the concrete support sampling tests at regular intervals, thereby redefining a more worthwhile meaning of urban renewal

19. Mr CHOW Ping-tim was dissatisfied with the introduction of work by the BD. He had been following up the water seepage problem of the buildings since 1990s. He would have made legislative amendment on his own to solve the problem of water seepage if the two municipal councils were not reorganised. He thought that the Government had all along been postponing the legislative amendment and that the roll-out of some of the water seepage tests which had actually been applied for some time in the three pilot areas represented a setback after the JO was set up more than ten years ago. He thus suggested that the new water seepage test should be implemented in Tsuen Wan or over the territory, instead of designating the three pilot areas. Besides, he opined that the FEHD, not the BD, should undertake the law enforcement and issuance of orders because the BD was not a law enforcement authority which was not in a position to enforce the relevant legislation. Moreover, he was of the view that the system was unsound, and that the seepage problem should be addressed through legislation and at source, instead of depending on the consultant companies to perform the gate-keeping role for the BD. Meanwhile, the BD also set a limit to the quantity of the cases taken up by the consultant companies and it was not value for money. The consultant companies would not proceed to handle more cases after completion of the prescribed quantity of cases out of commercial consideration. As a result, it was ineffective in solving the problem.

20. DB responded as follows:

- (1) he thanked for Members' views and concern about the work of the BD. The BD was pleased to note that Members understood that there was manpower constraint in the BD. The staff of the BD would make every effort to carry out their duties properly and would actively endeavour to seek resources so as to make improvements for the fall-off;
- (2) safety was the major principle for the building standards of all newly-built premises. It was clearly specified in the BD's practice note that the settlement of the nearby buildings should be monitored in the course of construction works or foundation works. The approach to monitoring the settlement included the adoption of experience indicators and engineering analysis. The former which referred to the stipulation of relatively conservative standards according to experiences, and the latter which referred to the analysis and assessment of the impact to the structures on the periphery of the site brought by the whole construction project, configured the upper threshold of settlement. To prevent deterioration of settlement, the

construction works should be suspended when settlement was found and the indicator reached the upper threshold of settlement. Meanwhile, the professionals of the construction site identified the reasons for settlement by conducting assessments and studied the remedial and mitigating measures. The construction works of Tin Wing Stop had been temporarily suspended due to the indicator of settlement edging closer to the upper threshold in May 2018. A careful examination of the real state of the soil on the periphery of the construction site was conducted, with a view to identifying the reasons for settlement, and the mitigating measures and improvement works were drawn up, as well as the consent from the Geotechnical Engineering Office and MTRCL were obtained, before the BD made approval on resumption of construction works of the site in phases recently. In addition, the soil of the construction site should be consolidated before the remaining construction works were carried out. It was manifested that the BD accorded priority to public safety and building safety;

- (3) as the Shatin to Central Link Project was currently under investigation of the Commission of Inquiry, it was inappropriate for the BD to give an account on the details openly. Members might view the result upon completion of the report of investigation;
- (4) the BD had instructed its staff to liaise with the relevant teams and units to learn about the other on-going operations when initiating various large-scale operations, so that the flat owners were able to fulfill the requirements by taking corresponding actions. However, as the target buildings were individually selected on the basis of meeting the pre-set criteria of the respective large operations, some of the flat owners of these buildings were unable to fulfill the requirements by taking corresponding actions concurrently. The BD adopted a risk-based approach to select the target buildings and accorded priority to the high risk buildings. The BD would arrange the target buildings to be concurrently selected for various large-scale operations as far as practicable;
- (5) the subdivision of flats should be handled systemically and orderly. At present, the BD conducted inspections in all the flats in each target building and issued removal orders to the flat owners whose sub-divided flats with irregularities were found;
- (6) in 2012, the Government promulgated the enhanced enforcement strategy for the UBW in the New Territories for ensuring building safety and public safety, acting in accordance with the law, categorisation for control and management, and prioritisation for progressive enforcement to deal with the UBW in phases. The BD would identify the first round targets via village-by-village large operations and carry out immediate enforcement actions against the newly erected UBW;
- (7) the installation of solar panels on the rooftops of village houses in the New Territories meeting the prescribed regulations after removal of UBW thereon was allowed. Also, the installation of solar panels meeting the restrictions on dimensions through minor works by the

- building owners of urban areas was allowed. The consent from the OCs should be obtained before the installation of solar panels at the communal podium of the housing estates;
- (8) the BD made approval on erection of signboards pursuant to the Buildings Ordinance. The BD should approve the application which had met all technical standards and specifications according to the legislation. If the erection of signboards on the communal external walls of the buildings was proposed, the BD would inform the respective OCs or owners' committees when making approval on the building plans. The BD would also inform the respective OCs when issuing the acknowledge letter upon receipt of the application of the minor works of the buildings. The owners and OCs of the buildings were informed of the proposed erection works of signboards through the aforesaid arrangements. The owners and OCs of the buildings might timely follow up the signboard construction works with the proposer of erection of signboards or take corresponding measures of building management through enforcing the deed of mutual covenant of the buildings to address the issues concerned;
 - (9) under the existing minor works monitoring system, the fibreglass water tanks installed by the buildings which did not exceed 9 cubic metres were categorised into minor works with simple application procedures;
 - (10) under the prevailing law enforcement policy, the BD took immediate enforcement actions against the UBW posing imminent danger by issuance of removal orders. The UBW which did not pose imminent danger would be handled according to the circumstances;
 - (11) in view of the 67 000 accumulated removal orders in December 2014, the BD had made efforts to clear these orders through different approaches, including setting up a task force for enhanced prosecution work. In 2018, the BD initiated prosecution for 3 360 cases of non-compliance of removal orders. As at March 2019, the number of the accumulated removal orders had dropped to about 23 000. The BD would continue to make efforts to clear the accumulated cases as early as practicable;
 - (12) the BD provided assistance for flat owners in various aspects, including publishing the pamphlets of the guidelines for flat owners upon receipt of notices of mandatory window inspection. The Government also encouraged the flat owners to carry out the building maintenance through implementing the Operation Building Bright 2.0 in 2018. The flat owners who intended to join the Operation Building Bright 2.0 were advised to participate in the Smart Tender Scheme of the Urban Renewal Authority (URA) through which the professionals provided technical advices with respect to the tender documents for the flat owners or OCs' reference;
 - (13) the URA was mainly responsible for the urban redevelopment work and had established a database of buildings in old areas which contained the records of the status of the buildings in these areas for reference when making decision on implementation of redevelopment projects;

- (14) the BD was aware of the water seepage problems which caused nuisance to the households and urged its staff to handle the cases with empathy. It was also hoped that the problem would be solved by conducting consultancy study on new testing technologies. The BD learnt the public's aspiration; however, as the staff of the JO could only conduct the non-destructive tests, they needed to conduct the tests in the flats of upper floors, whereas the flat owners of upper floors tended to bar the staff of the JO from visits to their flats, with a view to discouraging them from identifying the source of water seepage in their flats. Some of the flat owners even requested the JO to give written notices and brief them on the entire work stream of the tests as well as making guarantee of no damages in their flats. The JO would accede to their requests as far as practicable so as to obtain the consents on the tests from them. If the flat owners were still in-cooperative, the BD would consider applying for warranty of entry for conducting the tests. Amongst those, the colour water test was relatively simple. The staff concerned were only required to pour the colour water into the water outlets and inspect the signs of colour at the respective sites of the flats of lower floors. If no signs of colour was spotted, they would inspect the signs of colour at the respective sites of the flats of lower floors again in a few weeks. In addition, the BD could only conduct the ponding test subject to the time provided by the flat owners because the ponding test involved ponding water for more than one hour and the flat owners usually refused to the conduct of the test on the pretext of the need to use the toilet of the flat by a number of family members within the several hours of test;
- (15) the pilot scheme on new water seepage test was launched in mid-2018 in three pilot areas, namely the Central and Western district, Wanchai and Kowloon City. In 2018, the source of water seepage was identified for 47 out of 56 concluded cases which was a better result, compared to those under the conventional approaches. The source of water seepage was unidentified for nine cases partly because of the BD's investigations blocked by the tiles on the ceilings or serious concrete spalling, or water pipes or kitchen cabinets. The BD was planning to extend the pilot scheme to cover more districts progressively and to cover all districts over the territory ultimately. The BD also adopted the new approach to conduct the tests for the complex cases which were inactive to the conventional tests despite the Tsuen Wan district was not included in the trial points;
- (16) to enhance the one-stop service of the JO and streamline its workflow, the Government had set up a task force with membership comprising of the Food and Health Bureau, Development Bureau (DEVB), FEHD, Water Supplies Department (WSD) and BD to review the operation of the JO with the aim to handle the water seepage problem more effectively and expeditiously;
- (17) as the service level of the consultant companies was of paramount importance, the BD did not only follow the lowest bid wins principle, but also took into account the technicality assessments and past performances of the consultant companies when processing the

tendering exercise. The BD also examined the investigations by consultant companies, including examining the cases through random checks for review of the compliance of technical requirements by consultant companies when carrying out investigations and conducting questionnaire surveys for some cases through making direct enquiries to the users on the duration of stay at the scenes, work details and whether clear explanations were given by the staff of the consultant companies, with a view to making a full assessment on the performance of the consultant companies;

- (18) the BD hoped that the nuisance caused to the households of water seepage cases would be mitigated as soon as possible. However, it became more difficult to carry out investigations because there was more than one source of water seepage or the water seepage was intermittent in some of the cases. As a result, the BD needed to take longer to successfully identify the sources of water seepage; and
- (19) the BD was currently making preparation for submission of building plans of newly-built premises by electronic means. Meanwhile, the BD planned to promulgate the BIM for its future work.

21. The Chairman permitted Mr LO Siu-kit to speak for the second time.

22. Mr LO Siu-kit pointed out that he had mentioned at the meetings of the District Management Committee for many times that the erection of signboards at buildings by stall operators through making application of minor works to the BD only was an unreasonable arrangement; however, the BD did not face up to the question raised by him. The members of the OCs of the affected single-block buildings were mostly the elder people. Once the signboard fell down, they would probably be liable to the legal consequences for the signboard which was not belonged to the building. He urged the BD to keep in view the situation. Besides, there were single-block buildings all over his constituency area and there were only six to ten households in some of the six-storey buildings. The BD did not issue the removal orders for the UBW on rooftops and podiums of the buildings concurrently with the notices of building inspection. The flat owners were required to pay the maintenance and removal fees successively which led to heavy financial burden. He hoped that the in-house coordination of the BD would be achieved for issuance of the notices of building inspection and removal orders concurrently to the flat owners and provision of assistance for the flat owners.

23. The Chairman understood that the staff of the BD had difficulties in entering the flats to conduct the tests, but the source of water seepage should be identified as soon as possible upon successful entry. Besides, he requested the BD to consider the Members' views and duly plan for its future work.

V Item 4: Visit of Director of Lands to Tsuen Wan District Council

24. The Chairman welcomed Mr CHAN Chung-ching, Thomas, DL of the LandsD who visited the TWDC and introduced the work of the LandsD to Members. The other representatives from the LandsD attending the meeting were:

- (1) Miss LO Pui-yiu, Sapphire, District Lands Officer (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing);

- (2) Mr YIM Wai-hung, Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing); and
- (3) Ms LOU Yin-ye, Joanne, Senior Estate Surveyor/Training.

25. DL introduced the work of the LandsD.

26. The Chairman stated that as there were many items on the agenda of this meeting, each Member could only speak once for this item up to 3 minutes.

27. Mr KOO Yeung-pong said that the joint operation of clearance of illegally parked bicycles in Tsuen Wan district had been conducted for a number of times. However, the mechanism on handling the illegally parked bicycles was proved to be unsuccessful. He enquired about the number of cases of illegally parked bicycles under successful prosecutions in the past. In addition, the Buddha statues and memorial tablet of To Tei Kung (the Earth God) were placed underneath the footbridge between Hoi Shing Road and Tai Chung Road and the residents worshipped them from time to time. He stressed that he did not mean to oppose any religious activities, but he held that it was inappropriate to put the religious articles at the said locations. He had lodged complaint to the FEHD but was not entertained. He thus questioned whether the department concerned put aside his complaint due to religious reasons. As there was an increase in the number of these religious articles which had occupied more spaces, he suggested that the department concerned should deal with them as soon as possible. He also enquired whether the LandsD could carry out the land control and enforcement actions in order to follow up on the situation.

(Note: Mr LI Hung-por joined the meeting at 4:29 p.m.)

28. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris stated that nowadays, many new premises were built by the two side of the highways due to the problem of land resources and the residents nearby might be annoyed by the vehicle noise. He opined that the installation of noise barriers was the most effective noise mitigation measure, given that the developers should conduct the noise assessments for the newly-built premises in pursuant to the terms of land lease and should provide the appropriate initiatives such as installation of the fixed windows and acoustic fins in order to prevent the noise level from exceeding the upper limit of 70 decibels (dB); however, on the other hand, a fairly low standard was set for the openable windows in the Buildings Ordinance (Chapter 123) and the windows were normally kept open for occupancy in reality, thereby making the initiatives the passive form of measures without great effect. Based on past experience, it was very difficult to make the Government accede to the request of provision of noise barriers on the periphery of the highways after the completion of the premises. He therefore suggested that the LandsD should require the developers to fulfill the special conditions of land grant in the land lease by providing the noise barriers at the road sections of the highways where the premises were situated when granting the land to the developers. It saved the procedures such as determining the noise indicators by the Legislative Council (LegCo) and making funding applications to the LegCo. Besides, as the developers assessed the profits of the development projects, the cost passed onto flat buyers would probably be lower, even though the developers had included the construction

cost of noise barriers in the tender price for land bidding or passed the cost onto flat buyers during the sale of the properties. It would be favourable for the general public and the residents of the residential properties. He thus enquired the LandsD about the feasibility of requiring the property developers to construct the noise barriers through the special conditions of land grant in the land lease. He opined that by doing so, the residents living by the two sides of the highways could have a livable environment.

29. Mr MAN Yu-ming commended the LandsD for establishing the webpage of Geoinfo Map and VoiceMapHK mobile application, which, in his opinion, brought convenience to the members of the public in entertainment and daily lives. He therefore suggested that the LandsD should continue to provide the said information for the members of the public. Besides, there were land and housing problems in Hong Kong at the moment. There were also many residents of “subdivided units” in Tsuen Wan district. He opined that it would be extremely wasteful if the 37 short-term tenancy (STT) sites remained abandoned and derelict for long. He therefore suggested that the LandsD should make optimal use of the STT sites for construction of transitional housing in collaboration with the relevant departments, with a view to actively responding to the housing demand from the grassroots applicants who were waiting for allocation of public rental housing.

30. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis was concerned about the application of the use for the purpose of care and attention home on part of the 1/F and G/F of the shopping centre of Phase 1 of Allway Gardens. She stated that the residents in the district had raised objection through signature campaign and had expressed their views to the LandsD after the LandsD issued the consultation documents in respect of the application to the district councillors of the constituency areas, OCs of buildings and schools in the district. Recently, she received a letter from the LandsD which was the applicant’s response to the dissenting views. Given that a number of departments had accepted the explanation of the applicant, she was worried that the application was about to be approved. She therefore suggested that this case should be re-examined. She also gave three comments on the response from the applicant. Firstly, the applicant indicated that the application should be accepted because the premises concerned had been used for the purpose of care and attention home in the past. However, she pointed out that in fact, the area of the shopping centre which would be used for the purpose of care and attention home in this application was larger than before. On top of the area which had been used for the purpose of care and attention home in the past, an additional area of about 3 000 square feet on the G/F of the shopping centre was also included. Moreover, the applicant indicated that there were plenty of spaces in the market near Allway Gardens available for use to partly serve for the purpose of community facilities in future. However, she pointed out that the application involved the occupation of a large area of retail shops. If the application was approved, about three quarters of the floor area of the shopping centre would be used for a care and attention home. This would not only reduce the area of the retail shops and thereby worsening the imbalance of the purposes of the retail shops in the shopping centre of Allway Gardens, but also triggered an increase in the rents of other retail shops and thereby bringing an adverse impact on the living of the members of the public. Lastly, the applicant indicated that the laundry house of the applying premises lacked drying service and thus there was no contravention of the

licensing conditions of the Residential Care Homes (Elderly Persons) Ordinance (Chapter 459). However, she stated that she had used the drying service of the laundry house and therefore she opined that the applicant's claims were not true.

31. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie said that the hygiene conditions of numerous temporary fee-paying car parks were poor. Currently, there were temporary fee-paying car parks through STT in the vicinity of the private housing estates at the harbourfront of Tsuen Wan. However, it was always found that there was stagnant water on the ground in these car parks which caused pest and rodent infestation as well as the community hygiene problems. Although the FEHD provided assistance subject to the circumstances, the existing practice of requiring the tenants of the STT to carry out follow-up work in writing was relatively passive. She therefore suggested that the LandsD should stipulate the elementary hygiene standards for compliance of the tenants during the operation of business. In addition, she was concerned about the issue of direct grant of the land of community purpose for construction of transitional housing. The bureau concerned had earlier introduced the relevant project at the meeting of the TWDC. She also consulted the residents on her own and received many dissenting views. She hoped that the Government would carry out the public consultation work for the members of the public to give their views. She did not mean to oppose the provision of transitional housing, but she was of the view that the impact on sewerage discharge, noise and traffic would be brought by the selected site in Tsuen Wan. She thus enquired about the response for the said environmental impacts from the departments concerned and which department would undertake to handle the complaints on sewerage discharge, noise and traffic in future.

32. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly was concerned about the cement plant which had been in operation in the vicinity of Kwok Shui Road for many years. The traffic in Kwok Shui Road was affected by the frequent entry and exit of dump trucks which left much sludge on the ground. The slippery roads triggered traffic accidents and caused noise problem. A number of different private residential buildings were constructed in the vicinity of Kwok Shui Road upon the approval of the Planning Department (PD) and there were village houses around it. The operation of the cement plant had brought the environmental impact to the surrounding areas. According to the terms of land grant, the cement plant would be removed after some years. He thus suggested that the LandsD should consider carrying out measures such as providing the incentives for the move-out of the cement plant. Besides, it was recently relayed by the villagers that many lead granules and plastic granules in the vicinity of Chuen Lung were found. Upon investigation of the media, it was suspected that these granules were the pollutants from the activities held by Hong Kong Gun Club around Tsuen Kam and Chuen Lung. These pollutants affected the ecological environment and might affect the water quality. He thus enquired whether the LandsD had demarcated the restricted zones and stipulated activity details for the organisations of the same type; and whether the penalties for contravention were put in place. Moreover, he pointed out that the placement of skips at the roadside jeopardised the safety of members of the public and road users, and that there were no channels for lodging complaints about the placement of skips at the roadside during holidays. Ironically, the number of prosecution for placement of skips at the roadside was only 17 cases. He thus enquired about the definition of the offence, the reporting channels and the time required for clearance of skips at scene by deployment of staff from the departments concerned.

33. Mr TAM Hoi-pong stated that at present, the trees within ten metres from roadside were managed by the LCSD and the trees beyond ten metres were mostly managed by the LandsD. In the past, the trees felled by typhoons or due to other reasons were always not replanted. He had requested the LandsD to replant the fallen trees but the department concerned refused to do so on the grounds that it was not the tree plantation authority. He therefore hoped that the LandsD would form a tree plantation unit through allocation of resources, etc. so as to duly follow up on the problem of fallen trees. In addition, he was concerned about the land resumption work of Ma Wan Park and Ma Wan Old Village which was spearheaded by the DEVB and implemented by the LandsD. He said that he had time and again enquired about the details of meetings of Ma Wan Park Advisory Committee but no reply was given. He thus enquired about the reasons for the unfinished land resumption work of Ma Wan Old Village which had been under process for more than ten years and about the solutions to the problem. Moreover, the Government had expedited the process of land premium with a view to boosting the land supply; however, it was necessary to re-calculate the land premium for the project if there were changes in, including but not limited to the construction mode, orientation, number of flats and arrangement of big and small flats. He suggested that the calculation of land premium under the terms of land lease should not repetitively proceed; otherwise the resources would be wasted and it did not help expedite the land supply.

34. Mr CHENG Chit-pun said that the temporary car parks in the vicinity of Texaco Road and Wing Shun Street were poorly managed. It was found that some parts of the meshes were damaged and large amount of garbage was created. There were also stagnant water and unpleasant smell after the rain. Starting from May 2018, he had relayed the residents' complaints on the said conditions to the LandsD. As far as he knew, the LandsD had issued a letter to the tenant to carry out the follow-up work. However, the follow-up work waxed and waned. The FEHD was sometimes required to assist in the anti-mosquito and anti-rodent work. He thus enquired the LandsD about the problems encountered when handling the problem concerned. He expected that the departments concerned would keep in view and improve the environment of the temporary car parks.

35. Mr WONG Ka-wa stated that the serious problem of illegal parking was attributed to the inadequate parking spaces in Tsuen Wan district. In particular, the long vehicles such as tourist coaches and dump trucks which were illegally parked at the narrow roadside had brought impact to the traffic. He therefore suggested that the vacant site at Yau Ma Hom Road where the works was completed about one year ago should be used as a temporary car park and the workflow such as tendering should be conducted as soon as possible. Besides, a department had earlier conducted the district-based consultation on the application of planned land use for the two vehicle repair workshops in Kwok Shui Road. The application was finally approved although dissenting views from the housing estates on the periphery and the district councillors of the constituency areas were obtained. The members of the public had no choice but accepted it. Recently, the vehicle repair workshops organised automobile trade shows which caused serious traffic congestion at the road sections nearby and assistance was drawn from the Police to deal with it. He thus enquired whether the vehicle repair workshops had obtained approval for automobile trade. Moreover, the land granted for many villages and buildings would be expired

in 2047 or so. He enquired whether the term of the land lease of these houses would be automatically extended; and alternatively, about the subsequent arrangements for the land lease. He opined that the LandsD should do the planning in advance so as to address the public's concern and handle the relevant problems.

36. Mr LO Siu-kit commended the LandsD and the team of District Lands Office (DLO), Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing for their efforts on land administration. He pointed out that the period of tenancy of the temporary car parks was mostly one year. The tenants were not committed to improving the environment of the temporary car parks because the renewal arrangement of the tenancy was not confirmed. He therefore suggested that the period of tenancy should be extended for requiring the tenants to improve the environment and facilities of the temporary car parks. In addition, he was concerned about the joint operation for illegal structures conducted by the LandsD. He also pointed out that at present, the LandsD should allow the occupants of the illegal structures not less than 24 hours to cease occupying the land by fixing a notice on the illegal structure. However, the days of fixing the notice and carrying out the removal operation were not included. In other words, the occupants were able to make clearance in three days during which the FEHD was unable to handle the illegal structures. For example, the FEHD hardly enforced the law if the illegally built concrete platform was temporarily rectified before the expiry of the specified timeframe. He therefore suggested that the legislative amendment should be made in order to shorten the timeframe for clearance of the illegal structures, so that the joint operations for illegal structures would be carried out more effectively.

37. Mr LAM Faat-kang applauded the team of DDLO, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing for actively following up various land administration work. He said that recently, many small houses in the district were served with the removal orders from the BD; however, the policies of the LandsD and BD were not correspondingly aligned and the residents were confused. He opined that there were many premises with UBW in the New Territories. If the Government adopted a tough stance across-the-board, there would be strong opposition. He also opined that the aim of enacting legislation was to maintain the stability of our society. Hence, the rights of the indigenous villagers should be determined and the legal challenges arising from the measures should be considered. As there was a vast number of UBW cases, he suggested that the LandsD should plan ahead for future needs; handle the matter as soon as possible; and draw reference from the practice of the ICAC in the 1960s which amnesty was granted for the non-compliance cases in the past.

38. DL responded as follows:

- (1) he thanked Members for giving views on the work of the LandsD and their questions and suggestions on district matters;
- (2) the goal of the LandsD was to make better use of the government land as far as practicable. The planning for long-term land use of some of the new town development areas including Tsuen Wan was ready. The LandsD would fully utilise the vacant land for which the form of development was pending within the gap period prior to the development, for example, through letting out the said vacant land at market rents by public tender as the STT temporary car parks, construction of transitional housing, or making it available for the

district organisations or non-governmental organisations to make application of land use for greening and community purpose. Competition for land resources inevitably existed at the district level due to different land uses under planning, including retail shop, market and bazaar purpose as well as the aged home and transitional housing for satisfying the pressing demand. The Government sought to balance the land uses by incorporating the views from the communities, making projection that the tenants of the land together with the project managers were responsive to the aspirations from districts and taking the traffic and environmental factors into account, with a view to pooling the land resources to the purposes that met the needs of our society as a whole;

- (3) it was aware that better state of environment and longer tenancy period of some of the STT sites should be pursued. The managers of the tenancy might not pool resources to improve the environment of the site because the tenancy period of the STT car parks was generally one year for the time being. The LandsD was currently discussing the pilot scheme on mechanical multi-story parking system and prolonging the tenancy period of the STT with the Transport Department, with a view to improving the environment of the STT car parks. According to the STTs, the operators should carry out the management work for the STT sites properly. The LandsD undertook to require the tenants to properly carry out the management work for the state of environmental hygiene of the site and follow up on the complaints concerned. Previously, the LandsD had received comments from the members of the public on the meshes of STT car parks and their overall environment. In the long run, the LandsD would review the terms of the STTs in order to explore the feasibility of requiring the tenants to properly carry out the management work for the state of the STT sites in use, with a view to improving the overall environmental hygiene in the district;
- (4) the major duties of the LandsD included land administration and prevention of illegal occupation or misuse of land. The prevailing Land (Miscellaneous Provisions) Ordinance (Chapter 28) targeted at the prolonged occupation of larger pieces of land and occupation by UBW on government land. According to the aforesaid Ordinance, the LandsD might serve a notice of not less than 24 hours in respect of illegal occupation of unleased land. If the illegal occupation of unleased land persisted, the LandsD might carry out the land control and enforcement actions. The LandsD adopted different approaches to handle the movable objects such as illegally parked bicycles, platforms of retail shops and skips, etc. according to the actual circumstances. The Police might also carry out the enforcement actions and remove the articles according to the Summary Offences Ordinance (Chapter 228) when the articles caused obstructions. The LandsD proposed to follow up on individual complaint cases according to the priority in order to make an all-out effort to address the demand from districts;

- (5) at present, the private land owners or tenants were responsible for the management of the trees on their private land according to the terms of land lease, whereas the relevant departments undertook the daily regular management and maintenance of trees in the public facilities on government land, including roads, parks and community facilities provided by the Government. For instance, the LCSD was responsible for the trees within ten metres from roadside. In addition, there were many unleased or unallocated government land in Hong Kong. Due to the broad expanse of the unleased and unallocated government land which were not in frequent use by the members of the public, the trees in general grew naturally thereon. The LandsD had difficulties in pooling resources to carry out the daily regular maintenance and replanting of trees. Regarding the majority of the complaints on vegetation about the overgrown plantation on unallocated government land, the LandsD would carry out the actions such as removal of trees and maintenance of slopes when necessary, for example, adverse impacts brought by fallen trees to passers-by, landslide from slopes or overgrown weeds, in order to ensure the public safety;
- (6) at present, the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) was dedicated to handle the noise from existing infrastructures. The Environment Bureau had also stipulated the established policies and mechanisms for taking the provision of noise barriers at the existing roads into account. General speaking, noise barriers were not provided exclusively for individual development projects. On development of land, the developers might be required to provide the facilities derived from the development projects as necessary through the terms of land lease. On the other hand, the district-based public facilities such as the roads, sewerage facilities and noise barriers in the district, if needed, should be provided through regular public works programmes for the district;
- (7) regarding the environmental pollution problem which was likely caused by the activities held by the gun club in Tsuen Wan district, the land lease of the gun club was granted by the LandsD. According to the terms of the land lease, the gun club organised the shooting activities within the area of land grant in compliance with the legislation and terms of land lease. The LandsD had learnt about and followed up on the situations with the gun club. It was learnt that two departments, namely, the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department which was duty-bound to enforce the Country Parks Ordinance (Chapter 208) and manage the areas of country parks, and the WSD which was duty-bound to manage water gathering grounds, were involved in this case. It was noted that the departments concerned had followed up on the incident. Besides, the LandsD would seek advice from the relevant departments and tie in with the enforcement actions taken by the departments through enforcing the terms of land lease concurrently;
- (8) according to the Ma Wan development agreement signed by the Government and the developer of Ma Wan Park, the developer was

required to develop Ma Wan Park in phases, including Phase 1 of Ma Wan Park which was completed and Phase 2 of Ma Wan Park which was under planning. Currently, the planning permission of Ma Wan Park had already been extended to 2022. The LandsD would continue to discuss and follow up on the development status with the developer. It was hoped that the development project of phase 2 of Ma Wan Park would be implemented as soon as possible. The Lands D would report the progress or the project concerned to the district councils (DCs);

- (9) the LandsD had all along been making endeavour to expediting the process of land premium,eliminating the unnecessary amendments to land lease and re-calculation of land premium. However, it was stressed that the terms of the existing land lease should be treated with respect and the procedures of amendments to and deliberations of the land lease should be activated, with a view to safeguarding the public interests and ensuring the use of public funds in a reasonable manner;
- (10) the illegal structures of the small houses in the New Territories fell within the purview of the enforcement work of the BD. It was noted that the BD had implemented the registration system and would carry out the enforcement actions according to the nature and severity of the illegal structures with priority. The LandsD would tie in with the work of the BD by carrying out the land and enforcement actions in relation to the terms of land lease;
- (11) the DEVB had make clarification of the untrue claim that all the land leases would be expired in 2047. In general, the land leases had a term of 50 years. Therefore, the Government had granted land with a term beyond 2047, and the lease extensions or new leases of land granted by the Government since 1997 had obviously gone beyond 2047. The LandsD would carry out the work for renewal of land leases as always according to the policies of renewal of land leases as appropriate; and
- (12) as for the individual cases put forth by Members including the placement of religious articles underneath the footbridge at Tai Chung Road, the application from the retail shops in Allway Gardens for purpose of care and attention home, the impact brought by the vehicle repair workshops and cement plant at Kwok Shui Road as well as the proposal on the temporary car park at the STT site of Yau Ma Hom Road would be recorded by the LandsD and followed up and reverted to the Members concerned by theDLO, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing.

39. The Chairman requested the LandsD to note and follow up on Members' views and continue to make concerted efforts with the Members.

40. As the Chairman was required to take up other urgent matters, the meeting would be temporarily chaired by the Vice Chairman.

VI Item 5: 2019/20 Work Plan of the Independent Commission Against Corruption (ICAC) Regional Office (New Territories South West)
(TWDC Paper No. 4/2019)

41. The Acting Chairman stated that the ICAC Regional Office (New Territories South West) introduced its work plan to Members every year. The representatives from the ICAC attending the meeting were:

- (1) Ms Jodi LEUNG, Regional Officer of New Territories West (RONTW);
and
- (2) Ms Rita IP Sau-hing, Senior Community Relations Officer, ICAC Regional Office (New Territories South West).

42. RONTW of the ICAC introduced the key features of the work plan of the ICAC Regional Office (New Territories South West) for the current year, including the consolidation of the culture of clean election, enhanced anti-corruption education for the grassroots and building management. She invited the TWDC to co-organise the probity activity for Tsuen Wan district through “Support Clean Election” programme in 2019/20 with the ICAC Regional Office (New Territories South West).

43. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis supported the work of the ICAC. In her experience, many people, who depended on someone else to report corruption, were unwilling to do so. However, the ICAC Annual Survey 2018 revealed that 81.7% of the respondents were willing to report corruption. She enquired about the method of sampling of the survey. In addition, she thanked the ICAC for paying attention to the situation of building management in recent years and enquired about the details of the complaints of corruption in building management in relation to private organisations which accounted for 38% in the corruption risk assessment.

44. Mr LO Siu-kit thought that the commitment of the ICAC was manifested in the result of zero election-related corruption case in Tsuen Wan district. He enquired about the details of the complaints of corruption in building management in relation to private organisations which accounted for 38% in the corruption risk assessment. In addition, he learnt that many people lodged complaints of suspected corruption problems in building management to the ICAC but many cases of complaints were withdrawn due to insufficient evidence. He enquired the ICAC about the number of substantiated cases of complaints of corruption in building management ultimately and the triage of the corruption cases to the ICAC or HKPF.

45. RONTW of the ICAC responded as follows:

- (1) the ICAC engaged an independent research institute every year to conduct a territory-wide annual survey. The research institute conducted the survey by random selection according to the household information provided by the Census and Statistics Department instead of districts by demarcation. The findings of the survey on the number of people who indicated that they had not come across corruption or the number of people who were willing to report corruption were the statistics worked out through collection of figures in an impartial manner;
- (2) 81.7% of the respondents of the ICAC Annual Survey 2018 indicated that they would report corruption. It revealed that a high level of

probity was persistently maintained in Hong Kong and the integrity culture was deeply rooted in Hong Kong;

- (3) 66% of the complaint cases received by the ICAC in 2018 was related to the private organisations, in which 38% was the complaint cases of building management that was comparable to the rates in the past few years;
- (4) building management which involved the maintenance and daily management of buildings was closely related to the daily life of the general public, and therefore, more reports would be received. There was only a small number of substantiated corruption cases upon investigator in spite of the considerable number of complaints. After all, there were individual cases that involved corruption. For example, the ICAC had earlier successfully incriminated the offenders of a bid-rigging case involving corruption before the court of justice;
- (5) Members could encourage the members of the public to report the suspected corruption cases to the ICAC and provide the relevant information for the ICAC to conduct investigations; and
- (6) the ICAC was responsible for dealing with corruption cases. It was a bribery if the agent accepted advantage without the prior permission of his principal and conducted his principal's affairs or business, such as granting works contract. The offeror of the advantage was also guilty of bribery. The ICAC would deal with the building management problems involving the bribery in accordance with the law. On the other hand, the Police was responsible for dealing with the cases involving other offences, such as criminal intimidation.

46. The Acting Chairman asked if Members agreed that the TWDC would co-organise a series of probity activities of "Support Clean Election" programme in 2019/20 for the district with the ICAC till September 2019 or before the commencement of cooling-off period of the District Council Elections, whichever was earlier.

47. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC would co-organise a series of probity activities of "Support Clean Election" programme in 2019/20 for the district with the ICAC till September 2019 or before the commencement of cooling-off period of the District Council Elections, whichever was earlier.

48. The Chairman resumed the chair.

VII Item 6: Briefing on "Lift Modernisation Subsidy Scheme"
(TWDC Paper No. 5/2019)

49. The Chairman stated that the URA submitted the paper for introduction of the Lift Modernisation Subsidy Scheme (the "LIMSS"). The representatives from the departments attending the meeting were:

- (1) Mr Patrick LAU, Senior Manager, Building Rehabilitation, URA;
- (2) Mr SO Ngai-long, Senior Manager, Community Development, URA;
- (3) Mr CHAN Chi-wai, Acting Senior Engineer/General Legislation 5 (SE/GL5(Atg)), Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (EMSD); and
- (4) Mr TSE Man-ho, Charles, Engineer/General Legislation 5/2 (E/GL5/2), EMSD.

50. SE/GL5(Atg) and E/GL5/2 of the EMSD together with Senior Manager, Building Rehabilitation of the URA introduced the paper.

51. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris said that residents of his constituency area were looking forward to the implementation of the LIMSS for enhancement of the safety of the lifts. Hong Kong Garden consisted of 28 blocks and the size of domestic units ranged from 350 square feet to 1 382 square feet. He enquired whether the annual average rateable value (the "ARV") of domestic units in Hong Kong Garden was within the limit prescribed under the LIMSS. If so, in view of the fact that individual blocks in Hong Kong Garden were financially independent of each other, residents living in blocks with annual ARV not exceeding the prescribed limit would be worried that this might render them ineligible for subsidy under the Scheme. As such, he enquired whether application could be made by one of the blocks in Hong Kong Garden if the annual ARV of the domestic units therein did not exceed the prescribed limit under the Scheme.

52. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben said that he had time and again requested the Government to launch a similar lift subsidy scheme upon occurrence of the lift incidents at Waterside Plaza. Given the large number of old buildings in Tsuen Wan district, he believed that the LIMSS could speed up the modernisation of existing lifts. He noted that the LIMSS applicants might opt for tender documents prepared by the URA's consultant other than the e-tendering platform under the "Smart Tender". He was of the view that this was a sign of progress because the URA could directly monitor the performance of its consultants for timely detection of potential problems, which would in turn help prevent bid-rigging. It was hoped that likewise, this practice could be adopted for building maintenance works. On the other hand, he was concerned about the availability of manpower in the lift industry. He was worried that the number of lift modernisation works might fall short of the expectation of the public due to a shortage of manpower during the implementation of the LIMSS. Therefore, he enquired about the support measures to be adopted by the department concerned to facilitate the implementation of the LIMSS.

53. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis expressed concern over the buildings of almost 40 years of age given the coincidental occurrence of several lift breakdowns at Allway Gardens and the lift accidents at Waterside Plaza. Apart from Allway Gardens, two other housing estates in her constituency area might be eligible for the LIMSS; nevertheless, she had not been informed of the intentions of the relevant OCs to participate in the Scheme yet. To assess its popularity, she wished to know how many buildings in Tsuen Wan district eligible for the LIMSS belonged to large housing estates and how many applications from the building had been received by the URA so far. She also enquired about the circumstances under which the Government would mandate either lift replacement or retrofitting of safety devices and the conduct of associated works in residential buildings.

54. Mr LO Siu-kit thanked the department concerned for acceding to his request for providing free consultancy services to the LIMSS applicants. He also enquired whether successful applicants who opted for free consultancy services provided by the URA could simply engage contractors through tender instead of hiring their own consultants, and the URA would undertake for works acceptance testing thereafter.

If so, he thought that it was desirable. In the light that there would be two rounds of application under the Government's HK\$2.5 billion LIMSS, he enquired the URA whether the Scheme would be terminated upon exhaustion of funds. If this was the case, he opined that the URA should timely seek additional funding from the Government for extending the validity period of the Scheme, so as to enhance the safety of the lifts. He learnt that the URA adopted the lowest conforming quotation as a yardstick for determining the level of subsidies payable to eligible applicants. He hoped that the URA would clarify the method of calculating subsidy. He pointed out that upon receipt of tender proposals, an OC might accept a higher conforming quotation having regard to the word of mouth enjoyed by the tenderers. He held that the URA should determine the level of subsidy based on the quotation accepted by the OC. Besides, electricity companies also provided subsidies for owners to carry out building services improvement works, so as to enhance the energy efficiency performance of their buildings. He was of the view that building owners should be allowed to receive subsidies from the URA and electricity companies for the implementation of lift modernisation works and other building services improvement works respectively.

55. Mr KOO Yeung-pong welcomed the LIMSS. Despite that he had organised a briefing session on the LIMSS for members of the public, quite many people still did not have a clear understanding of the scheme details. In this regard, he requested the URA to provide the relevant information, including the eligibility criteria and subsidy entitlements, how to assess the lift replacement or retrofitting of safety devices to the existing lifts as well as the reasonableness of the contractors' quotations, etc. While the replacement of a lift cost nearly HK\$1 million, eligible LIMSS applicants would receive subsidy capped at HK\$500,000 per lift. Therefore, he also hoped that the URA would keep owners of single-block buildings better informed because they had to share the remaining expenses so incurred. Given that the majority of owners of buildings aged 50 years were the elder people, he hoped that further assistance would be provided for the owner's committees of these buildings in completing the application forms. He also hoped that the URA would provide project evaluation guidelines with respect to the costs and quality of deliverables, etc.

56. Regarding the retrofitting of essential safety devices as stated in paragraph 5(a)(i) of the paper, the Chairman enquired the EMSD whether it implied that such safety devices were universally applicable to the lifts of different brands, thus contributing to a better understanding of whether or not these essential safety devices could be installed in aged lifts with ease, so that owners could make an informed decision about when making a choice between lift replacement or retrofitting of essential safety devices to the existing lifts.

57. E/GL5/2 of the EMSD responded as follows:

- (1) the Government had mandated the retrofitting of four essential safety devices to aged lifts in different periods of time, namely the advanced car door mechanical lock and door safety edge for lifts installed after 1984, the double brake system for lifts installed after 2002, the ascending car overspeed protection device for lifts installed after 2003 and the unintended car movement protection device on the brake system for lifts installed after 2007;

- (2) in general, there should not be any problem in retrofitting the four essential safety devices in aged lifts, which might involve the replacement of certain parts additionally. Given the relatively compact size of the equipment in the machine room of a modern lift, spatial constraint should not be a key consideration; and
- (3) as a monitoring body, the EMSD recommended that if the financial situation permitted, the relevant building owners might consider joining the LIMSS for replacement of the entire lift, so as to fully enhance the safety of lifts.

58. SE/GL5(Atg) of the EMSD responded that the EMSD had fully communicated with the industry on the LIMSS at the design stage. After taking into account the manpower and capacity of the industry, the EMSD had decided that the Scheme would be rolled out in phases over six years, whereby subsidies would be granted for the modernisation of 600 lifts in the first year up to 900 lifts per year thereafter. Upon completion of the lift modernisation works, the comprehensive safety inspections should be conducted by registered lift engineers before the issuance of Resumption Permits by the EMSD. Besides, the relevant lift maintenance contractors were required to keep records of information on safety devices installed in the lifts maintained by them. The owners might contact their contractors for details and discussion.

59. Senior Manager, Building Rehabilitation of the URA responded as follows:
- (1) upon receipt of the enquiry on the annual ARV of domestic units in Hong Kong Garden, the URA had referred the case to the Rating and Valuation Department for following up, and a reply would be given as soon as possible;
 - (2) taking Hong Kong Garden as an example, the URA would regard the entire housing estate as the unit of application;
 - (3) about 130 buildings, including single-block buildings and large housing estates, in Tsuen Wan district were eligible for the LIMSS;
 - (4) as far as technical support was concerned, a consultant would be assigned to advise the applicant free of charge. The consultant would liaise with the lift maintenance contractor for working out possible options on the necessary devices to be installed in the lift with estimated cost so that owners could make an informed choice, and would also assist in tender preparation and the conduct of tender exercise and oversee the implementation of the project. However, it was up to the owners to decide which contractor would be selected;
 - (5) on the other hand, owners might engage its own consultant to perform the same duties of the free consultant by using the standard template of tender documents prepared by the URA;
 - (6) while the lowest conforming quotation was used as the basis for calculation for the time being, the URA would review whether this standard would still be adopted;
 - (7) the URA considered that there should not be duplication of funding for the same project, but intended to grant subsidies to owners who met the eligibility criteria;
 - (8) after drawing reference from the existing “Operation Building Bright 2.0 Scheme” and “Fire Safety Improvement Works Subsidy Scheme”,

the URA had simplified the application formalities of the Scheme wherever possible. Apart from on-line application, a video on how to complete the application form was available on the URA website. Owners were also welcome to visit the URA office in person, and its staff would be glad to offer assistance in completing the application forms; and

- (9) the URA would make continued efforts to publicise the Scheme, including sending staff to brief various DCs on the scheme details, with a view to encouraging the eligible building owners to submit applications.

60. Mr CHOW Ping-tim said that upon assessment, Riviera Gardens in his constituency had decided not to join the Scheme at the outset because the owners should pay several hundred thousand Hong Kong dollars personally, representing a commitment of HK\$40 million from the entire housing estate under the Scheme. He opined that old buildings might join the Scheme despite that the subsidies would not be sufficient to meet the needs of large housing estates. Even if the replacement of lift was more cost-effective than the retrofitting of the four essential safety devices, the replacement cost at about HK\$2 million was very expensive indeed. He thought that the subsidy capped at HK\$500,000 per lift was simply insufficient to incentivise the participation of large housing estates in the Scheme, not to mention other buildings. He pointed out that many building owners were not sure about their eligibility in the Scheme because the ARV of all domestic units in the buildings concerned in 2017/18 were close to the maximum value. Moreover, tens of millions of Hong Kong dollars were spent only for prevention of potential accidents in the buildings. The lift accidents at Waterside Plaza, even so in old buildings, did not mean the same problematic result of the lifts of all the other buildings. He urged the Government to adopt a pragmatic approach in the design of the Scheme with the relaxation of eligibility criteria, so as to incentivise owners to submit applications.

61. Mr LI Hung-por said that lift modernisation works had been carried out in his housing estate, whereby conventional lifts had been converted into lifts powered by regenerative drives. Given that such accidents of people being trapped in lifts in the housing estate rarely occurred, and coupled with the fact that the lift powered by regenerative drives had achieved better performance stability, under this background, if it was proposed that owners were to share the expenses after deducting the subsidy for modernising the lifts again, the owners might think that the OC attempted to reap benefits from such works. Therefore, upon discussion, the OC of the housing estate concerned had decided not to retrofit any of the safety devices recommended by the Scheme.

62. SE/GL5(Atg) of the EMSD responded as follows:

- (1) as at end of May 2019, the URA had received more than 80 applications, involving about 500 lifts. It was considered that some progress had been made. It was expected that more applications would be received before the closing date; and
- (2) lift regenerative drive was a relatively new and reliable technology. However, the relatively conventional drive installations were still adopted for some existing lifts which had never been modernised. The EMSD wished to adopt the principle with a risk-based approach in prioritising the grant of LIMSS subsidies to the buildings in need.

63. Senior Manager, Building Rehabilitation of the URA responded that the URA intended to send staff to the housing estates or buildings to brief the owners, OCs and owners' committees on the LIMSS, so that they could have a better understanding of the benefits of the Scheme and decide whether they would join the Scheme or not.

64. The Chairman requested the URA and EMSD to consider Members' views. Members might directly contact the departments concerned if necessary.

65. The Chairman said that due to the time bound simultaneous interpretation service, the meeting would proceed with the discussion of items 15 and 16 first.

VIII Item 15: Crime Brief for Tsuen Wan District – Comparison of Crime Statistics between March to April 2019 and March to April 2018
(TWDC Paper No. 14/2019)

66. District Commander (Tsuen Wan) (DC(TW)) of the HKPF reported on the situation of the crimes in Tsuen Wan district.

67. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie said that the monthly rent for a parking space of Ocean Supreme was currently about HK\$5,500. Many people thought that it was too expensive and opted to park their vehicles illegally, thereby probable to affect the nearby minibus station. She had submitted an improvement proposal on the aforesaid problem to the TD but was not accepted. Hence, she hoped that the Police would enhance the law enforcement action to minimise the traffic impact brought by the illegally parked vehicles. Also, many new residents in Tsuen Wan were worried about the two robberies which happened in one day on 20 April 2019. She hoped that the Police would strengthen the law enforcement so as to restore public confidence in law and order of Tsuen Wan district.

(Note: Mr LI Hung-por left the meeting at 6:33 p.m.)

68. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis stated that the Police gained appreciation from the members of the public for setting up more road blocks to intercept the illegal road racing at Route Twisk. She hoped that the Police would keep up its work before the ultimate solution for the problem came up. Besides, she received a number of suspicious telephone deception calls during March and April 2019, but there was a decreasing trend in the number of telephone deception in the crime brief. It was believed that it was due to no reports from the general public for the time being. She hoped that the Police would pay attention to this.

69. Mr CHOW Ping-tim said that the illegally parked vehicles were always found in Hoi Pa Street near Tai Chung Road, Chung On Street, Tsuen Wing Street, Tsuen Wah Street and Yeung Uk Road. The problem of illegal parking was not solved even though the Police had issued the tickets persistently. He hoped that the Police would step up the relevant work. In addition, he enquired about the types of burglary cases in the crime brief and hoped that the Police would pay more attention to the vice crimes and criminal damage cases which were also on the rise when compared to the figures of the same period last year. He also enquired the Police about the priority of handling different types of cases. He opined that the illegal gambling in public housing estates and shop front extensions were left unhandled whilst the on-street promotional recording cases were under process.

70. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael stated that Mei Wan Street was originally marked with single yellow line where the vehicles were allowed to leave shortly after

pick-up/drop-off. Subsequently, part of the carriageway of Mei Wan Street was marked with double yellow lines by the TD for prevention of illegal parking. However, illegal parking was still spotted due to the lack of law enforcement action. As a result, some of the upcoming vehicles had to stop in the middle of the carriageway for pick-up/drop-off which went against the intended purpose of marking double yellow lines. He hoped that the Police would enhance the law enforcement, particularly during the period of 2:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m. on Saturdays and Sundays.

71. Mr WONG Ka-wa thanked the Police for taking actions against the illegal gambling in Lei Muk Shue Estate. He hoped that the Police would conduct the blitz operations so as to solve the problem of illegal gambling which was found next to the kindergarten in Lei Muk Shue Estate.

72. Mr LO Siu-kit stated that he would maintain liaison with the Police and the Police Community Relations Unit as well as providing the relevant crime information for the Police to take corresponding actions as soon as possible. He thanked the Police for making arrests of some of the people who operated illegal mahjong parlours in Tsuen Wan district in May 2019 and making arrests of the holders of Two-Way Exit Permits who were involved in prostitution in collaboration with the Immigration Department. He learnt that the Police had issued 10 000 tickets for illegal parking monthly on average which indicated a heavy workload. He thus suggested that the Police should enhance the manpower to handle the problem of illegal parking which posed dangers on the roads marked with single yellow line and double yellow lines. Besides, many vehicles made U-turns which posed dangers at the section with double white lines of Sai Lau Kok Road with heavy traffic flow. He hoped that the Police would pay more attention to this.

73. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris thanked the Police for assisting in combating the illegal road racing and the problem of vehicle modification. However, the residents were still suffering from sleep deprivation due to the noise generated from the vehicles involved in illegal road racing and vehicle modification. He hoped that the Police would step up the relevant actions. He pointed out that the bus stops and lay-bys off Lido Garden in Castle Peak Road – Sham Tseng Section were always occupied by the illegally parked vehicles. As a result, the buses and minibuses had to stop at the carriageway on the right for pick-up/drop-off and it was very dangerous. Upon arrival of the police officers after receipt of complaints, they generally issued verbal warnings only to the illegally parked vehicles at the said bus stops and lay-bys. Those illegally parked vehicles usually left before the police officers issued the tickets. He opined that verbal warnings lacked deterrent effect and he urged the Police to handle the problem actively.

74. DC(TW) of the HKPF responded as follows:

- (1) there was a serious problem of illegal parking due to insufficient parking spaces in Tsuen Wan. The HKPF carried out the law enforcement actions on traffic offences almost every day and would conduct the joint operations with the Regional Traffic from time to time. Besides, the HKPF would deploy the mobile video teams to take law enforcement actions and would directly send the tickets to the addresses of the registered vehicle owners after the mobile video teams

- took videos of the information of the vehicles in breach of traffic regulations. By doing so, it was not necessary to deploy the police officers to handle the illegally parked vehicles at the scene;
- (2) as the suspect was believed to be the same person who was involved in the two robberies taking place within a short period of time, the HKPF started the investigation promptly and arrested the suspect successfully within 24 hours. The arrested person was currently under detention in prison, pending for the trial;
 - (3) it was worth drawing attention to the deception cases which was under a decreasing trend. The HKPF believed that publicity and education were essential to prevention of deception cases, and that greater potential threats were posed to the elder people who were likely the victims of deception cases. In this connection, the HKPF arranged the members of Senior Police Call to carry out promotion on crime prevention through the senior companionship for attaining desirable results. As the summer vacation was approaching, the HKPF would also arrange the members of Junior Police Call to carry out promotion on crime prevention through the youth companionship for prevention of falling prey to employment traps and pecuniary losses;
 - (4) the HKPF was concerned about the problem of burglary and would spare no effort to handle burglary cases by taking appropriate measures. The burglars were believed to commit crimes in general every day or burgle in a number of premises in a day. Therefore, the number of burglary cases dropped significantly when the HKPF arrested only one suspect of the burglary case;
 - (5) most of the criminal damage cases involved splashing of paint in the public housing estates. In the past few months, the HKPF had successfully cracked down a considerable number of such cases and the relevant figures would be reported in the next crime brief. The HKPF would maintain close liaison with the management offices of the public housing estates to look for the clues from the closed circuit television footages shortly after the cases happened;
 - (6) illegal gambling was a social problem in all districts. The elder people were usually involved in illegal gambling. The HKPF would continue to take combating actions against illegal gambling and would deal with all the organised or controlled gambling activities; and
 - (7) the HKPF thanked the Members for maintaining collaboration with the Police to achieve the goal of detection of crimes by the Police through providing the Police Community Relations Officers with the information of the vice crimes and the problem of illegal gambling in Tsuen Wan district. It was hoped that the Members would continue to maintain communication with the HKPF.

75. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie stated that there was a serious problem of illegal parking in the areas such as the slope beside Tsuen Wan West Sports Centre, the roundabout off Bayview Garden, the areas off Serenade Cove, the carriageways around City Point, Wing Tak Street, Wing Shun Street and Hoi Kwai Road. She hoped that the Police would enhance the law enforcement. Also, she received a sexual harassment incoming call last Friday and reported to the Police. She hoped that the Police would arrest the people involved as soon as possible.

76. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael requested the Police to step up its efforts to ticket the illegally parked vehicles in Mei Wan Street from 2 p.m. to 6 p.m. on Saturdays and Sundays. He also enquired whether the mobile video teams of the Police would be stationed at Mei Wan Street during the said period.

77. Mr CHOW Ping-tim said that the Police generally advised the illegally parked commercial vehicles to leave and only issued tickets to the illegally parked private vehicles. He opined that the law enforcement was not conducted in a fair and impartial manner. He hoped that the Police would take law enforcement actions fairly and impartially against all the illegally parked vehicles which had seriously blocked the traffic flow, instead of being selective in taking law enforcement actions. In addition, the problem of illegal parking was not solved even though restricted zones were designated in some areas. He hoped that the Police would handle this problem seriously.

78. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris learnt that the Police took combating actions against speeding on Castle Peak Road and Tuen Mun Road on a regular basis in order to monitor the situation. He enquired whether the combating actions were conducted consistently. Besides, he enquired whether the mobile video teams of the Police would be stationed at the bus stops and lay-bys in front of Lido Garden. If the mobile video teams would be stationed at these spots, he would disseminate the relevant information to the residents in order to minimise the chance of illegal parking by the residents in the vicinity.

79. DC(TW) of the HKPF responded as follows:

- (1) the HKPF noted the Members' request for enhanced law enforcement actions on traffic offences at the sites in question and there was sufficient manpower for handling the problem of illegal parking. Under certain circumstances, the mobile video teams of the HKPF would take videos of the information of vehicles breaching traffic regulations and directly send the tickets to the vehicle owners. By doing so, it was not necessary to deploy the police officers to handle the vehicles breaching traffic regulations at the scene;
- (2) the HKPF was currently carrying out investigation of the aforesaid sexual harassment case of the Member;
- (3) the aim of taking law enforcement actions on traffic offences was to prevent the improper behaviours of road users. During execution of duty, the police officers would make reasonable judgments to prosecute all unlawful road users and would exercise discretion according to individual circumstances. The police officers generally advised the motorists who stayed in the illegally parked vehicles, if any, to drive the vehicles away. The police officers would issue the tickets to the vehicle owners if the motorists failed to comply with the advice from the police officers. No one was above the law. The police officers should never take law enforcement actions against any selected individuals. Anyone who contravened the traffic legislation might be ticketed;

- (4) the traffic police accorded priority to ensuring road safety. Therefore, the Traffic New Territories South would deploy the police officers to conduct the law enforcement actions and education work regularly. Due to the unavailability of resources for dealing with illegal road racing on highways in Tsuen Wan Police District, the Traffic New Territories South was responsible for the combating actions of speeding, illegal road racing, illegal vehicle modification and non-compliance of traffic legislation by vehicles. In 2018, the Traffic New Territories South successfully detected over 20 000 vehicles of speeding, impounded 858 vehicles for examination, referred about 2 000 vehicles to the TD for call-up inspections and prosecuted about 500 persons who contravened the traffic legislation in Tsuen Wan district. In the past six months, the HKPF carried out a total of 13 operations in Tuen Mun Road and issued 290 fixed penalty notices (FPNs); and carried out one operation in Tsuen Wan Road and arrested one motorist who committed speeding; and carried out two operations in Castle Peak Road and issued 54 FPNs;
- (5) in two to three weeks after a Member played a footage of speeding at the last full council meeting, a similar footage was found on the internet. The police officers of the Traffic Branch Headquarters looked for useful clues from the footage and arrested three males and detained two vehicles involved in the case. It was manifested that the HKPF would handle the information provided by the Members seriously; and
- (6) the HKPF was currently unable to provide the figures on law enforcement actions at the bus stops and lay-bys conducted by the mobile video teams. Yet, the HKPF would provide the relevant figures in the next crime brief. Also, Members could contact the HKPF to obtain the relevant figures.

80. The Chairman requested the Police to keep up its efforts to handle the matters of concern from Members.

IX Item 16: Crime Brief for Ma Wan – March to April 2019
(TWDC Paper No. 15/2019)

81. DC(TW) of the HKPF reported on the situation of the crimes in Ma Wan.

82. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said that private vehicles and taxis were prohibited from entering some of the roads in Ma Wan. Recently, however, many taxis had entered the restricted zones for a number of times in the past few months. He hoped that the Police would increase the intervals and frequencies of patrols in order to prevent the recurrence of similar incidents.

83. DC(TW) of the HKPF stated that he would forward the Member's views to the officers concerned.

84. As the Chairman was required to take up other urgent matters, the meeting would be temporarily chaired by the Vice Chairman.

X Item 7: Revitalising Historic Buildings Through Partnership Scheme – Fong Yuen Study Hall and Homi Villa
(TWDC Paper No. 6/2019)

85. The Acting Chairman stated that the DEVB submitted the paper for introduction of the revitalisation of Historic Buildings Through Partnership Scheme – Fong Yuen Study Hall and Homi Villa (commonly known as the “White Chamber”). The representatives from the bureau and committee attending the meeting were:

- (1) Professor LAU Chi-pang, Chairman, Advisory Committee on Built Heritage Conservation (ACBHC);
- (2) Mr LEE Hong-nin, Robin, Chief Assistant Secretary (Works) 2 (CAS(W)2), DEVB;
- (3) Mr CHAN Wai-kin, Raymond, Project Manager (Heritage Conservation) 1, DEVB; and
- (4) Mr CHAN Chun-hin, Kevin, Assistant Project Manager (Heritage Conservation) 2, DEVB.

86. CAS(W)2 of the DEVB introduced the paper.

87. Mr TAM Hoi-pong was delighted to learn that Fong Yuen Study Hall was once again included in the Revitalising Historic Buildings Through Partnership Scheme (the “Revitalisation Scheme”). In the past, the Yuen Yuen Institute had operated Fong Yuen Study Hall and subsequently returned it to the Government due to poor operating conditions. He had visited Fong Yuen Study Hall for a number of times and organised guided tours to Fong Yuen Study Hall. In view of the positive nature of this project, he would like to comment on its adaptive re-use. First of all, he suggested that the non-profit-making organisations should connect Fong Yuen Study Hall and other monuments near Ma Wan Old Village as well as planning the guided tours. Besides, as Fong Yuen Study Hall was built on stable and strong soils, it was suggested that reinforcement works for the upper level should be carried out in order to facilitate the access of visitors to the rooftop, so that they could appreciate the beautiful scenery in the open air. Moreover, it was necessary to attract visitors to the revitalised Fong Yuen Study Hall in order to alleviate the possible operational difficulties. In addition, he enquired about the feasibility of the revitalisation project and he was worried that there were other difficulties in the course of implementation of the revitalisation project.

88. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie supported the captioned two revitalisation projects. She was concerned about how to attract tourists and group visits of students to the revitalised historic buildings. She opined that the planning philosophy of the non-profit-making organisations was the key to the success in view of the possible implications on the provision of software facilities. Given the remoteness of Ma Wan and inadequacy of the transport network, she suggested that various monuments in Ma Wan should connect with each other and electronic tour guide equipment should be provided, so as to enhance the interest of the tourists and group visits from organisations such as schools. While envisaging few tender proposals from the non-profit-making organisations, she suggested that prudence should still be exercised in selection of partner organisations, with a view to attracting the tourists to pay visits frequently.

89. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that despite the pleasant and tranquil setting in the vicinity of the White Chamber, the existing public facilities such as toilets might not be able to cope with the demand from a large number of tourists. Therefore, he did not recommend for the development of the White Chamber into a scenic spot through planning. Instead, he suggested that the White Chamber should be developed into an exhibition gallery cum café through planning and the history and heritage of Tsuen Wan district and Ma Wan should be showcased through better use of information technology, e.g. the display of photos of the old and new Tsuen Wan on a giant screen, so that the next generation could have a better understanding of the history of Tsuen Wan district.

90. Mr LO Siu-kit stated that he had visited Fong Yuen Study Hall which, in his opinion, was inaccessible. Visitors could hardly notice the secluded building. Moreover, it was difficult to attract visitors to the less spacious venue with a small collection size even though guided tours were readily available. He proposed to set up restaurants and souvenir shop that offered distinctive items for sale under the revitalisation project in order to encourage tourists to stay longer. Besides, he had also visited the White Chamber. He opined that despite its remoteness, parking spaces were provided in the relatively spacious White Chamber that commanded a view of the enchanting landscape day and night. Therefore, it was suggested that speciality restaurants with painting murals should be set up to showcase the monuments in Tsuen Wan district in order to boost the patronage.

91. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben supported the revitalisation of the White Chamber which commanded a view of its beautiful surroundings. As the exhibition on the Airport Core Programme completed nearly 20 years ago was not attractive to the tourists anymore, the engagement of the non-profit-making organisations to operate the project was an effective approach in optimising the use of land. He was concerned about the large radar installation at the waterfront in the vicinity of the White Chamber, and suggested that the department concerned should conceal it behind a baffle to avoid negative impact on visitors. Besides, he suggested that the department concerned should proactively support and facilitate the implementation of the Revitalisation Scheme, as well as providing one-stop service to assist the non-profit-making organisations in application of the use of the government land in a more expeditious and straightforward manner.

92. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris opined that there was an ampler scope for discussion of the two projects which had not commenced yet. He thought that the White Chamber, which was located in a remote area, consisted of the relatively small building blocks with basic finishes merely for use as an exhibition gallery, but its yard and car park had occupied a relatively large area. They were not in proportion to each other. He thus suggested that consideration should be given to retrofitting a glass structure, increasing the size of the building blocks and optimising the use of space of the car park, so as to boost the patronage. Besides, given that the White Chamber commanded a view of the natural hills and beautiful sea and there was a pier managed by the Marine Department in its vicinity, he suggested that the non-profit-making organisations should adopt the relatively bold designs for better utilisation of the natural assets in the surrounding area, e.g. constructing a pier for staging angling activities for tourists. In addition, he suggested that the design of the White Chamber should reflect the architectural features that dovetailed with long-term

residency programmes for individuals or organisations, thereby encouraging the arts practitioners to set up their own arts studios or music rehearsal rooms on a long-term basis, or alternatively, for pet lovers to launch animal care service, instead of making the White Chamber available for a museum or exhibition gallery.

93. The Acting Chairman thanked the government department concerned for proposing the White Chamber project. He said that the TWDC had repeatedly discussed the subject matter in the past and hoped that the White Chamber would be given a new lease of life through the Revitalisation Scheme. Given the remoteness of the White Chamber and Fong Yuen Study Hall, he suggested that more leeway and greater flexibility on planning should be given to the applying organisations and a receptive attitude to a wide range of operational modes should be adopted. On the basis of availability for visits by the general public, the opening hours and dates should not be confined to restrictions, e.g. to consider the availability of Fong Yuen Study Hall for visits by the general public on Saturdays and Sundays only, with a view to seeking to balance the financial status with conditions for operation.

94. Mr MAN Yu-ming stated that despite that the former operator had failed to operate Fong Yuen Study Hall, to preserve the heritage of Ma Wan, he suggested that the Government should take over Fong Yuen Study Hall and carry out revitalisation works to echo the historical atmosphere of Ma Wan by drawing reference from the previous practice of the Sam Tung Uk Garden project. He pointed out that the Government should relax regulatory control over the operation of the relatively well-placed White Chamber and encourage the non-profit-making organisations to improve project performance. He held that different approaches should be adopted for the two revitalisation projects.

95. Mr LAM Faat-kang supported the Revitalisation Scheme launched by the Government. He said that given the beautiful setting of the White Chamber, to optimise the use of land, the Government might give the corresponding policy support to incentivise the operators to improve the operational efficiency. He also suggested that youth education organisations should convert the White Chamber into a training centre, so as to promote the harmonious exchange between the local and mainland youth organisations as well as enabling the youth in Hong Kong to understand the policies of the Mainland and the Greater Bay Area, with a view to integrating the cultures of the two places.

96. Mr CHOW Ping-tim suggested that catering services should be provided and distinctive structures should be erected at the White Chamber and Fong Yuen Study Hall for visitors to take photos. For instance, reference might be drawn from the large windmill which was set up at a café on a hilltop in Yilan County, Taiwan, which attracted an influx of visitors to take self-portraits. Besides, he was of the view that the subsidy of HK\$5 million was not sufficient and the operators might need to procure funding from other investors.

97. CAS(W)2 of the DEVB responded as follows:

- (1) he thanked Members for their support for and their views on revitalisation of Fong Yuen Study Hall and the White Chamber. The DEVB would actively follow up with the non-profit-making organisations and applicants;

- (2) the Government took forward the revitalisation projects in partnership with non-profit-making organisations. The historic buildings under the Revitalisation Scheme should be government-owned, yet to be taken over by a government department for alternative uses and had limited commercial development potential. So far, a total of 19 projects in five batches had been rolled out through the non-profit-making organisations since the Revitalisation Scheme was launched more than ten years ago. Under the Revitalisation Scheme, the participating non-profit-making organisations had proposed creative and innovative solutions to operation that represented the interplay between collective wisdom and expertise. Therefore, most of the up and running projects had managed to meet the respective pre-set targets;
- (3) Fong Yuen Study Hall had initially been included in Batch I of the Revitalisation Scheme, and the Social Service Department of the Yuen Yuen Institute had undertaken the revitalisation for Fong Yuen Study Hall - Tourism and Chinese Cultural Centre cum Ma Wan Residents Museum. As the attendance fell short of target due to various reasons such as the business nature and geographical location of Fong Yuen Study Hall, the non-profit-making organisations concerned decided in 2017 to discontinue the operation of the project. The information about historic buildings in the vicinity of Fong Yuen Study Hall would be incorporated into the information booklet on revitalising Fong Yuen Study Hall under preparation by the DEVB, so that the applying organisations could explore how to connect Fong Yuen Study Hall with the historic buildings nearby. Fong Yuen Study Hall would be incorporated into Batch VI of the Revitalisation Scheme. The DEVB expected that Fong Yuen Study Hall would be revitalised under a creative and innovative approach by drawing on collective wisdom and expertise as well as the information given by the DEVB;
- (4) it was necessary to strike a right balance for the revitalised historic buildings because these buildings might be overburdened with influxes of visitors but low attendances might undermine the operational sustainability of these buildings;
- (5) a site visit to the White Chamber was conducted by the DEVB together with the members of the ACBHC, who unanimously agreed that the White Chamber commanded a view of the beautiful landscape but there was no catering services; and
- (6) the DEVB would actively consider the retrofitting of new structures such as the glass canopy and machine room facilities to the White Chamber in order to cope with its operational needs.

(Note: Mr YAU Kam-ping left the meeting at 7:40 p.m.)

98. The Chairman of the ACBHC responded as follows:

- (1) the Revitalisation Scheme had been operating for over ten years since 2008, during which a total of 19 projects had been rolled out through invitation of proposals from the non-profit-making organisations for the adaptive re-use of the historic buildings with heritage significance but yet to be taken over by any government departments for alternative

uses by drawing on collective wisdom, e.g. Lui Seng Chun and Mei Ho House in Sham Shui Po district as well as the Old Tai Po Police Station in Tai Po district, etc.;

- (2) a set of highly transparent, multi-dimensional assessment criteria had been developed by the ACBHC, including technical complexities involved in the adaptive re-use and preservation of historic buildings, ability to uphold the role as a social enterprise, financial viability of the proposed projects and management capability of non-profit-making organisations. It was considered that even in the face of low attendance, a project would be able to reach break-even point provided that the operator could make good use of the historic building. For instance, Tai O Heritage Hotel had been operating accommodation and catering services on a small scale; and
- (3) the White Chamber and Fong Yuen Study Hall revitalisation projects had their own characteristics. Despite that the first-time operation of Fong Yuen Study Hall was far from satisfactory, an attempt might be made to revitalise it from a new perspective by connecting Fong Yuen Study Hall with the historic buildings nearby and the heritage sites in Ma Wan that had undergone transformation over the years. Moreover, given the unique architectural features and style of the White Chamber in a scenic setting, the ACBHC believed that both projects would be appealing to non-profit-making organisations.

99. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris declared his interest that the projects concerning Mei Ho House and Bridges Street Market mentioned by the DEVB had been undertaken by the construction company in which he worked for, and that the construction company might consider submitting tenders for the captioned projects. Besides, he had given views purely from a construction practitioner's perspective.

100. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie opined that the previous Fong Yuen Study Hall project had failed owing to the external factors such as inaccessibility and wrong positioning. Given the mesmerising stories behind historic buildings, it was crucial to connect these buildings and their surroundings as well as giving a clear account of the stories behind them with a view to boosting the attendance. She quoted the examples of the operational modes of Tai Kwun in Hong Kong and an exhibition gallery in Taiwan which highlighted that their sustainability had hinged on utilisation of working capital and sources of income, as well as their ability to generate innovative ideas to enhance project appeal including the provision of catering services, the adaptive re-use as a spiritual centre, the retrofitting of glass structures on rooftop and the availability of memorabilia for sale, in order to well support the self-financing operation without the Government's funding. Moreover, she held that there was a general trend of developing self-portrait photography hotspots.

101. Mr TAM Hoi-pong enquired about the feasibility of carrying out the reinforcement works for the upper level of Fong Yuen Study Hall. He also suggested that catering service on the upper level of Fong Yuen Study Hall should be provided, so as to capitalise on the beautiful assets of the nature. Besides, given the circuitous path leading to Fong Yuen Study Hall, he suggested that the works staircase adjoining to Fong Yuen Study Hall should be modified to facilitate the access of visitors. Moreover, given the low attendance of Fong Yuen Study Hall on weekdays, it was

suggested that applying organisations should consider how to make good use of the site; otherwise, they might encounter operational difficulties.

102. The Acting Chairman thanked the representatives from the DEVB and the Chairman of the ACBHC for attending the meeting and requested the DEVB to note Members' views.

103. The Chairman resumed the Chair.

XI Item 8: Provision of Public Car Park with Automated Parking System at the Short Term Tenancy Site at Hoi Shing Road, Tsuen Wan
(TWDC Paper No. 7/2019)

104. The Chairman stated that the TD submitted the paper for introduction of the provision of public car park with automated parking system (the "APS") at the STT site at Hoi Shing Road, Tsuen Wan. The representatives from the department and company attending the meeting were:

- (1) Mr TANG Kam-fai, Keith, Principal Project Coordinator/Parking (PPC/P), TD;
- (2) Mr FUNG Siu-cheuk, Peter, Engineer/Strategic Studies 10, TD;
- (3) Mr FONG Ka-ho, Brad, Senior Engineer, Ove Arup and Partners Hong Kong Limited (OAP); and
- (4) Miss CHIONG Hoi-ki, Jenny, Assistant Engineer, OAP.

105. PPC/P of the TD introduced the paper.

106. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael said that he had proposed at the meeting of Traffic and Transport Committee the installation of an APS at the temporary Hoi Shing Road Car Park on a trial basis. He pointed out that at present, there were about 200 parking spaces in the temporary car park on the subject site at Hoi Shing Road. Under the five-year STT for provision of a car park with APS, 160 parking spaces thereof would be retained, while it was anticipated that about 70 new parking spaces would be provided in the area currently occupied by the remaining 40 parking spaces upon the installation of APS. As a result, the new car park would provide a total of 270 parking spaces, representing an increase of 35%. He pointed out that to ensure the prudent use of public funds and land resources, no more than 80% of the existing parking spaces should be retained for the use of multi-purpose vehicles and trucks, instead, 50% thereof (i.e. 100 parking spaces) should be released for providing about 180 new parking spaces upon the installation of APS, making up a total of about 380 parking spaces (representing an increase of 90%). He found it difficult to support the pilot project if the percentage increase in the number of parking spaces in the car park with APS was lower than 90% of the original quantity. In view of the demand for parking spaces at the location concerned, he was of the view that the car park operator would only be able to achieve full cost recovery within the five-year period if it could increase revenue through the provision of more parking spaces. He requested the TD to consider releasing 50% of the existing parking spaces for installation of APS.

107. Mr WONG Ka-wa stated that automated parking technology in neighbouring regions such as Taiwan and Japan had reached maturity. He was worried about the need to re-tender the site after dismantling the APS upon expiry of the STT agreement

in the future, just like the case of Hong Kong Observation Wheel, thus preventing this local site from being used as a car park. Besides, as the operator had to make heavy capital investment in the installation of APS, he enquired whether the operator would be able to achieve cost recovery within the five-year period. Given the exorbitant rental and prices of parking spaces at present, and coupled with the anticipated intake of residents in several buildings under construction near the existing car park this year, the shortage of parking spaces had led to a demand for new parking spaces. Moreover, local consumers had no choice but to park their vehicles illegally owing to the shortage of parking spaces, thus increasing the workload of the HKPF. At present, there were parking queues at each and every shopping mall in Tsuen Wan, resulting in road obstruction. He enquired the TD whether the situation of parking queues had been taken into account, and whether the future operator would be informed of the situation, so that the parking queue could be confined within the car park to avoid road obstruction.

108. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben said that in fact, he was the first LegCo Member to table a motion of requesting for an increase in the number of parking spaces, including the automated parking spaces, way back in 1996. Also, he had strived for the provision of automated parking spaces at the TWDC meetings and on different occasions. Despite that there would be a mere increase of several dozens of parking spaces at Hoi Shing Road, Tsuen Wan upon the installation of APS, he thought that it was a step forward. He was of the view that the TD should not require the operator to release 50% of the existing parking spaces in Hoi Shing Road Car Park for provision of automated parking spaces. It was worrisome that insufficient return on investment would become a stumbling block to the project. He hoped that the TD would give leeway to the operator. Moreover, it should be specified in the land lease that flexibility was allowed for addition of several modular parking decks when the car park reached its full capacity or there was an ever-increasing demand. When necessary, the operator might seek the TD's approval for addition of freestanding modular parking decks. Besides, he enquired about the impact of the provision of a car park with APS at the location concerned on existing users from now until 2021, how the TD would deal with the situation, and whether the entire site would be resumed, thus necessitating the car owners of 200 vehicles currently parked at the temporary car park to look for parking spaces elsewhere. He hoped that the Lands D and TD would consider the coexistence of conventional and automated parking spaces as well as assembly of the modular parking decks one by one, so that parking spaces could still be made available to other vehicles in the interim to reduce the impact arising therefrom. Given that there were quite a number of private land lots in the New Territories, he also hoped that the Government would provide policy support and permit the installation of APS on private land. It was believed that the operators would adopt the appropriate operational modes to achieve break-even. He opined that in the next step, the Lands D should provide land grant options for applicants to choose from, say, a five-year STT with installation of APS and one-year STT without installation of APS, to promote the wider application of APSs.

(Note: The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben left the meeting at 8:23 p.m.)

109. Mr CHENG Chit-pun supported the introduction of APS, but pointed out that the Commissioner for Transport had indicated during her previous visit in Tsuen Wan

district that the TD would identify an alternative site for constructing a car park and look into the use of the “flying carpet style” parking system. Therefore, people had been given the impression that several hundred new parking spaces might be made available upon completion of the sizable car park. However, only 270 parking spaces would be provided at the initial stage of the pilot project concerned, which was quite different from what the Commissioner for Transport mentioned regardless of site selection and operational mode. He expressed concern over a mere 35% increase in the number of parking spaces from 200 to 270, and opined that it was necessary to improve the rate of increase. He further pointed out that a number of photomontages contained in the briefing materials showed that the APS would be used by private vehicles. However, as automated parking spaces should be able to accommodate any vehicles under 1.5 or 1.6 metres in height, he enquired whether the system could be fine-tuned for the parking of multi-purpose vehicles.

110. Mr LO Siu-kit stated that during her recent visit in Tsuen Wan, the Commissioner for Transport had mentioned about the installation of APS at Wing Shun Street and it was expected that at least 200 to 300 new parking places would be provided. But currently, it was proposed that Hoi Shing Road which was very tranquil at nighttime had been designated as a trial site. It was believed that the operator could only do business at daytime. He enquired the TD about the reasons for changing the site for provision of a car park with APS and why the STT site at Hoi Shing Road had been selected as a trial site. He pointed out that as a car park had already been provided on a formed site at Hoi Kwai Road near Clague Garden Estate, if it was ultimately intended to provide the additional several dozens of parking spaces, the car park concerned might be designated as a trial site because automated parking spaces could be put into use immediately after the installation of APS therein. Besides, he enquired the TD whether consultation had been conducted with Members on locations with tremendous demand for parking spaces during the site selection process. He was of the view that after all, the car parks with APS should be provided in response to local needs. Moreover, given the existence of a number of potential vacant sites in Tsuen Wan town centre for car park purpose, the TD had instead arranged to provide a car park with APS in the industrial area at Hoi Shing Road. He also pointed out that the vehicular flow at Hoi Hing Road would increase drastically upon the intake of residents in Ocean Pride. Given that traffic had tailed back towards Belvedere Garden during peak commuting hours, he was worried that this might aggravate the situation in the future. He thus enquired the TD about the traffic routeing via Hoi Hing Road and Tai Chung Road Roundabout upon the provision of 70 new parking spaces at the proposed car park. He expressed discontent that the provision of a car park with APS at Hoi Shing Road was unable to alleviate the demand for parking spaces in Tsuen Wan town centre. Thus, he requested the TD to assess the traffic arrangements at the location concerned.

111. Mr TAM Hoi-pong opined that the application of mechanised systems to increase parking capacity was a step in the right direction; nevertheless, the rectangular structure of the parking system was visually displeasing. Therefore, if a car park with APS was provided on the site at Wing Shun Street, the modular parking decks could be installed underneath the flyover by drawing reference from the practice in Taiwan, so as to avoid creating adverse visual impact. Besides, he enquired the TD about the underlying reasons for the provision of a car park with APS at Hoi Shing Road, and about the reasons for not setting up a car park with APS underneath the flyover at Wing Shun Street.

112. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie commented that given the popularity of car parks with APSs nowadays, e.g. some buildings in areas with strong demand for parking such as Wan Chai and Mong Kok had already been equipped with APSs, while it was also the case for CDW Building in Tsuen Wan, people were no strangers to the operation of APS. Apart from Hoi Shing Road, she opined that the department concerned might consider the concurrent implementation of projects concerning the installation of APSs on STT sites at Wing Shun Street and Hoi Kwai Road respectively after gauging public views and relevant demand. Given that parking spaces for vehicles such as trucks were currently available at other car parks at Hoi Shing Road, she enquired the TD whether it had adopted a conservative approach in providing new parking spaces at the proposed car park with APS at Hoi Shing Road to accommodate the needs of trucks. She pointed out that many people in support of the pilot project were concerned about the car park entrance and exit as proposed in the paper. Therefore, she wished to draw the attention of the TD to the possibility of road obstruction arising from the vehicular flow via the car park entrance and exit. As the monthly rental of parking spaces in some newly completed residential development was as high as \$5,500, many residents had indicated that they might prefer parking their vehicles illegally to renting parking spaces for their vehicles. She had already brought this issue to the attention of the HKPF. As an influx of population had driven demand for parking spaces in Tsuen Wan district, it was considered that the pilot project proposed by the department concerned was conservative, and that multiple sites instead of one single site should be designated as the trial sites. Besides, the TD should put in place more flexible arrangements and provide options to tenderers during tender invitation.

113. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis welcomed and looked forward to the early availability of the APS. During her previous visit on the operation of APS, she realised that drivers needed to spend two minutes to park into and retrieve their vehicles from automated parking spaces. Therefore, to avoid the occurrence of traffic congestion as a result of long parking and retrieval time, she was of the view that it was sensible to increase the number of parking spaces by about 30% on a trial basis. Moreover, she was doubtful about the claim that there was a keen demand for parking spaces in the vicinity of Hoi Shing Road because it might cause a great deal of inconvenience to drivers who might need to take other means of transport to reach other destinations after parking their vehicles at Hoi Shing Road. She pointed out that there was a tremendous demand for parking spaces at other locations in Tsuen Wan. As a case in point, the problem of illegal parking of vehicles had persisted in the vicinity of Tsuen King Circuit and Allway Gardens in recent years, and the STT car park at Tsuen King Circuit had often reached full capacity. Thus, she suggested that additional sites suitable for installing APSs on a trial basis should be identified. Besides, given the mature APS technology, she enquired the TD why the system concerned would only be tested out two years later.

114. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones supported the introduction of APSs; nevertheless, merely several dozens of new parking spaces, which would be provided in the car park with APS at Hoi Shing Road as proposed by the TD, was not sufficient to alleviate the shortage of parking spaces in Tsuen Wan district. He urged the TD to explore solutions to provide more parking spaces as soon as possible. As the car parks of public housing estates such as Fuk Loi Estate and Cheung Shan Estate had

been operating beyond their respective capacities, he suggested that the TD should discuss with relevant departments the trial application of APSs at car parks of public housing estates to cope with the keen demand for public parking spaces therein.

115. Mr CHOW Ping-tim pointed out that the puzzle parking system had been in use for many years. CDW Building Car Park was a case in point. As drivers had to take longer to park their vehicles in the narrow parking spaces therein, the situation was far from satisfactory. Moreover, the car park with APS had failed to live up to its name as its parking system was not fully automated. As the STT site at Hoi Shing Road was relatively spacious, he suggested that the TD should increase the number of parking spaces and adopt the “Ferris-wheel-style” system to enhance the visual appeal. He would oppose the provision of a car park with APS at Wing Shun Street due to its insufficient traffic load for the additional traffic flow. Regarding the site at Hoi Shing Road as currently proposed, provided that the district councillor of the constituency area did not raise objection, he would accede to the proposal on implementation of the pilot project at Hoi Shing Road. Besides, as the cost of installation of APSs was not high, owing to rate of return on investment considerations, he believed that there would be a large number of tender submissions. However, he had reservations about the five-year pilot project and opined that the maximum project duration should be three years.

116. Mr KOO Yeung-pong pointed out that it was a well-known fact that there was a shortage of parking spaces in Tsuen Wan. As a case in point, police officers had even been summoned to Tsuen Wan Plaza last week because the massive parking queue had overflowed onto the street, giving rise to traffic congestion. He agreed with the proposed increase in parking capacity; nevertheless, he opined that the provision of a car park with APS at Hoi Shing Road would pose potential problems because the one-way carriageway had been experiencing traffic congestion even on weekdays. He suggested that the TD should give careful consideration. He pointed out that as the related site formation works had been completed upon closure of Tai Ho Road Car Park, it was suggested that consideration might be given to the construction of a car park with APS at the location concerned to substantially increase the parking capacity for the well-being of residents in Tsuen Wan district.

117. PPC/P of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) according to conservative estimates, the internal rate of return was about 10% over the five-year period if approximately 40% of the parking spaces were managed by the APS after taking into account of the factors such as the cost of APS, rental of parking spaces therein, operating expenses and utilisation rate;
- (2) the TD would discuss with the Lands D about specifying in the tender document that the operator was required to provide not less than 40% automated parking spaces. The TD believed that if profitable, the operator would increase the number of automated parking spaces accordingly. Therefore, the provision of the additional 70 parking spaces was only the minimum requirement. If it was specified in the tender document that the operator was required to provide more automated parking spaces, there would be a lukewarm response to the tender, which would in turn hinder the progress of the pilot project concerned;

- (3) the STT did not impose any restriction on the ratio of monthly parking spaces to hourly parking spaces, which was a matter of commercial decision;
- (4) the operator could continue to operate the conventional, outdoor car park during the process of relevant system design, application approval from the department concerned and procurement of APS. The operator should expect that assembly and testing of the APS would take several months to complete upon receipt of shipment. As a modular parking deck occupying five parking spaces could be assembled separately, the number of available parking spaces would not be significantly reduced during the process. During the five-year operating period, the conventional, outdoor car park could still continue to provide about 200 parking spaces before completion of the installation of APS. Moreover, the operator would take measures to minimise the impact arising from a reduction in the number of parking spaces when the APS was under installation and testing. At least 270 parking spaces were provided after the APS was put into operation;
- (5) to streamline the application procedures for the use of APSs in private car parks, the TD was currently discussing with the Lands D, property developers, professional bodies, operators and suppliers and reviewing the relevant code of practice;
- (6) there were quite many STT car parks in Tsuen Wan district, but the utilisation rates of some of them were as low as about 50% to 60%. Only the STT car parks at Wing Shun Street and Hoi Shing Road had the relatively high utilisation rates respectively. Therefore, the TD considered specifying in the STT of one of these two car parks that the operator was required to install the APS on a trial basis. The current utilisation rate of Hoi Shing Road Car Park was about 80% to 90%, higher than that of Wing Shun Street Car Park at about 70% to 80%. Besides, as the parking rental of Hoi Shing Road Car Park was also higher than that of Wing Shun Street Car Park, the business could break even sooner. Moreover, given that Hoi Shing Road Car Park was located in the industrial area, its surroundings were less vulnerable to the installation of APS and mechanical operations. On the other hand, given the proximity of Wing Shun Street Car Park to residential buildings, the public's tolerance level was relatively low from the perceptual perspective. In view of this, the TD tended to designate the more financially sustainable Hoi Shing Road Car Park as a trial site for the implementation of the pilot project;
- (7) the provision of a car park with APS underneath the flyover was subject to certain restrictions. For instance, the Highways Department had required the provision of adequate headroom above the APS for maintenance purpose. Moreover, parking spaces underneath flyovers had to meet more stringent fire safety requirements, thus increasing the APS installation cost;
- (8) the advantage of the provision of a car park with APS on a STT site was that the operator could decide which APS model (such as puzzle-style or Ferris-wheel-style) should be adopted based on commercial considerations. The TD was of the view that the operator was more likely to adopt the puzzle-style APS having regard to

technical and financial considerations. However, the TD would merely require the operator to install the automated parking spaces of not less than 40% of the total parking spaces under the terms and conditions of the STT. Therefore, it was possible that the operator would install an alternative APS model (such as the Ferris-wheel-style); and

- (9) normally, a one-year STT would be granted for car park use. To improve profit potential of the car park with APS on a STT site, the TD was actively discussing with the Lands D the grant of a STT for a period of not less than five years for implementing the pilot project.

118. Senior Engineer of OAP responded as follows:

- (1) according to the preliminary traffic impact assessment, as the proposed car park was primarily intended for the use of vehicles running within the district or on associated road network, there would not be a drastic increase in vehicular flow in the future. The additional parking spaces was conducive to curbing illegal parking in the district, including loading and unloading of goods at roadside, thereby alleviating road traffic congestion; and
- (2) the consultant OAP had also drawn reference from the utilisation rates of car parks in the same district. Under the current proposal, about ten modular automated parking decks would be installed in the proposed car park, and one or two vehicles would queue up for allocation of parking spaces in each of these decks during rush hours. The operator was required to provide an adequate buffer zone to prevent the parking queue from causing road obstruction outside the car park. The operator might also place the modular parking decks further away from the front part of the car park, so that the driveway could be used as a buffer zone.

119. The Chairman learnt that the parking rental of Hoi Shing Road Car Park had increased by about 50% over the past five years. He was of the view that the financial performance of the car park should be made known after it had been put into operation for a year. He enquired the TD when the car parks with APS would be provided at other locations in Tsuen Wan. He pointed out that the TD was unable to review the utilisation rate of Tai Ho Road Car Park as mentioned by a Member because it had been closed.

120. PPC/P of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) the TD would assess the effectiveness of the pilot project based on the criteria such as response to tender, technical feasibility, receptiveness of the TWDC and local stakeholders as well as financial sustainability, etc.;
- (2) in fact, as APSs had been in use in only a few property developments over the territory, the TD needed to gather and review the experience in building, operating and managing the APS under the pilot project as well as the information on its financial sustainability. At this stage, the TD could not confirm when the APS would be extended to cover other districts; and

- (3) in view of the aspirations of various DCs for the provision of car parks with APSs, the TD would make continued effort to seek advice from various government departments for proactively working out the specific implementation details. Moreover, consideration would be given to the provision of car parks with APSs on suitable STT sites in other districts having regard to the outcome of the pilot project implemented at the STT site at Hoi Shing Road.

121. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael pointed out that no single criterion alone should be adopted for evaluating tender proposals in a market-driven economy. He suggested that the TD should, by drawing reference from the practice of MTRCL, specify in the tender document that government rent and the number of new parking spaces provided would carry equal weight, and that the operator was required to provide at least 70 new parking spaces. In case all tenderers intended to provide 70 new parking spaces, attention should be paid to the tenderer who was willing to pay more government rent. If a tenderer intended to pay less government rent but was willing to provide more parking spaces, the scores could be prorated. He suggested that the TD should specify the requirements such as government rent, capital outlay and parking capacity in the tender document. He would support the proposed project so long as the market was left to decide the economic factors involved.

122. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie opined that the pilot project concerned was too conservative, and requested the Government to adopt a more proactive approach in implementing the pilot project. She learnt from the TD that Tai Ho Road Car Park was not in great demand. She believed that this was because the intake of residents in the nearby housing estates had not completed yet. Upon successive completion of resident intake of housing estates in the vicinity of the waterfront, there would be a drastic increase in the demand for parking spaces. Therefore, she requested the TD to closely monitor the utilisation rates of the existing parking sites in the vicinity of the waterfront. Moreover, the rental of parking spaces in the vicinity of the waterfront as high as \$5,500 per month had dampened the demand for parking spaces for rent. In view of this, she held that despite that Tai Ho Road Car Park was underneath the flyover, after all, the installation of a double-deck APS on this parking site would help tackle the problem of inadequate car parks in the vicinity of the waterfront. It was hoped that the consultant would examine this alongside with the pilot project concerned, in order to eliminate the shortage of parking spaces in Tsuen Wan district. Besides, she commented that the pilot project lasting for five years was too long, and requested to reduce the duration of the pilot project.

123. Mr WONG Ka-wa was worried that the car park with APS might encounter operational problems upon expiry of the five-year STT, just like the case of Hong Kong Observation Wheel in Central. Besides, as Hoi Shing Road was adjacent to a major truck road, parking queues would create traffic impacts. He enquired the TD about the measures to be adopted to address potential problems and the sources of data.

124. Mr LO Siu-kit looked forward to the early provision of the car park with APS. He pointed out that under the current design of the entrance of the car park with APS at Hoi Shing Road, vehicles from Tai Chung Road had to make a detour via the petrol

filling station before entering the car park, leading to possible competition for road space with trucks. Therefore, he suggested that the entrance of the car park should be relocated to Hoi Kok Street underneath the flyover, so that vehicles could gain access to the car park from a number of roads.

125. Ms LAM Yuen-pan, Phyllis did not understand why APSs could only be installed at STT car parks. She believed that the aspiration for installation of APS at Lo Tak Court Car Park could secure the necessary support. She hoped that the TD would take it into consideration.

126. PPC/P of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) the focus of discussion at this meeting was the provision of a car park with APS at the STT site at Hoi Shing Road. The installation of APSs at other car parks might be left for discussion in the future;
- (2) the TD would explore the possibility of providing the car park entrance/exit at Hoi Kok Street in collaboration with the consultant;
- (3) the TD was currently discussing with the Lands D the feasibility of maintaining the status quo of the APS upon expiry of the STT under the prevailing land policy;
- (4) in view of the aspirations of various DCs for the provision of car parks with APSs, the TD would expedite the implementation of the pilot project; and
- (5) the TD was currently discussing with the Lands D how tender proposals would be evaluated. The TD would take Members' proposals into account provided that the evaluation approach was in line with government policies and subject to the approval of relevant bureaux and departments.

127. Senior Engineer of OAP responded as follows:

- (1) the car park with APS in question would comprise ten modular parking decks, and one or two vehicles would queue up for allocation of parking spaces in each of these decks during rush hours. A queuing area would be provided in the proposed site; and
- (2) upon submission of detailed design, the operator would be required by the TD to conduct traffic impact assessment, including the locations and quantities of car park barriers, as well as providing a sufficient buffer area at the entrance of the car park to ensure no parking queue outside the car park.

128. The Chairman requested the TD to consider Members' views, do its utmost to take forward the pilot project and provide the car parks with APSs at other locations in a timely manner, as well as updating Members of the project progress in the upcoming TWDC term.

XII Item 9: Strongly Request the Government to Put Aside the Idea of Demolition and Redevelopment of Tsuen Wan Town Hall, Preserve the Original Structure of the Auditorium of Tsuen Wan Town Hall with Historic Value, and Propose to Increase the Funding for Upgrading Facilities for Various Musical Performances such as the Audio Equipment, Lighting Devices, Adjustable Backdrop and Computerised Projectors, etc. The Government Should not Insist to Destroy the Precious Venue and Collective Memory of Hong Kong People

(TWDC Paper No. 8/2019)

129. The Chairman stated that Mr CHOW Ping-tim submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Ms WONG Fan-ni, Jasmine, Senior Manager (New Territories South) Promotion (SM(NTS)P), LCSD;
- (2) Mr CHEUNG Wa-on, Derek, District Planning Officer/Tsuen Wan & West Kowloon (DPO/TW&WK), PD; and
- (3) Mr CHOW Chun-hun, Gary, Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan) (ADO(TW)), Tsuen Wan District Office (TWDO).

Besides, the written reply of the PD was tabled at the meeting.

130. Mr CHOW Ping-tim introduced the paper.

131. DPO/TW&WK of the PD responded as follows:

- (1) the former Tsuen Wan Magistrates' Courts and its adjoining government sites were the precious lots in the district. Members and the Government were highly concerned about the development plan of the said sites. As the development plan of the said site was still at the conceptual stage, there were neither specific proposals nor a predetermined position on the need for demolition of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall so far; and
- (2) the Tsuen Wan Town Centre G/IC Sites Development Working Group (the "Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG") was set up under the TWDC to discuss the matters relating to the development of the said sites through the commissioning of a consultancy study. The PD would listen to the views from Members and the general public during the planning process.

132. SM(NTS)P of the LCSD responded as follows:

- (1) at this stage, the Government had not formulated any substantive plan on the consolidation of several government sites in Tsuen Wan town centre yet. The LCSD would adopt an open attitude towards in listening to the views from different stakeholders, including the performing arts groups, hirers and venue partners of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall, local arts groups, residents in Tsuen Wan district and members of the public;
- (2) enriching the community's quality of life through the provision of quality cultural and recreational services was one of the objectives of the LCSD. To this end, the LCSD had been keeping a close watch on the repair and maintenance of venues and facilities under its purview in close collaboration with the Architectural Services Department (Arch SD) as well as the EMSD. Should there be any deficiencies, the LCSD would make improvements accordingly; and

- (3) over the past two years, the stage facilities and equipment of the Auditorium of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall had been upgraded. The light system, public address system and computerised subtitles system for the stage had been refurbished. Also, a new digital projector had been procured and some wireless microphones had been replaced. The LCSD planned to replace the light-emitting diode cyclorama lightings and smoke machines of the Auditorium and Cultural Activities Hall of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall in the current financial year. Starting from the next financial year, the LCSD would gradually replace or procure other equipment subject to the availability of resources.

133. ADO(TW) of the TWDO responded that in response to the implementation of the Government's policy on "single site, multiple use", the TWDC had already set up the Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG to discuss the future development of government sites in Tsuen Wan town centre and conduct a preliminary study. Upon the consent given to the conduct of a preliminary study by the Members of the Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG at its last meeting, the TWDO had immediately proceeded with the tender exercise of the preliminary study. In response to the letter of intent and tender documents issued for the study, the Faculty of Architecture of the University of Hong Kong had indicated its intention to take up the preliminary study with submission of a proposal. He reiterated that the future development direction of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall had not been determined yet.

134. Mr LAM Faat-kang said that the TWDC had set up the Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG to follow up on the development direction of the vacant former Tsuen Wan Magistrates' Courts site. Currently the Government's decision on the said development was still pending, he was worried about the spread of the rumour of demolition of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall. He opined that the Government should make a decision as to whether the Tsuen Wan Town Hall would be demolished through rational discussion after conducting a study to gauge views from stakeholders and performing arts groups. Given that the stage of the Auditorium of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall was too small and the backstage of the Cultural Activities Hall of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall was not spacious enough, he suggested that the feasibility of expanding the Tsuen Wan Town Hall should be explored in one go. Besides, Members had realised the benefits of the integrated community hub during the TWDC's exchange visit to Singapore. Therefore, he supported the construction of a similar community hub or world-class music centre in Tsuen Wan district with government funding.

135. Mr TAM Hoi-pong opined that the concept of "single site, multiple use" could be applied to a diversity of building types but not auditorium spaces. He thought that the distinctive design of auditorium spaces could justify the existence of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall as a freestanding venue free from the influence of other buildings, instead of making it as a part for the "single site, multiple use". He said that the cultural ambience of any one place hinged upon the existence of historic buildings in the community. As a case in point, people might associate the Tsuen Wan Town Hall with Tsuen Wan.

136. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie stated that Members of the TWDC and Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG should have acquired an understanding of the future development of the sites in Tsuen Wan town centre. As the DCs were duty bound to deal with livelihood matters, Members who deemed it worthwhile to retain the Tsuen Wan Town Hall might voice their views at the meetings of the Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG. In the face of a gradual westward shift of Tsuen Wan town centre, she held that the Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG should discuss the provision of necessary facilities as well as hardware and software ancillary facilities in Tsuen Wan district in the future. At this meeting, she would like to formally make clarification to the media that the TWDC had never mentioned the need for demolition of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall.

137. Mr KOO Yeung-pong said that the Tsuen Wan Town Hall, the first of its kind in the New Territories, had actually modelled on the architectural design of the Hong Kong City Hall. The world-class philharmonic orchestras, which were invited to participate in the international music competitions at the Tsuen Wan Town Hall every year, commented on the insufficient facilities at dressing rooms at backstage of the Auditorium and Cultural Activities Hall. As a result, the Kwai Tsing Theatre and Yuen Long Theatre had not modelled on the architectural design of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall. Besides, the availability of Proscenium Theater and sound enclosure at the Auditorium of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall was in line with the principle of “single site, multiple use”, enabling it to offer a greater array of artistic forms in Tsuen Wan district. The Auditorium of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall had been noted for its excellent acoustics made possible by the retrofitting of an acoustic canopy, thus obviating the need to use loudspeakers for transferring high-fidelity sound from the stage to every corner of the venue. The policy on “single site, multiple use” provided an opportunity to facilitate the development of government sites such as the former Tsuen Wan Magistrates’ Courts as well as the Tsuen Wan Town Hall and its piazza. He proposed the construction of either a world-class facility, alike the Xiqu Centre, to enhance the artistic ambience of Tsuen Wan district, or a multi-purpose venue and an auditorium dedicated for musical performances to enhance the provision of cultural facilities in Tsuen Wan district.

138. Mr CHOW Ping-tim learnt that the captioned matter was within the scope of the terms of reference of the Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG. However, as the Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG had not fixed the dates of meetings yet, he would like to put forth the captioned matter at the TWDC meeting for record purpose. He pointed out that the Kwai Tsing Theatre and Yuen Long Theatre were the theatres intended for different modes of performances rather than auditorium spaces. On the other hand, as organisations could hardly afford the exorbitant venue rental charged by the Xiqu Centre, its vacancy rate was extremely high, while the current utilisation rate of the Tsuen Wan Town Hall had reached nearly 100%. As far as the district was concerned, the impact arising from demolition and construction activities during the redevelopment period would simply be unbearable. Besides, he believed that the commissioning of a consultancy study was an arrangement to identify the options for taking forward the development plan.

139. The Chairman thanked the representatives from the departments for attending the meeting and called on Members to actively participate in the meetings of the Tsuen Wan Town Centre WG.

140. The Chairman said that as the Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael was required to take up other urgent matters, the meeting would proceed with the discussion of item 12 first.

XIII Item 12: Strongly Request the Government and MTRCL to Duly Handle the Noise Problem of Tsuen Wan Railway

(TWDC Paper No. 11/2019)

141. The Chairman stated that the Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael and Mr CHENG Chit-pun submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr CHEUNG Sau-cheong, Andrew, Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Assessment & Noise)1 (SEPO(A&N)1), EPD;
- (2) Ms LAM Yuen, Annie, Public Relations Manager – External Affairs, MTRCL; and
- (3) Mr CHAN Yiu-chung, Jacky, Senior Public Relations Executive – External Affairs, MTRCL.

142. Mr CHENG Chit-pun introduced the paper.

(Note: Mr CHOW Ping-tim left the meeting at 9:40 p.m.)

143. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael said that the majority of the respondents disapproved the effectiveness of the noise mitigation measures taken by MTRCL as revealed in a recent survey. Also, 80% of the respondents indicated that the noise generated from the repair works from 10:00 p.m. to 2:00 a.m. and from 6:00 a.m. to 8:00 a.m. affected the sleep quality. 40% of the respondents thought that they could not stay focused and felt uncomfortable sensation in their ears because of the noise, and some of the respondents complained about the repair workers for swearing loudly. According to the data provided by the residents of Tsuen King Garden, the MTRCL had conducted the repair works from 1:00 a.m. to 5:00 a.m. on 3 May to 6 May 2019 and on 21 May to 27 May 2019. He opined that the works of replacing the signalling system, even so, should not be conducted so frequently. In addition, the residents of Tsuen King Garden also pointed out that the high-frequency sound, which was generated from the interaction of the wheels and rails when the trains were making U-turns to return to the Tsuen Wan Depot, was emitted for as many as 17 times at the short interval from 7:00 a.m. to 8:00 a.m. on 21 May 2019. He believed that it was caused by the problematic train lubricating system. He requested the MTRCL to reduce the frequency of repair works in small hours from seven to eight times a month on average to two times a month and discuss with him the noise mitigation methods in a visit to the affected household.

144. Senior Public Relations Executive – External Affairs of the MTRCL responded as follows:

- (1) the necessary repair works including the repair of the points (i.e. railway switch/turnout) and re-pavement of granular layer were scheduled at the night time non-traffic hours on a regular basis in order to ensure the normal and smooth operation of the trains. The MTRCL had conducted such works for more than 20 times over the past three months and it was expected that these works would be carried out

occasionally during night time in the fourth quarter of 2019. The number of times and frequency of these works might vary subject to the practical needs for repairs;

- (2) the MTRCL was very concerned about the potential impacts brought by the noise generated from repair works and incoming/outgoing trains at the Tsuen Wan Depot to the residents and had taken mitigating measures on noise control at source, including the regular maintenance and re-profiling of rail, maintenance of trains, shutting down the air-conditioning of the incoming/outgoing trains at the Tsuen Wan Depot, reminding train captains of the speed limit for incoming/outgoing trains at Tsuen Wan Depot as well as avoiding trains from running on curved tracks. The MTRCL had also installed a lubricating system and would closely monitor the system, with a view to ensuring the compliance of railway safety requirements and effective noise mitigation. Besides, the MTRCL would continue to remind the workers to avoid talking loudly;
- (3) the MTRCL understood that Members and the residents were concerned about the noise issue particularly during the night time repair works. Hence, the MTRCL would carefully arrange for the schedules of repair works at different times in order to minimise the nuisances to the residents. The MTRCL reiterated that the re-pavement and replacement of the ballast on the tracks were the necessary repair works for smoother rail in tracks and train operations. It was believed that it was conducive to mitigating the noise generated from the running of trains; and
- (4) the MTRCL undertook to learn from the engineering department as to whether the repair works could be carried out intermittently and whether it was possible to reduce the frequency of night time repair works. The MTRCL would also conduct an on-site inspection with the relevant departments and Members after the meeting.

145. SEPO(A&N)1 of the EPD responded as follows:

- (1) the EPD kept in view the progress of handling the railway noise in other countries. It was learnt that most of the countries handled the noise problem through planning of the new railways. In Hong Kong, the MTRCL was requested to conduct the environmental impact assessments and propose the practicable noise mitigation measures according to the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance in respect of the new railway systems in order to ensure that the railway noise should meet the relevant noise planning standards in the environmental impact assessment memorandum; and
- (2) the noise of running train was regulated under section 13 of the Noise Control Ordinance (Chapter 400) and the measurement and assessment of railway noise should proceed according to the memorandum promulgated under the Ordinance.

146. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael requested the MTRCL to reduce the frequency of repair works in small hours from seven to eight times a month on average to two times a month. He also enquired whether the MTRCL would send its

staff to conduct the on-site inspection with him. In addition, the noise was measured by volume in dB only instead of the noise frequency under the prevailing railway noise standards of the EPD. He enquired whether the EPD would stipulate the new railway noise standards on the basis of the measurement of the noise frequency.

147. Mr LO Siu-kit said that the captioned matter was under discussion for over ten years. When the MTRCL planned and constructed the Tsuen Wan Depot in the early years, the trains were arranged to make U-turns at the Tsuen Wan Depot because there were not many residences around the Depot. He agreed that the noise generated from the interaction of the trains and rails would affect sleeping and noted that the MTRCL had taken measures such as the use of lubricating oil to mitigate the noise of the interaction. An appropriate quantity of lubricating oil should be applied; otherwise, excessive use of the lubricating oil would probably lead to train derailment. In addition, he suggested that the MTRCL should mitigate the noise of interaction by adopting plastic wheels or magnetically levitated transportation system. Moreover, he was worried that the train safety would be affected by the reduction in the frequency of repairs. Hence, he suggested that the MTRCL should study the construction of a roof cover for Tsuen Wan Depot with the PD, Lands D and other relevant departments, and that the MTRCL should be allowed to conduct business operation for topside development in recovery of the construction cost of the topside development for a win-win situation.

148. Mr LAM Faat-kang said that he had given many views on the noise problem in relation to the MTRCL and noted that the EPD would report the result of noise monitoring at Tsuen Wan Depot of the MTRCL to the Environmental and Health Affairs Committee on a regular basis. He pointed out that the MTRCL had initially used water for noise mitigation and changed to use lubricating oil later due to the excessively high water consumption. However, the noise problem was not completely solved. He thought that the MTRCL should keep abreast of time when conducting the planning. He suggested that the MTRCL should consider the construction of a roof top for Tsuen Wan Depot in order to solve the noise problem. He asked Members to follow up the matter at the meetings of the LegCo.

149. The Chairman stated that the safety of railway operation was a prime concern. In the course of repairs, the MTRCL should spare no effort to minimise the preventable noise, such as the noise from the conversations of its staff. He suggested that the MTRCL should arrange a more frequent schedule for repairs without affecting the safety of trains. In addition, he enquired the EPD about the standard for calculation of noise frequency under the legislation and the actual circumstances of the law enforcement.

150. SEPO(A&N)1 of the EPD responded as follows:

- (1) apart from the measurement of the A-weighted equivalent continuous sound pressure level in 30 minutes, the EPD would also measure the noise levels of different frequencies when the trains ran past. If the noise levels exceeded the "Acceptable Noise Level" in the Technical Memorandum, the EPD would request the MTRCL to adopt the improvement measures and issue the "Noise Abatement Notice" according to the circumstances; and

- (2) the EPD had upgraded the equipment and software of noise measurement to achieve greater precision and effectiveness in measurement of the impact of noise frequency of the railway noise.

151. Senior Public Relations Executive – External Affairs of the MTRCL responded as follows:

- (1) it was believed that Members were aware of the principle of the repairs conducted by the MTRCL. The MTRCL undertook to follow up on Members' requests with the engineering department;
- (2) the MTRCL would discuss the issue of on-site inspection with Members after the meeting; and
- (3) the noise of running trains at Tsuen Wan Depot had met the statutory standards. The MTRCL noted Members' views; however, the MTRCL did not plan to proceed the topside development for Tsuen Wan Depot.

152. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael was pleased to learn from the EPD that the apparatus for measuring noise frequency was readily available. He also invited the EPD to send its staff to conduct the on-site inspection with him.

153. SEPO(A&N)1 of the EPD stated that the EPD might consider conducting an on-site inspection with Members.

154. The Chairman asked the EPD and MTRCL to discuss the issue of the on-site inspection with Members.

XIV Item 10: Request to Fully Improve the Fresh Water and Flush Water Supply of Lei Muk Shue Estate
(TWDC Paper No. 9/2019)

155. The Chairman stated that Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr SZETO Wai-tun, Engineer/NTW (Distribution 1) (E/NTW(D1)), WSD;
- (2) Mrs TANG FUNG Shuk-yin, Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan) (CM/M(WT&T)), Housing Department (HD);
- (3) Mr CHANG Wai-pong, Stephen, Maintenance Surveyor (Tsing Yi & Tsuen Wan), HD; and
- (4) Ms LO Kit-man, Housing Manager (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi & Tsuen Wan 7), HD.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael left the meeting at 10:03 p.m.)

156. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly introduced the paper.

157. CM/M(WT&T) of the HD responded as follows:

- (1) the HD noted Members' concern on the fresh water and flush water supply of Lei Muk Shue Estate and would review room for improvement with the WSD and Members after the meeting;

- (2) according to the record of the HD, the fresh water supply of Lei Muk Shue Estate was suspended and then resumed in two hours in April 2019; and
- (3) due to the design constraints, some flush water pipes should be replaced together with the valves and in general, the flush water supply for about ten units would be affected only.

158. E/NTW(D1) of the WSD responded as follows:

- (1) the WSD offered apology to the public for the flush water main burst incident in Lei Muk Shue Estate in April 2019 which affected the flush water supply in the estate;
- (2) the WSD would regularly monitor the conditions of the water mains so as to slim the chance of water main bursts. The WSD would also replace the water mains of higher risk proactively; and
- (3) the WSD would relay the Member's views on exemption of the charge of the fees of fresh water from the affected households during the suspension of flush water supply.

159. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that there was a serious problem of water main bursts in the vicinity of Lei Muk Shue Estate. As a result, the water main repair works on Wo Yi Hop Road and Lei Shu Road were almost never-ending in the past three years. He commended the WSD for discussing the road closure proposals with Members in advance and he hoped that the works would be completed as soon as possible. In addition, he suggested that the HD should prepare for a schedule on suspension of fresh water supply due to cleansing of water tanks and main bursts for the residents' information. He pointed out that the contactors found that some of the water pipes contained asbestos during the water pipe repair works but the contractors casually placed the asbestos after the removal of asbestos. He was discontent about it and hoped that the WSD would enhance the monitoring of contractors.

160. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly stated that there were the valves for control of water supply for Lei Muk Shue Estate off Hong Shue House and Yeung Shue House but one of them was currently not in use, thereby the majority of the residents in Lei Muk Shue Estate were affected whenever the problem of water supply arose. He hoped that the WSD would investigate the reasons for the unused valve and suggested that the unused valve should be reactivated whenever practicable. Besides, owing to the difference between the water supply and water consumption as indicated in water metres in Lei Muk Shue Estate, the WSD needed to turn off the valves for conducting the tests on the water supply. Hence, he hoped that the WSD would arrange water wagons to provide fresh water for the affected residents during the tests, so as to minimise the inconvenience caused during the tests.

161. E/NTW(D1) of the WSD responded as follows:

- (1) the WSD had provided the guidelines on handling asbestos for contractors because the old water pipes might contain asbestos. The WSD would follow up on the situations as mentioned by Members and report to Members after learning about the details; and
- (2) the WSD would collaborate with the HD to conduct the pressure tests during non-peak hours such as nighttime or early morning and shorten

the time for the pressure tests as far as practicable. However, as the inner water pipe leakage of the public housing estates was not under the purview of the WSD, the WSD was unable to deploy water wagons to provide fresh water for the affected residents in the course of the pressure tests. He would study with the Customer Contact Section of the WSD as to whether the provision of fresh water by water wagons could be arranged in future.

162. CM/M(WT&T) of the HD responded as follows:
- (1) the HD would handle the water pipes containing asbestos by strictly adhering to the respective guidelines; and
 - (2) the water main bursts were unforeseen incidents and the schedules on cleansing water tanks were arranged beforehand. The relevant departments would make concerted effort to minimise the impacts to the residents.

163. The Chairman thanked the representatives from the HD and WSD for attending the meeting.

XV Item 11: “Request the Department of Health and Kowloon West Cluster of Hospital Authority to Improve the Healthcare Services of Lei Muk Shue Estate”
(TWDC Paper No. 10/2019)

164. The Chairman stated that Mr WONG Ka-wa submitted the paper. The representative from the department responsible for giving response was Dr LUK Wan, Chief of Services, Department of Family Medicine & Primary Health Care, Kowloon West Cluster of the Hospital Authority (HA). Besides, the written replies of the Food and Health Bureau (FHB), Department of Health (DH) and HA were tabled at the meeting.

165. Mr WONG Ka-wa introduced the paper.

166. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly said that the location of Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic was convenient and about 80% to 90% of the residents of Lei Muk Shue Estate including the elderly and the people with disabilities opted to seek medical treatment from the clinic. He hoped that the healthcare services would not be fully suspended during the renovation works of Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic. He also opined that it was unfair to the residents of Lei Muk Shue Estate and its vicinity if the existing healthcare services were downscaled and provided by a few clinics during the renovation period. Hence, he hoped that the HA would embrace public sentiment and carry out the renovation works in phases. Besides, it was difficult to make an appointment through the General Out-patient Clinics Telephone Appointment System and he suggested that Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic should provide evening out-patient services in order to satisfy the needs of the residents of Lei Muk Shue Estate and its vicinity.

167. The Chairman enquired whether the HA would consider the provision of non-emergency ambulance transfer service.

168. Chief of Services, Department of Family Medicine & Primary Health Care, Kowloon West Cluster of the HA responded as follows:

- (1) the HA adopted the patient-oriented approach by heeding to the patients' aspirations in the course of clinic renovations and planning;
- (2) the HA would first consider carrying out the works in phases for the general and simple clinic renovation works, so that the patients did not need to seek medical treatment from other clinics;
- (3) the renovation works for North Kwai Chung General Out-patient Clinic in 2012/13 only involved the conversion of the space which was not in use frequently into consultation rooms. Hence, the clinic maintained normal operation during the renovation period. Unlike the said situation, the renovation works for Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic was a full renovation for the patient registration counters, waiting hall, treatment rooms for nurses, consultation rooms for doctors and pharmacy, which was difficult to proceed in phases. After weighing various factors such as the patients' safety, coordination of clinic facilities and availability of spare spaces for providing limited healthcare services, the HA decided to relocate Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic to the 5/F, Block C, Yan Chai Hospital (YCH) (the "temporary clinic") to maintain its existing healthcare services during the renovation period. When the same type of full renovation works was carried out for Lady Trench General Out-patient Clinic in 2015/16, the healthcare services at the original site were also suspended during the renovation period and the patients had to seek medical treatment from the said temporary clinic. At that time, the operation of the temporary clinic was smooth in general and the members of the public and patients were satisfied with the arrangement. Hence, the HA introduced a series of measures according to the experience, with a view to minimising the impact to the patients brought by the renovation works of Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic;
- (4) the staff of Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic would continue to provide service in the temporary clinic during the renovation period from August 2019 to March 2020, with a view to maintaining the quality of the existing services. The overall out-patient service capacity in Tsuen Wan district would not be reduced due to the renovation works. The temporary clinic would provide the one-stop service including the registration, blood-taking and injection alike that of Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic. These services were not directly associated with YCH and the registration, blood-taking and other services of YCH would not be affected;
- (5) the staff of Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic would individually make arrangements for the patients who had difficulties in accessing YCH based on their clinical conditions. The patients in stable condition as assessed by the medical practitioners would be prescribed with drug items for an extended period and given the date of follow-up consultation after the completion of the renovation works, so that they were not required to attend the follow-up consultation during the renovation period. The HA would also provide other clinics at

other locations for patients' selection. The HA hoped that Members would understand the difficulties encountered by the HA. The patients could contact the staff of Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic for making arrangement individually if they had any difficulties; and

- (6) Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic would arrange the non-emergency ambulance transfer service for the patients in need to seek medical treatment from the temporary clinic.

169. Mr LO Siu-kit said that it was inappropriate to compare Lady Trench General Out-patient Clinic with Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic as the former was near YCH but the latter was far away from YCH. Healthcare services was very important to the housing estates where most of the residents were the elderly. It was noted that 100 residents, including the elderly and mobility-handicapped, sought medical treatment from Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic on average daily. He agreed that it was not safe for the patients to seek medical treatment from the construction site. Hence, he suggested that the HA should arrange the mobile clinic to be stationed near Mrs Yu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic to provide the relevant services or make logistic arrangement for the patients to seek medical treatment from Lady Trench General Out-patient Clinic.

170. Mr TAM Hoi-pong supported the paper and agreed that the renovation works would cause inconvenience to those who sought medical treatment. He suggested that the HA should provide shuttle bus service alike bus route 32H for the patients to reach the temporary clinic if the HA could not carry out the renovation works in phases.

171. Mr WONG Ka-wa stated that most of the roads on the periphery of Lei Muk Shue Estate were steep road. It took Members four years to secure the provision of eight seats on the pavement between Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic and Lei Muk Shue Estate for the elderly to take rest on their way. He would definitely lodge a complaint jointly with the patients to the Office of the Ombudsman if the HA commenced the renovation works before a consensus was reached. He suggested that the HA should arrange the mobile clinic to be stationed near Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic to provide the drug collection services. In addition, he enquired whether a motion could be moved immediately.

172. The Chairman agreed with Members' views and pointed out that making comparison between the travel distance from Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic to YCH and that from Lady Trench General Out-patient Clinic to YCH was inappropriate. The residents of Lei Muk Shue Estate and the residents in the vicinity of the clinic would be affected during the renovation works of Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic. Besides, according to section 17(1) of the Standing Orders, any Member who wished to move a motion at a meeting of the Council was required to give the Secretary a notice in writing ten clear working days before the meeting. Hence, he did not accept the motion immediately moved by Members.

173. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly and he strongly opposed the suspension of the existing general out-patient service by the HA due to

the full renovation of Mrs Wu York Yu General Out-patient Clinic, thereby failing to provide the proper and easily-accessible out-patient service for the residents of Lei Muk Shue Estate, in particular the elderly and the people with disability.

174. Chief of Services, Department of Family Medicine & Primary Health Care, Kowloon West Cluster of the HA responded as follows:

- (1) the HA wished to set up a temporary clinic at an easily-accessible site when planning the renovation works at the beginning;
- (2) a general out-patient clinic provided service for about 150 to 200 patients daily, including the patients who developed symptoms of fever and the patients with communicable diseases. The temporary clinics should be in compliance with the clinical standards of pharmacy intravenous admixture service and ventilation and so did the mobile clinics. Hence, it was difficult to set up a temporary clinic or arrange the mobile clinic to provide services; and
- (3) the HA would arrange non-emergency ambulance transfer service for the patients of impaired mobility, under home care or residential care homes to seek medical treatment from the clinics. The community nurses would also provide door-to-door service of wound care and insulin injection for the patients who could not leave their homes, so as to save patients from visiting the clinics for receiving the services required.

175. The Chairman requested the HA to consider Members' views. He enquired whether Members agreed to convey Members' aspiration in writing to the FHB, DH and HA in the name of the TWDC.

176. Members unanimous agreed to convey Members' aspiration in writing to the FHB, DH and HA in the name of the TWDC.

(Post-meeting note: The Secretariat conveyed Members' views in writing to the FHB, DH and HA on 4 June 2019.)

XVI Item 13: About the Impact on the Supply of Drivers of Residents' Coaches in Tsuen Wan District after the Commissioning of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge
(TWDC Paper No. 12/2019)

177. The Chairman stated that Mr TAM Hoi-pong submitted the paper. The representatives from the TD responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Ms LUI Hiu-fai, Monica, CTO/NTSW; and
- (2) Mr LAU Wing-hang, Will, Senior Transport Officer/Tsuen Wan.

Besides, the joint written reply of the Transport and Housing Bureau and TD was tabled at the meeting.

178. Mr TAM Hoi-pong introduced the paper.

179. CTO/NTSW responded as follows:

- (1) overall, there was a manpower shortage of drivers in the transport industry in recent years apart from residents' coaches. The TD

recommended that the driving licence holding period requirement for driving a private car or light goods vehicle should be reduced from three years to one year in order to attract more drivers to join the transport industry and become the drivers of commercial vehicles. The TD had gained support from the transport industry, Panel on Transport of the LegCo and Road Safety Council upon seeking their views on the recommendation. The TD planned to submit the legislative proposal to the LegCo in 2019;

- (2) the TD was pleased to learn that the residents of Ma Wan agreed to increase the fare of the residents' coaches of Ma Wan at a low rate. It was believed that it was conducive to solving the problem preliminarily; and
- (3) the TD would actively communicate with the operators of the residents' coaches and follow up on the service of residents' coaches of Ma Wan, with a view to implementing the improvement measures as soon as possible.

180. Mr WONG Ka-wa agreed that there was a manpower shortage of drivers in the transport industry and suggested that the TD should study the ways to attract more entrants to join the transport industry. He opined that the drivers often quit because of the low pay and poor fringe benefit. Thus, he suggested that the coach operators should offer cash awards or bonus to the drivers who had continuously served for a certain number of years. He also requested the TD to actively assist in solving the problems.

181. Mr KOO Yeung-pong believed that a greater impact would be brought to the coach operators after the commissioning of Liantang Port. He said that the crux of the manpower shortage of drivers was the drivers' pay as stated in the Member's paper. Under a free economy, the TD and the Government did not impose restriction to the drivers' pay offered by the commercial vehicles operators. In recent years, however, drivers' pay was not high in general although the drivers often became the subject of complaints and suffered from great pressure at work. As a result, many drivers opted to quit. He thought that the Government should reinforce the public education on paying respect to drivers. He believed that the drivers might join the industry again if the operators of the residents' coaches of Ma Wan increased the drivers' pay.

182. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly opined that the status in reality could not be addressed through the TD's recommendation. He said that in general, the risk for drivers was higher than that for security guards and personnel in the service industry but the drivers' career prospect was dim, which discouraged the young entrants to join the industry. As a result, there was a severe manpower shortage of drivers of buses and green minibuses over the territory. He suggested that the TD should consider the optimisation of routes for buses and green minibuses as well as the better pay and allowance for the drivers, so as to attract more entrants to join the industry and solve the problem of frequent lost trips of buses and green minibuses.

183. Mr LO Siu-kit pointed out that overall, there was a manpower shortage of drivers in the transport industry. Normally, the pay of the young employers who had

worked for three years should reach satisfactory levels and they were reluctant to cut their pay and change to work as drivers. Hence, he thought that more young entrants would be attracted to join the industry through the TD's recommendation which was supportive to the operators. He hoped that the recommendation would be approved as soon as possible in order to solve the problem of the manpower shortage of drivers.

184. The Chairman enquired Members about the level of increase in the fare of the residents' coaches of Ma Wan as agreed by the residents.

185. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said that the problem of manpower shortage of drivers of the residents' coaches of Ma Wan arose starting from September-October 2018. He believed that it was more or less associated with the commissioning of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge. Hence, he requested the TD to provide in writing the data on the cross-boundary coach drivers and proposals on elimination of the impact on residents' coaches after the commissioning of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge. The main service targets of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge were the tourists and cross-boundary travellers and he opined that the TD should prioritise the services of the residents' coaches. He also agreed that a greater impact would be brought to the coach operators after the commissioning of Liantang Port. He pointed out that Members in general held that the fare of the residents' coaches and drivers' pay were the key to solving the problem. The residents did not oppose an increase in the fare of residents' coaches of Ma Wan by 10% the maximum together with a set of service package. However, the profit from the residents' coach services of Ma Wan was served to offset the loss from the ferry services of Ma Wan. The drivers' pay and the fare increase of the residents' coaches of Ma Wan were not directly correlated. He hoped that the TD would look into the relevant factors and actively study the way forward of the transport industry.

186. CTO/NTSW responded that the TD noted Members' views and would consider their views when discussing the service enhancement proposal with the operators.

187. The Chairman thanked the representatives from the TD for attending the meeting.

XVII Item 14: Re-examination of the Traffic Conditions of Shek Wai Kok Road and Improvement of the Transport Ancillary Facilities
(TWDC Paper No. 13/2019)

188. The Chairman stated that Mr MAN Yu-ming and Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones submitted the paper. The representatives from the TD responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Ms LUI Hiu-fai, Monica, CTO/NTSW; and
- (2) Mr LAU Wing-hang, Will, Senior Transport Officer/Tsuen Wan.

189. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones introduced the paper.

190. Mr MAN Yu-ming added that the vehicles which stopped next to each other on both lanes at the bus stop off Shek Kwai House in the morning posed danger to the residents who boarded on and alighted from the buses and disturbed the order of

forming queues for the minibuses. He hoped that the department concerned would study the widening of the road in question. Besides, the traffic conditions in Shek Wai Kok during the Ching Ming and Chung Yeung Festival were alleviated after the Police introduced the new traffic measures. He hoped that in the long run, the department concerned would enhance communication and discuss the proposals on improvement of the road design. Moreover, it was difficult to eradicate the illegal parking problem in Shek Wai Kok Estate due to the lack of the card reading machine. Some of the illegally parked vehicles might block the emergency vehicular access. He hoped that the HD would keep in view the problems.

191. CTO/NTSW of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) the TD noted the Member's views on request for widening of the road in question;
- (2) the TD would strengthen the law enforcement with the Police and warned off the drivers of minibuses who illegally occupied the bus stop to wait for passengers;
- (3) the TD would study how to improve the junction of Shek On Road and the scheduling of traffic lights with the engineers; and
- (4) the passenger demand for buses and minibuses was keener during the morning rush hours and the frequencies of the buses and minibuses were higher. A change in service intervals of the buses or minibuses might affect the service frequencies, which led to a longer queuing time and caused inconvenience to the passengers. The TD would study the improvement measures on alignment of buses and minibuses stopping at the bus and minibus stops under coordination with the relevant bus and minibus companies.

192. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly said that the traffic problems in Shek Wai Kok should be solved without delay. He suggested that the TD should widen the road in question and maintain the divergence by better use of the traffic signals as soon as possible to facilitate the pick-up/drop-off of the passengers of the buses and minibuses, with a view to avoiding traffic congestions or traffic accidents.

193. The Chairman asked the TD to consider Members' views.

XVIII Item 17: Application for District Council Funds by the Jockey Club Riviera Gardens Lutheran Integrated Service Centre
(TWDC Paper No. 16/2019)

194. The Secretary introduced the paper.

195. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of interest. No Member made declaration of interest.

196. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1)	Tsuen Wan District Road Safety Carnival	223,403.00

XIX Item 18: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan Safe and Healthy Community Steering Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 17/2019)

197. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that the Vice Chairman was the Vice Chairman of the Tsuen Wan Safe and Healthy Community Steering Committee (the Committee); that Mr YAU Kam-ping, the Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben, Mr WONG Ka-wa and Mr LO Siu-kit were Members of the Committee for declaration of interest of their membership of the Committee.

198. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. No Member made declaration of other interest.

199. The Chairman requested the Vice Chairman who was concurrently the Vice Chairman of the Committee and the Members who were concurrently the Members of the Committee to remain silent during the discussion of the application concerned and should not participate in the decision-making or voting of the application concerned, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

200. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1)	Tsuen Wan Safe and Healthy Community Day	80,960.00

XX Item 19: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan Central Area Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 18/2019)

201. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that Mr KOO Yeung-pong, Mr KOT Siu-yuen, Mr CHOW Ping-tim and Mr LO Siu-kit were the Members of the Tsuen Wan Central Area Committee (the Committee) for declaration of interest of their membership of the Committee.

202. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. No Member made declaration of other interest.

203. The Chairman decided that the Members who had declared their membership of the Tsuen Wan Central Area Committee to participate in the discussion, decision-making and voting, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

204. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding applications:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Applying Organisation/ Co-organiser</u>	<u>Amount Approved</u> (\$)
(1) Tsuen Wan Central Area Outing 2019	Yan Chai Hospital Board of Directors	36,500.00
(2) Health Talk of Breast Care	Yan Chai Hospital Board of Directors	18,000.00

XXI Item 20: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan District Office (TWDC Paper No. 19/2019)

205. The Secretary introduced the paper.

206. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of interest. No Member made declaration of interest.

207. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding applications:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Applying Organisation/ Co-organiser</u>	<u>Amount Approved</u> (\$)
(1) Arts Performance Pleasure for Families in Tsuen Wan 2019	Tsuen Wan Culture and Recreation Co-ordinating Association	350,000.00
(2) 2019-2020 Tsuen Wan District Private Buildings Building Management Certificate Course	-	21,000.00

XXII Item 21: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan Committee for Celebration of Reunification of Hong Kong with China (TWDC Paper No. 20/2019)

208. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that the Chairman, the Vice Chairman and Mr YAU Kam-ping were the Vice Chairmen of the Tsuen Wan Committee for Celebration of Reunification of Hong Kong with China (the Committee); that Mr KOT Siu-yuen was the Vice Chairman of the Committee; that the Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael was the Honorary President of the Committee; that Mr LAM Faat-kang and the Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben were the Honorary Advisors of the Committee; and that Mr MAN Yu-ming, Mr KOO Yeung-pong, Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones and Mr LO Siu-kit were the Advisors of the Committee for declaration of interest of their membership of the Committee.

(Note: Mr WONG Ka-wa left the meeting at 11:15 p.m.)

209. The Chairman said that he and the Vice Chairman were the Vice Chairmen of the Committee which were substantive positions. According to section 48(13) of the Standing Orders, as he and the Vice Chairman had made declaration of interest, all attending Members (except the Chairman, the Vice Chairman and the Members who

had disclosed the interest according to section 48(9) of the Standing Orders) should elect one Member to chair the meeting. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie was elected as the Acting Chairman.

210. The Acting Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. No Member made declaration of other interest.

211. The Acting Chairman decided that the Members who concurrently held the nominal post titles in the Committee to participate in the discussion, decision-making and voting of the matter, and requested the Members who concurrently held the substantive positions in the Committee to remain silent during the discussion of the application concerned and not to participate in the decision-making or voting of the application concerned, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

212. Mr TAM Hoi-pong thought that the reunification of Hong Kong with China was not a day for celebration and he disagreed with the organisation of “Tsuen Wan Carnival in Celebration of the 22nd Anniversary of the Establishment of the HKSAR”. He requested to vote by open ballot.

213. Apart from Mr TAM Hoi-pong who voted against and Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris and Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly who abstained, all the other Members agreed to endorse the following funding application:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1) Celebration of the 22 nd Anniversary of the Reunification of Hong Kong with China in Tsuen Wan	250,000.00

214. The Chairman resumed the chair.

XXIII Item 22: Application for District Council Funds by the Tsuen Wan Youth Association
(TWDC Paper No. 21/2019)

215. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that the Chairman was the President of the Tsuen Wan Youth Association; and that Mr MAN Yu-ming was the Founding President of the Tsuen Wan Youth Association for declaration of interest of their Presidentship of the Tsuen Wan Youth Association.

216. The Chairman stated that he was the President of the Tsuen Wan Youth Association which was a substantive position. According to section 48(13) of the Standing Orders, as he had made declaration of interest, the meeting would be temporarily chaired by the Vice Chairman.

217. The Acting Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. No Member made declaration of other interest.

218. The Acting Chairman decided that the Member who concurrently held the nominal post titles in the Tsuen Wan Youth Association to participate in the

discussion, decision-making and voting of the matter, and requested the Member who concurrently held the substantive position in the Tsuen Wan Youth Association to remain silent during the discussion of the application concerned and should not participate in the decision-making or voting of the application concerned, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

219. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1)	Promotion of Creative Arts in Tsuen Wan	200,000.00

220. The Chairman resumed the chair.

XXIV Item 23: Application for District Council Funds by the Tsuen Sing Cultural and Arts Association
(TWDC Paper No. 22/2019)

221. The Secretary introduced the paper.

222. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of interest. No Member made declaration of interest.

223. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1)	Chinese Dancer Junior On Stage	70,000.00

XXV Item 24: Application for District Council Funds by Cheung Ching Friends Association
(TWDC Paper No. 23/2019)

224. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones and Mr CHENG Chit-pun were the Honorary Advisers of the Cheung Ching Friends Association for declaration of interest of their Honorary Advisorship of the Cheung Ching Friends Association.

225. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. No Member made declaration of other interest.

226. The Chairman decided that the Members who were concurrently the Honorary Advisers of the Cheung Ching Friends Association to participate in the discussion, decision-making and voting of the matter, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

227. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1)	Chinese Opera Appreciation Guided Tour	30,000.00

XXVI Item 25: Information Papers

228. Members noted the contents of the following information papers:
- (1) Report of District Facilities Management Committee (TWDC Paper No. 24/2019);
 - (2) Report of Culture, Recreation and Sports Committee (TWDC Paper No. 25/2019);
 - (3) Report of Traffic and Transport Committee (TWDC Paper No. 26/2019);
 - (4) Report of Community Building, Planning and Development Committee (TWDC Paper No. 27/2019);
 - (5) Report of Social Services and Community Information Committee (TWDC Paper No. 28/2019);
 - (6) Report of Coastal Affairs Committee (TWDC Paper No. 29/2019);
 - (7) Report of Environmental and Health Affairs Committee (TWDC Paper No. 30/2019);
 - (8) Report of District Management Committee (TWDC Paper No. 31/2019);
 - (9) Items Endorsed by Circulation by the Tsuen Wan District Council during the Period from 19 March 2019 to 20 May 2019 (TWDC Paper No. 32/2019); and
 - (10) Financial Statement of Tsuen Wan District Council Funds as at 17 May 2019 (TWDC Paper No. 33/2019).

229. Mr KOT Siu-yuen said that Tsuen Wan district had won two swimming champions in the Hong Kong Games (HKG) of the current year. In addition, the Closing Ceremony of the HKG would be held on 2 June 2019 (Sunday) and he invited all Members to join actively.

XXVII Item 26: Any Other Business

230. The Chairman stated that a letter from the Young Artists Development Foundation was received earlier to apply for display of the TWDC logo and the name of the district on the flag to be used at the flag delegation session of the opening ceremony of the “HK Youth Drawing Day 2019” which would be held on 6 July 2019 (Saturday). The flag delegation session of the “HK Youth Drawing Day 2019” aimed to demonstrate the concerted efforts to promote community art across the 18 districts in Hong Kong, which cultivated the observation, imagination and creativity of Hong Kong teenagers through the painting activity. The TWDC had endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from the Young Artists Development Foundation from 2016 to 2018.

231. Members unanimously endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from the Young Artists Development Foundation.

232. The Chairman stated that a letter from the BD was received earlier to invite the TWDC to nominate a Member to take up the new membership of the third-term Selection Panel (Mandatory Building Inspection Scheme and Mandatory Window Inspection Scheme) for tendering advice to the BD on selection of target buildings during the term from 1 June 2019 to 31 May 2022. Mr LO Siu-kit had served as a

member of the first two terms of the Selection Panel. According to the Six-year Rule stipulated by the Home Affairs Bureau on Advisory and Statutory Bodies, a non-official member should not be appointed to serve on the same body in the same capacity for more than six years to ensure a healthy turnover of members of advisory and statutory bodies as well as to ensure a reasonable distribution of workload. He invited Members to nominate a Member to take up the new membership of the third-term Selection Panel (Mandatory Building Inspection Scheme and Mandatory Window Inspection Scheme). In addition, he thanked Mr LO Siu-kit on behalf of the TWDC for his service for the last two terms of the Selection Panel (Mandatory Building Inspection Scheme and Mandatory Window Inspection Scheme).

233. Mr LO Siu-kit nominated Mr KOO Yeung-pong to take up the new membership of the third-term Selection Panel (Mandatory Building Inspection Scheme and Mandatory Window Inspection Scheme). Members unanimously agreed that Mr KOO Yeung-pong would take up the new membership of the third-term Selection Panel (Mandatory Building Inspection Scheme and Mandatory Window Inspection Scheme).

234. The Chairman stated that the LCSD would continue to organise the “Sport for All Day” on 4 August 2019 (Sunday) under the theme of “Stay Active, Healthy and Happy!”. For Members’ information, as a token of appreciation from the LCSD for the TWDC’s funding provision for encouraging local organisations to organise the recreational and sports activities in support of the “Sport for All Day” on 4 August 2019, the TWDC was included in the list of supporting organisations of the “Sport for All Day 2019” which was uploaded to the LCSD’s website for the public.

235. Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan) of the TWDO said that an on-site inspection of Sai Lau Kok Garden was scheduled for Members in the morning on 6 June 2019 (Thursday) after discussion with the Arch SD and LCSD, so as to facilitate Members to give views on the Signature Project.

(Post-meeting note: The Secretariat had invited Members in writing on 30 May 2019 to the on-site inspection of Sai Lau Kok Garden at 11:00 a.m. on 6 June 2019.)

236. The Chairman stated that this was the last TWDC meeting for Mr HUEN Yeuk-hon, John, Senior Liaison Officer (1) of the TWDO before his transfer. He thanked him on behalf of the TWDC for his contribution and service to the TWDC, and wished him all the best in his work and career.

237. The Chairman reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 30 July 2019 and the deadline for submission of paper was 15 July 2019.

XXVIII Adjournment of Meeting

238. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 11:30 p.m.

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat
July 2019