

(Translation)

Minutes of the 8th Meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (5/16-17)

Date: 24 January 2017

Time: 2:30 p.m.

Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Mr CHUNG Wai-ping, SBS, MH (Chairman)

Mr WONG Wai-kit (Vice Chairman)

Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH

The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael, BBS, JP

Mr KOO Yeung-pong, MH

Mr LI Hung-por

Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis

Ms LAM, Lam Nixie

Mr LAM Faat-kang, MH

The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben, JP

Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones

Mr CHAN Sung-ip, MH

Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly

Mr WONG Ka-wa

Mr KOT Siu-yuen

Mr CHOW Ping-tim

Mr CHENG Chit-pun

Mr LO Siu-kit

Mr TAM Hoi-pong

Absent:

Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris

In Attendance:

Miss YIP Kam-ching, Jenny, JP	District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr CHONG Kong-sang, Patrick	Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr CHAN Shiu-man, Simon	Senior Executive Officer (District Management), Tsuen Wan District Office
Ms LEE Lai-kiu, Winnie	Senior Liaison Officer (2), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr LAM Shu-wing, Vincent	District Commander (Tsuen Wan) (Acting), Hong Kong Police Force

Ms LAU Chui-ying, Bo	Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan) , Hong Kong Police Force
Mr WONG Kwok-chun, Alex	District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing), Social Welfare Department
Mr LO Kam-lun, Alan	District Lands Officer (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department
Mr TSE Hing-chit	Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department
Mr YUEN Hong-shing, Honson	Chief Transport Officer/NT South West, Transport Department
Mr WONG Hon-kit	Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan), Housing Department
Ms KHATTAK Nasreen	District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Mr LAM Lap-tak, Daniel	Chief Engineer/NTW 2 (New Territories West), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr CHENG Kwok-kuen, Chris	District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mrs TSANG CHAN Mi-fong	Chief School Development Officer (Tsuen Wan & Kwai Tsing), Education Bureau
Miss LAM Siu-yung, Daisy (Secretary)	Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr LAU Shun-tak, Donald	Executive Officer I (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
<u>For discussion of item 3:</u>	
Mr CHENG Yan-chee	Chief Corporate Affairs Officer and Executive Director, Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority
Mr CHAN On-ting, Eddy	Senior Manager (External Affairs), Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority
<u>For discussion of item 4:</u>	
Mr CHONG Kwok-wai	District Engineer/Tsuen Wan, Highways Department
Mr CHEUNG Kim-hung	Engineer/Tsuen Wan 2, Transport Department
<u>For discussion of item 5:</u>	
Miss LAM Shuk-fan, Janice	Senior School Development Officer (Tsuen Wan)1, Education Bureau
<u>For discussion of item 6:</u>	
Miss LAM Shuk-fan, Janice	Senior School Development Officer (Tsuen Wan)1, Education Bureau

For discussion of item 7:

Mr CHOI Sheung-ming	Senior Structural Engineer/Site Monitoring (A), Buildings Department
Mr CHEUNG Ping-kwong	Senior Divisional Occupational Safety Officer, Labour Department
Mr LI Wai-kei	Divisional Occupational Safety Officer, Labour Department

For discussion of item 8:

Mr CHEUNG Kim-hung	Engineer/Tsuen Wan 2, Transport Department
Mr TAI Moon-kwong, Daniel	Senior Environment Protection Officer (Regional West)2, Environmental Protection Department
Ms Amy CHAN	Chief Personal Data Officer (Acting), Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data
Mr Anthony CHAN	Senior Personal Data Officer (Acting), Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data

Action

I Opening Remarks and Introduction

The Chairman welcomed the Members and representatives from the government departments to the 8th meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (TWDC) and introduced Mr CHENG Kwok-kuen, Chris, who replaced Mr CHAN Ming-cheong, Horman to assume the post of District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan), Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD).

2. The Chairman reminded Members that according to sections 17(1) and 27 of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders (the “Standing Orders”), any Member who wished to move a motion or ask any question at a meeting of the Council was required to give the Secretary a notice in writing ten clear working days before the meeting. Thus, he reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 28 March 2017 and the deadline for submission of paper was 13 March 2017. In addition, according to section 28 of the Standing Orders, unless otherwise agreed by the Chairman, Members could speak and make supplementary remarks once for each agenda item at the meeting and each Member could speak up to three minutes.

3. The Chairman stated that the representatives from Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority (MPFA) were attending another meeting at the moment. They would arrive at the Main Conference Room at 3:00 pm. Therefore, discussion of agenda item 4 would be held prior to the discussion of agenda item 3.

II Item 1: Confirmation of Minutes of the 7th Meeting held on 29.11.2016

4. The Chairman said the the Secretariat had received three proposed amendments from Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris prior to this meeting. The proposed amendments were stated as follows:

- (1) in line 1 to line 2 of paragraph 28 in the captioned minutes, “他認為應先制訂實質的經濟及交通政策，以支持《香港 2030+》。” (“He opined that a substantive economic and transport policy should firstly be stipulated to support Hong Kong 2030+”) should be amended as “他認為應先制訂實質的經濟及交通政策，以支持《香港 2030+》內的土地規劃內容。” (“He opined that a substantive economic and transport policy should firstly be stipulated to support the land planning of Hong Kong 2030+.”);
- (2) in line 3 to line 5 of paragraph 28 of the captioned minutes, “他認為，提供足夠土地以供相關行業發展是事成的先決條件。在建設前，香港需要認清哪些才是理想產業及有關運作模式，從而制定相關政策以配合發展。” (“He was of the view that the sufficient land supply for development of the trade was a prerequisite for achieving the goal. Before making advancement on development, it was necessary to identify the best industries for Hong Kong and their mode of operation, with a view to formulating relevant policies to tie in with the development.”) should be amended as “他認為，雖然提供足夠土地以供相關行業發展是事成的先決條件，但是在建設前，香港需要認清哪些才是理想產業及有關運作模式，從而制定相關政策以配合發展。” (“He was of the view that although the sufficient land supply for development of the trade was a prerequisite for achieving the goal, it was necessary to identify the best industries for Hong Kong and their mode of operation before making advancement on development, with a view to formulating relevant policies to tie in with the development.”); and
- (3) “如果鐵路系統是完善的，市民會懂得選擇。” (“If the railway system was robust, the general public would make a wise choice.”) should be added after “他認為兩者互相關連，前者不成即後者不達。” (“He opined that the above two ideas were interrelated. The former missed; the latter failed.”) in line 14 of paragraph 28 of the captioned minutes.

5. The minutes of the 7th meeting were confirmed with proposed amendments.

III Item 2: Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meetings

(A) Paragraphs 98-115 of the Minutes of the Meeting held on 29 November 2016: Request the Government to be Concerned about the Possible Dangers and Problems Related to Subdivided Units

6. The Chairman stated that Members had discussed the above issue at the TWDC meeting held on 29 November 2016. The statistics on the subdivided units submitted by the Buildings Department (BD) on 6 December 2016 had been distributed to Members for perusal.

IV Item 4: Request for Provision of a Walkway from Yau Ma Hom Road to Cheung Wing Road

(TWDC Paper No. 115/16-17)

7. The Chairman stated that Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly and Mr WONG Ka-wa submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr CHEUNG Kim-hung, Engineer/Tsuen Wan 2 (E/TW 2), Transport Department (TD);
- (2) Mr CHONG Kwok-wai, District Engineer/Tsuen Wan (DE/TW), Highways Department (HyD);
- (3) Mr LO Kam-lun, Alan, District Lands Officer (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing) (DLO (DLO, TW&KwT)), Lands Department (LandsD); and
- (4) Mr TSE Hing-chit, Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), LandsD.

Besides, the written replies of the Planning Department, LandsD and MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) were tabled at the meeting.

8. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly introduced the paper.

9. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that the captioned matter had been discussed at the District Council (DC) in the last two terms. At that time, the construction site of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) did not exist. He remembered that the handover of the construction site to the Government was at first scheduled in 2016 by the MTRCL. However, it was postponed for two times till the first quarter of 2018. He enquired whether the departments concerned would notify the DC, district councillors of the constituencies concerned or the heads of villages or representatives of villages when vetting the application of deferred handover by the MTRCL. In addition, he also hoped that the departments concerned would conduct the advance works and that the date of handover of the construction site by the MTRCL would not be postponed again, otherwise inconvenience would be brought to the residents nearby. He added that the roads near the construction site was winding which was unsuitable for residents' use. Once the accidents occurred when the residents were crossing the road, it was believed that the insurance company would not make any compensation for them. Hence, he noted that the residents were pleased to learn that Members put forth this matter at the meeting. He hoped that the DC of this term would be able to provide the residents with the concrete timetable for the project, so that the residents could witness the completion of the project.

10. E/TW 2 of the TD responded that the TD had earlier undertaken to study the provision of a walkway from Yau Ma Hom Road to Cheung Wing Road and would carry out the works as soon as possible after the MTRCL handed over the construction site to the Government. The TD would carry out a study on the design of the

walkway in the following few months and seek views from Members, heads of villages and residents.

11. DE/TW of the HyD responded that the temporary construction site mainly served as an exit of the temporary underground passageway for the construction of the major tunnel of the XRL, in order to facilitate the delivery of the dredged mud from excavation works of the tunnel. In current stage, the backfilling works was being conducted for the temporary underground passageway. Therefore, it was necessary to make application to the LandsD for deferment of handover of the temporary construction site in the first quarter of 2018. The construction site would be handed over to the LandsD after completion of the backfilling works.

12. DLO (DLO, TW&KwT) of the LandsD said that the LandsD was currently processing the application from the MTRCL on deferment of handover of construction site to the Government in the first quarter of 2018.

13. The Chairman requested the departments concerned to explain the details of the walkway from Yau Ma Hom Road to Cheung Wing Road and enquired whether the construction works for the XRL would be further postponed after the deferment to the first quarter of 2018 was made.

14. E/TW 2 of the TD said that stairway would be built at the location concerned and the road surface would be paved with concrete for pedestrians' access to Cheung Wing Road from Yau Ma Hom Road.

15. DE/TW of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) the application of the deferment of handover of the temporary construction site, which served as the temporary construction site for the XRL under the management of the MTRCL, was submitted to the LandsD from the Railway Development Office of the HyD;
- (2) currently, the HyD was making application to the LandsD for deferment of handover of the temporary construction site for one year to the first quarter of 2018 in order to carry out the backfilling works for the temporary underground passageway; and
- (3) there was no plan for making further application of deferment.

16. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly strongly objected to the further approval of the MTRCL's application of deferment. He pointed out that it was not the first time for the MTRCL to make application for deferment, resulting in repeated delays in the construction works. The site, which was a land for public use, was the social resource. He enquired why the LandsD and HyD would grant approval on the application from the MTRCL. He opined that the demand from the general public was not met. He expressed dissatisfaction over the relevant departments' failure to

notify the DC of the reasons for application for deferment from the MTRCL. He also hoped that the departments would explain the reasons for their proposed approval of application for deferment from the MTRCL. In addition, he hoped that the TD would hold a meeting with relevant departments to discuss the design of the walkway, so that the construction works for the walkway could be carried out soon after the construction site was handed over by the MTRCL. If necessary, the Members concerned and villagers could join the discussions. Moreover, he hoped that the stairs of the walkway would meet the current needs of the society. The walkway should be installed with a roof cover and lighting system as well as the landings for passers-by to stop for a while.

17. Mr WONG Ka-wa strongly objected to the approval of the MTRCL's application of deferment by the departments concerned. He passed the construction site the day before and only found two empty containers. Some of the facilities on the construction site had been removed already. He thought that it was not necessary to extend more than one year for completion of the backfilling works. He added that the departments concerned and Members concerned could conduct an on-site inspection at the construction site if necessary, so as to learn more about the reasons for application of deferment for more than one year for the construction works.

18. The Chairman enquired the HyD why the MTRCL had to make application for deferment of more than one year for the backfilling works; and whether the departments concerned could shorten the time required for the backfilling works.

19. DE/TW of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) the MTRCL had earlier excavated a temporary underground passageway for construction of the major tunnel of the XRL and delivery of the dredged mud. The backfilling works was currently underway;
- (2) in the written reply of the MTRCL, according to the current progress of works, it was expected that the construction site could be handed over to the LandsD in the first quarter of 2018; and
- (3) the HyD would refer Members' views to its Railway Development Office, so that the Railway Development Office and the MTRCL would follow up on the study of the feasibility of shortening the time for the backfilling works.

20. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly did not understand why the government departments were so weak and opined that the Government failed to be the gate-keeper because it accepted all applications for deferment from the MTRCL. He showed dissatisfaction over it. He pointed out that the residents had to walk in-between the lorries and whom would be held responsible once the accidents happened. Therefore, he hoped that the departments concerned should not allow the

MTRCL to lodge application for deferment and that the design for the walkway should be discussed as soon as possible so as to expedite the progress of the works for the walkway.

21. The Chairman said it was expected that the construction site would be handed over to the government department concerned in the first quarter of 2018. He hoped that the TD would conduct the preliminary design for the walkway as soon as possible for Members' perusal and that the departments concerned would follow up on Members' views as appropriate.

V Item 3: MPF Default Investment Strategy
(TWDC Paper No. 114/16-17)

22. The Chairman stated that the MPFA tabled the revised paper at the meeting and briefed Members on the Default Investment Strategy (DIS). The representatives from the MPFA attending the meeting were Mr CHENG Yan-chee, Chief Corporate Affairs Officer and Executive Director (CCAO&ED) and Mr CHAN On-ting, Eddy, Senior Manager (External Affairs).

23. CCAO&ED of the MPFA introduced the paper.

(Note: The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben joined the meeting at 3:10 p.m.)

24. Mr CHENG Chit-pun said that he had received several letters about the DIS from the banks and MPF companies earlier. However, the letters have many pages and were mixed in the Chinese and English languages. He thought that the majority of the general public would not understand the contents of the letters. He noted that the MPFA would organise the introductory talks on DIS but he opined that the straightest way was through the television or radio broadcast. Hence, he enquired whether the MPFA would plan to give a brief introduction of the DIS to the general public through these two channels.

25. Mr LO Siu-kit thought that "high fees, low return" was not the slogan for the MPF. The Government had carried out a number of initiatives to lower the administrative fees of the MPF, such as portability of the MPF and DIS. He pointed out that the contributions for the MPF accounts were not too much in the early stage of setting up the MPF accounts, so it was understandable that the administrative fees were a bit high. Currently, however, the sum of administrative fees could be considerably huge, even if the administrative fee was just 1% of the expenses because the contributions for the MPF accounts had amounted to more than \$600 billion. He considered that the Government should lower the administrative fees proactively. Besides, he said it mentioned in the paper that there were currently a total of 9.1 million MPF accounts and the actual number of account holders was 4.1 million, i.e. one person held two or more MPF accounts on average, on top of the MPF

account holders who changed their jobs frequently or the elderly people who had probably forgotten their MPF accounts. Hence, he enquired if these people passed away unfortunately, how the MPF savings in their MPF accounts would be handled. He also opined that the MPF proposals had been operated for years, so the MPFA should consider the ways of handling these MPF accounts.

26. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis enquired whether the employees were regarded as the persons who had given investment instructions and their MPF savings would not be transferred automatically for investments in accordance with the DIS, if they had never made any changes after opting for the MPF fund choices for once when they were recruited by their companies. Moreover, she said that some people would have learnt more about the the DIS after the Government carried out the publicity work. Thus, she enquired whether these people could take the initiative to adopt the DIS for their fund choices.

27. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones said many members of the public asked him questions about the contents of the letters about the DIS. He thought that the documents were too complicated for him to give answers. He added that some members of the public hoped that the investment portfolio could be streamlined, for example, through investing in one single stock or fixed investment products such as gold, so that the investment status would be clearer to them and the management fees for the investment would be lowered. It was hoped that the MPFA would take the views into further consideration.

28. Mr MAN Yu-ming learnt that the MPF trustees would issue a notice to the MPF account holders during April and September 2017. If the MPF account holders did not give replies in 42 days after receiving the notice, their investment portfolio would be adjusted to adopt the DIS. He pointed out that many employees possessed a number of MPF accounts. Thus, he enquired whether the MPF accounts would be adjusted for making investments in different types of DIS or in an integrated DIS in 42 days. He added that for those employees who possessed a number of MPF accounts, the management fees payable would be higher even though their MPF accounts were adjusted for making investments by adoption of the DIS. Thus, he enquired whether the MPFA planned to further consolidate the MPF accounts of these employees without contravening the laws and regulations. In addition, he opined that there was room for lowering the management fees because the sum of MPF contributions was huge. Given that the price reduction was led by the operators in market economy, he enquired whether the MPFA would implement other measures to stimulate the reduction of management fees, apart from the implementation of semi-portability of the MPF, with a view to increasing the benefits of MPF investments at the time of retirement of the employees. If the management fees were just reduced by 0.25%, there would be a considerable huge sum of amount in 20 to 30 years with compound interest. Hence, he hoped that the MPFA would actively consider the practicable proposals for reduction of management fees.

29. CCAO&ED of the MPFA responded as follows:
- (1) the MPFA was aware that the general public might not fully understand the contents of the DIS-related documents delivered by the trustees. However, as required by the law, the trustees should set out the information about the DIS in detail for their scheme members;
 - (2) the MPFA would produce the publicity materials such as information animation which was simple for the scheme members to get the ideas of the contents. The MPFA would also deliver the relevant messages and information to the employees through the stakeholders including the trustees, workers' unions, commerce chambers and employers;
 - (3) the MPFA would launch a TV film series on DIS and enhance the broadcast rate later. Also, information and short videos which were simple and straightforward to audience would be disseminated through the advertising light boxes of MTR stations, bus body advertising and social media on the Internet for members' comprehension of the details of the DIS;
 - (4) the Government and MPFA agreed to the common views from the general public that the MPF "charged high fees but yielded low return". Therefore, it was proposed to set a ceiling for the charges of funds in DIS and this proposal was approved by the Legislative Council (LegCo) in May 2016. During the discussion of the amendments to the legislation by the LegCo, some LegCo Members regarded that the ceiling of the fees was still too high. The MPFA considered that the level of the fee caps was a starting point. A review would be conducted within three years after the legislation came into effect, with a view to studying the effectiveness of the proposal in maintaining the persistent reduction of MPF fees;
 - (5) in fact, the implementation of the DIS would enhance the competition for the market. Since the passage of the legislation, the fees of a total of 40 funds had been reduced correspondingly. The highest reduction rate was even more than half of the original fees;
 - (6) regarding the public opinion on the excessive charges of the management fees from the trustees in the past, the trustees would give response accordingly based on the market operation. The MPFA hoped that the DIS would have a benchmarking effect, driving fee reduction of other MPF funds;
 - (7) the implementation of the DIS was a major initiative. Fourteen trustee companies would take this opportunity to contact their scheme members in order to figure out their scheme members' MPF accounts and their fund choices;
 - (8) according to the newly amended legislation, the MPF benefits of the scheme members would be invested automatically in DIS if scheme

members did not give their trustees an investment instruction for their MPF benefits. As some scheme members might not wish to adopt such an arrangement, the respective trustees had already contacted their scheme members actively in order to confirm the investment instructions from their scheme members;

- (9) according to the legislation, if scheme member had opted for fund choices, investments would be made according to their fund choices in their MPF accounts. After the scheme members changed their jobs, their MPF accounts would be automatically changed from the contribution accounts for MPF to personal accounts and investments would be made according to their original instructions in these personal accounts. However, if these personal accounts were deposited with new contributions after the legislation came into effect in April 2017 and instructions for investments were not given for the newly deposited MPF, investments would be made in DIS for these accounts. To facilitate the scheme members' understanding of the above arrangements, the trustees had actively informed their scheme members about the details of DIS in writing in the past few months. The trustees would contact those scheme members who could not be contacted earlier after the legislation came into effect, so as to ensure that their scheme members had clearly learnt about the DIS-related arrangements;
- (10) the MPFA was also concerned about the arrangements of consolidation of accounts. Currently, there were 9.1 million MPF accounts, amongst which 3.8 million were contribution accounts for MPF; however, the actual number of employees was 2.7 million. Under the existing system, an employee should create a contribution account for MPF for each of his jobs. When the employee no longer handled these accounts after changing jobs, these accounts would be automatically changed to personal accounts. At present, there were a total of 5.3 million personal accounts, i.e. each employee at least had one contribution account for MPF and one personal account. Thus, the MPFA always encouraged the scheme members to consolidate their MPF accounts; and
- (11) as mentioned by the Chief Executive in the latest Policy Address, the next objective of the MPFA was to put in place an eMPF, which was an electronic platform, to facilitate the standardisation, streamlining and automation of the MPF scheme administration, thereby paving the way for "one member, one account" in the long run. After the completion of the work for the DIS of the MPF, the MPFA would be committed to taking forward the eMPF.

30. Mr KOO Yeung-pong stated that he was working for a trustee company. According to his experience, many employees in Hong Kong did not understand the investment arrangements of their MPF accounts, so he supported the Government to launch the DIS, which provided another option for the employees who were unfamiliar with investments and the ceiling for the management fees was assured. He added that the charges for the MPF were mostly back-end loaded instead of front-end loaded, so it was unfair to the trade to achieve the proposal of “low fees, high return”. He opined that importance should be attached to education. Given that the trustees seldom explained the details of the fund choices to their scheme members face-to-face, and that the employees would always directly return the MPF subscription form to the personnel departments after completion, and that the trustees were not allowed to provide guidance for their scheme members to buy any products during the briefing of fund choices according to the rules of relevant licensing laws and regulations. Those who were unfamiliar with investments would probably be unable to make a wise choice. He hoped that the MPFA and trustees would contact their scheme members more frequently to enhance their knowledge of MPF, so that the original objectives of setting up the MPF could be achieved, i.e. the employees would be able to opt for suitable fund choices and enjoy the retirement protection.

31. CCAO&ED of the MPFA responded that the MPFA had all along been carrying out the education work and would continue to make efforts on it.

32. The Chairman requested the MPFA to take Members’ views into consideration and thanked the representatives from the MPFA for attending the meeting.

33. The Chairman said that as Mr LI Hung-por was engaged with some other matters at the moment, he was unable to discuss agenda item 5 which was proposed by him. Therefore, it would be followed by the discussion of agenda item 6.

VI Item 6: Request for Expansion of School Premises of the Old-styled Primary Schools in Tsuen Wan District
(TWDC Paper No. 117/16-17)

34. The Chairman stated that the Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben, Mr MAN Yu-ming, Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis and Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones submitted the paper. The representatives from the Education Bureau (EDB) responsible for giving response were Mrs TSANG CHAN Mi-fong, Chief School Development Officer (Tsuen Wan & Kwai Tsing) (CSDO(TW&KwT)) and Miss LAM Shuk-fan, Janice, Senior School Development Officer (Tsuen Wan)1 (SSDO(TW)1). Besides, the written reply of the EDB was tabled at the meeting.

35. Mr MAN Yu-ming introduced the paper.

36. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones said that the principal and parents of Tsuen Wan Public Ho Chuen Yiu Memorial Primary School in Shek Wai Kok hoped that the school premises would be expanded. They had already drawn up a substantive proposal for school premises expansion and there was land in the primary school available for use. He added that the primary school had been situated on the land of the Housing Department (“HD”) for years. The primary school would have to face up to some difficulties even if improvement works required for the primary school were carried out in the school premises. Hence, the primary school hoped that the EDB could assist in expansion of the existing school premises and demolition of the old block of the school premises.

37. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis stated that the school premises of Chai Wan Kok Catholic Primary School at the private building site and that of Tsuen Wan Public Ho Chuen Yiu Memorial Primary School were the same type of school premises. There were only 24 classrooms in Chai Wan Kok Catholic Primary School. She added that as nowadays, diversified education and whole-person development such as “One Sport and One Art for One Student” were implemented, special classrooms such as the visual art room and science room should be accommodated in school premises. However, due to the constraints of the school premises, these special classrooms were always converted from regular classrooms which did not meet the standard of current educational needs. For example, the safety problems in classrooms would be caused by doing experiments in classes or there was lack of water supply in classrooms during the visual art classes. She pointed out that there were no convention rooms for meetings and suitable places for students’ performance or graduation ceremonies in some of the schools. As a result, these schools had to apply for the use of the town hall for organising the activities. Even though there were halls in some of the schools, these halls were situated on upper floors of the school premises which did not meet the development and demand of the contemporary time. She said that Chai Wan Kok Catholic Primary School had submitted the proposal on expansion to the BD and EDB. In reply, the BD indicated that the BD was only responsible for the school premises in public housing sites and the school premises in private building sites were not undertaken by the BD. Therefore, she hoped that the EDB would assist Chai Wan Kok Catholic Primary School in carrying out the expansion work as soon as possible in order to meet the persistent needs of the school. Moreover, according to Chai Wan Kok Catholic Primary School, funds were allocated by the EDB for carrying out repair works in the school but the cost of erection of scaffolding was not included. As a result, the funds allocated could not be used for the repair of the water pipes on the external wall. She opined that the measures did not fit in with the reality and that the Government should not only attach importance to the school premises in public housing sites when implementing the improvement measures on expansion of school premises. Serious attention should be given to the needs of the schools and the school premises in private building sites should also be taken into consideration.

38. CSDO(TW&KwT) of the EDB responded as follows:
- (1) the EDB attached great importance to the teaching environment of the schools, in particular, the safety of the school premises;
 - (2) at present, there were about 900 ordinary public-sector schools in Hong Kong. The premises of these schools were built in different periods in accordance with the standards at the time of construction and covered various facilities. Amongst those, about 200 school premises were built in accordance with the current standards. Most of these school premises were built many years ago, including the “matchbox-style schools”;
 - (3) both of Tsuen Wan Public Ho Chuen Yiu Memorial Primary School and Chai Wan Kok Catholic Primary School as mentioned by Members were the “matchbox-style schools”;
 - (4) the EDB had closely liaised with the above two primary schools which had put forth the improvement proposals on school facilities, including the redevelopment in-situ and expansion of school premises. The EDB would take consideration according to individual circumstances of the schools, including the site area and teaching quality, sustainability of school operation, school’s consent to the EDB’s proposals and its well-preparation for the redevelopment work, as well as the school’s capacity in managing the redevelopment work and daily operation at the same time, etc.;
 - (5) the area of some school premises was too small. Therefore, a temporary school premises should be identified for removal before the redevelopment works was commenced;
 - (6) regarding the school expansion, the objective factors including the structure of the buildings, age of school premises, loading capacity and building height restriction of school premises, permit for use of the land and consents from relevant departments and residents nearby should be taken into consideration; and
 - (7) the EDB noted Members’ suggestions and concerns and would continue to liaise with the above two primary schools for providing assistance.
39. SSSO(TW)1 of the EDB responded as follows:
- (1) the schools would make application for carrying out large-scale repair works or immediate urgent repair works to the EDB subject to the needs of the school premises every year;
 - (2) the EDB had provided large amount of resources for the schools to carry out repair works. In the past three years, a number of primary schools with old-style school premises were granted an allocation of about \$2 million to \$4 million to carry out the works including

refurbishment of walls, replacement of tiles, leak-proof for ceiling, replacement of electrical wires for the whole school and rehabilitation of sewage drainage for improving the situation of the school premises; and

- (3) apart from redevelopment in-situ, the EDB would also learn from the schools of the districts whether reprovisioning of school premises would be considered.

40. The Chairman said that according to the EDB, it was necessary to arrange a suitable temporary school premises for school redevelopment. Thus, he enquired whether Tsuen Wan Public Ho Chuen Yiu Memorial Primary School was allowed to be moved into the vacant school premises of Tsuen Wan Lutheran School in order to facilitate the redevelopment works; whether the suitable redevelopment was allowed under the plot ratio of the site; and how Tsuen Wan Public Ho Chuen Yiu Memorial Primary School obtained the fund allocation for redevelopment of school premises from the EDB. He wished to know if the EDB had formulated the relevant policy arrangements, so that a change of environment could be expected for Tsuen Wan Public Ho Chuen Yiu Memorial Primary School.

41. CSDO(TW&KwT) of the EDB responded as follows:

- (1) subject to the circumstances, the schools would be accommodated to another school premises, if practicable, before the redevelopment works. The schools would be moved back to the original site of the school premises after the completion of redevelopment works;
- (2) the EDB had earlier contacted the schools in Tsuen Wan for the use of the vacant school premises of Tsuen Wan Lutheran School. However, many schools indicated that they were not willing to move to this vacant school premises due to the traffic arrangements, aspirations of students and parents as well as the schools' overall operation; and
- (3) the EDB had formulated a fair and open procedure on allocation of school premises for school sponsoring bodies to apply for school premises for operation of schools. Therefore, the feasibility of the proposal on the temporary use of the vacant school premises of Tsuen Wan Lutheran School to facilitate the redevelopment works for a designated school should be further explored.

42. Mr LAM Faat-kang stated that there were great differences on school facilities among the schools built in different years, say, the facilities in "matchbox-style schools" in Tsuen Wan district were much poorer than those in the newly-built schools. He learnt that the EDB had put large amount of resources for schools to carry out the improvement works. He enquired why the facilities of some schools, however, had never been fully updated in the past several decades. So, he opined that the EDB should conduct a review for this. He pointed out that the EDB

could change the purpose in use of the old school premises, or carry out redevelopment works for the school or construction works for new school premises within the same district, in order to minimise the need for making fund allocation to the schools for repair works persistently. Besides, he thought that the EDB should conduct the planning, depending on the situation of the school premises. Taking Tsuen Wan Public Ho Chuen Yiu Memorial Primary School as an example, the EDB should study on carrying out the continued repairs or redevelopment for its school premises and inform the school of this arrangement. He was of the view that Tsuen Wan Lutheran School was situated in a remote area. The EDB should firstly improve the facilities of the school premises of Tsuen Wan Lutheran School, such as construction of new elevator and school playground, instead of following the old-style mind set, in order to attract the schools to use it.

43. Mr CHENG Chit-pun learnt that as some of the school principals did not know how to make application for school redevelopment to the EDB, they changed to make application for carrying out immediate repair and large-scale repair works for their schools to the EDB. In most cases, the application for improvement works involving school expansion was always declined by the EDB. He noted that a total of six schools in Tsuen Wan district were built over 50 years ago. The school premises of these old-style schools were mostly troubled by the lack of repairs, facilities and classrooms. He said according to the school principals of these schools, the EDB adopted the approach of “when there was trouble, one turns to people who are helpful but not pleasing; when there was no trouble, one turns to people who are pleasing but not helpful”. For example, the EDB had contacted them early this year for solving the problem of insufficient school places. It was hoped that an additional five students could be enrolled in each grade of these schools. On the other hand, however, the EDB did not make approval for expansion of school premises of these schools. As a result, there were not enough classrooms in these schools which, in turn, leading to the failure of enrolment of more students. He added that there were two primary schools in his constituency, namely, Emmanuel Primary School commissioned 55 years ago and Sham Tseng Catholic Primary School commissioned eight years ago. The facilities of these two schools were of huge differences. The school premises of Sham Tseng Catholic Primary School was very beautiful with modern facilities, including the laboratory, activity rooms and computer rooms. Its computer room was even larger than the school hall of Emmanuel Primary School. Therefore, he hoped that the EDB would proactively take the initiative to offer the said schools the ways of application for school redevelopment or expansion.

44. Mr KOO Yeung-pong stated that the captioned topic put forth by the Members was about the discussion of the expansion instead of redevelopment of the old-style primary schools. He had undertaken the Chairmanship of Tsuen Wan District Parent Teacher Association Federation Limited which would arrange school visits every year in order to learn more about the characteristics and merits of the

schools. Hence, he knew that on school premises, the millennium schools or schools built after 2000 and the old-style school premises could never be properly compared due to the big differences between them. He worried about whether the primary schools concerned could be redeveloped in-situ; and enquired whether the EDB would discuss with the school sponsoring bodies concerned about the expansion of school premises. He opined that problem would arise after the school was requested to move away from its site because the history of the school was the most important of all. The residents would not know much about the school if the new school premises was not situated near the original site of the school, thus bringing impact to the school. He added that the improvement works of the primary schools concerned were last conducted in 2004 which was more than ten years ago. The history of the primary schools concerned was even much longer, so he agreed to improve the school facilities, with a view to enhancing students' learning. He noted that part of the school premises was situated within the area under the management of the HD. He hoped that the HD, EDB and departments concerned would discuss the matter as soon as possible after the meeting.

45. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones reiterated that the captioned topic was about the discussion of expansion of school premises. Due to the respective factor of the school traditions, the school would probably not intent to move to another place. He understood that objectively, there would be problems when the captioned proposal was implemented. After all, he still hoped that the implementation of the captioned proposal would be expedited. He pointed out that the HD had made every effort within its capacity to assist the schools in carrying out the improvement works, but still there were certain areas that fell beyond its capacity and certain constraints on the deeds should be dealt with in the first place. Hence, he hoped that the EDB would provide assistance in order to handle the problems as soon as possible and make the school premises more convenient for students' use.

46. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis said that the vacant schools were located in remote areas. The students and parents might not expect that the redevelopment or reprovisioning works would be carried out for their schools. Besides, the schools expected to move to the school premises nearby during the redevelopment works and move back to the original site of the school premises after the completion of works. She thought that it was hard to make the said arrangements. She believed that the expansion works would be more feasible at present. Taking Chai Wan Kok Catholic Primary School as an example, this primary school was preconditioned for expansion in-situ and had submitted the proposal on school expansion to the EDB. Hence, it was hoped that the EDB would take the initiative to study the feasible proposal with the school in order to solve the problem as early as possible.

47. The Vice Chairman noted the difficulties in redevelopment in-situ and opined that the main idea of the paper was the expansion of the existing school premises.

According to the district councillors of the constituencies, Tsuen Wan Public Ho Chuen Yiu Memorial Primary School and Chai Wan Kok Catholic Primary School considered that the schools were preconditioned for expansion works within the area of the schools after the schools had conducted a study. Thus, he enquired the EDB on how the application for school expansion was reviewed, the degree of feasibility and level of difficulties of the expansion works, as well as the way of carrying out the expansion works smoothly. He learnt that the expansion work in-situ would be more feasible due to the limited land resources. Moreover, he enquired the EDB whether Tsuen Wan Lutheran School could be used as a temporary school premises for the school during the period of redevelopment in-situ if the school and parents were willing to accept and got well-prepared for school removal. If this proposal was infeasible, the school would stop holding on their aspirations.

48. CSDO(TW&KwT) of the EDB responded as follows:

- (1) the EDB implemented the school improvement works plan during 1994 and 2006. In this connection, the EDB had conducted a study for the plan beforehand and took forward the improvement works for the school premises suitable for enhancement of facilities as decided by the EDB at that time. Therefore, the new wing had been built for a number of school premises already;
- (2) the EDB was aware that there was room for improvement of the plan. For example, there were still some problems in the facilities of the school premises of the “matchbox-style schools”. Hence, the EDB had discussed the problems concerned with the representatives from the “matchbox-style schools” and the Education Panel last year;
- (3) it was infeasible to re-provision all “matchbox-style schools” shortly. In the Policy Address, it was stated that the Government would provide funding for the EDB to assist the “matchbox-style schools” in improving the facilities within its existing school premises;
- (4) the EDB was currently liaising with the HD to study how to improve the facilities of school premises and make use of the spaces in the school premises flexibly, say, installation of double-glazed window system in classrooms at the raised position along the corridors; installation of sound-proof doors for the classroom to improve noise interference due to the internal corridor design in between classrooms (i.e. the classrooms were situated at both sides of the central corridors); installation of acoustic panel wall system with metal frame for mounting of modern teaching aids in classrooms; and how the basketball courts would be effectively shared by the schools and residents of the public housing estates; and
- (5) all along, the Regional Education Offices of the EDB had been maintaining liaison with the schools for familiarisation of the situations of the schools, keeping close contacts with the schools and relaying

views from schools to the relevant departments, so as to study the further improvements to be made for the schools.

49. The Chairman opined that currently, the EDB had been committed to a substantial sum of recurrent expenditure on school repairs. He requested the EDB to discuss the feasibility of expansion of school premises with the Members and school principals of the primary schools concerned.

VII Item 5: Objection to the Reinstatement of TSA at Primary 3 Level
(TWDC Paper No. 116/16-17)

50. The Chairman stated that Mr LI Hung-por and Mr TAM Hoi-pong submitted the paper. The representatives from the EDB responsible for giving response were Mrs TSANG CHAN Mi-fong, CSDO(TW&KwT) and Miss LAM Shuk-fan, Janice, SSDO(TW)1. Besides, the written reply of the EDB was tabled at the meeting.

51. Mr LI Hung-por introduced the paper.

52. Mr TAM Hoi-pong raised strong objection to TSA at Primary 3. He got the bad news from the EDB the day before about the reinstatement of TSA which was repackaged by another name. Due to the operation mode of TSA, the schools conducted a lot of drillings and fostered the completion of exercises. As a result, the parents had to accompany their children to finish their exercises until late night. He pointed out that according to the Secretary for Education, the relevant tryout study had been changed to a research study, but he worried that the mode of the research study would become the same as that of TSA at the end of the day. He stated that the children needed to go to the learning centres and do homework after school. He opined that the learning culture, which was distorted by TSA, had become the drilling culture. Therefore, he hoped that TSA would be completely abolished instead of being reinstated upon refinement. He would support the motion about this. In addition, he hoped that the EDB would advise the school principals to instruct the teachers that the students should not be given too much homework. He had been the class teacher for Form 1 classes and learnt from many Primary 6 students who were admitted to Form 1 that they got much more leisure time than they did in Primary 6. Hence, he considered that there was something wrong with the curriculum of the primary schools. Despite the Primary 6 students had to enter TSA assessment, now that the discussion focused on TSA at Primary 3 because the Primary 3 students were much younger. He hoped that a happy childhood would be returned to them after TSA was abolished. He said the parents of TSA concern groups seated for this meeting hoped that the TWDC would support the abolishment of TSA and would not support the implementation of the BCA research study upon refinement.

53. Mr KOO Yeung-pong said that although he had never entered TSA, his son was the candidate for the 1st TSA. He had an impression that his son had to be drilled for TSA but he did not additionally buy exercise books to over-drill him. He opined that TSA originally aimed to make improvements for the deficiencies after the assessments. However, many parents did not accept that there were differences in the learning abilities of their children. After all, the school management committees did not accept that there were differences in the learning abilities of the students in their schools. He criticised the EDB's practice of release of the TSA reports publicly, thus inducing pressure on schools to a certain extent. As a result, TSA became meaningless because the schools would request the students to have drillings for getting better comments in the TSA reports. He added that if the questions in the TSA papers were too simple, the comparisons among the schools would not be made effectively; if the questions in the TSA papers were too difficult, there would be demand for TSA exercise books in the market. He doubted whether the parents would really stop drilling their children if TSA was abolished. He thought that parents should consider the long-term development of their children. It was not a big deal to "lose at the starting line". Most important of all, their children should finally arrive at the finishing line. Parents should accept that there were differences in the learning abilities of their children and give their children proper trainings. He pointed out that the pressure of examinations was greater than that of TSA. If the purpose of the motion was to make students happy in learning, it was believed that the DSE should be abolished as well. Thus, he considered that the abolishment of TSA deserved a deep thought. On the other hand, he understood that Members put forth the motion for minimising the over-drilling and making students happy in their growth. Hence, it was difficult for him to decide whether he would go for or against the motion.

54. Mr CHENG Chit-pun noted the EDB's announcement of implementation of the refined TSA for students the day before. He considered that it was proper to put forth the captioned topic for discussion at the moment. He had contacted the parents' organisations which opined that there was something wrong with the existing TSA because it led to drillings. They also suggested that TSA should be conducted on an anonymous basis, so that the EDB could collect data from schools and the schools and their students were not going to be punished and then, the incentives for drillings in schools would be wiped out. He thought that by doing so, a happy childhood would be returned to the students and the original purpose of the implementation of TSA for assessment of students' academic levels without classifying the schools into lower and higher ranks would be achieved.

55. Mr LAM Faat-kang opined that TSA originally aimed to reflect the academic levels of the students, so that the schools got to know the real abilities of their students and offered assistance to them for their growth. This was favourable in principle. However, due to the current societal circumstances, a number of

matters were pending because they were “demonised” and “politicised”. From teachers’ points of view, the primary goal of the schools was to help their students to grow up happily by offering them assistance in making improvements after their deficiencies were identified. The schools should not be hindered by labelling and did nothing at all. Similarly, a district councillor should also get familiar with the status of the district timely for serving the community. As a district councillor, he had to conduct public opinion surveys and take targeted actions for the problems from time to time. Similarly, school teachers should get to know the academic levels of the students; otherwise the school education would become meaningless. He noted that the EDB launched the refined research study the day before. He supported the EDB for having made improvements after soliciting the public views. Therefore, he doubted if the Member put forth his viewpoints from a teacher’s perspective or on behalf of his political party. He added that his son took the initiative to request for a tutor for his schoolwork. He thought that to drill or not to drill, it all depended on the actual needs of the students; meanwhile, there was an actual need for the EDB to carry out the research study. Hence, he was unable to decide whether he would go for or against the motion.

56. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly stated that he raised objection to TSA at Primary 3 level or the refined research study as well as other similar assessments in paraphrases. He also supported the motion moved by the Members. He pointed out that TSA involved drilling and caused competitions, no matter the questions in the TSA papers were simple or not; or no matter TSA was conducted on an anonymous basis or not. He learnt that many parents were exhausted by TSA because they had to stay with their children for learning and they could only teach their children to finish the exercises after getting guidance for the difficult questions in the TSA papers. He said that as he felt disappointed at the various EDB policies and different Secretaries for Education over the years, he would raise objection to the EDB, no matter how TSA was streamlined. He hoped that the Government of the next term would stop being wrong-headed in the continued implementation of the the TSA policy which affected the teachers and students as well as increasing their pressure. The teachers had to spend much time to make preparations for TSA and the students had lost their childhood due to TSA. He pointed out that the children were able to do many joyful activities in the old days. Nowadays, however, the children could no longer do so because they had to sit for different types of examinations, including TSA and the refined TSA. He believed that anyone who well understood the hardship of the parents, teachers and students would also support the cancellation of TSA. Moreover, many pro-democratic Members opined that the candidates for the Chief Executive of the new term should include the “discontinuation of TSA” in their policy agenda.

57. Mr MAN Yu-ming said he felt strange for the parents’ behaviours because the parents worried about the over-drilling caused by TSA on one hand, but they

conducted drillings for their children as they insisted to “win at the starting line” on the other. He raised objection to the over-drilling of the students, but he thought that basic drillings were necessary because skills could only be enhanced through drillings. Owing to competitions, he opined that motivation could be driven by drillings but he could not understand why only drillings for TSA were under objection. He quoted an example of body check-ups. He pointed out that it was normal to seek medication therapy after the illnesses of human body were identified. Similarly, the athletes rectified for further advancement after learning about their weaknesses. Everyone wished that their children would attain higher achievements while they could learn happily. It was important to strike a balance between the two positions. He added that the parents nowadays had strong expectations over their children but they were unwilling to spend time on drillings, thus making it difficult for our society to get ahead. He opined that TSA or similar assessments in future should not be abolished. But he thought that the specifics of assessments could be duly adjusted, for example, to conduct the assessments on an anonymous basis and to make the assessments better with refinement features. He also requested the EDB to foster the mutual trust through communication with primary schools and parents of students as well as the publicity work.

58. Mr CHOW Ping-tim opined that as the Secretary for Education had been changed for a number of times over the years, the changing policies could hardly be familiarised by the general public. Also, the quality of education could never be persistently maintained due to the ever-changing policies. He raised objection to TSA at Primary 3 level and thought that the primary students should have a happy childhood. Frequent drillings could only push the children to remember the contents of textbooks and the hardship in their childhood. He did not understand why the Primary 3 students had to be drilled. He thought that drillings did not compatible with the modern society. He did not agree that the level of competency of the people of high calibre could be elevated through drillings. He thought that their level of competency dropped only because they did not truly absorb knowledge through drillings. He pointed out that the children in Sweden could learn happily and absorbed knowledge as if they were a sponge. To the contrary, the children in Hong Kong were forced to be cultivated with knowledge but they could never bring their talents into full play. So, he did not understand why such a mode of education was still followed suit. He opined that the small children should enjoy their campus life in primary schools and kindergartens. He did not agree that the small children were to be forced to learning. He also did not agree that a person’s future achievements could be guaranteed by good academic performance. He did not attain a good academic performance but he could still work as a district councillor. He was of the view that one’s success was attributed to his recognition capability, understanding of our society and motivation instead of forced drillings. He pointed out that everyone had his strength. People would always find their ways at different times and spaces. He thought that children should not develop themselves by following the standard

mode since young age. Instead, leeway should be given for children to bring their talents into full play under no compulsion. Hence, he thought that over-drilling should be avoided and he raised objection to the drillings for Primary 3 students.

59. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones opined that it was unfavourable to get things overdone. He pointed out that TSA originally aimed to identify the way to improve the teaching quality through assessments, and it was fairly important to get the way to achieve this. He thought that proper training was necessary, but over-drilling would bring about pressure to students. He stated that the mechanism for assessment would not exist if TSA was abolished. He also pointed out that the main point was not to drill the students, so TSA should be maintained for the EDB to get the information for improvement of the students' learning abilities over the territory. He added that if the schools lost the incentive that the TSA results were made a tool for school assessment, the schools would accept TSA and would not conduct drillings for their students. As such, the problem could be resolved. In addition, he doubted if it was good or bad to abolish TSA completely.

60. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis said that the EDB originally aimed to find out the deficiencies of the schools by implementation of TSA and reminded the schools to make improvements for helping the students to develop themselves. However, the existing mode of TSA induced drilling indirectly. Thus, she suggested that apart from TSA tests, the relevant data could be collected through questionnaires in order to check over the students' happiness index, active learning in schools and level of knowledge absorption. It was not necessary to conduct drilling for these and the schools could be stopped from conducting drilling secretly due to pressure. She believed that the EDB would not proactively request the schools to conduct drilling, but the schools always explained that they were asked by the EDB to conduct drilling to ensure the smooth implementation of TSA when TSA was implemented in schools. Therefore, she opined that the EDB should study the ways to stop the schools from conducting drilling secretly. She would not indicate for or against the abolishment of TSA but she thought that there was room for improvement for TSA.

61. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben said the parents did not wish that their children were overly bound by rote learning and being over-drilled and they thought that the homework should be lessened so that their children would have more time for fun. He added that in reality, the parents would buy supplementary exercise books for their children even if the schools assigned less homework. He thought that this was an overall social consciousness. He raised objection to the drilling for TSA, but there were disputes over the abolishment of TSA completely. Given that TSA at Primary 3 level was considered to be abolished due to the over-drilling from schools and that Primary 5 students were still drilled for TSA, TSA was duly recognised for its value of existence but then over-drilling should be avoided. Therefore, he thought that the schools would no longer drill the students after the incentives for conducting

drilling were wiped out. He pointed out that the practicable methods included the cancellation of recording the names of the students and schools for implementation of TSA. As such, the ranks of the schools would not be changed due to the TSA results. The schools soon lost the incentives for conducting drilling. In addition, the data from TSA would only be drawn by the education sector for reference to identify students' weaknesses. It was considerably favourable to the students and education as a whole. He thought that it was unfair to demolish TSA completely only because of individual cases of drillings. Moreover, he said that as not everyone was working in the educational field, the operation of the schools and the whole educational system should not be overly interfered and the value of existence of subject matters should also be respected. He was of the view that TSA had its value of existence; but problems emerged due to drillings. Hence, he would put forth an amended motion and hoped that Members would support it. He learnt that the EDB had discussed with the schools and parents in depth for TSA. He hoped that the EDB would further address parents' concerns, so as to reduce their worries about over-drilling of their children.

62. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie said that TSA originally aimed to learn more about the students' academic levels. However, the EDB did not take the design of TSA into full consideration. As a result, there was something wrong with the mode of TSA. She opined that the original purpose of TSA was very good. All of the examinations, interviews and assessments aimed to test one's abilities, strengths and weaknesses for making improvements. It was like someone who would identify his weaknesses in the course of his personal growth. She said a number of television programmes showed that problems emerged due to the management level of schools. Amongst those, the management level of an organisation created rankings for over ten schools under its supervision. The principals of the schools of lower rankings felt shameful due to the pressure induced. Then, they pushed the teachers to do better and then the teachers pushed the students to do better. The competitive mode of TSA was thus derived from this cause-and-effect relationship which was far beyond from serving the original purpose of the EDB. She opined that as the problem was triggered by the management level of schools, all incentives leading to over-drilling students and making TSA a tool for comparison should be wiped out, say, to conduct TSA on an anonymous basis. Despite the fact that she was not a parent and was not very clear about the details of internal operation of schools, she still hoped that the EDB would study carefully on wiping out the possible incentives. She added that the original purpose of TSA was good but TSA was not effective in reaching the intended results. Therefore, the relevant problems should be solved during the implementation of TSA.

63. CSDO(TW&KwT) of the EDB responded as follows:

- (1) TSA was an educational topic which had been attracting attention since 2015;

- (2) in October 2015, the Coordinating Committee on Basic Competency Assessment and Assessment Literacy (the Committee) had conducted a comprehensive review on the operation of TSA and different implementation arrangements. To enhance the participation of different stakeholders, members of school-parent cooperation and representatives from primary and secondary schools were included in the Committee. During the review process, the Committee had collected views from stakeholders in various forms;
- (3) the Committee had clearly pointed out in its report released in early December 2016 that the the refined TSA papers and questions would align with the requirements for basic competencies of Primary 3 students. Students were able to grasp the basic competencies in daily learning and were not required to make additional preparations or to be over-drilled for TSA;
- (4) after collecting views from different parties, the Committee recommended that the four refined new initiatives under the tryout study, including the improved assessment papers and question design, enhanced school reports, strengthened professional support measures and newly-added questionnaire survey would be extended from 50 primary schools to all primary schools over the territory;
- (5) the EDB was not going to make decision on reinstatement of TSA at Primary 3 level. Instead, it was hoped that the more comprehensive feedbacks could be collected from the primary schools after the research study was extended over the territory for the EDB's continued review and discussion to enhance the arrangements for TSA;
- (6) the EDB would organise talks for the schools in 18 districts to introduce and share the rationale and practice of assessment for learning with school managers, school principals, teachers responsible for school-parent cooperation, as well as the chairmen and members of parent-teacher associations of schools;
- (7) the EDB stressed that the research study was not for the reinstatement of TSA. To prevent over-drilling and reduce the worries from the schools for the possible risks brought by the data of assessment, the EDB would delete TSA from "school performance indicators"; and
- (8) the EDB would issue a notice on the arrangements of the basic competency assessment research study for all primary schools over the territory in due course. The EDB was pleased to communicate with schools in order to learn more about the difficulties of the schools and provide assistance for schools.

64. Mr LI Hung-por opined that the assessment conducted on an anonymous basis and the purpose of the assessment contradicted each other. He questioned why Members proposed that the study on the quality of education in Hong Kong should be

conducted on an anonymous basis, instead of by sampling. He was uncertain of the significance of conducting the territory-wide assessments regularly on an anonymous basis. Given that the schools would be held responsible for the assessments which were conducted by adoption of school names, improvements could be made for the weaknesses of the schools correspondingly. The way of making improvements in TSA was to conduct drillings for test papers. Besides, he thought that the assessments such as TSA only focused on the drilling for part of the subject and other aspects of development were neglected. He said he was not giving an idea of the suspension of school assessments. Instead, he supported the schools to conduct comprehensive and diversified school-based assessments. Furthermore, he had been working as a primary school teacher for over 30 years and was a holder of the Bachelor and Master of Education degrees. He was well-informed about the primary schools. He moved the motion based on his understanding and viewpoints concerning the problem. He did not mean to ban TSA completely but he considered that TSA could be conducted at Primary 6 and Form 3 and that TSA should not be conducted at Primary 3 because the Primary 3 students were too young. They should learn happily.

65. The Chairman said Mr LI Hung-por moved a motion that “the TWDC requested the Education Bureau to cancel the Territory-wide System Assessment (TSA) at Primary 3 level in order to relieve the existing heavy study pressure of Primary 3 students and return a happy childhood to students.” Mr TAM Hoi-pong seconded.

66. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben opined that it was unfair to cancel TSA all of a sudden without reviewing its effectiveness and benefits. The problem of over-drilling should be solved by handling the incentives for over-drilling. Hence, he moved the following motion that “the TWDC requested the Education Bureau to cancel the adoption of student and school names for the Territory-wide System Assessment (TSA) at Primary 3 level, so that the schools would lose all incentives for over-drilling in order to relieve the existing heavy study pressure of Primary 3 students and return a happy childhood to students.” Mr CHENG Chit-pun seconded.

67. The Chairman reminded Members to submit the authorisation, if any, to the Secretary to read out. No Members submitted the authorisation.

68. Mr WONG Ka-wa said the amended motion seemed to be slightly different from the original motion. The cancellation of the conduct of TSA by adoption of student and school names, instead of the cancellation of TSA, was mentioned in the revised motion. He hoped that the Secretary would repeat the amended motion once.

69. The Secretary repeated the amended motion.

70. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly opined that the views of the amended motion and the original motion contradicted each other. The original motion was the objection to TSA. The amended motion showed support to TSA on conditions. He enquired whether it was acceptable if the spirit of the amended motion and original motion contradicted each other.

71. The Secretary said according to section 21 of the Standing Order, the Chairman should determine whether a motion accepted for amending the original motion constituted a direct negation of the original motion.

72. The Chairman considered that the amended motion did not constitute a direct negation of the original motion and did not go against the spirit of the original motion.

73. Mr CHOW Ping-tim opined that literally, the amended part indicated that the amended motion went against the original motion. He said that the original motion was about the cancellation of TSA but the amended motion showed support to TSA on conditions and suggested the cancellation of the conduct of TSA by adoption of student and school names.

74. The Chairman stated that the word “cancel” was not deleted in the amended motion, so the spirit of the original motion was not contravened. Therefore, he considered that the amended motion was substantiated.

75. Mr CHOW Ping-tim, Mr WONG Ka-wa, Mr LI Hung-por, Mr TAM Hoi-pong and Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly stated that they would walk out in protest.

76. Mr LI Hung-por opined that the Chairman should learn the views for the amended motion from the mover before making a ruling. He further quoted an example to illustrate that after “he hoped that all demons could not enter this house” was revised as “he hoped that all demons in black hats could not enter this house, apart from the demons in red hats”. The meaning of the revised sentence went against that of the original sentence because the revised sentence meant that some of the demons were allowed to enter the house. Hence, he considered that the motion being amended should not be regarded as the amended motion because it was totally different from the original motion.

(Note: Mr CHOW Ping-tim, Mr WONG Ka-wa, Mr LI Hung-por, Mr TAM Hoi-pong and Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly walked out.

Mr WONG Ka-wa left the meeting at 5:20 p.m.; Mr LI Hung-por and Mr TAM Hoi-pong left the meeting at 5:23 p.m.; and Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly left the meeting at 5:24 p.m.)

77. The Chairman invited Members to cast votes for the amended motion. The motion was endorsed with a vote of 9 in favour, 0 against and 1 abstention.

78. The Chairman invited the representative from the EDB to brief the latest information about TSA which was announced by the EDB the day before.

79. CSDO(TW&KwT) of the EDB reiterated that the EDB did not propose for the reinstatement of TSA at Primary 3 level. The four refined novel elements under the basic competency assessment research study would be extended to all primary schools over the territory, so that more schools were able to participate in the research study for collection of the more comprehensive views for the EDB's continued review and refinement of the arrangement of the TSA.

80. The Chairman said that the Secretariat would convey the motion to the EDB after the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The Secretariat had conveyed the motion to the EDB in writing on 10 February 2017.)

(Note: The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben left the meeting at 5:25 p.m.)

VIII Item 7: Concern about an Accident Occurred at a Construction Site at Harbourfront and Urge to Step up the Monitoring of Safety
(TWDC Paper No. 118/16-17)

81. The Chairman stated that Ms LAM, Lam Nixie and the Vice Chairman submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Mr LAM Shu-wing, Vincent, District Commander (Tsuen Wan) (Acting) (DC(TW)(Atg)), Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF);
- (2) Ms LAU Chui-ying, Bo, Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan) (PCRO(TW)), HKPF;
- (3) Mr CHOI Sheung-ming, Senior Structural Engineer/Site Monitoring (A) (SSE/SM (A)), BD;
- (4) Mr CHEUNG Ping-kwong, Senior Divisional Occupational Safety Officer (SDOSO), Labour Department (LD); and
- (5) Mr LI Wai-kei, Divisional Occupational Safety Officer, LD.

Besides, the written replies of the LD, BD and HKPF were tabled at the meeting.

82. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie introduced the paper.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael joined the meeting at 5:30 p.m.)

83 The Vice Chairman said it was worrisome to note that an unfortunate accident took place at the leisure ground where the residents of Tsuen Wan usually passed by. He pointed out that the construction works were underway in many construction sites along the seaside. After the accident, many residents made enquiries to him as to whether there were safety problems in the construction sites other than the one in which the accident took place. Members could only relay their views to the contractors or sub-contractors concerned through the departments concerned. Members had also reflected the findings of their observations of the construction site in question to the departments concerned for a number of times. He hoped that the representatives from the departments who attended this meeting would explain to the Members and members of the public about the work done and actions taken in more than a month after the accident happened. Although these were the remedial or subsequent duties and actions, Members thought that this was important and would like to know more about the details. They also hoped that the construction works could be completed smoothly and the accident would not happen again. He learnt that different departments were dedicated to their specific scope of work when handling the industrial accidents. He worried that it was not effective in requesting the contractors to adopt safety measures as appropriate through publicity and briefings only. Hence, he enquired whether the departments concerned would impose penalties or take further actions against the contractors of the construction sites if their practices were in breach of the ordinances or safety regulations.

84. DC(TW)(Atg.) of the HKPF responded as follows:

- (1) there was a case of falling object from height on 4 January 2017 in Tsuen Wan district. A male aged 62 was hit in his head by a bamboo pole and certified dead in the hospital. This case was under investigation by the Crime Unit of Tsuen Wan Police District. The HKPF confirmed that the bamboo pole was fallen from one of the two construction sites along the seaside of Tsuen Wan. The actual position from where the bamboo pole fallen and the reason for the fall were still under investigation; and
- (2) the HKPF was not the dedicated department for prevention and monitoring of accidents in construction sites. The HKPF would discuss with the sub-contractors or the safety officers of the construction sites as far as possible after receiving complaints in order to figure out the ways for prevention of accidents.

85. SSE/SM (A) of the BD responded as follows:

- (1) after the accident, the staff of the BD were immediately assigned to arrive at the scene of accident to carry out an inspection at the lateral external angle of the external wall of the construction site of Block 1 of Pavilia Bay and continued to carry out the follow-up work the next day;

- (2) the staff of the BD first examined the safety of the scaffolding in the construction site and the problems requiring special attention. At that time, no imminent dangers or irregularities were spotted from the scaffolding in question. The BD had also inspected the two floors of Block 1 at the request of the Police on the day of accident. However, the source of problem could not be identified after the inspection; and
- (3) the BD had requested the recognised persons concerned in writing to submit the reports, examinations and assessments of the current status of the scaffoldings on the external walls, give an account of the reasons for the accident and submit the proposals on enhancement of the safety of the construction site. The recognised persons had already submitted the reports the week before. At present, the BD was vetting the reports and was unable to provide further information.

86. SDOSO of the LD responded as follows:

- (1) after the accident, the LD had proactively carried out an inspection at the construction site in question from the perspective of occupational safety and health (OSH) on 4 and 5 January 2017;
- (2) the LD had inspected the two blocks of buildings concerned. The inspections were carried out from the rooftop to the ground floor of the buildings in order to review the housekeeping at the construction site, scaffolding safety and condition of netting, etc. The LD found that the scaffolding had primarily met the requirements of the Code of Practice for Bamboo Scaffolding Safety published by the LD and the netting remained intact;
- (3) the LD had served the Improvement Notices to the contractor for making improvements to the environment of the construction site on 4 and 5 January 2017. The LD also served four Suspension Notices to the contractor for suspension of work at height in the environment after it was found that the safety condition of the work at height in the construction site was not satisfactory. Subsequently, the LD held a meeting with the management concerned at the construction site to urge them to step up efforts to improve the measures for work at height and adopt the measures for housekeeping at the construction site; and
- (4) the staff of the LD would be assigned to carry out the surprise inspections at the construction sites. If the construction site was found in violation of the Factories and Industrial Undertakings Ordinance (Chapter 59) and Occupational Safety and Health Ordinance (Chapter 509), the LD would institute prosecution without making prior warning and serve the statutory notice to the construction site for making improvement.

87. Mr CHOW Ping-tim said that after the accident, he immediately arrived at the scene to communicate with the contractor, developer and government departments. He pointed out that the construction site in question was adjacent to a park and a passageway. Such an incident was not common. He thought that alarm bells were ringing. People were reminded to stay alert. He learnt that the construction site of Pavilia Bay was re-opened. According to the BD and LD, loopholes were not found in the construction site under the existing laws and regulations on safety. Therefore, the LCSD was permitted to re-open the passageway and the enclosed areas were re-opened as well. He had once suggested the provision of temporary rooftop and safety netting for the passageway but finally it was not adopted. He pointed out that the safety of the passers-by of the area between the enclosed road section heading to Belvedere Garden and construction site had been considered. He opined that the area next to the exit of the West Rail Station was also very close to the construction site where many people would pass by. He hoped that the departments concerned would pay attention to this. He said while no progress had been made for the investigation of the Police, tens of thousands of residents of Riviera Gardens, Waterside Plaza and City Point always walked past the above areas. He hoped that the departments concerned would learn from experience and enhance the safety of construction site for prevention of recurrence of similar accidents. Moreover, he enquired whether accidents would be successfully prevented if the relevant safety measures were adopted by the construction site according to the existing laws and regulations. Also, he hoped that similar accidents would not happen again.

88. Mr CHENG Chit-pun enquired whether the scaffolding in construction site was controlled under the Construction Sites (Safety) Regulations (Chapter 59I); whether the construction site would be considered to have breached the law for its non-compliance of the Code of Practice for Bamboo Scaffolding Safety; and whether the LD enforced the laws by virtue of the Code of Practice for Bamboo Scaffolding Safety; and how often the LD carried out the surprise inspections. He pointed out that the developers would shirk the responsibilities arising from industrial accidents. As a result, the contractors or the workers would be held responsible for the industrial accidents. Thus, he opined that deterrent effect was not achieved by imposing the penalties of the existing ordinances. There were no incentives for the developers to step up efforts to supervise and make improvements to their construction sites. In addition, he was disappointed that the problems leading to this accident had not been identified at the moment. He said that no one would be held responsible for this accident and the insurance company did not need to make any compensation if the evidence for the location where the bamboo pole fell from was not available. It was unfair to the family members of the deceased. He hoped that the problems and irregularities would be identified in the investigation as soon as possible.

89. Mr LAM Faat-kang stated that the accident happened in Tsuen Wan was an unexpected misfortune. He noted that the departments had indicated that there was

no solution for the problems concerned. Only the LD mentioned that a lot of work had been done after the accident. He opined that if the departments were able to spot the safety problems in the construction site before the accident, the reviews would not have necessarily been conducted after the casualty was caused as the cost was too high. Besides, the accident happened in the park, which was near the construction site in question. It could be seen that the park would be endangered once the industrial accident happened in the construction site. As the park was managed by the LCSD, he thought that the LCSD should provide the signage and adopt the safety measures for the dangerous areas near the park, particularly at the places for groups of people to do activities in the park, so as to remind the general public that the construction works was underway and they should stay away from the area of construction works. He was of the view that experience should be gained from the accident and requested the departments concerned to carry out the remedial work after the accident.

90. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie said Hong Kong was an advanced city where many construction sites could be found. There were a lot of active or to-be-active construction sites in Tsuen Wan, not to mention other places in Hong Kong, and many people would walk past these construction sites. She was disappointed that none of the departments undertook to handle the relevant problems after the accident or when problems of the construction site were spotted by the general public. Besides, she enquired whether the LD had received her letter two years ago which was about the two construction sites at the seaside of Tsuen Wan; and whether the LD had inspected the construction sites and conducted the follow-up work, including carrying out examinations by sampling and conducting inspections, after the receipt of her letter. She believed that the LD would have mentioned about it, if these work were done, instead of indicating in its written reply in a passive and bureaucratic manner that the LD would remind the construction sites to be aware of the safety. She opined that the fatal accident happened because the construction sites were still not safe and did not comply with the laws and regulations even after being reminded by the LD. She was angry about it because she had already found out the problems and informed the LD of these two years ago. Yet, the LD did nothing to solve the problems but asked the Police to assist in reminding the construction site in question to be aware of the safety issues. It was really undesirable. She questioned why the LD did not do the job but asked the Police to do it. She also criticised the LD for being too late even though the LD had taken the initiative to conduct inspections on 4 and 5 January 2017 after the accident. She thought she had to relay to the Government as to why there was no department dedicated to handle the accidents in construction sites, and request the Government to review the relevant ordinances, and even relay the issue to the candidates of the election of the Chief Executive of the new term if the LD considered that it should not undertake the work for the accidents in construction sites. She hoped that the LD would give a reply to her clearly for the questions she had just raised, and explain why the LD did not report to the TWDC, and advise her of which department was dedicated to handle the problems of the construction sites.

(Note: Mr CHOW Ping-tim left the meeting at 5:50 p.m.)

91. The Chairman enquired the representatives from the LD if the LD was responsible for handling and monitoring the issue of industrial safety.

92. SDOSO of the LD responded as follows:

- (1) the LD was responsible for the OSH of the construction sites and mainly enforced the OSH ordinances in order to maintain the work safety of the workers at the workplaces;
- (2) according to the law, the offenders would be liable to the maximum penalty of a fine of \$500,000 and six-months' imprisonment;
- (3) the LD mainly enforced the ordinances for construction sites, including the Construction Sites (Safety) Regulations. It was stipulated in the provisions of the Regulations that the contractors should adopt reasonable and practicable measures to maintain the work safety of the workers in the course of work; and
- (4) the LD had received the letter from the Member in October 2015. It was mentioned in the letter that the tower crane hoisted objects over the street. At that time, the LD had assigned its staff to carry out inspections but the said situation was not found during the inspection. The LD had also requested the construction site to pay attention to this by serving a written warning to the construction site. In the past two years, the LD had all along been carrying out the follow-up work and surprise inspections. Regarding the construction site in question, the LD had carried out over 30 inspections and instituted prosecutions against the construction site in question for its non-compliance of OSH laws and regulations during the inspections and served the Improvement Notices to the construction site in question for making improvements to the environmental safety of the construction site over the past two years.

93. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie said she got the photos which showed the hoisting operation in the use of crane tower loading bricks at the construction site over the boundary of the construction site of Pavilia Bay towards the park off City Point. The time and date were 6:00 p.m. and 8:30 p.m. on 16 January 2017 and 10:00 p.m. on 17 January 2017 respectively. She hoped that the LD would contact her for conducting inspections together in spite of the staff of the LD were arranged for conducting inspections for a number of days consecutively. She did not understand why action was never taken for the said situation which had lasted for a couple of days. She enquired why heaps of bricks were allowed to be loaded on the crane tower. She thought that there was something wrong with the ways of inspection conducted by the LD. She doubted that the LD could not find out the bricks on the crane tower because the bricks were placed neatly when the LD conducted inspections in the construction site. She pointed out that the residents nearby always spotted the said hoisting operation and she could provide tons of photos and videos as evidence. However, she thought that the submission of the information about the said hoisting operation to the LD through making storage of these information by the residents or

by herself was unacceptable because the LD was expected to have spotted the said hoisting operation during inspections. Moreover, she said that earlier, the hoisting operation in the use of crane tower loading iron rods over the boundary of the construction site had lasted for three consecutive days. There was a newspaper report on it which indicated the same situation as that of the said problem. She had reflected the problem to the LD well before and learnt that it was caused by the elimination of work procedures by the workers, but she could not understand why the LD did not tell the sub-contractor about it. Thus, she enquired how the LD handled the problem for the same circumstances. She said she was not being critical to the problem of scaffolding, but she thought that the avoidable problem could be reviewed, for example, the hoisting operation in the use of crane tower over the boundary of the construction site. In addition, she did not agree that it was a problem of angles as explained by the LD. She thought that measurement by infrared could be arranged if necessary. She stated that she had checked the Code of Practice for Safe Use of Tower Cranes from the LD's webpage. As it was stipulated that the crane tower should not load objects in the air when the construction site stopped operation, she did not understand why the said hoisting operation still lasted for some time. She also enquired whether the LD adopted any measures for the construction sites along the seaside of Tsuen Wan and its vicinity. She opined that this was not only a problem in Tsuen Wan, but also a problem in the construction sites over the territory.

94. Mr KOO Yeung-pong said the departments should be urged to carry out the monitoring work regarding the accident in the construction site in question. Moreover, attention should not only be given to Pavilia Bay, but also to the construction sites of the buildings including the property development of the West Rail Station and Parc City which would be completed gradually in the next few years. It was because scaffoldings were still in use in the construction sites and there was a high pedestrian flow near the construction sites. Thus, he requested the departments concerned to provide the number of inspections of construction sites and prosecution figures on a regular basis for Members' reference.

95. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael stated that Hong Kong had long been troubled by the problems such as shop extensions, illegal parking, illegal road racing and taxi refusing hire. After all, legal action could not be taken only for the one-sided views because nothing could be done without any evidence. The staff of the departments concerned usually caught nothing at all when they arrived at the scene for taking law enforcement actions, even though photos had been taken on the spot. He requested the Commissioner of Police (CP) at the LegCo meeting this day to follow the practice in the United Kingdom that the closed circuit television (CCTV) should be installed over the territory. He pointed out that some Members had recorded the cases of repeated offences by themselves. He thought that the portable CCTV could be installed for record purpose at the locations of repeated offences. He added that according to the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data, it was fine to

do so if the videos were discarded in one month and regulatory control was exercised for the use of the CCTV.

96. The Chairman said that the arrangements of installation of the CCTV would be discussed under the next agenda item.

97. SDOSO of the LD stated that the LD would take careful consideration on the provision of the number of inspections of construction sites and prosecution figures for the TWDC on a regular basis. A reply would be given to the Members concerned after consideration.

98. The Chairman requested the LD to discuss with the Members concerned on handling the problems concerned after the meeting. He hoped that similar accidents would not happen again. He also requested the LD to provide the number of inspections of construction sites and the prosecution figures on a three-month basis for Members' reference.

99. As the Chairman was required to take up other urgent matters, the meeting would be temporarily chaired by the Vice Chairman.

IX Item 8: Request the Government to Employ Video Cameras to Assist Various Departments in Carrying out the Law Enforcement Work
(TWDC Paper No. 119/16-17)

100. The Acting Chairman stated that the Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael and Mr CHENG Chit-pun submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving response were:

- (1) Ms Amy CHAN, Chief Personal Data Officer (Acting) (CPDO(Atg.)), Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data (PCPD);
- (2) Mr Anthony CHAN, Senior Personal Data Officer (Acting), PCPD;
- (3) Mr CHEUNG Kim-hung, E/TW 2, TD;
- (4) Mr WONG Kwok-chun, Alex, District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing) (DSWO (TW/KwT)), Social Welfare Department (SWD);
- (5) Mr TAI Moon-kwong, Daniel, Senior Environment Protection Officer (Regional West)2 (SEPO(RW)2), Environmental Protection Department (EPD);
- (6) Mr LAM Shu-wing, Vincent, DC(TW) (Atg.), HKPF;
- (7) Ms LAU Chui-ying, Bo, PCRO(TW), HKPF; and
- (8) Ms KHATTAK Nasreen, District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan) (DEHS(TW)), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD).

Besides, the written replies of the Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau, HKPF and PCPD were tabled at the meeting.

101. Mr CHENG Chit-pun introduced the paper.

102. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael stated that the FEHD had successfully obtained the approval from the PCPD for the installation of the CCTV at 12 black spots. Although it was not effective due to the low pixel of the video camera, it was still a successful example of installation of the CCTV. Recently, he promoted the installation of the CCTV on taxis at the LegCo. After taking the issue of privacy into consideration, Hong Kong Taxi Council agreed to the installation of the CCTV at the back of the rear passenger seat for recording the remarks and activities of the drivers. It received good response. He had also put forth the proposal to the CP at the LegCo meeting this day. The CP indicated that the HKPF had made the same proposal several years ago but there were public views that the proposal was found in violation of the personal privacy. He opined that if the proposal was acceptable to the PCPD and was not found in contravention of the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance (Chapter 486) (the Privacy Ordinance), he would strongly request all the law enforcement departments to employ video cameras to assist in carrying out the law enforcement work in Tsuen Wan district. He pointed out that there were approximately hundreds of thousands of the CCTV cameras, commonly-called “eyes in the sky”, in Britain. He quoted an example to illustrate that the clue in detection of an offence was readily available thanks to the CCTV near the crime scene in Causeway Bay. The course of the incident in which a taxi lost control and dashed to the pedestrian road was recorded, despite the taxi driver told a lie that someone ran onto the road suddenly. Given the advanced technology nowadays, he strongly requested the law enforcement departments to consider the installation of the CCTV at the black spots of various key concerns in Tsuen Wan district. As such, the industrial safety would also be monitored. He said that the enforcement staff would not be able to take any law enforcement work if they did not spot any offences at the scene as reported by the general public. Hence, he hoped that the law enforcement departments would give response as to whether the CCTV would be installed. He would also request the departments concerned to give reasons if they responded that the CCTV would not be installed or further study should be conducted. He requested the law enforcement departments to discuss the practicable proposals with the PCPD in order to eradicate the illegal activities in Tsuen Wan district.

103. CPDO(Atg.) of the PCPD responded as follows:

- (1) the PCPD took a stance that the data user should follow the Privacy Ordinance when carrying out the deeds which involved personal privacy. The PCPD would not give approval or raise objection to the proposal of the data user. Also, the PCPD would not ban the data user from taking forward his proposals;
- (2) the law enforcement departments should comply with the six data protection principles, including the reasons for installation of the

CCTV and the use of methods which might give rise to violation of privacy, if it was considered that there was a practical need to exercise monitoring by installation of the CCTV. As the deed of monitoring per se was an action in violation of privacy, departments should strike a balance between the public interest and public privacy before making a decision on exercising monitoring;

- (3) the departments had to consider various aspects when installing video cameras, for example, whether personal privacy was involved in collection of data; if yes, the departments should collect the data in a fair manner, including the provision of a notice around the site of the CCTV to inform the general public that the site was under the CCTV monitoring. In addition, the departments should consider the storage period of the videos, the personnel for processing the videos and the relevant security facilities in order to prevent the general access to the videos. Besides, the departments should arrange their staff to provide the videos where any member of the public made request for access to the videos according to the Privacy Ordinance after he/she found that he/she was video recorded and identifiable in the videos. The PCPD would like to remind the departments that they should carry out the relevant work pursuant to the Privacy Ordinance even though there was a practicable justification for installation of the CCTV; and
- (4) the PCPD was a law enforcement authority and received complaints from the general public. The PCPD would carry out investigations after receiving complaints from the general public. Also, the PCPD would study whether the complaint was justified from an independent perspective by adoption of an unprejudiced approach, if any member of the public lodged complaints to the PCPD after considering that he/she was video recorded by the departments and he/she was identifiable in the videos.

104. E/TW 2 of the TD stated that as the captioned proposal involved personal privacy, the TD would tie in with the requests from the bureaux and various law enforcement departments.

105. DSWO (TW/KwT) of the SWD responded as follows:

- (1) Members' proposal on installation of video cameras for the residential care homes for persons with disabilities of medium and high care level met with the plan of the SWD;
- (2) regarding the incident happened in a residential care homes for persons with disabilities and the public attention over the incident, the Government would gradually implement a series of initiatives to enhance the monitoring of the residential care homes for persons with disabilities and raise the quality of service, including the requirement

of installation of the CCTV surveillance system at the public areas of the residential care homes for persons with disabilities for the daily activities of the residents in compliance of the Guideline on CCTV Surveillance and Use of Drones issued by the PCPD, so that the inspection or investigation staff could check over the videos for collection of evidence where necessary. It also facilitated the supervision of the management personnel over the operation of the residential care homes for persons with disabilities and the follow-up as well as evidence-collection work carried out by the Licensing Office of the SWD; and

- (3) the SWD would discuss with the trade on the relevant practical arrangements, including the locations for installation of the video cameras, the authority and circumstances of checking over the videos as well as the storage period of the videos.

106. SEPO(RW)2 of the EPD responded as follows:

- (1) the EPD agreed to the captioned proposal from Members;
- (2) on the law enforcement of the environmental protection issues, the use of video cameras was conducive to strengthening the effectiveness and deterrent effect of the law enforcement work on the illegal disposal of refuse by vehicles;
- (3) following the study of new method to enhance the inspection of fly-tipping of construction and demolition wastes, the EPD had launched a pilot scheme by installation of surveillance cameras at 12 black spots for Keep Clean 2015@Hong Kong. The EPD had selected the webcams which were available and easy for use in recent years for testing the quality of images under different environments, lightings and distances, with a view to identifying a cost-effective system for flexible arrangements of the inspection of fly-tipping of construction and demolition wastes. The pilot scheme had successfully identified 170 cases of fly-tipping of construction and demolition wastes but not all the images were clear enough for follow-up work. The images could not be clearly recorded by the webcams, particularly, in a dark environment at night or without street lightings. As a result, follow-up work could only be carried out for half of the cases in which the number plates of the vehicles were clearly recorded. Amongst those, the EPD had issued summons for 35 cases and fixed penalty notices for 11 cases. The Audit Commission had mentioned about the effectiveness of the pilot scheme and provided a lot of valuable opinions in its Director of Audit's report. Currently, the EPD was conducting a comprehensive review on the pilot scheme and planned to fine-tune the design and operation of the surveillance video-recording system according to the experiences

gained and problems found for making it a tool for inspection and prevention of fly-tipping of construction and demolition wastes; and

- (4) a number of factors and pre-conditions should be taken into consideration for effective use of video cameras for law enforcement work, including the selection of surveillance video cameras (which involved the consideration of the pixel and storage amount of the surveillance video cameras and endurance of the batteries of the surveillance video cameras), selection of the locations of installation of video cameras, power supply for the locations of installation of video cameras, wind and rain-proof quality of the video cameras, quality of the images of the number plates of the vehicles recorded by the video cameras, the possible privacy issues as well as the arrangements for manpower and resources in carrying out the installation of video cameras, collection of memory cards of video cameras and checking over the videos.

107. DC(TW) (Atg.) of the HKPF responded as follows:

- (1) the Police had all along been using the video cameras for taking law enforcement work;
- (2) on road traffic safety, the HKPF made use of the cameras to detect speeding and red-light jumping. At present, there were more than 200 cameras for detecting speeding and red-light jumping. On prevention and detection of crimes, the HKPF had made use of hand-held video cameras to carry out the law enforcement work for the activities involving public safety since 2006 and introduced the body-worn video cameras in 2013. On border and Hong Kong waters safety, the HKPF had set up more than 200 video cameras to monitor the border safety;
- (3) the video cameras used by the HKPF were of lower level of violation of privacy; and
- (4) the HKPF supported the proposal on installation of on-street CCTV for monitoring the on-street activities. The CCTV of this type had been adopted in many places in Britain, Singapore and China. The detection rate was also increased due to the installation of the CCTV. As consensus was not reached for installation of the CCTV on street monitoring due to the ever more disputes in our society, the HKPF considered that careful consideration should be taken for the installation of the CCTV.

108. DEHS(TW) of the FEHD responded as follows:

- (1) the FEHD had launched a pilot scheme, as supported by the DCs concerned, in the Central & Western district, Yuen Long district and Sham Shui Po district where the problem of illegal disposal of refuse

was more serious. The six-month pilot scheme was launched at the end of 2016. If it was effective, it would be extended to cover all districts, including Tsuen Wan district; and

- (2) the FEHD would submit paper to the Environmental and Health Affairs Committee of the TWDC to seek Members' views on installation of video cameras. It was hoped that Members would reach a consensus and suggest the hygiene black spots for the FEHD to carry out a feasibility study. The FEHD planned to select four hygiene black spots and two video cameras were to be installed for each of the hygiene black spots in compliance with the regulations and approaches under the Privacy Ordinance for collection of the images. All the images would be kept according to the regulations. It was hoped that Members would reach a consensus for the hygiene black spots as soon as possible for submission to the headquarters of the FEHD for follow-up work.

109. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael said that the TD was the only department which did not give its views on the captioned proposal. He opined that the TD should carry out a study on the captioned proposal. After consolidating the responses from the representatives of various departments, he opined that the government departments should take the initiative to install the video cameras in the enclosed environment and the places which were seldom visited by the general public, namely, the black spots of illegal disposal of refuse defined by the EPD, as well as the meeting rooms and corners of the premises of the residential care homes for persons with disabilities of the SWD. He pointed out that the publicly accessible places such as streets should be taken into consideration next, but the biggest problem of all would be triggered because the Police would take the law enforcement work mostly in the publicly accessible places. He agreed with the representative from the HKPF that nowadays, there was dissension within the society and it was difficult to put forth this disputable proposal. Moreover, a number of measures favourable to Hong Kong could not be implemented due to the dissension within society. He thought that this was a big problem. If the video cameras were not employed for the publicly accessible places, the efforts of police officers and staff of other departments would mostly go down the drain after these staff arrived at the scene upon receiving complaints. Therefore, he hoped that the political environment of Hong Kong could be changed and that the law enforcement departments would take a further step for installation of video cameras at the enclosed places.

110. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis said she had lodged complaints to the PCPD against someone who had installed the CCTV at the public places to record the status of the corridors, entrances and exits of the residence. However, the complaints were not substantiated. She added that the PCPD had stipulated a number of restrictions to regulate the installation of the CCTV by the departments or the general public.

Yet, the PCPD would not initiate prosecution against those people who neither designated a person who was responsible for access to the information nor posted the relevant notices after installing the CCTV for the purpose of safeguarding their own properties. She pointed out that the people or departments obeying the laws were refrained from installation of the CCTV due to the Privacy Ordinance but those people who had ill-intents would seize the opportunity to do illegal acts, say, by monitoring the time of people's entrance or exit from certain places before committing crimes and they discarded the videos before the Police arrived at the scenes. Hence, she agreed that the law enforcement departments should employ the video cameras as an aid for law enforcement work.

111. Mr LO Siu-kit supported the captioned proposal which was conducive to the Police in execution of work. He stated that the video cameras on vehicles were useful in handling the traffic accidents and the Police would identify the videos from the CCTV around the scenes of crimes in handling the burglary cases. He opined that the privacy was of the utmost important. To weigh the interest of an individual and the society, he hoped that the PCPD would carry out a further study on the Privacy Ordinance and the relevant provisions of the Privacy Ordinance would be relaxed. He supported and hoped that the law enforcement departments would employ the video cameras as an aid for law enforcement work. He also pointed out that in Mainland China, the police officers were not required to arrive at the scenes to issue the summons to the vehicles on highways, handle the traffic congestion and environmental hygiene problems because the CCTV had been adopted for surveillance. Therefore, the police officers would, in turn, be able to arrive at the scene of robbery promptly. He was of the view that Hong Kong failed to keep abreast of time. The government departments were always refrained from carrying out measures only because of the views from the minority. Hence, he hoped that the departments would no longer follow their own sets of policies and strike a balance for the society.

112. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones said the problem of fly-tipping of refuse was significantly improved after the installation of the CCTV by the EPD in his constituency area. He hoped that a further step would be taken. He added that it was difficult for the departments to arrange the manpower to monitor the behaviour of fly-tipping of refuse around the clock without installation of the video cameras. He pointed out that the social problems could be resolved by installation of the CCTV but the law enforcement departments were unable to install the CCTV due to the Privacy Ordinance. He opined that there was really something wrong with the Privacy Ordinance. Although the personal needs were protected under the Privacy Ordinance, the interest of society should also be fairly considered. He did not mean to raise objection to the Privacy Ordinance but he hoped that a clearer guidance under the Privacy Ordinance would be given for a smoother operation of society and for the departments to execute the work required. Moreover, the villagers living in rural

areas needed to install the video cameras for prevention of crimes but some of them who installed the CCTV worried that they had probably breached the Privacy Ordinance. Hence, he hoped that the PCPD would provide the villagers with more information for reference, so that the stakeholders could utilise the tools for protecting themselves.

113. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie supported the captioned proposal. When she served as a district councillor, she had frequently conducted on-site inspections and evidence collection with the departments to handle the district affairs. On law enforcement, however, there must be some difficulties in evidence collection work. Besides, she thought that the regulatory areas under the Privacy Ordinance might not be those as expected by the general public. She also pointed out that the expectation of the general public was always too high to meet the circumstances where the reality and physical situations permitted. She enquired whether the law enforcement work with the application of advanced technology should be ceased only for achieving a smoother course of law enforcement work. She also opined that people would either support or oppose to anything. Therefore, she opined that the departments should proceed with their work decisively if the work was considered to be correct. The departments should also be more courageous, decisive and dedicated in execution of work. She pointed out that the work which could be handled with the aid of video cameras should no longer be taken up by the stationed staff of the FEHD, HKPF or other departments. The problems concerned could be duly handled if the data collected were properly processed. Furthermore, she learnt that the Mainland China as well as lots of periphery countries and cities had already employed the video cameras as an aid for law enforcement work. For Hong Kong, it was crucial to strike a balance between the privacy and public interest. She hoped that this topic could be referred to the LegCo after DC's discussion for implementation of the captioned proposal as soon as possible.

114. Mr KOT Siu-yuen supported the captioned proposal. He opined that there was a great need in making use of the video tools to carry out the law enforcement work by the departments, particularly, the problem of illegal disposal of refuse outside the Tsuen Wan Government Offices Building at Sai Lau Kok Road in his constituency area. He said that given the Government Property Agency (GPA) was willing to undertake the law enforcement work for the said problem, however, the GPA was not aided by any system on its law enforcement work. It was very disappointing. He added that although the law and order in Tsuen Wan was good, the provision of video cameras was still conducive to the law enforcement work on various problems such as the foreign domestic helpers crowded at Lo Tak Court, illegal parking and traffic accidents in Castle Peak Road carried out by the Police in a more effectively way and was essential to the successful prosecution of the cases. He expected that the departments would give positive responses to the captioned proposal and implement the relevant proposals on law enforcement work with the aid of the video cameras.

115. Mr MAN Yu-ming supported the captioned proposal. He opined that the prevention of illegal gambling and illegal disposal of refuse had reached remarkable results after the installation of the CCTV at his constituency area. He pointed out that the installation of the CCTV was helpful in evidence collection and saving the manpower of the law enforcement departments. For example, much manpower for monitoring a few gamblers was saved. He added that usually the departments only carried out their own scope of work when taking law enforcement and the public interest was neglected to a small extent. Besides, as restricted by the laws and regulations, even though the Police worked harder, not all the law enforcement work could be executed. Hence, he supported to employ video cameras more frequently as the aid for the departments to carry out the law enforcement work. He also hoped that the LegCo would handle the captioned proposal by making amendments to the laws; otherwise it would be ineffective, even if useful videos were taken. He pointed out that under the HD's assistance, the problems of fly-tipping of refuse and illegal gambling in Shek Wai Kok Estate were slightly improved. But he considered that the relevant ordinances should be amended to facilitate the law enforcement work of the law enforcement departments, so that the unlawful situations could be further improved.

116. Mr CHENG Chit-pun thanked Members for their support and departments for their positive response to his proposal. For example, the SWD would install the video cameras; the EPD was working for the installation of video cameras; the FEHD would employ the video cameras for Tsuen Wan district; and the HKPF showed support for the proposal. He thought that the current operational costs of departments would be increased due to the compliance of the Privacy Ordinance and more factors would be taken into consideration for the practical operation. He opined that people would either support or oppose to anything. The departments should stand firm and carry out the measures which were considered to be correct and effective. Besides, he was of the view that the personal data and privacy should be respected and protected. He hoped that the law enforcement departments and the PCPD would discuss the details for steady implementation, so that the captioned proposal could be put into practice as soon as possible.

117. Mr KOO Yeung-pong noted that the pilot scheme of the FEHD was currently implemented on Hong Kong Island. He suggested that the Police could take Tsuen Wan district as the trial spot.

118. The Acting Chairman supported the captioned proposal. He stated that there were many difficult problems in Tsuen Wan district, such as illegal parking, which could not be under 7-day and 24-hour surveillance by the staff of the departments concerned due to manpower constraint. He hoped that the Police would employ the video camera system to handle the illegal parking.

119. CPDO(Atg.) of the PCPD responded as follows:

- (1) the PCPD would like to clarify that the Privacy Ordinance was neutral in nature and the installation of the CCTV was not forbidden under any of the provisions of the Privacy Ordinance. However, various factors for installation of the CCTV should be taken into consideration, including how the privacy of an individual who did not do unlawful acts was respected, whether the irrelevant people were not to be recorded and how the data was kept;
- (2) if it was considered that there was a need to install the video camera, it would be fine to do so when the personal data and privacy were protected during video recording. Also, the installation of the video camera by anyone else was not forbidden under the Privacy Ordinance; and
- (3) in 2008, Yau Tsim Mong District Council (YTMDC) had endorsed the installation of the CCTV at different locations within the district regarding the incidents of plastic bottles containing corrosive fluid being thrown from height. The PCPD considered that the YTMDC had prepared the documents with comprehensive contents on protection of privacy, including the purpose of installation of the CCTV, the primary locations for installation of the CCTV and the principles of avoidance of direct recording of private residences as far as possible, etc. The PCPD considered that these documents could be served for reference purpose.

120. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie hoped that if funding was available, the PCPD should strengthen the publicity for the public to learn that the installation of the CCTV was not banned under the Privacy Ordinance, with a view to balancing the over-expectation from the public and reducing the disputes. It was certainly constructive to our society.

121. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael stated that many people would be refrained if only guidelines were given without any enquiry services. He hoped that the PCPD would set up the service counters to provide active assistance for the departments which were planning for the implementation of certain proposals. As such, these departments could avoid contravening the Privacy Ordinance. He added that these departments would probably be unable to follow all the instructions in the reference documents prepared by the PCPD, if the PCPD only advised these departments to refer to these reference documents. Hence, he hoped that the PCPD would provide assistance for smooth implementation of the relevant measures by the departments, instead of making amendments to the law by the LegCo.

122. CPDO(Atg.) of the PCPD responded as follows:
- (1) the PCPD would give advice to and tie in with the departments raising enquiries as far as possible. The PCPD would also remind the departments of the factors to be taken into consideration in pursuant to the Privacy Ordinance;
 - (2) the PCPD was a law enforcement authority which carried out investigations after receiving complaints from the general public; and
 - (3) the Privacy Ordinance did not forbid anyone to do anything; however the Privacy Ordinance should be complied with when carrying out the deeds which involved personal data and privacy.

123. The Acting Chairman summarised that Members in general supported the captioned proposal and welcomed the departments' plan of employing video cameras as the aid for law enforcement. He agreed that a balance should be struck between the personal privacy and public interest. He also hoped that the departments would actively conduct the study on adoption of the new technology such as the CCTV as the aid for law enforcement concerning the matters favourable to the livelihood of the residents.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael left the meeting at 6:55 p.m.)

124. The Chairman resumed the chair.

X Item 9: Crime Brief for Tsuen Wan District – Comparison of Crime Statistics between November to December 2016 and November to December 2015
(TWDC Paper No. 120/16-17)

125. DC(TW)(Atg.) of the HKPF reported the situation of the crimes in Tsuen Wan district.

XI Item 10: Crime Brief for Ma Wan – November to December 2016
(TWDC Paper No. 121/16-17)

126. DC(TW)(Atg.) of the HKPF reported the situation of the crimes in Ma Wan.

XII Item 11: Proposed Outline of the Plan on 1st Duty Visit of Tsuen Wan District Council
(TWDC Paper No. 122/16-17)

127. The Secretary introduced the paper and proposed outline of the plan.

128. Mr CHAN Sung-ip said that a minimum of ten TWDC Members was required to sign up for launching the first duty visit of the TWDC. He hoped that Members would join the first duty visit actively. The duty visit fee would be adjusted with the number of participants. He hoped that Members would invite the Co-opted Members to sign up.

129. The Chairman hoped that Members and Co-opted Members would join the first duty visit actively. Also, he enquired Members if the proposed outline of the plan was endorsed.

130. Members unanimously endorsed the proposed outline of the plan.

XIII Item 12: Information Papers

131. Members noted the contents of the following information papers:

- (1) Report of District Facilities Management Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 123/16-17);
- (2) Report of Culture, Recreation and Sports Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 124/16-17);
- (3) Report of Traffic and Transport Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 125/16-17);
- (4) Report of Community Building, Planning and Development Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 126/16-17);
- (5) Report of Social Services and Community Information Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 127/16-17);
- (6) Report of Coastal Affairs Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 128/16-17);
- (7) Report of Environmental and Health Affairs Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 129/16-17);
- (8) Report of District Management Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 130/16-17);
- (9) Dates of Meetings of Tsuen Wan District Council and its Committees in 2017/18
(TWDC Paper No. 131/16-17); and
- (10) Financial Statement of Tsuen Wan District Council Funds as at 13 January 2017
(TWDC Paper No. 132/16-17).

132. Mr KOT Siu-yuen said that the TWDC got the third prize in the Jockey Club Vitality Run and the District Council Cup of Vita Green Cycling for Health Marathon Challenge 2017 on 8 January 2017 and 22 January 2017 respectively. He added that the opening ceremony of the 6th Hong Kong Games would be held at 3:30 p.m. on 23 April 2017 in Hong Kong Coliseum. It was hoped that Members would join the opening ceremony.

133. Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan) (ADO(TW)) of the Tsuen Wan District Office (TWDO) stated that since the District-led Actions Scheme (DAS) was implemented in April 2016, the TWDO had sought Members' views at the end of

2016 for making a review on the effectiveness of the DAS and drawing up the work plan for the coming year. After consolidating Members' views, the TWDO proposed that the shop front extension problem and enhanced anti-mosquito work in Tsuen Wan district would be handled continuously through the DAS in the coming year because it was considered that the DAS was still in its initial stage. In addition, the District Management Committee (DMC) had endorsed the work plan for the coming year at its meeting on 20 December 2016. The TWDO would closely cooperate with other government departments concerned to discuss the details of work and timely report to the DMC. Moreover, the TWDO welcomed Members' views.

XIV Item 13: Any Other Business

134. The Chairman said the "Chinese New Year Celebration Lunch" in 2017 which was organised by the TWDO and TWDC would be held from 12:00 noon to 3:00 p.m. on 10 February 2017 (the fourteenth day of the first month of the lunar calendar) at the Ballroom on the 5/F of Panda Hotel, Tsuen Wan. The TWDC was one of the organisers and he hoped that Members could arrive earlier to receive guests.

135. The Chairman stated that the Standard Chartered Hong Kong Marathon 2017 would be held on 12 February 2017 (Sunday). As the "18 District Challenge Race" would be held continuously, all districts were invited to enter the competition. This competition was not only conducive to advocating physical health and community solidarity, but also helped develop the friendship among the districts. Four TWDC Members and six Co-opted Members would enter this competition.

136. The Chairman said that the Home Affairs Department (HAD) and Information Services Department would hang up the lamppost bunting in 18 districts over the territory during April and August 2017 to mark the occasion of the 20th anniversary of the return of Hong Kong to the Motherland. Also, around 200 pairs of the lamppost bunting displaying the TWDC logo would be hung up at the main streets in Tsuen Wan town centre. Members were informed that the TWDC had approved the HAD to use the TWDC logo in organising the territory-wide activities at the meeting of the Finance and In-house Working Group in March 2016.

137. The Chairman said that the Committee on Reduction of Salt and Sugar in Food (the Committee) was going to implement the "Subsidy Scheme on the Promotion of Low Salt and Sugar Food Culture in the District" under the full support from the Food and Health Bureau as well as the relevant departments and organisations. "Low-salt-and-sugar" would be publicised in all districts over the territory, so that the "low-salt-and-sugar" culture could be expedited to spread over the place. The Committee would also provide a subsidy of \$250,000 for each DC from this day to 31 March 2018 to organise the programmes for promotion of "low-salt-and-sugar" diet. He proposed that this matter was to be referred to the Social Services and Community Information Committee for follow-up.

138. Members unanimously agreed to the above proposal.

139. The Chairman stated that Yan Chai Hospital, Tsuen Wan Committee for Celebration of Reunification of Hong Kong with China and Tsuen Wan District Dragon Boat Race Organising Committee would organise a series of celebration activities to mark the occasion of the 20th anniversary of the return of Hong Kong to the Motherland. The organisations and committees invited the TWDC to serve as a supporting organisation for the activities in celebration of the 20th anniversary of the return of Hong Kong to the Motherland and applied for display of the TWDC logo on relevant publicity materials.

140. Members unanimously agreed that the TWDC served as a supporting organisation for the activities in celebration of the 20th anniversary of the return of Hong Kong to the Motherland held by the above organisations and committees and endorsed the application for the use of the TWDC logo from the above organisations and committees.

141. Mr KOT Siu-yuen enquired whether any activities for the Chinese Lantern Festival would be held in Tsuen Wan Park. Besides, he was informed by the LCSD that “New Territories West Lunar New Year Lantern Carnival” would be held at Sha Tsui Road Playground on 10 February 2017 (Friday). He hoped that Members would join this lantern carnival which was one of the major activities in New Territories West.

142. (ADO(TW)) said that “2017 Chinese Lantern Festival Carnival in Celebration of the 20th Anniversary of the Establishment of the HKSAR (Tsuen Wan Park)” would be held at Tsuen Wan Park on 11 February 2017 (Saturday).

143. Mr KOO Yeung-pong said a male was unfortunately killed in the fire which broke out in a “subdivided unit” on the 1/F of Kam Shing Building at 6:30 p.m. on 12 January 2017. He thanked the Fire Services Department (FSD) for putting out the fire promptly so that the casualty was minimised. He also thanked the Police for arranging the police officers to maintain order at the scene and make registration for the affected residents. In addition, he thanked the TWDO for providing a temporary shelter at Lei Muk Shue Community Hall for the residents of the “subdivided units” on the 1/F of Kam Shing Building. He also thanked the SWD for providing the emergency necessities for the victims and the Members as well as the Co-opted Members who offered assistance to the affected residents. At present, the residents of three households were still living in Lei Muk Shue Community Hall and the SWD would take further follow-up actions. He expressed his gratitude to various departments once again for their support and cooperation.

144. Mr LO Siu-kit said DC(TW)(Atg.) of the HKPF would be posted out to other police district after the Chinese New Year. He thought that it was a pity because DC(TW)(Atg.) of the HKPF had assisted in tackling the vice, gambling and drug problems at Concord Square the next day after he assumed his office. Hence, he highly appreciated the performance of DC(TW)(Atg.) of the HKPF during the past few months and expressed heartfelt gratitude to him.

145. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones stated that several traffic wardens who were carrying out the prosecution work on jaywalking immediately assisted in maintaining the order when there was a fire in Shek Wai Kok Estate last month. Thus, he expressed gratitude to the Police.

146. Mr KOT Siu-yuen thanked DC(TW)(Atg.) of the HKPF, DEHS(TW) of the FEHD and TWDO for providing assistance in handling the unlawful postal delivery by domestic foreign helpers at Lo Tak Court and the problem of street obstruction arisen therefrom. He said he had seen the staff of various departments who were stationed at Lo Tak Court every Sunday. It was so exhausting. He hoped that the departments would study on employing the video cameras as the aid for law enforcement in compliance with the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance (Chapter 486), so that the departmental staff were no longer required to station at Lo Tak Court.

147. The Chairman proposed to make commendation on the FSD in writing for its excellent performance in taking prompt action for fire suppression in Tsuen Wan district in the name of the TWDC. He also highly appreciated the HKPF, FEHD, TWDO and departments concerned for their active involvement in handling the district affairs.

148. Members unanimously agreed the proposal.

(Post-meeting note: The Secretariat had expressed the commendation in writing to the FSD for its excellent performance in the fire suppression on 7 March 2017.)

149. The Chairman reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 28 March 2017 and the deadline for submission of paper was 13 March 2017.

150. The Chairman said as the Chinese New Year was coming, he wished everyone healthy and a prosperous new year. He also wished various departments every success in the year ahead. Finally, he requested the HKPF and FEHD to assist in law enforcement during the Chinese New Year and wished Tsuen Wan district a safe place during the Chinese New Year.

XV Adjournment of Meeting

151. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:23 p.m.

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat
February 2017