

(Translation)

Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> Meeting of Tsuen Wan District Council (1/2020)

Date: 9 January 2020

Time: 2:30 p.m.

Venue: Main Conference Room, Tsuen Wan District Office

Present:

Mr MAN Yu-ming, MH

Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris

Mr LI Hung-por

Mr SHUM Lester

Mr YAU Kam-ping, BBS, MH

Mr YICK Shing-chung, Angus

Mr LAM Sek-tim

Mr CHAN Sung-ip, MH

Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly

Ms CHAN Kim-kam

Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio

Mr WONG Ka-wa

Mr KOT Siu-yuen

Mr CHIU Yan-loy

Mr LAU Chi-hung

Mr LAU Cheuk-yu

Mr PUN Long-chung, Roy

Mr LAU Jackson

Mr TSE Man-chak

Mr TAM Hoi-pong

Absent:

Mr LAI Man-fai

In Attendance:

Miss YIP Kam-ching, Jenny, JP

District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr CHOW Chun-hun, Gary

Assistant District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Tsuen Wan District Office

Mr KWONG Chi-wing, Denis

Senior Executive Officer (District Management), Tsuen Wan District Office

Ms CHAN Tsz-yee, Emily

Senior Liaison Officer (1), Tsuen Wan District Office

Ms LEE Lai-kiu, Winnie

Senior Liaison Officer (2), Tsuen Wan District Office

Miss LAM Siu-yung, Daisy  
(Secretary)

Senior Executive Officer (District Council), Tsuen Wan  
District Office

Mr LAU Shun-tak, Donald

Executive Officer I (District Council), Tsuen Wan District  
Office

## Action

### I Opening Remarks and Introduction

District Officer (Tsuen Wan) (DO(TW)) of the Tsuen Wan District Office (TWDO) welcomed Members to the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Tsuen Wan District Council (TWDC) and congratulated Members for being elected as the new-term district councillors of Tsuen Wan district. She hoped that in the coming four years, the TWDC, TWDO and various government departments would maintain good communication, work together to build Tsuen Wan community and strive for the well-being of local residents, so as to make Tsuen Wan district a better and harmonious community.

2. DO(TW) of the TWDO stated that she would preside at the meeting for the election of Chairman and Vice Chairman of the TWDC and then the newly elected Chairman of the TWDC would take over the chair.

### II Item 1: The Election of Chairman of Tsuen Wan District Council

3. DO(TW) of the TWDO stated that on 31 December 2019, she issued the document to all Members who were invited to nominate the candidates for the office of the Chairman of the TWDC. It was also specified in the document that the nomination should be submitted to the Secretariat by 1:30 p.m. on 9 January 2020. At the close of the nomination period, she received one nomination form in which Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly was nominated for the office of the Chairman of the TWDC. According to section 5 of Schedule 5 of the District Councils Ordinance (Chapter 547), "...if only one candidate is nominated for the office of Chairman, the candidate is treated as having been elected Chairman..." As Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly was the only one candidate who was nominated for the office of the Chairman of the TWDC, she announced that Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly was the elected Chairman of the TWDC.

### III Item 2: The Election of Vice Chairman of Tsuen Wan District Council

4. DO(TW) of the TWDO stated that on 31 December 2019, she issued the document to all Members who were invited to nominate the candidates for the office of the Vice Chairman of the TWDC. It was also specified in the document that the nomination should be submitted to the Secretariat by 1:30 p.m. on 9 January 2020. At the close of the nomination period, she received one nomination form in which Mr LI Hung-por was nominated for the office of the Vice Chairman of the TWDC. According to section 5 of Schedule 5 of the District Councils Ordinance (Chapter 547), "...If only one candidate is nominated for the office of Vice Chairman, the candidate is treated as having been elected Vice Chairman." As Mr LI Hung-por was the only one candidate who was nominated for the office of the Vice Chairman of the TWDC, she announced that Mr LI Hung-por was the elected Vice Chairman of the TWDC.

5. DO(TW) of the TWDO stated that Mr CHAN Yuen-sum, Sumly, the Chairman of the TWDC, would take over chair.

(Note: Mr MAN Yu-ming, Mr YAU Kam-ping and Mr KOT Siu-yuen left the meeting at 2:35 p.m.)

#### IV Item 3: Any Other Business

6. The Chairman expressed heartfelt gratitude to Members for their support. He said that this day was an important day. He was elected as the Chairman of the TWDC thanks to the solidarity of Hong Kong people. Having served as a district councillor for over 30 years and participated in the District Council (DC) election of the previous terms, he commented that the current-term DC election was very meaningful because no candidate was elected uncontested. Also, the active participation of members of the public on the polling day showed that they were highly concerned about politics and people's livelihood. Hence, he hoped that DC Members of the current-term and the representatives of various government departments would proactively pay visits to the district and gauge public sentiments, as well as engaging in different consultation sessions with the residents and stakeholders to listen to the public's views attentively. Besides, he wished to bolster the image of the TWDC and proposed to strengthen the publicity work and enhance the transparency of the TWDC for gaining a more general acceptance from the public. He added that as the Chairman of the TWDC, he would chair the meetings in a fair and impartial manner, and allocate the resources of the TWDC as appropriate. Regarding the use of resources, he opined that the past activities involving free offers of snake feasts, vegetarian meals, mooncakes and glutinous rice dumplings should be replaced with the more meaningful activities of community involvement. In his opinion, the "large-scale white elephant" and "small-scale white elephant" projects should be declined and the funding system of environmental works should be reformed. In addition, he opined that as the public had a growing concern over the society and social environment, a number of matters regarding politics and people's livelihood would be discussed at the future meetings of the TWDC. Hence, he reminded Members to get well prepared and speak concisely at the meetings, so as to avoid protracting the meetings. Moreover, the TWDC Secretariat (the Secretariat) would develop a close rapport with Members. He believed that the workload in the new term of the TWDC would increase drastically and so would the pressure. Hence, he hoped that Members would be considerate when working with the staff of the Secretariat, in order to foster close collaboration with each other. He also looked forward to working closely with Members and the representatives of the government departments, in order to walk hand in hand with the local residents and build a harmonious community in Tsuen Wan.

(Note: Mr CHAN Sung-ip left the meeting at 2:39 p.m.)

7. The Vice Chairman shared his opinions on a couple of issues for the current term of the TWDC. He held that the incident of opposition to the proposed legislative amendments which had brought impacts to the community would become a subject of prime concern to the TWDC of the current term in addition to its normal function of keeping in view the district affairs. Also, a number of new Members had joined the current-term TWDC and he hoped that all Members would resolve differences and achieve harmony in order to materialise the creative and diversified

ideas. Members should also pay visits to the district and listen to the residents' views. Besides, as the TWDC of the current term comprised a wide spectrum of political groups and individuals instead of being dominated by one political party, he hoped that the TWDC would carry out the coordination work effectively. He would endeavour to assist the Chairman in handling the district work properly as well as allocating the resources for the district fairly and impartially, with a view to satisfying the needs of the residents in Tsuen Wan district. Again, he would like to thank all Members and residents for their support.

8. The Chairman asked whether Members would like to put forth special matters.

9. Mr TSE Man-chak said that the day of the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the TWDC marked the seventh month of the "anti-extradition to China" movement. Since the day a million Hong Kong people upholding the core values of the city took to the streets, some Hong Kong people were arrested and some sustained injuries. The Government did not care about the life and death of Hong Kong people. Also, it had neither faced up to the issue of police brutality nor looked into the pollution problem caused by the toxic chemicals associated with tear gas canisters. Up till present, no officials had taken political responsibility and stepped down. Since the night of "the 721 incident", they realised that Hong Kong people could only pave the way for the future by themselves and should no longer have blind faith in the established political system. On this day, the district councillors from the democratic camp would like to thank the electors in Tsuen Wan district who cast votes for them through one person, one vote. The electors had also used their votes to show the world their resistance against totalitarianism. "Five Demands, Not One Less" was not a mere slogan; instead, it was a belief to which they all adhered in the past. This era belonged to all Hong Kong people and "Liberate Hong Kong" was the people's vision of the future. In the days to come, they would uncompromisingly safeguard the core values of Hong Kong people and proactively solicit the public's aspirations, as well as striving for dual universal suffrage and defending democracy and freedom that were intrinsic to Hong Kong people. Apart from the attendees of this meeting, it relied on the comrades who fought against tyranny on the front line. They would not forget the frontline comrades' contributions to all Hong Kong people. Hence, he hoped that all attendants would stand and observe a one-minute silence.

10. The Chairman asked Members to vote for the proposal of observing a one-minute silence. After voting, the proposal was endorsed with a vote of 15 in favour, 0 against and 1 abstention.

(Note: Members observed a one-minute silence.)

11. The Chairman stated that to facilitate the work of the Secretariat, he proposed to discuss the following matters, including the appointment of the Secretary of TWDC, the adoption of the Tsuen Wan District Council Standing Orders (the Standing Orders), the formation of committees under the TWDC, the seating arrangement for Members of the TWDC, as well as the dates of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the TWDC and the joint meeting of the committees under the TWDC. Members unanimously agreed to the proposal.

12. The Chairman asked whether Members agreed to appoint Senior Executive Officer (District Council) (SEO(DC)) of the TWDO as the Secretary of TWDC and authorised the Secretariat to process the funding applications of excursions according to the Guidelines on the Tsuen Wan District Council Funds and allocation of Members' lockers in the common room. Members unanimously agreed to the above proposal.

13. The Chairman said that according to section 68 of the District Councils Ordinance (Chapter 547), the TWDC might make standing orders for regulating its procedure and that of its committees. He invited Members to give comments on the template of DC Standing Orders prepared by the Home Affairs Department (HAD).

14. Mr CHIU Yan-loy suggested that the proxy voting system should be abolished. He thereby proposed to delete section 31(2) of the Standing Orders which read "a member who is not present may fill in a standard form (Appendix IV) and appoint in writing another member to act as his or her proxy for the purpose of voting under Order 31(1). (This provision does not apply to the election of Chairman and Vice Chairman of the Council.)", as well as renumbering sections 31(3) and 31(4) of the Standing Orders as sections 31(2) and 31(3) respectively.

15. The Chairman held a ballot in respect of the abolition of proxy voting system. Members unanimously agreed to the above proposal.

16. Mr PUN Long-chung, Roy proposed that section 15 of the Standing Orders should be amended. In the past, the TWDC only allowed individual Members to film themselves and did not allow the filming or live broadcasting of the situation of the entire Main Conference Room by the public. In his opinion, the openness and transparency of the TWDC meetings should be further enhanced. Also, the TWDC meetings were public occasions, and the words and deeds of Members should be subject to public monitoring. Therefore, he proposed to amend section 15(3) of the Standing Orders as "in the course of a meeting of the Council, all persons attending or sitting in on the meeting at the place of the meeting shall not use any telecommunications devices for conversation and shall switch off all devices which may emit sound or switch the devices to silent mode." He further proposed to introduce a new section 15(4) which read "all persons attending or sitting in on the meeting may conduct live broadcasting, photography and video/audio recording", in order to clarify the amendment made to section 15(3). He opined that these two amendments not only superceded the outdated regulations, but also better aligned the course of meeting with the technological advancement nowadays.

17. SEO(DC) of the TWDO said that the issue concerned was an in-house affair of the TWDC and thereby, it should be discussed at the relevant meeting. Besides, it was stipulated in Schedule 1 of the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance (Chapter 486) that "where the person from whom personal data is or is to be collected is the data subject, all practicable steps shall be taken to ensure that he is explicitly informed on or before collecting the data."

18. Mr TAM Hoi-pong supported the proposal concerned. He said that due to the restriction on filming of the TWDC meetings, he found it difficult to report to the electors his work in detail during the tenure in the past four years. He opined that in

light of the technological advancement at present, it was unreasonable to only allow a Member to film himself or herself because the media were allowed to conduct live broadcasting at the meetings in the past. He thus commented that the amendment concerned was reasonable and practicable, i.e. any person attending the meeting in future might conduct filming and live broadcasting provided that he or she did not disrupt the orderly conduct of the meeting.

19. Mr LAU Cheuk-yu enquired about the correlation between personal privacy and video recording. He enquired whether his personal privacy was invaded as a number of cameras were filming at the Main Conference Room currently.

20. SEO(DC) of the TWDO stated that the media workers did not film the meetings for personal purposes. Also, the media workers should register with the Secretariat beforehand and prominently put a sticker issued by the Secretariat on his or her clothes for easy identification. Otherwise, the Chairman might turn down the request for filming from the persons concerned, in order to prevent disruption to the orderly conduct of the meeting.

21. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that this year, the pace of Hong Kong would be different from that in the past. Also, the dual universal suffrage had not been achieved in real terms yet. Besides, the elected district councillors should be held accountable for the TWDC's use of funding to the residents in the district. Hence, he hoped that apart from the provision of audio-recording service for the meetings, the Secretariat and TWDO would, subject to the availability of resources, provide assistance in filming the TWDC meetings by following the current practices of the Legislative Council in which the meetings were videoed and broadcast live by the Radio Television Hong Kong.

22. Mr YICK Shing-chung, Angus agreed to Members' views. He opined that many Members of the current term had pledged to enhance the transparency of the TWDC when running for the DC election. The residents also wished to acquire the first-hand situation of the TWDC meetings. As the details of the minutes of the TWDC meetings were collectively recorded in the past, it was probable that some information therein might lead to misunderstanding. He hoped that similar situations would not recur in future. Besides, as people could sit in on the TWDC meetings in the public gallery and the details of meetings were open information, he held that the Secretariat should not over-emphasise the issue as to whether the filming was conducted for personal purposes.

23. The Chairman stated that the proposed amendments to the Standing Orders which violated the legal provisions, if any, should be drawn up afresh. Also, he would duly perform the gate-keeping role to prevent disruption to the orderly conduct of the meeting caused by any person whose filming for personal record keeping or misbehaviour severely undermined personal privacy during the course of video recording. He asked Members to vote for the proposal. Members unanimously agreed to the above proposal.

24. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris asked the Secretariat to briefly introduce the amendments to the template of DC Standing Orders.

25. SEO(DC) of the TWDO stated that the HAD had mainly made textual amendments to the template of DC Standing Orders. For example, the procedures on declaration of interest adopted in the DC Standing Orders were also applicable to the working groups under the DCs upon amendment.

26. Mr WONG Ka-wa moved a motion that the appointment system of Co-opted Members should be abolished in the current term of the TWDC.

27. Mr CHIU Yan-loy supported for not setting up the appointment system of Co-opted Members. He opined that the original intent of appointing Co-opted Members was to engage with the members of the local community who expressed their views, but the practice of appointment was outdated. In his opinion, the abolition of the appointment system of Co-opted Members could put the TWDC back on the right track. Also, the Members who had secured the public mandate should take the responsibility of attending various meetings of the TWDC but should not appoint others to perform duties on behalf of them. He understood that the direct abolition of the appointment system of Co-opted Members might contradict the relevant provisions under the District Councils Ordinance (Chapter 547), and thereby hoped that the Secretariat would study the feasibility of the proposal concerned.

28. The Chairman held that the abolition of the appointment system of Co-opted Members in the current term of the TWDC was the more prudent approach. He asked Members to vote for the proposal. After voting, the proposal was endorsed with a vote of 14 in favour, 0 against and 2 abstention.

29. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris enquired whether the ballot was held for the motion or for the amendment of the relevant provisions in the Standing Orders.

30. SEO(DC) of the TWDO stated that Members had endorsed by ballot that the appointment system of Co-opted Members should not be set up in the current term of the TWDC. Therefore, Members of the current term would not make any nomination for Co-opted Members and amendment to the relevant provisions in the Standing Orders was not required.

31. The Chairman proposed to process the formation of committees under the TWDC. He said that according to sections 71(1) to 71(5) of the District Councils Ordinance (Chapter 547), "For the purpose of carrying out its functions, a District Council may appoint committees in accordance with this section. A District Council may appoint to a committee any person who is not a member if the person satisfies the qualifications set out in section 20(1). A committee of a District Council is to elect a member of the committee who is also a member of that Council, as the chairman of the committee. A member appointed under subsection (2) may vote at a meeting of the committee and is to be counted for the purpose of constituting a quorum. A District Council may delegate any of its functions to a committee." He added that seven committees were formed under the TWDC of the previous term, namely, the District Facilities Management Committee (DFMC), the Culture, Recreation and Sports Committee, the Traffic and Transport Committee (T&TC), the Community Building, Planning and Development Committee (CBPDC), the Social Services and Community Information Committee, the Coastal Affairs Committee and the Environmental and Health Affairs Committee. He noted that some Members had

prepared the papers on the proposed terms of reference of the current-term committees for perusal by fellow Members and the representatives of the departments. Moreover, he had received a total of five proposals on the terms of reference of the committees concerned at the meeting. He would invite the Members who had submitted the papers to give a brief introduction in turn and then a ballot would be held. Members could also put forth amendments to the proposed terms of reference of the committees concerned immediately.

32. The Chairman proposed to firstly develop courses of action for the Recreation, Sports, Arts and Culture For All Committee (RSACFAC) and invited the Member concerned to give an introduction.

33. Mr LAU Cheuk-yu said that the formation of the RSACFAC aimed to develop Tsuen Wan into a creative town. He commented that “creative city” was a pivotal concept promulgated by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. A number of regions around the world including Macao had already joined the network of creative cities. He thus hoped that Tsuen Wan district would be the first pilot site of Hong Kong creative city for promotion of local culture.

34. The Chairman asked Members to vote for the proposed name and terms of reference of the RSACFAC. Members unanimously endorsed the formation of the RSACFAC and agreed on its terms of reference.

35. The Chairman further proposed to develop courses of action for the Social Service and Community Development Committee (SSCDC) and invited the Member concerned to give an introduction.

36. Ms CHAN Kim-kam said that the name and terms of reference of the respective committee under the TWDC in the past mainly reflected its scope of work for social services and community information. She suggested that the work of the committee should be stepped up to promote the progress of civic engagement as well as enhancing the care and services for the adolescent and women groups. Regarding the use of TWDC funds, she suggested that the TWDC funds should be granted to the non-governmental organisations and community groups for organising community development projects and social services on civic engagement, with a view to implementing the work of civic engagement in the district. Therefore, she proposed to rename the committee as “Social Service and Community Development Committee”.

37. Mr WONG Ka-wa added that the SSCDC would also be tasked with the promotion of the services for the persons with disabilities, the elderly and the labour as well as fostering the medical and educational development.

38. The Chairman asked Members to vote for the proposed name and terms of reference of the SSCDC. Members unanimously endorsed the formation of the SSCDC and agreed on its terms of reference.

39. The Chairman further proposed to develop courses of action for the T&TC and invited the Member concerned to give an introduction.

40. Mr CHIU Yan-loy said that there were a wide range of traffic and transport issues in Tsuen Wan district. In his opinion, the relevant committee under the TWDC of the previous term attached more weight to the discussion of public transport services such as the bus services and might overlook the ancillary crossing facilities for pedestrians. He therefore proposed to review and reorganise the working groups under the committee concerned. He also proposed to establish a special working group for the ancillary crossing facilities for pedestrians such as subways, footbridges and pedestrian crossings, with a view to bringing convenience to the residents and achieving the goal of universal accessibility. Besides, he hoped that additional barrier-free accesses would be provided in the district, and that Members would actively participate and give advice in the T&TC meetings in order to improve the transport ancillary facilities in Tsuen Wan district.

41. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris said that the fifth item of the proposed terms of reference of the T&TC read “to monitor local residents’ views on traffic and transport matters in the District”. He suggested that “monitor” should be revised as “collate and reflect”

42. Mr CHIU Yan-loy agreed to the proposal. He said that the revised fifth item of the proposed terms of reference read “to collate and reflect local residents’ views on traffic and transport matters in the District”.

43. The Chairman asked Members to vote for the proposed name and revised terms of reference of the T&TC. Members unanimously endorsed the formation of the T&TC and agreed on its terms of reference.

44. The Chairman further proposed to develop courses of action for the District Planning, Development and Facilities Management Committee (DPDFMC) and invited the Member concerned to give an introduction.

45. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio proposed that the DFMC and CBPDC under the TWDC of the previous term should be merged into one committee, namely the “District Planning, Development and Facilities Management Committee” and the terms of reference should be streamlined. Besides, he suggested that the matters of community development and building which were set out in the terms of reference of the CBPDC under the TWDC of the previous term should be incorporated into the terms of reference of the SSCDC under the TWDC of the current term.

46. Mr TSE Man-chak hoped that the DPDFMC would serve to promote the local community economy through the discussion of the long-term planning and development of the district and the study on the ways to make effective use of the idle land, as well as putting forth measures to achieve the objectives concerned.

47. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said that the Member proposed to merge two committees under the TWDC of the previous term into one committee. He believed that the workload of the departments concerned would increase accordingly. He hoped that Members and the representatives of the departments would duly conduct the preparatory work and uphold the people-oriented principles when handling the works projects. Also, he hoped that the works projects which accounted for a larger proportion of TWDC funds would benefit the public in order to avoid wastage.

Besides, in his opinion, the construction cost of some projects funded by the TWDC of the previous term was too high. Hence, he hoped that the government departments which planned to make fund applications for the construction projects in future should observe the principles of frugality and practicability.

48. Ms CHAN Kim-kam agreed to the formation of the DPDFMC. She suggested that the public should be fully consulted in the implementation of district minor works (DMW) or community planning. The members of the community and the residents could therefore engage in the discussion of community planning and development projects, so that the works projects in the community would not be solely determined by the TWDC.

49. The Chairman agreed to Members' views. He suggested that the engineering staff of the government departments concerned should pay visits to the community and listen to the public views.

50. Mr LAU Chi-hung said that as the DPDFMC was tasked to monitor the DMW, he proposed to revise "endorse" as "monitor" in the sixth item of the proposed terms of reference.

51. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio said that it was already set out in the sixth item of the proposed terms of reference that the DPDFMC would monitor the progress of implementation of the DMW according to the progress reports.

52. Mr TAM Hoi-pong proposed to revise "endorse" as "deliberate" in order to allay the Member's concern.

53. The Chairman said that the proposed revision to the terms of reference as put forth by the Member might enfeeble the powers of the DPDFMC.

54. Mr TAM Hoi-pong thus proposed to revise "endorse" as "deliberate and endorse".

55. The Chairman asked Members to vote for the proposed name and revised terms of reference of the DPDFMC. Members unanimously endorsed the formation of the DPDFMC and agreed on its terms of reference.

56. The Chairman further proposed to develop courses of action for the Environment, Health and Climate Change Committee (EHCCC) and invited the Member concerned to give an introduction.

57. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said that tackling the issue of global climate change should start at the community level. The global climate change had caused the massive bushfires in Australia recently, and the replanting of trees in the aftermath of typhoons locally showed that Hong Kong could not stay immune. Hence, he proposed that the relevant committee under the TWDC of the previous term should be renamed to highlight the importance of tackling the issue of climate change. He wished to, through the EHCCC, draw the attention of more local residents to the ways for tackling and mitigating climate change, e.g. energy saving. Besides, the proposed terms of reference of the EHCCC were comparable to those of the relevant

committee under the TWDC of the previous term. The EHCCC would continue to discuss the matters of environmental hygiene and take responsibility for handling the allocation of DMW funds for the benefits of the residents in the district.

58. Mr SHUM Lester supported the formation of the EHCCC. He said that although global climate change was a worldwide problem, it also brought impacts to the community. For example, all districts over the territory had taken a series of contingency measures during the strike of typhoon Mangkhut in 2018. In view of the occurrence of increasingly extreme weather events around the world nowadays, the community would have to face the relevant problems as time went by. Therefore, the TWDC should duly perform its functions and conduct the educational and contingency work on natural disasters. Moreover, he suggested that the animal-friendly matters should be discussed by the EHCCC. The relevant committee under the TWDC of the previous term mainly focused on the hygienic condition in the community. As animals living in the community were also the major stakeholders and the animal rights were better safeguarded at present, he proposed that the EHCCC should handle the matters such as animal-human integration in the community.

59. The Chairman asked Members to vote for the proposed name and terms of reference of the EHCCC. Members unanimously endorsed the formation of the EHCCC and agreed on its terms of reference.

60. The Chairman proposed that the above committees should hold regular meetings on a bi-monthly basis. Members unanimously endorsed the proposal.

61. The Chairman said that as the seating arrangement for TWDC meetings according to the number of strokes of Members' Chinese names had been made effectively over the years, he proposed to continue to adopt the said arrangement. Members unanimously endorsed the arrangement.

62. The Chairman stated that the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the TWDC would be held at 2:30 p.m. on 22 January 2020 and the 1<sup>st</sup> joint meeting of the committees under the TWDC would be held at 10:00 a.m. on 22 January 2020. The main agenda of the joint meeting was the election of Chairmen and Vice Chairmen of the committees. Members unanimously agreed to the above arrangement.

63. The Chairman asked if Members needed to put forth other more urgent business. He said that according to section 28 of the Standing Orders, unless otherwise agreed by the Chairman, Members could speak and make supplementary remarks once for each agenda item at the meeting. He requested that Members should speak within 2 minutes.

64. Mr SHUM Lester said that recently, there was an outbreak of viral pneumonia with unknown cause in Wuhan. There were also signs that the virus was gradually spreading to Hong Kong. However, the Government's anti-epidemic measures and quarantine work at the borders so far had largely fallen short of public expectations. Therefore, he would like to move a motion that the matter concerned should be highlighted for discussion at the next meeting of the TWDC. He also suggested that the government departments concerned should be invited to assign

representatives to join the meeting as well as giving response to Members' enquiries and proposals on the epidemic, including but not limited to the Department of Health, Food and Health Bureau and Hospital Authority. Besides, he said that the relevant discussion paper was submitted to the Chairman and the Secretariat prior to the meeting.

(Note: The Secretariat received the discussion paper from Mr SHUM Lester on 9 January 2020.)

65. The Chairman agreed that the epidemic had caused huge impacts on the health of the public in Hong Kong and adopted the proposal of discussing the matter concerned at the next meeting of the TWDC. He also asked the Secretariat to invite the representatives of the departments concerned to provide information and give response to Members' enquiries.

66. Mr WONG Ka-wa said that according to media coverage, the Lennon Wall on which the public displayed their views near Lei Muk Shue Estate Bus Terminal was damaged by about 40 to 50 people with offensive weapons including iron poles and knives in the small hours on 8 January 2020. This incident was known as "the 18 incident". Some residents arrived at the scene after learning of the incident. The group of people in question pointed the objects such as iron poles at the residents. After the case happened, about four to seven police vehicles and some anti-riot police officers arrived at the scene. Upon separating the two parties, the police officers did not stop and search the people wielding offensive weapons. In his opinion, the police officers even escorted them to leave by taxis. He thus proposed that the Commander of Tsuen Wan Police Station should be invited to meet Members in respect of the said incident, so that Members could raise urgent questions accordingly.

67. The Chairman stated that he was also the district councillor of Lei Muk Shue constituency. In the morning on 9 January 2020, he had raised questions to the representative of the Police and enquired about the case in detail. He relayed the response given by the representative of the Police that the group of people in question had damaged the Lennon Wall at the location concerned with iron spades. He questioned that iron spades were offensive weapons. It would be very unsatisfactory if the Lennon Walls built by the public in different housing estates were frequently damaged by "clean-up teams" equipped with weapons in future. Therefore, he agreed to the Member's proposal that the Commander of Tsuen Wan Police Station should be invited to join the TWDC meeting on 22 January 2020 and give response to the relevant questions.

68. Mr CHIU Yan-loy supported the proposal of questioning the Commander of Tsuen Wan Police Station. He recalled that similar incidents had happened in the past. For example, youngsters were chased and stabbed by white-clad men on 5 August 2019 and 1 October 2019, and the victim suffered from stab wound to the bone. However, the Police had neither searched the hideouts of the suspects nor recorded the identity of the white-clad men. On 22 July 2019, there was hearsay that white-clad triad members would attack the public in the district. As the residents were worried that their personal safety would be at risk if they stayed on the streets, the entire Tsuen Wan district became a deserted place in the afternoon on 22 July 2019. He was therefore concerned about the safety in community.

69. The Chairman agreed that the representatives of the Police should be requested to give response to the questions concerned at the next TWDC meeting.

70. Mr CHIU Yan-loy pointed out that Tsuen Wan district was the first district in Hong Kong where water cannon vehicles were deployed by the Police to suppress the students and youngsters who protested peacefully. It was also the first community where a police officer pointed pistol at passers-by and shot a youngster with a live round in the chest. The youngster still had to receive medical treatment up till present. In this connection, he moved a motion that the TWDC should establish a standing working group named “Task Force on Community Safety and Monitoring of Police Power” according to the relevant ordinances. The Task Force would be responsible for following up on the issues of community safety and police brutality in the district within the current term of the TWDC. He wished to attend to the public’s complaints on the unfair enforcement of law by police officers through the open council system of the TWDC. Also, he wished to follow up on and improve the mode of enforcement of law of the Police according to the existing ordinances and systems, with a view to restoring Hong Kong people’s confidence in the Police.

71. Mr TSE Man-chak agreed that a working group on monitoring the Police should be set up. Besides, he said that between October and November 2019, about 40 to 50 armed anti-riot police officers with flag bags, tear gas launchers and long shields entered Belvedere Garden, Tsuen Wan and conducted inspection inside the housing estate. These police officers pointed at the bystanders on the footbridge. Eventually, no arrests had been made by the Police. Many residents questioned the mode of operation adopted by the Police. He also held that the Police should give a clear account of various incidents.

72. Mr PUN Long-chung, Roy agreed to the motion concerned. Last year, a number of incidents similar to the aforesaid incident in Belvedere Garden occurred at Luk Yeung Sun Chuen. That day, about 40 anti-riot police officers dashed into the podium of Luk Yeung Sun Chuen and directly shone strong flashlight at the residents. He opined that it was necessary to pursue the justifications for the Police’s operations and the deployment and reasons for their entry to the podium of Luk Yeung Sun Chuen through the platform of the standing working group under the TWDC. Besides, he agreed that the name of the working group concerned should consist of the term “community safety”. In his opinion, the community safety of Tsuen Wan district was on a downward trend. A noodle restaurant had been burgled earlier. It reflected that the Police failed to deploy sufficient manpower to tackle the law and order problems such as hawkers, illegal parking and burglary cases in the community. Thus, he suggested that the issues of community safety should be followed up by the working group concerned.

73. Mr SHUM Lester supported the formation of the standing task force concerned. He hoped that a database on different cases of police brutality against the public in the district would be set up. Besides, he was concerned about the issues of community safety. He opined that at present, the government departments conducted insufficient follow-ups on the use of weapons by police officers due to social issues in the community. After the Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing march on 25 August 2019, he had visited the frontline cleansing workers of the Food and Environmental Hygiene

Department (FEHD) and learnt that they were only given ordinary cleaning gloves and surgical masks when cleansing the tear gas residue. Therefore, he suggested that the Labour Department and FEHD should provide guidelines on the said matter and follow up the work equipment of the frontline cleansing workers, in order to safeguard their health and work safety.

74. Mr YICK Shing-chung, Angus said that an incident alike the aforesaid incident in Lei Muk Shue Estate had happened in the past. Also, some police entered Belvedere Garden for no reason. They attempted to take enforcement actions and pointed pistol at the residents. He opined that the Police did not have to give an account of the operation concerned owing to the disappointingly deficient system on monitoring the Police in force. Therefore, a working group should be formed to monitor and discuss the enforcement criteria of the Police and the use of police power, as well as holding the Police accountable for firing tear gas canisters rampantly within a day, abusing powers and making indiscriminate arrests, etc.

75. Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris said that according to the Standing Orders and the practice of the TWDC in the past, Members never discussed the matters which were not included in the agenda under Any Other Business. He thus proposed that the District Commander (Tsuen Wan) should be invited to join the TWDC meeting on 22 January 2020 and give response to Members' enquiries. Also, the formation of the working group concerned should be discussed that day. Compared to the current approach of Members making remarks in turn, the proposed arrangement could better align with the Standing Orders.

76. The Chairman stated that he understood Members' concern on the acts of police officers and thereby made a special arrangement. Members' views would be taken heed of at this meeting and further discussion of the matter concerned would be made at the meeting of the TWDC on 22 January 2020.

77. Mr CHIU Yan-loy said he put forth the proposal verbally and thought that Members could express their views on it. He would also submit a discussion paper on the formation of the working group concerned and move a motion at the meeting of the TWDC on 22 January 2020.

78. Mr LAU Cheuk-yu said that a number of students were arrested by the Police in front of Tsuen Wan Lennon Wall on 21 October 2019 (i.e. the footbridge to Discovery Park, Tsuen Wan). Although the court had subsequently ruled that there was insufficient evidence for the case, he hoped that the Police would explain the guidelines and procedures adopted for handling the incident concerned. He also proposed to set up Lennon Walls in the community and discuss the proposed locations for provision of Lennon Walls at the meeting of the TWDC on 22 January 2020.

79. Ms CHAN Kim-kam supported the formation of the monitoring working group concerned. She pointed out that there was an allegation from a teenage girl that she was gang-raped in Tsuen Wan Police Station in September 2019 (October 2019 according to newspaper reports). Neither did the teenage girl participate in the resistance events nor was dressed in black. She commented that the aforesaid case was unimaginable. In her opinion, the Police should give a clear account of their deeds in the past at the district level via the proposed working group. Besides, she

said that on 25 August 2019, the police officers cleared the participants of Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing march by kettling. The members of the public who participated in the peaceful assembly were left with no way out. Also, the Police had repeatedly entered the private areas of Tsuen Wan Plaza in her constituency area to make arrests, but the objective of the operations was ambiguous. She hoped that by establishing the working group concerned, the principles of humanitarian aid by Members, social workers and healthcare workers would be ascertained and the community safety would be assured again.

80. Mr LAU Chi-hung agreed that the working group concerned should be established. In the past six months or so, the Police focused its manpower on handling the movement of opposition to the proposed legislative amendments. It had brought about certain impacts on the crime rate in the community. For instance, within his constituency area Sham Tseng, the problem of noise nuisance caused by illegal road racing was serious. The residents were affected. He thus questioned that the Police failed to deploy sufficient manpower to tackle the said problem.

81. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said that there were incidents of police brutality in Tsuen Wan district. For example, in late December 2019, a group of people were interrogated by the police officers when printing T-shirts in Ma Wan. He opined that the working group concerned should be formed as soon as possible and it should be formally set up at the meeting of the TWDC on 22 January 2020.

82. Mr LAU Jackson said he learnt from news reports that police officers would not plan to attend any meetings which were targeted at the Police. He opined that the Police should assign its representatives to attend the TWDC meetings, in order to respond to Members' questions and facilitate monitoring by the public. He hoped that the Police would assign its representatives to attend the meetings of the aforesaid working group.

83. Mr LAM Sek-tim said that "the 18 incident" in Lei Muk Shue was similar to that happened in Yi Pei Square earlier, i.e. members of the public made a report to the Police but the police officers protected the suspicious persons upon arrival at the scene. Members of the public could not understand why the police officers did so. He thus enquired the Police about the reasons for that. Besides, as a number of large-scale incidents had happened in Tsuen Wan district in the past and brought about profound impacts to the district, he hoped that the Hong Kong Police Force would give an account of the incidents to the public.

84. Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio said that noise nuisance was often caused by illegal road racing along the flyover on Tsuen Wan Road in the small hours. Members of the public could hardly fall asleep. Although he had relayed the problem to the Police, the situation had not been improved so far. The Police failed to provide assistance for the residents in solving the problems such as illegal parking and illegal road racing, so the public grievance would mount. Moreover, during the DC election period in November 2019, he and some volunteers were setting up a street counter near the pedestrian crossing at Vision City on Sha Tsui Road. While the easy mount frame was not fully pulled up, several police officers had already come over and dispersed them. He thus opined that the working group concerned should be established to raise questions to the Police.

85. SEO(DC) of the TWDO stated that after the meeting, the Secretariat would seek advice from the Department of Justice (DoJ) as to whether the formation of the working group concerned might violate the prevailing legislation and exceed the bounds of terms of reference stipulated under the District Councils Ordinance (Chapter 547).

86. Mr CHIU Yan-loy said he wished to obtain a written reply from the Secretariat with respect to the advice given by the DoJ on the working group concerned for reference.

87. The Chairman hoped that the Secretariat would furnish the TWDC with clear legal advice by 22 January 2020, in order to facilitate the TWDC to make a decision in compliance with the laws and regulations of Hong Kong during the discussion on the name and terms of reference of the working group concerned at the meeting of the TWDC on 22 January 2020.

88. Mr SHUM Lester said that DO(TW) of the TWDO was not present when Members read out a statement and began discussing the formation of the working group concerned. He enquired whether it was associated with the approach adopted by the Government or HAD in respect of the discussion on politically sensitive matters by the DCs of the new term. He pointed out that the District Officer who served as a bridge between the TWDC and departments should be present during the discussion of various matters including those which were politically sensitive, in order to assure the smooth coordination and implementation of projects as well as duly following up on the work of the working group concerned.

89. DO(TW) of the TWDO would like to clarify the misunderstanding caused to the Member. She pointed out that she had to withdraw from the TWDC meetings at times when necessary due to the office commitments of the TWDO in her capacity. Meanwhile, other attendees from the TWDO also listened to Members' views. She would attend the meetings as far as possible.

90. The Chairman asked whether Members agreed that the matters about the working group concerned should be discussed at the TWDC meeting on 22 January 2020.

91. Mr TAM Hoi-pong said he noted that many DCs had established committees or working groups on monitoring the Police or on security affairs at their first meetings. Although he agreed that the official name of the working group concerned should be further discussed at the TWDC meeting on 22 January 2020, he held that the Chairman had the power to hold a ballot with respect to the direction of formation of the working group. He therefore proposed that a ballot should be held with respect to the direction of formation of the working group.

92. The Chairman opined that a ballot should be held with respect to the direction of formation of the working group. Members unanimously agreed to the proposal.

93. Mr CHIU Yan-loy proposed that an open ballot should be held for “the TWDC supports the formation of the Working Group on Community Safety and Monitoring of Police Power for endorsement at the TWDC meeting on 22 January 2020.” Members agreed to the proposal.

94. The Chairman asked Members to vote on the proposal concerned. The voting result was listed as follows:

For (15 votes in total)

The Vice Chairman, Mr NG Hin-lung, Norris, Mr SHUM Lester, Mr YICK Shing-chung, Angus, Mr LAM Sek-tim, Ms CHAN Kim-kam, Mr LUK Ling-chung, Antonio, Mr WONG Ka-wa, Mr CHIU Yan-loy, Mr LAU Chi-hung, Mr LAU Cheuk-yu, Mr PUN Long-chung, Roy, Mr LAU Jackson, Mr TSE Man-chak and Mr TAM Hoi-pong

Against (0 vote in total)

Abstention (0 vote in total)

95. The Chairman announced that the proposal concerned was endorsed.

96. The Chairman said he noted that Members had to handle a lot of matters, and therefore exercised discretion in making a special arrangement under Any Other Business at this meeting. Such an arrangement would not be made again in future.

97. Mr YICK Shing-chung, Angus said he had submitted a paper on the development of the harbourfront in Tsuen Wan for discussion at the next TWDC meeting. It was stated in the government’s document that a funding of \$30 million would be allocated for the development of the Tsuen Wan harbourfront. However, he was unable to find the relevant paper of the TWDC of the previous term. Recently, he learnt that a number of artistic chairs were installed along the Tsuen Wan harbourfront which presumably were the facilities provided under the project of cycle track, but he found later that these chairs were covered by the aforesaid funding of \$30 million. Hence, he hoped that at the next TWDC meeting, the Development Bureau and the departments concerned would give an account of the unspent balance of the funding of \$30 million and the details of the future development of the Tsuen Wan harbourfront.

98. Ms CHAN Kim-kam said that during August and November 2019, the Police had time and again shot tear gas canisters in Tsuen Wan district. The tear gas residue inside the buildings in the community had posed risk to the public health. Hence, she had submitted a motion paper for requesting the government departments concerned to explain to the public the use of tear gas canisters by the Police and to follow up the information of the recovery work, including the composition of tear gas canisters and the potential impacts on human body brought by the residual chemicals, the codes of practice on the use of tear gas canisters, the recovery work upon the tear gas canisters shot by the Police, as well as the protective measures for the frontline cleansing workers and staff when carrying out the recovery work.

99. Mr TAM Hoi-pong pointed out that previously, the TWDC and TWDO would respectively share half of the expenditure of the spring reception. He would object to the attendance of the representatives from the Liaison Office of the Central People's Government in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region at the spring reception. In addition, an allocation of about \$1 million was previously endorsed for organising the Lantern Festival activities. He learnt that in light of the recent circumstances, the said activities would probably be cancelled; if yes, he hoped that the said allocation would be used for other community purposes. He also requested for checking the receipts for reimbursement of the TWDC funds.

100. The Chairman stated that after the meeting, he together with the Vice Chairman and Secretariat would follow up on the papers submitted by Members including the departments giving response for the TWDC meeting on 22 January 2020. Besides, he expressed sincere gratitude to the representatives of various government departments, Members, members of the public and media workers for joining this TWDC meeting. He hoped that the current term of the TWDC would commence smoothly and concerted efforts would be made for the well-being of the residents of Tsuen Wan district.

V Adjournment of Meeting

101. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:25 p.m.

Tsuen Wan District Council Secretariat  
March 2020