

Minutes of the 9th Meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (6/16-17)

Date: 28 March 2017
Time: 2:30 p.m.
Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Mr CHUNG Wai-ping, SBS, MH (Chairman)
Mr WONG Wai-kit (Vice Chairman)
Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH
The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael, BBS, JP
Mr KOO Yeung-pong, MH
Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris
Mr LI Hung-por
Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis
Ms LAM, Lam Nixie
Mr LAM Faat-kang, MH
The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben, JP
Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones
Mr CHAN Sung-ip, MH
Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly
Mr WONG Ka-wa
Mr KOT Siu-yuen
Mr CHOW Ping-tim
Mr CHENG Chit-pun
Mr LO Siu-kit
Mr TAM Hoi-pong

In Attendance:

Miss YIP Kam-ching, Jenny, JP	District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr CHONG Kong-sang, Patrick	Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr HUEN Yeuk-hon, John	Senior Liaison Officer (1), Tsuen Wan District Office
Ms LEE Lai-kiu, Winnie	Senior Liaison Officer (2), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr CHAN Lok-wing	District Commander (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force
Ms LAU Chui-ying, Bo	Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr WONG Kwok-chun, Alex	District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing), Social Welfare Department
Mr LO Kam-lun, Alan	District Lands Officer/Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing, Lands Department
Mr TSE Hing-chit	Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department
Mr YUEN Hong-shing, Honson	Chief Transport Officer/New Territories South West, Transport Department
Mr WONG Hon-kit	Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan), Housing Department

Ms KHATTAK Nasreen	District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Mr LAM Lap-tak, Daniel	Chief Engineer/New Territories West 2, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms CHEUNG Yuk-king, Dilys	Chief Leisure Manager (New Territories West), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr CHENG Kwok-kuen, Chris	District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Miss LAM Siu-yung, Daisy (Secretary)	Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr LAU Shun-tak, Donald	Executive Officer I (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
<u>For discussion of item 3:</u>	
Dr LEUNG Siu-fai, JP	Director, Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department
Dr SIT Hon-chung, Thomas	Assistant Director (Inspection and Quarantine), Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department
<u>For discussion of item 4:</u>	
Mr TSANG Lap-kei, Freddie	Senior Engineer/2 (New Territories West), Civil Engineering and Development Department
<u>For discussion of item 5, item 12 and item 13:</u>	
Mr FAN Yung-kai	Coordinator (Market) Special Duties, Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Miss LO Wai-yin, Phoenix	Acting Senior Executive Officer (Planning)7, Leisure and Cultural Services Department
<u>For discussion of item 8:</u>	
Mr FUNG Chi-hung, Eric	Senior Telecommunications Engineer (Spectrum Planning)2 (Acting), Office of the Communications Authority
Dr LOH Lai-ting, Taron	Senior Medical and Health Officer (Community Liaison)1, Department of Health
<u>For discussion of item 9:</u>	
Mr WONG Wai-lim, William	Senior Transport Officer/Transport Facilities Management, Transport Department
<u>For discussion of item 10:</u>	
Mr CHAU Yat-cheung, Lawrence	District Planning Officer/Tsuen Wan and West Kowloon, Planning Department
Mr KWONG Wang-ngai, Walter	Senior Town Planner/Tsuen Wan, Planning Department
<u>For discussion of item 11:</u>	
Mr CHEUNG Ka-shing	Senior Wetland and Fauna Conservation Officer (Acting), Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department
Mr SHEK Chung-tong	Wetland and Fauna Conservation Officer (Enforcement), Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department

For discussion of item 14:

Mr FUNG Chi-hung, Eric	Senior Telecommunications Engineer (Spectrum Planning) ² (Acting), Office of the Communications Authority
Dr LOH Lai-ting, Taron	Senior Medical and Health Officer (Community Liaison) ¹ , Department of Health

Action

I Opening Remarks and Introduction

The Chairman welcomed Dr LEUNG Siu-fai, Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation (DAFC), Members and representatives from the government departments to the 9th meeting of the Tsuen Wan District Council (TWDC). He then introduced Mr CHAN Lok-wing, who had succeeded Mr KWOK Ho-ye, Anthony as District Commander (Tsuen Wan) (DC(TW)) of the Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF) and attended the meeting for the first time.

2. The Chairman reminded Members that in accordance with Orders 17(1) and 27 of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders (the Standing Orders) that any Member who wished to move a motion or ask any question at a meeting of the Council was required to give the Secretary a notice in writing ten clear working days before the meeting. Thus, he reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 23 May 2017 and the deadline for submission of paper was 8 May 2017. As there were many items on the agenda, the Chairman reminded Members to speak as concise as possible. In addition, according to section 28 of the Standing Orders, unless otherwise agreed by the Chairman, Members could speak and make supplementary remarks once for each agenda item at a meeting and each Member could speak up to three minutes.

II Item 1: Confirmation of Minutes of the 8th Meeting held on 24 January 2017

3. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had not received any proposed amendments to the minutes before this meeting. The minutes were confirmed without amendment.

III Item 2: Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meetings

(A) Paragraphs 81 to 99 of Minutes of the Meeting held on 24 January 2017: Concern about an Accident Occurred at a Construction Site at Harbourfront and Urge to Step up the Monitoring of Safety

4. The Chairman said that Members had discussed the above issue at the TWDC meeting on 24 January 2017. The supplementary information submitted by the Labour Department on 15 March 2017 had been distributed to Members for perusal.

IV Item 3: Visit of Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation to Tsuen Wan District Council

5. The Chairman welcomed Dr LEUNG Siu-fai, DAFC for his visit to the TWDC and introduction of the work of the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) to the Members. The representative from the AFCD attending the meeting was Dr SIT Hon-chung, Thomas, Assistant Director (Inspection and Quarantine) (AD(I&Q)).

6. The DAFC introduced the work of the AFCD.

7. The AD(I&Q) of the AFCD introduced the work and functions of the five branches of the AFCD, namely the Agriculture Branch, the Fisheries Branch, the Inspection and Quarantine Branch, the Country and Marine Parks Branch and the Conservation Branch.

(Note: Mr TAM Hoi-pong and Mr CHUNG Chun-chung, Jones joined the meeting at 2:48 p.m. and 2:52 p.m. respectively.)

8. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly understood that the AFCD was responsible for controlling diseases, managing and protecting the welfare of animal and plant. Nevertheless, he opined that the AFCD should replace the term “welfare” with “rights”. It was widely considered by the public that animals were deprived of their rights, and that the existing AFCD’s practice of only cooperating with the Police in animal abuse cases by conducting post-mortem examination or providing professional advice was far from adequate. Therefore, he hoped that the AFCD and the Police would jointly establish an animal police team to take enforcement actions against animal cruelty. Besides, he knew that the “Trap-Neuter-Vaccinate-Return” programme for animals was implemented at three sites. He was of the view that many stray animals in the territory were in need of care, adding that he wished to see neither uncontrolled breeding of unneutered animals nor lack of proper care for sick animals. Hence, he enquired why the programme was only implemented at a few sites and called for its early territory-wide implementation. Furthermore, he noted that the AFCD was concerned about re-homing of animals. However, under the existing policy, animals caught by the AFCD would be handed over to non-governmental organisations (NGOs) for handling, and animal adoption days would be held from time to time. He hoped that the AFCD could manage the existing animal adoption centres directly to facilitate animal re-homing, a request long sought by animal rights activists but not addressed by the AFCD for administrative reasons. He believed that the AFCD should be able to accommodate such request with the considerable resources secured. He continued that by bringing animal adoption centres under the direct management of the AFCD, interested parties could adopt animals without delay. He urged the AFCD to adopt his suggestion as soon as possible.

9. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that monkeys often caused nuisance to residents in his constituency. Recently, wild pigs had even been spotted in the vicinity of residential areas. While he did not deny that such nuisance might be caused by human encroachment of animals’ habitats, or the animals had simply been attracted by the food offerings left behind, he hoped that the AFCD could control the situation. In addition, he indicated that during weekends, numerous hikers visited Shing Mun Country Park near Lei Muk Shue Estate. He had urged the AFCD to install railings at part of the country park to prevent visitors from falling, but the AFCD had responded that as railing installation was beyond its purview, it had forwarded the request to the relevant department for follow-up. Still, he hoped that the AFCD could help expedite the handling of the problem to avoid injury. Furthermore, he noted that some operators of hydroponic farms had complained against the laborious development of hydroponic farming due to vegetable sampling or farm inspection by different departments. He considered that the relevant regulation was too stringent.

10. Mr TAM Hoi-pong opined that the movements of wild pigs should be controlled. He learnt that both the AFCD and concerned groups had done a great deal of work, and there were two wild pig hunting teams licensed by the AFCD. He was of the view that the AFCD should not kill wild pigs to address the problem, and called on the AFCD to work out a timetable to ban the wild pig hunting teams. Moreover, he noted that some dog lovers had found the dogs they had intended to adopt at the New Territories North Animal Management

Centre (AMC) in Sheung Shui to have been euthanised, but some dogs had been kept probably out of discretion. They were really confused about how long dogs were kept by the AMC. As such, he urged the AFCD to give an account of the arrangement and extend the waiting period for dog adoption at the AMC in Sheung Shui, so that more people could adopt the dogs. Besides, he pointed out the increasing staircases in country parks, adding that people hoped to visit country parks for hiking, not for climbing the concrete staircases. Although he knew that not all staircases had been installed by the AFCD, he hoped that when beautifying the stone staircases, the AFCD would not use too luxurious materials. He also stated that barges were often found berthed in the Brothers Marine Park, which had been designated in response to the reclamation works required for the construction of Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Facilities artificial island. According to the AFCD, there was a berthing area for barges in the marine park, which in his opinion rendered the marine park meaningless. He hoped that the AFCD would consider relocating the berthing area elsewhere.

11. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris considered that country parks in Hong Kong which were located near urban areas and easily accessible had been of fairly high quality. In particular, Shing Mun Country Park in Tsuen Wan district was within walking distance from the homes of many local residents. The dense trees and fresh air in country parks had all along been appreciated. It had been reported that the natural sandy paths of some country parks had been turned into concrete paths or paths made of cobblestones. He held that since hikers wished to get closer to nature, uphill paths should not be artificially paved like urban roads. He continued that it was undesirable or even self-defeating to turn sandy paths, except those subject to soil erosion or structural problems, into concrete paths, and thus called for maintenance of the natural landscape of country parks. In addition, he had relayed the emergence of illegal excavation and tree-felling in this constituency to the AFCD earlier. Nevertheless, the AFCD had not advised practically how it would follow up on the problems after inspection. He understood that it was impossible for the AFCD to station staff everywhere in the vast country parks permanently for monitoring purpose. Accordingly, he enquired about the AFCD's strategy to eradicate the problems of illegal excavation and tree-felling.

12. Mr CHAN Sung-ip saw it extremely unfair for the AFCD to provide comprehensive protection to poultry but grossly insufficient protection to farmers and fish farmers, pointing out that the AFCD had neither provided compensation to farmers whose farms had been destroyed by wild pigs, nor to fish farmers whose grey mullet fry had been eaten by birds. He opined that the AFCD should carry out registration for farmers and fish farmers and put the relevant situations on record, so as to extend protection to them.

13. Mr CHENG Chit-pun indicated that he had raised an agenda item in January this year to discuss the planting of distinctive trees in the parks in Tsuen Wan district, which had been supported by a number of Members. He stated that local parks were under the purview of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD), while country parks were under the AFCD's purview. Trees could not only beautify the environment, but also purify the air. Red leaves had even turned Tai Tong into a tourist attraction in Yuen Long district. Unfortunately, only a small number of red leaves were found in Shing Mun Reservoir in Tsuen Wan district. Therefore, he hoped the AFCD consider identifying suitable sites in the district to plant distinctive trees. Moreover, the works timetable for the proposed Ecological Park at Tso Kung Tam Valley had not yet been finalised. The LCSD had confirmed the cancellation of the proposed suspension bridge which could hardly be constructed at the

TWDC meeting held in March last year. At that meeting, the LCSD had also indicated that in Stage 1, the existing hiking trail and viewing platform would be enhanced, a large reptile and amphibian exhibition centre would be constructed at Tso Kung Tam Nursery and the nullah at Chiu Tam Path would be converted into culvert, in order to provide more ground space for greening. The LCSD had also mentioned at the meeting that it would study the provision of hiking trails with the AFCD. In this connection, he enquired about the intention of the AFCD to expedite the implementation of the works concerned.

14. Mr WONG Ka-wa remarked that although the AFCD hoped for the return of the fallen leaves around Shing Mun Reservoir to the soil so that their nutrients could be recycled back into nature, some drains were clogged by the fallen leaves. Hence, he would like to know if the AFCD could arrange for regular clearance of such fallen leaves. Furthermore, he was aware that styrofoam boxes used by vendors to keep the vegetables were disposed of at landfills after use. With increasing global awareness of environmental protection, he hoped that the AFCD could adopt effective measures to handle the styrofoam boxes disposed of. He noted that the AFCD would sell organic vegetables at Lam Tei, Yuen Long on every Sunday. He enquired if the arrangement could be extended to Tsuen Wan district to enhance residents' understanding of organic vegetables.

15. Mr CHOW Ping-tim said that he had learnt that all animals and plants in Hong Kong were under the purview of the AFCD just now. He enquired about the amount of annual funding provided to the AFCD and its percentage in the total government expenditure, opining that the Government should increase the funding to the AFCD if the same was inadequate. Moreover, he enquired of the AFCD about the details of the recreation and development training programmes, and whether there was any publicity video or successful case for sharing. He also noted that the AFCD had set up a fund to support agricultural development and applications for grant under \$160,000 could be exempt from means testing. Besides, he had often received papers from the Lands Department (LandsD) on the availability of vacant sites for use by the TWDC. He enquired if agricultural development at these sites was eligible for application for the fund, allowing appropriate deployment of idle land to provide more green areas and arable land in the district. Furthermore, he pointed out that over the years, media reports had mentioned about the invasion of a number of country parks by Mikania which grew at an alarming speed and seriously affected the growth of other plants. Thus, he enquired whether the AFCD could control the growth rate of Mikania to allay the concerns of the public. He also hoped that the AFCD could provide the relevant information to the TWDC for reference.

16. Mr TAM Hoi-pong was aware that many slow-growing Incense Trees had been fallen in recent years. He enquired if the AFCD could increase its manpower to strengthen monitoring against such illegal activities.

17. The Vice Chairman hoped that the AFCD could advise on two issues in relation to flowers, birds, insects and fish. Firstly, he noted that in recent years, many religious groups had organised activities to release animals into the wild, which, albeit out of good intentions, might lead to ecological disasters. He had received environmental complaints from village representatives and residents of Ha Fa Shan Village in Tsuen Wan against the release of fish, eels, insects and reptiles in the catchwater, resulting in the death of many animals which could not adapt to the natural environment and hence environmental problems. Uncertain of which government department to seek assistance from, he could only contact the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) or the Water Supplies Department for assistance

in clearing the animal carcasses from the catchwater. He enquired whether the laws enforced by the AFCD could address such situation by, for example, penalising persons who were spotted engaging in unauthorised animal release activities in country parks. Furthermore, he pointed out the presence of wild pigeons in the urban areas from time to time. Even though the AFCD had published the “What You Should Know about Avian Flu” leaflet for public reference, many people still fed wild pigeons, leading to the congregation of pigeons at specific locations, thereby causing serious environmental nuisance. As the AFCD had made clear that pigeons were protected wild animals and the public should not harass them, he enquired about the legislation and the penalty to prohibit feeding of wild pigeons so as to reduce the risk of spreading diseases.

(Note: Ms LAM, Lam Nixie joined the meeting at 3:25 p.m.)

18. The DAFC responded as follows:

- (1) the problem of monkey nuisance was serious in Tsuen Wan district. To control the population of monkeys in the long term, the AFCD had adopted a “Trap-Neuter-Return” (TNR) strategy, and the relevant programme had been implemented for years with about 1 000 monkeys neutered so far. The AFCD had been monitoring the birth rate and number of monkeys. Recently, the birth rate of monkeys had dropped to about 30% and their number had decreased from 2 500 to about 2 000. In the long run, the AFCD would control the growth of monkeys through the relevant programme, but in the short run, members of the public who were disturbed by monkeys could call the AFCD for deployment of its dedicated team, including a rapid response team, to the scene for inspection and assistance;
- (2) the AFCD considered that monkey nuisance cases were mainly caused by human feeding and the availability of fruits, peanuts or other food around housing estates, worshipping venues or temples and monasteries that attracted monkeys. Therefore, such food sources must be eliminated. The AFCD would negotiate with the relevant property management offices, management companies or responsible persons of temples, monasteries and columbaria about reducing food sources. For instance, the management of Po Fook Hill in Sha Tin had been advised to put away the food offerings immediately after worshipping activities. Trapping cages would also be used to catch monkeys for neutering treatment, and neutered monkeys would be returned to the wild at remote locations. The problem of monkey nuisance at the locations concerned had already improved after implementation of the relevant measures. Residents of Tsuen Wan district could call 1823 to notify the AFCD for follow-up actions in case of monkey nuisance;
- (3) the two existing wild pig hunting teams consisting of civilian volunteers would carry out wild pig hunting operations as required. Wild pigs had been widely regarded as wild animals in recent years. However, they were in fact not protected wild animals and would affect crops. The AFCD had tried to tackle the wild pig issue with a strategy similar to that adopted for addressing monkey nuisance after taking into account the views of animal welfare organisations (AWOs). Trials of a drug that could render wild pigs infertile would be carried out this year, in an attempt to control the number of wild pigs in the long term. On handling wild pig nuisance and crop damages, the AFCD would deploy staff to the scene for inspection and suggestion of feasible measures to address the situation. In view of the increased feeding of wild

- pigs and the aggravated problem of wild pig nuisance, the AFCD would step up its education efforts;
- (4) the AFCD had cooperated with the FEHD recently to study the design of rubbish bins to prevent monkeys and wild pigs from raiding them. A preliminary design which could prevent rubbish bins from being knocked over by wild pigs or lifted open by monkeys had been drawn up. The AFCD would identify suitable locations for the trial use of such rubbish bins, in order to reduce food sources for monkeys and wild pigs;
 - (5) the AFCD would step up education and publicity efforts to raise public awareness on animal feeding and release activities this year;
 - (6) the AFCD was working with the FEHD against unauthorised feeding of animals. Subject to the availability of sufficient evidence, offenders would be prosecuted for littering under the law. Yet, there were difficulties in taking enforcement actions against animal feeding in both the vast countryside and the urban areas in Hong Kong. As the AFCD considered it necessary to enhance its education efforts, more educational and publicity activities would be carried out starting from this year, in the hope of minimising animal nuisance;
 - (7) despite the absence of an effective method for neutering pigeons, the AFCD would inspect the spots of pigeon congregation and collect samples on site for avian flu tests. Over the years, no avian flu virus had been found in pigeons or in their faeces. To address the environmental hygiene problems caused by pigeon congregation, the FEHD would prosecute persons who fed pigeons and step up cleansing work. The AFCD would continue to cooperate with the FEHD in this area;
 - (8) the AFCD partnered with over a dozen AWOs to facilitate animal re-homing. Apart from financial support, the AFCD would also monitor the compliance of AWOs with the relevant guidelines, including their assessment of would-be adopters. In processing applications for re-homing, staff of the relevant AWOs would assess if the applicants were applying out of impulse and whether they had the means and time to keep pets. Upon completion of the assessment, the staff would also check if the adopters had fulfilled their responsibilities. As extra resources were required, the AFCD considered partnering with the relevant AWOs to be the best practice;
 - (9) the AFCD encouraged neutering of adopted animals and would provide funding for neutering treatment given to all animals adopted through its partnering AWOs;
 - (10) it would usually be less flexible for the Government to implement the re-home scheme on its own due to constraints of legislation and government framework. Contrastingly, partnering with AWOs could generally facilitate animal adoption;
 - (11) if an animal was assessed to be suitable for adoption, the AFCD would notify all AWOs first. If an AWO agreed to arrange for re-homing, the animal would be kept for a longer period of time instead of just four days. Nevertheless, due to the lack of space in the AFCD's facilities, animals that were not adopted or that were found unsuitable for adoption would be euthanised;
 - (12) at present, the TNR trial programme for stray dogs was implemented by two AWOs at the trial sites in Cheung Chau and Tai Tong, Yuen Long respectively. Upon expiry of the three-year trial period in early 2018, a review would be conducted. In fact, the trial programme was implemented owing to the lack

of scientific study in the world to prove the absolute effectiveness of TNR in reducing stray dog population. In addition, the AFCD had visited the 18 District Councils (“DCs”) to consult Members on the proposed trial programme, for which only less than half of the DCs had expressed support. The continuous implementation of the trial programme in future would require support from the relevant DC and residents of the constituency concerned. Moreover, the AFCD had received lots of objections and complaints against the trial programme. For example, due to the strong opposition of residents of the constituency concerned, who had lodged complaints through various channels such as the Office of The Ombudsman, Hong Kong and the Legislative Council (LegCo), the responsible AWO had been forced to give up one of the two trial sites, leaving only one site which was located far away from residential areas for implementation of the trial programme in Cheung Chau;

- (13) the AFCD would contact the Members concerned after the meeting for more information about whether the proposed railings in Shing Mun Reservoir that they had mentioned were located within the boundary of the country park under its purview, and would respond accordingly. Besides, the AFCD would also follow up on locations where drains were clogged by fallen leaves after the meeting;
- (14) in the absence of any special reason to the contrary, the AFCD would use natural materials for hiking trail and staircase construction. Common man-made materials would be considered only if the location was subject to serious soil erosion, or if requests from villagers to facilitate the access of the elderly were received. Only a small number of hiking trails within the boundary of country parks under the AFCD’s purview were concrete paths;
- (15) as a number of concrete paths passing villages had been constructed before the designation of country parks since 1977, the AFCD would not remove the concrete paths for reconstruction with natural materials. Also, since paths in the vicinity of country park hiking trails were neither constructed nor managed by the Department, the AFCD would liaise with the relevant departments. If the paths were located within the boundary of country parks but were constructed and managed by other departments, the AFCD would provide technical advice on the use of appropriate materials for path construction to the relevant departments in order to balance various needs;
- (16) according to the information of the AFCD, most cases of illegal excavation and tree-felling had occurred outside country parks. Members were welcome to report any occurrence in country parks to the AFCD. Illegal developments, unauthorised developments or illegal felling of trees in country parks would be closely monitored, systematically recorded and followed up. Not more than 20 cases, which involved illegal graves and unauthorised structures inside country parks, were under processing. If staff of the AFCD found suspected non-compliance cases near country parks during inspections, they would refer the cases to the relevant departments for handling. However, the AFCD would be responsible for taking law enforcement actions against illegal felling of trees found on government land, whether inside or outside country parks. Members could provide the relevant information on illegal felling of trees to the AFCD for its follow-up after the meeting;
- (17) the AFCD had all along been exploring suitable locations for planting distinctive trees in Tsuen Wan district, including Shing Mun Country Park.

- Yet, the existing trees would not be removed for such purpose. Furthermore, suitable soil condition, microclimate and environment were required for planting distinctive trees. For instance, since Sweet Gum Trees preferred areas of higher altitudes and lower temperatures, the AFCD had been uncertain about whether they could grow healthily in Tai Tong and whether their leaves would turn red even at the time of planting. The AFCD would continue to identify suitable places for planting suitable species including distinctive trees in country parks, so as to attract visitors to enjoy the flowers and trees;
- (18) while the LCS D had liaised with the AFCD on the proposed Ecological Park at Tso Kung Tam Valley, updated information was not available. In case of doubts about the design of hiking trails, the AFCD could provide professional advice to the LCS D;
 - (19) currently, the Government adopted a venue management strategy in controlling Mikania, i.e. the Mikania problem should be tackled by the venue managers concerned. If the sites were within the boundary of country parks, the AFCD would deal with the problem. Different approaches in Mikania control from application of herbicide, manual clearance to biological control had been considered and tried. As manual clearance was the most effective approach, staff of the AFCD would remove Mikania in country parks promptly if found during inspections. If Mikania was found in areas managed by other departments, the AFCD would advise the relevant departments to remove the same as soon as possible. The AFCD could also provide support if technical guidance or advice was needed;
 - (20) the AFCD had stated at a meeting of the Panel on Environmental Affairs of the LegCo last year that it would step up efforts to combat the illegal felling of Incense Trees, and that it would monitor Incense Trees jointly with local villagers and concerned groups, who would inform the AFCD of any problem once identified. In the past, regular patrols of black spots had been conducted by country park staff. However, a special duty squad would be set up this year for patrolling, and members of the squad would arrive at the scene as soon as possible after notification from residents. Where necessary, the AFCD would also conduct joint enforcement operations with the Police;
 - (21) the AFCD would install metallic tree guards to protect large and mature Incense Trees and provide a barrier against felling. A trial on the use of infrared automatic monitoring device for monitoring Incense Trees was also underway, but the issue of signal reception remained unresolved. Moreover, the AFCD would plant about 10 000 Incense Trees in country parks and other areas every year for population maintenance and species protection;
 - (22) the AFCD would provide a one-stop service for farmers who intended to build hydroponic farms as agricultural structures on agricultural land, including offering assistance in submitting applications to the LandsD. Members could contact the AFCD upon receipt of any request for assistance;
 - (23) the existing farmers' markets included Lam Tei Farmers' Market that sold accredited vegetables, Tai Po Farmers' Market that sold organic vegetables and other weekend farmers' markets organised by various organisations in Central and Taikoo Place. Although the AFCD hoped to help farmers set up farmers' markets in more districts, there were difficulties in identifying suitable sites. The AFCD was open to discussion and further feasibility study if the TWDC would like to set up a weekend farmers' market in Tsuen Wan district;

- (24) most food in Hong Kong was imported, and the most commonly used containers were styrofoam boxes, which were easy to transport and ideal for temperature maintenance. Based on the information collected from the industry, a styrofoam box used for carrying fish or vegetables cost around \$20 and its recovery prices ranged from \$8 to \$10. Thus, the industry would reuse styrofoam boxes as far as possible for at least eight to ten times. Nevertheless, styrofoam boxes were so common that they were not only used for keeping food, but also for packaging and transporting other products such as home appliances. Most of them were turned into waste and disposed of in landfills after use;
- (25) the AFCD noted that some machines could break down styrofoam into strips using heat, but odour and toxic substances might be emitted in the process. On the other hand, some machines could compress styrofoam into blocks using cold compression technology before transportation to landfills, in order to reduce the pressure on landfill sites. The AFCD would make an attempt to use cold compressors in wholesale fish markets while enhancing the recycling and reuse rates of styrofoam boxes;
- (26) the AFCD considered that due regard should be given to both conservation as well as agricultural and fishery production. On crop cultivation and pond fish culture, the AFCD had already adopted feasible and effective measures to help fishermen and farmers minimise the problems associated with wild birds feeding on ponds or crops. In addition, a study was underway this year to work out measures to prevent wild birds from feeding on ponds. The AFCD would also assist fishermen in carrying out field tests on their suggestions, if any, provided that birds would not be harmed;
- (27) the AFCD provided trainings of recreational fishing for fishermen, believing that recreational fishing could offer an alternative source of income. Before engaging in recreational fishing, fishermen should first get to know the relevant mode of business operation, and should ensure the safety of all visitors. Hence, the AFCD would provide operational trainings for interested fishermen, covering modes of publicity, design of eco-tourism routes or activity plans to promote the traditional fishery culture, ways of receiving visitors and provision of sufficient safety equipment, etc.; and
- (28) there were two types of funds under the AFCD, namely loan funds and sustainable development funds established for the fishery industry and the agricultural industry in 2015 and 2016 respectively. The Finance Committee of the LegCo had approved an allocation of \$500 million to each of the development funds. Trials or projects that would benefit the industry as a whole, not merely an individual, were eligible for funding from the AFCD.

(Note: Mr LI Hung-por joined the meeting at 3:29 p.m.)

19. The Chairman thanked the DAFC for attending the meeting and asked the AFCD to consider Members' views. Members who wished to follow up on the relevant matters could contact the AFCD after the meeting.

V Item 4: Progress Report on Major Works in Tsuen Wan (as at 28 February 2017)
(TWDC Paper No. 133/16-17)

20. The Chairman stated that the Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) regularly reported the progress of the major works in Tsuen Wan district. The

representative from the department attending the meeting was Mr TSANG Lap-kei, Freddie, Senior Engineer/2 (New Territories West) (SE/2(NTW)).

21. The SE/2(NTW) of the CEDD introduced the paper.

22. Mr LAM Faat-kang enquired about the progress of the Tsuen Wan District Signature Project Scheme – Redevelopment of Sai Lau Kok Garden (SPS project). As only 4% of the SPS project had been completed, he hoped that the departments concerned would strengthen the supervision of the SPS project and enhance communication with the contractor, so that the SPS project could be completed within the specific timeframe.

23. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie enquired about the progress of Green Master Plans for the New Territories – Study.

24. The Vice Chairman enquired about the progress of the Upgrading of West Kowloon and Tsuen Wan Sewerage – Phase 1 and the advance works for cycle track between Tsuen Wan and Tuen Mun.

25. The SE/2(NTW) of the CEDD responded as follows:

- (1) according to the information provided by the Architectural Services Department (ArchSD), the SPS project was in progress. At the early stage of the project, the completion rate might not be very high. The ArchSD would step up supervision efforts to ensure the timely completion of the SPS project. The CEDD would also convey the Member's concern to the ArchSD;
- (2) the CEDD would implement Green Master Plans for the New Territories in accordance with the established procedures, including application for resource allocation and drafting of tender documents;
- (3) it was expected that the Drainage Services Department (DSD) would seek funding from the LegCo for the Upgrading of West Kowloon and Tsuen Wan Sewerage – Phase 1 this year. If further information was required, the CEDD would relay the TWDC's request to the DSD; and
- (4) the advance works for cycle track between Tsuen Wan and Tuen Mun was under detailed design. The CEDD would actively seek resources with a view to commencing the works in the fourth quarter of next year.

26. The Chairman thanked the representative of the CEDD for attending the meeting to report on the progress.

VI Item 5: Closure of Tsuen King Circuit Market and its Future Development, Item 12: Request the Government Departments to Follow the Public Aspiration on the Change of the Use of Tsuen King Circuit Market As Soon As Possible and Item 13: Strongly Request the Government to Follow the Public Aspiration to Change the Use of Tsuen King Circuit Market to Benefit the Residents of the District
(TWDC Paper No. 134/16-17, TWDC Paper No. 141/16-17 and TWDC Paper No. 142/16-17)

27. The Chairman stated that the FEHD submitted the paper to consult Members on the closure of Tsuen King Circuit Market and its future development. Moreover, since item 12: Request the Government Departments to Follow the Public Aspiration on the Change of the Use of Tsuen King Circuit Market As Soon As Possible (TWDC Paper No. 141/16-17, submitted by Mr CHENG Chit-pun and the Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael) and item 13:

Strongly Request the Government to Follow the Public Aspiration to Change the Use of Tsuen King Circuit Market to Benefit the Residents of the District (TWDC Paper No. 142/16-17, submitted by Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis) were related to the same subject matter, they would be discussed together. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving responses included:

- (1) Ms KHATTAK Nasreen, District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan) (DEHS(TW)) of the FEHD;
- (2) Mr FAN Yung-kai, Coordinator (Market) Special Duties of the FEHD;
- (3) Mr WONG Kwok-chun, Alex, District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing) (DSWO(TW/KwT)) of the Social Welfare Department (SWD);
- (4) Mr YUEN Hong-shing, Honson, Chief Transport Officer/New Territories South West of the Transport Department (TD);
- (5) Mr CHONG Kong-sang, Patrick, Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan) (ADO(TW)) of the Tsuen Wan District Office (TWDO); and
- (6) Miss LO Wai-yin, Phoenix, Acting Senior Executive Officer (Planning)⁷ of the LCSD.

Besides, the written reply from the Education Bureau (EDB) was tabled at the meeting.

28. The DEHS(TW) of the FEHD introduced TWDC Paper No. 134/16-17.

29. Mr CHENG Chit-pun introduced TWDC Paper No. 141/16-17.

30. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis introduced TWDC Paper No. 142/16-17.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael joined the meeting at 4:25 p.m.)

31. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie concurred with Members' views, indicating that she had received numerous comments from local residents. She continued that having once lived in Allway Gardens, she was more or less aware of the situation of Tsuen King Circuit Market, which had been in the condition described in the papers for years and had further deteriorated recently. She opined that Members should focus on considering how to make good use of the market to benefit local residents. She believed that Members had already received a letter from a kindergarten proposing the relocation of its campus into the market, which had also been reported by the media. She saw the proposal worth considering, pointing out that in accordance with the established procedures, the FEHD had to vacate the market first before handing the market over to the Government Property Agency (GPA) for subsequent applications from other departments to take over the site. She considered applications from other interested departments to be the most important, while the TWDC could only support or oppose the applications. Therefore, the TWDC should proactively negotiate with the departments considered to be relevant by Members and encourage such departments to submit applications to the GPA to take over Tsuen King Circuit Market.

32. Mr LAM Faat-kang supported the suggestions made in the paper submitted by the FEHD, which should not sustain further losses for the sake of economic efficiency. He agreed with the closure of Tsuen King Circuit Market because the current rental income probably could not even cover utilities expenses such as electricity, yet contractors were still required for cleansing and management of the market. In addition, he opined that which government department to handle the site of over 40 000 square feet after Tsuen King Circuit Market was vacated should be considered. He continued that residents' request for the

accommodation of a kindergarten in the site would not constitute a big problem, and hoped the relevant government departments could follow up. Moreover, he held that the residents' requests listed in the information papers submitted by the Members concerned were also feasible and urged the Government to capitalise on the opportunity of vacating the market to plan properly to promote the future development of Tsuen Wan.

33. The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael said that he had proposed the revitalisation of Tsuen King Circuit Market to the FEHD several years ago. According to the results of a survey that he had conducted in October last year, 26% of the respondents hoped for a multi-purpose room in the market, 23% hoped for a youth centre, 17% wanted a community centre and 15% wanted a study room. Results from the Hong Kong 2011 Population Census suggested that about 20% to 30% of residents of Allway Gardens were aged under 24 and hence he concluded that the facilities requested were basically those that could cater for the needs of young people and majority of residents. He had learnt from earlier visits to local residents that Tsuen King Circuit Market had been popular when live fresh fish had been available for sale years ago. Yet, the market had lost its attractiveness following the cessation of fresh fish sale. He had called to enquire why the supermarket at Tsuen King Circuit did not sell fresh fish, and the supermarket had responded that fresh fish was not sold for fear of low customer demand due to competition from the market across the street. As such, he asked the supermarket to reconsider the sale of fresh fish in response to residents' request. Furthermore, if residents wished to purchase fresh meat or other goods which the supermarket could not provide, he suggested allowing NGOs to bid for the parking site for the operation of stalls selling food that was not available in the supermarket after its resumption in the future. Besides, he was very concerned about the provision of 15-year free education, stating that the current government subsidies for schools, such as the rental subsidy provided for schools renting private premises, was the reason for the annual rental increase. He was of the view that the Government should consider designating part of the Tsuen King Circuit Market site for the operation of the relevant kindergarten. He was discussing with the EDB to see if there was a policy support for leasing out the property under the GPA through open tenders for education purpose so that the kindergarten concerned could participate in the bidding, in order to prevent owners of private premises from eating up public money.

34. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones expressed support for the FEHD's proposal and found it wasteful to leave the market substantially vacant with merely a few shops still in operation for a long time. Given the serious shortage of land in Hong Kong, he urged the Government to help local organisations in need to apply for operation at the Tsuen King Circuit Market site as soon as possible after its resumption and upon completion of the relevant procedures. As many people or organisations were believed to have strong demand for the site, he hoped that the Government could exercise flexibility in processing such applications to shorten the process for lease by good intentioned service providers. He also believed that the site of 40 000 square feet could accommodate several organisations, including a kindergarten which only required a site area of at least 1 000 to 2 000 square feet.

35. Mr LO Siu-kit said that despite the TWDC's tremendous effort in an attempt to enhance and consolidate Tsuen King Circuit Market over the past few years, the proposal had eventually been shelved after many hurdles. The Audit Commission (AC) had even publicly announced the high vacancy rate of the market later. He pointed out that there were only about 20 stalls operating in the market and most of them were engaged in processing rather than retailing. He called for early resumption of the market and exploration of the use of the site of over 40 000 square feet after it was vacated. As both the Member and residents of the

constituency concerned hoped that the relevant resources could be used to provide convenience to local residents, he urged the Government to conduct an extensive consultation and make good use of the site to construct facilities needed by Tsuen Wan residents.

36. Mr LI Hung-por indicated that Members had come up with similar comments after liaising with various members of the public and looking at the matter from different angles. Tsuen King Circuit Market was closely linked to Tsuen Wan Centre. A green minibus service had used to operate between the two places to facilitate residents' grocery shopping, but it had been cancelled due to low patronage. He continued that although he had not conducted a comprehensive survey, he had consulted residents of his constituency on the future uses of the market. He learnt from residents' replies that they hoped for a multi-purpose room, a community hall and a study room. He further pointed out that some residents also hoped to reserve part of the Tsuen King Circuit Market site for sale of food ingredients. While he understood this suggestion would place a strain on the resources of the FEHD, he was simply reflecting the views of residents truthfully.

37. Mr MAN Yu-ming supported the proposal of the FEHD, commenting that the actual usage of Tsuen King Circuit Market had changed and had lost the function of market. He hoped that the FEHD would expedite the study of how to handle the site after its resumption. He said that according to the established procedures, it would be a long process for applicant departments to be allocated their respective spaces after resumption of the market by the GPA. Thus, he was of the view that the application process should be speeded up. Furthermore, as there was a lack of community facilities or venues for provision of urgent services in Tsuen Wan, the site of 40 000 square feet should be put to good use after it was vacated. Leaving the site idle for one day was more than just a waste of money. In fact, the interests of local residents would also be affected, which was not compatible with the pace of development of the modern society. Hence, he enquired if any department would be responsible for co-ordination to facilitate the complicated procedures and suggested the TWDO to take on such role. Besides, he held that the Government should respect the views of the Member of the constituency concerned who had analysed the needs of the public in detail. Having noted the comments of kindergarten parents, he also opined that the Government should understand their eagerness to foster their children. Hence, he hoped that various practical needs could be met as far as possible under the leadership of the leading department.

38. Mr CHAN Sung-ip expressed his full support for the closure of Tsuen King Circuit Market.

39. Mr KOO Yeung-pong supported the proposal of the FEHD, indicating that with the passage of time and the improvement of ancillary transport facilities, the community's demand for Tsuen King Circuit Market had changed and the historic role of the market had come to an end. The Government must study ways to make the best use of the site. He thanked the FEHD for operating the market despite enormous difficulties. He pointed out that the current market stall rental of \$90 was even lower than mini-storage rentals, and the FEHD would still sustain a loss even if the stallholders kept renewing their tenancy agreements, which would definitely draw severe criticism from the AC. Therefore, he saw it necessary to address this issue as soon as possible and to vacate and hand over the site to the Government. He stated that a number of Members had already conducted surveys to gauge residents' views. He also held that the site should be put to the best use to cater for local needs in the future and the existing tenants should be resettled properly.

40. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly supported the closure of Tsuen King Circuit Market provided that the existing tenants were reasonably compensated, their rights were taken care of and no inconvenience was caused to residents nearby. He knew that the FEHD had worked hard to keep the market in operation, yet the goods or services provided by the market could not satisfy the needs of local residents anymore due to the emergence of various competitors in the neighbourhood in response to market demand. Furthermore, he was worried that the reallocation of the site would have to go through numerous departments in accordance with the established government procedures after the closure of the market. It was uncertain if any department would be willing to take over the site by then and when the relevant facilities would be opened for use. He opined that the demand for study rooms was great as many people had requested for and many young people would use such facility. He indicated that according to the reply of the EDB, there were sufficient study rooms in Tsuen Wan district, young residents along Tsuen King Circuit might not use most of them because of their relatively remote locations in areas such as Lei Muk Shue and Belvedere Garden. He urged the relevant government departments to conduct site visits before responding to Members' enquiries in future. In addition, he enquired if a bazaar could be operated on a trial basis at Tsuen King Circuit Market before its closure so that interested parties could have hands-on experience to facilitate future bazaar operation.

41. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that the issue of Tsuen King Circuit Market had been discussed for years. Members had once requested for the reprovisioning of the market, which, however, had been substituted by supermarkets gradually over time. He pointed out that whether real estate hegemony would push up commodity prices through rising rent was an issue worth studying. Yet, the relevant departments should decide on the fate of the market operating under difficult business condition as soon as possible. He hoped the TWDO could have a comprehensive understanding of the suitable district facilities for local residents such as a community hall and a multi-purpose room. Furthermore, he supported the use of the site by the Government. Nevertheless, if the site was open for application from private organisations, he hoped that the application process would be fair, open and just and all organisations in Tsuen Wan would be allowed to apply without giving preference to certain local organisations or stakeholders.

42. Mr TAM Hoi-pong was opposed to leaving supermarkets only for local residents to buy fresh food. Since many people had lobbied for the construction of new markets while requesting for the closure of the existing ones, he enquired if the stalls on the second and third floors of Tsuen King Circuit Market could be relocated to the ground floor for continuous operation while maintaining the market operation on that floor. He understood that this approach had been attempted and eventually failed, and enquired about the reason for such failure, hoping that the FEHD could learn from the lesson. He said that there were still about a dozen stalls in operation in the market now. If they did not want to move to Tsuen Wan town centre, the ground floor would undoubtedly be an alternative. Besides, he had no further comment on the uses of the second and third floors of the market and only hoped for uses that followed residents' views. Moreover, he hoped that the Government could adopt a "through-train" mode when considering the way forward after the closure of the market. Otherwise, he was worried that the result might be beyond control after the market was taken over by the GPA.

43. Mr CHOW Ping-tim supported the FEHD's proposal. He said that as the current usage rate and rental income of the market were low, it might be better to close the market

than to barely keep it in operation. He continued that under the existing government policy and mechanism, further development of the site after the FEHD handed over Tsuen King Circuit Market would be subject to lots of constraints. He hoped to meet with the next Chief Executive (CE) to see if there were ways to reduce the constraints, otherwise it would probably take a long time to complete the construction works which would commence only after the GPA took over the market.

44. The Vice Chairman was aware that the current situation of Tsuen King Circuit Market had existed for a long time, and during the discussion at the last meeting of the TWDC, Members had hoped to reduce the market from two storeys to one storey. He also knew that the FEHD had worked very hard and had tried new methods to raise the occupancy rate of the market but to no avail. He agreed that Members felt helpless about the closure of the market and found it a pity to lose a place for residents to buy fresh food. As local residents had already made a sacrifice, he hoped that the relevant government departments would proactively explore ways to optimise the resources and put the vacated market to uses beneficial to local residents. He stated that the results of surveys conducted by Members all pointed to a similar direction, i.e. a general wish for the provision of facilities for use by local residents. He said that some parents with children attending the relevant kindergarten, the only one in the Allway Gardens constituency, also attended this meeting as observers. Faced with a rental increase every year, the kindergarten might eventually need to relocate if it could not withstand the pressure of rental increase. In this case, the Allway Gardens constituency would be left with no kindergarten. Therefore, he hoped that the relevant departments could consider reserving the market site for the accommodation of the kindergarten in the future. He believed that the two-storey Tsuen King Circuit Market site of a total of 40 000 square feet would require extra resources from the relevant departments before it could be put to other uses. As such, he was worried that only a few departments would submit applications to take over the site and opined that no possibilities should be excluded at this stage. He hoped that all the departments concerned would spare no effort in securing resources in order to put Tsuen King Circuit Market to better community uses.

45. The Hon Michael TIEN said that according to the EDB, the Government hoped for the operation of more kindergartens on government sites. If the Tsuen King Circuit Market site could be used for education purpose, the EDB could offer concessionary rents. In addition, he indicated that some NGOs were interested in selling local agricultural products in the parking spaces to create job opportunities for the disadvantaged. In this connection, he enquired of the FEHD about the feasibility of using the parking spaces for the sale of agricultural products, and whether it could issue licenses to the interested NGOs.

46. The DEHS(TW) of the FEHD responded as follows:

- (1) as the FEHD did not know which department would take over the parking spaces, the Member's suggestion could hardly be implemented; and
- (2) NGOs or non-profit-making organisations (NPOs) could submit proposals to the relevant bureaux or government departments. If the proposals were supported, the FEHD would process the licensing applications concerned having regard to the relevant factors and in accordance with the established procedures.

47. The Chairman stated that some Members had already learnt about the situation of the long established Tsuen King Circuit Market as Regional Councillors years ago. It was a pity that its continuous operation would inevitably lead to a waste of public money. Thus,

Members agreed to the closure of Tsuen King Circuit Market and the follow-up by the FEHD. Moreover, he hoped that the FEHD would provide compensation arrangements for the existing stallholders and help them find other places for operation as soon as possible. He also urged the FEHD to spearhead concerted efforts of various government departments while taking Members' suggestions into consideration for the well-being of the community.

VII Item 6: "Request to Establish Bazaars in Tsuen Wan"
(TWDC Paper No. 135/16-17)

48. The Chairman said that Mr WONG Ka-wa had submitted the paper. Besides, the written reply of the Food and Health Bureau (FHB) was tabled at the meeting.

49. Mr WONG Ka-wa introduced the paper.

50. The District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan) of the LCSD responded as follows:

- (1) the LCSD was open to the establishment of bazaars;
- (2) as the LCSD's venues were for recreational purpose, so the operation of bazaars had to be co-ordinated to ensure other users were not affected. Besides, bazaar activities could only be one-off and non-recurring in nature; and
- (3) the LCSD would conduct evaluation for the proposed bazaar after considering its time and impact on the surroundings. If the proposed bazaar was considered feasible, the LCSD would process the application for use of leisure venue for non-designated use.

51. The DEHS(TW) of the FEHD responded as follows:

- (1) the FEHD was open to the establishment of bazaars;
- (2) the key was that the proposed bazaar should not have any adverse impact on food safety and environmental hygiene should not cause obstruction to public passageways;
- (3) the FEHD would provide assistance if a venue was suitable for setting up a bazaar and support was gained from the community and the TWDC; and
- (4) if the proposed venue was under the purview of another department, consent from the relevant department should be obtained first.

52. The District Lands Officer/Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing (DLO/TW&KwT) of the LandsD responded that according to the written reply from the FHB, support from the relevant department or the FHB had to be secured for the establishment of the proposed bazaar. The LandsD would provide assistance accordingly.

53. The Chairman enquired of the LandsD if there were any venues suitable for the establishment of bazaars.

54. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly remarked that the emergence of real estate hegemony had caused exorbitant rentals and made it more difficult for the public to get their basic necessities. As a result, many people had voiced support for the establishment of bazaars in recent years. He hoped that the new Government would not focus solely on protecting the interests of large groups or consortia, but would be more considerate for ordinary members of the public. He indicated that bazaars could not only provide food and basic necessities to the public, but could also revive the local economy. A number of bazaar vendors operating on a small scale were given an opportunity to be self-reliant while promoting self-sufficiency in

the community. He said that apart from rendering cooperation, it was also vital for government departments to provide support. For instance, the bazaar at Tung Chau Street, albeit lasted for only a few days, had attracted lots of visitors. However, owing to the lack of full cooperation from the Government, the bazaar had been faced with problems such as power shortage and insufficient circulation space. He hoped that the relevant government departments could provide corresponding support to help interested organisations establish bazaars in Tsuen Wan district. Furthermore, he enquired if the LCSD could try organising activities such as food carnivals in local playgrounds during special festivals as a side show for public enjoyment and purchase of specialty food, and whether the site of Tsuen King Circuit Market could be used by interested organisations and members of the public to establish a bazaar for trial operation after the closure of the market.

55. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris indicated that the emergence and design of bazaars had always been the subject of urban architecture. Bazaars could be seen in various forms. A number of bazaars that were considered interesting had been formed spontaneously without repeated planning or design. Also, the emergence of bazaars was closely related to the community because the most important factor for the formation of bazaars was the condition to attract patronage and visitors in the surroundings. He cited the magnificent ancient temples, particularly the area in front of the renowned ancient Greek temples, as a classic example. Apart from their attractiveness as landmarks, the availability of traffic hubs and parallel streets had also facilitated the emergence of bazaars, just like Sai Yeung Choi Street and Tung Choi Street near Nathan Road. He said that the establishment of bazaars was different from the construction of sports centres which merely required the provision of facilities on land provided. Instead, the Government should understand the reasons for the emergence of bazaars and permit their spontaneous formation. He found from his search that the website of the FEHD did not provide any information on unlicensed hawker black spots in Tsuen Wan district. He believed that since unlicensed hawkers trading on the narrow footbridges with high patronage and limited space as part of the footbridge network that mainly covered Tsuen Wan might cause congestion, enforcement officers would drive them away in a timely manner and they could not congregate for a long time. In addition, he opined that the two locations with the highest patronage in Tsuen Wan were the vacant land and passageway off the two MTR stations. Unlicensed hawkers occasionally spotted trading in these areas under private management were promptly driven away by security guards. Hence, he held that the government land between Tsuen Wan West station and Hoi Shing Road had the potential to become a bazaar, subject to the views of residents and the Member of the constituency concerned. If open space was not used and an alternative site was identified deliberately for the establishment of a bazaar, the bazaar would become a market, which would run counter to the closure of Tsuen King Circuit Market. He believed that the policy of the FEHD should be changed to allow the revitalisation of the soon abandoned government site and the incorporation of bazaar culture. He also considered that the healthy integration of bazaar culture into Tsuen Wan was possible only after implementation of all the key points he had mentioned.

(Note: The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben joined the meeting at 5:10 p.m.)

56. Mr LO Siu-kit did not support the establishment of bazaars in Tsuen Wan, commenting that bazaars that were not held once or twice a week were not bazaars at all. He pointed out that the events held only during major festivals or annually in Victoria Park or at the Hong Kong Convention and Exhibition Centre were one-off in nature and regarded the re-establishment of bazaars as a retrogression. Bazaars had been everywhere in Tsuen Wan

back in the 1950s and 60s. Many market stall operators nowadays were actually hawkers with hawker licences who had been resettled in the markets. He opined that problems would arise if bazaars were re-established on the streets. For example, stall operators would request for increased trading days and designation of a venue for their operation, just like the dawn market in Tuen Mun. He stated that there were already Hau Tei Square Hawker Bazaar and several markets in Tsuen Wan, just that the public was not enthusiastic in bidding for the stalls. Even though the market rental of Tsuen King Circuit Market was only \$90, the stalls were left largely vacant. Therefore, he held that venues should not be designated for hawker operation. Moreover, people often talked about real estate hegemony without taking into account the fact that market stallholders had to pay rental for their operation while bazaar vendors enjoyed free rental. He enquired whether market stallholders should give up their stalls to operate at bazaars if similar goods were sold in markets and bazaars. Furthermore, he supported organising short-term bazaars during major festivals, but considered it necessary to think twice about the establishment of long-term bazaars, so as to avoid the need for the FEHD and the LandsD to arrange for temporary hawker markets or construct markets for the resettlement of the affected bazaar vendors at very low rental rates upon resumption of the sites concerned in the future. Besides, he indicated that shopping at markets might not be cheaper than shopping at supermarkets now.

57. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said that the demand for bazaars in Tsuen Wan was relatively low. He had paid a visit to Yeung Uk Road and its vicinity last Sunday and had bought most of the daily necessities there. As such, he opined that the agenda item concerned should be changed to “festive bazaars”. He held that reference could be made to the annual bazaar held in May at a sports ground in Tsing Yi, and bazaars could be organised in Tsuen Wan district half-yearly or on festive occasions only. In addition, he knew that the LegCo Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Bazaars had a list of potential bazaar sites in the 18 districts, some of which were located in the periphery areas. Therefore, he suggested that Members could examine the list first to find out the potential sites in Tsuen Wan for trial bazaar operation during festivals.

58. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben indicated that the concept of establishing bazaars was good as ordinary members of the public would have the opportunity to buy various goods. Nevertheless, he opined that Tsuen Wan town centre was not lacking in shopping venues with a hawker bazaar and various shops and markets. He enquired if Members had concrete suggestions for bazaar locations and specific proposals for discussion, considering this as more important than simply making a stand. He continued that the relevant suggestions must be agreed and supported by local residents, otherwise their implementation would be met with difficulties or controversies.

59. Mr MAN Yu-ming said that he had been inspired by Members’ discussion on the difference between bazaars and markets. At present, there were three markets in Tsuen Wan, namely Yeung Uk Road Market, Market Street Market and Heung Che Street Market, as well as Hau Tei Square Hawker Bazaar. He pointed out that Hau Tei Square, formerly a traditional market, had only been transformed into the present Hau Tei Square Hawker Bazaar after much design effort and promotion by the TWDC. Since there were not many operators in the hawker bazaar, he opined that a bazaar could be established at the hawker bazaar site after consulting local residents to achieve a sense of continuity.

60. Mr WONG Ka-wa hoped the Chairman ask the relevant departments if suitable sites could be provided for the TWDC’s consideration in establishing bazaars. He was of the

view that bazaars could help promote the respective cultures of Hakkas, Fujianese, Chaozhouese and other ethnic minorities living in Tsuen Wan district and the sale of specialty goods. Furthermore, he commented that bazaars nowadays should be more sizeable and meet the relevant requirements as compared to those in the past and should neither obstruct public passages nor cause hazard. He stated that there were also bazaars in Tsuen Wan, such as the one held at Citywalk 2 in the past month or two, selling mainly handmade goods. Therefore, he believed that some organisations would hope for government departments' support for the establishment of bazaars, yet the Government must take into account the interests of rent-paying shop operators. Besides, he regarded those operating outside shops or markets as hawkers instead of bazaar vendors.

61. The Chairman considered the agenda item groundless. Members should give careful consideration to the fact that bazaars would probably serve as a precondition for the unlicensed hawkers to become licensed hawkers. He cited the example of the annual Tin Hau Festival Celebrations held by Tsuen Wan Rural Committee on the 23rd day of the third lunar month, remarking that the event could be held in cooperation with the LCSD and be relocated to Sha Tsui Road Playground. After the worshipping ceremony for Tin Hau Festival, the event could be opened to the public in the form of temple fair with a parade, performances, traditional Cantonese operas and specialty stalls. As the site under the LCSD was available for booking by other organisations, it could not be used for bazaar purpose for an extended period of time. In this connection, he enquired if the LandsD could provide alternative sites for the establishment of bazaars. Also, he saw it necessary to study in detail whether to establish bazaars, such as whether the food to be sold should meet the safety standards of the FEHD.

(Note: Mr LI Hung-por left the meeting at 5:27 p.m.)

62. The DLO/TW&KwT of the LandsD responded as follows:

- (1) the LandsD had regularly provided the information of existing vacant sites for the TWDC's reference;
- (2) most of these vacant sites were not suitable for the establishment of bazaars because they were located in relatively remote areas without adequate transport facilities; and
- (3) the LandsD would process applications submitted by NPOs for use of suitable vacant sites as appropriate.

63. The Chairman thanked the LandsD for providing assistance.

VIII Item 7: "Strong Objection to the Revised 'Well-off Tenants Policies' and Request to Offer a Consultation Period"

(TWDC Paper No. 136/16-17)

64. The Chairman stated that Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly submitted the paper. The representatives from the Housing Department (HD) responsible for giving response was Mr WONG Hon-kit, Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan) (CM/M(WTT)). Besides, the written reply from the Transport and Housing Bureau (THB) was tabled at the meeting.

65. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly introduced the paper.

66. The CM/M(WTT) of the HD responded as follows:

- (1) a series of discussions and consultations had been conducted in the community to examine the revised “Well-off Tenants Policies” (revised policies), including the public consultation exercise conducted by the Long Term Housing Strategy Steering Committee (LTHSSC);
- (2) apart from the LTHSSC’s consultation exercise, the Subsidised Housing Committee (SHC) of the Hong Kong Housing Authority (HA) had also discussed the policies in 2014 and reviewed the comments of the LTHSSC subsequently. After further discussion at the meeting on 24 October 2016, the SHC had formally submitted a paper to look into the relevant issue on 31 October 2016. In the end, the specific arrangements for the revised policies had been endorsed at the SHC meeting held on 9 December 2016;
- (3) upon announcement of the related arrangements, members of the public had expressed many different views. The HD had also received a large number of public comments on the revised policies;
- (4) the HD had briefed various stakeholders such as housing groups on its paper and listened to their views at the meeting of the LegCo Panel on Housing on 9 January 2017. After collecting the relevant comments, the HD had submitted another paper to the SHC and endorsed the implementation details in February 2017, while the HA had resolved putting the revised policies into formal implementation in October 2017;
- (5) only a limited number of well-off tenants would be required to declare their assets and income under the declaration cycle in October 2017;
- (6) Both the Government and the HA agreed that the rising demand for public rental housing (PRH) would lengthen the waiting time for PRH allocation;
- (7) the HD would review the effectiveness of the revised policies after their implementation in October to assess if the revision could achieve the desired results; and
- (8) the main objectives of the revised policies were to distribute PRH resources to those with more pressing needs in a more focused way, and to distribute the tight public resources in a fairer manner.

67. Mr MAN Yu-ming expressed grave dismay at the HD’s decision that would subject 460 000 PRH tenants to declarations in one or two years notwithstanding its acknowledgement of the existing housing shortage and failure to estimate the number of PRH units that could be vacated upon implementation of the revised policies. He continued that the revised policies had generated continuous controversies, yet the key issue was the short duration discussion before their hasty endorsement by the SHC. In his opinion, despite improvements in some measures such as requirements on the lump-sum retirement benefits received under mandatory provident fund (MPF) schemes, occupational retirement schemes and civil service pension schemes, the revised policies as a whole appeared to be surreptitiously substituting one measure for another. All in all, he considered that the HD had implemented the policies in haste without conducting adequate consultation. Thus, he strongly opposed the revised policies but supported the rational allocation of PRH resources, on which he believed that the HD should conduct a comprehensive review.

68. Mr WONG Ka-wa opined that neither the HD had conducted any consultation prior to the implementation of the revised policies, nor the well-off tenants defined by the HD could afford any property in reality. He said that some PRH tenants with a higher average household income in his constituency were regarded as well-off tenants after the asset test due to higher incomes of their children. As the Government had all along encouraged children to

live with their parents with a view to fostering closer relationship and avoiding social problems, he questioned why the HD had still decided to implement the revised policies in October this year under this direction. He pointed out that if the current-term Government and the next-term Government continued to have different views on the same policy, the public would lose confidence in the new-term Government. Therefore, he hoped that the TWDC could write to the relevant departments to urge the new-term Government to review the situation. In addition, he was sceptical about the HD's representation that a property could be purchased at some \$2 million for the whole family.

69. Mr TAM Hoi-pong expressed strong reservations about the revised policies and found their hasty implementation worthy of consideration. Based on the concept that the PRH units allocated to those better-off should be freed up, he did not strongly oppose the policies. Moreover, he agreed with the concept that a number of social problems could be avoided if children lived with their parents. Having recently received numerous comments on the calculation of lump-sum insurance claims and MPF benefits, he saw it too hasty to implement the revised policies in October this year. As such, he hoped that the HD could put them into implementation after holding more public consultation sessions in all districts. He further held the view that the PRH problems could be addressed immediately if the daily quota for One-way Permits was reduced.

70. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones did not support the revised policies, indicating that as a Member serving PRH tenants, he had already called on the Government not to implement the policies in haste immediately upon their introduction. He considered it problematic to implement a quite significant policy revision without adequate consultation and consideration. He stated that according to the paper of the HD, the policies had been introduced in 2014, discussed in October 2016 and endorsed in February 2017. Over such a short period of time, many problems had remained unclarified and a number of concerns had remained unaddressed. The best thing of this practice was to endorse the policies hurriedly, even though various problems would emerge afterwards, the greatest being how many units could be vacated after their implementation to expedite PRH allocation to applicants waiting for a long time. He opined that the quickest way to solve residents' problems was to construct more PRH, rather than introducing nuisance-causing policies with extensive impacts before thorough consideration. Furthermore, he believed that PRH resources should be reasonably allocated, so excessively well-off tenants should return their PRH units and their continuous staying in their PRH units should absolutely not be tolerated. He said that in earlier years when the property price level had been lower, a flat in a tenement building could be purchased at only several hundred thousand dollars. However, under the revised policies, PRH tenants who owned a flat in a tenement building would be required to vacate their PRH unit and move into such a flat. It was really unsympathetic to the elderly who had to climb up many stairs to get home. He enquired how the HD would deal with the situation. In addition, he was aware of lots of criticisms against the Government's impractical waiting time target for PRH allocation of four years given the current actual waiting time of seven to eight years. Hence, he looked forward to the construction of more PRH so that applicants on the waiting list could be allocated PRH units as soon as possible.

71. Mr LO Siu-kit said that it was extremely hasty for the revised policies which had been formally mentioned in 2016 to be implemented in October 2017. He had received relevant enquiries even though there were no PRH estates in his constituency. Besides, he noted that some of the terms in the revised policies were more lenient than the former ones and the HD would exercise discretion when handling cases of households with family

members living with their own elderly parents. Nevertheless, children of the elderly would have to move out if they were also listed as household members in the PRH tenancy of the same unit. He pointed out that even after buying their own flats with their hard-earned savings, the children would still need time to save up money for getting married before moving out of their PRH units and delete themselves from the tenancy. If the children had purchased their own flats under the existing “two pillars” system, they would have to move out of their PRH units after implementation of the revised policies in October. They might not complete the sale of their properties by October even if they had such intention. As such, he considered the arrangement undesirable. He opined that the Government should provide the financially well-off tenants with a housing ladder to help them move out of their units. Therefore, the HD should study ways to improve the prevailing housing policies. He stated that it was understandable to require PRH tenants who had purchased their own properties to move out of their PRH units. However, the HD should reconsider the necessity to force them to delete themselves from the tenancy or move out of their PRH units if their properties were only small investments or had depleted their parents’ savings.

72. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben opined that the revised policies could not achieve much, yet would require enormous manpower and resources to conduct random checking of income and assets declared by PRH households. The additional administrative work arising from the revised policies would hinder the operation of the HD. PRH tenants might also suffer from dramatic family changes in order to meet the requirements of the new policies, thereby creating social problems. In his view, the revised policies were thus not worth the effort and would lead to widespread discontent among the public. He continued that the public already had difficulties in renting private flats. If the household members who moved out of PRH units also turned to the private rental market, the housing problem was only transferred from one sector to another. He contended that the revised policies were unwise in that they would simply create social problems instead of achieving justice. He found the policies that would work after implementation certainly worth supporting. Still, the revised policies were already envisaged to be ineffective by everyone. Therefore, he hoped the HD would reflect the TWDC’s strong opposition to the implementation of the revised policies to the HA.

73. Mr NG Hin-lung Norris said that most buildings in his constituency were private housing and some of the tenants were awaiting PRH allocation. The shortage of PRH supply was widely known, and the fact that it took years to identify land for housing development was indisputable. In view of this, he opined that the revised policies were appropriate as a measure to increase a small number of PRH units in the short run. He held that the Government had already factored in many considerations in the revised policies by making allowance for special circumstances of elderly members, Comprehensive Social Security Assistance (CSSA) recipients and the disabled, and deducting lump sum retirement benefits and insurance claims from the calculation of asset limits. He considered that this was a zero-sum game in the short term between the existing PRH tenants who had to vacate their PRH units under the revised policies on the one hand, and the applicants on the PRH waiting list who had to bear exorbitant rent on the other. He wondered if the former was in a worse situation than the latter. He believed that social welfare officers or social workers would provide assistance to those who were asked to move out of their PRH units but had special difficulties in doing so. Moreover, he enquired if the HD had conducted a comprehensive income and assets test for PRH tenants and whether overseas assets would be reviewed, in order to demonstrate the fairness of the mechanism. He opined that the HD should rectify the above situation to refine the policies. He remarked that given the shortage of overall

housing supply in Hong Kong and the PRH developments in progress, it would not do any good to the society as a whole to stop the relevant departments from making rules that provided for fair use of resources on the above grounds.

74. The CM/M(WTT) of the HD responded as follows:
- (1) the SHC had received many TWDC Members' comments at its meetings and the LegCo Panel on Housing meetings;
 - (2) the HD took note of most Members' concerns about the short duration discussion, inadequate consultation and hasty implementation of the revised policies;
 - (3) the revised policies had not been endorsed all of a sudden. Since the HD had begun the review from as early as 2013-14, the HA considered the revised policies the result of discussions with various stakeholders in the past three to four years rather than a hasty decision;
 - (4) the HA had endorsed the revised policies for the sake of fairer distribution of PRH resources, which might give Members a sense that the revised policies would cause nuisance and inconvenience to the existing PRH tenants;
 - (5) the revised PRH household income limits were five times of the PRH waiting list income limits (PRHILs). Taking a four-person household as an example, the household monthly income limit had been raised to over \$100,000. On the other hand, the revised asset limit had been raised from 84 times to 100 times of the PRHILs, which was equivalent to about \$2,700,000 at the current level;
 - (6) the HD noted that what Members and the PRH tenants were concerned most was not income and asset limits but the change from the "two pillars" system to a "one pillar" system, under which households with private property ownership would be required to vacate their PRH units;
 - (7) after listening to many stakeholders' comments, the HA had endorsed the deduction of lump-sum retirement benefits received under MPF schemes and civil service pension schemes from the calculation of asset limits. Households whose members were all aged 60 or above or with all members receiving CSSA or disability allowance would also be exempted from the revised policies;
 - (8) the HD could not foresee the results of the revised policies before their implementation, nor could the HA estimate at this stage the effects of the revised policies after their implementation. The revised policies and their effectiveness would be reviewed upon implementation;
 - (9) the HD clarified that not all PRH tenants would be required to declare their income and assets. Tenants would have to make the declaration only after living in PRH for ten years;
 - (10) the HD thanked Members for their understanding of the foreseeable difficulties that the HD would face in implementing the revised policies formulated by the HA, including requiring PRH tenants to declare their income and assets. As the executive arm of the HA, the HD had to implement the revised policies as endorsed accordingly;
 - (11) the CE-elect would be sworn in soon. According to her election manifesto, a housing ladder would be re-constructed to allow families at different income levels to purchase their homes, which was believed to have reflected the public demand for housing such as PRH, Home Ownership Scheme flats and Green

Form Subsidised Home Ownership Scheme flats. The housing problem was expected to be resolved upon implementation of such initiative; and

- (12) the HD had met with tremendous difficulties in finding suitable sites for housing construction. It was hoped that the HD would gain support from Members and local residents with a view to solving the problem of housing supply in the long run.

75. The Chairman thanked the representative of the HD for attending the meeting. He said that most Members considered the consultation period of the revised policies inadequate and urged the HD to consider Members' views.

IX Item 8: "Strongly Request the Communications Authority to Submit the Information on the Total Number and Distribution of Large-scale Transmitters on the Rooftops of the Buildings hired by the Telecommunications Providers in Tsuen Wan to Facilitate Understanding of the Current Operational Environment and the District Council to Follow up on the Relevant Impacts. Meanwhile, the Communications Authority had the Responsibility to Resolve the Worries about the Living Environment under the Impact of the Strong Electromagnetic Wave Generated by the Transmitters. It is Proposed that a Professional Medical and Scientific Survey should be Conducted and an Effective Control on the Direction of Installation and Limit on the Number of the Large-scale Transmitters on Each Commercial and Residential Building should be Stipulated in order to Ensure the Health and Safety of the General Public."
(TWDC Paper No. 137/16-17)

76. The Chairman said that Mr CHOW Ping-tim had submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving responses included:

- (1) Mr FUNG Chi-hung, Eric, Senior Telecommunications Engineer (Spectrum Planning)² (Acting) (STE(SP)²(Atg.)) of the Office of the Communications Authority (OFCA); and
- (2) Dr LOH Lai-ting, Taron, Senior Medical and Health Officer (Community Liaison)¹ (SM&HO(CL)¹) of the Department of Health (DH).

Besides, the written replies from the OFCA and the DH were tabled at the meeting.

77. Mr CHOW Ping-tim introduced the paper.

78. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben indicated that the problem of electromagnetic radiation had aroused public concern. Electromagnetic wave was invisible and untouchable, and would also be generated by home routers. The general public were unclear about the standards established by the Government, nor were they able to ascertain the impact of electromagnetic wave on human health. Sharing the same feeling, he hoped that the OFCA could conduct more tests and inform the public of the situation. He found the occurrence of a number of cancer cases in the same place at the same time very shocking, and hoped that the OFCA could look into whether there was any direct correlation between electromagnetic wave and cancer in order not to cause panic among the public. In addition, he enquired if anything had been planned after the release of the relevant media reports to allay the fear of the public, whether the OFCA had measures in place to ban equipment that had been complained repeatedly for subjecting members of the public to direct exposure, and under what circumstances the telecommunications providers would be required to remove the equipment concerned.

79. Ms LAM Yuen-pun, Phyllis said that she had proposed a similar agenda item for discussion in 2013, when ten transmitters/receivers had been installed at Tsuen King Circuit Playground without prior public consultation, causing health concern among the residents who often did morning exercises or fitness exercises in the nearby parks. She continued that she had already mentioned in the paper submitted years ago the obsolete standards adopted in Hong Kong, which had been developed in 1998 without any update so far. As Hong Kong was characterised by hilly terrains, she had suggested transmitters be constructed in rural areas uphill instead of in urban areas to minimise impact on the public. She wondered why the telecommunications providers had not invested resources in constructing transmitters like CLP Power Hong Kong Limited had done, and considered that the Government should render support in this regard. Moreover, she was aware that some owners of private buildings did not know much about the risks of transmitters, and had thus allowed owners' corporations to hire out the rooftops of their buildings to the telecommunications providers for transmitter installation. She called for attention from the Government. In her opinion, even though it was still unknown whether there was any direct correlation between electromagnetic wave and cancer, the relevant media reports had a psychological impact on many people. Hence, she hoped that the Government could seek solutions to the problems from a technical perspective.

80. Mr MAN Yu-ming said that given the crowded environment in PRH units, many residents were concerned about the installation of transmitters. He enquired if there was any standards for transmitter installation in PRH estates; and if so, what the standards were. It was perfectly normal for the public to express concern about their health, so he hoped that the OFCA could provide more information for him to explain to the public.

81. Mr LAM Faat-kang urged the Government to seriously follow up on the worrisome matters for the general public and disseminate correct messages, so as to enhance public understanding and ease their worries. Besides, he opined that Hong Kong could follow the practice on the Mainland by placing transmitters as fake trees on the roadside or in the bushes. Due to concerns over transmitters, the housing estate where he lived had already prohibited the telecommunications providers from installing transmitters in its area. Although he did not have the relevant data available, he knew that the absence of transmitters would certainly cause inconvenience to the public. As members of the public were currently ill-informed, he hoped that the Government would conduct a study and provide the public with appropriate information.

82. The STE(SP)2 (Atg.) of the OFCA responded as follows:

- (1) to ensure the radiation safety of radio installations, the Communications Authority (CA) had adopted the non-ionising radiation (NIR) limits recommended in the "Guidelines for Limiting Exposure to Time-varying Electric, Magnetic, and Electromagnetic Fields" (the Guidelines) developed by the International Commission on Non-ionizing Radiation Protection (ICNIRP) as the radiation safety standards after seeking advice from the DH;
- (2) the Guidelines developed by the ICNIRP, an independent scientific commission, had been endorsed by the World Health Organization (WHO). The ICNIRP limits or similar requirements were also adopted by the United States, Canada, Germany, France, Australia and New Zealand, and economies with dense population such as Singapore, Japan and Korea;
- (3) a mobile phone operator would be allowed to use a base station only after it was licensed by the CA. In vetting the license application, apart from

examining the radiation level of the individual base station, the OFCA as the executive arm of the CA would also assess the total radiation level rather than just the number or antenna direction of base stations at the location. After assessment, if the OFCA considered that the application complied with the radiation safety standards, the mobile phone operator would then be granted approval for the use of the base station. Also, the operator concerned was required to provide the OFCA with a measurement report within one month from the commencement of operation of the base station to demonstrate the compliance of the radiation level with the safety standards;

- (4) according to the record of the OFCA, there were about 1 600 base stations in Tsuen Wan. However, as the OFCA's delineation of Tsuen Wan district was not entirely the same as constituency delineation, the actual figures might be different; and
- (5) members of the public might call the OFCA's hotline at 2961 6648 to arrange for on-site measurements if they were concerned about radiation safety at home.

83. The SM&HO(CL)1 of the DH responded as follows:

- (1) radiation could be classified into ionising radiation and NIR. Ionising radiation such as X-rays and nuclear radiation had a greater impact on the human body;
- (2) with lower energy, NIR was insufficient to change the chemical properties of substances and to cause harm by breaking chemical bonds in the human body. In addition, the strength of radiation decreased rapidly with distance from the source;
- (3) radiofrequency (RF) electromagnetic fields (EMF) generated by mobile phone technology were a type of NIR. Based on the information published by the International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) under the WHO in 2011, RF EMF was classified as "possibly carcinogenic to humans" (i.e. Group 2B). Thus far, there was no up-to-date data or sufficient study to show that NIR was carcinogenic to humans;
- (4) regarding exposure to RF EMF within the environment (including RF EMF generated by telecommunications base stations and transmitters), the IARC had indicated after examining the study results that there were no signs of increased risk of cancer in exposure to RF EMF within the environment for the time being;
- (5) as mentioned by the OFCA, the ICNIRP had formulated the Guidelines for human exposure of NIR, which had been endorsed by the WHO. The WHO considered that at present, there was insufficient evidence to suggest that human exposure to EMF below the exposure limits recommended in the Guidelines would cause any adverse health effects; and
- (6) the DH noted the concerns of the public and Members and would by no means continue to monitor the information provided by the WHO regarding the effects of RF EMF posed to human health. Relevant professional medical advice would also be timely provided to the OFCA.

84. Mr CHOW Ping-tim enquired what the response plans of the relevant departments were in case of future study breakthroughs classifying the electromagnetic wave generated by mobile phones as Group 2A. He stated that the relevant departments should take a precautionary approach in addressing his enquiry, albeit hypothetical in nature, to avoid

failure to give an account of any outbreak of incidents in the future. He considered the relevant departments too conservative and too defensive in responding to Members' enquiries without providing further constructive advice and information on the distribution of transmitters directing at buildings in Tsuen Wan district, rendering Members unable to monitor the level of protection or prevention adopted by the OFCA in relation to base station transmitters. Furthermore, he would like to know if the OFCA had reviewed the occurrence of a number of cancer cases in the same building, opining that the same incident might still occur even if residents received due medical care from doctors or a scientific study was conducted. He held that when Members were unable to respond to the public's request for an explanation, they could only submit an agenda item to the TWDC for discussion and convey the responses of departmental representatives to the public later. Moreover, he was dissatisfied with the responses given by the relevant departments.

85. The STE(SP)2 (Atg.) of the OFCA responded that in the past three years, the OFCA had conducted a total of 800 measurements for radiation level in residence at the request of Members or the general public, and had taken random inspections for more than 3 500 base stations on its own initiative. None of the base stations had been found to have exceeded the radiation standards.

86. The Chairman urged the relevant departments to explore the impact of electromagnetic wave on human health before problems arose, so that Members would have sufficient justifications to explain to the public in future. He also requested the departments to inform Members of the tests conducted in writing.

87. The Chairman said that since the OFCA and the DH would also respond to item 14, the TWDC would proceed with the discussion of item 14 first to optimise meeting time.

X Item 14: Request the Government to Address the Problem of Telecommunications Base Stations in the Vicinity of Sheung Chui Court As Soon As Possible
(TWDC Paper No. 143/16-17)

88. The Chairman stated that the Hon Ben CHAN submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving responses included:

- (1) Mr FUNG Chi-hung, Eric, STE(SP)2 (Atg.) of the OFCA;
- (2) Mr WONG Hon-kit, CM/M(WTT) of the HD; and
- (3) Dr LOH Lai-ting, Taron, SMHO(CL)1 of the DH.

Besides, the written replies from the OFCA and the DH were tabled at the meeting.

89. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben introduced the paper.

90. The STE(SP)2 (Atg.) of the OFCA responded that the OFCA had provided assistance as far as possible upon informed by the Member of prospective owners' concerns about the large number of telecommunications base stations in the vicinity of Sheung Chui Court. Having learnt that the HD could arrange for an on-site radiation measurement at Sheung Chui Court in mid-April, the OFCA hoped for early completion of such work to address the prospective owners' concerns about radiation.

91. The CM/M(WTT) of the HD responded that the Occupation Permit for Sheung Chui Court was expected to be issued soon. It was hoped that the OFCA could contact the HD after the meeting to arrange for an on-site radiation measurement next week.

92. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben thanked the HD for assisting the OFCA in arranging for an on-site radiation measurement. He believed that the base stations which were totally sheltered by Sheung Chui Court had lost their function and effect. Therefore, he hoped that the OFCA could contact the telecommunications providers concerned for removal or relocation of the base stations, regardless of the data collected after the on-site measurement. He continued that although the base stations were now useless, it took quite a long time for them to be relocated under the normal procedures, which raised concerns among the prospective residents. Hence, he urged the OFCA and the telecommunications providers to discuss the relocation arrangements for the base stations, and requested the telecommunications providers to move the base stations away as soon as possible. In addition, he enquired how many service operators were involved and whether the OFCA had liaised with such operators. If not, he hoped that the OFCA could contact the operators and invite them to conduct an on-site inspection.

93. The STE(SP)2 (Atg.) of the OFCA responded as follows:

- (1) The OFCA and the HD would arrange for an on-site radiation measurement as soon as possible;
- (2) The OFCA would convey the Member's concern to the operators and ask the operators to contact the Member directly;
- (3) The OFCA had not yet liaised with the operators; and
- (4) The OFCA would not request the operators concerned to relocate the base stations which complied with the radiation safety standards with approval granted.

(Note: Mr WONG Ka-wa left the meeting at 6:47 p.m.)

94. The Chairman asked the OFCA to directly request the operators to move the base stations away, in order not to waste time on further measurement or study.

95. Mr CHOW Ping-tim said that the question he had raised under item 8 was the same in nature as this item, but the Chairman had handled them differently. If the Chairman asked the OFCA to directly request the operators to move the base stations in the vicinity of Sheung Chui Court away, he urged the Chairman to ask the OFCA to directly request the operators to move the base stations on the rooftop of Riviera Plaza away as well.

96. The Chairman asked the OFCA to directly request the operators to relocate the base stations on the rooftop of Riviera Plaza as well.

97. The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben stated that he had requested the base stations in the vicinity of Sheung Chui Court be relocated not only on the grounds of radiation safety concerns, but because they had lost their function after being sheltered by Sheung Chui Court, which was different in nature from the question under item 8. Nevertheless, he considered that the Chairman had handled the two items properly, and hoped that the OFCA and the HD would address the base station problems in an appropriate manner, by, inter alia, requesting the operators to contact the Members concerned, in order to come up with solutions to the problems.

98. Mr CHOW Ping-tim pointed out that every resident considered base stations nearby as dangerous and hence wished for their relocation. He learnt from literature that telecommunications base stations served to maintain uninterrupted mobile phone

communication within their coverage, and they would lose their function only after discontinuation of use.

99. The Chairman asked the OFCA and the HD to contact the Members concerned to work out solutions jointly.

XI Item 9: Management of the Parking Spaces in the Government Multi-storey Carpark on Sai Lau Kok Road
(TWDC Paper No. 138/16-17)

100. The Chairman stated that Mr LAM Faat-kang submitted the paper. The representative of the TD responsible for giving response was Mr WONG Wai-lim, William, Senior Transport Officer/Transport Facilities Management (SRO/TFM).

101. Mr LAM Faat-kang introduced the paper.

102. The SRO/TFM of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) there were a total of 545 parking spaces for private cars, vans and taxis, as well as 34 parking spaces for motor cycles in the Tsuen Wan Government Multi-storey Carpark on Sai Lau Kok Road (the Carpark). At present, 470 parking spaces for private cars/vans, 30 parking spaces for motor cycles and 40 parking spaces for taxis were available for monthly parking, accounting for about 93% of the total number of parking spaces;
- (2) monthly parking tickets were sold starting from the morning on the 23rd of each month. Ticket buyers would normally wait at the shroff office in advance, and some would even start queueing in the evening before the sale;
- (3) the Carpark operator would deploy one or two additional staff on the day the monthly parking tickets were sold to maintain order;
- (4) on 23 February 2017, some ticket buyers had had disputes with the staff of the Carpark operator for leaving the queue for a long time after using objects to occupy their places. In response, the Carpark operator had explained the rules of monthly ticket purchase to every ticket buyer and had stated clearly that objects could not be used for occupying queue positions on the day of sale on 23 March 2017. The ticket buyers had queued orderly on that day, and no complaint had been received. Thus, the TD would maintain the existing practice of selling monthly parking tickets on a first-come-first-served basis;
- (5) the TD had been concerned about the sale of monthly parking tickets of the Carpark and whether residents had other special comments on the purchase of monthly parking tickets on a first-come-first-served basis. In this connection, the TD had conducted a survey by distributing a total of some 500 questionnaires to ticket buyers in the queue in May 2016. Among the questionnaires returned, over 60% of the respondents agreed with the purchase of monthly parking tickets on a first-come-first-served basis, only 1% of the respondents agreed with the sale of monthly parking tickets by balloting, while the rest had no comment or made suggestions such as the sale of monthly parking tickets online or on public holidays;
- (6) the sale of monthly tickets for parking spaces in most of the car parks managed by the TD was scheduled to commence at 7:30 a.m. on the 23rd of each month to make it easier for members of the public to get accustomed to the practice. Besides, the current mode of sale was accepted by most residents;

- (7) since the disputes on 23 February 2017, the TD had urged the Carpark operator to step up maintenance of queue order to improve the situation;
- (8) the TD understood that some ticket buyers had queued up in advance in the hope of getting monthly parking tickets at the earliest possible time. In fact, over 90% of the parking spaces in the Carpark had been reserved for monthly parking. As a small number of monthly parking tickets were still available after everyone in the queue had made their purchase, it might not be necessary for residents to arrive too early; and
- (9) the TD called for Members' understanding that it had already made every effort to reduce the inconvenience to the Carpark users.

103. The Vice Chairman said that as a regular user of the Carpark, he had to queue up for a monthly parking ticket as well. He found the management of the Carpark worthy of concern in that the current mode of monthly ticket sale had been in use for years. In response to the statement of the TD that there were still monthly parking tickets available after the last person in the queue had made the purchase, he pointed out that the sale of monthly parking tickets in recent months had been quite tight. Some people might have failed to get their monthly parking tickets even if they arrived at the shroff office at around 9 a.m. He requested the TD to look up the relevant statistics. Ticket buyers might queue up earlier and earlier for fear of failure to make their purchase. He continued that monthly parking tickets were sold starting from 7:30 a.m. Yet, he had waited for nearly two hours to buy a monthly parking ticket after arriving at the shroff office at 7:30 a.m. last month. In view of the possible inconvenience to residents who did not work in Tsuen Wan district, he suggested expediting the workflow of the ticket sale. At present, it took around four hours to sell over 400 monthly parking tickets. If an additional counter was operated, the selling time could be reduced and some ticket buyers could go to work after making the purchase without the need to start queueing up in the early morning. In addition, buyers of monthly parking tickets for private cars, taxis and motor cycles were required to wait in the same queue. He suggested separating the ticket buyers into different queues, so as to speed up the ticket sale, facilitate the maintenance of queue order and make the waiting ticket buyers feel more comfortable.

104. Mr LO Siu-kit indicated that another serious incident had occurred in the Carpark last year. While Members had discussed with the TD and the Carpark operator about the incident, it seemed that no follow-up action had been taken since then. During the disputes on 23 February 2017, he had also provided assistance on site and learnt that the Carpark operator had not pushed through the removal of occupying objects from the queue, but had done so only after putting up notices for a period of time to resolve the disputes eventually. He knew that many people waiting to buy monthly parking tickets had to start work at 9 a.m. However, the last person in the queue could only get the monthly parking ticket at around 10 a.m. upon commencement of sale at 7:30 a.m. He had requested the sale of monthly parking tickets be advanced to 6:30 a.m., but the Carpark operator could not cooperate due to shift change of its staff at 7 a.m. Therefore, he was in discussion with the Carpark operator to see if the start time could be advanced to 7 a.m. Moreover, in the absence of space for an additional counter besides the two existing ones, he suggested a one-day advancement or postponement of the sale of some 70 monthly parking tickets for motor cycles and taxis to shorten the queue. He opined that if the above two suggestions could be implemented concurrently, the last person in the queue would be able to make the purchase before 9 a.m. He noted that a number of ticket buyers had queued up early in order not to take a half day leave from work, but not for fear of failure to get their monthly parking tickets. He hoped

that the TD could implement the relevant measures, stating that according to the Carpark operator, it would implement his two suggestions subject to the consent of the TD to ensure a smoother ticket sale workflow.

(Note: The Hon TIEN Puk-sun, Michael left the meeting at 7:10 p.m.)

105. Mr. CHENG Chit-pun said that according to the survey conducted by the TD, most ticket buyers preferred queueing up at the shroff office for the purchase of monthly parking tickets to allocation by balloting. He pointed out that if the target respondents of the survey were those in the queue, the result would be biased and unrepresentative. He had learnt after enquiring with the TD that among the government car parks, Kennedy Town Car Park adopted a balloting system for selling its quarterly parking tickets. He enquired of the TD why only that car park adopted the balloting system while other car parks maintained the existing arrangement of on-site sale. Since the TD had stated that there were monthly parking tickets left even after everyone in the queue had made their purchase, which was not a sign of shortage but a sign of surplus, he did not understand why the parking tickets could not be sold by balloting.

106. Mr TAM Hoi-pong found the issue a thorny one after following up on it for a period of time. He had once suggested bi-monthly balloting for the sale of monthly parking tickets, which, however, was not preferred by the queueing buyers. After liaison with the TD, he suggested that it was not necessary for parking tickets of all government car parks in the territory to be sold on the 23rd of each month to facilitate their operators' manpower deployment. He said that two staff members responsible respectively for ticket sale and order maintenance were deployed in the shroff office of the Carpark. The sale process was fully manual without the use of computers. He opined that the provision of an additional counter with the deployment of additional staff could speed up the process. Furthermore, he concurred with a Member's suggestion of arranging for the sale of monthly parking tickets for taxis on another day, which was considered a feasible measure under the existing constraints.

107. Mr KOO Yeung-pong enquired if the TD had conducted any survey to find out whether the existing monthly parking ticket buyers made their purchase every month; if yes, he suggested the TD follow the practice of private residential estates by letting out parking spaces on a yearly basis and distributing questionnaires to users each year to collect their intention of rental renewal. He was not sure if this suggestion would involve any legislation, but he believed that it could resolve the current issue in Tsuen Wan, otherwise any mode of monthly ticket sale would be futile. As the practice of selling parking tickets on a first-come-first-served basis would definitely lead to vicious competition, he suggested leasing out the parking spaces annually at monthly rental payments starting from next year. He considered that comments of the Carpark users on the above suggestion could be gauged first. If the suggestion was implemented, ticket buyers would no longer need to arrive early to join the queue. He gave the example that the TWDC had once been accused of elder abuse after many people who had showed up early to queue for free event tickets distributed by it had been reminded not to use objects to occupy their places in the queue. He contended that the existing sale of monthly parking tickets might draw the same criticism. Therefore, he suggested a more rational way of selling monthly tickets such as by balloting instead of on a first-come-first-served basis. Moreover, he hoped the TD conduct a survey to see if the above suggestion was feasible first.

(Note: Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly left the meeting at 7:17 p.m.)

108. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris noted from the TD that there were monthly tickets left even after everyone in the queue had made their purchase. He remarked that ticket buyers had queued up in advance for fear that they could not get their monthly parking tickets and this indicated a shortage in supply. He pointed out that the TD could consider raising the parking fees or leasing out the parking spaces by tender to solve the relevant problem. In his view, the provision of parking spaces was not a social welfare. Car parks required constant maintenance and there was a persistent demand for more parking spaces, yet the TD had only focused on curbing the growth of private cars. He asked the TD to consider the direction he suggested for solving the problem.

109. The STO/TFM of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) Kennedy Town Car Park was the only car park under the management of the TD to sell quarterly parking tickets by balloting because some ticket buyers had shown up to queue for the parking tickets more than ten days before the sale day years ago. As a result, its parking tickets had subsequently been sold quarterly by balloting. Currently, its parking spaces were leased out on a quarterly rather than monthly basis and successful applicants were required to make a one-off prepayment of three months' rent;
- (2) due to the large amount of administrative work involved, balloting was only used by Kennedy Town Car Park for the sale of quarterly parking tickets;
- (3) the TD would consider Members' suggestions, including commencement of ticket sale in the early morning, separation of the queues for monthly parking tickets for taxis and motorcycles or rescheduling the ticket sale for taxis and motorcycles to another day;
- (4) some car parks under the management of the TD had already arranged for the sale of various monthly parking tickets on different days. The TD would study the situation of Tsuen Wan Car Park and consider the applicability of the practice;
- (5) according to statistics, it took about 30 seconds to complete the manual sale of a monthly parking ticket which merely involved validity verification of driving licence and collection of fee. The TD would study whether manpower could be increased to shorten the waiting time; and
- (6) the TD would proactively study ways of shortening the waiting time for the monthly tenants of Tsuen Wan Car Park and explore improvement measures with the operator. He called for understanding from the TWDC that time was needed for the TD to study the measures concerned.

110. Mr LAM Faat-kang welcomed the TD's undertaking to implement improvement measures, stating that separation of the queues for monthly parking tickets for private vehicles, taxis and motorcycles could indeed shorten the queueing time. He hoped the TD proactively consider the allocation of more resources to parking space rental such as the sale of monthly parking tickets through Octopus system to reduce the processing time. He continued that the disclosure by the TD that there were tickets left even after everyone in the queue had made their purchase would attract those with no intention of queueing for the tickets to join the queue, thereby pushing up the demand for parking spaces significantly. The shortage of parking spaces in Tsuen Wan district was a hard fact and that was the reason the TWDC had studied the feasibility of providing parking spaces at Sha Tsui Road Playground.

111. The Chairman asked the representative from the TD to discuss further with the relevant Members after the meeting.

XII Item 10: Request the Government to Study the Land Use of the Former Tsuen Wan Magistrates' Courts site in order to Meet the Needs of the Tsuen Wan Community
(TWDC Paper No. 139/16-17)

112. The Chairman stated that Mr KOO Yeung-pong and Mr KOT Siu-yuen submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving responses included:

- (1) Mr CHAU Yat-cheung, Lawrence, District Planning Officer/Tsuen Wan and West Kowloon (DPO/TW&West Kln) of the Planning Department (PlanD);
- (2) Mr KWONG Wang-ngai, Walter, Senior Town Planner/Tsuen Wan of the PlanD;
- (3) Mr WONG Kwok-chun, Alex, DSWO(TW/KwT) of the SWD;
- (4) Mr Alan LO Kam-lun, District Lands Officer/Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing) (DLO(DLO, TW&KwT)) of the LandsD; and
- (5) Mr TSE Hing-chit, Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing) of the LandsD.

Besides, the written replies from the LandsD and the PlanD were tabled at the meeting.

113. Mr KOO Yeung-pong introduced the paper.

114. Mr KOT Siu-yuen supplemented that the former Tsuen Wan Magistrates' Courts (TWM) located near the Tsuen Wan Town Hall (TWTH) was in a pretty good geographical location. Hence, he hoped that the site could be used for development of community and livelihood facilities which were in shortage in Tsuen Wan, in order to tie in with the future development of Tsuen Wan. He knew that the usage rates for the TWTH Auditorium and Cultural Activities Hall were nearly 100% and a number of youngsters or groups had nowhere to hold meetings or stage performances. He therefore enquired if complex facilities like Youth Square in Chai Wan could be built in Tsuen Wan, with a view to providing more ancillary facilities for future use by the rapidly growing local population.

115. The DPO/TW&West Kln of the PlanD responded as follows:

- (1) The former TWM Building site was currently zoned for "Government, Institution or Community" (GIC) use, and a four-storey building could be constructed thereon. The existing building height restriction would be reviewed if necessary;
- (2) The site was preliminarily reserved for development of social welfare facilities, and the TD was studying the parking spaces, loading/unloading areas and exit/entrance of the proposed building;
- (3) The PlanD understood Members' concerns about the population growth and development of community facilities in Tsuen Wan district. Members were encouraged to give further views on the former TWM Building site; and
- (4) Apart from the former TWM Building site, there were still other GIC sites available for development of community facilities in Tsuen Wan.

116. Mr CHOW Ping-tim said that the site where the historic former TWM Building was located was a precious GIC site in the urban area. One of the problems to be tackled included the implementation of underground development to provide more parking spaces. He hoped that some of the facilities to be developed at the site could complement with the

TWTH nearby, considering it a waste to construct a building of only four storeys there. In addition, he opined that the proposed building should not be considered from one direction, but should be developed into a multi-purpose complex. The site was really suitable for re-provisioning Yeung Uk Road Market if it was not subject to freight traffic restrictions. Moreover, he held that the Government should look at things from multiple perspectives, place the future building under the management of different departments and consider increasing the plot ratio of the site so that more storeys could be built.

117. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie supported the Government's land use study of the former TWM site in order to meet the needs of the Tsuen Wan community. She indicated that developments in Tsuen Wan town centre were becoming saturated, and that was why the feasibility of increasing the building height of podium garden and ground floor of Sai Lau Kok Garden had been studied earlier to increase the space available. The changeable sites in Tsuen Wan town centre were limited with roads and other planned developments in the surroundings all finalised. Hence, the TWDC should explore in greater depth to find out how the former TWM site could help solve the key problem of future district development. She continued that the problem of insufficient parking spaces in Tsuen Wan would aggravate upon completion of housing developments in Tsuen Wan West in the future. Since it generally took quite a long time for a development to proceed from planning to implementation, she called on the TWDC to discuss the matter actively as soon as possible, and to apply for funding from the Government to implement the solutions concerned.

118. Mr CHAN Sung-ip expressed support for high-rise development as well as underground car park development at the former TWM Building site. He stated that the Government could consider relocating low-rise buildings in the vicinity such as Lady Trench Polyclinic, Princess Alexandra Community Centre and the TWTH, so as to release more sites for high-rise developments.

119. Mr LAM Faat-kang supported the Government's land use study of the former TWM site in order to meet the needs of the Tsuen Wan community. He invited Members to express their views on the relevant site, a valuable land in Tsuen Wan town centre, at the Community Building, Planning and Development Committee (CBPDC) meetings for discussion.

120. Mr TAM Hoi-pong opined that the former TWM site was suitable for moderate underground development, and that even though Sha Tsui Road Playground would have to be temporarily closed for excavation works for a few years, the works would unlikely cause any impediment because the playground was not put to any use for the time being. He continued that before studying the number of storeys of the proposed building, the Government must conduct an air ventilation assessment from a scientific perspective. The plot ratio was also closely related to building height and width. Given that the housing developments underway along the Tsuen Wan waterfront, he saw the need to take into account the air ventilation impact of the proposed development on old buildings such as Fuk Loi Estate. He also hoped that the completed building would not be rectangular in shape, a design that blocked air ventilation the most.

121. Mr LO Siu-kit considered that the former TWM site was very precious and suitable for both high-rise and underground development. Thus, he was surprised with the PlanD's statement that the site would only be used for construction of a four-storey building. He further enquired if the proposal of using the building for social welfare purpose had been confirmed or was still open for discussion. In case of the former, he held that if the future

building was more than four storeys in height, then four storeys could be designated for social welfare purpose, while the rest could be allocated to different departments for management. He also urged the Government to consider whether part of the facilities in Princess Alexandra Community Centre could be relocated to the new building. As the availability of land for development in Tsuen Wan town centre was rare, he hoped that the Government could seriously consider the land use of the site and the height of the proposed building to optimise the use of the site.

122. The Vice Chairman saw it an excellent opportunity now to discuss the use of the former TWM site which was hard to come by when the existing building thereon was no longer used for its original purpose. He also suggested Members consider the proposal as a large-scale planning project at the initial stage. He continued that while the existing GIC zoning could be maintained, there was still room for discussion as to whether the proposed building should be four storeys in height only. Therefore, the Government should not exclude any possibility in the course of the planning study, but should take into consideration the facilities required by residents in Tsuen Wan district. In the absence of another site for use in Tsuen Wan town centre in the foreseeable future except the former TWM site, he called on the Government to engage the public in studying ways to develop the site. He believed that there should be more alternative options for consideration, even though the site was suitable for both social welfare use and parking use. In view of the lengthy time involved in the process from planning, building completion to occupation, he hoped that the TWDC of the current term could commence the process of discussion and planning to further promote the community development in Tsuen Wan.

123. The Chairman concluded that in developing the former TWM site, the traffic issues around the TWTH, Sha Tsui Road Playground and Tsuen Wan district as a whole could also be considered. He suggested underground development of shopping mall, market or parking facilities beneath the site and even the TWTH to promote the economic development of the district. The overall traffic condition of Tsuen Wan district would absolutely be affected if there was traffic congestion at the above location, rendering traffic problem the most pressing issue to be resolved. He also hoped the Government could consider increasing the number of floors of the new building to accommodate other livelihood facilities and community hall, as well as to concentrate various departmental offices in the same building. Besides, he suggested referring the agenda item to the CBPDC for further study.

(Note: The Hon CHAN Han-pan, Ben left the meeting at 7:42 p.m.)

124. As the Chairman was required to take up other urgent matters, the meeting would be temporarily chaired by the Vice Chairman.

XIII Item 11: Request the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department to Adopt Proactive Measures to Stop Monkeys from Causing Nuisance to the Residents of Tsuen Wan

(TWDC Paper No. 140/16-17)

125. The Acting Chairman stated that Mr MAN Yu-ming and Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones submitted the paper. The representatives from the AFCD responsible for giving responses included:

- (1) Mr CHEUNG Ka-shing, Senior Wetland and Fauna Conservation Officer (Acting); and

- (2) Mr SHEK Chung-tong, Wetland and Fauna Conservation Officer (Enforcement) (W&FCO(E)).

In addition, the written reply from the AFCD was tabled at the meeting.

126. Mr MAN Yu-ming introduced the paper.

127. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones said that the problem of monkey nuisance was relatively serious and monkeys usually appeared around Shing Mun Reservoir. Cheung Shan Estate, Lei Muk Shue Estate, Ho Fung College and Shing Mun Tunnels Bus Interchange were also frequented by monkeys. He continued that there had been cases where residents could only hide from monkeys appearing near their homes after notifying the AFCD because they did not know how to expel the monkeys and could only wait for the AFCD staff to handle the situation. He was worried that children might be hurt when they came into contact with monkeys. He pointed out that rubbish bins in housing estates contained more food waste which attracted monkeys. Upon removal of the rubbish bins, the number of monkeys frequenting the housing estates had been greatly reduced. He was aware that the AFCD was studying the use of new rubbish bins to prevent monkeys from searching for food therefrom. He hoped that the new rubbish bins could be used in Tsuen Wan district first, and that the AFCD could inform Members and the staff of the HD about the relevant information so that assistance could be provided accordingly to reduce the appearance of monkeys. Furthermore, he hoped that the AFCD could control the reproduction of monkeys at source, with a view to reducing the number of monkeys.

(Note: Mr CHOW Ping-tim left the meeting at 7:49 p.m.)

128. The W&FCO(E) of the AFCD responded as follows:

- (1) the AFCD had adopted various measures to handle monkey nuisance and preventive measures were the most effective;
- (2) having noted that many monkeys raided rubbish bins at Shing Mun Tunnels Bus Interchange and other locations, the AFCD had invited wildlife experts to assist in the design of new rubbish bins to prevent monkeys from searching for food therefrom;
- (3) a monkey contraceptive programme had been launched to control the population growth of monkeys for years. There was a significant decrease in the birth rate and number of monkeys after more than 80% of monkeys had been neutered. As the neutering process was still underway, monkeys would still be seen in country parks;
- (4) the AFCD attached great importance to public education and had liaised closely with Ho Fung College. Apart from capturing and repelling the monkeys creating nuisance, the department had also held briefings on management of monkeys causing nuisance and ways to repel them for school teachers and staff. Besides, the AFCD had also sent staff to brief the staff of the HD or management offices in the vicinity; and
- (5) the AFCD would consider to use the newly-designed wild monkey-proof rubbish bins in Tsuen Wan district first.

129. Mr LAM Faat-kang indicated that some monkeys had entered Lo Wai Village and Pak Tin Pa Tsuen to search for food. He was glad that the AFCD was studying the use of new rubbish bins and that the department would consider their priority use in Tsuen Wan district. He hoped that Members would be informed before the installation of new rubbish bins.

130. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said that it was indeed quite difficult for monkeys and local residents to co-exist peacefully. He emphasised equality between humans and animals, remarking that monkeys approached residential areas simply for food. Hence, he found the AFCD's effort in designing new rubbish bins to be desirable. He continued that apart from human food, monkeys also fed on fruits. The fact that they did not remain in Shing Mun Reservoir but went to unfamiliar places for food might be a sign of ecological degradation of Shing Mun Reservoir. Therefore, he enquired if the AFCD would study planting fruit trees that monkeys preferred at selected locations to attract monkeys to return to the wilderness for food as a fundamental solution.

131. Mr CHAN Sung-ip said that according to the AFCD, it was not advised to attack monkeys with batons. He hoped the department could brief residents on the correct ways to drive away monkeys.

132. The Acting Chairman hoped that the AFCD could provide Members with simple ways to drive away monkeys. Moreover, he enquired of the general time required for the department's special action team dedicated for handling monkey nuisance to arrive at the scene after receiving a call for assistance.

133. The W&FCO(E) of the AFCD responded as follows:

- (1) the AFCD would brief the management office concerned and residents on the correct ways to drive away monkeys at the scene upon receipt of report. Booklets on prevention of monkey nuisance were also available. If Members were concerned that residents of the housing estates affected had insufficient understanding of the situation, the department could send staff to provide briefings;
- (2) the AFCD had two teams dedicated for handling monkey nuisance. Barring other commitments, the team members could normally arrive at the scene in 45 minutes upon receipt of report; and
- (3) there were a number of ways to drive away monkeys, the more common one being laser pointers. Another method was making noise by banging nearby metals or objects with hard objects. Nevertheless, animals should be cared for and it was not advised to attack monkeys with batons.

134. The Acting Chairman thanked the representatives of the AFCD for attending the meeting and hoped that the department would keep in contact with Members of the constituencies frequented by monkeys to lower their nuisance and danger to humans, so as to ensure peaceful co-existence between humans and animals.

XIV Item 15: How the Government Responds to the Speculations on the Land Lot and Residential Properties as well as the Loopholes of Special Stamp Duty for Residential Properties
(TWDC Paper No. 144/16-17)

135. The Acting Chairman stated that Mr TAM Hoi-pong submitted the paper. Moreover, the Acting Chairman pointed out that according to the Inland Revenue Department (IRD), the LegCo was considering the Inland Revenue (Amendment) Bill 2017 which would subject residential property transactions to a new ad valorem stamp duty (AVD) rate. On the other hand, the Financial Services and Treasury Bureau (FSTB) had stated that since special stamp duty for residential properties was under the purview of the THB, it would not send any representative to the meeting. Furthermore, the Financial Secretary's Office (FS's Office),

the Development Bureau (DEVB) and the THB did not send representatives to the meeting, but the relevant written replies were tabled at the meeting.

136. Mr TAM Hoi-pong was discontent that the relevant bureaux and departments did not send representatives to the meeting to discuss whether the public could afford suitable housing. He stated that the new residential developments completed recently in Tsuen Wan were too expensive and hence unaffordable to the general public. Therefore, he regarded this agenda item highly relevant to Tsuen Wan district. Before he was elected as a TWDC Member, the public had successfully lobbied for a lower building density, which had however pushed up the prices of new residential flats. He indicated that residential developments had often been implemented at the expense of green belts, open spaces and even good local air ventilation without serving the best public interest eventually. He continued that the exemption from AVD was originally available to first-time buyers for acquisition of a residential property only, but some property buyers had been exempted from AVD for acquisition of more than one residential property under one single instrument. He believed that the additional properties must have been bought for speculation. Furthermore, he was of the opinion that remedies should be made to plug the loophole in the relevant ordinance that buyers could still be exempted from AVD for acquisition of further residential property after buying their first properties.

137. The Acting Chairman said that as the relevant bureaux and departments did not send representatives to the meeting, the Secretariat would put the Member's views on record and convey them to the relevant bureaux and departments.

(Post-meeting note: The Secretariat wrote to the FS's Office, the DEVB, the FSTB, the IRD and the THB on 8 May 2017 to convey the Member's views.)

XV Item 16: Crime Brief for Tsuen Wan District – Comparison of Crime Statistics between January to February 2017 and January to February 2016
(TWDC Paper No. 145/16-17)

138. The DC(TW) of the HKPF reported the situation of the crimes in Tsuen Wan district.

139. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris said that illegal parking had been a persistent problem around Sham Tseng and Tsing Lung Tau. He pointed out that despite the slight improvement during the Police's territory-wide operation to combat illegal parking last year, the problem had remained serious after the operation. Thus, he would like to know more about the enforcement effort in this area and enquired if the Police could provide the relevant statistics for reference.

140. Mr CHAN Chun-chung, Jones was pleased that the four cases of illegal gambling activities at Shek Wai Kok reported in January this year had all been detected and he thanked the Police for their work.

141. The DC(TW) of the HKPF responded as follows:

- (1) the Police had issued 207 fixed penalty notices against parking contraventions (Pol. 525) and six fixed penalty tickets against moving offences (Pol. 570) around Sham Tseng and Tsing Lung Tau in January 2017, 140 notices and six tickets in February 2017 as well as 217 notices and three tickets in March 2017 (as at 24 March 2017) respectively;

- (2) the Police had conducted a total of 117 traffic control operations around Sham Tseng and Tsing Lung Tau by using laser guns, setting up road blocks, deploying police vehicles and stepping up traffic police patrol; and
- (3) the HKPF would keep up their efforts in addressing the difficult-to-solve traffic problems in Tsuen Wan district.

142. The Acting Chairman said that the HKPF had stated in the Tsuen Wan District Annual Policing Plan this year that the strategic action plans for Tsuen Wan would include strengthening enforcement against illegal parking and obstruction of traffic. He also noted that the Police had deployed officers for such purpose at night in the past month. He expressed his support and called on the HKPF to continue enhancing their efforts.

XVI Item 17: Crime Brief for Ma Wan – January to February 2017
(TWDC Paper No. 146/16-17)

143. The DC(TW) of the HKPF reported the suitation of the crimes in Ma Wan.

144. Mr CHAN Sung-ip was satisfied with the report.

145. The Chairman resumed the chair.

XVII Item 18: Proposal for Tsuen Wan District Council Funds Allocation in 2017/18
(TWDC Paper No. 147/16-17)

146. The Secretary introduced the paper.

147. The Chairman asked Members whether they endorsed the proposed funds allocation and its administrative arrangements.

148. Members unanimously endorsed the proposed funds allocation and its administrative arrangements.

XIII Item 19: Application for Funds by Environmental and Health Affairs Committee for District Minor Works under Minor Environmental Improvement Project
(TWDC Paper No. 148/16-17)

149. The Secretary introduced the paper.

150. The Chairman asked Members whether they endorsed the funding application submitted by the Environmental and Health Affairs Committee (EHAC) for implementation of district minor works under the Minor Environmental Improvement Project.

151. All except one Member endorsed the funding application submitted by the EHAC for implementation of district minor works under the Minor Environmental Improvement Project.

XIX Item 20: Application for District Council Funds for Organising Activities by Tsuen Wan Festival Lightings Organising Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 149/16-17)

152. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that Mr LO Siu-kit and Mr CHOW Ping-tim were the Vice Chairman and Member of the Tsuen Wan Festival Lightings Organising Committee (TWFLOC) respectively for declaration of interest for their membership of TWFLOC.

153. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. Mr KOO Yeung-pong made declaration of his appointment as the Vice President of the TWFLC.

154. The Chairman decided that Members who had declared interests might not speak and vote but they might remain in the meeting as observers, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

155. Mr TAM Hoi-pong indicated that he would vote against the funds applications under the two agenda items due to his own political beliefs and the conviction that the reunification of Hong Kong with China was not a cause for celebration.

156. All except one Member endorsed the following funding application:

<u>Name of activity</u>	<u>Allocated funds</u>
	(<u>\$</u>)
(1) Tsuen Wan District Lighting Decoration to celebrate the 20 th Anniversary of the Establishment of the HKSAR	600,000.00

XX Item 21: Application for District Council Funds by Tsuen Wan Committee for Celebration of Reunification of Hong Kong with China
(TWDC Paper No. 150/16-17)

157. The Secretary introduced the paper.

158. The Chairman said that he was the President of the Tsuen Wan Committee for Celebration of Reunification of Hong Kong with China (TWCCR) with no individual monetary gain. Besides, the Vice Chairman and Mr CHAN Sung-ip made declaration of their Deputy Chairmanship of the TWCCR.

159. As the Chairman and the Vice Chairman had declared interests, Members unanimously agreed that the chairmanship of the meeting be temporarily taken over by Mr MAN Yu-ming as the temporary Chairman in accordance with Order 48(13) of the Standing Orders.

160. The temporary Chairman decided that the Members who were also members of the TWCCR might not speak and vote but they might remain in the meeting as observers, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

161. The temporary Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. Mr KOO Yeung-pong made declaration of his Vice Chairmanship of the Federation of Tsuen Wan District Sports and Recreation Association (FSRA) and Mr LAM Faat-kang made declaration of his membership of the FSRA, while Mr LO Siu-kit made declaration of his membership of the Tsuen Wan Football Association.

162. The temporary Chairman decided that the Members who had declared interest might not speak and vote but they might remain in the meeting as observers, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

163. After voting, Members endorsed the following funds application with five votes for it, one vote against it and zero abstention:

<u>Name of activity</u>	<u>Allocated funds</u> (\$)
(1) Celebration of the 20 th Anniversary of the Reunification of Hong Kong with China in Tsuen Wan	451,200.00

164. The Chairman resumed the chair.

XXI Item 22: Application for District Council Funds for Organising Activities by the Federation of Tsuen Wan District Sports and Recreation Association
(TWDC Paper No. 151/16-17)

165. The Secretary introduced the paper and stated that Mr KOO Yeung-pong was the Vice Chairman of the FSRA as well as Mr LAM Faat-kang and Mr CHOW Ping-tim was the committee members of the FSRA for declaration of interest of their membership of the FSRA.

166. The Chairman asked Members to make declaration of other interest. Mr CHAN Sung-ip made declaration of his appointment as the Deputy Chairman of the Tsuen Wan District Dragon Boat Race Organising Committee (DBROC).

167. The Chairman decide that the Members who had declared interest might not speak and vote but they might remain in the meeting as observers, according to section 48(11) of the Standing Orders.

168. Members unanimously endorsed the following funding application:

<u>Name of activity</u>	<u>Applicant organiser/ co-organiser</u>	<u>Allocated funds</u> (\$)
(1) International Dragon Boat Race cum Carnival in Celebration of the 20 th Anniversary of the Establishment of the HKSAR	DBROC	250,000.00

XXII Item 23: Information Papers

169. Members noted the contents of the following information papers:

- (1) Report of District Facilities Management Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 152/16-17);
- (2) Report of Culture, Recreation and Sports Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 153/16-17);
- (3) Report of Traffic and Transport Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 154/16-17);
- (4) Report of Community Building, Planning and Development Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 155/16-17);
- (5) Report of Social Services and Community Information Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 156/16-17);
- (6) Report of Coastal Affairs Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 157/16-17);

- (7) Report of Environmental and Health Affairs Committee (TWDC Paper No. 158/16-17);
- (8) Report of Tsuen Wan District Management Committee (TWDC Paper No. 159/16-17); and
- (9) Financial Summary of the Tsuen Wan District Council Funds for 2016/17 (TWDC Paper No. 160/16-17).

(Post-meeting note: The Financial Summary of the Tsuen Wan District Council Funds for 2016/17 had been revised. Please refer to Annex 1 for details.)

170. Mr KOT Siu-yuen thanked Members for attending the Tsuen Wan District Delegation Pledging Ceremony for the Hong Kong Games held on 5 March 2017. He also hoped Members could attend the 6th Hong Kong Games Opening Ceremony to be held at the Hong Kong Coliseum at 3:30 p.m. on 23 April 2017.

171. Ms LAM, Lam Nixie said that the Coastal Affairs Committee had implemented two projects this year. Firstly, the Tsuen Wan Promenade Placemaking Project had been launched in collaboration with a local organisation to study improvement initiatives for coastal facilities. Secondly, the Brief on Tsuen Wan Waterfront Event Space providing a list of locations along the Tsuen Wan Promenade suitable for organising various activities with descriptions and recommendations had been published for distribution to over 100 event organisers in Hong Kong. She hope that more quality activities would be held along the Tsuen Wan Promenade.

(Note: Mr LO Siu-kit left the meeting at 8:28 p.m.)

XXIII Item 24: Any Other Business

172. The Chairman reported that the TWDC had received a letter from the Hong Kong Council on Smoking and Health (COSH) applying for the display of the TWDC logo on the publicity materials of the 8th “Quit to Win” Smoke-free Community Campaign to show the TWDC’s support for a smoke-free Hong Kong. Since the COSH was a government-sponsored statutory body, he suggested that Members endorse the application.

173. Members unanimously agreed the application for the use of the TWDC logo by the COSH.

174. The Chairman reported that the TWDC had received a letter from the Labour and Welfare Bureau (LWB) on implementation of the Public Education Activities on Rehabilitation in 2017-18. To encourage the organisation of more large-scale publicity activities to promote the spirit of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD) at the district level, in addition to the proposed allocation of \$53,000 for each DC, the Sub-committee on Public Education on Rehabilitation under the LWB proposed an additional allocation of \$200,000 in total for a maximum of four DCs subject to a cap of \$50,000 for each selected DC. In other words, the selected DCs could receive a total allocation of up to \$103,000 to organise large-scale local publicity activities promoting the spirit of the UNCRPD. He suggested authorising the Working Group on Age-friendly Community and Rehabilitation (WGACR) under the Social Services and Community Information Committee to coordinate and implement the relevant activities.

175. Members unanimously agreed the TWDC's support for the project and the authorisation of the WGACR to follow up on the matter.

176. The Chairman reported that the TWDC had received a letter from the Hong Kong Tourism Board ("HKTB") inviting 18 DCs to participate in the 2017 Hong Kong Dragon Boat Carnival – HKSAR 20th Anniversary Trophy race to be held on 4 June 2017 (Sunday). The 2017 Hong Kong Dragon Boat Carnival, organised by the HKTB and co-organised by the Hong Kong China Dragon Boat Association, would be held at Victoria Harbour and along the Central Harbourfront between 2 and 4 June 2017. The carnival would feature the Hong Kong International Dragon Boat Races, the BeerFest, the Food Trucks Gala and a special race in celebration of the 20th anniversary of the establishment of the HKSAR – the HKSAR 20th Anniversary Trophy race. As the FSRA had already formed the DBROC to organise the dragon boat races to be held in Tsuen Wan district, he suggested the FSRA assist in following up on the arrangement of the Tsuen Wan delegation team to participate in the 2017 Hong Kong Dragon Boat Carnival – HKSAR 20th Anniversary Trophy race.

177. Members unanimously agreed the relevant arrangements.

178. The Chairman reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 23 May 2017 and the deadline for submission of paper was 8 May 2017.

XXIV Adjournment of Meeting

179. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:35 p.m.

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat
April 2017