

(Translation)

Minutes of the 7th Meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (4/16-17)

Date: 29 November 2016

Time: 2:30 p.m.

Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Mr CHUNG Wai-ping, SBS, MH (Chairman)

Mr WONG Wai-kit (Vice Chairman)

Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH

The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael, BBS, JP

Mr KOO Yeung-pong, MH

Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris

Mr LI Hung-por

Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis

Ms LAM, Lam Nixie

Mr LAM Faat-kang, MH

The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben, JP

Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones

Mr CHAN Sung-ip, MH

Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly

Mr WONG Ka-wa

Mr KOT Siu-yuen

Mr CHOW Ping-tim

Mr CHENG Chit-pun

Mr LO Siu-kit

Mr TAM Hoi-pong

In Attendance:

Miss YIP Kam-ching, Jenny, JP District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr CHONG Kong-sang, Patrick Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr CHAN Shiu-man, Simon Senior Executive Officer (District Management), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr HUEN Yeuk-hon, John Senior Liaison Officer (1), Tsuen Wan District Office

Ms LEE Lai-kiu, Winnie Senior Liaison Officer (2), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr LAM Shu-wing, Vincent Deputy District Commander (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force

Ms LAU Chui-ying, Bo Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force

Mr WONG Kwok-chun, Alex	District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing), Social Welfare Department
Mr LO Kam-lun, Alan	District Lands Officer (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department
Mr TSE Hing-chit	Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department
Mr YUEN Hong-shing, Honson	Chief Transport Officer/NT South West, Transport Department
Mr WONG Hon-kit	Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan), Housing Department
Ms KHATTAK Nasreen	District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Mr TSANG Lap-kei, Freddie	Senior Engineer/NTW 2 (New Territories West), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms CHEUNG Yuk King, Dilys	Chief Leisure Manager (New Territories West), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr CHAN Ming-cheong, Horman	District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Miss LAM Siu-yung, Daisy (Secretary)	Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr LAU Shun-tak, Donald	Executive Officer I (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office

For discussion of item 3:

Prof CHAN Siu-chee, Sophia, JP	Secretary for Food and Health (Acting), Food and Health Bureau
Miss WONG Shuk-han, Diane	Principal Assistant Secretary for Food & Health (Food)2, Food and Health Bureau
Mr HUI Fai-wing	Senior Superintendent (Cemeteries & Crematoria) Special Duty, Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Mr LIN Wai-tung, Ryan	Senior Project Manager 321, Architectural Services Department
Mr TANG Sze-wai	Traffic Engineering Consultant, Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited

For discussion of item 4:

Mr MA Siu-cheung, Eric, JP	Under Secretary for Development, Development Bureau
Miss LAU Bo-ye, Winnie	Chief Town Planner/Strategic Planning, Planning Department
Mr NG Kim-wai	Senior Town Planner/Strategic Planning 3, Planning Department

For discussion of item 5:

Mr YAU Wai-lun, Valent	Senior Geotechnical Engineer/Mainland West 3, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr KEUNG Sin-kwok, Patrick	Senior Engineer 9/Central Wanchai Bypass (Major Works Project Management Office), Highways Department
Mr NG Kwok-leung, Lawrence	Senior Engineer/Slopes (NT Region), Highways Department

For discussion of item 6:

Mr WAN Wai-on	Assistant District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing)2, Social Welfare Department
---------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

For discussion of item 7:

Mr LEE Chee-kwan	Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Assessment & Noise)3, Environmental Protection Department
Mr CHOW Chung-kwong	Senior Engineer 4/Tuen Mun Road (Acting) (Major Works Project Management Office), Highways Department
Mr CHAN Yung-leung	Engineer 2/Tuen Mun Road (Major Works Project Management Office), Highways Department

For discussion of item 8:

Mr CHAN Yan-sum, Danny	Director (Product Development, Marketing and Sales), Hongkong Post
Mr LIU Kin-cheong, Steven	Senior Manager (Retail Business/Kowloon and New Territories), Hongkong Post

For discussion of item 9:

Miss TONG Sze-yin	Engineer/NTW (Customer Services) Inspection, Water Supplies Department
Mr KO Po-wai	Senior Health Inspector (Environmental Hygiene) Tsuen Wan 2, Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Mr LEUNG Chun-wai	Professional Officer 1/Joint Office 2, Joint Office
Ms WONG Yan-yan	Senior Building Surveyor/D5, Buildings Department
Mr LEUNG Kwok-chu, Gilbert	New Territories South Divisional Commander (Acting), Fire Services Department
Mr CHEUNG Ngao-tin	Station Commander, Tsuen Wan Fire Station, Fire Services Department

For discussion of item 10:

Mr LAM Chun-cheuk, Tim	Engineer/Tsuen Wan 1, Transport Department
------------------------	--------------------------------------------

I Opening Remarks and Introduction

The Chairman welcomed the Members and representatives from the government departments to the 7th meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (TWDC) and introduced:

- (1) Mr LAM Shu-wing, Vincent, Deputy District Commander (Tsuen Wan) (DDC(TW)), Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF), who attended this meeting on behalf of Mr KWOK Ho-ye, Anthony, District Commander (Tsuen Wan), HKPF; and
- (2) Mr TSANG Lap-kei, Freddie, Senior Engineer/NTW 2 (New Territories West), Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD), who attended this meeting on behalf of Mr LAM Lap-tak, Chief Engineer/NTW 2 (New Territories West), CEDD.

2. The Chairman reminded Members that according to sections 17(1) and 27 of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders (the “Standing Orders”), a Member who wished to move a motion or ask any question at a meeting of the Council was required to give the Secretary a notice in writing ten clear working days before the meeting. Thus, he reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 24 January 2017 and the deadline for submission of paper was 9 January 2017. In addition, according to section 28 of the Standing Orders, unless otherwise agreed by the Chairman, Members could speak and make supplementary remarks once for each agenda item at the meeting and each Member could speak up to 3 minutes.

II Item 1: Confirmation of Minutes of the 6th Meeting held on 27.9.2016

3. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had not received any proposed amendments to the minutes before this meeting. The minutes were confirmed without amendment.

III Item 2: Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meetings

4. The Chairman said that there were no matters arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

IV Item 3: Public Columbarium Facilities to be Constructed at Two Sites at the Eastern & Western Ends of Sham Shui Kok Drive in Tsuen Wan
(TWDC Paper No. 85/16-17)

5. The Chairman said that the Food and Health Bureau (FHB) and Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) had submitted papers to brief Members about the Government’s proposal for the construction of public columbarium facilities (columbarium) at two sites located at the eastern and western ends of Sham Shui Kok Drive in Tsuen Wan (subject sites). The representatives from the Government and the consultancy company attending the meeting were as follows:

- (1) Professor Sophia CHAN, Secretary for Food and Health (Atg.) (S for F&H Atg.) of the FHB;
- (2) Miss WONG Shuk-han, Diane, Principal Assistant Secretary for Food & Health (Food) 2 (PAS for F&H (F)2) of the FHB;
- (3) Mr HUI Fai-wing, Senior Superintendent (Cemeteries & Crematoria) Special Duties of the FEHD;

- (4) Mr LIN Wai-tung, Ryan, Senior Project Manager 321 of the Architectural Services Department (ASD); and
- (5) Mr TANG See-wai, Traffic Consultant of Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Ltd (Arup).

(Note: Mr Li Hung-por joined the meeting at 2:43 p.m.)

6. The Chairman said that the FHB announced the above two sites in Tsuen Wan for columbarium development in as early as 2011 and commenced to conduct the relevant technical study. The technical study had been completed. The FHB would be introducing the latest progress of the proposal to the TWDC at this meeting. The relevant information included the estimated number of niches to be provided, preliminary direction of the architectural design and the study relating to the ancillary transport facilities, etc. As the project had yet to enter the detailed design stage, the information provided by the departments concerned would mainly be directional. Such information might be duly adjusted to address the actual development of the project. He believed that the departments concerned would solicit Members' views and continue to optimise the development plan.

7. S for F&H Atg. of the FHB said that owing to the aging population in Hong Kong, there was a growing public demand for niches. The Government had a genuine need to construct more columbarium facilities to meet the needs of the general public. She added that the Government was committed to promoting the district-based columbarium development scheme in recent years and 24 potential sites across 18 districts had been identified for the development of columbaria. The two subject sites in Tsuen Wan were located at the east and west of Sham Shui Kok Drive on North Lantau, providing a total of 26 000 niches. The FHB would brief Members about the preliminary proposal of constructing columbarium facilities at the two subject sites. With the support of the TWDC, the FHB would carry out the detailed conceptual design and report to the TWDC in due course. In addition, the proposed columbarium would be built according to the landscapes of the location concerned. The proposed columbarium would also incorporate various greening works, and would comply with the relevant standards of the Environment Bureau / Environmental Protection Department (EPD).

8. Traffic Consultant of Arup briefed Members on the preliminary proposal for the construction of columbarium facilities at the two subject sites located at the east and west of Sham Shui Kok Drive in Tsuen Wan, including the location of the sites, traffic mitigation measures and the proposed arrangements of special shuttle bus services at MTR Sunny Bay Station and the pick-up/drop-off bays.

(Note: Ms LAM, Lam Nixie joined the meeting at 2:50 p.m.)

9. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben said that the Discovery Bay Tunnel exit and Sham Shui Kok Drive were close to each other. Residents of Discovery Bay using

Cheung Tung Road would have opinions on the proposal. He added that as Cheung Tung Road was an ancillary road only and would not be able to accommodate traffic flow that was too heavy, he was of the view that if a columbarium was to be constructed, the Government should take into account the needs of the residents of Discovery Bay and the impacts caused to them. He noted that a road was being constructed off Siu Ho Wan near the Discovery Bay Tunnel exit, and that the residents wished that a road could be provided around the area so that the residents could travel to other places via the highway directly, rather than taking Cheung Tung Road or the MTR at the Siu Ho Wan Extension Area. In this way, if the traffic volume of Cheung Tung Road increased in future, there would be another option on the road access to the urban areas for the residents of Discovery Bay. At last, he mentioned that at present, the residents of Discovery Bay who drove needed to travel a long way via Cheung Tung Road to go to MTR Sunny Bay Station or drive to Tung Chung town centre before entering the main road, or they had to drive to Sunny Bay for parking. The residents hoped that the temporary land at the Discovery Bay Tunnel exit could be changed to car park use so that they could go home directly after parking and would not be affected by the increase in the number of other road users. He believed that disputes at district level could certainly be resolved if the Government could carry out the measures above.

10. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly said that he was concerned about the impact on the traffic condition of Cheung Tung Road caused by the project concerned. He pointed out that many cyclists would take Cheung Tung Road on holidays and weekdays, causing many traffic accidents. He was worried that if Cheung Tung Road was the only access to the columbarium after construction, it would cause burden on the traffic of the said location as well as causing more traffic accidents. He took the view that the Government should consider how to solve the traffic issues before taking forward the proposal; otherwise it would cause inconvenience to the residents of Tung Chung and the Lantau Island. He added that he was supportive towards the construction of the columbarium. Although the location of the proposed columbarium was in Tsuen Wan, the Islands district and its residents would be affected the most. He enquired whether the representatives from the FHB and FEHD would consult the Islands District Council. Moreover, the consultancy company had mentioned that both New Territories taxis and urban taxis could enter the columbarium. As the columbarium was located on the Lantau Island that was within the service area of Lantau taxis, he enquired whether the Government would amend the existing regulations or make special arrangements so as to allow New Territories taxis to enter the subject sites. He considered that as the number of Lantau taxis was limited, foreign visitors and residents of the Lantau Island would be affected should there be too many taxi users. Finally, he enquired if the Government and consultant would discuss the special traffic arrangements to facilitate the residents of Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing to access the columbarium.

11. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said that he would not raise objection against the extensive area of the subject sites. He pointed out that the North Lantau Refuse Transfer Station was located in the north of the subject sites. If a columbarium was

constructed next to the North Lantau Refuse Transfer Station, there would be no space for construction of other waste reduction related facilities at the North Lantau Refuse Transfer Station in future. He added that there was some land on the east of the western subject site, and enquired about how the Government would utilise the land within the extensive area of the subject sites. He was also worried that the Government would construct incompatible facilities on the other side of the columbarium. He pointed out that the area of the eastern subject site was smaller than that of the western subject site. He enquired why the subject sites were located at the two pieces of land separately, without making use of the land in the east of the western subject site. He was of the view that the construction of the columbarium would have effect on the traffic in Discovery Bay. He believed that the Government would consult the Islands District Council on the project. If the Government would allow taxis to enter the columbarium during the Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods, he expected that many people would take taxis from Tsing Yi instead of Sunny Bay. Therefore, he enquired whether the Government would arrange other public transport from Tsing Yi to the columbarium; and whether it was possible to forbid taxis from entering the area of the columbarium during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods. He considered that the greatest risk of the proposal was that there would be a lot of taxis waiting for picking up and dropping off passengers on the road. In addition, he requested the Government to use the most advanced technologies in constructing the columbarium to ensure compliance with the highest emission standards.

12. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that he hoped the Government could arrange a visit to the subject sites, so that the Members could learn more about the actual environment. He did not agree with the proposed traffic arrangements in the proposal, and pointed out that the Tsuen Wan town centre and some public housing estates were already very crowded as a result of the large number of visitors going to the Yuen Yuen Institute and other columbarium facilities on the hill during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods. He hence took the view that the construction of 26 000 niches in the Sunny Bay area would cause traffic problems. Moreover, he hoped that public transport would be arranged for direct access to the columbarium from Tsuen Wan, Tsing Yi and Kwai Chung, so as to ease the visitor flow. Besides, he enquired whether the Government could provide a road for taxis and special shuttle buses to reach the columbarium directly from Tsuen Wan, Tsing Yi and Kwai Chung, without passing through Sunny Bay and Discovery Bay Tunnel. Reference might be drawn from the design of the Tolo Highway, Tai Po in which a flyover was built for return trip. He considered that it was necessary to construct a columbarium, however, the ancillary facilities in the proposal were not detailed enough. If the TWDC was asked to endorse the proposal, he would raise objection. Given that there would be 26 000 niches in the proposed columbarium, he was of the view that the columbarium should be designed in such a way to be able to accommodate a large number of disabled visitors going to the columbarium at the same time. For example, elevators with higher capacities should be provided and covered roof tops should be built over slopes. He enquired whether a crematorium would be included in the current design of the project. In addition, he opined that

the bus company should provide two routes bounding for the east and west of the subject sites respectively, rather than providing a circular route, so as to reduce the pick-up and drop-off time. He hoped that the roads connecting to the columbarium would be widened so as to accommodate the vehicles and pedestrian volume during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods.

13. Mr LO Siu-kit said that he had driven a car to visit the location of the proposed columbarium on Sunday to inspect the environment and the ancillary transport facilities nearby. He pointed out that Cheung Tung Road was very narrow and Members had discussed whether cycling should be banned on Cheung Tung Road. Therefore, he agreed with the proposal of constructing a new road from the North Lantau Highway to the columbarium. He was of the view that the subject sites, with its back against the hill and the front facing the sea, were ideal locations for accommodation of niches of ancestors. If the problem of ancillary transport facilities could be resolved, the columbarium might be developed in two phases so as to reduce the impact on the public. From his on-site observations, the existing taxi parking area was located at the west of the subject site and the route was relatively winding, which was unsatisfactory for the elderly or disabled persons. He took the view that the major cause for traffic congestion was that the pick-up and drop-off time of taxis was too long owing to the fact that the visitors would bring many ritual offerings which in turn would take more alighting time. Nevertheless, there would be fewer articles to bring along when they departed and hence the boarding time would be shorter. Hence, he hoped that on traffic design, the Government would allow taxis to pick up and drop off passengers in the west of the subject site but parking should not be permitted for traffic control. Moreover, he opined that the Government should forbid private vehicles from entering the columbarium as the visitors would need to park their private vehicles near the columbarium after getting access by their private vehicles, resulting in traffic congestion. He said that drivers could park their private vehicles at car parks outside the area of the columbarium and take taxis to reach the columbarium. Moreover, he opined that it was quite complicated for the elderly to take the special shuttle bus. He hoped that the Government would draw up a more ideal proposal on taxis parking. For example, more pick-up and drop-off bays could be provided at other locations, apart from MTR Sunny Bay Station, so as to bring convenience to the elderly visitors of the columbarium.

14. Mr CHENG Chit-pun stated that he supported the construction of columbarium in principle, but he was concerned about the problem of ancillary transport facilities. He pointed out that Sham Shui Kok Drive was currently a dual two-lane traffic and the road surface was relatively narrow. The subject sites should be accessed via the tunnel beneath the highway. As he estimated that only single-decker bus could pass the tunnel due to its height, he was worried that the provision of single-decker bus services would not be able to cater for the demand for transportation from visitors of 26 000 niches. Besides, he enquired that apart from MTR Sunny Bay Station, whether special shuttle bus services could be provided at somewhere else, such as Tsing Yi, during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods. Moreover, he noted from the proposal that a pick-up/drop-off area for

private vehicles would be constructed. He worried that if no parking spaces were provided, the owners of the private vehicles would park their vehicles at Sham Fung Road, thus causing traffic congestion in Cheung Tung Road. He therefore enquired whether the Government would construct parking spaces for private vehicles at the same time. He thought that if the Government did not intend to encourage the members of the public to drive their private vehicles to the columbarium, the pick-up/drop-off area should not be constructed; otherwise, the Government should consider the parking problem of the private vehicles. He added that parking spaces could be provided for visitors on weekdays but the Government should designate the columbarium as the restricted zone for private cars during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods.

15. Mr KOO Yeung-pong considered that the columbarium should be constructed as soon as possible. He accepted the Government's current proposal of construction of columbarium and suggested that the marine transport facilities should be included. He pointed out that the only access from Tsuen Wan to the Lantau Island was Tsing Ma Bridge. Once the Tsing Ma Bridge was closed due to accidents, the road traffic would be obstructed. He enquired whether 26 000 niches was the maximum number of niches that could be constructed, and agreed that a visit to the subject sites should be arranged. He opined that constructing the columbarium at the subject sites should bring minimal impact to the public.

16. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris believed that the construction of columbarium at Sham Shui Kok Drive was not relevant to the Tsuen Wan district solely. Not only were the subject sites relatively close to Tung Chung and Discovery Bay, but they were also the essential access to the urban area for the residents of Tung Chung and Discovery Bay. Therefore, he hoped that the Government should take a holistic approach in considering the public views, including soliciting the views from the residents of Tung Chung and Discovery Bay. He noted that one of the principles on the design of the columbarium was that it would be built along the hillside. As the sites identified by the Government included the two pieces of flat lands next to Siu Ho Wan Bus Depot and North Lantau Refuse Transfer Station, he believed that the design of the columbarium would be constrained in future. He thought that given the extensive area within the subject sites, the Government should explore whether a columbarium should be constructed on the two pieces of selected lands. He added that there were lots of outstanding building designs in recent years, such as the columbarium in Wo Hop Shek. He hoped that the Government would maintain such standard on building design, enhancing the public acceptance of this kind of "not-in-my-backyard" facilities.

17. Mr CHOW Ping-tim agreed to conduct a visit to the subject sites. He enquired whether the land to the east of the western subject site was reserved for other purposes; otherwise why the land was not used for construction of more columbarium facilities. He opined that the large-scale construction projects would be allocated with more resources from the Government. As the existing proposed columbarium was not large in scale, the Government could only provide the special shuttle bus in

the existing road network for carriage of visitors or make arrangements for them to take other means of interchange transport at MTR Sunny Bay Station. Besides, he thought that there was lack of long-term strategy in some of the Government's planning, thus causing the insufficient road and ancillary transport facilities. Following the current development trends and demands, the land next to the columbarium would be changed for residential development. As the subject sites were situated along the railway line, he enquired about the feasibility of the Government's constructing a railway station or a rail line at the subject sites. He believed that this could tie in with the future development. Besides, he opined that the Government should consider the parking arrangements for the private vehicles. He also agreed that restricted access to the columbarium by private vehicles should be implemented only during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods.

18. Mr MAN Yu-ming supported the construction of the columbarium. He opined that as the subject sites were situated in Tsuen Wan, the TWDC should discuss it in detail. He hoped that the Government would arrange for a visit to the subject sites. He pointed out that there was a pressing demand on niches from the public and it was difficult to identify a place which was suitable for construction of columbarium. He thought that as the current subject sites were far away from the urban area and there were not many indigenous residents, the subject sites could accommodate more niches. Therefore, he suggested that the Government should consider increasing the number of niches to be constructed and adopting the more forward-planning design concepts. Besides, he gave views that the design of the proposed columbarium should be alike that in Wo Hop Shek which was attractive to the general public to change their thoughts on columbarium. As the demand for columbarium was increasing due to the delay of the plan for construction of columbarium for years, he supported the construction of a columbarium at the subject sites.

(Note: Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones joined the meeting at 3:17 p.m.)

19. Mr LAM Faat-kang supported that the construction of a columbarium at the subject sites. He cared about the overall ancillary facilities and planning vision of the proposal, and thought that the design and vision of the proposal were feasible and support from the public could be earned. He added that the environment of the subject sites of the columbarium was good. The Government should incorporate new design concept therein, for example, by providing the garden of remembrance for scattering of cremated ashes and scattering of cremated ashes services at sea. Besides, he thought that the companies providing the scattering of cremated ashes services at sea could offer ancillary shipping facilities, including carriage of visitors to and from the columbarium during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods, so as to relieve some of the demand for road traffic. He also thought that the Government could follow the practice of the Shatin Racecourse, i.e. to construct a rail line to carry the visitors to and from the columbarium during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods, in order to solve the problem of ancillary transport facilities. Besides, he considered that the current ancillary facilities were too simple and not comprehensive enough. It was hoped that the Government could allocate more

resources for making further refinement.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael joined the meeting at 3:20 p.m.)

20. The Vice Chairman stated that most of the Members who joined the discussion did not raise objection to the subject sites of the columbarium. He also showed support to this. He added that there was a considerable demand for niches. Given that it was difficult to identify site for columbarium development that was widely accepted, he hoped that the Government could work hard for the proposal as far as possible. He thought that construction of 26 000 niches was not a large-scale plan and hoped that the Government would further consider increasing the capacity of the columbarium to accommodate more niches. He noted that the majority views from Members were about the ancillary transport facilities of the columbarium and opined that as Sunny Bay was the major hub for interchange transportation under the current design, there would be great pressure on the traffic and transport of Sunny Bay during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods. As a result, the residents in Discovery Bay would have views on this arrangement. He thought that on design, a slip road could be constructed connecting North Lantau Highway and the columbarium, and measures such as making arrangements of public transport to access the columbarium from Tsuen Wan, Kwai Fong and Tsing Yi could minimize the traffic burden of Sunny Bay. In addition, he hoped that the Government could consolidate Members' views solicited at this meeting and proceed to the detailed design. It was also hoped that the Government would submit the detailed design of the project to the TWDC for further discussion and decision as soon as possible so that the construction plan would not be delayed. Lastly, he enquired whether the Government had plans to construct a second phase for the columbarium at the subject sites so as to meet the increasing demand from the public if the ancillary facilities were fit for facilitating the development.

21. S for F&H Atg. of the FHB responded as follows:

- (1) thanked Members for giving valuable views on transportation and other aspects;
- (2) the FHB would contact the Tsuen Wan District Office in due course for arranging a site visit for Members;
- (3) the FHB understood the concerns on the traffic situation from Members and the public, especially the traffic arrangements during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods. The FHB would make every effort to yield the best outcome;
- (4) the FHB welcomed the views from the TWDC that the number of niches should be increased. The consultancy company calculated that the subject sites were suitable for construction of 26 000 niches according to the terrain and size of the subject sites and the result of traffic impact assessment of the subject sites. As the TWDC suggested to construct more niches, the FHB would study this suggestion in order to explore room for and feasibility of the increasing the scale of the development;

- (5) the FHB reiterated that the current outlook design of the columbarium was a conceptual design only. The FHB would proceed with carrying out the detailed design after the meeting. The ASD, which was responsible for designing the columbarium, had taken part in the design of columbaria for years. In recent years, the columbarium buildings designed by the ASD were very appealing and had won awards. The FHB believed that the standard of design of the ASD would continue to raise;
- (6) the FHB understood that although the subject sites were within the District Council Boundaries of the TWDC, the actual locations were in North Lantau. The FHB had already communicated with the Islands District Council;
- (7) it took time for the FHB to conduct different assessments. The FHB hoped that the detailed design would be carried out as soon as possible and would report to the Members during this District Council term;
- (8) the subject sites were identified by the Planning Department (PD). The FHB and the consultancy company estimated the number of niches that could be constructed at the subject sites according to the size of the land and ancillary transport facilities nearby;
- (9) on environmental protection, the FHB would adopt measures in order to meet the relevant standards. In the latest columbarium designs, certain floors of the columbarium would be designated as smoke-free floors in which burning joss paper would be restricted. Besides, paper offerings could only be burnt in the centralised joss paper burners that met the standards of the EPD in order to lessen the effect to the environment; and
- (10) the FHB encouraged the general public to adopt green burial, hence the preliminary design of the columbarium included a garden of remembrance. Currently, the FEHD provided the scattering of ashes service in designated waters. Should there be an increase in demand for the service of scattering of ashes at sea in future, the FHB would study in detail on the feasibility of provision of this service at the subject sites.

22. Traffic Consultant of Arup responded as follows:

- (1) there were three pick-up/drop-off bays for Lantau taxis, two pick-up/drop-off bays for urban taxis and one pick-up/drop-off bay for private vehicles at the columbarium;
- (2) Arup had conducted a number of surveys on traffic and pedestrian flow in 2013 and 2014 respectively, including the pedestrian flow of Yuen Yuen Institute and Tsuen Wan Chinese Permanent Cemetery, in order to estimate the pedestrian flow arising from the 26 000 niches to be provided at the two subject sites in Sham Shui Kok Drive. Arup noted that the pedestrian flow would vary on different dates during Ching Ming Festive period, and the peak would be on the day of Ching

Ming Festival, which would amount to about 40% of the overall pedestrian flow. The existing ancillary transport facilities were sufficient to cope with the highest pedestrian flow during the peak hour, i.e. the pedestrian flow from 11 am to 12 noon on the day of Ching Ming Festival;

- (3) Arup understood that the ancillary transport facilities was a crucial part of the design of the columbarium, and considered that it was difficult to identify a suitable pick-up/drop-off area within the location of the proposed columbarium. Currently, there was one bus stop at MTR Sunny Bay Station which was relatively large with low usage rate. The bus stop was equipped with good ancillary facilities, such as the queuing facilities and roof cover. It was hoped that public transport mode such as double-decker buses would be used effectively for transport of passengers to and from the columbarium;
- (4) there was a large car park for private vehicles next to MTR Sunny Bay Station. Drivers could park and ride on shuttle bus to and from the columbarium;
- (5) Members' views on provision of ancillary facilities as well as interchange vehicles on North Lantau Highway would involve the relatively large-scale transport infrastructure project. As the surroundings of North Lantau Highway were slopes, large-scale modification works on these slopes for extension or widening of roads would be required. In view of this, it should be taken up by the Development Bureau (DEVB) for consideration or taken into account from the overall planning of the area;
- (6) currently, Cheung Tung Road had met the standards for bus operation. Therefore, it is planned to make use of Cheung Tung Road for shuttle bus operation. The traffic assessment also indicated that after the columbarium was constructed, the traffic capacities of Cheung Tung Road and associated junctions would not be affected;
- (7) currently, the proposed transport arrangements were drawn up according to the most critical hour on the day of Ching Ming Festival. As the road traffic in Sham Shui Kok would be busier by that time, it was therefore proposed that temporary traffic management measures, such as allowing only shuttle bus to enter the area of the columbarium, would be imposed. As for other non-peak dates, taxis and private vehicles would be permitted to enter the area of columbarium for picking-up/dropping-off passengers but were not allowed to park in the area; and
- (8) it was noted that there were a number of site constraints during the planning stage. For example, the adjacent buildings were low-rise buildings. Hence, the height restriction had been taken into account during the preliminary design stage. Meanwhile, part of the land was designed as a pick-up/drop-off area for a more proper pick-up/drop-off arrangement. Arup proposed that 26 000 niches could be constructed after fully utilising the land.

23. PAS for F&H (F)2 of the FHB responded as follows:
- (1) according to the traffic impact assessment, the proposed transportation arrangements were sufficient to cope with the development of the columbarium. The FHB would relay Members' views to the DEVB for their consideration from the perspectives of overall planning and development;
 - (2) the subject sites of the columbarium were identified after discussions at district level were held. There were some existing facilities in the vicinity of these two subject sites, including Sham Shui Kok Chlorine Loading and Unloading Area, North Lantau Refuse Transfer Station, bus company depots and food waste centre. Part of the land was reserved for public facilities in the long run. The FHB would discuss with the PD in future if the FHB noted that there was vacant land in the vicinity of the subject sites for the development of columbarium; and
 - (3) the FHB indicated that the eastern and western subject sites were the most suitable sites within the area.

24. The Chairman supported the proposal of constructing a columbarium but opined that the number of the niches to be provided, i.e. 26 000 niches at present, was relatively small. He stated that Members could make further consideration and give views, for example, on how to provide more niches at the subject sites, after the on-site visit. He thought that the larger scale of the columbarium, the better the ancillary transport facilities would be. For instance, a railway station or a roundabout at the highway for direct access to the columbarium could be provided. He requested the FHB to adopt advanced technology in constructing the columbarium, and to timely communicate with the TWDC on the progress of the proposal on a regular basis. He hoped that the FHB would make arrangements for conducting a site visit to the subject sites. He also thanked the S for F&H Atg. of the FHB for attending the meeting.

V Item 4: Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030
(TWDC Paper No. 86/16-17)

25. The Chairman stated that the DEVB and PD submitted the paper and introduced the major findings of the study and recommendations in Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030 (Hong Kong 2030+) to Members. The representatives from bureau and department responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr MA Siu-cheung, Eric, Under Secretary for Development (US for DEVB), DEVB;
- (2) Miss LAU Bo-yee, Winnie, Chief Town Planner/Strategic Planning (CTP/SP), PD; and
- (3) Mr NG Kim-wai, Senior Town Planner/Strategic Planning 3 (STP/SP3), PD.

26. US for DEVB of the DEVB stated that in early 2015, the Government had commenced the preparatory work for Hong Kong 2030+ to update the territorial development strategy to guide planning, land and infrastructure development and to shape the built environment of Hong Kong beyond 2030, based on the development strategies in 2007. Under the concerted efforts of the PD, relevant departments and bureaux, the DEVB made recommendations in Hong Kong 2030+ and the 6-month public engagement of Hong Kong 2030+ had been commenced since 27 October 2016. The DEVB hoped that the overall report on land development and infrastructure in Hong Kong would be studied from a macro perspective.

27. STP/SP3 of the PD introduced the vision and planning goal, the three building blocks of the strategy, including planning for a liveable high-density city, embracing new economic challenges and opportunities, and creating capacity for sustainable growth, and a conceptual spatial framework to translate the building blocks, as well as the institutional arrangements for Hong Kong 2030+ in place.

28. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris was pleased to note that the forward-planning Hong Kong 2030+ was implemented locally. He opined that a substantive economic and transport policy should firstly be stipulated to support the land planning of Hong Kong 2030+. On economic policy, a high-tech manufacturing industry should be developed in Hong Kong for diversification of local industry structure. He was of the view that although the sufficient land supply for development of the trade was a prerequisite for achieving the goal, it was necessary to identify the best industries for Hong Kong and their mode of operation before development, with a view to formulating relevant policies to tie in with the development. He quoted the New Territories North and agricultural industry as the examples to illustrate that Hong Kong people were very concerned about food safety. Food was one of the global and regional issues. The Governments of various countries were prone to provide large amount of resources for the universities to study the technologies for enhancement of production efficiency in order to ensure the food supply over the regions of the countries. In fact, the agricultural industry had been developed into a high-tech industry many years ago. The agricultural industry was no longer confined to the traditional mode requiring large quantity of land and manual operation. Nowadays, indoor commercialised large-scale planting and production activities had begun. From the perspective of planning, high-tech agricultural industry was no longer confined to occupy the large area between the cities with greenery or to be stationed in certain locations which were demarcated as the office area like that of Hong Kong Science Park. Hence, he thought that the Government should maintain liaison with the target trades and timely adjust the framework of the plan. On transport policy, he considered that railway would become the major transportation mode widely adopted by the big cities, like Hong Kong and it was the most environmentally friendly means of transportation. Hence, he thought that there was a need to build the railway network persistently. In the paper, it mentioned that the connectivity of the urban and rural fringe area should be enhanced and the surge of number and use of vehicles should be managed. He opined that the above two ideas were interrelated. The former missed; the latter failed. If the railway system was robust, the general public would make a wise choice. The railway in Hong Kong shared 50% of the public transport market and that in Tokyo shared 90%. It showed

that there was still room for development on market share of public transport in Hong Kong. He thought that there were many constraints in the mode of railway development in Hong Kong, such as construction of heavy rail plus property development on its roof. In fact, there were 100 000 residents from Sam Shing, Tuen Mun to Belvedere Garden and this population equalled to that covered by the South Island Line of the MTR which was about to be commissioned. The Government also planned to extend the commercial activities to the places other than the metropolitan area. In view of this, he considered that Tuen Mun, Tsuen Wan and Shatin should be incorporated into the railway planning because the Northern Link was the only railway under planning to connect New Territories East and New Territories West and the railway covering a population of one million across Tuen Mun, Tsuen Wan and Shatin had already become overloaded.

29. Mr LI Hung-por said that it was not easy to get a full comprehension of Hong Kong 30+ because a number of concepts were involved. He opined that it was good for the Government to have an overall planning direction, but consideration should be taken on how the planning goals were to be achieved. He thought that no one was going to raise objection to certain planning directions, such as the innovative technology, development for sufficient land supply, development of Lantau and New Territories North, control of increase on the number of vehicles and turning waste to energy. However, to avoid conflicts, the Government should further discuss in detail and explain how the concepts and techniques were to be put into practice. He pointed out that it was difficult to discuss because there was no concrete proposals in Hong Kong 2030+. Besides, he enquired whether the Government would make arrangement for the elderly to live in China on addressing the problem of population increase. As currently the decision on the procedure of vetting the applications of mainlanders for settlement in Hong Kong was solely made by the Central Government, he enquired whether there was room for the Government to take part in making decision in future.

30. Mr TAM Hoi-pong stated that he raised objection to Hong Kong 2030+ because he considered that population planning was not included, leading to the failure to carry out town planning and spatial planning. He pointed out that a liveable high-density city would be created under Hong Kong 2030+, but it was very likely that there was a contradiction between liveability and high density and the density would be greatly increased due to the increasing population. Hence, he hoped that the DEVB and PD would accord priority to handle population planning, say, the fact that 50 000 people came to stay in Hong Kong through the application of One-way Permit every year and that a large number of migrants who were professionals or made investment in Hong Kong came to stay in Hong Kong. Besides, he pointed out that the Government estimated that 74 000 flats would be completed for non-permanent Hong Kong residents as at 2030. He was shocked at the estimate and enquired about the reasons for provision of 74 000 flats for non-permanent Hong Kong residents. He reiterated that carrying out population planning was of utmost importance during the consultation period. He said that academically, sufficient capacity should be befitted with the town planning as appropriately designed. According to Hong Kong 2030+, he would have to face up to an even more crowded Hong Kong in daily life in 2030. He hoped that the Government would understand his concern. On spatial planning, he opined that an

implied concept of integration of Shenzhen and Hong Kong was incorporated into the planning in Hong Kong 2030+. In the past, Hong Kong was a gateway to the world; nowadays, however, a number of planning was originated from an idea that Hong Kong was one of the cities in China. He therefore felt that Hong Kong belittled itself ever knowingly. He hoped that Hong Kong people would be proud of this place in 2030 as energized by Hong Kong 2030+ and that Hong Kong was not just one of the cities in China. He pointed out that according to Hong Kong 2030+, the Government expected that everyone would enjoy a larger living space and there would be sufficient open spaces. However, he noted that the Government continued to build houses on open spaces and remove many trees in recent years. Thus, he enquired the Government on how these two expectations would be achieved.

31. Mr LAM Faat-lang said that as a special administrative region of high degree of autonomy, Hong Kong should be developed into a level which surpassed its strength. He noted that planning was a crucial element of city development. He hoped that the Government would make slight adjustment for Hong Kong 2030+, having regard to the current circumstances of Hong Kong, for example, carrying out a study of Hong Kong on keeping pace with the national development of One Belt One Road, so that China would bridge the world and achieved wealth-sharing at an international level. He added that the problem of aging population in Hong Kong became worse. He hoped that the DEVB would take consideration of creating a comfortable living environment through, for example, provision of sufficient living spaces, parks and ancillary facilities in the communities for the retirees and the elderly. He opined that the Government should be committed to elevating the quality of retirement life of Hong Kong people.

32. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones opined that the DEVB had proposed a good planning that was deserved commendation. He stated that although Hong Kong 2030+ was not the best planning of all, it helped taking an important step for the development of Hong Kong which was lack of planning for long. He thought that currently, it was important to let the general public know that there was planning in Hong Kong and provide relevant information for the public discussion of the development of Hong Kong. Although he did not fully agree to the proposals in Hong Kong 2030+, he thought that the Government had taken the first step for the future development of Hong Kong. He hoped that the DEVB would keep up its hard work. In addition, he enquired why Hong Kong 2030+ only addressed the living problem and land use. He regarded that it was more important to improve people's living from planning. Besides, he hoped that the DEVB would consider the channels for receiving messages by the general public at the next stage of publicity work. He pointed out that it would probably be difficult to launch Hong Kong 2030+ because it was difficult for the general public to understand the content of Hong Kong 2030+. He hoped that the Government would take further consideration of this and solve the related problem.

33. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis stated that Hong Kong 2030+ was based on Hong Kong 2030 which was promulgated in 2007. She enquired whether the Government had conducted a review on the planning for the next 24 years as proposed in Hong Kong 2030. She pointed out that there was a huge increase in the number of private vehicles as mentioned in Hong Kong 2030+. She thought that the

rate of increase on the number of private vehicles could not be met by the current planning and city design, so the problem of illegal parking in Tsuen Wan district had become serious. Besides, she said that the Government had implemented the new transport policy of giving priority to railway followed by the buses cum eradication of unauthorised residents' services routes. Thus, she enquired that whether this policy would be implemented by tying in with Hong Kong 2030+; and the effectiveness of this policy over the years. She believed that as the policies of some departments should tie in with Hong Kong 2030+, the departments concerned were requested to conduct review on the effectiveness of their policies. On transportation, she agreed that giving priority to railway was appropriate in terms of policy; however, in reality, inconvenience was brought to some of the residents because some of the public transport routes were cancelled due to this policy and more people had to take a ride on their own vehicles. As a result, the number of vehicles could not be reduced and the traffic could not become smoother. Besides, she pointed out that it was a great target of making Hong Kong people live in a larger residence as depicted in Hong Kong 2030+. However, she noted that the property developers and commercial sector were currently studying on how Hong Kong people could buy properties for themselves, i.e. purchasing the residential properties in smaller sizes. After all, it went against the Government's planning. Thus, she enquired how to tie in with the DEVB on policy.

34. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie opined that a comprehensive and far-sighted target should be set for the development of a city. She thanked the Government for the time on reviewing and making comparison of the status of Hong Kong and surrounding cities as well as studying the change of the overall major direction over the world and surrounding regions for taking forward the planning work. She was concerned about the current position of Hong Kong in the world, but she thought that at present, there was no clear policy for Hong Kong to develop towards this approach. On economic development, she was of the view that the Government should not only focus on the finance and property, but also foster the development of different trades, such as the agricultural industry with innovative technology. She pointed out that for example, in Japan, the LED lights were adopted for planting without any sunlight in the industrial buildings. This technology had emerged many years ago, thus she enquired why it had never been developed in Hong Kong. Besides, she pointed out that currently, the young people were concerned about the direction of their future development. However, their happiness index was very low because they were unable to find their way. Young people in Hong Kong had a vision for starting business or inventing special products, so she enquired whether the Government would provide assistance for them, including financial subsidies and technical support, so that they could develop their own career on innovative agricultural technology.

35. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly stated that the Government maintained land development for the purpose of solving the housing problem. He opined that the Government should stipulate a set of well-planned population policy to address the problem. He added that as the price of private properties was on the surge, the grassroots were still unable to make purchase of the properties even though a number of "harsh measures" were carried out. The waiting time for the public housing was lengthened from 3-4 years to 6-7 years nowadays. Hence, he considered that the

housing problem was really serious. To give an overview on the overall development, as for the construction of residential properties, the ancillary facilities were not provided for the residential properties, say, there were no wet market and transport ancillary facilities or neighbouring areas for employment in the suburb. He thought that the Government should stipulate a long-term plan and take account of the corresponding ancillary facilities for construction of housing as well as the impact of reclamation brought to the ecological environment. He was of the view that according to the Government, there were numerous brownfield sites for use after “soft-lobbying” for these sites. He hoped that the Government would take further consideration of utilising the existing brownfield sites for development. Besides, he was not opposed to the Government to identify more suitable land for construction of residential properties. Yet, he requested for provision of ancillary facilities and stipulating corresponding population policy.

36. US for DEVB of the DEVB responded as follows:

- (1) Hong Kong 2030+ was a high-level and forward-looking proposal. Although all the problems could not be solved in a short period of time, the existing problems would occur time and again if consideration was taken to the short-term problems only without making a long-term planning;
- (2) currently, it was not easy to identify the land suitable for development mainly due to the different aspirations of our society in the past ten-odd years and the request to the Government for suspension of projects for new land. Subsequently, the reclamation projects were almost at halt in the past ten-odd years and thus the development of new towns slowed down. As a result, the Government’s remaining land reserve was almost used up. Hence, the DEVB had to carry out the planning to address the current needs for housing;
- (3) the DEVB adopted the short, medium and long-term measures to solve the problem. Firstly, Hong Kong 2030+ was mainly devised for the long-term development of Hong Kong. Regarding the existing problems in Hong Kong, the Government of the current term was committed to conducting a number of land planning for better use of every piece of land. In the long run, a land reserve should be prepared through drawing up a strategic blueprint without resorting to identification of land in times of need;
- (4) Hong Kong 2030+ was a set of recommendation made by different bureaux and departments after a joint study. It was also hoped that the general public would understand how the Government handled the problem of long-term planning;
- (5) the brownfield sites in the New Territories were conducive to the local economy. An integrated planning and provision of sufficient ancillary facilities were required for the development of brownfield sites. Therefore, immediate land supply was not available despite the lease of these brownfield sites had expired;
- (6) on strategic transport infrastructure, an initial planning was proposed in Hong Kong 2030+ and the follow-up work would be undertaken by the Transport and Housing Bureau (THB). After the completion of the consultation work for Hong Kong 2030+, the THB would commence a

study on railway and strategic highway corresponding to Hong Kong 2030+; and

- (7) a review on the progress of the recommendations proposed in 2007 had been conducted during the course of study for Hong Kong 2030+. The new development areas/new town development, including Kwu Tung North, Fanling North, Hung Shui Kiu and Tung Chung development areas, involved in these recommendations, were entering different stages of development. The DEVB would continue to implement and follow up other recommendations proposed in 2007, and stipulate an updated overall planning.

37. CTP/SP of the PD responded as follows:

- (1) on agricultural development, Hong Kong 2030+ would tie in with the recommendations for the new agricultural policy, including developing an Agricultural Park and designating Agriculture Priority Areas. In addition, the agricultural land was not only regarded as the source of food supply, but also enriched with ecological values for some of them, as recognised in Hong Kong 2030+;
- (2) on top of the publication for public consultation of Hong Kong 2030+, the PD had uploaded a series of topical reports to the dedicated website of Hong Kong 2030+. The PD had conducted presentations during visits to secondary schools and held interactive discussion forums with the young people from professional institutes. The PD would also organise knowledge-sharing sessions on further elaboration of each topic, including renewable environmental capacity, hosted by the experts and professors from universities. Guided visits for site inspections would also be arranged for all sectors from our society to learn more about the concepts of Hong Kong 2030+. The first guided tour on City Oasis would be held on 4 December 2016 in Kowloon Bay;
- (3) as there were several universities, Science Park and Industrial Estate in the east, it was proposed in Hong Kong 2030+ that an Eastern Knowledge and Technology Corridor was to be created. The associated further developments included the construction of another Science Park/industrial estate through identifying the land in the vicinity of Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point and part of the land in the development area in Kwu Tung North was reserved for scientific research purpose. It was hoped that a synergised effect would be brought by spatial distribution together with land use, so that the pre-conditions for better coordination of the Government, industry, academia and research sectors would be created;
- (4) the Government had published a report on population policy in 2015. The Census and Statistics Department made a baseline projection that the local population would reach its height at 8.22 million as mentioned just now. This estimate was made from the actual figures on the 150 quotas for One-way Permit in recent years;
- (5) currently, only one-fourth of the land in Hong Kong was developed. It was found from other global research that Hong Kong was one of the models that adopted an approach of compact and high-density

development and it was, in turn, an approach of sustainable development. As Hong Kong had been adopting an approach of compact development for the local land development, a large quantity of valuable green-blue assets, including the country parks, were maintained. In this connection, a new concept of the overall planning of the green-blue resources was devised in Hong Kong 2030+. The connectivity of these resources would be enhanced and more ecological corridors would be provided. The Government hoped that more recreational and leisure spaces would be created for the general public through the consolidation of the green-blue resources and that the ecological environment would be improved for better air ventilation and cityscape;

- (6) Hong Kong was positioned as an Asia's World City instead of one of the cities in China in Hong Kong 2030+. The title of World City did not only indicate its competitiveness on economy. Various indexes showed that the competitiveness of Hong Kong economy was relatively good, but the liveability and creativity of the city was at an average level only. Therefore, the PD had focused on the enhancement of the liveability of Hong Kong in Hong Kong 2030+;
- (7) on the enhancement of living space, as illustrated in Hong Kong 2030+, the development capacity, i.e. the sufficient land, would firstly be created for making a chance for enhancing the living spaces. The PD hoped that this prerequisite would be created; and
- (8) in addition to the traditional four pillar industries, it was mentioned in the report of Hong Kong 2030+ that the young people would be encouraged to develop start-up enterprises and provided with more co-working spaces. This was also a highlight of Hong Kong 2030+.

38. Mr TAM Hoi-pong raised objection to the development plan of East Lantau. He had been advocating the population control which was a reasonable and practicable solution to all problems in Hong Kong. He was disapproval of the way adopted by the Government of the current term to madly scramble for land. He also opined that the core problem of the development of East Lantau was the reclamation and various infrastructures in hundred thousand million dollars. Our society was currently engaged in the discussion of the aging population and insufficient retirement protection and hospitals, but the Government spent money on the infrastructure instead of on the people. He thought that the Government should not identify land at a high cost. Instead, the Government should adopt the policies such as restraining population from entering Hong Kong and reserve more money for the people to live their life after retirement. Hence, he was opposed to the construction of East Lantau Metropolis. The East Lantau Metropolis was mentioned at length in Hong Kong 2030+. He hoped that the decision for development of the East Lantau Metropolis was made after consultation. He also hoped that the Government of the next term would have a different idea and take forward the land development by sustainability. He was of the view that the concept of development of East Lantau would finally become a white elephant project. In addition, he pointed out that this type of project in hundred thousand million dollars would create social conflicts and our society had spent too much time on discussing whether such project should be carried out or not. He hoped that the Government would stop the implementation of the project of East

Lantau Metropolis before it was too late.

(Note: Mr MAN Yu-ming and Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones left the meeting at 4:49 p.m.)

39. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris opined that a railway should be constructed to connect Tuen Mun, Tsuen Wan and Shatin. According to the Government, in Hong Kong 2030+, the Western Economic Corridor was in the west of Hong Kong and the Eastern Knowledge and Technology Corridor was in the east of Hong Kong. However, the east and the west would only be connected by the proposed Northern Link. It could be seen that either Yuen Long and Tai Po or Tuen Mun and Shatin was not connected effectively by railway. Due to environmental protection, railway was the future mode of transportation with far-reaching efficacy. Due to inflation, the earlier the construction of railway, the lower the construction cost was. He pointed out that according to a survey in 2014, construction of railway to connect Tsuen Wan, Tuen Mun and Shatin was not recommended. At that time, the Government proposed to construct a bridge by the sea or construct a tunnel through a hill for the passage of the trains, so the construction cost was horrifying. He thought that the cost would be lower if the Government adopted other approach such as monorail or construction of railway along the hillside. Moreover, he said that traffic congestion was common at Tuen Mun Road and Shing Mun Tunnel Road, so he enquired why short-term planning was devised for this problem. He worried about that, not to mention Hong Kong 2030+ was a far-sighting plan. He also enquired to what extent Hong Kong 2030+ was conducive to resolve the problem. In addition, he worried that the Government would adopt the approach alike that of construction of the Science Park for new technology planning, i.e. to construct offices for the industries to get stationed out of admiration. He was of the view that not only the general public, the owners of the industries or undergraduates of the field should also be included in the target group of technology planning. Thus, he enquired whether the Government would stipulate the relevant policy for this.

40. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie stated that she was concerned about the future development of the young people. As there were more students of commercial, finance and related industries subjects, she enquired the Government if biotechnology or other industries were to be included in the subjects under selection for local universities or Institute of Vocational Education. She opined that to a certain extent, there was a close relationship between the demand for housing and the transport. The demand for the land in core zones was increased because people living in remote areas needed to take more time to go to work in urban areas. She thought that if the time taken on transport was shortened and the public transport network was improved, the pressure from demand for housing could be relieved to a certain degree. The one-hour living circle was advocated in different cities over the world such as London or in the cities in China. The remote areas could be connected by means of transport such as high-speed railway. She opined that it deserved consideration in Hong Kong. Besides, she had submitted paper to the Government in 2012 for the proposal on construction of a highway from Tuen Mun to Tsuen Wan and a railway from Tsuen Wan to Shatin, but there was no any response after the consultation for the railway projects in 2020 which was carried out earlier. She was of the view that the housing density in Hong Kong was currently very high. If a good railway network

connecting the east and the west of the New Territories was constructed, the Government would not have to construct houses and increase housing density in the areas of the scale which was close to a town centre so as to maintain the space per person. She opined that the Government should not identify the land for housing immediately when housing was mentioned because the housing problem was mainly affected by a number of external factors. She hoped that the Government would take further consideration and study the proposals to handle the matter.

41. Mr KOO Yeung-pong said he learnt from the briefing on Hong Kong 2030+ by the Director of Planning the night before and noted that the first strategic planning for Hong Kong in 1948 was undertaken by Sir Abercrombie, a British town planner. At that time, Sir Abercrombie proposed that an underground railway and a cross-harbour tunnel should be built in Hong Kong. Subsequently, the Cross Harbour Tunnel was commissioned in 1972 and the underground railway was commissioned till 1979. He pointed out that Hong Kong 2030+ was the planning for the coming ten-odd years, so it should be far-sighted in nature. Overall speaking, the Western Economic Corridor and the Northern Economic Belt were about the economy. Moreover, he opined that mismatch and wrong estimate on population were found in the previous planning. The residents in the New Territories had to go to work in Kowloon and Hong Kong Island, leading to the problem on transport ancillary facilities. As the economy of the northwest areas would be developed in future, he hoped that the traffic burden in the commercial areas could be relieved because by that time, the residents in the NT were able to work in the vicinity of their residence. He stated that the transport infrastructure under the reclamation programme of East Lantau Metropolis would connect Hong Kong West, the Lantau and over the territory. He thought that as the programme was carried out for the future development of Hong Kong, objection should not be raised to the projects concerned at the very beginning. He pointed out that the planning in 1948 was the super white elephant project at that time because it was proposed that a cross-harbour tunnel and an underground railway were to be built. Nowadays, however, the tunnel and railway constructed under this big white elephant project were in use by everyone. At last, he hoped that the Government would re-consider the development of the railway network from Tuen Mun to Tsuen Wan during the consultation in order to facilitate the public access to the New Territories. In addition, Tsuen Wan was located in the centre of the New Territories which was characterised by high accessibility and the economic development of Hong Kong would also be driven by the railway network.

42. US for DEVB of the DEVB responded as follows:

- (1) the DEVB proposed two strategic growth areas, namely, the East Lantau Metropolis and North New Territories in this planning proposal. The DEVB was open to these two directional developments;
- (2) the Census and Statistics Department had prepared the baseline population projections according to the current actual usage rate of 150 quotas of One-way Permit and found that the population in Hong Kong would increase continuously in the long run. Besides, the majority of application for One-way Permit was approved for family reunion arising from Hong Kong and China cross-boundary marriage;

- (3) the DEVB understood the problem on traffic issues and would actively follow up on this problem with the THB. The DEVB noted that the THB would conduct a study to explore how the highways and railways would meet the long-term development of Hong Kong after Hong Kong 2030+ was launched;
- (4) the DEVB would relay Members' views on Tuen Mun to Tsuen Wan Link to the THB;
- (5) one of the visions in Hong Kong 2030+ was to address the problem of home-job unbalance, i.e. the uneven spatial distribution of the locations of workplace and residence among the citizens. For example, people living in the areas such as North Western New Territories who did not enjoy much employment opportunities within the areas had to go to work in the urban areas in the morning. As a result, the south bound trains of the East Rail or West Rail were very crowded, but the north bound trains in the morning carried least number of passengers. Hence, when planning, emphasis was put on the provision of employment opportunities for the New Territories. The residents in the New Territories could enjoy more employment opportunities in the region, so that the traffic pressure incurred by home-job unbalance would be relieved;
- (6) Hong Kong 2030+ mainly involved the high-level land policy. Other bureaux would plan according to their own policy areas; and
- (7) the DEVB would further consolidate Members' views and report all the views in the consultation report for Members' reference.

43. CTP/SP of the PD responded that an emphasis was put on improving the home-job balance in the planning. According to the previous studies conducted by the PD, the conglomeration of commercial institutions would only be advocated through commercial activities in a considerable scale. Hence, the PD hoped that the commercial hubs out of urban areas would be successfully developed through the scale of strategic growth areas. As such, the travel patterns of the general public would be changed and the remaining capacity of the transport infrastructure would be in better use in order to lessen the demand for new transport infrastructure.

(Note: Mr LI Hung-por left the meeting at 5:01 p.m.)

44. The Chairman said that the development of Sha Tau Kok in the North New Territories was always mentioned in the community. He wished to know the development plan for Sha Tau Kok in the North New Territories; and whether Sha Tau Kok was included in Hong Kong 2030+. He opined that the Government could consider developing the rural tourism in the vicinity of Liantang Boundary Control Point in the northern east of Sha Tau Kok and incorporate the relevant strategies into Hong Kong 2030+. Moreover, he proposed that the DEVB could consider developing the areas around Wu Kau Tang and study the provision of facilities such as creation of a new town and development of rural tourism in Wu Kau Tang under the future development strategy, so that more economic belts would be produced for better seize of the opportunity of development.

45. CTP/SP of the PD responded as follows:
- (1) currently, the areas in the North New Territories under planning included the areas around Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai; and
 - (2) Hong Kong 2030+ was a directional planning at strategic level. The views on the detailed planning for individual areas such as Sha Tau Kok would be recorded by the PD.

46. The Chairman hoped that the DEVB and PD would consider Members' views for drawing up Hong Kong 2030+ and make strenuous efforts to increase the living space and redevelop the old urban areas.

VI Item 6: "Strongly Request to Enhance the Monitoring and Increase the Number of Privately-run Residential Care Homes for the Disables"
(TWDC Paper No. 88/16-17)

47. The Chairman stated that Mr WONG Ka-wa submitted the paper. The representatives from departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr WONG Kwok-chun, Alex, District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing) (DSWO(TW/KT), Social Welfare Department (SWD)); and
- (2) Mr WAN Wai-on, Assistant District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing)², SWD.

Besides, the written replies of the Labour and Welfare Bureau and SWD were tabled at the meeting.

48. Mr WONG Ka-wa introduced the paper.

49. DSWO(TW/KT) of the SWD responded as follows:

- (1) the Bridge of Rehabilitation Company, a private residential care home for person with disabilities, had attracted wide media coverage at the end of October 2016. After the licensing office of the SWD found that the manpower, monitoring and facilities of the Bridge of Rehabilitation Company were beyond the standards during the blitz inspection in early 2016, the SWD sought legal advice from the Department of Justice (DoJ) on the non-compliance of the Bridge of Rehabilitation Company. According to the legal advice, the SWD was in a position of authority to terminate the Certificate of Exemption of the Bridge of Rehabilitation Company. The Director of Social Welfare also announced on 20 October 2016 that the SWD planned to revoke the Certificate of Exemption of the Bridge of Rehabilitation Company. The district social welfare offices of the SWD immediately deployed 32 social workers to assist 79 persons with disabilities of the Bridge of Rehabilitation Company in identifying suitable residential care homes for replacement, providing financial assistance for the persons affected, making arrangement of visits to the residential care homes with vacancies and identifying suitable transport ancillary facilities for them. The SWD had successfully transferred these 79 residents of the Bridge of Rehabilitation Company and thanked for the assistance provided by the localities;
- (2) there were approximately 13 000 places in the residential care homes for persons with disabilities under the SWD. The number of places in

the residential care homes for persons with disabilities would be substantially increased in future, including redevelopment of Siu Lam Hospital, conversion of a vacant residential care home in Kwun Tong and conversion of three vacant primary school premises in Tuen Mun, Tai Po and Sai Kung into hostels for physically handicapped persons respectively. A total of about 2 500 places would be increased in five years, representing an approximate 20% rise;

- (3) more service places for the elderly and persons with disabilities would be provided through the Special Scheme on Privately Owned Sites for Welfare Uses. Should all the 64 schemes went well, a total of 8 000 service places, including 2 000 residential places, for the persons with disabilities would be provided, making an additional increase of residential places by 15% in ten years. The number of the increased residential places, together with those created upon redevelopment and conversion projects, would be equivalent to about one-third of the existing residential places;
- (4) the licensing office of the SWD conducted seven blitz inspections for each residential care home on average every year and would step up the inspections for non-compliance and the residential care homes under complaint. The SWD would enhance manpower for its licensing office in order to increase the frequency of inspection. Currently, the inspection work was mainly carried out jointly by the surveyors, social workers and staff from the Hong Kong Fire Services Department (FSD). The SWD hoped that experienced retirees from the disciplinary forces would be recruited to join the teams to carry out the inspection work and process the prosecution more effectively;
- (5) the SWD would strengthen the staff training and enhance the requirement on the level of qualifications of the persons-in-charge of the residential care homes for persons with disabilities, e.g. only professionals could take up the persons-in-charge; and
- (6) currently, the SWD was seeking legal advice on the request for enhancing the transparency of monitoring work. If it was feasible, the SWD planned to disclose the information and status of the residential care homes in breach of laws and regulations on its webpage for public information.

50. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly opined that the crux of the problem was due to insufficient resources at present. As there were insufficient places in the residential care homes, the persons with intellectual disabilities and persons with disabilities were under the care of their parents who suffered many hardships every day. He thought that the SWD should apply for more resources from the Government for construction of residential care homes for persons with disabilities and increase the amount of subsidies for the residential care homes under the Bought Place Scheme. In addition, he was of the view that the residential care services were unsatisfactory. He pointed out that the residents of the residential care homes were not under duly care because the ratio of the manpower to the disables of the residential care homes of bought places was 1:40. He agreed that the Government should not only strengthen the monitoring of the residential care homes, but also enhance the resources for the residential care homes; otherwise it was unfair to those who were dedicated to run residential care homes. He added that the residents of Lei Muk Shue did not mind

that there would be a residential care home in Lei Muk Shue. He also thought that the residents in Lei Muk Shue would not be affected by the residential care home. He hoped that the Government would lobby support from more localities for construction of residential care homes in the district. Moreover, he expressed dissatisfaction over the Education Bureau whom had occupied the vacant primary and secondary school premises for a long time. He considered that some of the vacant primary and secondary school premise were suitable for being converted into the residential care homes for persons with disabilities. He hoped that the departments concerned would conduct a review on it. He also noted that some residents of the residential care homes had suffered from abuse and sexual abuse of different levels. He thought that the SWD should study on how to strengthen the monitoring of the residential care homes, including installation of closed-circuit television (“CCTV”) or improvement of the reporting system, so that the residents of the residential care homes would no longer suffer from abuse or sexual abuse.

51. DSWO(TW/KT) of the SWD responded as follows:

- (1) the SWD was allocated with recurrent funding and one-off resources for implementation of the said additional residential care places;
- (2) the Bridge of Rehabilitation Company was a private residential care home for persons with disabilities and the fee of each place was about \$6,000 per month. The SWD was currently encouraging the private sector to enhance the quality of service through the Bought Place Scheme, with a view to providing services of better quality for the general public. Currently, there were a total of 450 bought places and the amount of subsidy for each bought place was about \$10,000 per month;
- (3) he thanked Members for their support at the district level. The SWD would continue to identify the suitable premises in the district for development of the residential care homes for persons with disabilities in order to further shorten the waiting time of the residential care homes for persons with disabilities; and
- (4) the SWD was currently seeking legal advice on the feasibility of installation of CCTV at the public areas of the residential care homes so as to tie in with its inspection, monitoring and evidence collection work.

52. Mr WONG Ka-wa was concerned about how the residential care homes for persons with disabilities could be provided in districts. He opined that on subsidised residential care homes, it was very difficult to lobby support from the local communities for construction of residential care homes for person with disabilities in the communities. He enquired whether the Government would include the residential care homes for persons with disabilities in the proposed planning. As such, it was not necessary to carry out the lobbying work. On private residential care homes, he appreciated that Yan Chai Hospital Lei Muk Shue Rainbow Court offered a small amount of places for severer disabled persons. He also enquired whether the SWD had stipulated short-term proposal on increasing the number of residential care home places, on top of the long-term proposals, in order to shorten the waiting time of the persons with disabilities. He noted that some Members had bought the services of Fu Hong Society in order to provide assistance for the persons with intellectual disabilities. He also hoped that the Government would assist in extending the

services for the persons with intellectual disabilities, so that the persons with intellectual disabilities would get the employment opportunity for integration into our society.

53. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly opined that the Government should reserve places for the purpose of residential care homes for persons with disabilities and the elderly when construction of public housing was underway; otherwise, the Government would need to take time to identify the location and conduct district consultation for residential care home because there would be a great resistance for provision of residential care home after the public housing was commissioned. He hoped that the Government would request the private property developers to reserve land for residential care home when land development was underway. For example, the property developer had reserved some places in Luk Yeung Sun Tsuen for the purpose of youth service. Besides, he thought that there were shortcomings in provision of services by the residential care homes. For example, a patient of dementia aged 40 or so in Lei Muk Shue got lost when going hiking. Although currently the patient was found, the family members were still unable to spot suitable services for that patient. He hoped that the SWD could provide supplement services for this type of persons in need. He noted that the SWD had revoked the Certificate of Exemption of the Bridge of Rehabilitation Company after the incident, but the persons involved in the incident were still at large. He opined that it was a loophole in law that some people who were not able to express their thoughts or who were afraid to express their own thoughts failed to provide evidence. He hoped that the SWD and public figures would review the existing legal system and carry out a reform so as to protect the interest of the people who were unable to express their views or defend themselves. As such, they would be under duly care.

54. DSWO(TW/KT) of the SWD responded as follows:

- (1) currently, the SWD would make recommendation on incorporation of social welfare facilities into the development projects of public housing and private housing estates to the government departments concerned, such as the Housing Department and PD, in order to meet the needs for social welfare service;
- (2) for example, a place for provision of a residential care home for the elderly had been reserved under the private development project which was lately completed in Tsuen Wan;
- (3) the SWD would continue to make recommendation on incorporation of social welfare facilities into the development projects to the government departments concerned, subject to the circumstances and service demand of the districts;
- (4) recently, the SWD had been successful in reserving a place for provision of service unit for persons with disabilities, including the special child care centre and early education cum training centre, under a development project of public housing in Kwai Tsing district;
- (5) the Member was requested to provide the SWD with the information of the patient of dementia who got lost when going hiking earlier after the meeting, so that the SWD could arrange a Standardised Care Need Assessment for the patient and arrange suitable services for the patient according to the outcome of assessment; and

- (6) the SWD had referred the cases of suspicious sexual abuse to the Police. The DoJ had considered the information from the Police investigations when making decision on prosecution.

55. The Chairman thanked the representatives from the SWD for attending the meeting and requested the SWD to consider Members' views.

VII Item 7: "Request to Enhance the Management of Greening Noise Barriers"
(TWDC Paper No. 89/16-17)

56. The Chairman stated that Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly submitted the paper. The representatives from departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr LEE Chee-kwan, Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Assessment & Noise)³ (SEPO(A&N)³), EPD;
- (2) Mr CHOW Chung-kwong, Senior Engineer 4/Tuen Mun Road (Acting) (Major Works Project Management Office) (SE4/TMR Atg. (MWPMO)), Highways Department (HyD); and
- (3) Mr CHAN Yung-leung, Engineer 2/Tuen Mun Road (Major Works Project Management Office), HyD.

57. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly introduced the paper.

58. SE4/TMR Atg. (MWPMO) of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) the wind tolerant and drought tolerant vegetation were planted at the noise barriers next to Tuen Mun Road by the HyD. The species of the vegetation were selected by the professional consultant team including horticulturists, engineers and field officers. Before planting the species, a three-month prototype plant testing was conducted at Tai Lam Section and the testing result was satisfactory;
- (2) the contractor originally expected that the greening works and automatic sprinkler watering system would be completed at the same time. However, due to some reasons, the automatic sprinkler watering system could not be completed at the same time. Thus, the contractor had to adopt the temporary watering system. Some of the plants withered because the source of water for the temporary watering system was unstable and the vegetation maintenance work was carried out by the contractor improperly; and
- (3) it was hoped that the growing environment for the vegetation was provided after the automatic sprinkler watering system was connected to the permanent water source in October 2016.

59. Mr WONG Ka-wa enquired whether the EPD would give comments on the incident. He noted that the problem arose due to the incompleteness of the sprinkler system. As the noise barriers had been installed for some time, he enquired why no one had mentioned at the Council meetings that the relevant works had not been completed yet; whether the automatic sprinkler system in the incident was completed later than the scheduled timetable; and what penalties would be imposed by the Government. He pointed out that a number of departments expressed concerns over the incident after it was widely reported by the media. He enquired whether the Government would adopt punitive measures against the contractor for the next tender in order to punish the contractor who performed negligently in the incident; and

whether the contractor had taken the initiative in informing the HyD of the incompleteness of the automatic sprinkler system at the same time or the HyD took note of it only after the media had reported the incident. He added that the problem of withered plants not only emerged in Tsuen Wan district, but also in Tuen Mun district. He opined that the greening noise barriers could be replaced by the painting canvas if the greening noise barriers were not suitable for use, so that there were no withered plants anymore.

60. Mr CHENG Chit-pun said he found that the withered plants were gradually replaced by the HyD when he passed by the locations concerned. He also hoped that the problem would be solved after the completion of the automatic sprinkler system in the long run. He thought that the current practice was very expensive at cost and great deal of manpower was allocated for the maintenance. He suggested that the departments could consider replacing the real flowers with the artificial flowers if only aesthetic purpose was to be served.

61. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris stated that vertical greening was a major trend. He supported that the Government made an attempt to allocate resources on vertical greening. He opined that this kind of vegetation was conducive to purification of roadside air, noise absorbing and beautification of the streetscape. He also enquired whether the current practice was correct and effective. He thought that vertical greening should not be abandoned and improvement had to be made after this individual incident happened. He encouraged the HyD to learn from the incident and the experiences of other vertical greening projects, discuss with the departments including the Leisure and Cultural Services Department, Arch SD and Buildings Department (BD) and give comments on the design of vertical greening projects. As such, other departments could draw reference from it when coming across the same circumstances and prevent recurrence of the similar incident as well as reducing the cost of vegetation maintenance in future. In this way, the greening noise barriers would become effective in creating a liveable green city.

62. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie stated that the departments wished to carry out the work conducive to the residents' living environment out of goodwill, but problems occurred due to their insufficient monitoring work. She opined that the departments should identify the problem in the workflow of monitoring the greening noise barriers. She thought that the function of the DC was to assist in solving problems and that priority should be given to identifying and solving problems before conducting a review on the monitoring work for its insufficiency. She agreed that vertical greening was a major trend. Many non-profit-making organisations had discussed with her the arrangement of proceeding vertical greening projects for the buildings in different districts, including the factory sites in Tsuen Wan and on the surface of some commercial buildings. She noted that the Government did not conduct inspections after some of the projects were completed. Therefore, she hoped that the relevant departments should stay alert and pay more attention to the monitoring work thereafter, so that the problem would not occur again.

63. SE4/TMR Atg. (MWPMO) of the HyD responded as follows:
(1) the HyD had all along been strictly monitoring the contractors. If technical problems or poor management performance was found, the HyD would take appropriate action according to the terms of the

contracts, including issuance of warning letters to the contractors and would be recorded in the quarterly performance reports of the contractors. The record would then be served as the assessment criteria when the contractors tendered Government projects in future; and

- (2) as the contractor's work performance on vegetation maintenance was poor, the vegetation in question had not been transferred to the HyD. Hence, the contractor was still responsible for the daily vegetation maintenance, including the replacement of the withered plants. The vegetation in question would be transferred to the HyD for maintenance after the contractor had duly met the requirements in the contract until the the vegetation maintenance period expired.

(Note: Ms LAM, Lam Nixie left the meeting at 5:50 p.m.)

64. SEPO(A&N)3 of the EPD responded as follows:

- (1) the EPD had occasionally received public views on beautification and greening of the noise barriers at different locations. In this connection, the Government would study different beautification and greening options before drawing up proposals and would adopt the options at suitable locations. The proposals included different ways of greening, such as installation of planters beneath the noise barriers for greening, and adoption of vertical greening or climber greenery for greening. The EPD would adopt the suitable ways for integration of the noise barriers with the environment as far as possible, subject to the environment and the situation of the relevant locations;
- (2) the Government had adopted the vertical greening for the noise barriers at Yeung Uk Road, Tsuen Wan. This greening project was completed in 2011 and no problem had ever occurred so far. This incident occurred due to the technical problems of the project; and
- (3) the EPD hoped that the original intent of the design of the vertical greening noise barriers newly constructed in Tsuen Wan district would be well maintained.

65. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly felt amazed and thought it was unacceptable for the HyD's practice on planting vegetation while the automatic sprinkler system was incomplete. He hoped that the Government would provide sufficient ancillary facilities and ensure the effective operation of the automatic sprinkler system after gaining experience from this incident and that the HyD could carry out the monitoring work for a period of time. In addition, all the vegetation of the greening noise barriers of Tuen Mun Road near Chi Lok Fa Yuen, behind Tuen Mun Town Hall and in some other places were found withered, besides those of the location concerned. He hoped that the HyD could discuss with the contractor how improvements were to be made. At last, he noted that only ten odd people undertook the works at the location concerned every day and the work progress was slow. Also, there were many holes which were densely packed in the greening noise barriers during the period of construction works. He worried that traffic accidents would be caused at the location concerned. He hoped that the relevant departments could solve the problem as soon as possible.

66. The Chairman requested the representatives from the EPD and HyD to discuss with the Members concerned after the meeting.

67. As the Chairman was required to take up other urgent matters, the meeting would be temporarily chaired by the Vice Chairman.

VIII Item 5: Request to Conduct Comprehensive Examination on the Retaining Walls on the Slopes from Castle Peak Road in Ting Kau to Tsing Lung Tau (TWDC Paper No. 87/16-17)

68. The Acting Chairman stated that agenda item 5 was rearranged to be discussed at the moment due to re-prioritisation of the agenda items. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael and Mr CHENG Chit-pun submitted the paper. The representatives from departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr YAU Wai-lun, Valent, Senior Geotechnical Engineer/Mainland West 3, Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD);
- (2) Mr KEUNG Sin-kwok, Patrick, Senior Engineer 9/Central Wanchai Bypass (Major Works Project Management Office) (SE9/CWB(MWPMO)), HyD;
- (3) Mr NG Kwok-leung, Lawrence, Senior Engineer/Slopes (NT Region) (SE/S(NT)), HyD;
- (4) Mr LO Kam-lun, Alan, District Lands Officer (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department (Lands D); and
- (5) Mr TSE Hing-chit, Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands D.

Besides, the written reply of the BD was tabled at the meeting.

69. Mr CHENG Chit-pun introduced the paper.

70. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael opined that the problem was very serious. According to the BD in its written reply, the BD noted that only the non-structural precast concrete panels were involved in the accident happened at the slope/retaining wall next to the footbridge in Ting Kau in August 2016 after learning from the CEDD and HyD. He was of the view that the word “only” in the written reply made people feel that the BD did not attach importance to the problem arising from non-structural external wall. He pointed out that the concrete panel was 1 m x 5 m in area and the BD should conduct inspections even though no structural walls were involved. Besides, he learned from the BD’s written reply that there were a total of 20 panels along the Castle Peak Road alike that in the accident. He enquired whether the BD had inspected the rest of the 19 panels alike after the accident happened in August 2016. He thought that if the BD did not conduct any inspection work, what was going to do if another panel alike collapsed. He enquired what the BD had done if the inspection work was carried out. He noted that the HyD had examined the retaining wall of the said slope in August 2015, so he enquired about the details of the examination. The HyD would carry out the examination once a year but the retaining wall of the slope collapsed in less than a year after the examination. He considered that there was something wrong with the method of examination adopted by the HyD. He also enquired whether the HyD had reviewed its method of examination after the accident happened; and whether the HyD would continue to adopt the existing design or the existing design was banned. He hoped that the HyD would seriously handle the problem so as to prevent the recurrence of similar

incidents.

(Note: Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly and Mr WONG Ka-wa left the meeting at 6:00 p.m.)

71. SE/S(NT) of the HyD responded as follows:
- (1) the incident occurred on 21 July 2016 and a total of four panels collapsed;
 - (2) the HyD had carried out a primary examination after the incident happened. Under the circumstances of limited information, the HyD suspected that the passers-by would be affected by another panel. Subsequently, the HyD had removed the panel in question;
 - (3) the HyD had all along been concerned about the impact of the retaining wall of the slope brought to the passers-by. The panels mainly served the decorative purpose. The stability and capability of soil consolidation of the retaining wall were not affected by the incident;
 - (4) the HyD expressed concern over the incident and carried out examinations according to the regular maintenance reports in the past but no irregularities were found. As a current practice, the HyD had been carrying out routine examination once a year in accordance with the maintenance guide prepared by the Geotechnical Engineering Office. Besides, an examination would be conducted by professional engineers once every five years. According to the records, the HyD had conducted the regular examination for the retaining wall of the slope in the incident in August 2015 and the latest examination was conducted by the professional engineers in January 2015. No irregularities were shown in the examination reports at that time;
 - (5) the routine examination for the retaining walls and slopes included reviewing the drainage function and signs such as cracks on the surface of the retaining walls as well as the spalled, loosened or inclined concrete. The details were set out in the Guide to Slope Maintenance prepared by the CEDD;
 - (6) in general, the CEDD was responsible for examining the design of the slopes and retaining walls and providing professional advice on geotechnical engineering; and
 - (7) the Major Works Team and consultant engineers of the HyD together with the contractors had carried out a re-examination for the retaining wall in the incident and other retaining walls alike along the Castle Peak Road after the incident.
72. SE9/CWB(MWPMO) of the HyD responded as follows:
- (1) the panels on the surface of the retaining wall, which were not the structural parts of the retaining wall, were involved in the incident;
 - (2) the retaining wall and panels were constructed under the “Ting Kau and Sham Tseng Sections of Castle Peak Road Improvement Project”. These retaining wall and panels were completed in 2006 and had been in use for over ten years. Under the said project, 20 retaining walls of different types and designs were constructed along the sections of Castle Peak Road. In order to maintain the aesthetic quality of different types of retaining walls along the road, the consultant

engineer created an aesthetic design by adopting the panels alike. However, the method of fixing the panels would be varied depending on the structural types of the retaining wall and constraints of physical environment. As shown in the records of the said project, there were a total of two retaining walls with precast parts alike, including the retaining wall in the incident. In the assembling work conducted at the construction site, the adjoining panels were fastened together with steel rods and were stuck onto the concrete retaining wall by cement. Another retaining wall was situated at the vicinity of the car park beneath the bridge of Castle Peak Road (Ting Kau Section);

- (3) after the incident, the HyD had promptly instructed the consultant engineers and contractors to carry out the on-site slope inspections and investigations. It was found that the structural status of the retaining walls in the incident was good and the other panels on the surface of the retaining walls were not found spalled or loosened. Besides, it was found in the investigation that the group of panels spalled in the incident was located at the edge of the corner of the retaining walls and was close to the slope on the top of the retaining wall. Water stains and signs of erosion were found on the surface of the panels up there. According to the findings, the consultant engineers estimated that the edge of the corner underneath the panels was probably affected by the rainwater running from the top of the retaining wall during heavy rainfalls, leading to the erosion of the concrete adhesive layer and steel rods between the panel and the retaining wall. As a result, the panels collapsed. Negligence was not found in the investigation;
- (4) on the other hand, the consultant engineers and contractors had examined another panel on the retaining wall with the same fixing method of the retaining wall in the incident. It was found that its fixing status was good and there was no sign of loosening; and
- (5) nevertheless, the HyD accepted the recommendations from the consultant engineers and contractors that steel pins were fastened on the retaining wall in the incident and on the panels on the surface of the other retaining wall for safety sake. The retaining wall in the incident had been fastened with the steel pins and the same was being done to other retaining wall at the moment. It was hoped that it would be completed before the end of 2016.

73. The Acting Chairman enquired whether the HyD had conducted the follow-up work for the rest of the 18 retaining walls.

74. SE9/CWB(MWPMO) of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) the HyD and consultant engineers had carried out the site inspections for the rest of the 18 retaining walls in order to examine whether there were problems on each of the retaining walls such as irregularities or water stains alike that found from the retaining wall in the incident, as well as any other cause of imposing potential risks. Tapping tests had also been conducted for the panels of potential risks for identifying the gaps between the retaining walls and panels. No signs of loosening were found on the panels; and

- (2) the risk of loosened panels on retaining walls would be lowered after the HyD took the above preventive measures.

75. Mr LO Siu-kit stated that he had discussed with the HyD after receiving complaints in August 2016 or so. He thought that the panels, which were not kind of adornment, should be defined as the structural external walls due to its large size. After the panels fell down, there were many holes on the retaining walls and a soft drink can was found stuffed into one of these holes. So, he felt worried about the construction of the retaining walls. He pointed out that the water drainage and discharge outlets were at the back of the panels and the outlets of the berm channel were deeper than the panels. Hence, the water from the berm channel would be discharged through the panels. He considered that due to the design, the panels would subsequently be loosened after the water seeped from the panels for some time. Hence, he hoped that the HyD would consider not only the aesthetic quality, but also the safety issues of the design for construction of retaining walls, in particular, the design of water drainage, in order to prevent the recurrence of similar incidents.

76. Mr CHENG Chit-pun said he worried that the passers-by would be injured due to the spalling of the panels on retaining walls. He enquired about the method of fixing the panels on retaining walls; whether the panels were fixed on the retaining walls by using two hooks; and whether there was something wrong with the design or negligence was found in the construction procedures. As estimated by the HyD, the cause of the incident was the erosion of the steel rods due to the seepage of rainwater from the panels. As there was rainfall from time to time, he enquired how the HyD prevented the problems arising from rainfall in future. He enquired whether the follow-up work would be carried out for the rest of the 18 retaining walls, apart from the remedies being taken for the retaining walls of similar design.

77. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris worried about the the current status of the retaining walls. He said that construction of retaining walls from Tsuen Wan to Tsing Lung Tau and Tuen Mun was included in the widening of Castle Peak Road. The residents of Tsing Lung Tau would walk past the said retaining walls when going or leaving home, in particular, the section from Sea Crest Villa to Sham Tseng. He learnt that the panels were no longer attached to the retaining walls when the retaining walls reached a certain height, and that mechanical fixing devices should be anchored on the walls for the panels so as to prevent spalling and ensure public safety. He learnt from the Practical Note APP-16 Cladding Works for the authorized persons, registered structural engineers and registered geotechnical engineers issued by the BD that since 1988, it was stipulated that the stone cladding should not be fixed on the walls only by sand/cement. Hence, he enquired the HyD whether the fixing devices were included in the design of the cladding of the retaining walls; whether such design had complied with the BD's standard of cladding of buildings; and how the HyD would deal with the slopes from Ting Kau to Tsing Lung Tau to ensure that its cladding could be maintained on the slopes. He believed that it was difficult to detect problems inside the cladding during the site inspections and enquired how the HyD would handle this problem.

78. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael stated that the panels did not have any other practical functions but making the retaining walls more beautiful. He enquired the purpose of installation of panels for the retaining walls. He opined that

nowadays, in the modern society with advanced technology, there should be some ways for further beautifying the retaining walls other than installation of panels. He thought that the major cause of the incident was the water seepage due to default on design. He enquired whether the company taking up the design of the panels in the accident was to be held responsible by the HyD. In addition, according to the HyD, the private owners were responsible for the three out of the rest of the 18 retaining walls. He enquired whether the HyD or those private owners had inspected the retaining walls since August 2016, and the work done during the said period.

79. The Acting Chairman said that similar accidents were rarely seen in Hong Kong. He wished to know the solutions to the incident and hoped that similar accidents would not occur again. He added that Members lost confidence in the HyD because the professional consultants of the HyD had failed to identify the problems according to the Maintenance Guide by the CEDD in 2015. He enquired the HyD whether it was considered that there was something wrong with the current design of the retaining wall and there was a need to follow up closely on the rest of the retaining walls so as to regain Members' confidence in HyD.

80. SE9/CWB(MWPMO) of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) the fixing method of the panels, which was designed by the contractors according to the structural types of retaining walls and constraints of physical environment, would be adopted after it was confirmed by the consultant engineers;
- (2) the panels on the retaining walls in the incident were not attached by cement only. For fixation, the panels were fastened with steel rods and seams. Also, there was a shackle to link the panel on the top and the retaining wall;
- (3) according to the investigation of the consultant engineers, this incident of spalling of some of the panels on the retaining walls was caused by the erosion due to rainwater seepage triggered by the environmental factor, i.e. the location of the panels. It was considered that this was an individual incident and similar circumstances had never happened in the past. The HyD and consultant engineers did not find any irregularities during the examination of other related panels on retaining walls. The HyD and its contractors had gained experience from the incident in order to prevent the recurrence of similar incident;
- (4) the HyD accepted the proposal on fastening steel pins from the consultant engineers and contractors because it was worrisome that similar accident would be caused by rainwater seepage. The method was first to drill holes on the surface of the existing panels to get through to the retaining walls, and then to fill the holes by putting steel pins and grout. The number of steel pins varied subject to the size of the panels;
- (5) the HyD and consultant engineers had reviewed the drainage channels at the top and bottom of the retaining wall in the accident. It was considered that they had met the standard;
- (6) the HyD accepted the proposal from the engineers and contractors and steel pins were fastened onto the panels on the other retaining walls alike;

- (7) the HyD and consultant engineers would also continue to inspect the other retaining walls alike in the vicinity of the road sections along Castle Peak Road. Follow-up action would be taken as appropriate when any irregularities were spotted;
- (8) the HyD and consultant engineers were currently checking over the information of the relevant contracts of the project. The contractors should bear the remedial cost if the accident was related to the potential problem arising from the project after investigation. Anyway, the contractor was currently carrying out the work for fastening the steel pins;
- (9) the Practical Note mentioned by the Member was applicable to the works of the BD. The design in the accident was proposed by the contractors and was approved by the consultant engineers after review; and
- (10) the contract of the project was completed in 2006. In the following few years, some land lots where the retaining walls situated were sold to the private property developers. Large-scale construction works for residential properties in the land lots were carried out by the private property developers. The HyD was not involved in the projects which were conducted by the private property developers of the residential properties subsequently. Therefore, it was not appropriate for the HyD to give any comments.

81. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris said that there were many retaining walls along the coast of Tsuen Wan West. He enquired about the locations of the two retaining walls of the same design; and whether the panels on the rest of the retaining walls were fastened by adoption of similar methods without a mechanical fixing device. Part of the Practical Note that he mentioned, which was a set of rules on architectural techniques for the information of the engineers, was about the stone cladding. He thought that the nature of work in the Practical Note was similar to that of the panels in the incident. He pointed out that the BD issued the Practical Note for reference because it was noted that there would be crisis of spalling after the panels were attached to the retaining walls. He believed that retaining walls were different from buildings. However, he opined that this incident was similar to the circumstances mentioned by the BD in the Practical Note. Hence, he enquired the HyD whether there were any standards of construction of retaining walls for compliance.

82. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael stated that if the HyD considered that the panels could be fixed firmly by fastening the steel pins, why the 20 retaining walls were not fastened with the steel pins. He thought that only this was a permanent solution to the problem. He opined that the recurrence of the similar incidents could hardly be prevented because the HyD would only carry out the inspections once a year. Hence, he requested the HyD to conduct the stabilisation works by fastening the steel pins for the 20 retaining walls. Besides, he thought it was strange that the retaining walls were built by the HyD but their maintenance works was undertaken by the private housing estates. He considered that even though the retaining walls were owned by the private housing estates, the HyD should contact the private housing estates so as to check whether the stabilisation works for the slopes had been conducted by these housing estates.

83. Mr LO Siu-kit said that the location of the incident was at the top of a plane surface and there was a slope next to it. It was not at the corner, however, as mentioned by the HyD. He did not understand why the rainwater accumulated at the said location. He pointed out that the collapsed panels were originally at the second highest location and the panel at the highest location was still attached to the retaining wall after the incident. He hoped that the HyD would study from various perspectives whether there was something wrong with the design of the panels and that similar incidents would not happen again, so as to maintain the safety of passers-by and vehicles. He had followed the engineers to learn more about the cause of incident at the scene. He thought that the HyD had failed to give a good explanation for the incident from the outcome of its investigation. There were still many doubts that had not been cleared. He hoped that the HyD would review the rest of the 18 retaining walls and carry out the necessary remedial work.

84. SE9/CWB(MWPMO) of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) the HyD would take Member's views into consideration;
- (2) the fixing method of the panels could be varied, depending on the factors such as the structural types of the retaining wall and constraints of physical environment. Apart from the retaining walls in the accident, there were "reinforced earth retaining walls" which were formed by the earth, reinforcement and panels, and these panels served as the structural part of this type of retaining wall. The other type was that the panels, which were fastened with steel rods and seams, were fixed on the retaining walls by concrete and reinforced stripes;
- (3) the HyD and consultant engineers found that one retaining wall shared the problem of water stains alike that of the retaining wall in the accident during the review of the rest of the 18 retaining walls. The HyD had adopted the recommendations from the consultant engineers and contractors that steel pins were fastened on the retaining wall; and
- (4) according to the terms of the deed of the land lot, the owner of the land lot should be responsible for the maintenance of and bear the liabilities for the slopes and retaining walls of the land lot. The owner of the land lot could consider seeking assistance from the relevant professionals if necessary. The HyD would provide assistance within its capacity.

85. The Acting Chairman enquired whether the design of the three private retaining walls was the same as that of the retaining walls in the incident.

86. SE/S(NT) of the HyD further responded as follows:

- (1) the HyD could only confirm at the moment that there was one retaining wall of similar aesthetic quality at Deauville; and
- (2) the retaining walls of aesthetic design similar to that of the retaining walls in the incident were currently included in the review programme, but their fixing methods were probably not the same. The HyD preliminarily found that a considerable amount of retaining walls were under the design of reinforced earth retaining walls. There was a very slim chance of spalling of the panels without prior signs. Hence, there would probably be a change on the number of retaining walls under the similar design of the retaining walls attracting attention in

this incident which should be followed up finally.

87. The Acting Chairman stated that the DC hoped that similar accidents would not occur again in Tsuen Wan district. It was also hoped that the departments concerned would carry out examinations and necessary work for the slopes of Castle Peak Road. Besides, he hoped that the departments concerned would provide the information of the slopes and records of follow-up work after the accident by the departments concerned to the DC for Members' reference. He thanked the representatives from the departments for attending the meeting.

IX Item 8: Propose to Conduct a Study on Automatic Self-service Postal Kiosks
(TWDC Paper No. 90/16-17)

88. The Acting Chairman stated that Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris submitted the paper. The representatives from the Hongkong Post responsible for giving response were Mr CHAN Yan-sum, Danny, Director (Product Development, Marketing and Sales) (D(PD, M&S)) and Mr LIU Kin-cheong, Steven, Senior Manager (Retail Business/Kowloon and New Territories).

89. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris introduced the paper.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael left the meeting at 6:40 p.m.)

90. D(PD, M&S) of the Hongkong Post responded as follows;
- (1) all along, information technology had been actively applying in the operation of postal services of the Hongkong Post, with a view to enhancing operational efficiency, improving customer experience enhancement and continuous developing postal services;
 - (2) the Hongkong Post had launched the Integrated Postal Services System at the counters of post offices in July 2015. The automate counter operation helped streamline the manual work procedures;
 - (3) the Hongkong Post launched self-service mail collection service through registration for a Mail Collection Number in May 2016. The general public who had enrolled for this service were able to collect the large mails, which originally through the regular door-to-door mail delivery, at the designated post office or iPostal Station, i.e. the self-service mail collection stand;
 - (4) the Hongkong Post had made an attempt to introduce the self-service postal machine several years ago but it was terminated because it not very effective due to the limited technology level; and
 - (5) in recent years, with the development of information technology, the postal authorities worldwide such as the United States, Canada, Australia and Korea had already introduced the self-help mail postal facilities. In response to the trend, the Hongkong Post had contacted the postal authorities worldwide for details of the functions and operations of these facilities. In general, these facilities could serve the general postal functions. The Hongkong Post would study whether it was suitable for implementation of these facilities locally after learning more about the details. If feasible, the Hongkong Post would launch the service on trial after taking the service demand,

resources required and requirement of venues in districts into consideration. The Hongkong Post took a positive stance towards the proposal.

91. Mr KOO Yeung-pong said that there were only five post offices in Tsuen Wan district and each of the post offices gave extensive service coverage. He opined that apart from the rural area, the automatic self-service postal kiosks for residents' convenience should also be provided for Ma Wan which was densely populated. He stated that Tsuen Wan district could serve as a spot on trial for the automatic self-service postal kiosks if the Hongkong Post considered that it was feasible after study. Subject to the outcome after it was on trial for one or two years, a decision could be made on extension of the service to other districts.

92. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis supported the implementation of the automatic self-service postal kiosks. She said that regular mails had already been replaced by e-mails or other forms of communication. She also opined that only larger mails should be delivered by postal service. Hence, she enquired whether larger mails could be delivered through the automatic self-service postal kiosks. She worried that the criminals would do illegal acts such as delivery of drugs or dangerous goods through the automatic self-service postal kiosks. She was of the view that it would be difficult to spot this problem when the mails were handled by machines automatically instead of by manual operation. In addition, she enquired whether the automatic self-service postal kiosks were equipped with scanners. She thought that the Hongkong Post should consider whether personal privacy was involved in the installation of scanners. She hoped that the Hongkong Post would be able to maintain the legal use of automatic self-service postal kiosks, with a view to providing a safe and reliable service for the general public.

93. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said that there was no post office in Ma Wan. It was relayed by the residents that they had to go to the Tsuen Wan Post Office in person when they were required to collect the mails. He opined that the automatic service could be provided for the places with no post office, islands or fairly remote areas with more inhabitants. He also hoped that the Hongkong Post would consider running the service on trial in Ma Wan.

94. Mr CHENG Chit-pun stated that the primary postal service was provided by a Mobile Post Office in his constituency twice a week. Previously, he had received comments on the postal services from the residents that large parcels could not be delivered through the Mobile Post Office. He had made enquiries to the Hongkong Post for this problem. In reply, however, the Hongkong Post said that it was difficult to solve this problem because the size of the windows for postal delivery were standardised and the general public were required to deliver the larger mails at the post offices in Tsuen Wan. Besides, he had enquired whether this problem could be solved by the new technology when visiting the Central Mail Centre earlier, so he supported the proposal of provision of automatic self-service postal kiosks. He opined that iPostal Station was suitable for the residents in remote areas such as Sham Tseng and Tsing Lung Tau. It could only facilitate the mail collection but could not solve the problem of mail delivery. He hoped that the Hongkong Post would implement the automatic self-service postal kiosks which could serve multi functions.

95. D(PD, M&S) of the Hongkong Post thanked Members for their views and responded as follows:

- (1) Tsuen Wan district was a large place but some of the areas were not densely populated. For better use of resources, the Hongkong Post was unable to set up post offices in each and every site in Tsuen Wan district;
- (2) the Hongkong Post had all along been studying the development of self-service postal machine but the information technology was not in progress in tandem with it, and the outcome of the testing at earlier time was not very effective;
- (3) as the information technology nowadays was under advanced development and similar facilities had been in use globally, the Hongkong Post would study the two systems of self-service postal machine and iPostal Station for combination of the two functions of collection and delivery of mails; and
- (4) the Hongkong Post was uncertain as to the feasibility of the captioned proposal and its implementation in the same mode for different locations. Yet, the Hongkong Post was agreeable to the conduct of research and testing towards the main direction of the service and would discuss with the Members on the suitable spots on trial.

96. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris was glad to note that the Hongkong Post stayed positive to his proposal. He pointed out that according to the Audit Commission's report, the operational efficacy of the Mobile Post Office was relatively low at present. Each Mobile Post Office only served 11.5 members of the public and handled 12.5 mails daily on average. Given that the automatic self-service postal kiosks was suitable for implementation in Hong Kong, he believed that the service of these kiosks would be provided more effectively, if they were provided in the same district for a long period of time, comparing to the Mobile Post Office which only provided service for half an hour. It could also help the Hongkong Post to cut its expenditure. He anticipated that the Hongkong Post would carry out a study on the above service and hoped that good news would be learnt from the Hongkong Post.

97. The Acting Chairman thanked the representatives from the Hongkong Post for attending the meeting. It was hoped that the Hongkong Post would carry out a study on the feasibility of implementation of the automatic self-service postal kiosks. The implementation of the automatic self-service postal kiosks on trial in Tsuen Wan district and extension of the service by the Hongkong Post were also welcome.

X Item 9: Request the Government to be Concerned about the Possible Dangers and Problems Related to Subdivided Units
(TWDC Paper No. 91/16-17)

98. The Acting Chairman stated that Mr KOO Yeung-pong, the Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben and Mr LO Siu-kit submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr LAM Shu-wing, Vincent, DDC(TW), HKPF;
- (2) Ms LAU Chui-ying, Bo, Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan) (PCRO(TW)), HKPF;
- (3) Miss TONG Sze-yin, Engineer/NTW (Customer Services) Inspection, Water Supplies Department (WSD);

- (4) Mr KO Po-wai, Senior Health Inspector (Environmental Hygiene) Tsuen Wan 2, FEHD;
- (5) Mr LEUNG Chun-wai, Professional Officer 1/Joint Office 2 (PO1/JO2), Joint Office (JO);
- (6) Ms WONG Yan-yan, Senior Building Surveyor/D5 (SBS/D5), BD;
- (7) Mr LEUNG Kwok-chu, Gilbert, New Territories South Divisional Commander (Acting) (NTSDC Atg.), FSD;
- (8) Mr CHEUNG Ngao-tin, Station Commander, Tsuen Wan Fire Station, FSD;
- (9) Mr LO Kam-lun, Alan, District Lands Officer (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing) (DLO(DLO, TW&KT)), Lands D; and
- (10) Mr TSE Hing-chit, Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing) (AA/L(DLO, TW&KT)), Lands D.

Besides, the written replies of the BD, Lands D and HKPF were tabled at the meeting.

99. Mr KOO Yeung-pong introduced the paper.

100. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben said that the Government should be more concerned about the “subdivided units” because fires had been broken out in these units which triggered the possible hazards to law and order as well as environmental hygiene in the district. He pointed out that the flat owner could not be contacted when a fire broke out in Yi Pei Square. Even worse, the name of the flat owner was not shown from the Land Registry. As a result, the contact of the flat owner for the details of design of the flat remained unsettled. Hence, he had proposed earlier that the Government should set up a registration system for “subdivided units” to record the layout plans and contact persons of the “subdivided units” and that the contact persons were required to receive regular training for management of “subdivided units”. He opined that the “subdivided units” emerged due to the housing problem; and that the registration system for “subdivided units” was only a method for management of the “subdivided units” and it had nothing to do with the lawfulness of the “subdivided units”. He noted from a talk on fire safety held in the district earlier that the “subdivided units” were not equipped with fire extinguishers, so he thought that the Government should require that a considerable amount of fire extinguishers should be provided in the “subdivided units”. Besides, he opined that the housing problem could not be solved by the “subdivided units”. He hoped that the Government would consider providing transitional housing for the people living in the “subdivided units” and the people in need of houses in the waiting queue for the public housing; otherwise, the number of “subdivided units” would in turn on the surge. Moreover, he pointed out that the problem of the prostitutes’ trading of sex service by hiring the “subdivided units” in urban areas was fairly serious. He hoped that the Police would take a serious view on this problem.

101. Mr LO Siu-kit said that Stage 7 of Tak Yan Building in the town centre of Tsuen Wan was incorporated into the BD’s special major operation. However, the BD had never instituted prosecution officially against any of the flats in Tak Yan Building since 2013. After the BD’s staff who were responsible for the special major operation referred the case to the BD’s district staff in Tsuen Wan for follow-up work upon the failure to institute prosecution for the problem of the mezzanine floor of Tak Yan Building till 2015, he came to note that the target buildings in the BD’s special major operation could only be followed up by the BD’s staff who were

responsible for the special major operation, and that the BD's district staff in Tsuen Wan was not in a position to carry out the follow-up work. As at the day before, he noted that the BD had issued four advisory letters to the three "subdivided units" for operation of "one-woman brothels" on the 1/F and to the one "subdivided unit" on the 2/F of Tak Yan Building. The owner of the "subdivided unit" on the 2/F undertook to make improvements. He pointed out that only four flats and one mezzanine floor in Tak Yan Building were found non-compliance of the laws and regulations. Since 2013, however, the BD had only referred one of the flats, which did not give any response to the BD, to its prosecution section, and formal prosecution could only be instituted in at least two months. He was dissatisfied with this. Since the implementation of the Minor Works Control System, the flat owners were required to inform the BD of all changes to the premises in principle; otherwise the BD would not carry out inspections for the changes to the premises, including the flats being converted into "subdivided units". He enquired whether a notification to the BD for inspection was to be served in seven days after a flat was converted into a "subdivided unit". He added that the owners' corporation could call 1823 to inform the BD for carrying out the inspections after illegal alteration of the premises was found. He pointed out that according to the current policy of the BD, the BD would only carry out inspections after the flat owners took initiative to make reports to the BD. He believed that most of the owners of the "subdivided units" would not take initiative to report what they had done to their flats. That was the reason for the deterioration of the problem of "subdivided units" in the town centre of Tsuen Wan. To address this problem, it was important for the BD to carry out the elementary gate-keeping duties. At present, there was a pressing demand of housing from the general public but the Government could not address their needs within a short period of time. As a result, the housing in the form of "subdivided units" emerged. Hence, he hoped that the Government would study how the problem of "subdivided units" could be solved effectively, including the problems of water seepage, thickening of floor slabs or the structural problems arising from alteration of the flats, as well as the possible fire safety problems caused by provision of additional doors and windows, in order to ensure the safety of the tenants of "subdivided units" and the occupants of the buildings where "subdivided units" existed. Furthermore, he was of the view that if the relevant policies remained unchanged, the problem of "one-woman brothel" or "single-room one-woman brothel" would not be resolved. He requested the Legislative Council Members to discuss how the policies could be improved at the Legislative Council in order to combat the problems of "subdivided units" and prostitution more effectively.

102. SBS/D5 of the BD responded as follows:

- (1) the BD had mentioned in its written reply the initiatives taken for solving the building safety problem of the "subdivided units";
- (2) the BD handled the safety problem of building hardware by virtue of the Buildings Ordinance (Chapter 123). However, the area as to whether unlawful trading was involved in the use of the building was not covered by the Buildings Ordinance;
- (3) the BD ensured the building safety by legislation in the first place and the works relating to "subdivided units" were incorporated into the Minor Works Control System in order to deal with the quality of the works relating to "subdivided units" at source;

- (4) on law enforcement, the BD adopted its prevailing policy on law enforcement to handle first the irregularities which caused imminent danger, obviously constituted threats or brought about nuisances to the environment, including constituting threats to fire safety such as hindrance to escape routes or removal of smoke door, excessive thickening of floor screeding leading to overloading of floor slabs, or causing serious problem of water seepage;
- (5) the BD not only handled the reports of illegal “subdivided units” from the general public, but had also carried out a large-scale operation since 2011 to inspect the target domestic/composite buildings where “subdivided units” existed, with a view to taking law enforcement actions for the irregularities relating to the “subdivided units” orderly and systematically. It was an offence if any person failed to comply with the removal order without reasonable excuse. The maximum penalty was a fine of \$200,000 and one-year’s imprisonment upon conviction, and a further fine of \$20,000 at maximum for each day during which the offence continued. In general, the irregularities relating to “subdivided units” in the domestic/composite buildings could be eliminated through rectification or improvement works. This was different from the situation of industrial buildings because the conversion of the flats of industrial buildings for domestic purpose would pose the greatest risk on fire safety to the occupants in these flats, and such risk could not be eliminated only by rectification or improvement works. Hence, the “subdivided units” in industrial buildings were definitely not suitable for domestic purpose. The BD was dedicated to the eradication of domestic use of the flats in industrial buildings;
- (6) the public education and publicity was strengthened by the BD on the common irregularities and possible risks of the works for “subdivided units” and engagement of relevant professionals and registered contractors for the works. Also, the BD had briefed the property management personnel and the trade on the possible problems of “subdivided units”, key features of the Buildings Ordinance and relevant liabilities through talks and seminars. In addition, the BD had organised regularly the “Building Safety Certificate” Courses, including the building and fire safety problems of the premises where “subdivided units” existed, for the flat owners, tenants, members of owner’ corporations, members of owners’ committees and members of mutual aid committees of private buildings;
- (7) Stage 7 of Tak Yan Building was one of the target buildings of BD’s large-scale operation in 2013. The BD selected the target buildings and engaged the consultant company through open tendering in 2013. The consultant company commenced the inspection work and submitted the inspection reports to the BD in 2014. The BD issued four orders to Stage 1 of Tak Yan Building for rectification of the irregularities relating to “subdivided units” in 2015. Subsequently, some of the flat owners applied for extension of rectification period or requested for assistance. Currently, compliance with one of the orders was ensured and the BD would continue to follow up the remaining three orders which had not yet been complied with.

Recently, the flat owners concerned contacted the BD immediately and undertook to carry out the improvement works after they were served warning letters by the BD. However, it was found that the improvement works had never been carried out since the letter was served one month ago. Therefore, the BD decided to institute prosecution against the flat owners concerned; and

- (8) regarding the fire in Yi Pei Square last year, the BD had immediately issued orders to the flat owners of the building concerned after the fire. The representatives of the flat owners concerned had taken initiative to contact the BD and the works required in the orders had been completed.

103. NTSDC Atg. of the FSD responded as follows:

- (1) it was undesirable for the FSD to carry out the fire-fighting and rescue work in the small “subdivided units” of the flats of a building because the design of layout was relatively complicated. The firemen had to break open a number of doors for entering the “subdivided units” to put out the fire and carry out the rescue. Moreover, the mobility of the residents of “subdivided units” was comparatively higher. There were sundries inside and outside the “subdivided units” and the passageways were narrow. All these factors had made it harder for the rescue and search work carried out by the firemen when there was a fire;
- (2) in dealing with the circumstances of these “subdivided units”, after receiving numerous reports for help in fire, the Fire Services Communications Centre would deploy additional rescue teams for search and rescue operations so as to further ensure people’s lives and properties;
- (3) the FSD had all along been paying close attention to the fire safety problem of the buildings in the district and assigned its staff to carry out inspections for the buildings in the district frequently. The FSD would refer the case to the departments concerned for follow-up if suspected “subdivided units” were found in the flats of the buildings during the inspections;
- (4) the FSD had carried out over 4 000 inspections for the buildings in Tsuen Wan district over the past two years. A total of 18 flats of suspected “subdivided units” were found in the course of inspections and the cases had been referred to the BD for follow-up;
- (5) the FSD had all along been paying close attention to the problem of “subdivided units” in the district and was pleased to collect the views from different localities in the community. The FSD would invite the localities, including the residents of three nil buildings or building management personnel, to take up the fire safety ambassadors or building fire safety envoys to assist in carrying out the inspections for irregularities in the buildings they lived. The FSD would carry out the law enforcement work after they made referral of the irregularities found during the inspections, if any, to the FSD;
- (6) the FSD had frequently organised fire talks and fire drills for the residents in the district, with a view to enhancing their awareness of fire safety. Over the past two years, the FSD had organised 88 fire

prevention talks with over 2 000 participants in total and had conducted 48 fire escape drills with over 1 000 participants in total; and

- (7) the FSD also organised large-scale fire prevention publicity regularly basis, including the Tsuen Wan District Fire Safety Carnival, Visit to Three Nil Buildings and Tsuen Wan Fire Safety Bus Parade.

104. PO1/JO2 of the JO responded as follows:

- (1) after receiving the report of water seepage, the staff of the JO would carry out inspection for the flat. If the flat of suspected water seepage was a “subdivided unit”, the JO would make referral to the staff of the BD for follow-up; and
- (2) if it was found by the JO that the source of water seepage was due to the additional drainage pipes, the JO would issue the Nuisance Notice to the flat owner concerned for repair of the drainage pipes.

105. DDC(TW) of the HKPF responded as follows:

- (1) the “one-woman brothel” or “single-room one-woman brothel” as indicated in the paper submitted by the HKPF at the meeting was not unlawful under the existing legislation. It was also quite difficult to adopt the strategies for combating the operation of “one-woman brothel” by legislation;
- (2) the Police could only make application to the court for closure of the premises for six months if the owner, tenant or person in charge of the premises was convicted for the offence of management of vice establishment and such offence was committed again within a period beginning 4 months after and ending 16 months after the conviction, as stipulated in section 153A of the Crimes Ordinance (Chapter 200). The HKPF had paid much attention to the development of the situations;
- (3) although it was relatively difficult to combat the problem of “one-woman brothel” or “single-room one-woman brothel” in the “subdivided unit” by legislation, the HKPF had successfully ceased the operation of 13 “subdivided units” since 2016. The HKPF was striving for identifying the tenants or flat owners of the 18 “subdivided units”. It was hoped that these “subdivided units” would cease operation; and
- (4) it was hoped that the regular undercover operations and high-profile patrols carried out by the HKPF would deter the operation of prostitution in Tsuen Wan district.

106. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis said that she had received complaints about the “subdivided units”. The flat owner relayed to her that the flat next to him was converted into a “subdivided unit” and it was extremely unfair. Also, the amount of refuse from the “subdivided units” was more than that of the other flats. She enquired about the report of the problem of the flats of “subdivided units”. After making enquiries, she noted from the BD that the person who reported to the BD should provide evidence to prove that there was something wrong with the layout of the flats of “subdivided units”. She opined that it was not easy for general public to identify the professionals to assist in reviewing the layout. Besides, she thought that

the problem of “subdivided units” could not be resolved by the existing mechanisms of the departments. Hence, she supported that a registration system for “subdivided units” should be set up and requested the BD to carry out regular examination for the registered “subdivided units”. She was of the view that the approach taken by the HKPF should be drawn for reference for the units which were reported without registration, and that the BD and FSD should set up a joint office for blitz inspections and undercover operations in order to protect the interest of the residents. As the residents were very concerned about whether the structural and fire safety of the buildings were affected by the “subdivided units”, she hoped that the departments would study the relevant proposals in depth in order to ensure the safety of Hong Kong people.

(Note: Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris left the meeting at 6:40 p.m.)

107. Mr KOO Yeung-pong enquired whether the BD currently exercised a more stringent or more lenient control over the “subdivided units” when compared to its control over these units prior to the Building (Minor Works) Regulation (the Regulation) which came into effect on 3 October 2012. He said that the Regulation did not target at particular years of construction of the buildings and most of the “subdivided units” were found in the three nil old-styled buildings, say, the unit next to his councillor’s office was a suspected “subdivided unit”. Besides, he enquired how many residents of the “subdivided units” would carry out the works via lawful persons after the Regulation came into effect. He guessed that most of the cases handled by the JO for Investigation of Water Seepage Complaints were about the water seepage problems arising from the “subdivided units”. He also enquired whether the BD had prepared for the estimated number of “subdivided units” in Tsuen Wan. He noted that many flats of some buildings in the district were being converted into “subdivided units”, leading to a rapid surge of residents of the buildings and constituting the fire safety problems. He worried that the residents were unable to escape when there was a fire.

108. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben said he hoped that the departments would be concerned about the problem of “subdivided units” which could not be solved by Tsuen Wan district on its own. He was held responsible for relaying the reality of the problem to government departments, so that the problems triggered by the crimes, law and order, and fire would not be getting worse. He pointed out that the BD was responsible for handling the hazardous building problems, but the BD avoided discussing Members’ viewpoints, such as the construction of “subdivided units” by heavyweight concrete. Also, the BD did carry out the large-scale operation to handle the problems such as illegal structures but the focus was wrongly put, say, on issuing an order to request the owner of Wong Kam Building to improve the windowsills, which was so minor that did not constitute danger to public safety, comparing to the issue of “subdivided units”. He opined that there was something wrong with the BD’s work and enquired whether the BD should accord priority to the work associated with safety and people’s lives.

109. Mr LO Siu-kit said that the BD had issued four warning letters to Stage 7 of Tak Yan Building since 2013. In other words, the BD also considered that the units being served with warning letters were potentially dangerous, but the BD had only

instituted prosecution until December 2016. He enquired what the flat owners did, so that the law enforcement work had been delayed for more than two years. He opined that the BD had only handled the trivialities; after all, tolerance was given to the problems of such obvious non-compliance which had been addressed by warning letters. He thought that this was undesirable. He pointed out that the general public was concerned about the safety of the “subdivided units” and the whole building. He was of the view that the BD should handle the problem by priorities. He also considered that many outstanding cases were pending for clearance due to the insufficient manpower of the department. He hoped that the Government would increase the manpower of the department to handle these outstanding cases first and then initiate direct investigation after clearance of these cases, in order to improve the overall situation.

110. Mr KOT Siu-yuen stated that the flats of a number of single block private buildings equipped with elevators at Lo Tak Court were converted into “subdivided units”. He found during the home visit conducted earlier that a number of foreign domestic helpers were living in a flat. He opined that it was probably another type of vice establishment. He enquired how the HKPF would handle such cases.

111. Mr CHOW Ping-tim opined that the “subdivided units” or housing problem should be solved by making amendments to the Buildings Ordinance. He pointed out that the existing Buildings Ordinance, which had been adopted for decades, could not solve the problem of “subdivided units”. The problem of “subdivided units” could only be eradicated by getting to the bottom. He was of the view that the ratio of conversion for “subdivided units” and the limit of the number of the rental flats should be stipulated in the Buildings Ordinance. As the BD was not authorised to arrange its staff to enter the flat for investigation under the Buildings Ordinance and there was no dedicated teams for undercover operations in the BD, the BD could only solve the problems such as the windowsill which could be spotted outside a flat. He thought that the BD should take initiative to or the Legislative Council Members should put forth the amendments to the Buildings Ordinance. Besides, he said that the FSD could also consider appointing the District Council Members to be the fire safety ambassadors to assist the FSD in carrying out inspections.

112. SBS/D5 of the BD responded as follows:

- (1) the BD was concerned about the building safety in Tsuen Wan district;
- (2) since October 2012, the common works relating to “subdivided units” had been incorporated into the “Minor Works Control System” under the Buildings Ordinance, including the erection of non-load bearing block wall, laying of solid floor screeding, or erection/alteration of aboveground drain. Previously, the exempted works referred to the works relating to “subdivided units” in compliance with the relevant legal requirements that did not affect the building structure. After the Building (Minor Works) Regulation came into effect, the owners should appoint the designated registered contractors or the designated general building professionals, if necessary, to carry out the building works through the simple and effective procedures in order to elevate its quality and enhance building safety;
- (3) as at September 2016, the BD had received 13 000 information by submission under the minor works. The BD did not have the figures

- on the quantities of “subdivided units” for each district;
- (4) Wong Kam Building was one of the target buildings in the BD’s large-scale operation. The aim of the operation was to handle the illegal structures inside and outside the buildings, but it had nothing to do with the “subdivided units”. The external wall of Wong Kam Building was equipped with window shutters but these shutters were moved to the edge of the building which had become the exterior illegal structures constituting threats to the general public after the flat owners moved in. Hence, this was one of the illegal structures which had to be eradicated in the large-scale operation;
 - (5) the BD would closely follow up the remaining removal orders for Tak Yan Buildings; and
 - (6) the BD not only carried out the large-scale operation for direct inspection of the target buildings where “subdivided units” existed, but also handled the reports from the general public. The Government’s policy was not to eradicate all subdivided flats but to ensure their safety. Hence, the BD would follow up on the construction works which constituted dangers to the fire and building structural safety or caused water seepage. Members could contact the BD if follow-up work for individual cases was required.

113. In summary, the Acting Chairman said that many Members were concerned about the problem of “subdivided units”. Currently, there were numerous “subdivided units” in Tsuen Wan district and Members had received a number of complaints about these units. They had to contact the dedicated departments to solve the problem, subject to the circumstances. For example, the problem of “one-woman brothel” was handled by the Police; the structural problem was handled by the BD; the water seepage problem was handled by Water Supplies Department or JO for Investigation of Water Seepage Complaints. As the BD undertook the greatest responsibility of all amongst the various departments, he hoped that the BD would understand the TWDC’s concern over the problem of “subdivided units”, and that the BD would follow up the cases of suspected “subdivided units” referred by the Members, and that the BD would conduct the follow-up work and report to the Members, so that Members could explain to the general public. Although the BD did not have the figures of “subdivided units” in Tsuen Wan district, he still wished to know the number of cases under process in the district, including the number of cases under inspection over the past year, number of cases for actions about to be taken, and the number of cases in which irregularities were found after inspections. He considered that the BD should be able to provide the above figures.

114. SBS/D5 of the BD responded as follows:

- (1) the BD had handled more than 100 reports relating to “subdivided units” as at October 2016; and
- (2) there were 33 target buildings in Tsuen Wan district for the large-scale operation. All the actions had been taken for four out of 33 target buildings and the remaining target buildings were in process.

115. The Acting Chairman requested the BD to submit the figures on “subdivided units” to the DC after the meeting. The DC would follow up the problem of “subdivided units” with the BD in writing after the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The Secretariat had requested the BD to follow up the problem of “subdivided units” in writing on 11 January 2017.)

XI Item 10: “Strongly Request the Transport Department to Devise Comprehensive Improvement Measures for the Traffic Network Covering the Roads Connected to the Junctions of Yeung Uk Road/Luen Yan Street/Ma Tau Pa Street/Wing Shun Street/Texaco Road/Wang Lung Street in order to Ensure a Reasonably Smooth and Safe Traffic Flow of the Roads in the Above Areas and Meet the Needs of Various Areas Fairly.”

(TWDC Paper No. 92/16-17)

116. The Chairman stated that Mr CHOW Ping-tim submitted the paper. The representative from the Transport Department (TD) responsible for giving response was Mr LAM Chun-cheuk, Tim, Engineer/Tsuen Wan 1 (E/TW1).

117. Mr CHOW Ping-tim introduced the paper.

118. E/TW1 of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) the improvement proposal for Wang Lung Street had been discussed at the meeting of the TWDC on 26 July 2016;
- (2) in 2011, the TD carried out a consultation through the TWDO for provision of a pedestrian crossing at Wang Lung Street and Ma Tau Pa Road. The TD observed that the public generally were reluctant to use the footbridge 60 metres away and they opted to cross Ma Tau Pa Road at the road junction, thus causing a traffic safety problem. After consideration, a pedestrian crossing was provided at Wang Lung Street and Ma Tau Pa Street by the TD for the passers-by as appropriate. The vehicular traffic from Wang Lung Street would be directed to the left or to the right, heading to Ma Tau Pa Road;
- (3) the existing traffic signal arrangements were not affected by the pedestrian crossing provided at Ma Tau Pa Road near Texaco Road;
- (4) the synchronicity of the traffic signals currently implemented for Wing Shun Street (northbound), Texaco Road and Ma Tau Pa Road was not the first-time measure. The TD had earlier implemented similar traffic arrangements at the junction of Luen Yan Street which was directed from the left of Yeung Uk Road for enhancement of traffic safety; and
- (5) the TD was currently devising the traffic improvement proposals for Wing Shun Street, Ma Tau Pa Road, Texaco Road and Luen Yan Street, including a study on widening the road sections in the vicinity of Luen Yan Street and Ma Tau Pa Road, in order to relieve the vehicular traffic of Ma Tau Pa Road southbound and northbound.

119. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben supported that consideration should be given to the traffic for the district as a whole. As the traffic of the whole district and residents of Riviera Gardens, Wing Shun Street and Tsing Yi would be affected by the traffic congestion from the factory site with the tailback extending to the roundabout of Texaco Road, he opined that making improvements to the problem of traffic congestion at the factory site was a local affair and council duty of Tsuen Wan district.

120. Mr CHOW Ping-tim was dissatisfied with the reply from the TD. He opined that the TD had given a fallacious statement for the reason of provision of a pedestrian crossing at Wang Lung Street that the pedestrians were reluctant to use the footbridge. He pointed out that as the passers-by were reluctant to use the pedestrian crossing facility at the junction of Wing Shun Street and Texaco Road heading to Tsuen Wan Park and the pedestrian flow over the place was low, the pedestrian crossing facility outside Gunzetal Limited was sufficient for pedestrians' use. Thus, he requested the TD to demolish the pedestrian crossing facility at Wang Lung Street for a smoother vehicular flow. He added that the TD should have anticipated that a pedestrian crossing facility was to be provided at land lot 393 when the TD proposed in 2011 that a pedestrian crossing was provided at Wang Lung Street. He also thought that the TD should not provide a pedestrian crossing at Wang Lung Street in 2011. Instead, the TD should request the developer for provision of pedestrian crossing facility in the course of the design for 393 development project. In addition, he was of the view that the TD had missed the best opportunity of the road widening works for a smoother vehicular traffic from Ma Tau Pa Road directed to the left into Yeung Uk Road because the location in question was under construction of a lift base and there was no room for road widening works. He pointed out that currently, the vehicles from Wang Lung Street were forbidden to turn right. Also, when the vehicles on the fast lane opposite the traffic lane set off, the vehicles on the traffic lane would set off as well. After the provision of the pedestrian crossing facility, the vehicular flow would be held up for 22 seconds. Hence, he thought that the proposal was unreasonable. He considered that the TD should not consider the proposal of provision of a pedestrian crossing facility only. Moreover, he requested the TD to demolish the pedestrian crossing facility at the junction of Wing Shun Street and Texaco Road heading to Tsuen Wan Park in order to maintain the vehicular flow, if the TD was not going to demolish the pedestrian crossing at Wing Shun Street.

121. The Chairman requested E/TW1 of the TD to discuss how the relevant traffic problem could be solved with the Members concerned and the Traffic and Transport Committee after the meeting.

XII Item 11: Request to Solve Problems on the Unlawful Operation of Postal and Delivery Business and Street Obstruction Arising Thereof at Lo Tak Court
(TWDC Paper No. 93/16-17)

122. The Chairman stated that Mr KOT Siu-yuen submitted the paper. The representatives from departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr LAM Shu-wing, Vincent, DDC(TW), HKPF;
- (2) Ms LAU Chui-ying, Bo, PCRO(TW), HKPF;
- (3) Mr LO Kam-lun, Alan, DLO(DLO, TW&KT), Lands D;
- (4) Mr TSE Hing-chit, AA/L(DLO, TW&KT), Lands D;
- (5) Ms KHATTAK Nasreen, District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan) (DEHS(TW)), FEHD; and
- (6) Mr CHONG Kong-sang, Patrick, Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan) (ADO(TW)), TWDO.

Besides, the written reply of the HKPF was tabled at the meeting.

123. Mr KOT Siu-yuen introduced the paper.

124. ADO(TW) of the TWDO responded as follows:
- (1) after being relayed by the Members and general public the problem of gathering of the foreign domestic helpers which had become worse since mid-November 2016, the TWDO had learnt more about the incident from the relevant law enforcement authorities and liaised with the relevant law enforcement authorities to deploy the staff to communicate with the foreign helpers and other relevant members of the public at the scene in Lo Tak Court according to the circumstances;
 - (2) the TWDO and relevant departments had reminded the people concerned of keeping the public area clear when they stayed there and not to bring about nuisances and impacts to the passers-by and residents nearby; and
 - (3) after the TWDO and relevant departments made appeals and gave advice, the situation in the vicinity of Lo Tak Court was improved on last two Sundays. The TWDO believed that the relevant law enforcement authorities would continue to monitor the situation closely and conduct the follow-up work as appropriate. The TWDO was pleased to maintain a close liaison with the law enforcement authorities and relayed the views from the DC and residents to the law enforcement authorities.
125. DDC(TW) of the HKPF responded as follows:
- (1) the Police had also deployed staff to conduct inspections in the vicinity of Lo Tak Court on previous Sundays; and
 - (2) currently, the Police did not find anyone who carried out packaging on the pedestrian roads in the vicinity of Castle Peak Road. The packaging was mainly carried out outside the Hong Kong Red Cross Donor Centre. The Police had deployed its staff at the scene to ensure that the pedestrian roads were kept clear and the situation was obviously improved.
126. DEHS(TW) of the FEHD responded as follows:
- (1) thanked Members for their assistance on facilitating the communication between the law enforcement authorities and the relevant company. The person-in-charge of the company had also exercised self-discipline and adopted the advice from the departments. As a result, the situation was obviously improved on last two Sundays; and
 - (2) the FEHD was not held responsible for handling the problem of noise nuisance. It was hoped that the responsible departments would offer assistance on this matter.
127. AA/L(DLO, TW&KT) of the Lands D responded as follows:
- (1) on combating the illegal street obstruction, the District Lands Office (DLO) took up the role of assisting the relevant departments in demolishing the structures at the locations concerned; and
 - (2) the DLO did not find any illegal structures from the relevant cases.
128. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben opined that it was noisy in Lo Tak Court and it was really undesirable. The foreign domestic helpers also placed the goods around

the place. He hoped that the departments concerned not only gave advice to them, but also handled the problem by virtue of the Summary Offences Ordinance (Chapter 228) or reserved a designated area at certain road sections or road surface for the foreign domestic helpers to use the postal service. If they used the postal service outside the designated area, the law enforcement action should be taken against them by virtue of section 4A of the Summary Offences Ordinance; otherwise, they would only continue to use the postal service at the said location which triggered dissatisfaction from the residents. He hoped that the departments concerned would study the solutions for duly handling the problem and should not delay in handling the problem after the Christmas holidays because the foreign domestic helpers would cease using the postal service at the said location. By that time, the problem would disappear and the opportunity of handling the problem was missed out.

129. The Chairman suggested that the TWDO should discuss the relevant follow-up work with the departments concerned, in order to minimise the noise nuisance from the packaging by the foreign domestic helpers.

130. ADO(TW) of the TWDO responded as follows:

- (1) the TWDO was well aware that the problem had brought inconvenience to the residents. The TWDO would closely monitor the situation with the HKPF and FEHD and enhance the communication with the members of the public. It was to advise that they should exercise the civic virtue and should not bring about improper nuisances and impacts to other passers-by or residents when using the public areas; and
- (2) the departments concerned would study in depth and seek other feasible solutions. However, Members' understanding was sought because, given the existing systems and rules, it was necessary to carry out further studies on the feasibility of the solutions to address the circumstances which were relatively complicated. For example, land issues might be involved in and attention from residents and localities might be drawn for Member's proposal on reservation of a designated area on the road surface for the foreign domestic helpers to use the post service.

131. Mr KOT Siu-yuen thanked for the assistance of the TWDO, HKPF and FEHD and noted that the situation was obviously improved over the past two weeks. For example, the road outside the elevator at Castle Peak Road – Tsuen Wan was clear. He said that the people who carried out the packaging at Foo Yu Building and Lik Sang Plaza were cleared after the operations taken by the law enforcement authorities, but they went to some other places such as PCCW Tsuen Wan Exchange Building and Cheong Wah Building for packaging. Hence, he still received complaints that the residents in Lo Tak Court could not rest and nuisances were caused due to the packaging starting at 7:00 a.m. to 8:00 a.m. on Sundays. He hoped that the effective joint operations of TWDO, HKPF and FEHD would be maintained and the packaging would start later due to the joint operations. Besides, he noted from the interview in relation to the said street obstruction conducted earlier by the mass media that the foreign domestic helpers who took up the packaging work on a part-time basis on Sundays were suspected to have breached the Employment Ordinance. He hoped that the Immigration Department would conduct investigations in order to eradicate

the packaging work taken up by the foreign domestic helpers illegally.

132. The Chairman thanked the representatives from the departments for attending the meeting and requested the relevant departments to relay the situation of contravention of the conditions of stay by the foreign domestic helpers to the Immigration Department.

XIII Item 12: “Request Various Departments to Handle the Problem of Street Obstruction Caused by the Goods and Sundries Placed Outside the Shops in Tsuen Wan Town Centre During Holidays”
(TWDC Paper No. 94/16-17)

133. The Chairman stated that Mr TAM Hoi-pong submitted the paper. The representatives from departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr LAM Shu-wing, Vincent, DDC(TW), HKPF;
- (2) Ms LAU Chui-ying, Bo, PCRO(TW), HKPF;
- (3) Mr LO Kam-lun, Alan, DLO(DLO, TW&KT), Lands D;
- (4) Mr TSE Hing-chit, AA/L(DLO, TW&KT), Lands D; and
- (5) Ms KHATTAK Nasreen, DEHS(TW), FEHD.

Besides, the written replies of the Tourism Commission and HKPF were tabled at the meeting.

134. Mr TAM Hoi-pong introduced the paper.

135. DEHS(TW) of the FEHD responded as follows:

- (1) the FEHD, together with the HKPF, had all along been enforcing the Fixed Penalty (Public Cleanliness and Obstruction) Ordinance (Chapter 570) and liaised with the HKPF and Lands D to take part in the “District-led Actions Scheme” (DAS) coordinated by the TWDO; and
- (2) on Sunday, the FEHD, together with the HKPF, would step up the inspections of the shops in Tsuen Wan town centre and issue warnings to the shops for causing street obstruction due to placement of goods and sundries outside the shops. The law enforcement actions would be taken when necessary.

136. The Chairman said that after the Fixed Penalty (Public Cleanliness and Obstruction) Ordinance (Chapter 570) came into effect and the DAS was implemented, he noted that the law enforcement authorities had stepped up the inspection work for Chuen Lung Street and Market Street in Tsuen Wan as well as giving advice to and taking law enforcement actions against the shops, in order to improve the problem of street obstruction. Should serious street obstruction occur in future, he would request the Members to contact the FEHD directly for follow-ups.

XIV Item 13: Crime Brief for Tsuen Wan District – Comparison of Crime Statistics between September to October 2016 and September to October 2015
(TWDC Paper No. 95/16-17)

137. DDC(TW) of the HKPF reported the situation of the crimes in Tsuen Wan district.

138. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben commended the Police for rapidly detecting a case of suspicious indecent assault of a child aged four in Tsuen Wan Park recently. He said that similar cases in other districts were still under investigation and a deterrent effect could be achieved as the case was rapidly detected in Tsuen Wan. It was applauded by different sectors of the community. He added that the on-street prostitution at Ho Pui Street and Chung On Street in the morning and in the evening was very serious. He enquired whether the Police would take the large-scale operations to combat the on-street prostitution. Besides, he noted that the Police would issue enclosure orders to the flats for prostitution for a long period of time. Hence, he enquired whether the combating actions against prostitution and figures on successful enclosure of the flats for prostitution could be included in the Crime Brief for the DC's reference.

139. DDC(TW) of the HKPF responded as follows:

- (1) the Police had taken regular undercover operations and committed to identifying the staff suitable for taking undercover operations. This year, the numbers of arrests in the undercover operations and prostitutes had increased, compared to those of the same period of last year;
- (2) the Police would also conduct high-profile patrols at the locations where prostitutes frequently appeared and would increase the frequency of patrols in order to achieve a deterrent effect;
- (3) according to section 153A of the Crimes Ordinance (Chapter 200), the Police could enclose the flat, which was permitted by anyone for prostitution, for six months. On the other hand, it was stipulated in the above Ordinance that the Police could only make application to the court for closure of the premises for six months if the owner, tenant or person in charge of the premises was convicted for the offence of management of vice establishment and such offence was committed again within a period beginning 4 months after and ending 16 months after the conviction. Hence, the above Ordinance targeted at the vice massage establishments but did not target at the "one-woman brothels" or "single-room one-woman brothels" of the "subdivided flats";
- (4) the HKPF had successfully applied for the enclosure of the vice massage establishments for six months, but it would be more difficult to enclose the flats of "one-woman brothels" or "single-room one-woman brothels";
- (5) it was difficult for the HKPF to institute prosecution against prostitution or to provide evidence for prostitution. However, the Police would meet and caution the owners or tenants who were arrested due to prostitution in their flats and duly impose pressure on the owners and tenants of the flats. It was hoped that they would cease letting out their flats or cease permitting the prostitution in these "one-woman brothels" or "single-room one-woman brothels"; and
- (6) till present, the HKPF had successfully advised the owners or tenants of 13 "subdivided flats" who had let out their "subdivided flats" to the Mainland women for prostitution to cease permitting the prostitution in their "subdivided flats" and cease letting out their "subdivided flats". At present, the HKPF was conducting the follow-up work for the

18 “subdivided flats” alike in order to curb the premises from being used for prostitution.

140. Mr CHOW Ping-tim stated that the problem of illegal parking was found in many places in Tsuen Wan district. He hoped that the Police would strengthen the law enforcement work, in particular, for the busy roads such as Yeung Uk Road, Luen Yan Street, Wing Shun Street and Chung On Street. Besides, he said that the publicity materials for DC activities posted on the footbridges had been torn away and the publicity materials for the latest DC activity had also been torn away. The relevant organisation had reported this to the Police. He hoped that the Police would provide assistance and paid more attention to this situation. He also enquired whether footbridges were the sites deserving attention during police patrols. Moreover, a lady had sat underneath the footbridge at Tai Ho Road for recycling activity for a long time. She was not only found underneath the footbridge at Tai Ho Road, but was also found at the junction of Riviera Gardens or other places. He opined that the acts of this lady were very annoying, but none of the government departments was able to take law enforcement action against her. It was believed that it was due to the loopholes of the legislation. As these people had occupied the streets for a long time, brought about impacts on the streetscapes and caused nuisances, he hoped that the Police would disperse them when conducting patrols.

141. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben said he would like to make suggestions to the Police to follow the practice of other departments to take larger-scale operations in the vicinity of Ho Pui Street and Chung On Street for enhancing the deterrent effects, with a view to combating the prostitution at the above streets. He also hoped that the Police would frequently adopt the measure of enclosure of the flats in future so as to enhance the deterrent effects.

(Note: The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben left the meeting at 8:39 p.m.)

142. The Vice Chairman praised the Police for the rapid detection within 24 hours of a case of indecent assault of a young child which occurred in Tsuen Wan district earlier. He opined that this could boost the confidence of the general public on law and order in the district. Also, the work of front-line police officers was fully appreciated. Besides, a resident relayed to him that a non-Chinese person was seen committing robbery in a supermarket at Lo Tak Court several weeks ago but the resident did not report the robbery to the Police. He had told the resident to report the robbery to the Police if it took place again in future. He hoped that the Police would be concerned about the robbery case. Moreover, a primary school lodged a complaint about the problem of illegal parking at Lai Shun Road to him and he had sought assistance from the Community Relations Office. He hoped that the HKPF would be concerned about the said complaint and refer the complaint to the New Territories South Region as well as enhancing the strength on handling the traffic congestion problem of the said street.

143. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis said some mothers told her that they were very worried about the problem of indecent assault of young children. She was glad to note that the case was detected shortly after she mentioned this problem to the Police. She also commended the Police for handling the case rapidly. Besides, she pointed out that the fencing for prohibition of illegal parking was erected at On Yuk Road next

to Summit Terrace by the Police, but the fencing did not function properly due to the lack of follow-up work. She hoped that the Police would be concerned about this matter.

144. DDC(TW) of the HKPF responded as follows:
- (1) the Police actively targeted at the sensitive cases and these cases would be rapidly cracked down by the Crime Units and mobilisation of the police officers;
 - (2) the Police would follow up on Members' enquiries and step up the efforts to tackle with them;
 - (3) there were two robbery cases during September and October 2016 in Tsuen Wan district. The robber of one of the cases knew the victim very well and the crossbody bag of the victim of the other case was snatched in Lei Muk Shue Estate; and
 - (4) in summary, there were not many robbery cases in Tsuen Wan district. The Police hoped that the public would report robbery to the Police when they witnessed it, so that the Police could take arrests timely to maintain law and order in Tsuen Wan district.

145. Mr LO Siu-kit said he hoped that a letter would be issued to the HKPF in the name of TWDC to make commendation on rapid detection of crimes by the Police in order to boost the morale of the Police.

146. The Chairman agreed to issue a letter to the HKPF in the name of the TWDC to make commendation on rapid detection of crimes by the Police and request the HKPF to follow up on the traffic problems.

(Post-meeting note: The Secretariat had issued a letter to the HKPF for commendation of rapid detection of crimes on 12 January 2017.)

XV Item 14: Crime Brief for Ma Wan – September to October 2016
(TWDC Paper No. 96/16-17)

147. DDC(TW) of the HKPF reported the situation of the crimes in Ma Wan.

XVI Item 15: Terms of Reference and Recommendations for Relevant Matters of Duty Visit Proposed by the Working Group on Duty Visit
(TWDC Paper No. 97/16-17)

148. The Secretary introduced the paper and relevant recommendations.

149. The Chairman enquired whether the Members endorsed the above recommendations.

150. Members unanimously endorsed the above recommendations.

XVII Item 16: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan District Office
(TWDC Paper No. 98/16-17)

151. The Secretary introduced the paper.

152. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of interest. No Member made declaration of interest.

153. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Applying Organisation/ Co-organiser</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1) Chinese New Year Celebration Lunch by Tsuen Wan District Office and Tsuen Wan District Council	Tsuen Wan District Council	60,000.00

XVIII Item 17: Application for District Council Funds by Cheung Ching Friends Association
(TWDC Paper No. 99/16-17)

154. The Secretary introduced the paper.

155. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of interest. No Member made declaration of interest.

156. Except a Member abstained from making endorsement, the remaining Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Applying Organisation/ Co-organiser</u>	<u>Amount Approved (\$)</u>
(1) Tai Chi Demonstration cum Fun Day	Wan Yeung Tai Chi Club	142,465.00

XIX Item 18: Information Papers

157. Members noted the contents of the following information papers:

- (1) Report of District Facilities Management Committee (TWDC Paper No. 100/16-17);
- (2) Report of Culture, Recreation and Sports Committee (TWDC Paper No. 101/16-17);
- (3) Report of Traffic and Transport Committee (TWDC Paper No. 102/16-17);
- (4) Report of Community Building, Planning and Development Committee (TWDC Paper No. 103/16-17);
- (5) Report of Social Services and Community Information Committee (TWDC Paper No. 104/16-17);
- (6) Report of Coastal Affairs Committee (TWDC Paper No. 105/16-17);
- (7) Report of Environmental and Health Affairs Committee (TWDC Paper No. 106/16-17);
- (8) Report of District Management Committee (TWDC Paper No. 107/16-17);
- (9) Items Endorsed by Circulation by the Tsuen Wan District Council during the Period from 20 September 2016 to 21 November 2016 (TWDC Paper No. 108/16-17); and

- (10) Financial Statement of Tsuen Wan District Council Funds as at 17 November 2016
(TWDC Paper No. 109/16-17).

XX Item 19: Any Other Business

158. The Chairman stated that the Task Force on Tsuen Wan District Signature Project Scheme had held a meeting on 28 October 2016 to follow up the progress of the work for Signature Project Scheme of “Redevelopment of the Sai Lau Kok Garden”. In addition, the construction works under the project would be commenced in November 2016 and a simple and official Ground-breaking Ceremony had been held on 11 November 2016. That day, many localities and representatives from relevant departments attended the ceremony by invitation to witness the kick-off of the project which had been discussed and expected by Tsuen Wan district for years. The relevant information would be uploaded to the TWDC website timely for public browsing.

159. The Chairman stated that a letter from Yan Chai Hospital was received earlier to invite The TWDC to serve as a co-organiser of “Yan Chai Charity Poon Choi Feast in 2016-2019” and apply for display of the TWDC logo on relevant publicity materials. Yan Chai Hospital organised poon choi feast every year to raise fund for “Yan Chai Hospital Medical Fund”. “Yan Chai Charity Poon Choi Feast in 2016-2019” would be held at 6:00 p.m. on 3 December 2016 (Saturday) at Sha Tsui Road Playground. About 600 tables would be set up for the poon choi feast.

160. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC served as a co-organiser for “Yan Chai Charity Poon Choi Feast in 2016-2019” and endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from Yan Chai Hospital.

161. The Chairman stated that a letter from Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups was received earlier to invite the TWDC to serve as a supporting organisation for “‘Neighbourhood First’ – 2017 Reunion Dinner in 18 Districts”. The Reunion Dinner would be held on 14 January 2017 (Saturday) in 18 districts over the territory and a total of 1 000 tables would be set up for the reunion dinner. It aimed to initiate the spirit for caring the neighbourhood in all districts by the young people over the territory and it was expected that 90 tables would be set up for the reunion dinner in Tsuen Wan district to serve a total of 1 080 people in the district.

162. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC served as a supporting organisation for “‘Neighbourhood First’ – 2017 Reunion Dinner in 18 Districts” and endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups.

163. The Chairman stated that a letter from Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups was received earlier to invite the TWDC to serve as a supporting organisation for the “1st Hong Kong Community Youth Sports Festival”. The Sports Festival would be held in February 2017 and ten competitions serving as the platforms for mutual learning and exchange would be arranged for the young people. The final competition would be held on 26 February 2017 (Sunday) in Hong Kong Sports Institute.

164. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC served as a supporting organisation for the “1st Hong Kong Community Youth Sports Festival” and endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups.

165. The Chairman stated that “Vita Green Cycling for Health Marathon Challenge 2017” would be held on 22 January 2017 (Sunday). The “District Council Cup” would be held continuously. The organiser invited all DCs to join the competition. This competition helped promote the physical health and community reunion for all communities and enhance the friendship amongst the districts. Three TWDC Members would join the said competition.

166. The Chairman stated that a letter from the Ocean Park was received earlier. To celebrate the 40th anniversary of the Ocean Park, the Ocean Park Hong Kong would launch the “CSR Programme for Low-income Families” (the Programme) during January and June 2017 by inviting 10 000 people from low-income families to visit the Ocean Park and enjoy a day in Ocean Park happily without financial pressure. The Programme was sponsored by Chinachem Group. With a view to widely promoting the Programme, the Ocean Park Hong Kong invited the 18 DCs to serve as the supporting organisations for the Programme and applied for display of the TWDC logo on relevant publicity materials. The “Kick-off Ceremony of Ocean Park’s 40th Anniversary Celebration” would be held by the Ocean Park Hong Kong on 10 January 2017 and Members would be invited to attend the ceremony.

167. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC served as a supporting organisation for the “CSR Programme for Low-income Families” of the Ocean Park Hong Kong and endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from the Ocean Park Hong Kong.

168. The Chairman stated that the Committee on the Promotion of Civic Education invited all DCs to submit applications for civic education projects or recommend the local organisations to submit applications for civic education projects as appropriate through “CPCE’s Cooperation Scheme with District Councils 2017-18”, with a view to organising activities for promotion of civic education at district level. The ceiling of total subsidies for each district was \$200,000. According to the arrangements made for the past few years, the Chairman proposed that this matter was to be referred to the Tsuen Wan District Civic Education Committee for coordination and implementation of the relevant activities.

169. Members unanimously agreed the above proposal.

170. The Chairman stated that the TWDO would organise a series of celebration activities for Tsuen Wan district in 2016-17 and 2017-18 to mark the occasion of the 20th anniversary of the return of Hong Kong to Motherland. The TWDO invited the TWDC to serve as a co-organiser for the celebration activities of the 20th anniversary of the return of Hong Kong to Motherland and applied for display of the TWDC logo on relevant publicity materials.

171. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC served as a co-organiser for the celebration activities of the 20th anniversary of the return of Hong Kong to Motherland and endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from the TWDO.

XXI Adjournment of Meeting

172. There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 9:05 p.m.

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat
January 2017