

(Translation)

Minutes of the 18th Meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (5/22-23)

Date: 31 January 2023

Time: 2:30 p.m.

Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly (Chairman)

Mr YAU Kam-ping, BBS, MH (Vice Chairman)

Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH

Mr CHAN Sung-ip, BBS, MH

Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio

Mr WONG Ka-wa

Mr KOT Siu-yuen, MH

Mr LAU Cheuk-yu

In Attendance:

Mr AU Ka-shing, Billy, JP

District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr LEE Soeng-him, Sean

Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr TANG Kwok-hung, Stephen

District Commander (Tsuen Wan) (Acting), Hong Kong Police Force

Mr CHAN Kwok-ho

Assistant District Commander (Crime) (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force

Mr FUNG Chi-ho, Eric

Police Community Relations Officer (Tsuen Wan), Hong Kong Police Force

Ms WONG Siu-fan, Phoebe

District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing), Social Welfare Department

Ms HO Mun-yee, Money

District Lands Officer/Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing), Lands Department

Mr YU Hok-chi, Raymond

Administrative Assistant/Lands (District Lands Office, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing) (Acting), Lands Department

Mr MOK Ka-sing, Mark

Chief Transport Officer/NT South West, Transport Department

Mrs LAI CHAN Wai-fan, Clara

Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan), Housing Department

Mr HUNG Sai-kit

District Environmental Hygiene Superintendent (Tsuen Wan), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr HO Kai-ho, Stanley

Chief Engineer/West 4, Civil Engineering and Development Department

Ms LIM Ting-ting, Sylvia

Chief Leisure Manager (New Territories West), Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Ms LO Man-nin, Patty

Deputy District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan) District Support, Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Miss CHAN Pui-ying	Chief School Development Officer (Tsuen Wan & Kwai Tsing), Education Bureau
Mr LIM Kuen (Secretary)	Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office
Miss LEUNG Tsz-wai, Apple	Executive Officer I (District Council), Tsuen Wan District Office

For discussion of item 2:

Mr CHAN Pak-woon	Senior School Development Officer (Tsuen Wan)2, Education Bureau
------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------

For discussion of item 3:

Mr WU Kwok-yuen, Jacky, JP	Head of the Sustainable Lantau Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr IP Wai-man, Raymond	Deputy Head of the Sustainable Lantau Office (Works), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms CHENG Nga-see, Ellen	Chief Engineer/Lantau 4, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms KUN Ka-yin, April	Assistant Director of Planning/Territorial, Planning Department
Mr NG Kim-wai	Chief Town Planner/Studies and Research 2, Planning Department
Mr SZE Wang-cho, James	Project Manager (P&E Study), Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited
Ms Carmen CHU	Project Manager (Transport Infrastructure), Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited
Ms Theresa YEUNG	Deputy Project Manager (Planning), Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited
Dr LEUNG Kam-shing	Team Leader (Town Planning), Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited

For discussion of item 4:

Ms LIN Kit-mei, Flora	Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Assessment & Noise)3, Environmental Protection Department
Mr LUI King-piu, Bill	Assistant Environmental Protection Officer (Assessment & Noise)32, Environmental Protection Department
Mr CHEUNG Kai-cheung, Henry	Senior Engineer 2/Tsuen Wan Road, Highways Department
Mr CHAN Yee-hing, Paul	Engineer/Tsuen Wan 1, Transport Department

Action

I Opening Remarks and Introduction

The Chairman welcomed Members and representatives from government departments to the 18th meeting of the Tsuen Wan District Council (TWDC), and introduced:

- (1) Mr HO Kai-ho, Stanley, Chief Engineer/West 4, Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD), who attended the meeting for the

first time and replaced Ms LIU Tze-kwan, Fiona, Chief Engineer/West 2 to attend future meetings; and

- (2) Ms LO Man-nin, Patty, Deputy District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan) District Support, Leisure and Cultural Services Department, who attended this meeting on behalf of Ms LEE Mei-sheung, Dickie, District Leisure Manager (Tsuen Wan).

2. The Chairman reminded Members that according to sections 17(1) and 27 of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders (the “Standing Orders”), any Member who wished to move a motion or ask any question at a meeting of the Council was required to give the Secretary a notice in writing ten clear working days before the meeting. Thus, he reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 28 March 2023 and the deadline for submission of papers was 13 March 2023. In addition, according to section 28 of the Standing Orders, unless otherwise agreed by the Chairman, Members could only speak once on each agenda item at the meeting and each Member could speak up to 1.5 minutes. A maximum of five Members could speak on each agenda item. If more than five Members spoke on an agenda item, he would shorten the speaking time of each Member. The Member(s) who had submitted a paper would have 2 minutes to give an introduction and 1.5 minutes to draw a conclusion. The representatives of the departments would have up to 2 minutes to give a response.

II Item 1: Confirmation of Minutes of the 17th Meeting held on 29.11.2022

3. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had received one proposed amendment from Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio prior to this meeting. The proposed amendment was set out as follows:

- (1) he proposed that in lines 1 to 3 of paragraph 21 of the minutes of the 17th meeting held on 29 November 2022, “他認為青衣至大嶼山連接路落成後，可能會將一部分原先經荃灣路前往市區的車輛，分流至經屯門或元朗的道路前往市區。” (He opined that upon the completion of Tsing Yi – Lantau Link (TYLL), some of the vehicles travelling to urban areas via Tsuen Wan Road originally might be diverted to travel via the roads in Tuen Mun or Yuen Long when heading towards urban areas.) should be amended as “他留意到剛才路政署官員簡介時指此項工程計劃會對荃灣路的交通有正面作用，他懷疑興建青衣至大嶼山連接路之類的基建可能會將一部分由屯門或元朗原先經荃灣路前往市區的車輛，分流至經這些新建的公路。” (He noticed that officials from the Highways Department (HyD) had just made remarks about the positive effect on the traffic on Tsuen Wan Road brought about by the captioned project in their presentation. He supposed the construction of infrastructures such as TYLL might divert some of the vehicles travelling from Tuen Mun or Yuen Long to urban areas via Tsuen Wan Road originally to these newly constructed highways.)

4. The Chairman enquired whether Members would like to immediately put forth proposed amendments. No Member immediately put forth a proposed amendment.

5. The Chairman enquired whether Members endorsed the minutes and the relevant proposed amendment. Members unanimously endorsed the minutes and the relevant proposed amendment.

III Item 2: Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meetings

(A) Paragraphs 57 to 67 of the Minutes of the Meeting held on 29 November 2022: Request for Improvement to the Security, Environment and Facilities of Three Primary Schools in Lei Muk Shue Estate, Tsuen Wan

6. The Chairman stated that the paper of the captioned matter under the Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meeting was submitted by him. He thus asked the Vice Chairman to take over the chair temporarily.

7. The Acting Chairman said that the representatives from the departments responsible for giving responses were:

- (1) Miss CHAN Pui-ying, Chief School Development Officer (Tsuen Wan & Kwai Tsing) (CSDO(TW&KwT)), Education Bureau (EDB);
- (2) Mr CHAN Pak-woon, Senior School Development Officer (Tsuen Wan)², EDB;
- (3) Mrs LAI CHAN Wai-fan, Clara, Chief Manager/Management (Wong Tai Sin, Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan) (CM/M(WT&T)) Housing Department (HD); and
- (4) Mr TANG Kwok-hung, Stephen, District Commander (Tsuen Wan) (Acting) (DC(TW) (Atg.)), Hong Kong Police Force (HKPF).

8. CSDO(TW&KwT) of the EDB responded as follows:

- (1) schools were responsible for the maintenance of school premises. They should carry out routine inspection to school buildings and proceed with necessary actions in a timely manner with a view to keeping such buildings in good condition. At present, the EDB assisted aided schools in handling large-scale or complex school premises repair and improvement works through the annual Major Repairs (MR) and Emergency Repairs (ER) mechanisms. Aided schools were eligible to apply for grants to carry out repair works through the aforementioned mechanisms if the cost of repair works exceeded \$3,000 (for aided primary and special schools) or \$8,000 (for aided secondary schools). When the EDB considered the allocation of funding for taking forward the repair requests submitted by schools, priority would be accorded to necessary works items concerning safety, health, sanitation or statutory requirements; other proposed works items requiring repair or improvement would also be considered for approval. The EDB had issued a call circular in May 2022, inviting schools to submit applications for grants to carry out MR works in the 2023-24 financial year. These applications were being processed and the results would be announced in April this year. If schools found any damage to school facilities, including works items that had been proposed under the MR exercise but not yet approved, they could apply for ER according to the established mechanism. As to repair works costing less than \$3,000 (for aided primary and special schools) or \$8,000 (for aided secondary schools), schools could arrange the repair

works themselves and charge the expenditure to the “School and Class Grant” account under the “Operating Expenses Block Grant”;

- (2) the EDB had just received a draft document from the HD prior to this meeting on the use of flagstaffs located off campus by schools. The EDB would maintain liaison with the HD regarding this document and follow up on the said matters. If the three primary schools in Lei Muk Shue Estate were confirmed to be the exclusive users of the flagstaffs in question, the EDB would further follow up on matters related to the maintenance of the flagstaffs. In regard to the application for the relocation and addition of flagstaffs from a primary school, the EDB would continue to be in touch with the relevant departments and take appropriate follow-up actions;
- (3) concerning the issue of school security facilities, the engineering consultancy commissioned by the EDB had conducted a preliminary enquiry with the schools about the situation and would hold meetings with the three primary schools respectively on 31 January 2023 to discuss matters related to enhancing the security facilities (including the applications and follow-up arrangements for ER works such as the installation of anti-theft grilles and fences);
- (4) regarding the issue of paint peeling off from the exterior walls of a school, the EDB had followed up with the school, and the relevant works were in progress; and
- (5) as to the problem of insufficient electricity supply reported by a school, the school had clarified that it only wanted to increase the number of socket outlets in the staff room, and there was no shortage of power supply. The EDB had advised the school to submit applications for MR works as necessary.

9. CM/M(WT&T) of the HD responded as follows:

- (1) during the on-site inspection on 21 December 2022, the principals of the three primary schools had requested for carrying out improvement works. The HD had completed the improvement works concerned in the public areas of the housing estate on 3 January 2023, including installing anti-theft barbed wire coils on the roof of the pump room next to Ho Shun Primary School (Sponsored by Sik Sik Yuen) and resurfacing the pavements near the fire gate at Block 5 with Besser blocks;
- (2) in order to delineate the responsibility for repairing the flagstaffs in question, the HD, after seeking legal advice, had drafted a permit authorising schools to use the flagstaffs independently and had forwarded the draft to the EDB. The HD would maintain close liaison with the EDB to follow up on the arrangements; and
- (3) the HD’s contractor for tree maintenance services had inspected the trees in Lei Muk Shue Estate (including those located around the schools) on 12 January and 18 January 2023. All trees had been found to be in good health condition upon inspection.

10. DC(TW) (Atg.) of the HKPF responded as follows:
- (1) as a school in Lei Muk Shue Estate had been burgled, the HKPF had sent officers from the Tsuen Wan Police District and New Territories South Regional Crime Prevention Office to inspect the security facilities in the school premises together with the principals of the three primary schools in Lei Muk Shue Estate in November 2022;
 - (2) on 21 December 2022, the HKPF, jointly with the EDB, HD and Members, had conducted on-site inspections at the three primary schools in Lei Muk Shue Estate and had provided the schools with security advice, such as increasing the height of the fences, retrofitting strands of razor wire and setting up CCTV systems to enhance the overall security level of the schools; and
 - (3) the HKPF would continue to provide the schools with advice on the installation of additional security facilities so as to ensure that the works items met the security requirements. The HKPF would continue to work with the TWDC to follow up on the matters concerned.

11. Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly said that the school premises of the three primary schools in Lei Muk Shue Estate were all in a so-called “matchbox-style” design and located near the slopes. As the facilities in the school premises were vastly decrepit, security issues might arise easily. He thanked Members and the government departments for conducting on-site inspections together at the schools concerned and was pleased to learn that progress had been made in the relevant follow-up work. He pointed out that since the flagstaff of S.K.H. Chu Oi Primary School (Lei Muk Shue) was out of order, the national flag could not be raised and lowered along the flagstaff properly. Not only would it require the school staff to climb up to a dangerous position to adjust the national flag, but it would also hinder the school from fulfilling the obligations stipulated in the National Flag and National Emblem Ordinance. He thus urged the departments concerned to promptly delineate the responsibility for repairing the flagstaffs. He noted that the HD had drafted a permit which authorised schools to be the independent users of the flagstaffs and had passed the draft to the EDB. He advised the relevant departments to grant permits to the three schools at the same time or to the school with the malfunctioned flagstaff first so that the EDB could repair the flagstaff for the affected school as soon as possible. He was also glad to hear that the EDB was following up on the problem of paint peeling off from the exterior walls of Ho Shun Primary School (Sponsored by Sik Sik Yuen). Besides, he urged the relevant departments to expeditiously commence the fence heightening works for the schools so as to reduce the security risks of the three primary schools. He understood that it took time for such works to complete, and even if schools applied to the EDB for the ER grant, full funding might not be granted right away. He hoped that the EDB would exercise discretion to provide the schools with appropriate assistance. In addition, he urged the EDB to promptly install additional socket outlets for Lei Muk Shue Catholic Primary School as well as to resurface the roof of the school. He said that the problem of concrete spalling from the ceiling of that primary school was acute. If only small-scale patch up works were carried out, water might still leak through the ceiling on rainy days, thereby leading to the recurrence of the dangerous situation of concrete spalling. Therefore, he opined that the entire roof should be resurfaced instead of carrying out small-scale patch up works only. He hoped that the departments concerned would

continue to follow up proactively and maintain close liaison with the schools to assist them in creating a safe teaching and learning environment.

12. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that he attended the meetings between the three primary schools in Lei Muk Shue Estate and the HD every year, but the HD and relevant departments had indicated in every meeting that there was very little they could do to solve the problems encountered by the schools. He pointed out that he had written to the Tsuen Wan District Office (TWDO) four years ago to relay the problem of malfunctioned flagstaffs in schools, but it had not been properly addressed. Although the EDB stated that the school had already complied with the relevant guidelines drawn up by the EDB in terms of raising the national flag, the school still hoped that the matter concerned would be further handled in a proper manner. He thus requested to continue the discussion on the captioned item under the Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meeting at the next meeting. Incidentally, he said that he had contacted the CEDD through the HD regarding the issue of large rocks falling from the slopes near the schools, but no reply was received. He knew that the CEDD would carry out maintenance works for the slopes every few years, but the slopes near Ho Shun Primary School (Sponsored by Sik Sik Yuen) and S.K.H. Chu Oi Primary School (Lei Muk Shue) were not included. Ho Shun Primary School (Sponsored by Sik Sik Yuen) worried that the large rocks falling from the slope would break through the fence and cause injuries to teachers and students. He urged the relevant departments to draw up a timetable for the maintenance of the slopes near the three primary schools or to contact the schools for better understanding of the situation. He also welcomed the departments to contact Members to collect views.

13. The Acting Chairman opined that if the relevant departments could submit and implement the timetable for the maintenance of the flagstaffs, there was no need to continue the discussion on the captioned item under the Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meeting.

14. Mr WONG Ka-wa agreed and urged the departments concerned to implement the timetable for repairing the flagstaffs as soon as possible. If no progress was made on the relevant issues after three months, he would submit the paper again.

15. CSDO(TW&KwT) of the EDB responded as follows:

- (1) the EDB was aware that S.K.H. Chu Oi Primary School (Lei Muk Shue) had a removable flagstaff for flag-raising for the time being. If the school was confirmed to be the exclusive user of the flagstaff in question, the EDB would repair the malfunctioned flagstaff for the school expeditiously. The EDB had received the permit drafted by the HD on the day of the meeting and would require some time to study the content. The EDB would reply to the HD as soon as possible and hoped that the HD would process the permits for the three primary schools in Lei Muk Shue Estate in the meantime. The EDB learned that the flagstaff of S.K.H. Chu Oi Primary School (Lei Muk Shue) had been damaged during the summer holiday in 2022 and had been closely following up on the matter; and

- (2) if Lei Muk Shue Catholic Primary School had already lodged an application under the annual MR exercise for the problem of concrete spalling from the ceiling, the result of the application would be announced in April this year. When the EDB considered the allocation of funding for taking forward the repair requests submitted by schools, priority would be accorded to necessary works items concerning safety, health, sanitation or statutory requirements. Therefore, the repair works for the malfunctioned flagstaffs would be prioritised. Being deeply concerned about the issue of malfunctioned flagstaffs and attaching great importance to national education in schools and students' safety, the EDB would closely follow up on the related matters.

16. CM/M(WT&T) of the HD responded as follows:

- (1) the HD had forwarded the draft documents of the aforementioned permit to the EDB. If the EDB had no comments, the HD would promptly issue permits to the three primary schools concerned at the same time;
- (2) according to the arrangement of repair or alteration works laid down by the HD and the EDB for estate aided schools, the HD would no longer undertake major and emergency repair works on the relevant school premises since 1 April 2014. The areas within the fences of which heightening works were requested by the three schools were for the exclusive use of the three schools respectively; and
- (3) the HD would continue to cooperate with the EDB in carrying out the relevant works and would closely follow up on the maintenance of the slopes near the schools.

17. The Acting Chairman said that if the schools had submitted applications to the EDB for the repair works on the rooftop, they might need to wait until the summer holidays to commence the works. The Acting Chairman asked the departments concerned to follow up on the progress of each works item after the meeting.

18. The Chairman resumed the chair.

IV Item 3: Kau Yi Chau Artificial Islands
(TWDC Paper No. 47/22-23)

19. The CEDD and Planning Department (PlanD) briefed Members on the preliminary proposals for four aspects of the Kau Yi Chau Artificial Islands (KYCAI) under the Study on the Artificial Islands in the Central Waters, namely, the reclamation extent, broad land use, strategic transport infrastructure and possible financing options. The representatives from the departments and consultancy responsible for giving responses were:

- (1) Mr WU Kwok-yuen, Jacky, JP, Head of the Sustainable Lantau Office (HSLO), CEDD;
- (2) Mr IP Wai-man, Raymond, Deputy Head of the Sustainable Lantau Office(Works) (DHSLO(W)), CEDD;
- (3) Ms CHENG Nga-see, Ellen, Chief Engineer/Lantau 4 (CE/L4), CEDD;
- (4) Ms KUN Ka-yin, April, Assistant Director of Planning/Territorial (ADP/T), PlanD;

- (5) Mr NG Kim-wai, Chief Town Planner/Studies and Research 2 (CTP/S&R2), PlanD;
- (6) Mr SZE Wang-cho, James, Project Manager (P&E Study), Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited (OAP);
- (7) Ms Carmen CHU, Project Manager (Transport Infrastructure), OAP;
- (8) Ms Theresa YEUNG, Deputy Project Manager (Planning), OAP; and
- (9) Dr LEUNG Kam-shing, Team Leader (Town Planning), OAP.

20. HSLO and CE/L4 of the CEDD and CTP/S&R2 of the PlanD introduced the paper.

21. Mr CHAN Sung-ip said that a promising vision was outlined for the public in the planning and design of the project. Being sufficiently equipped with land transport facilities, the KYCAI could accommodate a sizeable population. He was concerned about the impacts of the construction of Island A and Island B on the surrounding waters. He also pointed out that the location in question was currently an anchorage area. Many leisure boats and cargo vessels would travel past this area. Also, noise would be generated from the loading/unloading activities of vessels at night and during the small hours. It was similar to the current situation of the waters off the Tsuen Wan waterfront where leisure boats were berthed. He thus recommended considering the relocation of the anchorage area to minimise the potential impacts on nearby residents, thereby building a beautiful and liveable artificial island for the public to reside.

22. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio opined that despite the fact that the departments concerned had drawn reference from the latest data and made a conservative estimate of the land sales revenue, which was mentioned in paragraph 25 of the paper, it was still an over-optimistic estimate. He pointed out the drop in the Centa-City Leading Index from 170.39 in February 2019 to 156.77 in December 2022. He was worried that the index reflected the continuation of the downward trend in property prices, and enquired whether the estimate of the land sales revenue set out in the paper was a sound calculation. He said that the tendering of government land sale sites had been unsuccessful for more than one occasion in recent days. Also, the valuation of a commercial site in Mong Kok (at the junction of Sai Yee Street and Argyle Street), of which the tendering had recently commenced, had even plummeted 40%. The situation was worrying. He hoped that the departments concerned would explain the estimated land sales revenue of the project in further detail. Besides, he was concerned about the financing options of the project. He pointed out that it was indicated in the preliminary cost estimate of the three-runway system at the Hong Kong International Airport that the issuance of bonds had only accounted for a small proportion of the funding sources. However, the amount of bonds issued had increased subsequently. He said that having issued bonds, the Government should repay bondholders the principal and pay them interest in the future. He was worried that the Government might run into financial difficulties because of this practice, and enquired whether the proportion of bonds issued under this project would also increase in the future.

23. Mr WONG Ka-wa suggested that when developing large-scale projects, the Government should draw reference from the experience of developing Tsuen Wan or

add elements of Tsuen Wan to the projects. Moreover, he said that although the Government had adopted an innovative approach to develop Ma Wan back then, this area was still poorly served by public transport compared to urban areas. The population of Ma Wan would gradually increase following the forthcoming implementation of development projects of a relatively large scale in Ma Wan. He suggested that the Government should design a railway system for Ma Wan in order to complement the KYCAI which would undergo long-term development in the plan. Besides, he opined that the project would have negative impacts on fisheries. The livelihood of fishermen would be adversely affected by the dredging works in the waters concerned. Also, the amount of compensation might not meet the needs of fishermen. As such, he suggested that the departments concerned should take into account the impacts of the project on fisheries when carrying out an environmental impact assessment (EIA), and should prevent the same planning blunder which resulted in the berthing of vessels in the waters off Belvedere Garden, Tsuen Wan.

24. Mr LAU Cheuk-yu said the paper showed that the estimated construction cost of the project was about \$580 billion and the land sales revenue was around \$750 billion. He considered the yield too low. The debts eventually had to be borne by the next generation. Also, there had been frequent cost overruns in the Government's construction projects in the past. He thus enquired whether the departments concerned could ensure that this project would not incur a cost overrun and would be profitable. He said that Hong Kong had budget surpluses during the British Hong Kong era. However, construction projects financed by cumulative loans and incurred mounting debts had been implemented in Hong Kong ever since its return to the motherland. He advised the departments concerned to revise the estimate. Besides, pointing out that the project advocated environmental protection and encouraged residents to travel by bicycle, he enquired about the ways to strike a balance between protecting the environment and generating transport revenue.

25. Mr MAN Yu-ming said he supported increasing the supply of land in Hong Kong by reclamation besides the development of existing sites. Although the KYCAI would be connected with a railway system and a trunk route, the traffic and pedestrian flow from the KYCAI would have certain impacts on Tsuen Wan due to its close proximity to the district. Hence, he hoped that the departments concerned would further explain the traffic impacts on Tsuen Wan district brought about by the project. Besides, while supporting the development of the third Central Business District (CBD3) of Hong Kong, he enquired about the relation and differentiation of roles between the CBD3 and Northern Metropolis. In his opinion, resource wastage caused by the overlapping of functions between these two areas should be prevented. He also suggested enhancing the transparency of the project so that the public could access more information on it. Furthermore, he pointed out that the project would commence in 2024, but the first batch of residential developments would only be ready for population intake in 2033 at the earliest. He was disappointed at the long construction time. He said it was mentioned in the Chief Executive's 2022 Policy Address that the Government placed emphasis on the belief of enhancing the speed and efficiency in the housing policies. He therefore suggested that the development period should be shortened. He opined that the longer the construction time of a major project, the greater the uncertainty and risk. Hence, he recommended compressing the construction time of the infrastructure in order to minimise the risk

and promptly supply the market with a large number of residential flats. Finally, he said that if the Government issued bonds to raise funds, it should settle the debts in the future. He thus suggested that prudent consideration should be given to the proportions of the issuance of bonds, public-private participation and sale of land in the funding sources. In his opinion, the public would have greater confidence in the project if more relevant information could be made available to them.

26. The Chairman said that as this project involved Sunny Bay of Tsuen Wan district, he was concerned about the potential environmental impacts on Sunny Bay (e.g. the water quality) brought about by the related construction works. He urged the departments concerned to handle the matters carefully in order to forestall adverse impacts on the environment and daily life of the residents at Sunny Bay. In addition, he was concerned about the expenditure of the project. He said that the total construction cost had not been clearly set out yet. In his opinion, making adjustments to the construction cost repeatedly based on the market prices was undesirable. He also enquired when the exact expenditure would be announced. Moreover, as a relatively large number of bonds would be issued under the project, the interest payable would be enormous. He was worried that the next generation would have to bear the interest accrued in the future, and had reservations over the project expenditure. He pointed out that the public-private participation approach was currently adopted in the operation of several tunnels in Hong Kong. It meant that having helped construct a tunnel, a private organisation had the right to operate the tunnel within a specified franchise period. The Government could only regain the control of the tunnel after many years. He was worried that if the public-private participation approach was adopted to raise funds, the control of the project would fall into the hands of major consortiums. The consortiums could obtain valuable land resources to make profits simply by paying a trifling sum and using a few resources. As such, he urged the Government to prudently consider various financing options and implement cost-effective projects for the people of Hong Kong. He also cast doubt on the necessity of such kind of large-scale construction projects.

27. Mr KOT Siu-yuen said he supported the project. He held that the project could help solve the land and housing supply problems in Hong Kong. He commented that the number of residential flats tentatively proposed for the KYCAI was smaller than his expectation. Citing Sentosa, a major entertainment attraction in Singapore, as an example, he suggested that the working, residential, as well as leisure and entertainment sites should be concentrated in certain areas of the three artificial islands respectively during the planning stage, with a view to enabling more effective and efficient use of the land resources. Besides, he took Youth Square in Chai Wan as an example. He proposed adding youth elements to the CBD3 of the KYCAI and providing more gathering venues for young people from the New Territories or even across Hong Kong. He also suggested that a youth hostel should be constructed on the KYCAI.

28. The Vice Chairman said that the reclamation project could boost the supply of land. He also pointed out that the development of Tsuen Wan district had also relied on the levelling of mountains and reclamation. He opined that the construction of infrastructure could increase the working population, and believed that Government was capable of solving the issues related to the financing options.

29. HSLO of the CEDD responded as follows:
- (1) over the past ten legislative years between 2012 and 2022, the final accounts of a total of 535 Category A projects had been settled and the total expenditure was about \$151 billion. It was 90% of the original approved project estimate (\$169 billion or so). It could be seen that in general, the public works projects could be completed within the approved project estimate although some individual projects should apply for additional funding to the Finance Committee;
 - (2) generally speaking, the Government's objective of implementing public works projects was not to generate revenue. The development of the KYCAI would bring about substantial social and economic benefits to Hong Kong. Such benefits of the project could be shown in the first batch of population intake of residential flats in 2033. It was estimated that upon full development of the KYCAI, the economic activities could annually generate a value added of about \$200 billion for Hong Kong, accounting for about 7% of the gross domestic product. Besides, the provision of public housing as well as quality strategic roads and railways for the public would bring social and economic benefits;
 - (3) as the project was still under study at the moment, the CEDD was unable to work out a detailed cost estimate. The CEDD had prepared an estimate according to the prices in September 2018. Upon making adjustments solely based on the civil-engineering-related indexes, the total construction cost was roughly estimated at about \$580 billion in the second quarter of 2022. Nearly 30% of the budget would be spent on the reclamation works of the KYCAI; about 20% on the construction of infrastructure of the KYCAI; and the remaining 50% or so on the development of strategic transport infrastructure. The CEDD would continue to take forth the study. It wished to work out a more specific cost estimate during the detailed project design stage and ground investigation in 2024. The CEDD also planned to submit funding application for the reclamation works to the Legislative Council in 2025. It would be able to provide more precise information on the construction cost at that time;
 - (4) the CEDD noted Members' views on the financing options. Hong Kong had the advantage as an international financial centre. He wished to harness the collective wisdom in the study at the next stage to formulate suitable financing options;
 - (5) a number of existing anchorage areas would be affected by the project. In view of Hong Kong's position as a maritime centre, the CEDD would properly relocate and re-provision anchorage areas according to the transport demand. It would also make every effort to re-provision the anchorage areas near their original locations;
 - (6) the Government was considering zoning a site in Ma Wan for private housing development. Currently, the CEDD was conducting an engineering feasibility study on this housing project. It would also examine the traffic issues of Ma Wan together with the departments

concerned including the HyD and Transport Department (TD). Consideration would be given to an array of related factors such as the transport demand, engineering feasibility and cost-effectiveness. The CEDD would report on the results of the study to the TWDC in a timely manner;

- (7) the CEDD noted that Members wished to speed up the construction progress. The CEDD stated that according to the current schedule of the project, it was expected to take only four and a half years to progress from the study stage to the construction stage. It would be faster than the reclamation project in Tung Chung East, which had taken six years to progress from the planning stage to the construction stage; and
- (8) the CEDD was conducting an EIA for the project, and would propose suitable measures to minimise the impacts of the works on the surroundings of Tsuen Wan and Sunny Bay.

30. DHSLO(W) of the CEDD responded as follows:

- (1) the CEDD was conducting an EIA at the moment, and would ensure that the project would comply with the requirements of the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance. The CEDD would also draw up suitable mitigation measures to minimise impacts on fisheries; and
- (2) the Government would support the fishermen affected by the reclamation works of the KYCAI on various fronts. For example, it would explore the incorporation of cultural and tourism elements of outlying islands into the planning of the KYCAI, such as setting up a fisherman's wharf, in order to provide fisheries with an opportunity for upgrading and restructuring; review the mechanism for granting ex-gratia allowances to the affected fishermen; and increase the overall competitiveness of fisheries through the Sustainable Fisheries Development Fund.

31. ADP/T of the PlanD responded as follows:

- (1) the KYCAI and Northern Metropolis, which were mentioned in the final recommendations of the Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030 announced in 2021, were two of the possible solution spaces to be available in the medium- to long-term that mainly served to increase land supply for Hong Kong in the future and meet the medium- and long-term development needs of the territory. The two development projects also dovetailed with the national strategies including the 14th Five-Year Plan, the Guangdong-Hong Kong-Macao Greater Bay Area development and the Belt and Road Initiative, which had injected continuous impetus to the growth of Hong Kong and supported the development of the "eight centres" in Hong Kong;
- (2) these two development projects, the KYCAI and Northern Metropolis, had their own unique positioning. With its close proximity to the existing Metro Area, the KYCAI would extend the advantage of the Harbour Metropolis and further reinforce Hong Kong's position as

Asia's World City and an international financial centre. The KYCAI would act as one of the core engines for driving economic development in the future. On the other hand, the Northern Metropolis adjoined Shenzhen. With its unique geographical advantage, the Northern Metropolis would contribute to the development of Hong Kong and Shenzhen. Hence, the Government planned to develop the Northern Metropolis into an international innovation and technology hub, creating new impetus for the development of Hong Kong; and

- (3) the PlanD noted Members' views on refining the planning and adding youth elements to the project. It would further consider the demand for introducing youth facilities during the study on the detailed design at the next stage.

32. CTP/S&R2 of the PlanD responded as follows:

- (1) the CEDD would continue to study and refine the land uses within the CBD3, such as exploring the feasibility of introducing emerging industries and youth creative industries, in order to create more employment and start-up opportunities for young people on the KYCAI;
- (2) the residential sites would be apportioned between public housing and private housing at a ratio of 70:30 by the PlanD preliminarily. The provision of youth hostels in public housing would not be ruled out at the current stage. The PlanD would continue to study the supply of different types of public housing; and
- (3) in order to strike a balance between the liveability and endeavour to make optimum use of land, the PlanD tentatively proposed reserving around a quarter of the 1 000-hectare KYCAI, i.e. 250 hectares, for residential purposes. These residential sites could accommodate a population of 500 000 to 550 000 people, i.e. around 50 000 to 55 000 people per square kilometre. The development density was not low compared to other New Development Areas.

33. The Chairman summarised the discussion. He pointed out the great concern of Members over the financial arrangements of the development project. For instance, they were concerned that a heavy financial burden might fall on the people of Hong Kong due to cost overruns of the project. Thus, he advised the departments concerned to prudently consider the expenditures, financing options and development scale of the project. Also, Members were concerned about the potential impacts of the project on the ecosystem, fisheries and operation of the anchorage areas. They also proposed increasing the provision of facilities on the KYCAI. The Chairman urged the departments concerned to take into account Members' views at the detailed study stage.

(Note: Mr WONG Ka-wa left the meeting at 3:43 p.m.)

V Item 4: Request for Prompt Provision of Noise Barriers Along the City Point Section of Tsuen Wan Road Before the Commencement of Its Widening Works

(TWDC Paper No. 48/22-23)

34. The Chairman said that Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio submitted the paper. The representatives from the departments responsible for giving responses were:

- (1) Mr CHEUNG Kai-cheung, Henry, Senior Engineer 2/Tsuen Wan Road (SE 2/TWR), HyD
- (2) Mr CHAN Yee-hing, Paul, Engineer/Tsuen Wan 1, TD
- (3) Ms LIN Kit-mei, Flora, Senior Environmental Protection Officer (Assessment & Noise)³, Environmental Protection Department (EPD)
- (4) Mr LUI King-piu, Bill, Assistant Environmental Protection Officer (Assessment & Noise)³², EPD

Besides, the written reply of the HyD was tabled at the meeting.

35. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio introduced the paper.

36. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio said that he had all along been concerning about the progress of the Widening of Tsuen Wan Road. Some residents of City Point told him that they suffered from noise nuisance as the windows of their flats faced towards Tsuen Wan Road. He thus proposed a prompt provision of noise barriers so as to reduce the noise impact on the residents. The HyD mentioned in its written reply that it would consult the TWDC on the measures of noise mitigation. He enquired about the details of the noise mitigation measures and whether those measures included the construction of noise barriers. He pointed out that residents had been longing for the construction of noise barriers on Tsuen Wan Road by the government. If the department chose to adopt other noise abatement measures in the end, those measures must be effective and feasible. Besides, he suggested that the HyD and the TD should, under the Widening of Tsuen Wan Road, handle the issue related to the connection between City Point and MTR Tsuen Wan West Station by constructing a boardwalk in lieu of a footbridge. He also voiced concern over the situation where the space under the flyover at Tsuen Wan Road was left idle for too long that homeless persons placed miscellaneous articles thereat and caused the problem of rodent infestation. He hoped that such problems would be properly resolved as soon as possible.

37. Mr CHAN Sung-ip said that the TWDC had repeatedly discussed the Widening of Tsuen Wan Road, but the roadworks concerned had not yet been carried out. He agreed that the proposed widening works for Tsuen Wan Road should be commenced without delay so as to improve the traffic conditions along Texaco Road. In addition, he hoped that noise barriers could be constructed promptly to reduce the impact of noise nuisance on nearby residents. He urged the relevant departments to expeditiously fix the commencement date for the widening works.

38. SE 2/TWR of the HyD responded as follows:

- (1) The HyD had substantially completed the investigation and various technical assessments for the Widening of Tsuen Wan Road and had drawn up a preliminary project proposal. The HyD planned to consult the Traffic and Transport Committee under the TWDC on this proposal in February this year;

- (2) as for the construction of noise barriers, the HyD had been in communication with the EPD on the EIA during the investigation and study stage. Based on the result of the EIA, the HyD would recommend appropriate noise mitigation measures, including retrofitting noise barriers and surfacing the roads with low-noise materials; and
- (3) the HyD had been maintaining communication with the TD on the traffic demand of the relevant roads when formulating the preliminary project proposal.

39. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio said that the residents had been suffering from the serious noise nuisance generated from illegal road racing and goods vehicles travelling in the small hours for a long time. He urged the HyD to construct noise barriers as soon as possible so as to effectively resolve the noise problem.

40. The Chairman urged the departments concerned to consider Members' views and strive for an early commencement of the related works under the Widening of Tsuen Wan Road, including taking the suggestion of constructing noise barriers into consideration.

VI Item 5: Crime Brief for Tsuen Wan District – Comparison of Crime Statistics between October to November 2022 and October to November 2021
(TWDC Paper No. 49/22-23)

41. DC(TW) (Atg.) and Assistant District Commander (Crime) (Tsuen Wan) (ADC(C)(TW)) of the HKPF briefed Members on the crime situation of Tsuen Wan district.

42. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio said that late-night unloading activities were frequent at the vegetable and fruit shops near San Tsuen Street, Chuen Lung Street and Ho Pui Street. The unloading activities would usually start from 10:00 p.m. and last until 3:00 a.m. or so, causing persistent noise nuisance to nearby residents. He had sent several letters concerning this problem to the HKPF. Noting that the Police had given advice and warnings to people generating the noise, he hoped that the Police would continue to follow up on and properly handle the problem in order to minimise the noise impact on residents of nearby housing estates (e.g. Vision City). Moreover, he pointed out a noise problem caused by false intruder alarms which were often triggered at two shops in Tsuen Wan town centre. He had reported the incident of false intruder alarm at one of those shops to the Police and followed up on the case together with the Police. He suggested that the Police should give advice to operators of shops at which false intruder alarms were repeatedly triggered, thereby reducing the wastage of police resources deployed to handle these false alarms. Moreover, he had found that some workers, who appeared to be the cleaning contractors engaged by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD), would place trolleys in front of a shop from around 9:00 p.m. to 10:00 p.m. He suspected that this was the cause of false intruder alarms at the shop in question. A false intruder alarm would last about 15 minutes. If it went off in the small hours, nearby residents would have to suffer from a serious noise disturbance. He thus urged the FEHD to remind its cleaning contractors to avoid placing any objects outside shop entrances. He also advised the Police to remind the shop operators

concerned to put up notices stating that their intruder alarms were relatively sensitive. It could therefore prevent false alarms triggered by a pedestrian or an object being too close to the intruder alarms. He was willing to liaise with the Police Community Relations Office in order to provide it with further information in this regard.

43. The Chairman stated that the village houses close to the hillsides on Wo Yi Hop Road had been frequently burgled in recent years. A household in this area had suffered a loss of about \$200,000 in the latest burglary. He hoped that the Police would step up the patrols in the area. He also urged the departments concerned to install additional lighting systems and remove miscellaneous objects there, preventing wrongdoers from taking advantage of the geographical location. He suggested that the officers of the Crime Prevention Bureau of the Police should meet the victims of the burglaries and discuss with them the ways to enhance the security of the area in question. Besides, the public were concerned about an arson case involving two teenagers which had taken place in Lei Muk Shue Estate earlier. The youth arsonists were totally unaware of the dire consequences of arson, which might inflict heavy casualties. He held that apart from the Police's enforcement actions, the Social Welfare Department (SWD) and schools should also redouble their efforts in youth education so that young people would realise that arson was an extremely serious offence. Additionally, he pointed out that the problems of illegal gambling and illicit cigarettes smuggling were rampant in Tsuen Wan district, and urged the Police to strengthen the enforcement work. He said that he had referred a case involving a tenant of Lei Muk Shue Estate to the HKPF. This tenant was in debt and had been harassed by a debt collector who also lived in Lei Muk Shue Estate every day. As a result, the tenant and his/her family were afraid to go home and became homeless. He wished to discuss the ways to follow up on the abovementioned situation with the Police after the meeting. Besides, a woman aged about 70 years old, who was a recipient of the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance living in Tsuen Wan district, had fallen victim to an online romance scam. Her family had sought assistance from him and told him that the elder had already lost tens of thousands dollars to the scammer. The elder still refused to believe that she had been scammed even though her family had already reported the case to the Police. In his opinion, the Police and SWD should provide more support for scam victims. Also, he suggested holding on-street exhibitions and explaining common scams to the public on the spot, thereby promoting anti-fraud information among the elderly more effectively. He hoped that the Police would carry out publicity activities in the district. He also called on Members to take part in such activities, with a view to promoting anti-fraud information and raising people's awareness against scams.

44. DC(TW) (Atg.) of the HKPF responded as follows:

- (1) having handled the complaints on metal-hammering noise in Tsuen Wan district, the HKPF had received no such complaint recently;
- (2) a noise problem was caused by the increase in loading/unloading activities of goods at shops following the resumption of economic activities in the society. The HKPF would jointly take enforcement actions with the EPD, e.g. giving advice to shop operators making late-night noise. Due to the manpower constraint, the HKPF should deploy resources to handle more pressing problems first (e.g. prevention of burglaries). Having said that, the Police would continue

to follow up on the noise problem in order to ease the noise disturbance caused to residents;

- (3) the Police's control centre would also be notified when an intruder alarm of a shop was activated. The HKPF would then send officers to investigate at the shop. The police officers would only leave the scene after the shop operator had turned off the alarm and confirmed no damage to property. The HKPF would record the numbers of false intruder alarms of shops. It would also advise operators of shops with relatively frequent false intruder alarms to arrange repairs or replace their intruder alarm service providers. While agreeing that the installation of intruder alarms was an effective measure against burglary, he did not rule out the possibility that some shop operators had adjusted the sensitivity of intruder alarms on their own, resulting in repeated false alarms and therefore wastage of police resources;
- (4) more people would dine out as the epidemic had eased. Burglars of several cases had taken advantage of residents' absence when they were away from home. In response to the recent burglaries, the HKPF had carried out anti-theft publicity to remind the public to check whether doors and windows had been securely locked before leaving home and appeal to them to refrain from keeping too many valuables at home. The HKPF advised occupants of "three-nil" buildings to install window grilles and lights next to windows as well as to draw reference from the leaflets distributed by the Police and advertisements against burglary in order to increase their anti-theft awareness. Also, the Police would step up the patrols at "three-nil" buildings;
- (5) recently, there was an upward trend in burglaries in Tsuen Wan district. Between October and November 2022, there had been a total of seven burglaries and the Police had cracked two of these cases. The overall number of burglaries from January to November 2022 recorded a year-on-year decrease of eight cases. In January 2023, about seven shops had been burgled in Tsuen Wan district. The Police had arrested three people and cracked eight burglary cases so far; and
- (6) in order to deter people from taking part in on-street gambling, the Police had previously issued penalty notices to offending gamblers according to the Prevention and Control of Disease (Prohibition on Gathering) Regulation (Cap. 599G) and related anti-epidemic measures. The Police would continue its efforts to combat on-street gambling although the anti-epidemic measures on the prohibition of group gatherings had been relaxed.

45. ADC(C)(TW) of the HKPF responded as follows:

- (1) due to changes in social culture and lifestyles, people had more opportunities to use smartphones and access the Internet. The number of online scams had increased accordingly. Most of the victims were vulnerable to online scams because they had poor family communication and craved attention. The HKPF welcomed government departments or professionals to refer scam victims to it for follow-up. The public should stay alert and should not trust strangers easily in case of detecting suspicious circumstances. They could also

tell their families about the situation and discuss with them the actions which should be taken. A person who suspected that he/she had fallen victim to a scam should immediately contact the Police for assistance; and

- (2) the youth arsonists and the elderly victim of the online romance scam lacked attention from their families as well. The parents of the young people in question should also be held accountable for their children's delinquency. The Police hoped that the departments concerned would provide appropriate support for the youth arsonists when they were on trial. The HKPF wished to provide assistance for juvenile criminals in partnership with the SWD or non-profit-making organisations. Members or government departments were also welcomed to put forth suitable proposals or channels to the HKPF with a view to helping juvenile criminals to turn a new leaf.

46. District Social Welfare Officer (Tsuen Wan/Kwai Tsing) of the SWD responded as follows:

- (1) the SWD had all along been collaborating with the Police to provide support for juvenile criminals. The SWD welcomed the Police to refer the case to it for follow-up if the young people in question and their parents agreed on the referral. Besides, the Community Support Service Scheme (CSSS) was implemented by a non-governmental organisation (NGO) in Tsuen Wan district. The CSSS aimed at providing supporting services for young people cautioned under the Police Superintendent's Discretion Scheme or those arrested. The NGO concerned could provide counselling and supporting services for the youth arsonists during their legal proceedings. The SWD would liaise with the district youth service unit to learn about the youth arsonists' case in order to provide them with suitable support. The SWD would continue to increase the law-abiding awareness of young people through various channels (e.g. online platforms, school social workers or activities held by the Integrated Children and Youth Services Centres); and
- (2) people fell victim to scams due to different reasons. After being scammed, some victims might be saddled with huge debts and required support and psychological counselling services from social workers. It was also likely that some victims were ashamed to ask for help. Hence, NGOs had set up crisis hotlines for victims to seek assistance and to provide them with counselling services. Members could contact the SWD if they learnt of any scam victims in need of counselling services.

VII Item 6: Crime Brief for Ma Wan – October to November 2022
(TWDC Paper No. 50/22-23)

47. DC(TW) (Atg.) of the HKPF briefed Members on the crime situation of Ma Wan.

VIII Item 7: Information Papers

48. Members noted the contents of the following information papers:
- (1) Report of District Planning, Development and Facilities Management Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 51/22-23);
 - (2) Report of Environment, Health and Climate Change Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 52/22-23);
 - (3) Report of Traffic and Transport Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 53/22-23); and
 - (4) Report of Social Services and Community Development Committee
(TWDC Paper No. 54/22-23).

IX Item 8: Any Other Business

49. The Chairman said that the previous terms of the TWDC had compiled reports to summarise the work and accomplishments of the Council in their respective tenures. He would discuss matters related to the preparation of the report for the current-term TWDC with the TWDO. Besides, he called on Members to contact him before the next meeting if they knew any organisations which were interested in co-organising activities under the Community Involvement Programme with the TWDC.

50. The Chairman was aware that the TWDO was actively following up on the safety issue at Tso Kung Tam. He hoped that progress would be made on the corresponding actions by the summer of 2023.

51. Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan) of the TWDO responded that the TWDO was currently carrying out the relevant improvement works at the location concerned, including replacing notice boards and repairing railings. Warning banners would be hung on the railings upon the completion of the repair works. The works were expected to be completed in the first quarter of 2023.

52. Mr KOT Siu-yuen appreciated the assistance provided by the HKPF and the FEHD during the Lunar New Year Fair, including managing crowds and maintaining order. Some citizens relayed to him that the crowd management measures had made the route towards the fair inconvenient, thus extra time had been taken for them to enter the fair. He hoped that relevant departments would properly map out the arrangements for the Lunar New Year Fair next year with a view to facilitating a smoother public access to and from the fair. He also expressed his wish for an increase in the number of stalls and the resumption of dry goods area in the fair.

(Note: Mr KOT Siu-yuen left the meeting at 4:34 p.m.)

53. The Chairman reminded Members that the date of the next meeting was 28 March 2023 and the deadline for submission of papers was 13 March 2023.