

(Translation)

Minutes of the 7th Meeting of Traffic and Transport Committee (5/20-21)

Date: 8 February 2021

Time: 2:30 p.m.

Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Mr CHIU Yan-loy (Chairman)
Mr YICK Shing-chung, Angus (Vice Chairman)
Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH
Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris
Mr LI Hung-por
Mr SHUM Lester
Mr LAM Sek-tim
Ms CHAN Kim-kam
Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio
Mr WONG Ka-wa
Mr KOT Siu-yuen, MH
Mr LAU Chi-hung
Mr LAU Cheuk-yu
Mr PUN Long-chung, Roy
Mr LAU Jackson
Mr LAI Man-fai
Mr TSE Man-chak

Government Representatives

Mr LAI Yik-wing, Wesley	Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr FUNG Chun-pang, Alex	District Operations Officer (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr KWAN Lam	Assistant District Operations Officer (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr WONG Pui-kai	Officer-in-Charge, District Traffic Team (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force
Mr LAU Wing-hang, Will	Senior Transport Officer/Tsuen Wan, Transport Department
Mr CHOW Kai-hang, Daniel	Engineer/Tsuen Wan 1, Transport Department
Mr CHEUNG Kim-hung, Michael	Engineer/Tsuen Wan 2, Transport Department
Mr LEE Huen-yiu	District Engineer/Tsuen Wan, Highways Department
Miss LEUNG Ming-sze, Ashley	Executive Officer (Development), Tsuen Wan District Office

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat Representatives

Miss LAM Siu-yung, Daisy	Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr YIM Hong-yue, Owen	Executive Officer (District Council)3, Tsuen Wan District Office
Mr NG Cheuk-pong, James (Secretary)	Executive Officer (District Council)4, Tsuen Wan District Office

In attendance:

Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly	Chairman, Tsuen Wan District Council
-------------------------	--------------------------------------

Attendance by Invitation:

For discussion of item 3

Mr MA Kin-ye	Senior Engineer 5/Universal Accessibility, Highways Department
Mr LO Chun-chung	Engineer 9/Universal Accessibility, Highways Department

For discussion of item 4

Mr WAN Cheuk-keung, Ian	Senior Engineer 2/Tsuen Wan Road, Highways Department
Mr YU Chun-tat	Engineer 4/Tsuen Wan Road, Highways Department
Mr TAI Derek	Project Manager, AECOM Asia Company Limited

For discussion of item 5

Mr TO Kam-biu, David	Principal Project Coordinator/Tsing Yi-Lantau Link, Highways Department
Mr TSANG Chung-man, Alex	Senior Engineer 1/Route 11, Highways Department
Ms YIN Ching-kei, Jackei	Senior Engineer 2/Route 11, Highways Department
Ms KAN Yuet-man, Carol	Senior Engineer 5/Transport Planning, Transport Department
Mr MAK Tak-ming	Operating Director (Infrastructure), Meinhardt Infrastructure and Environment Limited - Aurecon (Hong Kong) Limited Joint Venture

Absent:

Mr TAM Hoi-pong

The Meeting

I Opening Remarks and Introduction

The Chairman welcomed the Members and representatives from the government departments to the 7th meeting of the Traffic and Transport Committee (T&TC), and introduced Mr NG Cheuk-pong, James who attended the meeting for the first time and replaced Miss CHEUNG Wai-nga, Katherine to assume the post of Secretary of the T&TC.

2. The Chairman stated that for Members' information, Mr TAM Hoi-pong was absent with apologies.

3. The Chairman stated that according to section 28 of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders (the "Standing Orders"), unless otherwise specified, each Member might speak on each agenda item once only. Each Member might speak up to 1.5 minutes if four or fewer Members spoke on the agenda item and up to 1 minute if more than four Members spoke on the agenda item. Representatives of the departments might have up to 8 minutes to introduce the paper. The total time for giving response was 5 minutes.

II Item 1: Confirmation of Minutes of the 6th Meeting held on 19.10.2020

4. The Chairman stated that the Secretariat received one proposed amendment from Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio before the meeting.

5. The Secretary said it was proposed that in lines 6 to 7 of paragraph 51 of the captioned minutes, "雖然他於文件中建議應拆除分隔楊屋道東行左邊兩條及右邊兩條行車線的花槽或遷移禾笛街的士站" (Although he had suggested in the paper that the planters separating the two nearside and two offside lanes of Yeung Uk Road eastbound should be demolished or the taxi stand on Wo Tik Street should be relocated) should be amended as "雖然他於文件中提及多項可供考慮的建議例如拆除分隔楊屋道東行左邊兩條及右邊兩條行車線的花槽或遷移禾笛街的士站" (Although he had put forth a number of proposals for consideration in his paper, such as demolishing the planters separating the two nearside and two offside lanes of Yeung Uk Road eastbound or relocating the taxi stand on Wo Tik Street).

6. The Chairman asked whether Members endorsed the minutes and the relevant proposed amendment. Members unanimously endorsed the minutes and the relevant proposed amendment.

III Item 2: Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

7. The Chairman said that there were no matters arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

IV Item 3: Universal Accessibility Programme (UAP) Special Scheme
(T&TC Paper No. 58/20-21)

8. The Chairman stated that the Highways Department (HyD) submitted the paper to brief Members on the UAP Special Scheme (Special Scheme). The representatives from the department attending the meeting were:

- (1) Mr MA Kin-ye, Senior Engineer 5/Universal Accessibility (SE5/UA), HyD; and
- (2) Mr LO Chun-chung, Engineer 9/Universal Accessibility (E9/UA), HyD.

9. SE5/UA and E9/UA of the HyD introduced the paper.

(Note: Mr SHUM Lester and Mr LAU Chi-hung joined the meeting at 2:44 p.m.)

10. The views and enquiries of Members were consolidated as follows:

- (1) the long history of Shek Wai Kok Estate and the relatively serious problem of aged roads would add difficulties to the works. Nevertheless, he considered it necessary to carry out the project so as to facilitate the access of persons with disabilities and elders. Among the five proposed projects, he opined that the retrofitting of lifts at Walkway Nos. NS18 and SWK03 was more effective after his preliminary assessment. He also enquired whether there were any other proposed locations for the lift to be retrofitted at Walkway No. NS18 (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
- (2) Walkway No. NF220 connected Shek Kuk House, Shek Tsui House and Lo Wai Village. Given the flaws in its design, its utilisation rate was constantly low as many residents would rather risk jaywalking instead. Therefore, there was an urgent need to retrofit lifts thereat. He regretted that no Members had further spoken on the footbridge between Shek Kuk House and Shek Tsui House ever since the proposed project was rejected in 2017. He hoped that lifts would be provided thereat successfully to facilitate the access of the residents of Shek Wai Kok Estate and Lo Wai Village. He had written to the HyD to strive for the inclusion of Walkway No. NS18 in the Special Scheme, and thus supported the project in the hope that residents could reach home without walking on a long ramp. However, as lifts had already been installed in the vicinity of Walkway Nos. SWK01 and SWK02, he did not support the retrofitting of lifts at Walkway Nos. SWK01 and SWK02 to avoid a waste of resources. On the other hand, since there were no lifts or ramps provided near Walkway No. SWK03, he supported the retrofitting of lifts at Walkway No. SWK03 to facilitate the access of mobility impaired persons and wheelchair users. Besides, as many pipelines were laid in the vicinity of Shek Lan House, he proposed that the scope of the works should be limited to the retrofitting of lifts at the location next to the exit of Shek Wai Kok Commercial Centre only in order to reduce the difficulty of the works. He also urged expedition of the implementation of the works (Mr LAI Man-fai);

- (3) he was glad to hear there were a total of five works options, and believed that enthusiastic responses would be received from the residents. In his opinion, it was necessary to respect the residents' wishes when making the decision. He had previously conducted a questionnaire survey at several locations in the upper and lower sections of Shek Wai Kok Estate. The survey findings showed that residents preferred the proposed retrofitting of lifts at Walkway Nos. SWK01, SWK02 and SWK03. He believed that residents residing at different parts of the estate would have different needs, so he considered that an opinion poll was necessary in order to understand the residents' needs. Incidentally, technical difficulties had to be overcome (Mr MAN Yu-ming); and
- (4) he opined that the terms used by the HyD to assess the level of technical difficulty of various projects were more or less the same, and hoped that the HyD would not assess the level of difficulty of the projects based on their construction costs. He cited Walkway No. NS18 as an example to illustrate that various kinds of problems, including conflicts with underground pipelines, alteration of planters, and construction of foundations prior to that of the elevated decks, would be encountered during the implementation of every project. Therefore, he did not understand the difficulties as referred to by the HyD, and hoped that the HyD would provide additional data to explain why the projects were considered difficult to be taken forward after assessment (the Vice Chairman).

(Note: Mr LAU Cheuk-yu joined the meeting at 2:49 p.m.)

11. SE5/UA of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) the HyD assessed the level of difficulty of various projects according to the physical setting and related constraints in each of the projects concerned. For example, facing problems such as the lack of working space and conflicts with a large number of underground pipelines during its implementation, the level of difficulty of retrofitting of lifts at Walkway No. SWK03 near the exit of Shek Wai Kok Commercial Centre was therefore rated as very difficult in the preliminary assessment. The five proposed walkways were not technically infeasible according to the preliminary assessment. Members could consider the projects in a comprehensive manner by taking into account their respective level of difficulty in the preliminary assessment and other factors when deciding on the projects to be implemented;
- (2) the HyD held that the current proposed location for retrofitting a lift at Walkway No. NS18 was appropriate, but it was not finalised yet. Adjustments would be made accordingly after the stage of detailed design, in which views from all the stakeholders and the locations of public facilities would be taken into consideration. As the lift would be retrofitted at the exit of the subway, the locations available for selection would be very similar; and

- (3) the estimated construction cost of a project would be affected by its level of difficulty as well as the volume of works. For example, as the level of difficulty of the proposed project at Walkway No. SWK01 was rated as less difficult in the preliminary assessment, its construction cost was lower correspondingly. Separately, considering the necessity to overcome the constraint imposed by the lack of working space in the proposed project at Walkway No. SWK03, and the need for a higher lift tower and provision of three exits in the proposed project at Walkway No. NF220 near Shek Kuk House, the construction costs of both projects were thus relatively higher. The overall level of difficulty and volume of works of the proposed projects at Walkway Nos. SWK03 and NF220 could be reflected in their respective estimated construction costs.

12. The Chairman said it was more likely that Members could reach a consensus on the implementation of the project at Walkway No. SWK03. Instead of being limited by the construction costs, the projects should be taken forward by overcoming the technical difficulties as far as possible. He also enquired of the HyD whether it was necessary for the T&TC to consider pedestrian flow or other objective factors and decide on the three walkways for the implementation of works on the same day.

13. SE5/UA of the HyD responded that Members should consider the factors from a holistic perspective and select not more than three existing walkways for the implementation of the projects under the Special Scheme. He hoped that the T&TC would promptly make the decision so as to facilitate the implementation of relevant works.

14. The Chairman concluded that the T&TC would select not more than three walkways for the implementation of relevant works by circulation of paper.

(Post-meeting note: The T&TC selected Walkway Nos. NF220, SWK03 and NS18 for the implementation of the projects under the Special Scheme by circulation of paper after the meeting.)

V Item 4: Investigation on Widening of Tsuen Wan Road, Extension of Existing Vehicular Bridge at Texaco Road and the Associated Junction Improvement Works, and Tsuen Tsing Interchange Improvement Works
(T&TC Paper No. 59/20-21)

15. The Chairman stated that the HyD submitted the paper to brief Members on the investigation on widening of Tsuen Wan Road, extension of the existing vehicular bridge at Texaco Road and the associated junction improvement works, and the improvement works at Tsuen Tsing Interchange. The representatives from the departments attending the meeting were:

- (1) Mr WAN Cheuk-keung, Ian, Senior Engineer 2/Tsuen Wan Road (SE2/TWR), HyD;
- (2) Mr YU Chun-tat, Engineer 4/Tsuen Wan Road (E4/TWR), HyD; and
- (3) Mr TAI Derek, Project Manager, AECOM Asia Company Limited.

16. SE2/TWR and E4/TWR of the HyD introduced the paper.
17. The Chairman said that the discussion at this meeting would focus on Tsuen Tsing Interchange. Members could express their views, if any, on the widening of Tsuen Wan Road and the associated junction improvement works in future discussions.
18. The views and enquiries of Members were consolidated as follows:
- (1) he agreed that an additional lane should be provided on Texaco Road near Sandoz Centre under works item no. 4, but objected to the erection of a traffic sign indicating the loading/unloading lay-by thereat. He urged the HyD to carefully design the curvature of the proposed link road under works item no. 3 to prevent traffic accidents. Besides, he drew the HyD's attention to a recent incident involving an overturned container truck that occurred at the junction of Texaco Road and Lung Tak Street towards City Point direction, and enquired whether the curvature of the road section concerned could be improved to enhance traffic safety. Regarding works item no. 2, he pointed out the serious problem of speeding at the location for the proposed extension of the flyover, and hoped that additional screening structures could be provided. He also urged the HyD to attach importance to the noise problem and avoid carrying out works in the small hours (Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio);
 - (2) considering that Tsuen Tsing Interchange was a major bottleneck on Tsuen Wan Road, he hoped that the HyD would provide additional data and explain to what extent the vehicular traffic entering the roundabout could be diverted, and how the traffic pressure at the roundabout could be eased upon the completion of works. He also requested the HyD to make projections of the traffic condition in five and ten years, so as to evaluate whether the current design proposal on the provision of an additional lane could achieve the anticipated outcome by diverting 60% of the vehicular traffic, and whether additional slope cutting works were necessary for the construction of another lane (Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris);
 - (3) as the problems of the traffic at Tsuen Tsing Interchange and the unfinished Texaco Road flyover had persisted for many years, he hoped that the works would be expeditiously taken forward within this term of the District Council (DC). He pointed out that the kerb in the middle of the roundabout and the shrubs in the planters on its two sides would obstruct the motorists' sightline, and wished that the HyD could improve the design to enhance traffic safety (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
 - (4) he opined that the proposed provision of a loading/unloading lay-by under works item no. 4 would cause traffic obstruction. In view of the large volume of vehicles (including public transport carriers) travelling to and from Tsing Yi via the vehicular bridge at Texaco Road and Tsing Yi North Bridge at present, extension of the vehicular bridge could immediately divert the traffic flow and alleviate the traffic congestion at

Tsuen Tsing Interchange. Therefore, he suggested according priority to the implementation of works item no. 2. He agreed that works item no. 1 could also divert the traffic flow, but was concerned about the impact of slope cutting on traffic. Additionally, he hoped that vehicles would no longer need to wait at the traffic lights when entering Wing Tak Street from Texaco Road. He thus suggested that the HyD and Transport Department (TD) should consider adopting the proposal of Wing Shun Street put forward by the last-term DC for works item no. 3, or separating the operation of the two sets of traffic lights by keeping on the green light of the traffic light at the left-turn slow lane to facilitate vehicular movement. The arrangement for the right-turn lane could be considered at a later date (Mr SHUM Lester); and

- (5) some residents of Pavilia Bay had relayed to him the undue inconvenience of having to travel past the waterfront area before entering the car parks of their housing estate. He therefore enquired of the TD how Wing Tak Street could be effectively integrated into the proposal of works item no. 3 to meet the residents' needs. Given that a pedestrian crossing was currently provided at the location where Kwai Fuk Road joined Texaco Road, he enquired whether the HyD would discuss how the design of the above pedestrian crossing should be enhanced with the relevant DCs before connecting the joint of the vehicular bridge at Texaco Road to the ground. He also pointed out that the roundabout was in the proximity of residential premises such as City Point, Pavilia Bay and Ocean Pride, and therefore hoped that noise barriers or other facilities could be provided at appropriate locations to reduce noise and prevent complaints from residents (the Vice Chairman).

19. SE2/TWR of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) at present, some vehicles would occupy the nearside lane of Texaco Road off Sandoz Centre from time to time for loading/unloading activities, affecting the traffic at that section of Texaco Road and around the roundabout. Under the proposed works item no. 4, a part of the landscaping area would be converted into a traffic lane, so that even if the leftmost lane was occupied by vehicles, there would still be two lanes available for use by vehicles travelling to Tsuen Wan;
- (2) the HyD would pay attention to the design requirements of the slip road connecting the down ramp of Tsuen Wan Road to Texaco Road in the detailed design stage;
- (3) the engineering consultant had carried out environmental review for the works items. The findings showed that the impact of the works on the noise sensitive receivers in the vicinity was compliant with the requirements stipulated by the existing environmental legislation. Nevertheless, the HyD would explore in the detailed design stage the use of low noise surfacing materials when paving the new road sections under the project as appropriate;

- (4) the traffic condition at the roundabout would be improved after all the proposed works had been completed. As shown in the traffic impact assessment (TIA), it was anticipated that the exclusive left-turn lane to Tsing Yi would divert about 60% of the vehicular traffic flow entering the roundabout from the approach road of Tsuen Wan Road (Tuen Mun bound) in 2031; the extension of the existing vehicular bridge at Texaco Road could divert about half of the vehicular traffic flow entering the roundabout along the at-grade carriageway at Texaco Road; and the slip road connecting the down ramp of Tsuen Wan Road and Texaco Road could divert about a quarter of the vehicular traffic flow entering the roundabout along the down ramp;
- (5) owing to the obstruction caused by structures, the motorists' sight distances were far from satisfactory at some of the entrances of the roundabout at Tsuen Tsing Interchange at present. The engineering consultant would study the adjustment of the entry angles at the roundabout, and utilise the space of the inner circle of the roundabout as far as possible to increase the sight distances and thereby enhance road safety;
- (6) the HyD planned to take forward the five proposed improvement measures altogether under the improvement works at Tsuen Tsing Interchange. If some of the works items were able to be completed in phases, the relevant road sections would be opened for public use first in order to alleviate the traffic pressure at Tsuen Tsing Interchange as soon as possible; and
- (7) regarding the traffic issues in the district, the HyD would continue to coordinate with the TD to explore feasible improvement measures.

20. The Chairman concluded that the T&TC supported the proposal submitted by the HyD. He hoped that the project would be implemented promptly so as to alleviate the traffic congestion at Tsuen Tsing Interchange. In addition, he requested the HyD to plan in advance the temporary traffic arrangements to be implemented during the road closure period under works item no. 1.

VI Item 5: Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau) and Associated Major Roads
(T&TC Paper No. 60/20-21)

21. The Chairman stated that the HyD submitted the paper to brief Members on Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau) and the associated major roads. The representatives from the departments attending the meeting were:

- (1) Mr TO Kam-biu, David, Principal Project Coordinator/Tsing Yi-Lantau Link (PPC/TYLL), HyD;
- (2) Mr TSANG Chung-man, Alex, Senior Engineer 1/Route 11 (SE1/R11), HyD;
- (3) Ms YIN Ching-kei, Jackei, Senior Engineer 2/Route 11 (SE2/R11), HyD;
- (4) Ms KAN Yuet-man, Carol, Senior Engineer 5/Transport Planning (SE5/TP), TD; and

- (5) Mr MAK Tak-ming, Operating Director, Meinhardt Infrastructure and Environment Limited (Meinhardt) - Aurecon (Hong Kong) Limited (Aurecon) Joint Venture (Operating Director of Meinhardt - Aurecon Joint Venture).
22. SE1/R11 of the HyD introduced the paper.
23. The views and enquiries of Members were consolidated as follows:
- (1) he was concerned that the enormous project cost would aggravate the Government's fiscal deficit, so he enquired about the amount of funding under application for the project. To find out whether Route 11 could indeed relieve the traffic pressure of Tuen Mun Road (TMR), he enquired of the departments how the traffic volume/capacity ratio stated in the paper was calculated (Mr TSE Man-chak);
 - (2) he generally supported the construction of Route 11, and opined that Route 11 could serve as an alternative route to TMR (Ting Kau Section) to prevent the traffic in Northwest New Territories (NWNT) from paralysing by traffic accidents. Besides, he was concerned about the impact of the project on the environment, especially the noise and pollution problems. These included the landscape impact on and noise problems at Tsing Lung Tau and sea water pollution at beaches along Castle Peak Road (CPR) (Mr LAI Man-fai);
 - (3) he was discontented with the Government, which approved the departments' submission of a cross-district issue for discussion at the T&TC meeting while restricting Members from submitting this type of agenda items. He objected to the construction of Route 11, as he considered that it was part of the proposed Northwest New Territories-Lantau-Metro Transport Corridor, with the objective of paving the way for the future East Lantau Metropolis (ELM) project. In his opinion, there were some other methods to cope with the population growth up to 2030. As such, he queried about the necessity for the ELM project and its project cost (Mr PUN Long-chung, Roy);
 - (4) he pointed out that the proposed Tsing Lung Bridge was of a similar length to Tsing Ma Bridge, and was close to the residential premises in Tsing Lung Tau. In this connection, he enquired whether the HyD had assessed the potential noise emission and environmental impact. In addition, he pointed out that a large number of objections had been received when the proposal of Route 11 was first launched by the Government in 2000, and the proposal had not even been endorsed by the then-Legislative Council after gazettal. Thus, he enquired whether the Authority had taken the relevant objections into consideration when formulating the current proposal (Mr LAU Cheuk-yu);
 - (5) he objected to the construction of Route 11 because he was concerned about the impact of the project on the environment and landscape in the vicinity, and worried that the residential premises around Sham Tseng would be surrounded by several bridges. He queried whether the

project was intended for paving the way for the Lantau Tomorrow project. He also enquired whether the HyD had considered the impact of the recent social situation (such as the emigration tide) on population growth, necessity of the project, and financial implication of the project cost after conducting the feasibility study in May 2018 (Mr LAU Chi-hung);

- (6) he hoped that the HyD would provide the presentation materials, such that Members could have a better understanding of the project and give views. He also pointed out that most drivers who left from Hung Shui Kiu would take Tai Lam Tunnel or TMR for travelling to Kowloon. In view of the frequent traffic congestion at TMR (Sham Tseng Section), he enquired in what way Route 11 would be beneficial to the traffic at the road section concerned and in Tsuen Wan district, and whether reclamation was necessary for the implementation of the project (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
- (7) he noted that the HyD had consulted the T&TC on a small number of road sections in Tsuen Wan district involved in Route 11. He enquired about the location of Road P1 on the map, which was mentioned in paragraph 9 of the paper. He also pointed out that the words used in paragraph 15 of the paper were vague, and found it difficult to understand the meaning of “部分行程” (some journeys). Hence, he suggested that the HyD should cite examples for illustration in the future for the ease of understanding. He opined that the similarity in the name of the proposed Tai Lam Chung Tunnel and the existing yet distant Tai Lam Tunnel would cause confusion easily. He therefore suggested that the Authority should rename the proposed tunnel (Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio);
- (8) she objected to the construction of Route 11, and opined that the problem of traffic congestion in New Territories West and areas around TMR could be solved by diverting and regulating the traffic flow through such methods as introduction of ferry routes and restriction on the use of bus lane by particular types of vehicles during peak hours. In addition, as the estimates in Annex 2 of the paper showed that the situation was still manageable at present, it was not necessary to construct Route 11 for the purpose of complementing the ELM project. She enquired of the HyD about the criteria used for estimating the current situation and the situation in 2036 and for assessing their differences (Ms CHAN Kim-kam);
- (9) he objected to the construction of Route 11. In his opinion, the current proposal could only improve the external traffic of Yuen Long and Tuen Mun. Incidentally, the construction of another road connecting to Stonecutters Island for the diversion of traffic from Lantau Link would increase the traffic flow and overburden the Western Harbour Crossing. Therefore, the proposal was infeasible. He queried if the real purpose

- of the project was to connect Lantau Link to Kennedy Town via the artificial islands in East Lantau and Kau Yi Chau (Mr SHUM Lester);
- (10) as the proposed Tsing Lung Bridge under Route 11, which would connect Tsing Lung Tau and Yam O, was in close proximity to the west of Hong Kong Garden, he was concerned that the bridge would affect the landscape and cause air and noise impact in the area concerned, and urged attention to these aspects during design. He understood that the construction of Route 11 was implemented for the purpose of tying in with the new development areas in the New Territories West. However, as residents would be gradually moving into the new residential developments at Hung Shui Kiu and So Kwun Wat, Route 11, which would come into operation only after 15 years, could not serve as a solution to such an imminent issue. To solve the problem, the Government had to adopt a multi-pronged approach through measures including controlling the growth of private cars, carrying out railway planning, as well as making improvement to roads and public transport services (Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris);
- (11) Route 11 could divert the traffic flow on CPR to avoid undue reliance of the external traffic of NWNT on CPR. He did not object to the construction of Route 11 in principle, as long as it was not intended for paving the way for the Lantau Tomorrow project. He was concerned about the actual distance between the proposed road, Hong Kong Garden and other nearby residential premises in Ting Kau and Ma Wan, and the impact on the residents in the said areas. He enquired whether the HyD had formulated any measures to monitor such impact. Additionally, he was concerned about how the current proposal could accommodate the traffic flow at the junction of Route 11 and CPR. If there was no effective measure to tackle the traffic flow problem, he would oppose the project. He also urged the HyD to enhance the existing ancillary transport facilities and explain whether the proposal was paving the way for the Lantau Tomorrow project (the Vice Chairman);
- (12) Route 11, which incurred a project cost amounting to hundreds of millions of dollars, would show its effectiveness in 15 years. However, various problems would arise immediately as soon as the works commenced. These included the impact on the environment during construction works, impact on traffic caused by the re-provisioning of some road sections of TMR, and the landscape and noise impact after completion of the works. He thus hoped that the HyD would consult the T&TC again after proposing a detailed plan (Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly);
- (13) he was concerned about the possible influx of left-hand-drive vehicles into various districts of Hong Kong upon connection to Shenzhen with Route 11, which could lead to traffic accidents and worsening of traffic congestion. Moreover, he was concerned that the substantial amount of vehicles travelling to Tsing Yi via Route 11 and Lantau Link would cause traffic congestion at Tsuen Tsing Interchange. He therefore

requested the HyD to provide the estimates of traffic accidents and congestion at the road sections concerned. Otherwise, he would object to the construction of Route 11 (Mr LAM Sek-tim); and

- (14) he noted that the project would include the earmarking of a road on Kau Yi Chau for connecting the artificial islands in East Lantau and Kennedy Town. He therefore enquired the HyD about the relationship between the proposed Tsing Yi-Lantau Link and the project, the specific arrangements and the latest progress (the Chairman).

24. PPC/TYLL of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) the feasibility study for the project was about to be completed. Its major objectives were to work out the preliminary alignment, locations of road linkages and number of lanes at each road section, examine the impact of various factors, and assess if there were any insurmountable difficulties in the project. The HyD would then proceed to conduct investigations and collect various kinds of data for undertaking preliminary design and more in-depth studies of Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau). The HyD would prepare the cost estimate of the project according to market factors after finalising the alignment and design;
- (2) the proposed project comprised three main parts, namely Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau), Tsing Yi-Lantau Link and widening of a section of Yuen Long Highway between Lam Tei Quarry and Tong Yan San Tsuen. In the light of the continuous development of NWNT, the HyD estimated that the population of NWNT would increase by about 500,000 in 2036 and by another 150,000 in 2041, thus resulting in an increase in the traffic needs to and from the urban areas among the NWNT residents and exerting pressure on the overall traffic of NWNT. Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau) was mainly used for diverting the traffic flow of TMR and Tai Lam Tunnel to alleviate the traffic pressure brought by the future population growth in NWNT;
- (3) the traffic volume of Lantau Link would increase upon connection to North Lantau with Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau). In this connection, the HyD suggested that it was necessary to construct Tsing Yi-Lantau Link in order for traffic diversion, and it would conduct the engineering study of the project promptly. When there was traffic congestion at Lantau Link, motorists could travel from NWNT to the urban areas via Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau) and Tsing Yi-Lantau Link. This routing could shorten the journey distance and time of the drivers currently travelling from the vicinity of Lam Tei to the urban areas via Tai Lam Tunnel. Additionally, given the relatively high traffic flow on TMR, the proposed new trunk road would also be remarkably effective in diverting the traffic on TMR;
- (4) as Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau) would connect to Yuen Long Highway near Lam Tei Quarry, the HyD planned

to widen Yuen Long Highway (section between Lam Tei and Tong Yan San Tsuen) according to the traffic flow at that time to ensure smooth traffic;

- (5) the target commissioning date of Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau) was not later than 2036. The aim of the project was to meet the traffic needs brought by the future developments in NWNT, which was different from that of the “Lantau Tomorrow Vision”;
- (6) the HyD could provide Members with copies of the slide presentation for reference after the meeting; and
- (7) the HyD held that Route 11 (section between Yuen Long and North Lantau) and associated major roads could alleviate the traffic congestion at TMR and Tai Lam Tunnel with positive impact on the environment.

25. Operating Director of Meinhardt - Aurecon Joint Venture responded that it had conducted a feasibility study on the preliminary alignment proposal, which included TIA, technical and feasibility assessment, land resumption assessment, and preliminary environmental study. It had also conducted assessment on various aspects such as air quality, noise, landscape, visual impacts, ecosystem, water quality, waste management, contaminated land and cultural heritage. Meinhardt - Aurecon Joint Venture had communicated with the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) and relevant departments regarding the preliminary environmental study, and proposed mitigation measures in response to the environmental impact created by the project. The HyD would finalise the alignment and design of the project and communicate with relevant stakeholders during the next stage of the investigation. Subsequently, it would apply to the EPD for an environmental permit for works implementation.

26. SE1/R11 of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) road works in the immediate proximity of the residential premises around Hong Kong Garden, Tsing Lung Tau had been avoided in the design of the preliminary alignment. To protect the main structural columns of Tsing Lung Bridge, it was necessary to carry out small-scale reclamation at Tsing Lung Tau and Kwai Shek in North Lantau. Incidentally, reclamation would shorten the main span of Tsing Lung Bridge, thereby reducing the difficulty of construction;
- (2) the HyD pointed out that Road P1 was within the area under the Tung Chung New Town Extension project. Upon the completion of Road P1, motorists could make a right turn on Tsing Lung Bridge and travel to Tung Chung and Hong Kong International Airport along Road P1; and
- (3) the TD would consider the naming of various road sections upon commissioning in a timely manner to avoid confusion to the motorists.

27. The Chairman requested the HyD to provide the presentation materials for circulation, and hoped that the departments would take note of Members’ opposing views. He enquired about the re-provisioning arrangement of TMR, design height of Tsing Lung Bridge, and distance between the bridge deck and the residential premises. Besides, he hoped that after the proposed alignment of Tsing Yi-Lantau Link had been

confirmed with the departments, the T&TC would be consulted and a site inspection would be arranged for a better understanding of the opinions held by the residents in Sham Tseng and Tsing Lung Tau.

28. SE1/R11 of the HyD responded that the re-provisioning of TMR was intended for the construction of Tsing Lung Bridge and Tai Lam Chung Tunnel. The HyD would first wait for the completion of the re-provisioning of the road sections concerned on TMR before proceeding to implement traffic diversion arrangements to ensure smooth traffic flow on TMR.

29. The Chairman concluded by requesting the HyD to arrange a site inspection for Members in the future so as to learn about the residents' views.

VII Item 6: Information Papers

(A) Traffic Enforcement Result in TWDIST between November and December 2020 Concerned Illegal Parking Location (T&TC Paper No. 61/20-21)

30. District Operations Officer (Tsuen Wan) (DOO(TW)) of the Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF) reported on the latest status of the law enforcement in Tsuen Wan District. The HKPF formed a "District Traffic Enforcement Team" (the Team) through internal redeployment in November 2020. 10 police officers were specifically arranged to handle traffic complaints from the peak hour at 7:00 a.m. to 11:00 p.m. The Team was provided with specialised vehicles and the latest e-ticketing system so as to enable it to take law enforcement actions at relatively remote locations within a short time and simplify the procedures. Since the implementation of the new scheme on 29 November 2020, the Team had issued a considerable number of fixed penalty tickets (FPTs). For example, 1 275 FPTs were issued within the week from 31 January to 6 February 2021. The HKPF would continue to keep a close eye on the new scheme and implement timely improvements to enhance the effectiveness of law enforcement.

31. Officer-in-Charge, District Traffic Team (Tsuen Wan) of the HKPF briefed Members on the illegal parking locations concerned in the traffic enforcement report of Tsuen Wan Police District between November and December 2020.

32. The views and enquiries of Members were consolidated as follows:

- (1) he enquired about the contact information of the Team (the Chairman);
- (2) he pointed out that speeding would occur on CPR and TMR every week, and opined that the number of patrols conducted by the HKPF was inadequate. He hoped that the HKPF would provide relevant enforcement statistics (Mr TSE Man-chak);
- (3) in addition to enquiring of the HKPF about the number of FPTs issued last year, he would like to draw the HKPF's attention to the intermittent noise nuisance caused by motorcycles speeding from Tsuen Wan Police Station to the vicinity of Allway Gardens (Mr LAU Cheuk-yu);
- (4) he considered that the speeding problem was serious around Sham Tseng, and enquired of the HKPF about the details of setting up road blocks in

this regard. Separately, as there was only one car park around Ting Kau Village and it was often illegally occupied by vehicles from areas outside Ting Kau Village, villagers were hindered from parking their vehicles. He thus requested the HKPF to follow up the situation (Mr LAU Chi-hung);

- (5) he commended the enhanced effectiveness of law enforcement. He hoped that the HKPF would monitor the situation of the prolonged illegal occupation of parking spaces, and proposed installing parking meters at appropriate locations. He also enquired whether the figures stated in the paper included the cases in which FPTs were issued after the review of video footage in office (Mr WONG Ka-wa);
- (6) having compared the enforcement statistics at Sha Tsui Road and Yeung Uk Road, he pointed out that there were fewer occurrences of illegal parking on Sha Tsui Road, which was a major road in the district. On the contrary, the problem of illegal parking was so rampant on Yeung Uk Road that the safety of passengers was being seriously jeopardised during their boarding and alighting of buses and minibuses. He urged the HKPF to step up enforcement action at the road sections concerned (Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio);
- (7) he pointed out that shop operators around Yeung Uk Road Market and Sha Tsui Road had been handling a substantial amount of goods recently. The waste produced therefrom accumulated on the roads, causing serious traffic congestion. He wished that the HKPF and related departments would address the problem. He also pointed out the frequent noise nuisance caused by the illegally modified vehicles running on Texaco Road, Tsuen Fu Street and CPR in the small hours in recent days (Mr LAM Sek-tim);
- (8) he enquired whether the officers of the Team were commonly known as “咖啡仔” (“coffee boys”). There were frequent occurrences of illegal parking on CPR near Belvedere Garden and in the vicinity of Ocean Pride, but it was difficult to get in contact with the HKPF for tackling the problem in the peak hours at present. Besides, even if the HKPF had taken responsive measures, their effectiveness was somewhat limited on the roads which were painted with yellow box markings. He urged the HKPF to strengthen its efforts in combating illegal parking and directing traffic, and enquired of the HKPF about the timetable and effectiveness of the inter-departmental joint operation against speeding, which it had previously undertaken to perform, at the current stage (the Vice Chairman); and
- (9) he was concerned about the problem of illegal parking on Kwok Shui Road and Shing Mun Road. In his opinion, the current practice of liaising with the Police Community Relations Office first was rather complicated. He hoped that the HKPF would provide District Councillors with a direct method of contacting the Team (Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly).

33. DOO(TW) of the HKPF responded as follows:
- (1) the HKPF noted Members' views, and would make an all-out effort to take law enforcement actions and combat various traffic offences;
 - (2) the HKPF did not have the exact data on the speeding problem on CPR so far, but it would study the issue and provide relevant information after the meeting. The HKPF would also provide the previous enforcement statistics for comparison in the hope that the enforcement actions taken could reduce the negative impact of traffic problems on the public and enhance the quality of life;
 - (3) the HKPF would follow up on the noise problem caused by motorcycles departing from Tsuen Wan Police Station;
 - (4) the locations for the HKPF's targeted enforcement actions included the various locations stated in the paper as well as Ting Kau and Kwok Shui Road as mentioned by Members. The Team would enhance the effectiveness of vehicle deployment to deal with traffic issues at relatively remote locations;
 - (5) the HKPF would study the locations for installing parking meters with relevant departments;
 - (6) the figures stated in the paper did not include the cases in which FPTs were issued after the review of video footage in office;
 - (7) the Traffic New Territories South of the HKPF was responsible for tackling the speeding problem, which was mainly identified on expressways, whereas the Tsuen Wan Police District would act as a go-between and relay Members' views. The inter-departmental joint operation against speeding was under discussion. The latest development would be reported to the T&TC once available; and
 - (8) to avoid confusion to the public, the HKPF wanted to streamline the communication channels. At present, the public could make phone calls to the regional consoles or the report rooms of police stations for case referral to the Team. The HKPF would also consider whether a hotline was to be set up or other established approaches should be adopted for handling complaints. Members might also contact him for follow-up or referral if necessary.

34. Assistant District Operations Officer (Tsuen Wan) of the HKPF responded that the newly established Team consisted of only 10 police officers. The so-called "coffee boys" referred to the existing traffic wardens, who would continue to take law enforcement actions against traffic offences. Incidentally, the HKPF was very concerned about the problem of illegal parking at Ocean Pride, and had towed away the vehicles concerned and painted yellow box markings at the relevant road sections in the hope of improving the situation.

(B) Minor Traffic Improvement Projects Completed in the Past Two Months, in Progress and Planned to Commence by the Highways Department (Tsuen Wan District) and Timetables (as at 29 January 2021)

(T&TC Paper No. 62/20-21)

35. District Engineer/Tsuen Wan (DE/TW) of the HyD reported on the relevant information.

36. The views and enquiries of Members were consolidated as follows:

- (1) he enquired about the anticipated completion dates of the Widening of Road and Improvement of Traffic Signs and Traffic Markings on Castle Peak Road – Sham Tseng near Rhine Garden under Project No. NE/17/00461-77 (Project No. NE/17/00461-77) and the Re-provisioning of Road Markings at the Roundabout on Castle Peak Road – Tsing Lung Tau near Sea Crest Villa Phase 3 under Project No. TW/19/00502-132 (Project No. TW/19/00502-132) which was not set out in the captioned paper (Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris);
- (2) on the day when the Extension of the 24-hour No-stopping Restriction Zone on Hoi Hing Road near Tsuen Wan Road under Project No. TW/20/01046-94 (Project No. TW/20/01046-94) was implemented, the outsourced contractor left directly without painting yellow box markings at some of the locations due to obstruction caused by illegal parking. The yellow box markings were not painted back thereat until the media had uncovered the incident and he had lodged a complaint in person. He criticised the HyD for its ineffective monitoring and allowing the contractor to work irresponsibly and carelessly. He enquired of the HyD whether the project would be divided into two parts so that the contractor could make profit repeatedly in a single project. He expressed regret at the delay of the Improvement of Pavement Facilities and Roadside Fencing on Castle Peak Road – Tsuen Wan near Belvedere Square, Belvedere Garden Phase II under Project No. TW/18/02734-122 (Project No. TW/18/02734-122), which had just been completed, for almost one year. He said that he had in fact been actively striving for the implementation of the project upon receipt of a complaint in 2018, and was informed that the HyD had accepted the views in 2019. Yet, the project had been repeatedly delayed, and was not completed until November 2020. By that time, the complainant had passed away for more than two months, and could never use the facilities. He urged the HyD to remember the lesson when carrying out district works in the future and not to delay the works without a proper reason (the Vice Chairman);
- (3) he enquired about the details of the Installation of Roadside Bollards in Fui Yiu Kok Street near Fu Yuen Industrial Building under Project No. TW/20/02013-179 (Project No. TW/20/02013-179), and whether the project was the same as another project implemented for preventing large goods vehicles from ramming onto the pavement (Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio);

- (4) he enquired about the details of the Improvement of Pedestrian Crossing Facility and Traffic Signs on Sha Tsui Road near Tsuen Wing Street under Project No. TW/18/01930-108 (Project No. TW/18/01930-108) and the Updating of Road Markings for the Parking Spaces Reserved for Persons with a Disability on Tsuen Kwai Street under Project No. TW/19/01568-146 (Project No. TW/19/01568-146), both of which had been issued with a Works Request Form (Mr LAM Sek-tim);
- (5) he enquired about the details and progress of the Alteration of Road Markings on Route Twisk near Fu Yung Shan Road under Project No. TW/20/01767-168 (Project No. TW/20/01767-168). He noted that the HyD would simplify the road marking design for the Improvement of Traffic Markings on Wai Tsuen Road near Tsuen Kam Interchange under Project No. TW/20/03184-246 (Project No. TW/20/03184-246), and wished that the HyD would inform him of the proposal before implementing the works (Mr PUN Long-chung, Roy);
- (6) he enquired about the details and progress of the Improvement of Road Markings on Sam Tung Uk Road near Lo Wai Road under Project No. TW/20/01179-191 (Project No. TW/20/01179-191) (Mr LAI Man-fai); and
- (7) she had conducted district consultation about the Provision of Motorcycle Parking Spaces at Hoi Kwai Road Public Transport Interchange under Project No. TW/20/03349-255 (Project No. TW/20/03349-255). Many members of the public opposed the project as they held that narrowing of the pavement would be dangerous, and expressed concern over the noise problem caused by motorcycles. She queried about the urgency of the project, and hoped that the HyD would suspend the project (Ms CHAN Kim-kam).

37. DE/TW of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) the HyD anticipated that the first phase of Project No. NE/17/00461-77, which was about the modification of a pedestrian crossing off Tsuen Wan Catholic Primary School, would commence in March 2021 and be completed before June 2021 to bring convenience to students going to and from schools. The HyD was currently studying the temporary traffic arrangements for the second phase of the project, which was about the widening of carriageway at Rhine Garden;
- (2) as Project No. TW/19/00502-132 involved a roundabout and cold milling and resurfacing works, the traffic arrangements required would be rather complicated. Thus, the HyD did not have a definite anticipated completion date, but it hoped to complete the project within this year;
- (3) Project No. TW/20/01046-94 could not be completed immediately as scheduled due to vehicle obstruction. Yet, the HyD had finished painting the yellow box markings within 48 hours after the incident. The HyD calculated the project cost according to the actual number of

works items involved, and would consider reporting to the Police immediately when similar situations arose in the future;

- (4) regarding Project No. TW/18/02734-122, the HyD would coordinate with the Leisure and Cultural Services Department and expedite the progress as far as possible in the future;
- (5) the HyD had completed Project No. TW/20/02013-179 by installing three additional bollards outside Fu Yuen Industrial Building. The HyD and TD had not yet commenced the large-scale improvement works in Fui Yiu Kok Street;
- (6) the HyD had completed Project No. TW/18/01930-108 by providing a signalised pedestrian crossing off Sheung Chui Court, which had commenced operation on 2 February 2021;
- (7) the HyD was currently waiting for the approval from the HKPF and TD for the temporary traffic arrangements of Project No. TW/20/01767-168. The works would be commenced promptly; and
- (8) Project No. TW/20/01179-191 was a project on improvement of road markings, in which the HyD would incorporate double white lines into the hatched markings. It was anticipated that the works would be completed in the first quarter of 2021.

38. Engineer/Tsuen Wan 1 of the TD responded as follows:

- (1) Project No. TW/20/02013-179 consisted of the provision of three additional bollards at the entrance of the laundry on the ground floor of Metex House, instead of the large-scale widening works to be implemented at the corner of Indi Home in Fui Yiu Kok Street;
- (2) Project No. TW/20/03184-246 comprised two main parts. Firstly, priority would be accorded to the provision of the “SLOW” road markings on the road section between the roundabout exit at Wai Tsuen Road and Fairview Garden Block 1. Secondly, the size of the traffic signs would be adjusted and reduced to the lower limit of the design standards according to the destinations so as to widen the motorists’ viewing angle when they made a turn; and
- (3) regarding Project No. TW/20/03349-255, the TD had previously conducted a site visit with relevant Members and stakeholders to learn about the situation of the parking of motorcycles in the vicinity. Owing to the divergence in views during the consultation period, the TD would consider whether the project should still be taken forward.

39. The Chairman reminded Members that they could directly contact the representatives of the TD or HyD if they had any enquiries upon receiving the papers and plans of the projects in order to solve the problems early and save discussion time at the meeting.

(Note: Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris left the meeting at 4:51 p.m. Mr LI Hung-por left the meeting at 4:52 p.m. Mr LAU Cheuk-yu left the meeting at 4:53 p.m.)

- (C) Financial Statement of Traffic and Transport Committee Funds as at 22 January 2021
(T&TC Paper No. 63/20-21)
40. Members noted the contents of the information paper.

VIII Item 7: Any Other Business

41. The views and enquiries of Members were consolidated as follows:
- (1) as Item 3 involved his constituency, he hoped that Members' names would be indicated during the circulation of paper (Mr MAN Yu-ming);
 - (2) regarding the traffic flow brought by the development projects at the two sites in Tsuen Wan West near Yau Kom Tau Village and Po Fung Road, although road improvement works would be carried out near One Kowloon Peak, the crux of the traffic problem lied in Castle Peak Road – Tsuen Wan and Chai Wan Kok roundabout. He enquired how the conclusion in the TIA conducted by the TD was drawn. In his opinion, only a limited number of vehicles from the development projects would travel to Tsuen Wan MTR Station or Sha Tin via Castle Peak Road – Tsuen Wan and Chai Wan Kok roundabout, and most vehicles would travel to Kowloon and other districts via Lai Shun Road and Hoi On Road (Mr TSE Man-chak);
 - (3) given the substantial amount of complaints about traffic congestion and illegal parking he had received, he urged the HKPF to strengthen enforcement before the Lunar New Year holidays to ease the traffic on Sha Tsui Road and Yeung Uk Road (Mr LAM Sek-tim); and
 - (4) he enquired of the departments how the traffic impact brought by the luxurious residential development on the hill behind Belvedere Garden should be assessed, and hoped that they would provide a more detailed proposal to increase the service frequency of public transport in the district. He was also concerned about the latest development of the smart car park scheme (the Vice Chairman).

42. Engineer/Tsuen Wan 2 of the TD responded that the TIA of the two sites at Yau Kom Tau Village was conducted by the HyD. Relevant information would be provided after the meeting.

43. DOO(TW) of the HKPF responded that the HKPF was concerned about the traffic condition on Sha Tsui Road. In the light of the seasonal changes in the traffic condition brought about by the Lunar New Year Fair, the HKPF would see the diversion of traffic as its primary goal and deploy additional officers for law enforcement.

44. The Chairman said that the next meeting was tentatively scheduled for mid-March 2021 for discussion on the papers previously submitted by Members.

(Post-meeting note: The 8th meeting of the T&TC meeting was rescheduled to 11 March 2021.)

IX Adjournment of Meeting

45. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:02 p.m.

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat

16 March 2021