

(Translation)

Minutes of the 17th Meeting of Traffic and Transport Committee (1/2023)

Date: 17 April 2023

Time: 2:30 p.m.

Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Mr CHAN Sung-ip, BBS, MH (Chairman)

Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH

Mr YAU Kam-ping, BBS, MH

Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio

Mr WONG Ka-wa

Mr KOT Siu-yuen, MH

Government Representatives

Mr LEE Soeng-him, Sean

Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan),
Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr CHEUNG Lap-hong

District Operations Officer (Tsuen Wan) (Acting),
Hong Kong Police Force

Mr KWAN Lam

Assistant District Operations Officer (Tsuen Wan),
Hong Kong Police Force

Mr LAM Chi-chung

Officer-in-Charge, District Traffic Team (Tsuen Wan),
Hong Kong Police Force

Miss CHENG Wing-yin

Senior Transport Officer/Tsuen Wan,
Transport Department

Mr CHAN Yee-hing, Paul

Engineer/Tsuen Wan 1, Transport Department

Mr LEE Huen-yiu

District Engineer/Tsuen Wan,
Highways Department

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat Representatives

Ms LEUNG Tsz-wai, Apple

Senior Executive Officer (District Council)
(Acting), Tsuen Wan District Office

Miss MAK Wing-yan, Wendy

Executive Officer (District Council) 3,
Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr NG Cheuk-pong, James
(Secretary)

Executive Officer (District Council) 4,
Tsuen Wan District Office

In attendance:

Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly

Chairman, Tsuen Wan District Council

Attendance by Invitation:

For discussion of item 3

Ms KWAN Kwok-yan, Vivian

Chief Transport Officer/Bus/New Territories 2,
Transport Department

Ms WONG Ka-ye, Chloe

Transport Officer/Bus/New Territories South
West, Transport Department

Mr Stephen WAN

Manager (Operations), Kowloon Motor Bus
Company (1933) Limited

Ms CHENG Wai-ting

Assistant Manager (Operations), Kowloon
Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited

Mr CHOW Lai-hei

Assistant Manager (Public Affairs), Kowloon
Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited

Mr Luka LAI

Senior Operations Support Officer, Kowloon
Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited

Mr CHAN Ho-fung, Clarence

Operations Manager (Kowloon and New
Territories), Citybus Limited

Mr YIP Wai-yeung

Planning Officer, Citybus Limited

Miss KWOK Chi-ching

Corporate Communications Officer,
Citybus Limited

For discussion of item 6

Mr CHEUNG Kai-cheung, Henry

Senior Engineer 2/Tsuen Wan Road,
Highways Department

Ms LIN Kit-mei, Flora

Senior Environmental Protection Officer
(Acting), Environmental Protection Department

Absent:

Mr LAU Cheuk-yu

The Meeting

I Opening Remarks and Introduction

The Chairman welcomed Members and representatives from the government departments to the 17th meeting of the Traffic and Transport Committee (T&TC), and introduced:

- (1) Mr CHEUNG Lap-hong, District Operations Officer (Tsuen Wan) (Acting) (DOO(TW)(Atg)), Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF), who attended this meeting on behalf of Mr CHOW Ching-chi, Alfred.

2. The Chairman stated that according to section 28 of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders, unless otherwise specified, Members who submitted a paper might have up to 1.5 minutes to introduce the paper and 1 minute to make supplementary remarks for each agenda item. Other Members might speak once for up to 1.5 minutes. A maximum of four Members could speak for each agenda item. If more than four Members spoke on an agenda item, he would shorten the speaking time of each Member. The representatives of the departments might have up to 3 minutes to give response.

II Item 1: Confirmation of Minutes of the 16th Meeting held on 20.2.2023

3. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had received two proposed amendments from Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio prior to this meeting. The proposed amendments were set out as follows:

- (1) Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio proposed that paragraph 8(1) of the captioned minutes should be amended as “鑑於有關工程頗具規模及十分重要，故此應該有充分的諮詢及討論，並希望政府盡快開展工程，特別是隔音罩的興建，這是環宇海灣居民渴望已久的環節。他認為在荃灣公園範圍的擬建高架行車道在惡劣天氣情況下未必能夠有效為途人遮風擋雨，故之前曾多次要求部門興建連接環宇海灣及荃灣西站的行人天橋，他仍然堅持此項要求，亦不反對以新橋面下“預仔橋”形式興建，並進一步建議，荃灣路工程組別可以連繫該署的行人天橋 E 組別負責人員，商討如何連結這條建議的預仔橋和行人天橋 E，例如接駁位水平的配合”(given that the project was of fairly large scale and immense importance, there should be extensive consultation and discussion. He hoped that the Government would expeditiously commence the works concerned, especially the construction of noise enclosures, which was an item the residents of City Point had been longing for. He opined that the proposed elevated carriageway within the area of Tsuen Wan Park might not be effective in serving as a shelter from the rain and wind for pedestrians during adverse weather, and had therefore made repeated requests to the department for the construction of a footbridge connecting City Point and Tsuen Wan West Station. He continued to insist on such request and did not object to the construction of the abovementioned footbridge under the new flyover as an

associated footbridge. He further suggested that the section responsible for the Tsuen Wan Road project might liaise with the HyD officer(s) who was in charge of the construction of Footbridge E to explore ways to properly link the proposed associated footbridge of the flyover with Footbridge E, for instance, ensuring a leveled connection point of the two footbridges through coordination); and

- (2) Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio proposed that in line 2 of paragraph 10(2) of the captioned minutes, “訪問” (interviews) should be amended as “民意調查” (a survey).

4. The Chairman asked whether Members endorsed the captioned minutes and the proposed amendments. Members unanimously endorsed the captioned minutes and the proposed amendments.

III Item 2: Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

5. The Chairman said that there were no matters arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

IV Item 3: Bus Route Planning Programme 2023-2024 for Tsuen Wan District (T&TC Paper No. 1/2023)

6. The Chairman stated that the Transport Department (TD) submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments and bus companies responsible for giving responses were:

- (1) Ms KWAN Kwok-yan, Vivian, Chief Transport Officer/Bus/New Territories 2 (CTO/B/NT2), TD;
- (2) Ms WONG Ka-yee, Chloe, Transport Officer/Bus/New Territories South West, TD;
- (3) Mr Stephen WAN, Manager (Operations), Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited (KMB);
- (4) Ms CHENG Wai-ting, Assistant Manager (Operations), KMB;
- (5) Mr CHOW Lai-hei, Assistant Manager (Public Affairs), KMB;
- (6) Mr Luka LAI, Senior Operations Support Officer (SOSO), KMB;
- (7) Mr CHAN Ho-fung, Clarence, Operations Manager (Kowloon and New Territories) (OM(K&NT)), Citybus Limited (Citybus);
- (8) Mr YIP Wai-yeung, Planning Officer, Citybus; and
- (9) Miss KWOK Chi-ching, Corporate Communications Officer, Citybus.

7. CTO/B/NT2 of the TD introduced the paper.

8. The views and enquiries of Members were summarised as follows:

- (1) he enquired of the KMB whether it had conducted a trial run for the proposed re-routing of route no. 30X bound for Allway Gardens via Texaco Road, Ma Tau Pa Road and Yeung Uk Road. He hoped that the routing of route no. 30X would follow that of the afternoon departures of route no. 930A, i.e. buses would make a left turn at Tsuen Tsing Interchange to go into Yeung Uk Road via Texaco Road, so as to avoid the overlapping of routing of route nos. 30X and 238X after the adjustment. He also enquired whether the re-routing of route no. 30X could be implemented throughout the day, and whether the first departure of route no. 234X bound for Bayview Garden could be advanced to 6:30 a.m., with a view to meeting the current demand of passengers of route no. 30X who alighted at the en-route stop on Tai Chung Road for heading to work in the area of Chai Wan Kok Street in the morning peak hours (Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio);
- (2) pointing out that the utilisation rate of the Hong Kong International Airport (HKIA) had recovered to about 60 to 70 percent of the pre-pandemic level, he requested to implement the re-routing of airbus routes proposed in the Bus Route Planning Programme (BRPP) 2020-2021 for Tsuen Wan District as soon as possible to facilitate the commuting of residents and complement the recruitment exercises of the HKIA. Given that route no. 230X had all along been popular with passengers (especially commuters) because of its rather direct routing, he hoped that the bus company concerned would provide an additional departure for route no. 230X bound for Tsim Sha Tsui in the morning. He also requested that the bus fares of bus routes travelling from areas around Lei Muk Shue and Wo Yi Hop Road to Tsuen Wan to be adjusted based on the fares of route nos. 36 and 43X, avoiding the problem of discrepancy in bus fares for different routes with the same destination (Mr WONG Ka-wa); and
- (3) according to the TD's consultation paper, route no. A30 was expected to commence operation in the second quarter of 2023, providing bus service plying between Lei Muk Shue and the HKIA. He therefore hoped that the bus company would provide the bus schedule of the route concerned. As to route no. 36 series, some passengers complained that the bus models deployed for route no. 36B were too old, and the service frequency of route nos. 36, 36A, 36B and 36M could not meet the demand. Citing route no. 36 as an example, he said that buses of this route departing in the afternoon peak hours were often full when they arrived at the en-route stop at Lady Trench Polyclinic, therefore he hoped that additional departures would be provided during the period between 5:00 p.m. and 8:00 p.m. Besides, he relayed the request of villagers in the area of Kwok Shui Road that they hoped the bus companies or green minibus (GMB) operators would provide public transport services plying

between Kwai Fong and Tsuen Wan via Kwok Shui Road (Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly).

9. CTO/B/NT2 of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) the TD had earlier conducted a consultation on the proposed relocation of the terminus of route no. A30 and no objections had been received. The TD understood that there would be an increased demand from the public for travelling to the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge (HKZMB) and the HKIA after the full resumption of normal travel between Hong Kong and the Mainland, therefore the bus company had been requested to introduce the routes concerned promptly, and it would later provide the details of the bus schedule to be implemented;
- (2) at the time of formulating the BRPP, the TD had taken into consideration the views raised by Members and the public (including those raised at online discussion forums), including the public concern over the overlapped routing of route nos. 30X and 238X at Texaco Road. The TD would continue to discuss with the bus company concerned on the routing arrangement and consult the related District Councils when necessary. As many passengers taking route no. 30X would alight at the en-route stops in the area of Chai Wan Kok in the morning peak hours, the TD hoped to retain the relevant bus trips to reduce the impact on existing passengers and commuters. The TD would also discuss with the bus company concerned on the feasibility of advancing the first departure of route no. 234X bound for Tsuen Wan; and
- (3) as regards the service frequency of route no. 36 in the afternoon peak hours not meeting the demand, the TD would conduct a site investigation with the bus company concerned and determine if its service frequency needed to be enhanced based on the patronage and related indicators.

10. SOSO of the KMB responded as follows:

- (1) the KMB noted the various suggestions raised by Members (including the proposed re-routing of bus route no. 30X by making a left turn at Tsuen Tsing Interchange to go into Yeung Uk Road via Texaco Road, advancement of the first departure of route no. 234X, as well as service enhancement of route no. 230X bound for Tsim Sha Tsui with an additional departure in the morning), and would continue to explore the feasibility of these proposals with the TD;
- (2) some passengers would take route no. 30X at Whampoa Garden and Hung Hom for travelling to work in Chai Wan Kok. Since the service of route no. 234X did not cover this area, the KMB proposed to maintain the existing routing of departures of route no. 30X before 9:00 a.m.; and

- (3) according to the statistics on patronage, the existing services of route no. 36 series were adequate to meet passenger demand. The KMB would closely monitor the changes in patronage and whether individual bus trips were often full, with a view to reviewing the need to implement service frequency adjustment or enhancement.

11. Assistant Manager (Public Affairs) of the KMB responded that owing to the subsiding epidemic situation as well as the resumption of normal social and economic activities, there was an increased public demand for travelling to the HKZMB and the HKIA. The KMB was at present accelerating the recruitment of manpower and deployment of resources for expeditious introduction of route no. A30.

12. The views and enquiries of Members were summarised as follows:

- (1) given that the proposed re-routing of Citybus route no. 930 required buses, after arriving at Arsenal Street and the flyover, to cut across three lanes for reaching the new en-route stop at Immigration Tower and then cut across those three lanes again for heading towards Causeway Bay, he enquired whether Citybus had conducted a trial run of the arrangement and calculated the reduced journey time. Regarding the proposed re-routing of route no. 30X that buses would make a left turn at Tsuen Tsing Interchange to go into Yeung Uk Road via Texaco Road, he understood that traffic congestion often occurred at the location concerned. However, he believed that the problem could be tackled through conducting a research on the demand and supply of parking spaces in Tsuen Wan district by the TD and strengthening the combat against illegal parking by the HKPF. Furthermore, he expressed disappointment with the BRPP for not covering route nos. A31, 42M and 243M. Since there were no direct bus services plying between Air Cargo Area in the airport and Tsuen Wan or Tsing Yi at present, residents had to interchange between transport modes or routes before reaching their destination. In addition, owing to the relatively low service frequency of route no. A31, buses of this route were often full when they arrived at the en-route stops at Nina Hotel Tsuen Wan West and Panda Hotel. With the fact that passenger baggage had taken up much space in the bus compartment, passengers often found it difficult to board the bus and had to remain standing during the bus journey. Therefore, it was necessary to increase service frequency for this route. After route no. 43B had been re-routed to no longer travel via Luen Yan Street and Yeung Uk Road, passengers mainly relied on route nos. 42M and 243M for travelling between Tsuen Wan and Tsing Yi, resulting in long queues of passenger awaiting buses of these two routes. He opined that the time slots selected by the TD and the bus company for examining the patronage of routes failed to reflect the actual passenger demand during the peak hours. Lastly, he requested to cancel the

arrangement of route no. 930X routing via Nina Tower in the morning peak hours, enhance the service frequency of route no. 930X and upgrade route no. 933 to whole-day service (Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio);

- (2) he pointed out that the sectional fare of route no. 43X from Shing Mun Tunnel to Tsuen Wan West Station had been successfully reduced to a level comparable to that of route no. 36 thanks to the persistent effort made by Members, yet the bus fares of many routes bound for Tsuen Wan via Lei Muk Shue and Wo Yi Hop Road remained high at present. As a result, many residents of Lei Muk Shue would rather wait for route no. 36 than take other routes, leading to a mismatch of resources. He urged the TD and the bus company to address the problem squarely (Mr WONG Ka-wa); and
- (3) he hoped that the bus company would introduce route no. A30 in the second quarter as scheduled and provide an en-route stop in Lei Muk Shue for overnight airbus routes. Regarding the occupancy rate of route no. 36 series, he asked the bus company to examine the patronage during periods with relatively high patronage as specified by Members. In addition, he requested the TD once again to consider the suggestion of providing public transport services plying between Kwai Fong and Tsuen Wan via Kwok Shui Road by bus companies or GMB operators (Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly).

13. SOSO of the KMB responded that route no. 32M was already providing bus services from Kwok Shui Road to Kwai Fong. The KMB would study the feasibility of introducing new routes and making downward adjustment to sectional fares, and was willing to examine the patronage with Members at specified time.

14. OM(K&NT) of the Citybus responded that the journey time of route no. 930 bound for Wan Chai had long been affected by the congested traffic on Gloucester Road where vehicles would turn into Cross Harbour Tunnel. The Citybus therefore suggested that the routing of route no. 930 might draw reference from the existing routing of route nos. 70 and 307, in which buses would reach the en-route stop at Immigration Tower via Arsenal Street and the flyover and head for Causeway Bay afterwards. It was anticipated that the journey time would be shortened by 10 minutes as a result. In regard to Members' concern over the matter of buses cutting across lanes, some Citybus routes had already adopted this arrangement and the bus drivers concerned had already familiarised themselves with it. Regarding Members' suggestions related to route nos. 930X and 933, the Citybus would make timely adjustment to the services in response to the passenger demand.

15. CTO/B/NT2 of the TD responded that the TD would follow up with the bus company on the introduction date of route no. A30 and urge the bus company to implement the proposed sectional fare for route no. 43X. Moreover, the TD would examine the need of transport services plying between Kwok Shui Road and Kwai Fong/Tsuen Wan as well as the appropriate way of providing services. Furthermore, as the TD had noticed the popularity of route no. 933 among passengers, it had recommended extending its service area to cover North Point last year, believing that the service efficiency could thus be enhanced.

16. The Chairman concluded by requesting the departments and bus companies concerned to consider the views of Members and implement various arrangements for enhancement of bus routes.

V Item 4: Request for a Research on the Demand and Supply of Parking Spaces in Tsuen Wan District

(T&TC Paper No. 2/2023)

17. The Chairman stated that Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio submitted the paper. The representative from the TD responsible for giving response was Mr CHAN Yee-hing, Paul, Engineer/Tsuen Wan 1 (E/TW1), TD.

18. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio introduced the paper.

19. The views and enquiries of Members were summarised as follows:

- (1) the problem of illegal parking in Tsuen Wan district was severe. He opined that sole reliance on law enforcement actions taken by the Police could only treat the symptoms but not the root cause of the problem. He cited the situation at a section on Yeung Uk Road off Indi Home as an example, pointing out that illegally parked vehicles had caused obstruction to passengers boarding and alighting from minibuses and school buses, endangering the safety of passengers and school children. He therefore requested the TD or Transport and Logistics Bureau to take the lead in conducting a comprehensive research on the demand and supply of parking spaces in Tsuen Wan district, which aimed to analyse the adequacy of suitable parking spaces in the district by area (such as Tsuen Wan East industrial area, Chai Wan Kok industrial area and town centre, etc.) and find out whether drivers committed illegal parking at the roadside for the sake of time or money saving. The research could identify the crux of the problem of illegal parking, facilitating the targeted enforcement actions taken by the Police and regulating the supply and demand of parking spaces by leveraging market forces, thereby tackling the problem at the root (Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio);

- (2) the number of private car (PC) parking spaces in Tsuen Wan district, especially in the town centre, was seriously inadequate. In addition, the strength of law enforcement actions taken by the Police was not enough and the penalties imposed upon the offenders were of low deterrent effect. At around 5:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m. on the day before the meeting, he had seen a few PCs parking on the double yellow lines painted at the bus stop opposite Yeung Uk Road Market. The driver and passengers of one of the PCs had even left the vehicle and gone shopping, and had then driven away as if nothing had happened. Passengers of buses and taxis had been forced to board and alight from the vehicles in the middle of the road, posing a severe safety hazard to them. He requested the TD to provide adequate parking spaces and urged the HKPF to step up law enforcement (Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly); and
- (3) as there were often long queues of vehicles at the car parks in the district on weekends, he hoped that the Government would make improvement to the overall planning and increase the number of PC parking spaces in private residential developments (the Chairman).

20. E/TW1 of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) to avoid aggravating the burden on road traffic, the Government did not encourage frequent users of public transportation to switch to PCs. Therefore, the Government's current policy was to accord priority to meeting the parking demand of commercial vehicles (CVs), and to provide an appropriate number of PC parking spaces if the overall development permitted;
- (2) the TD had completed a consultancy study on parking spaces for CVs in 2021, which aimed to assess the parking demand of CVs (Tsuen Wan district was covered in the research) and formulate short- and long-term measures to increase the supply of CV parking spaces. These measures included designating parking spaces at suitable on-street locations, making good use of the space underneath viaducts for the provision of parking spaces, specifying in the tenancy agreement of short-term tenancy (STT) car parks a minimum number of parking spaces for CVs and taking forward automated parking systems in public car parks in STT sites or government venues;
- (3) the TD had revised the relevant standards on parking spaces in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) in August 2021. The revisions included increasing the number of PC parking spaces in private and subsidised housing developments as well as the types and number of CV parking spaces in subsidised housing developments. The TD would continue to review the standards for parking facilities under the HKPSG on a regular basis and revise the relevant standards in a timely manner so as to tie in with the changes in society and economic environment;

- (4) the TD would provide additional on-street parking spaces for PCs and motorcycles as well as on-street parking spaces designated for people with disabilities (PWDs) at suitable locations on the premise that the traffic would not be adversely affected. Since July 2018, the TD had provided additional parking spaces at various locations in Tsuen Wan district. They included a total of 114 additional motorcycle parking spaces at Hoi Pa Street, Hoi Shing Road, Wing Tak Street, Tsuen Kwai Street, Yeung Uk Road, Texaco Road, Lei Shu Road, Lung Yue Road, Castle Peak Road - Ting Kau, Castle Peak Road - Tsuen Wan and so on; a total of 85 additional PC parking spaces at Heung Che Street, Yau Ma Hom Road, Lei Shu Road, Tsuen Wan Market Street, Tsuen Wing Street, Sham Tsz Street, Tsuen Kwai Street, On Yat Street, Tsuen King Circuit, Shiu Wo Street, Sha Tsui Road, Chung On Street, Pun Shan Street and so on; as well as a total of 21 on-street parking spaces designated for PWDs at Chung On Street, Lo Tak Court, Kwu Hang Road, Tung Wo Street, Heung Wo Street, Tai Mo Shan Road, Yuen Tun Circuit, Hau Tei Square, Sham Tsz Street, Hoi Tak Street, Tai Ho Road, Ma Sim Pai Road, Lei Shu Road, Pun Shan Street, Lung Tang Road, Castle Peak Road - Ting Kau, Castle Peak Road - Tsuen Wan and so on;
- (5) from the second half of 2023 to 2025, the TD would provide additional on-street parking spaces at various locations in Tsuen Wan district. They included a total of 100 motorcycle parking spaces at Shing Mun Road, Hau Tei Square, Sha Tsui Road, Texaco Road, Wang Wo Tsai Street, Sham Tseng Tsuen Road and so on; a total of 13 PC parking spaces at Sham Tseng Tsuen Road; as well as a total of two on-street parking spaces designated for PWDs at Yeung Uk Road and Sham Tseng Tsuen Road; and
- (6) the TD had conducted a survey on the utilisation rates of STT car parks in Tsuen Wan district in 2022. It was found that the utilisation rates of the 10 STT car parks in the district ranged from approximately over 30 percent to over 70 percent in daytime, and that the utilisation rates of most of them were approximately over 60 percent. This revealed that the parking spaces in the district were not yet fully utilised.

21. DOO(TW)(Atg) of the HKPF responded that the HKPF had all along been taking stringent law enforcement against illegal parking. Between October 2022 and March 2023, the HKPF had issued a total of 7 957 fixed penalty tickets at the locations concerned and towed away nine vehicles for causing serious traffic obstruction.

22. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio enquired of the TD whether the findings of the consultancy study on parking spaces for CVs would be submitted to the Tsuen Wan District Council (TWDC) for discussion, and opined that the act of the TD listing out the locations of additional parking spaces one by one had no significant bearing. He pointed out that the crux of the problem did

not only lie in the inadequacy of the total number of parking spaces but also the mismatch between the supply and demand of spaces for parking as well as loading/unloading at different locations. Tsuen Wan East industrial area was cited as an example for illustration. Although there were parking spaces left unused in the car parks, many vehicles were still illegally parked at the roadside on Texaco Road and Yeung Uk Road. In this connection, he considered it necessary for the TD to look into the situation so that the Police could strengthen enforcement more precisely for tackling the problem of illegal parking.

23. E/TW1 of the TD responded that the TD would consider the way of presenting the findings of the consultancy study on parking spaces for CVs to the TWDC for discussion. In addition, the survey on the utilisation rates of the STT car parks in Tsuen Wan district conducted in 2022 had taken each STT car park (including a few situated at Tsuen Wan East industrial area) into account. Among these car parks, the lowest utilisation rate was approximately over 30 percent and the highest utilisation rate was approximately over 70 percent, while the utilisation rates of most of these car parks were approximately over 60 percent.

24. The Chairman concluded by requesting the TD to review the planning of parking facilities in order to address the shortage of parking spaces in Tsuen Wan town centre.

(Note: Mr MAN Yu-ming joined the meeting at 3:22 p.m.)

VI Item 5: Improving the Traffic Black Spot at the Junction of Wo Yi Hop Road and Shing Mun Road

(T&TC Paper No. 3/2023)

25. The Chairman stated that Mr MAN Yu-ming submitted the paper. The representative from the TD responsible for giving responses was Mr CHAN Yee-hing, Paul, E/TW1.

26. Mr MAN Yu-ming introduced the paper.

27. E/TW1 of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) the repairs and maintenance of the slope near the section of Shing Mun Road turning onto Wo Yi Hop Road was undertaken by the Drainage Services Department (DSD). In response to the TD's notification given to the DSD earlier about the possible blockage of drivers' sightline by the trees at the location concerned, the DSD had carried out tree pruning on 6 April; and
- (2) the TD had also formulated the preliminary proposal for enhancing road design, including addition of road markings at the junction of Shing Mun Road and Wo Yi Hop Lane for reminding drivers to drive slowly and addition of traffic signs thereat

for reminding drivers to stop at the double white lines, as well as provision of additional traffic signs at the pedestrian crossing in front of the bus stop on Wo Yi Hop Road for reminding drivers to pay attention to the oncoming traffic from the slip road on the left. The TD would conduct a consultation on the proposal through the Tsuen Wan District Office in due course and issue a Works Request Form to the works department if positive response was received during the consultation.

28. The views and enquiries of Members were summarised as follows:

- (1) many people would visit Shing Mun Reservoir on holidays. However, some drivers would illegally park their vehicles on Shing Mun Road, causing traffic obstruction and blockage of other drivers' sightline. As the situation had been improved after being reflected to the HKPF at the meeting of the TWDC, he hoped that the HKPF would continue to strengthen law enforcement. He opined that the TD's measure of providing various additional road markings and traffic signs were inadequate, and was worried that the signs would only serve as reminders to drivers rather than changing their driving habits. He therefore proposed to install speed enforcement cameras at the location concerned for enhanced deterrent effect. He also opined that additional traffic lights would help secure the safety of pedestrians and drivers, and enquired whether such measure was technically feasible. As the speed of vehicles travelling on Wo Yi Hop Road was high in general and the section of Shing Mun Road turning onto Wo Yi Hop Road was a sharp bend, traffic accidents might easily occur there. He hoped that the TD and HKPF would adopt practical measures to improve the situation (Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly);
- (2) he thought that the installation of speed enforcement cameras might cause drivers to brake abruptly, resulting in rear-end collisions between vehicles. He suggested that the TD should explore the feasibility of installing yellow speed bumps on the road to remind drivers to reduce their speed (Mr WONG Ka-wa); and
- (3) as the section of Shing Mun Road turning onto Wo Yi Hop Road was a sharp bend with tilted road surface, the sightline of drivers would be blocked easily. Since the traffic there was busy, it would be dangerous in particular on rainy days with slippery road surface. There had been cases in which large vehicles overturned because of abrupt braking to avoid collisions with pedestrians. He therefore agreed to install additional yellow speed bumps on the road to remind drivers to slow down. He also enquired about the possibility of relocating the bus stop on Wo Yi Hop Road lest the sightline of drivers be blocked when leaving Shing Mun Road to turn into Wo Yi Hop Road (the Chairman).

29. DOO(TW)(Atg) of the HKPF responded that there was no record of traffic accident at the location concerned between January 2022 and March 2023.

30. E/TW1 of the TD responded that the TD would study various feasible measures of road improvement.

VII Item 6: Request for Extension of the Proposed Noise Barriers and Attention to the Noise Pollution Problem Caused by Tsuen Wan Road

(T&TC Paper No. 4/2023)

31. The Chairman stated that Mr LAU Cheuk-yu submitted the paper. As Mr LAU Cheuk-yu was unable to attend the meeting, he had asked Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio to introduce the paper on his behalf. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving responses were:

- (1) Mr CHEUNG Kai-cheung, Henry, Senior Engineer 2/Tsuen Wan Road (SE2/TWR), Highways Department (HyD);
- (2) Ms LIN Kit-mei, Flora, Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Acting) (SEPO(Atg)), Environmental Protection Department (EPD);
- (3) Mr CHAN Yee-hing, Paul, E/TW1, TD; and
- (4) Mr CHEUNG Lap-hong, DOO(TW)(Atg), HKPF.

32. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio introduced the paper.

33. SE2/TWR of the HyD responded that based on the findings of the traffic impact assessment, the HyD recommended implementing widening works for a section of Tsuen Wan Road with traffic demand (i.e. the section of Tsuen Wan Road between Parc City Tower 2 and Kwai Tsing Interchange). As the proposed widening works for Tsuen Wan Road was a designated project under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (EIAO), the project consultants were conducting an environmental impact assessment (EIA) according to the established requirement of the EIAO, which included a noise impact assessment. The preliminary findings of the noise impact assessment showed that the project could meet the criteria and requirements of the EIAO if the proposed noise mitigation measures were implemented at the said road section. As road widening works for the section of Tsuen Wan Road between Parc City Tower 3 and Ocean Pride Tower 7 were not included in the project, no other works (including addition of noise barriers/enclosures) would be implemented at this section either. The HyD anticipated that the EIA report in compliance with the EIAO would be submitted to the EPD for approval in mid-2023 and the report would be available for public access on the website of the EPD by then. The HyD had used low noise surfacing materials

for paving the main sections of Tsuen Wan Road and would also use such materials for paving the road sections under the Widening of Tsuen Wan Road in order to reduce traffic noise.

34. SEPO(Atg) of the EPD responded that in regard to the tackling of the traffic noise on Tsuen Wan Road at present, the EPD had requested the HyD to explore the feasibility of installing additional noise barriers/enclosures on the existing Tsuen Wan Road off Clague Garden Estate as far as practicable and subject to the availability of resources. After examining the section of the existing flyover on Tsuen Wan Road off Clague Garden Estate, the HyD found that the structure of the flyover could not bear the extra load brought about by the additional noise barriers/enclosures, and that there was inadequate government land at the area between Clague Garden Estate and the flyover on Tsuen Wan Road for retrofitting noise barriers/enclosures. Therefore, the proposal of retrofitting effective noise barriers/enclosures at the section of the existing Tsuen Wan Road off Clague Garden Estate was technically unfeasible. On the other hand, at the time of planning for these private residential developments, the developers of Ocean Pride and Parc City had assessed the impact of traffic noise from nearby roads (including Tsuen Wan Road) on the housing estates according to the requirement of the HKPSG. The developers had also adopted feasible noise mitigation designs and measures for the above two housing estates. For example, firstly, there was optimal use of the internal layout of the residential flats so that Tsuen Wan Road would be situating behind the ventilation windows in the living rooms and bedrooms of the affected flats as far as possible, while fixed glazing was used for windows directly facing Tsuen Wan Road. Secondly, to facilitate the cleaning of glass or maintenance of windows by the residents, the external wall of Parc City facing Tsuen Wan Road had been fitted with openable windows that were not for ventilation. Thirdly, architectural fins being effective in noise reduction were installed at suitable locations to minimise the impact of traffic noise on the residential flats. In addition, according to the requirement of the HKPSG, the developers had also installed acoustic windows, which were effective in blocking out the traffic noise from entering into the room, in the residential flats with ventilating windows that could not reduce the noise to the required level. By doing so, the residents could adjust the windows according to their needs to achieve a better indoor environment. The related noise mitigation design and measures as well as their purposes were prescribed by the developers in the deeds of mutual covenants and sales brochures of the housing estates, hence the owners and residents of the housing estates should have knowledge of such information. Seeing that the developers concerned had already taken measures in accordance with the HKPSG to cope with the impact of traffic noise from Tsuen Wan Road on the two housing estates, it was not necessary to retrofit noise barriers/enclosures on sections of the existing Tsuen Wan Road off the two housing estates.

35. The views and enquiries of Members were summarised as follows:

- (1) as the road widening works would increase vehicular flow on the entire Tsuen Wan Road, the noise to be generated thereafter would also adversely affect the buildings (such as those in Ocean Pride and Parc City) off the road sections where no widening works were carried out. In the planning of the residential developments, the developers had not anticipated that there would be widening works for Tsuen Wan Road in future so they had not adopted appropriate noise mitigation measures then. In his opinion, the decision of the departments concerned for not retrofitting noise barriers/enclosures at the road sections off Ocean Pride and Parc City was unfair to the residents, and it was not entirely unfeasible for retrofitting noise barriers/enclosures at these road sections from a technical perspective (Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly);
- (2) in case retrofitting of noise barriers/enclosures could not be carried out in the project, he suggested surfacing the road section concerned with low noise materials. Regarding the negative impact of traffic noise on the daily lives of residents of Ocean Pride and Parc City, he suggested that the EPD should make contact with residents for visiting the flats on higher floors late at night to measure the noise level (the Chairman); and
- (3) he agreed that the noise generated from the increased vehicular traffic flow upon completion of the road widening works would adversely affect the residents of Ocean Pride and Parc City. He asked the EPD to measure the noise level and pointed out that estate agents might not have explained to buyers in detail the impact of traffic noise on the housing estates concerned in the sales of residential properties (Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio).

36. SE2/TWR of the HyD responded that the HyD had carried out road surfacing works for the section of Tsuen Wan Road off Ocean Pride and Parc City with low noise surfacing materials. The engineering consultants had made assessment of the impact of the project on nearby noise sensitive receivers including Ocean Pride and Parc City during the noise model analysis. The project would meet the criteria and requirements of the EIAO if the proposed noise mitigation measures were implemented at the widened road sections.

37. E/TW1 of the TD responded that the Average Speed Camera System (ASCS) Trial Scheme implemented at Tsuen Wan Road aimed to reduce road safety and environmental problems caused by speeding vehicles through the installation of the ASCS. The TD had conducted on-site technical testing, and the related data analysis and findings of system assessment showed that the system was accurate and reliable. The TD continued to actively discuss with the HKPF on the arrangement of the adoption and application of the ASCS with a view to taking forward law enforcement with the use of such system.

38. Officer-in-Charge, District Traffic Team (Tsuen Wan) of the HKPF responded as follows:
- (1) during the period from April 2022 to March 2023, the HKPF had conducted 12 roadblock checks on Tsuen Wan Road and performed screening breath tests on a total of 1 755 drivers, among whom 19 drivers had been arrested after the tests. The HKPF had also conducted six laser gun speed check operations on Tsuen Wan Road and issued a total of 98 summonses. Traffic New Territories South under the HKPF had conducted 64 patrols by deploying unmarked police vehicles (commonly known as “invisible chariots”) on Tsuen Wan Road, and issued 182 summonses during the operations. It had also conducted seven operations against illegally modified vehicles, detaining 31 vehicles for suspected illegal modification and instituting prosecution against offenders in 36 cases;
 - (2) the HKPF had conducted nine roadblock checks and special operations on Castle Peak Road against illegally modified vehicles and illegal road racing in February 2023; and
 - (3) the HKPF would continue to combat the problems of illegally modified vehicles and illegal road racing.

39. SEPO(Atg) of the EPD responded that under normal circumstances, the EPD would arrange its staff to measure traffic noise during the peak period of traffic flow, so as to accurately capture the highest level of traffic noise at the road sections concerned. As the vehicular traffic flow was considerably low in the early hours, the level of traffic noise was relatively low as well. Therefore, the noise level obtained in the early hours might not reflect the highest level of traffic noise in general. The EPD would liaise with the Secretariat after the meeting to follow up on the request for measuring the level of traffic noise. In addition, it was the responsibility of developers and estate agents to disclose to buyers and tenants in detail the impact of traffic noise on the housing estates concerned as well as the noise mitigation design and devices that had been adopted, so as to aid the residents to make proper use of such devices.

(Post-meeting note: The EPD had liaised with the Secretariat after the meeting, requesting for its assistance in providing the information on the residential flats of which the households were willing to lend out their flats for conducting tests of traffic noise level, so as to make such arrangement. The Secretariat had contacted the Members concerned for assistance, and such Members were at present in communication with the owners’ committees of Ocean Pride and Parc City for obtaining the relevant information.)

VIII Item 7: Information Papers

(A) Traffic Enforcement Result in TWDIST between February and March 2023 Concerned Illegal Parking Location

(T&TC Paper No. 5/2023)

40. Members noted the contents of the information paper.

(B) Minor Traffic Improvement Projects Completed in the Past Two Months, in Progress and Planned to Commence by the Highways Department (Tsuen Wan District) and Timetables (as at 28 March 2023)

(T&TC Paper No. 6/2023)

41. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio enquired about the works progress of the provision of additional pedestrian crossing facilities at the bus terminus on Tsuen King Circuit near Allway Gardens.

42. E/TW1 of the TD responded that the TD had already issued a Works Request Form to the HyD.

43. District Engineer/Tsuen Wan of the HyD responded that the HyD had received the Works Request Form concerned. Examination of technical details was underway and the works would be launched as appropriate.

IX Item 8: Any Other Business

44. The Chairman reminded Members that the next meeting was scheduled on 19 June 2023 and the deadline for submission of discussion paper was 2 June 2023.

X Adjournment of Meeting

45. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:55 p.m.

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat

9 May 2023